

Document of  
**The World Bank**  
**FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY**

Report No: PAD2680

INTERNATIONAL BANK FOR RECONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT

PROJECT APPRAISAL DOCUMENT

ON A

PROPOSED LOAN

IN THE AMOUNT OF EURO 81.2 MILLION  
(US\$100 MILLION EQUIVALENT)

TO THE

REPUBLIC OF TUNISIA

FOR A

STRENGTHENING FOUNDATIONS FOR LEARNING PROJECT  
APRIL 27, 2018

Education Global Practice  
Middle East And North Africa Region

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

## **CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS**

**(Exchange Rate Effective: March 31, 2018)**

**Currency Unit = Tunisia Dinar (TND)**

**TND 1 = US\$ 0.4168**

**US\$ 1 = TND 2.3988**

**US\$ 1 = EUR 0.81126**

## **FISCAL YEAR**

**January 1 - December 31**

<b>Regional Vice President:</b>	<b>Hafez Ghanem</b>
<b>Country Director:</b>	<b>Marie Francoise Marie-Nelly</b>
<b>Senior Global Practice Director:</b>	<b>Jaime Saavedra Chanduvi</b>
<b>Practice Manager:</b>	<b>Safaa El Tayeb El-Kogali</b>
<b>Task Team Leader(s):</b>	<b>Michael Drabble, Samira Halabi</b>

## ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ADEB	<i>Aide à la Décision Budgétaire</i> (Budgeting Information Management System)
APR	Annual Progress Report
CBT	Central Bank of Tunisia
CIFFIP	<i>Centre International de Formation des Formateurs et d'Innovation Pédagogique</i> (International Center for Training of Trainers and Educational Innovation)
CNI	<i>Centre National d'Informatique</i> (National Center for Information System)
CNTE	<i>Centre National des Technologies en Education</i> (National Center for Technologies in Education)
CPF	Country Partnership Framework
CRE	<i>Commissariat Régional de l'Education</i> (Education Regional Office)
CREFOC	<i>Centre Régional de l'Education et de la Formation Continue</i> (Education and In-service Training Regional Center)
DGAF	<i>Direction General des Affaires Financières</i> (General Directorate for Financial Affairs)
DGAJ	<i>Direction General des Affaires Juridiques</i> (General Directorate for Legal Affairs)
DGBE	<i>Direction Générale des Bâtiments</i> (General Directorate for Civil Works)
DGCP	<i>Direction Générale du Cycle Primaire</i> (General Directorate for Primary Education)
DGEPSI	<i>Direction Générale des Etudes, de la Planification et du Système d'Information</i> (General Directorate for Studies, Planning and Information System)
DGFCP	<i>Direction Générale des Programmes et de la Formation Continue</i> (General Directorate for Programs and Continuous Training)
DLI	Disbursement Linked Indicator
DLR	Disbursement Linked Result
ECD	Early Childhood Development
EEP	Eligible Expenditure Program
EGMA	Early Grade Mathematics Assessment
EGRA	Early Grade Reading Assessment
ESMF	Environmental and Social Management Framework
EU	European Union
FM	Financial Management
FMA	Financial Management Assessment
GDP	Growth domestic Product
GOT	Government of Tunisia
GRM	Grievance Redress Mechanism
GRS	Grievance Redress Service
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
IPF	Investment Project Financing



IRI	Intermediate Result Indicator
IRR	Internal Rate of Return
MELQO	Measuring Early Learning Quality and Outcomes
MENA	Middle East and North Africa
MTEF	Medium-Term Expenditure Framework
MGPEF	Maghreb Governance and Political Economy Facility
MOE	Ministry of Education
NGO	Non-Governmental Agency
NPV	Net Present Value
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
PDO	Project Development Objective
PFM	Public Financial Management
PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
POM	Project Operations Manual
PPSD	Project Procurement Strategy for Development
PSC	Project Steering Committee
RBF	Results-based Financing
RPF	Resettlement Policy Framework
SABER	Systems Approach for Better Education Results
SFLP	Strengthening Foundations for Learning Project
SIADE	<i>Système Informatique pour l'Administration de la Dette Extérieure</i> (Debt Management Information System)
SOE	Statement of Expenditures
SPR	Semiannual Progress Report
TIMSS	Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study
TND	Tunisian Dinars
TOR	Terms of Reference
UGPO	<i>Unité de Gestion de Projet par Objectif</i> (Project Management Unit by Objective)
UGTT	<i>Union Générale Tunisienne du Travail</i> (Tunisian General Labour Union)
UNICEF	United Nations International Children's Fund

## BASIC INFORMATION

Is this a regionally tagged project? No	Country(ies)	Financing Instrument Investment Project Financing
--	--------------	--

- ☐ Situations of Urgent Need of Assistance or Capacity Constraints
- ☐ Financial Intermediaries
- ☐ Series of Projects

Approval Date 18-May-2018	Closing Date 30-Dec-2023	Environmental Assessment Category B - Partial Assessment
------------------------------	-----------------------------	---

Bank/IFC Collaboration No
------------------------------

## Proposed Development Objective(s)

The objectives of the Project are to improve learning conditions in public preschools and primary schools, and to increase access to public preschool education in selected districts.

## Components

Component Name	Cost (US\$ millions)
Improving quality and increasing supply of public preschool education	19.6
Improving learning conditions in public primary schools	46.6
Strengthening management practices in the education sector	62.5
Project management support	1.30

## Organizations

Borrower : Ministry of Development, Investment and International Cooperation

Implementing Agency : Ministry of Education

#### PROJECT FINANCING DATA (US\$, Millions)

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Counterpart Funding	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> IBRD	<input type="checkbox"/> IDA Credit	<input type="checkbox"/> IDA Grant	<input type="checkbox"/> Trust Funds	<input type="checkbox"/> Parallel Financing
Total Project Cost: 130.00	Total Financing: 130.00		Financing Gap: 0.00		
	Of Which Bank Financing (IBRD/IDA): 100.00				

#### Financing (in US\$ millions)

Financing Source	Amount
Borrower	30.00
International Bank for Reconstruction and Development	100.00
<b>Total</b>	<b>130.00</b>

#### Expected Disbursements (in US\$ millions)

Fiscal Year	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
Annual	0.00	10.79	11.80	27.42	30.64	14.85	4.50
Cumulative	0.00	10.79	22.59	50.01	80.65	95.50	100.00

#### INSTITUTIONAL DATA

##### Practice Area (Lead)

Education

### Contributing Practice Areas

Governance

### Climate Change and Disaster Screening

This operation has been screened for short and long-term climate change and disaster risks

### Gender Tag

Does the project plan to undertake any of the following?

a. Analysis to identify Project-relevant gaps between males and females, especially in light of country gaps identified through SCD and CPF

Yes

b. Specific action(s) to address the gender gaps identified in (a) and/or to improve women or men's empowerment

Yes

c. Include Indicators in results framework to monitor outcomes from actions identified in (b)

Yes

### SYSTEMATIC OPERATIONS RISK-RATING TOOL (SORT)

Risk Category	Rating
1. Political and Governance	● High
2. Macroeconomic	● Substantial
3. Sector Strategies and Policies	● Substantial
4. Technical Design of Project or Program	● Substantial
5. Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	● Substantial
6. Fiduciary	● Substantial
7. Environment and Social	● Moderate
8. Stakeholders	● Substantial
9. Other	
10. Overall	● Substantial

## COMPLIANCE

### Policy

Does the project depart from the CPF in content or in other significant respects?

☐ Yes    ☒ No

Does the project require any waivers of Bank policies?

☐ Yes    ☒ No

### Safeguard Policies Triggered by the Project

Yes

No

Environmental Assessment OP/BP 4.01

✓

Natural Habitats OP/BP 4.04

✓

Forests OP/BP 4.36

✓

Pest Management OP 4.09

✓

Physical Cultural Resources OP/BP 4.11

✓

Indigenous Peoples OP/BP 4.10

✓

Involuntary Resettlement OP/BP 4.12

✓

Safety of Dams OP/BP 4.37

✓

Projects on International Waterways OP/BP 7.50

✓

Projects in Disputed Areas OP/BP 7.60

✓



## **Legal Covenants**

### Section I.A.1 of Schedule 2 to the Loan Agreement

The Borrower shall vest the overall responsibility for the implementation of the Project in MOE, and to this end, shall, through MOE:

- (a) No later than three (3) months after the Effective Date, or such other date as agreed by the Bank, appoint and thereafter maintain a Project coordinator under terms of reference described in the Project Operational Manual.
- (b) No later than three (3) months after the Effective Date, or such other date as agreed by the Bank, establish, and thereafter maintain throughout Project implementation, the Project Steering Committee with composition acceptable to the Bank and defined in the Project Operational Manual.

### Section I.B.1 of Schedule 2 to the Loan Agreement

For purposes of the provision of Primary School Grants under Part 2.1(e) of the Project, upon achievement of DLR#2.1 as described in Schedule 4 of the Loan Agreement, the Borrower, through MOE, shall, upon selection of an Eligible Primary School pursuant to the criteria and procedures established in the POM, enter into a standard agreement with the Eligible Primary School, under terms and conditions acceptable to the Bank (the Primary School Grant Agreement).

## **Conditions**

### Section III.B.1 of Schedule 2 to the Loan Agreement (in relation to Category (2) on Payments of EEPs

1. Notwithstanding the provisions of Part A above, no withdrawal shall be made:

(a) for payments made prior to the Signature Date, except that withdrawals up to an aggregate amount not to exceed EUR4,872,000 may be made for payments made prior to this date but on or after the date twelve months prior to the Signature Date, for Eligible Expenditures under Category (2), provided that the Borrower shall have submitted the relevant EEP spending report for the referred period and such report shall have been found satisfactory by the Bank, in accordance with the provisions of the POM and the Disbursement and Financial Information Letter ; or

(b) for payments made under Category (2) until and unless the Borrower has furnished evidence satisfactory to the Bank with respect to the achievement of the respective Disbursement-Linked Results (DLRs) as referred to in Schedule 4 to the Loan Agreement and the additional supporting documentation set forth in the Disbursement and Financial Information Letter;

2. Notwithstanding the provisions of Part B.1(b) of this Section, if any of the DLRs referred to in Schedule 4 to the Loan Agreement has not been achieved, the Bank may, by notice to the Borrower: (a) reallocate all or a portion of the proceeds of the Loan then allocated to said DLR to any other DLR; and/or (b) cancel all or a portion of the proceeds of the Loan then allocated to said DLR.

## PROJECT TEAM

### Bank Staff

Name	Role	Specialization	Unit
Michael Drabble	Team Leader(ADM Responsible)	Education	GED05
Samira Halabi	Team Leader	Education	GED05
Mohamed Yassine	Team Member	Education	GED05
Emma Paulette Etori	Team Member	Operations	GED05
Almedina Music	Team Member	Economist	GED05
Elena Segura Labadia	Counsel	Legal	LEGAM
Abdoulaye Keita	Procurement Specialist(ADM Responsible)	Procurement	GGOPM
Kolie Ousmane Maurice Megnan	Financial Management Specialist	Financial Management	GGOMN
Antoine V. Lema	Social Safeguards Specialist	Social Safeguards	GSU05
Leila Chelaifa	Team Member	Program Assistant	MNCTN
Mehdi El Batti	Team Member	Financial Management	GGOMN
Mohamed Adnene Bezzaouia	Environmental Safeguards Specialist	Environment Safeguards	GEN05
Eric Ranjeva	Finance Officer	Financial Management	WFACS
Narjes Jerbi	Team Member	Program Assistant	MNCTN
Asma Ben Abdallah	Team Member	Operations	MNCTN
Simon Carl O'Meally	Team Member	Governance	GGOMN

### Extended Team

Name	Title	Organization	Location
Mustapha Ennaifar	Consultant		Tunis
Pierre Varly	Student Assessment Specialist		
Selima Ladari	Architect		Tunis
Hafedh Zaafrane	Education Specialist		Tunis

TUNISIA  
STRENGTHENING FOUNDATIONS FOR LEARNING PROJECT

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>I. STRATEGIC CONTEXT .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>A. Country Context .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>B. Sectoral and Institutional Context.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>C. Link to CPF.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>II. PROJECT DESCRIPTION.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>A. Project Development Objective (PDO) .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>B. Project Beneficiaries .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>C. PDO-Level Results Indicators.....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>D. Project Components .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>E. Project Cost and Financing .....</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>III. IMPLEMENTATION.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>A. Institutional and Implementation Arrangements .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>B. Results Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements.....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>IV. PROJECT ASSESSMENT SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>A. Theory of Change/Results Chain .....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>B. Economic and Financial Analysis .....</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>C. Technical Soundness.....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>D. Lessons Reflected in Project Design .....</b>	<b>31</b>
<b>E. Fiduciary.....</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>F. Safeguards.....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>G. Grievance Redress.....</b>	<b>37</b>
<b>V. KEY RISKS .....</b>	<b>38</b>
<b>A. Overall Risk Rating and Explanation of Key Risks.....</b>	<b>38</b>
<b>VI. RESULTS FRAMEWORK .....</b>	<b>41</b>

## I. STRATEGIC CONTEXT

### A. Country Context

1. **Tunisia underwent a significant political transition following the 2011 revolution, but economic stagnation poses serious challenges for the country's development.** Tunisia adopted a new Constitution in early 2014, followed by orderly presidential and parliamentary elections and the establishment of a democratically elected government in 2015. Civil society organizations, including youth groups, have gained more voice and have pushed for less corruption and greater transparency and accountability in public services. However, economic growth has averaged only 1.4 percent annually since the revolution (compared to 4.4 percent annually during the five years before the revolution). Growth is mainly driven by the agricultural and services sectors, while industrial output and non-manufacturing industries have contracted. Delays in reform implementation, security-related incidents, social unrest, and political instability have hindered growth.

2. **Despite a remarkable reduction in poverty, regional disparities have increased and account for most of the inequality in Tunisia.** The incidence of extreme poverty in Tunisia halved between 2010 and 2015, from 6 percent to 2.9 percent<sup>1</sup>. The poverty rate decreased by 5.3 percentage points over the 2010-2015 period (from 20.5 percent to 15.2 percent). Although the Gini index has dropped from 0.339 to 0.309 between 2010 and 2015, inequalities between regions persist. The poor are concentrated in the western regions, which are home to a large proportion of the poor. The problem of extreme poverty is almost absent in the cities of Greater Tunis, Nabeul, Monastir and Sfax.

3. **In recent years, young, educated Tunisians have experienced growing unemployment rates and job insecurity.** Although most of the unemployed are low-skilled workers, university graduates have the highest unemployment rate: 31.2 percent in 2017. Female graduate unemployment reached 40.4 percent. Unemployment rates are much higher in the interior compared to coastal regions. In 2017, public sector jobs represented 20 percent of employment in Tunisia, and public sector wages constitute nearly 40 percent of the national budget.<sup>2</sup> This system has resulted in significant deficits contributing to the growth of public debt from 41 percent to 71 percent of Tunisian growth domestic product (GDP) between 2010-2017. Tunisia's public wage bill grew from 10.7 percent of GDP in 2010 to more than 13.2 percent of GDP in 2018.<sup>3</sup>

### B. Sectoral and Institutional Context

4. **Tunisia has successfully addressed issues of access to schooling, having achieved universal primary education and gender parity more than two decades ago.**<sup>4</sup> Tunisia's basic education system is free and compulsory and consists of nine years of schooling divided into two stages: the primary cycle, which lasts six years, and preparatory or lower-secondary cycle, which lasts three years. At the end of the

---

<sup>1</sup> National Institut of Statistic of Tunisia – Flash : « *Consommation et Niveau de Vie* » - No1 Décembre 2016

<sup>2</sup> 2017 Finance Law

<sup>3</sup> 2018 Finance Law

<sup>4</sup> World Bank Edstats database. Data is for 2013.

nine-year cycle, students move on to four years of upper-secondary school. 94 percent of the 1.1 million children in primary school continue to lower secondary education.<sup>5</sup> Arabic is the official language, with French introduced in Grade 3 and English in Grade 6. At the end of secondary school, students must pass the *examen national du baccalauréat* to access public universities. In 2015, there were 2 million children enrolled in the public education system from preschool (*Année Préparatoire*) at five years of age to the end of high school. The private sector is small but growing; only 11 percent of schools overall are privately run. In the primary cycle, the number of private schools has increased rapidly since 2010, increasing from 109 to 401 private schools in 2016 (representing 8 percent of the total number of primary schools).

5. **Enrollment in preschool has witnessed rapid but unequal growth in the last decade.** In 2016, public preschool enrollment reached 52,238 children, up from 23,756 in 2005. In 2016, 86 percent of children in first grade had completed one year of preschool.<sup>6</sup> Primary school enrollment is near-universal for boys and girls, while lower and upper secondary enrollment is around 76 percent, and is higher for females than males (86 percent of females compared to 75 percent of males aged 12-18).<sup>7</sup>

6. **Other education indicators paint a mixed picture of the status of the education sector.** Student-teacher ratios and class sizes in primary school have been declining and are, on average, favorable. The student-teacher ratio declined from 28 in 1990 to 17 in 2016. Class sizes also became smaller, from 30 students in 1990 to 23 in 2016. Student-teacher ratios and class sizes are comparable with the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) averages. In the academic year 2015-16, for the primary cycle, the promotion rate was 86.7 percent, the repetition rate was 12.2 percent, and the dropout rate was 1.1 percent. The situation changes at the lower and upper secondary levels, where drop-out and repetition are more significant issues. For secondary education, repetition rates increase to 20 percent, and dropout to 13 percent, both disproportionately affecting male students.<sup>8</sup> This gap begins in primary school, where learning outcomes are assessed using a framework of the competency-based approach. Students pass through the primary cycle according to a regulatory framework determined by the Ministry of Education (MOE). Internal efficiency, measured by another grade repetition metric, is low: 43 percent of 15-year-old Tunisian students have repeated a grade at some point, the second highest repetition rate of all countries participating in the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA 2015) and three times higher than the OECD average.<sup>9</sup>

7. **Budget allocations for education exceed averages for MENA countries and international benchmarks and are mostly used to cover recurrent salary expenditures.** In 2016, the education budget increased by more than 10 percent and represented 18.7 percent of the national budget and around five percent of GDP. Between 2005 and 2016, the MOE's budget grew at an annual rate of 8.2 percent. In 2017, only around four percent of the MOE budget was allocated to capital expenditures, most of which was infrastructure-related. 93 percent of the overall budget is on salaries for teachers, personnel, and administrators with less than three percent for spending on inputs such as school operating costs, learning

---

<sup>5</sup> République Tunisienne. Ministère de l'Éducation. L'éducation en chiffres. Année scolaire 2016/2017

<sup>6</sup> *Idem*

<sup>7</sup> *Idem*

<sup>8</sup> *Idem*

<sup>9</sup> PISA 2015 Results (Volume II): Policies and Practices for Successful Schools. Annex B Table II.5.9 Grade repetition. OECD 2016 / <http://gpseducation.oecd.org/CountryProfile?primaryCountry=TUN&threshold=10&topic=PI>

materials and teacher professional development. The budget for salary expenditures increased by 54 percent in nominal terms between 2012 and 2017, while the budget for investment decreased by 26 percent. The increase in salary expenditures can be attributed to the recruitment of thousands of additional teachers and administrative staff after the revolution in 2011. Only 34 percent of the education budget goes to preschool and primary education<sup>10</sup>, despite evidence showing high returns to early childhood education. The largest share of the budget, 62 percent, is allocated to lower and upper secondary, with the remaining four percent going to general support services. On average, unit costs at all levels of education have increased by 2.9 percent annually since 2010; these grew faster in secondary education (3.9 percent) compared to primary education (2.5 percent).

**8. The system produces low levels of student learning as measured by international and national assessments.** Tunisia has participated in the PISA from 2003 to 2015. The average scores in science, mathematics and reading have all decreased from 2012 to 2015, although some improvements have been made from 2003 to 2012. The 75th percentile in Tunisia performs below the 25th percentile of the OECD average on PISA, placing Tunisian 15-year-olds at around three years of schooling below the OECD average.<sup>11</sup> Results from the 2011 Trends in Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) results tell a similar story for primary school learning outcomes: 65 percent of 4th graders do not reach the lowest international level in mathematics and science. Out of the 30 percent of 6th graders who elect to take the highly selective exam to access elite public middle schools, 55 percent score zero in mathematics. On national measures of Grade 12 student achievement, the *baccalauréat*, success rates have declined in the last five years with only 43 percent of students passing in 2015.<sup>12</sup> There are wide regional disparities in these results—Sfax, for example, had a pass rate of 67 percent in 2016, compared to only 37 percent in Kasserine. These results point to a need for targeted interventions in the most disadvantaged areas.

**9. The government has laid out strategic orientations for the improvement of pre-tertiary education in its 2016-2020 Five-Year Plan (*Plan Quinquennal*).** The priority programs outlined in these documents include increasing access to and quality of preprimary education, strengthening programs for teacher education and training, strengthening systems for learning assessment, and reviewing the functions and tasks of the different governmental bodies in education. The MOE has identified some major challenges restricting improvement in education outcomes relevant to the Project, such as: (a) uneven access to preschool and limited early learning opportunities for 5-year-olds living in disadvantaged areas; (b) the presence of thousands of untrained teachers practicing with limited pedagogical skills and weak content knowledge; (c) the lack of school leadership and limited role of primary school directors; (d) the lack of standardized, reliable, comparable data on what students in primary school are learning; (e) governance challenges due to the complexity and multiplicity of functions and responsibilities between different administrative units and (f) the limited budget for much needed capital expenditures in both infrastructure and high-quality teacher professional development programs. The following paragraphs detail how the Project will address the priorities and challenges in pre- and primary education outlined in the MOE's strategy.

---

<sup>10</sup> Zaafrane 2017.

<sup>11</sup> World Bank PISA 2015 Tunisia Country Brief

<sup>12</sup> Females outperform males on the *baccalauréat*; in 2016, 63 percent of the *baccalauréat* graduates were girls.

10. **The first challenge relates to the limited supply of preschool classrooms in lagging regions<sup>13</sup>, which has been a constraint to reducing inequality in educational outcomes.** Global evidence shows that high-quality preschool education contributes to school readiness and later academic achievement through the development of a range of skills, such as skills in reading and mathematics, and in attention, effort, initiative, and behavior.<sup>14</sup> Moreover, studies show that children who attend preschool are less likely to repeat classes or drop out of education.

11. **The MOE has made significant progress toward the universalization of one year of preschool for children five years of age, although it is currently neither mandatory nor free.** The MOE has almost doubled the supply of preschool classrooms in the last decade, from 1,256 (28 percent of schools) in 2005 to 2,194 (48 percent of schools) in 2016. Many decrepit, unoccupied teacher houses were quickly transformed into preschools, but without meeting the required standards for layout and surface area per child. Although the demand for preschool has been rising steadily, supply in the most disadvantaged areas has been limited, and the preschool enrollment rate varies widely across regions. On average, 81.2 percent of first graders have benefitted from preschool education, but this masks wide inequalities among regions. In Tunis, around 96 percent of first graders have had some preschool education, while in Kasserine and Kairouan, this rate is 44 percent and 55 percent, respectively. Nationwide in 2017, 34,000 children started school without any preschool experience (the equivalent of 17.6 percent of 195,000 first graders).

12. **Limited information is available on preschool quality, which is essential to positively impact children's readiness to enter first grade.** While the MOE has rapidly increased access to public preschool, it has faced challenges related to the preparation of preschool teachers. Current preschool teachers are usually former primary school teachers at the end of their careers who have received limited training. They work under the guidance of primary school directors and inspectors who also have not had learning opportunities related to preschool education. For pre-service training, a new applied bachelor degree program (2016-2017) includes a module in preschool education. In-service training of preschool teachers is the responsibility of the pedagogical inspectors. Despite the existence of some national standards for preschool, the Ministry of Education currently has limited resources to ensure that preschool classes conform to these standards. Preschool quality in Tunisia has several strengths, including a favorable average class size, adapted materials, caring educators, and equitable inclusion of special needs children. However, other key aspects could be improved. In particular, learning objectives are not clearly identified or defined; instructional techniques are mostly teacher-centered and involve collective repetition; the physical space is not flexible enough for the range of developmental activities; and the range of instructional tools utilized can be limited.<sup>15</sup> The United Nations International Children's fund (UNICEF),

---

<sup>13</sup> Lagging regions, or *regions defavorisées*, are defined using a regional development index (*indice de développement régional*) that contains 18 governorate-level variables. A simple average is taken based on these 18 variables and a threshold is established below which a governorate is considered a lagging region. Variables include education attainment levels, unemployment rate, percentage of households with piped water, child mortality and gender disparities, among others. According to recent development indices, the following governorates are considered zones defavorisées: Zaghouan, Kébili, Gabès, Mahdia, Medenine, Gafsa, Béja, Tataouine, Kef, Sidi Bouzid, Siliana, Kairouan, Kasserine, and Jendouba (Country Partnership Framework (2016–2020) for the Republic of Tunisia Report No. 104123-TN).

<sup>14</sup> In Tunisia, a recent MOE-UNICEF study demonstrates that first graders who have attended quality preschools perform better in language and mathematics than those who have not attended (after controlling for socio-economic background).

<sup>15</sup> Bausson Mt, Berger M, Berger My, Besson L. 2016. *Pour Une Cohésion De La Politique Educative En Milieu Préscolaire : Etat des Lieux de L'éducation Préscolaire en Tunisie*.



with the European Union (EU) support, has supported the MOE to prepare a new curriculum framework and standards for preschool teachers. In 2018, all preschool teachers (2500) will participate in a five-day professional development program to be trained on the new curriculum.

13. **The second challenge is the influx of untrained teachers in recent years, posing a serious constraint to learning.** After the revolution, around 20,000 untrained teachers were hired based on the candidate's age and years of unemployment as part of the government's efforts to maintain social order. Ad-hoc remedial activities provided by inspectors were insufficient to raise the quality of these new recruits. In addition, the primary teacher union successfully negotiated a reduction in the teacher working time from 20-25 hours a week to 15-18 hours. To compensate for the sudden shortage in supply of teaching hours, around 12,000 contract teachers were hired temporarily. Although most newly recruited and/or contracted primary school teachers have university-level degrees, they have had no preparation, and very limited access to continuing professional development. In recent years, teachers have been promoted automatically, based on years of service, but the practice of promotion based on performance, or the "*note pedagogique*", is expected to be re-introduced in 2019. As part of an agreement signed with the union, the MOE has agreed to gradually regularize most contract teachers without requiring any certification. Improving the skills of these primary school teachers, and improving the system for teacher professional development in general, are urgent priorities.

14. **Teacher professional development is repetitive, outdated, over-theoretical, and does not respond to teachers' needs.** A national teacher professional development program is set annually. Education and In-service Training Regional Centers (*Centre Regional de l'Éducation et de la Formation Continue* [CREFOCs]) develop their own regional programs in parallel according to guidelines provided by the central MOE. National professional development programs are based on inspectors' reports of teacher performance. At the district level, inspectors are required to deliver two training sessions a year. In general, training courses do not adequately address the heterogeneity of teachers' skill levels. Professional development is not linked to career opportunities and there is very little follow-up to monitor to what extent newly taught methods are being applied in the classroom. There is no organized peer-to-peer learning at school level to pair untrained teachers with more experienced ones. Inspectors and pedagogical counselors often lack resources to adequately respond to teacher needs, and the quality and utility of feedback to teachers are unknown. Governance of the teacher professional development system is also problematic, as there is little to no quality assurance of programs delivered. As needs for teacher professional development have increased, financing has decreased. In 2017, the MOE budget for professional development was at 0.4 percent of the overall education budget, while it was at 1.6 percent in 2006.

15. **The third challenge relates to the limited role of primary school directors and a missing culture of collaborative school leadership and improvement.** The process for selection and preparation of primary school directors needs strengthening. School directors are selected based on seniority, and unlike school leaders in middle and high schools, they are not prepared for their roles through any kind of professional development on effective school leadership. They do not have access to any financial resources, and only basic management/reporting tools are at their disposal. Primary school directors can make few decisions to improve teaching and learning. Although they are explicitly required to provide guidance to teachers on curriculum and teaching-related tasks, this role is often left to pedagogical counselors and inspectors who make periodic visits. They do not have any say in determining the selection



or removal of teachers in their schools, as this is fully determined by the MOE. School directors do not have any decision-making authority in rewarding strong performance. However, they do have full autonomy in managing the distribution of time during schooling hours and teachers' duties and responsibilities. Unlike lower and upper secondary schools, primary schools do not receive a budget due to their legal status as non-administrative public establishments. Introducing professional school management practices and empowering school leaders with skills and resources for school improvement will be an important part of the revitalization of the Tunisian primary school.

**16. The current roles of inspectors and pedagogical counselors in primary education have limited impact on teacher practices.** Around 850 pedagogical counselors report to 615 inspectors, and while they conduct regular classroom visits and give feedback to individual teachers, often the approach is not effective in promoting and supporting school-level professional interaction among teachers. Pedagogical counselors are former teachers who volunteer for the position, and are trained by inspectors for their new roles. According to the MOE General Inspection, the observation methods used by primary education inspectors are outdated and happen at most twice a year, while best practice suggests that teachers need frequent observations and feedback along with opportunities to practice and improve. Inspectors are also responsible for delivering professional development, but the style of this delivery is a traditional lecture-based approach which does not lead to changes in teacher practices.

**17. The fourth challenge relates to the policies, technical procedures, and pedagogical practices relating to learning assessments at the primary level.** MOE has a reference framework for assessment. However, there is no standardized national assessment of student performance in primary school and a lack of comparable data to support underperforming schools, improve quality, develop teacher professional development programs and promote public accountability. According to the General Directorate for Primary Education (*Direction Générale du Cycle Primaire* [DGCP]), the practice of classroom assessment by primary school teachers needs improvement. Teachers need training that allows them to gain a better understanding of how to assess student learning and how to integrate the results of classroom assessments into their teaching practices.

**18. The fifth challenge relates to Tunisia's unbalanced education budget.** Despite the growing share of education in the Government of Tunisia (GOT) budget, fewer resources are allocated for necessary capital expenditures in infrastructure, professional development, and educational innovation. Similarly, the MOE budget for non-salary recurrent expenditures to pay for training and for monitoring and assessment of learning has stagnated over the years. The physical environment of most primary schools in Tunisia has deteriorated due to a systematic lack of school maintenance and limited investments in infrastructure. This negatively impacts the learning conditions in pre- and primary education. To improve the equity, quality, and sustainability of spending in the sector, adjustments to the current budget distribution may be necessary. For this, the MOE will need to gather better information on the use of resources to ensure efficiency and effectiveness of education spending.

**19. Several initiatives are underway in collaboration with other international partners.** On pre-primary education, the World Bank and UNICEF have jointly supported the development of a multi-sectoral Early Childhood Development (ECD) strategy; the proposed project will support implementation of elements of the strategy related to preschool access and quality. The World Bank has also supported the development of a strategy for information and communication technologies (ICT) for education known

as Digital School (*Ecole numérique*) with the overall goal of improving the quality of education and the employability of students, elements of which will also be implemented through the Project. Initial teacher training programs are being improved and are currently being piloted, with an emphasis on building teachers' reflective skills. The first cohort of approximately 2,500 primary school teachers trained under this new program will graduate in June 2019. A French language assessment for all untrained teachers is underway, the results of which will be used to place teachers in an intensive language remediation program. For the preschool level, UNICEF, with EU financing under the EMORI<sup>16</sup> project (*Programme d'appui à l'éducation, la mobilité, la recherche et l'innovation*) has supported the MOE in developing a new general curriculum framework and has begun training inspectors to work on development of a new primary school curriculum. The World Bank and UNICEF are also working together with the Ministry of Social Affairs to reduce social inequalities and prevent intergenerational transmission of poverty by putting in place an integrated child-specific social protection system. The system aims to provide a monetary allocation to families with children between 7 and 17 years of age in disadvantaged regions to guarantee access to quality health and education services. In terms of civil works, the Arab Fund for Economic and Social Development has committed US\$200 million to support the construction and equipment of schools, including preschool classrooms, construction of sanitary facilities for primary schools, school canteens, and school fences. The Italian Agency for Development Cooperation will also support the construction of sanitary facilities, school canteens and playgrounds in preschools and primary schools through a new 25 million Euros commitment to start in 2019. The African Development Bank provides support in the areas of technical and technological training.

**20. The Project is designed to support the Government in addressing major challenges in the primary education cycle by directing resources towards key areas that can have a transformative impact on student learning.** The Project interventions will focus on expanding access to quality early childhood education, strengthening literacy and numeracy in the early grades, improving teacher skills, and improving school management and accountability<sup>17</sup>, and student assessment. Based on the principle that real improvement in education quality can only come from within the school, the Project will aim to empower school leaders and instructional staff to work collaboratively to raise student achievement and other dimensions of school quality. This change is expected to result from a set of activities, including the introduction of management and leadership skills for primary school directors (including effective parental engagement), the provision of effective and relevant teacher professional development programs for untrained and unprepared pre- and primary school teachers, and supportive coaching and mentoring techniques for inspectors and pedagogical counselors. The establishment of a reliable and robust student assessment system for the purposes of identification and remediation of low performing schools and at-risk students is expected, in the long term, to lead to gains in efficiency and effectiveness. The Project will also help accelerate the Government's efforts to exploit the use of digital tools throughout the education system (for professional development, classroom instruction, and for monitoring and reporting). At the same time, the Project will support management systems at the central and regional levels.

---

<sup>16</sup> EMORI Project is a Euro 65 million financing from the EU for the GoT for education. Euro 38 million is education budget support, while Euro 12 million is executed by UNICEF for specific activities in pre- and primary education and 21<sup>st</sup> century life skills. Euro 15 million finances other Government-EU partnership activities.

<sup>17</sup> This approach follows the E4C framework which was developed by the World Bank and the IsDB and endorsed by all Arab Ministers of Education in December 2016.

21. **The Project will also incentivize a gradual shift from financing of inputs to financing based on results.** Using a results-based financing approach will increase the overall results orientation of the government's strategy by linking disbursements to the achievement of key results. The approach will contribute to strengthening the education system because it is geared towards changing improving behaviors towards good governance. Disbursement-linked indicators (DLI) will help shift the policy dialogue toward results, especially in the initial years as they will be used to leverage the government's investments in data systems and to institutionalize a culture of measurement and utilization of results.

### **C. Link to CPF**

22. **The proposed Project will support results from Pillar II: Reducing regional disparities and Pillar III: Promoting increased social inclusion of the Country Partnership Framework (CPF) FY 2016–2020.**<sup>18</sup>

The CPF underlines the strong links between education and poverty and vulnerability in Tunisia. The most vulnerable population groups are characterized by household heads with no or some primary education. Almost half of poor households in Tunisia are headed by individuals with no education. In contrast, the least vulnerable population groups have household heads with secondary or university education. Unsurprisingly, education attainment, along with region and urban/rural location, explains around 75–90 percent of the observed gaps in access to public services, such as quality education, water and sanitation. Through its interventions, the Project will contribute to the CPF objectives: 2.1 Improved access to and quality of services in lagging regions, and 3.3 Improved and more equitable social programs. By increasing the supply of preschool services in lagging districts, the Project reinforces the goals of a World Bank Development Policy Operation under preparation that will support the Ministry of Social Affairs in the establishment of an integrated social protection system for children in the most disadvantaged areas.

23. The project is aligned with the World Bank Group's goals of ending extreme poverty and boosting shared prosperity in a sustainable manner. It also contributes to the implementation of the Middle East and North Africa Regional Strategy pillar of renewing the social contract by improving learning conditions in public primary schools across Tunisia, expanding access to preschool in selected districts, investing in much-needed capacity building of teachers and school leaders, and strengthening measurement of and transparency in learning outcomes.

## **II. PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

### **A. Project Development Objective (PDO)**

24. The objectives of the Project are to improve learning conditions in public preschools and primary schools, and to increase access to public preschool education in selected districts.

---

<sup>18</sup> Report No. 104123-TN. Discussed by the Board of Executive Directors on May 17, 2016.

## **B. Project Beneficiaries**

25. The direct project beneficiaries based on 2017 data from the Ministry of Education include 1,144,000 students attending public preschool and primary school; 64,000 teachers in public primary education who would benefit from improved opportunities for professional development; 5,360 school directors and deputy directors; 615 pedagogical inspectors; and 850 pedagogical counselors.

## **C. PDO-Level Results Indicators**

26. The PDO-level results indicators are as follows:
- Children enrolled in public preschool in targeted districts, disaggregated by gender and by urban/rural areas;
  - Primary school directors demonstrating new school leadership practices after training (disaggregated by gender);
  - Trained preschool and primary teachers demonstrating skills learned through the core professional development program (disaggregated by gender).

## **D. Project Components**

27. The Project will adopt a financing structure with an investment project financing (IPF) portion for Components 1, 2 and 4 and sub-components 3.1 and 3.2, and a results-based funding (RBF) portion using Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) for sub-component 3.3.

### **Component 1: Improving quality and increasing supply of public preschool education (total cost: US\$19.6 million; World Bank: US\$19.6 million)**

28. The Project will support MOE's strategy aimed at providing universal access to quality preschool services for all children of five years of age to prepare learners for success in primary school and beyond. The Project will impact key domains of child development in preschool while increasing access to public preschools in 31 mostly poor selected districts (the list of districts is included in the Project Operations Manual [POM]). An innovative contribution of the Project will be the introduction and use of a preschool quality assurance mechanism (DLI #1) to measure progress in service delivery and child development.

#### **Sub-component 1.1: Professional development program for public preschool teachers**

29. The objective of this sub-component is to finance the design and delivery of an advanced professional development program for all public preschool teachers in Tunisia based on the recently approved national preschool curriculum. The General Directorate for Primary Education (*Direction Générale du Cycle Primaire* [DGCP]), the General Directorate for Programs and In-Service Training (*Direction Générale des Programmes et de la Formation Continue* [DGFCP]), the International Center for Training of Trainers and Educational Innovation (*Centre International de Formation des Formateurs et d'Innovation Pédagogique* [CIIFFIP]) and the National Center for Technologies in Education (*Centre National des Technologies en Education* [CNTE]) will be responsible for content development and training master trainers. Delivery to teachers will take place in the CREFOCs, virtually, and within primary schools. Preschool teachers will participate in face-to-face and distance learning modules. The training modules

will to help the teachers to improve classroom practices, including gender-sensitive classroom management. This includes equipping teachers with the concepts, skills and attitudes to encourage equal participation of girls and boys.

30. The pedagogical counselors and inspectors will also participate in parts of the professional development program, so that they provide in-class coaching. To ensure that children enrolled in non-public preschools also benefit from trained teachers, those teachers will be eligible to participate in parts of the professional development program.

31. All preschool teachers will benefit from regular professional development. The professional development of preschool teachers will also benefit from the strengthening of primary school leadership under sub-component 2.1, which will seek to increase the collaboration and exchange between preschool and primary education in one school learning community.

#### **Sub-component 1.2: Provision of instructional materials for preschool**

32. While the MOE has opened many new preschool classrooms in recent years, it has been unable to provide a range of quality instructional materials. The lack of pedagogical resources is a serious impediment for quality preschool education. Therefore, the objective of this sub-component is to ensure that new and existing classrooms have the necessary instructional materials, linked to the new curriculum, for use in preschool classrooms and that materials are sensitive to the different educational needs of girls and boys. The Project will develop and/or procure and distribute these pedagogical resources and will train teachers on their effective use based on students' needs. For the first time, the MOE will use the preschool quality assurance mechanism introduced under sub-component 1.3 to monitor the availability the instructional materials and how instructional materials are used by teachers in daily interactions with the children in preschool classrooms.

#### **Sub-component 1.3: Implementation of a preschool quality assurance mechanism**

33. The MOE does not have any instrument at its disposal to monitor the quality of preschool services. The MOE is unable to take corrective actions to improve preschool services based on measurement and evidence. Therefore, the objective of this sub-component is to build capacity for measuring quality in preschool education. This subcomponent will finance the development of a quality measurement tool, an adaptation of the Measuring Early Learning Quality and Outcomes (MELQO) instrument (or similar), which measures both the quality of the learning environment and child development. Training modules on quality and results obtained from the use of these instruments will be integrated into the professional development program. A network of key preschool specialists will be trained to implement the measurement tools. Results from the first round will be used as a baseline to measure improvements in overall preschool quality and to inform changes to preschool policies and practices.

34. The introduction of the preschool quality assurance mechanism will be used as a DLI under sub-component 3.3. This will be an important contribution of the Project to introduce results-based management in support of the MOE strategy to monitor and improve the quality of public preschool services. The DLI will incentivize the official adoption of the tool to ensure sustainability.

#### **Sub-component 1.4: Increasing the supply of public preschool classrooms in selected districts**

35. The challenge of providing one year of preschool to all children of five years of age in Tunisia has not yet been met. The MOE has selected an initial list of 31 school districts in 12 regions (9 regions are among the 15 targeted lagging regions) based on a targeting methodology that accounts for education, basic social services, distance to schools, and economic development indicators. In these 31 districts, approximately 10,000 children enter first grade each year without any preschool. This accounts for 30.3 percent of the total number of children (33,000) who did not have access to preschool in Tunisia in 2017. Therefore, the objective of this sub-component is to build at least 250 preschool classrooms in areas where there are no other service providers.

36. All public primary schools without preschool classrooms have been identified, and schools without a preschool and with at least 10 children enrolled in the first grade will benefit from the construction of a preschool classroom (and corresponding sanitary blocks). The construction will take place within the premises of existing public primary school sites. A standard MOE school design will be used with technical specifications that ensure the learning environment is suitable for the range of activities in the preschool curriculum. This sub-component will mainly benefit young learners from rural areas who currently have no access to public preschool, private kindergartens, or koranic schools. By the end of the Project, it is expected that at least 250 new preschool classrooms will have been built, providing access to 5,000<sup>19</sup> additional 5-year-olds. New classrooms will also be furnished and equipped appropriately. Exterior spaces will be refurbished and equipped with playgrounds.

#### **Component 2: Improving learning conditions in public primary schools (total cost: US\$46.6 million; World Bank: US\$46.6 million)**

37. The objective of this component is to improve a set of factors that directly affect learning in primary school, namely (i) school leadership, (ii) skills and knowledge of untrained primary school teachers, (iii) the quality of instructional support to teachers, and (iv) the physical school environment. Some of the interventions, such as the rehabilitation of primary schools will target the same 31 districts as in sub-component 1.4. Other interventions, such as strengthening school leadership and support for the professional development of primary school inspectors and pedagogical counselors, will benefit all primary schools.

##### **Sub-component 2.1: Strengthening school leadership**

38. The objective of this sub-component is to improve school management and performance through better prepared primary school directors. This sub-component will provide a program of professional development for at least 3,000 primary school directors and deputy directors. School directors will participate in a professional development program on leadership, effective methods and tools of primary

---

<sup>19</sup> To achieve universal access, the MOE needs around 1,650 additional preschool classrooms nationwide (assuming 20 children per preschool classroom to reach 33,000 children). In the 31 targeted districts in which civil works for preschool classrooms are planned, around 9,500 of 18,000, or approximately 50 percent, first-graders in 2016 had not had access to preschool. Investing in preschool classroom construction will enable 5000 additional children to attend, meeting 50 percent of the determined need in the selected districts.



school management, collaboration for school improvement, and engaging parents and the school community. Through a cascade model, a network of carefully selected, experienced, and high-performing school directors will form the core group of trainers to be trained at the CIFFIP. Delivery to school directors will be through face-to-face modules in CREFOCs. Inspectors will also participate in select activities to better support the implementation of the new leadership practices of school directors. The school directors will have access to digital tools to complete the distance learning modules and participate in a community of practice. With support from key school staff, the school principal will form a school leadership team, which will conduct a self-review of the school's performance on key domains such as teaching and learning, community engagement, and the student environment. Based on the self-review, the school leadership team would develop a school improvement plan with actions to address the quality of teaching and learning and other dimensions of quality. School directors who complete the program would be eligible for a school grant to implement school improvement activities. For primary schools to receive grants, their legal status would have to be amended (DLI 2.1), and policies and procedures established. A draft law is currently under review. Once adopted, the POM will be revised to include the description of the primary school grant mechanism. Disbursement on school grants will be conditional on complying with these conditions to be reviewed and agreed upon with the World Bank. School leaders and other staff would also be required to undergo capacity building related to budgeting, financial management, and monitoring and reporting on the use of these grants. These grants would permit primary school leaders, along with the school council, which includes parent representation, to directly implement a range of activities to improve the quality of their school. Dimensions of school quality would be defined in a framework document to be included in the professional development program for primary school principals.

39. A key element of the professional development program for school directors will be effective parental engagement. School directors will learn innovative approaches to engage parents and involve them more fully in the educational process. These approaches would include but would not be limited to regular information-sharing with parents through text message or other platforms. School leaders will be encouraged to engage parents through volunteer activities that they may do with their children at school or at home.

#### **Sub-component 2.2: Upskilling primary school teachers**

40. The objective of this sub-component is to improve teacher pedagogical skills and content knowledge in key subjects taught in primary education. To ensure that classrooms are led by teachers with a minimum skill level, around 14,000 untrained teachers nationwide will participate in a hybrid professional development program that includes virtual, face-to-face, and classroom-based support. This program will be jointly developed by the DGFPC and DGCP and will focus on key teacher competencies in Arabic, French, mathematics, and science. The curriculum for the professional development of primary teachers and the methods for its implementation will be designed under the Project. Diagnostic tools will be used to define the different needs of male and female teachers. Based on this, the content for the training of trainers will be developed through technical assistance, with the CNTE supporting the development of digital content through a consultative process that includes the viewpoints and experiences of male and female teachers as well as students. Training of trainers will be provided within the CIFFIP. The face-to-face part of the professional development programs tailored to incorporate the different needs of male and female teachers will be implemented by trainers in CREFOCs. Support will be

provided to CREFOCs to cover the operational costs of face-to-face training. Digital tools, as well as training on their use, will be provided, and digital educational resources will be made available to teachers to carry out distance learning activities. Teacher learning resources will include digital access to high quality lesson plans<sup>20</sup> to be used by teachers and inspectors during classroom visits. Digital tools for the management of professional development will be developed under sub-component 3.1 to allow teachers, instructional support staff, and school directors to plan, track, and monitor differentiated professional development needs and progress.

### **Sub-component 2.3: Improving the quality of instructional support to primary school teachers**

41. The objective of this sub-component is to shift the existing model of instructional support from control to one of coaching and mentoring. Teams of inspectors and pedagogical counselors will learn to adopt new approaches and effective techniques to better support teachers in the classroom and to improve the quality and type of feedback teachers receive. This new coaching model, supported by technical assistance, is expected to increase collaboration and adoption of innovative and effective teaching practices within the school. Inspectors, pedagogical counselors and school directors equipped with new leadership skills are expected to organize regular reflective sessions with teachers within their respective schools and with other primary schools in the vicinity. This collaborative practice of “lesson study” would target an identified area for development in their student learning. Using existing evidence, instructional staff could collaboratively plan, teach, and observe a series of lessons. Discussion, reflection, and expert input will help teachers track and refine their interventions. The MOE will introduce digital tools that can be used for distance learning, for example, to record and show lessons that teachers and inspectors can analyze together.

### **Sub-component 2.4: Promoting literacy-rich classroom environments**

42. The objective of this sub-component is to improve student literacy skills through regular reading activities in school and at home. To ensure that students interact more with books, spend more time reading, exhibit more positive attitudes toward reading, and reach higher levels of reading achievement, selected primary classrooms will be equipped with well-designed reading corners. These reading corners will provide students with access to high-quality reading materials that they are interested in reading and are able to read with success. Reading corners will serve to complement teacher-led instruction in literacy skills. Student opinions will be considered in determining the choice of books. Some primary classrooms will also be equipped with digital books on a pilot basis.

### **Sub-component 2.5: Improving the physical environment of public primary schools in selected districts**

43. The objective of this sub-component is to improve primary school facilities to promote a better teaching and learning experience for staff and students. The MOE has invested little to improve primary school facilities over the years. On the annual survey of needs carried out by school directors, the MOE reported that 600 primary schools (approximately 13 percent of total primary schools) did not have access to water. This sub-component will finance small rehabilitation and/or refurbishment of targeted primary

---

<sup>20</sup> Emma Dorn, Marc Krawitz, Chadi Moujaes, *Mona Mourshed*, *Stephen Hall*, and *Dirk Schmautzer*. Drivers of student performance: Insights from the Middle East and North Africa. McKinsey & Company. Report October 2017.



schools to ensure that they meet minimum standards such as access to water, electricity, connectivity, classroom furniture, and outdoor spaces. Rehabilitation works will be estimated concurrently with the construction of preschool classrooms so that one contract is prepared for work in each targeted primary school. The cost of primary school rehabilitation will be capped at US\$30,000 per school. The Project will help the MOE to improve the maintenance for primary schools as well as to gradually increase the share of its budget allocated to the rehabilitation of school facilities.

**Component 3: Strengthening management practices in the education sector (total cost: US\$62.5 million; World Bank: US\$32.5 million)**

44. The objective of this component is to: (i) develop and reinforce the tools and management practices used at the central MOE and in the regional offices for the improvement of learning conditions in the primary cycle; and (ii) strengthen results-based management in the MOE using the results-based financing for sub-component 3.3.

**Sub-component 3.1: Management of primary school teacher professional development**

45. The objective of this sub-component is to improve the effectiveness of the teacher professional development system. This sub-component will design and implement a digital tool for better management and tracking of individual teacher professional development pathways. Given that teachers have different professional development needs and different starting points, the system will allow them to customize a development plan based on their current needs in consultation with their respective inspectors and pedagogical counselors. The offer of professional development of all types (virtual, face-to-face, school-level) will be available. The system will also be open to school directors and other end-users for monitoring.

**Sub-component 3.2: Implementing and utilizing learning assessments to strengthen instruction**

46. The objective of this sub-component is to generate reliable data on student learning that can help inform changes in instructional practices. This sub-component will support the development, implementation, and effective utilization of learning assessments in primary school. Technical assistance has been provided during Project preparation to identify the critical steps needed to implement the student assessment system. The MOE has reiterated its support to monitoring progress overall and targeting interventions for low performing schools. An early grade reading (EGRA) and mathematics (EGMA) assessments will also be adapted and implemented in a sample of 2nd and 3rd grade classrooms. Results of the EGRA and EGMA will be used to identify specific areas for intervention and support.

47. Second, a broader curriculum-based national assessment will be designed and implemented for a nationally-representative sample of primary school students. Results of this assessment will be disseminated and shared with regional commissioners of education to enable them to plan and implement appropriate interventions based on results of the learning assessment. The CIFFIP will be responsible for the implementation of this task in close collaboration with the DGCP and other relevant departments. Both the EGRA and the national learning assessment will require technical assistance and capacity building for relevant staff.

### **Sub-component 3.3: Supporting results-based management**

48. The objective of this sub-component is to support results-based management to increase MOE accountability and ownership for achieving key results under the Project. To achieve the identified results under the DLIs (see Table 1 below), the MOE will use the Eligible Expenditure Programs (EEPs) identified in its budget and resources from the loan proceeds. A total of US\$60 million is expected to be allocated for the EEPs by the MOE during the next five years.

49. The EEPs will finance operating costs of the CREFOCs, Education Regional Offices (*Commissariat Régional de l'Éducation* [CREs]), CIFFIP and CNTE. These four institutions will play a key role for the achievement of the Project objectives as they will contribute to the improvement of learning conditions in public preschools and primary schools through: (a) training activities to strengthen the capacity relevant personnel in the MOE; (b) activities to support public primary school maintenance; and (c) activities to support the development of distance learning platforms and training modules.

50. The list of indicative EEPs is as follows:

- Non-salary recurrent expenditures allocated through the MOE's budget for the 26 CREFOCs, responsible for professional development activities to benefit preschool and primary school teachers, school directors, inspectors and pedagogical counsellors. Expenditures include payments incurred by the CREFOCs for utilities, small supplies, travel and non-consulting services.
- Non-salary recurrent expenditures allocated through the MOE's budget for the 26 CREs, responsible for maintenance and general supervision of pre- and primary schools. Expenditures include payments incurred by the CREs for utilities, small supplies, travel and non-consulting services.
- Non-salary recurrent expenditures allocated through the MOE's budget for the CIFFIP, responsible for the training of trainers in professional development activities and the development of professional development programs. Expenditures include payments incurred by the CIFFIP for utilities, small supplies and non-consulting services.
- Non-salary recurrent expenditures allocated through the MOE's budget for the CNTE, responsible for the preparation of digital tools and content for distance learning used in professional development programs. Expenditures include payments incurred by the CNTE for utilities, small supplies and non-consulting services.

**Table 1: Summary of DLIs**

<b>Component 3.3: Results-based funding to strengthen the foundations for learning</b>	
DLI 1	Quality assurance mechanism for public preschool education established
DLI 2	Public primary schools receive and manage funds to improve quality
DLI 3	Improved teacher classroom practices
DLI 4	Strengthened measurement and use of learning outcomes to inform policy
DLI 5	Key investment programs in the education sector are prioritized

**Component 4: Project Management Support (total cost: US\$1.3 million; World Bank: US\$1.3 million)**

51. This subcomponent will cover project management, including the monitoring and evaluation of Project progress and results.

52. The Project Management Unit by Objective (*Unité de Gestion de Projet par Objectif* [UGPO]) will be responsible for coordinating Project activities and reporting on follow-ups. In these reports, the data will be disaggregated by CRE and gender. A grievance mechanism (GRM) will be established at the UGPO with parallel mechanisms in all regions involved in civil works and in CREs for professional development programs. Quarterly reports will be sent from the delegations to the UGPO related to the GRM.

53. Strengthening the quality and frequency of communication around these interventions, both within and outside the Ministry of Education, will be key to encouraging a change in attitude and behavior. Effective communication between the central level and regions and schools, as well as the public, is essential to achieve the objectives set for this Project. Specific support activities to improve communication regarding current and future activities will be included in this sub-component.

**E. Project Cost and Financing**

54. The proposed instrument for the Project is Investment Project Financing (IPF) with DLIs to be implemented over five years. Total project cost is US\$130 million with US\$100 million financed by IBRD and US\$30 million financed by the borrower. Disbursements under sub-component 3.3 will be triggered by the verification of achievement of DLIs and the documented execution of the EEPs in selected MOE budget line items. Up to a maximum of US\$30 million will be disbursed through the RBF mechanism.

55. The RBF mechanism rewards the MOE for achieving key results related to the project objectives and supporting medium-term goals for the education sector sustainability. This approach will enhance the impact of the World Bank's financial and technical support and increase the overall results orientation of the MOE's strategy. The DLIs will be a critical tool for shifting the policy dialogue toward results.

56. The Project comprises 5 DLIs with a total of 17 Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs). An amount of US\$30 million will be allocated for the results-based activities in sub-component 3.3. Each DLR is priced at a value reflecting its significance in the results chain and incentivizing the achievement of the respective result. Some DLIs are scalable. The World Bank Financial Management Guidelines will apply to the EEPs. Upon achievement of the DLIs, as ascertained through an agreed protocol, amounts claimed will be capped at the amounts of the agreed DLIs and transferred from the loan account to the Public Treasury.

**Table 2: Project Cost and Financing**

<b>Project Components</b>	<b>Project Cost (US\$)</b>	<b>IBRD Financing (US\$)</b>	<b>% IBRD Financing</b>
<b>Component 1: Improving quality and increasing supply of preschool education</b>	<b>19,600,000</b>	<b>19,600,000</b>	<b>100</b>
1.1 Professional development program for preschool teachers	2,600,000	2,600,000	
1.2 Provision of instructional materials for preschool	1,500,000	1,500,000	
1.3 Implementation of preschool quality assurance mechanism	500,000	500,000	
1.4 Increasing the supply of public preschool classrooms in selected districts	15,000,000	15,000,000	
<b>Component 2: Improving learning conditions in public primary schools</b>	<b>46,600,000</b>	<b>46,600,000</b>	<b>100</b>
2.1 Strengthening school leadership	3,000,000	3,000,000	
2.2 Upskilling teachers	24,000,000	24,000,000	
2.3 Improving the quality of instructional support to teachers	1,300,000	1,300,000	
2.4 Promoting literacy-rich classroom environments	3,600,000	3,600,000	
2.5 Improving the physical environment of public primary schools in selected districts	14,700,000	14,700,000	
<b>Component 3: Strengthening Management Practices in the Education Sector</b>	<b>62,500,000</b>	<b>32,500,000</b>	<b>52.0</b>
3.1 Management of teacher professional development	600,000	600,000	
3.2 Implementing and utilizing learning assessments to improve instruction	1,900,000	1,900,000	
3.3 Supporting results-based management	60,000,000	30,000,000	50
<b>Component 4: Project Management Support</b>	<b>1,300,000</b>	<b>1,300,000</b>	<b>100</b>
<b>Total Project costs</b>	<b>130,000,000</b>	<b>100,000,000</b>	<b>76.9</b>
Front-End Fee	250,000	250,000	100
<b>Total Financing Required</b>	<b>130,000,000*</b>	<b>100,000,000</b>	<b>76.9</b>

*Note:* \* Total Project costs were calculated based on the EEPs' budget amounts for 2018–23 and the Bank loan amount. Budget amounts per year were based on the 2018 Annual Budget Law and forecasts for 2017–19 by introducing an inflation rate of 5 percent per year. Exchange rate: US\$1 = DNT2.39 (dated March 31, 2018; *Source:* Central Bank of Tunisia).

### III. IMPLEMENTATION

#### A. Institutional and Implementation Arrangements

57. The MOE will be responsible for implementing the Project. The UGPO within the MOE will oversee the overall fiduciary management for the Project. In this capacity, the UGPO will update and monitor procurement plans and produce relevant management reports in collaboration with the units responsible

for the implementation of the Project activities. This unit will also liaise with the World Bank and will be responsible for reporting to the World Bank on fiduciary matters. The UGPO is fully staffed and has prior experience with the management of World Bank-financed projects.

58. A Project Coordinator will be nominated by the MOE. The Project Coordinator will be responsible for coordinating the Project implementation and liaising with all the units involved in the Project. The Project Coordinator and the UGPO General Director will be the World Bank main interlocutors. The Project Coordinator will report to the Project Steering Committee (PSC). The overall strategic direction for the Project will be provided by the (PSC). The main role of the PSC will be to provide guidance to the Project, approve annual work programs and budgets, and coordinate with other education sector interventions. The PSC will meet twice a year. The Project Coordinator and PSC will be established no later than three months after Project effectiveness.

59. The execution of all civil works will be under the joint responsibility of the General Directorate for Civil Works (*Direction Générale des Bâtiments et des Equipments* [DGBE]), the General Directorate for Studies, Planning and Information System (*Direction Générale des Etudes, de la Planification et du Système d'Information* [DGEPSI]), the DGCP and the CREs. The UGPO will carry out the overall planning and procurement for civil works while the CREs will be responsible for conducting site studies. CREs will hire local engineers and architects to prepare the technical specifications for the civil works.

60. The execution of professional development activities for teachers, school directors, pedagogical counselors and inspectors will be under the joint responsibility of the CIFIIP, DGPFC, the DGCP and the CREFOCs. It is expected that financial transfers will be executed from the MOE project account to the CREFOCs and CIFIIP to finance the activities related to the Project.<sup>21</sup> To prepare the syllabi and modules of the professional development programs for teachers, school directors, inspectors and pedagogical counselors, the Project will recruit global and/or regional expertise to provide technical assistance. When possible, the MOE will partner with national and international universities to support the evidence-based development of the training programs. Professional development programs will usually begin with the training of master trainers by experts, and then trainers will deliver training to teachers, school directors, inspectors and pedagogical counselors in the CREFOCs. During regular school visits, the inspectors will assess the extent to which the trained teachers make use of their new skills in the classroom. The inspectors, pedagogical counselors and school directors will work together to identify strengths and weaknesses in the use of new teacher skills, and this would be reported to the DGPFC and trainers who in turn will take corrective actions in the program design as needed. The CIFIIP will oversee the development of the national student assessment. The CNTE will be responsible for development of the online training platform, to produce digital content, and for the management of digital tools for professional development. The CNTE will identify its need for technical assistance to ensure that innovations in education technology are incorporated in the development of accessible and user-friendly online content for education personnel in the field. The MOE will set up a Technical Coordination Committee for the activities related to professional development and national assessments before the launch of the Project.

61. As mentioned under sub-component 2.1, public primary school will be eligible to receive a grant to implement school improvement activities. To receive these grants, primary school legal status will need

---

<sup>21</sup> CIFIIP and CREFOC are public entities with financial autonomy with their budget with the MOE's budget (*Etablissements Publics à Caractère Non Administratif* [EPNA])

to be amended first (DLR 2.1), and policies (eligibility criteria) and procedures will be established. The POM will be revised to include the description of the primary school grant mechanism.

62. The detailed responsibilities, implementation arrangements, detailed arrangements for procurement, action plans, calendar of execution, result indicators and monitoring and evaluation protocols for each subcomponent are described in the POM. The POM was prepared by the UGPO and agreed with the World Bank.

## **B. Results Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements**

63. The monitoring of outcomes/results will be based on the agreed Results Framework and monitoring arrangements that are described in detail in the POM. Data will be disaggregated by district, region, and gender when relevant to track the Project's impact on various groups in lagging regions.

64. The monitoring of outcomes will be done at the country level led by the UGPO and DGEPSI. The monitoring will be conducted within the framework of the preparation of a Semiannual Progress Report (SPR), and Annual Progress Report (APR). These reports will present progress in respect of the monitoring indicators in the Results Framework. They will also include information about any grievances received and actions taken in relation to grievances.

65. The verification of achievement of DLIs/DLRs will be undertaken in ways that are both credible and sustainable by using, to the fullest extent possible, existing government systems for oversight and monitoring, paired with an independent or third-party agent. The verification protocols vary according to the nature of the DLIs, and will include the review of administrative documents and data, consultations with beneficiaries, and spot checks of schools or other MOE entities, as described in the verification protocols in Table B.2 below. The selection of the Verification Agency will be completed before the assessment of the first DLRs is due.

66. The World Bank will conduct semi-annual implementation support missions to review progress in the achievement of the Project's development objectives and outcomes. Financial management reviews will be conducted four times a year.

## **IV. PROJECT ASSESSMENT SUMMARY**

### **A. Theory of Change/Results Chain**

**Table 3: Results Chain**

<b>Activities</b>	<b>Outputs</b>	<b>Project Outcomes</b>	<b>Higher-level Objectives</b>
<b>Component 1: Improving quality and increasing supply of preschool education</b>			
1.1 Professional development program for preschool teachers	Preschool teachers completing preschool professional development program	Preschool teachers have increased capacity and access to appropriate	

		educational materials	
1.2 Provision of instructional materials for preschool	Preschool classrooms received teaching and learning materials		
1.3 Implementation of a preschool quality assurance mechanism	Preschool classrooms that have been evaluated using the new quality assurance mechanism		
1.4 Increase the supply of public preschool classrooms in selected districts	Preschool classrooms built	Children in rural lagging districts have access to well-equipped preschool classrooms	
Component 2: Improving learning conditions in public primary schools			
2.1 Strengthening school leadership	School directors and deputy directors completing the new leadership program	School leaders demonstrating improved management practices (set goals with teachers, give feedback on lesson plans and teacher performance, support teachers in classroom assessments, use data to evaluate learning needs)	
2.2 Upskilling teachers	Teachers completing core professional development program	Teachers with improved pedagogical skills and content knowledge	
2.3 Improving the quality of instructional support to teachers	Inspectors and pedagogical counselors provide in-class coaching and support	Teachers using more effective pedagogical skills and improve their practice. The quality of instructional support to teachers is improved.	
2.4 Promoting literacy-rich classroom environments	Number of primary school classrooms equipped with a reading corner	Students afforded access to high-quality reading materials to support language learning	
2.5 Improving the physical environment of public primary schools in	Schools meet minimum standards	Physical environment is improved to increase motivation and	



selected districts		commitment to better school performance	the resources and data to improve student learning
Component 3: Strengthening management practices in the education sector			
3.1 Management of teacher professional development	Teacher professional development tool established and utilized	Teachers can personalize their own learning and instructional support staff can better manage process	
3.2 Implementing and utilizing learning assessments to improve instruction	National learning assessments implemented	Reliable data available to inform teacher practice and evidence-based reforms	
3.3 Supporting results-based management	Intermediate-results indicators are achieved	MOE’s commitment to achieving key results is strengthened	

## B. Economic and Financial Analysis

67. Public investment in the education sector, especially in the lagging regions, is strongly justified in Tunisia. The public sector remains the sole source of provision of education in many remote and rural areas where the private sector is virtually absent. Investment in education is economically and socially profitable. The data show that the prevalence of poverty declines significantly with the improvement in education levels. The socio-economic impact of the Project is even more important in that it targets the most disadvantaged regions of the country. In fact, despite the regional targeting of certain components, the Project will impact all primary students (more than one million) who will benefit from improved quality of instruction. Because Tunisia has achieved universal primary education, the main contribution of the project lies in improved quality of education. Thus, an improvement in student performance of the equivalent of the standard deviation of their score in the standard assessment tests generates an increase of 1 to 2 points of economic growth over the long term.

68. Economic benefits, though not immediate, are expected to come from a larger number of students with improved learning, the related higher average future earnings of school graduates, and improved efficiency of public spending in the education sector. The results of the economic analysis based solely on the impact of the qualitative improvements of the primary cycle lead to an internal rate of return (IRR) of 17.6 percent and a net present value (NPV) of TND375 million. These estimates are based on conservative assumptions about the expected impact of the Project: a 15 percent reduction in repetition (thus improving resource allocation efficiency) and dropout (improving the productivity of primary school leavers as measured by the private income differential). At the end of the project, a decrease of 2.2 percentage points in grade repetition rate (from 12.2 percent to 10 percent) and a 0.2 percentage point decrease in the dropout rate from (1.1 percent to 0.9 percent) are expected.

69. The following table presents the main assumptions and results of the financial and economic benefits resulting from the impact of the Project in terms of improving the quality of education measured by improving the internal efficiency of primary education. The benefit of the Project is measured in two



ways: (a) greater efficiency of public expenditure resulting from the reduction of repetition, and (b) income levels of would be school leavers who stay in school.

**Table 4: Main assumptions and results of the financial and economic analysis**

	Current Situation (2017)	Average for 2019-2030	
		Without SFLP	With SFLP
Impact of decreased repetition			
Repetition rate	12.2%	12.2%	10.3%
Number of repeaters in primary education	134,296	147,587	124,472
Unit cost in primary education (TND/student)	1,670	1,670	1,670
Annual cost of repetition (million TND)	224.3	246.5	207.9
Advantage: annual budget savings (million TND)			38.6
Impact of decreased dropout			
Dropout rate	1.1%	1.1%	1%
Number of dropouts in primary education (annual)	12,109	13,307	11,637
Annual Income (TND)			
Incomplete primary education	9,643	9,643	9,643
Secondary education	11,781	11,781	11,781
Advantage: additional income/year (million TND)			3.6

70. The table shows that the persistence of a repetition rate of 12.2 percent (2016 level) is associated with an estimated annual average cost of TND247 million during the 2019-2030 period. Conservative assumptions of a gradual reduction in the repetition rate by 2.2 percentage points while maintaining the same level of the unit operating cost of 2017 (TND1,620 per pupil per year) reduces this cost to TND208 million, a savings of nearly TND40 million per year. In fact, one percentage point of repetition costs TND20 million per year for the state budget during the period 2019-2030. The reduction in dropout (from 1.1 percent to 0.9 percent) will improve the average qualification levels and future income levels of the education system's leavers.

71. The income differential between future workers who have not completed primary education and those who have reached secondary school is estimated at about TND2,140 per year, a difference of 22 percent. Reducing dropout will allow an average of 1,670 students to benefit from this additional income. The calculation of the IRR based on the Project direct costs of TND205 million and its recurrent costs of annually TND13.1 million (such as maintenance of schools, professional development programs, standardized national assessment) and considering the financial benefits resulting from the decreased repetition and economic benefits from the income stream of future graduates, results in an IRR of 17.3 percent during the next two decades. The NPV is the undiscounted sum of the cost-benefit flow of TND375 million. The adoption of a discounting cost of 4.5 percent (approximately equivalent to the GDP deflator over the last three years) results in a NPV of TND185 million.

### **C. Technical Soundness**

72. The Project introduces several innovative elements in the Tunisian education system. It is the first investment that specifically targets preschool and primary education. Using DLIs, the project will create a culture of results-based management and will focus MOE efforts on critical institutional reforms that will improve overall quality. Quality assurance in preschool, the professionalization of primary school directors, modernizing teacher professional development, and the implementation of a national learning assessment are expected to address key challenges that hinder improvements in quality. The project will also maximize the use digital tools and technology to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of management processes.

73. The scientific evidence base for the main interventions is strong. First, investing in high-quality early learning can have substantial and lasting impacts on children. Second, there is evidence that school leadership is a key element in improving overall school performance and student learning. Third, education systems that have improved sustainably and systematically have done so with a robust evaluation system. Fourth, recent studies have shown that the practicality, specificity, and continuity of teacher professional development programs are key factors that influence effectiveness. Finally, the Project introduces much-needed innovations that aim to facilitate diffusion of the best teaching practices within schools. School-level collaboration can provide teachers with pedagogical or classroom management techniques that are relevant to their school context. This type of support can transfer knowledge through modeled practice, which may be inherently more effective in supporting the adoption of new practices and behaviors than off-site, lecture-based training. Engaging the whole school can also promote continuous support and reinforcement for new behaviors.<sup>22</sup> Through the professional development of school leaders and the introduction of elements of school-based management, the project will encourage a bottom-up approach to school improvement. This approach will allow members of the school community to identify areas for improvement and provide them with skills, resources, and support to improve learning. Such a change will be gradual and will need the commitment of the entire school community: teachers, directors, pedagogical counselors and inspectors. The introduction of learning assessments in primary education will allow the MOE to benchmark progress at school, regional and national levels. The Project will invest in building capacity for analysis and translation of results into activities to improve learning, such as targeted professional development activities, better pedagogical support, and direct interventions in low performing primary schools.

74. Supporting the MOE to upgrade education infrastructure is essential in the current Tunisian context of fiscal constraint and limited investment resources. There is strong evidence that high-quality infrastructure facilitates better instruction, improves student outcomes, and reduces dropout rates, among other benefits.<sup>23</sup> The Project will support the MOE to adopt an improved approach to construction norms and designs, particularly in preprimary, linking the overall quality of the classroom learning environment with child development.

---

<sup>22</sup> Bruns, Barbara; Oliveira Costa, Leandro; Menezes Cunha, Nina. 2017. *Through the looking glass: can classroom observation and coaching improve teacher performance in Brazil? (English)*. Policy Research working paper; no. WPS 8156; Impact Evaluation series. Washington, D.C.: World Bank Group.

<sup>23</sup> A recent study from the U.K found that environmental and design elements of school infrastructure together explained 16 percent of variation in primary students' academic progress. This research shows that the design of education infrastructure affects learning through three interrelated factors: naturalness (e.g. light, air quality), stimulation (e.g. complexity, color), and individualization (e.g. flexibility of the learning space).

#### **D. Lessons Reflected in Project Design**

75. The proposed Project will benefit from the technical and policy dialogue in education conducted with the GOT since 2011. The World Bank has acquired a deep analytical understanding and knowledge base on education through the preparation of five System Approach for Better Education Results (SABER) Tunisia Country Reports on: Teachers (2011); Workforce Development (2012); Student Assessment (2013); School Health and School Feeding (2015); and Early Childhood Development (2015). The work on SABER has allowed the World Bank to build a strong partnership with the GOT, working across several line ministries. Collectively, the SABER reports have identified policy areas that the Project will address, especially those related to Teachers, Student Assessment, and ECD.

76. Lessons learned from a review of the Implementation Completion Review of the last World Bank-financed project (EQIP II) which was implemented between May 2004 and September 2010 have been integrated into the project design as reflected in the table below.

**Table 5: Lessons learned from previous World Bank-financed project in education (P082999 Education Quality Improvement Program Phase 2)**

<b>Issue</b>	<b>Mitigation measure reflected in project design</b>
The complexity of the Project requires a high level of collaboration and coordination across actors and institutions with the education system, a practice not commonly observed.	The project will focus on interventions in the pre- and primary cycles only. Both directors and technical staff of relevant departments and agencies, including senior staff in the CREs and CREFOCs, have been engaged in the preparation process. The Project Steering Committee is expected to play a key role in communication and coordination of activities.
Refusal by MOE senior leadership to make public the results of the 4th grade national test	Post-revolution, Tunisia has adopted measures to increase openness and transparency in government. The MOE and stakeholders surveyed in the field have expressed a strong demand for improving the MOE's capacity to carry out national evaluations. A DLI that is part of the Results Framework is expected to incentivize the dissemination of results of the national learning assessment (DLI 5). Specific activities will be included to translate results from the learning assessment into improved programs and teaching practices in the classrooms.
Failure to implement governance and management reforms related to School Improvement Plans and empowerment of School Councils	The model for school improvement plans will be adjusted to reflect the capacity constraints of the local context. The role of pedagogical councils will be strengthened, and the interventions will be more closely supported with strong communication strategies and dialogue with parents, teacher unions, local administrators, and other key stakeholders. A DLI is expected to incentivize the preparation and implementation of school improvement plans through the

	change in the primary school legal status to allow schools to manage a budget (DLI 2).
Lack of proper maintenance of school infrastructure	The Project will support the MOE's initiative to put in place a cost-effective preventive maintenance program for school maintenance to protect the sustainability of investments in school infrastructure. The maintenance function will be strengthened once the legal status of primary schools is amended.

77. **A qualitative analysis conducted as part of the Maghreb Governance and Political Economy Facility (MGPEF) confirmed the acceptability and feasibility of the project interventions.** Extensive consultations with MOE officials and other stakeholders were conducted through political economy analyses<sup>24</sup>. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with stakeholders, including union representatives, primary school teachers, primary school directors, inspectors of primary education, parents, and community leaders. Interviewees were unanimously favorable to Components 1 and 2 of the Project, citing poor physical conditions and lack of teacher training as the two biggest perceived barriers to student learning. Parents, teachers and school directors were cognizant of the pedagogical usefulness of the preschool year and favored the creation of more preschool services in their region, provided that these classes are created under appropriate material and educational conditions. Component 2, which aims to improve teaching conditions in primary schools, also achieved a favorable consensus during consultations. The reforms proposed are perceived as additional positive resources made available to the educational community to assist them in their work. This is especially true for strengthening teacher professional development, which is seen by all stakeholders as a priority. The directors interviewed complained of being restricted to administrative tasks and of not being empowered to play a leadership role. The provision of professional development for school principal schools also received a favorable response.

78. **Strong coordination mechanisms among development partners will be important throughout project implementation.** The World Bank interventions were selected to complement those of other international partners and to avoid duplicating approaches. The Project will be implemented in close collaboration with other key donors such as UNICEF, the European Union, and the French Cooperation. The MOE and donors have agreed on the main terms of a partnership agreement to jointly review progress on the implementation of the Education Five Year Plan (2016-2020) and coordinate support to the education sector.

## **E. Fiduciary**

### **(i) Financial Management**

79. **The financial management risk is assessed as Substantial because of the results-based financing mechanism which represents an important innovation for the MOE.** The main risks and weaknesses are related to (i) the lack of experience of the Ministerial Inspectorate to act as an Independent Verification

<sup>24</sup> These analyses were undertaken by the Maghreb Political Economy and Governance Filter (MPEGF), a process led by the Governance Global Practice to ensure that political economy risks are appropriately evaluated for all projects.

Agent of the DLRs, (ii) the insufficiencies in the UGPO's existing manual of procedures with regard to the RBF arrangements, and (iii) the important work load of the financial staff due the increase of the UGPO's portfolio. The UGPO's financial management (FM) arrangements which are based on the Tunisian government financial management systems are generally acceptable and provide reasonable assurance on the use of the Project's resources for the intended purposes. To mitigate the identified risks and weaknesses, the following measures have been identified: (i) a thorough review of the MOE's budget lines was carried as part of the project appraisal to identify mature and pertinent activities in line with the project's development objectives<sup>25</sup>; (ii) the strengthening of the capacity of the budget managers (through technical assistance with support from the Ministry of Finance<sup>26</sup>) to ensure smooth execution of the EEPs and avoid any unresolved issues in the execution processes, and (iii) the recourse to an independent verification agent. In addition, UGPO's existing manual of procedures will be amended to include the Results-Based Financing arrangements. Lastly, one additional accountant will be appointed during the implementation to strengthen UGPO's financial team.

80. **Financial Management arrangements.** The country financial management systems such as budgeting, accounting, internal controls, funds flow, financial reporting and external audit, will be applied. The Project's annual activities will be approved by the World Bank and included in the MOE's annual budget. Special attention will be paid to the planning and budgeting of the EEPs in the MOE annual budget. The Project's activities will follow the national budget execution and internal control procedures which include the segregation of duties between the payment authorizer and the public accountant as well as the ex-ante control by the financial controller. This will be complemented by the provisions of the UGPO's manual of procedures which includes detailed procedures at the decentralized level. The national information management systems, respectively ADEB (budgeting) and SIAD (treasury), will also be used. Primarily financial data to prepare the interim financial report will be generated from these systems and used to develop the project's financial reporting statements. Simplified financial reporting templates will be developed to report on the beneficiaries (CREs, CREFOCs, CNTE, CIFFIP) expenditures. The country's project monitoring and evaluation system (*Système de Suivi et d'Evaluation de l'Exécution des Projets Publics*) developed by the National Center for Information System (*Centre National d'Informatique* [CNI]) which is in the gradual deployment phase might be used once agreed by all the parties. The project's funds will be disbursed into a designated account to be opened at the Central Bank of Tunisia which will be part of the treasury single account. Detailed information on the disbursement arrangements are provided below. The external audit will be carried out by the General Financial Control (*Contrôle Général des Finances*)<sup>27</sup> based on agreed terms of reference.

## **(ii) Disbursement**

81. **Flow of funds and disbursement arrangements.** The following disbursement methods may be used under the loan for Category 1: (i) advance, (ii) retroactive financing, (iii) reimbursement, (iv) direct payment, and (v) special commitments. The Project's funds will be managed by the UGPO through a designated account to be opened at the Central Bank of Tunisia. This account will be exclusively used for Project funds. The disbursements of Category 1 will follow the standard approach by which the UGPO will

---

<sup>25</sup> Preliminary results of the ongoing Public Expenditure Review were used to this end.

<sup>26</sup> The Ministry of Finance is providing technical assistance activities to pilot line ministries to ensure a proper planning, budgeting and accountability under the umbrella of the program budgeting approach.

<sup>27</sup> in line with the existing external audit arrangements for the donors-funded projects

make payments to providers of goods, works and services. Disbursements from Category 2 will follow a results-based financing approach by establishing a set of DLIs that would trigger disbursements for an overall amount of US\$30 million and retroactive financing of up to US\$6 million. The control of the DLIs will be carried out by an verification agent. Reimbursement will be the disbursement method for the DLIs following the provisions of the Disbursement and Financial Information Letter. The reimbursement will be made directly into the MOE current account (part of the Treasury single account) opened at the Central Bank of Tunisia.

82. **Link of underlying expenditures to DLIs.** Once the MOE has met the agreed DLI/DLR targets and the World Bank has approved them, the funds disbursed under this modality will be documented against the presentation of the EEPs for an amount which will be the lesser between the amount allocated for the achievement of the DLRs and the incurred EEPs at the time of the verification of the DLIs.

83. **Retroactive expenditures.** Based on the project's needs, the World Bank could finance up to 20 percent of the US\$30 million allocated for eligible expenditures under Category 2 in table 6 below incurred by the borrower up until one year before the Loan Agreement signature.

**Table 6: Allocation of Loan Proceeds**

<b>Category</b>	<b>Amount of the Loan Allocated (expressed in EUR)</b>	<b>Amount of the Loan Allocated (expressed in USD)</b>	<b>Percentage of Expenditures to be financed (exclusive of Taxes)</b>
(1) Goods, works, non-consulting services, consulting services, Training and Incremental Operating Costs under Parts 1, 2 (including Primary School Grants under Part 2.1 (e) of the Project), 3 (but excluding Part 3.3) and 4 of the Project	56,637,000	69,750,000	100%
(2) Payments for EEPs under Part 3.3 of the Project	24,360,000	30,000,000	100%
(3) Front-end Fee	203,000	250,000	Amount payable pursuant to Section 2.03 of this Agreement in accordance with Section 2.07 (b) of the General Conditions
<b>TOTAL AMOUNT</b>	<b>81,200,000</b>	<b>100,000,000</b>	

### **(iii) Procurement**

84. Procurement for the proposed Project will be carried out by the UGPO. The Project will be executed in accordance with the World Bank's Procurement Regulations for Borrowers under Investment Policy Financing (dated July 2016, revised in November 2017) ("Procurement Regulations"), and the provisions stipulated in the Procurement Plan and the POM. The Project's procurement consists mainly of the construction and rehabilitation of schools in 12 governorates, the acquisition of equipment for schools to improve learning conditions and technical assistance consulting services for training, capacity building for teachers and managers, evaluations, etc. In addition, goods, non-consulting services, consulting services, and training will also be financed through budget lines identified in the EEPs. These expenditures will be procured through national competitive bidding and will need to be satisfactory to the World Bank. A procurement capacity assessment was carried out in February 2018. Overall, procurement risk for the project is rated "Substantial". The assessment found that the implementing units (UGPO and CREs) that will be responsible for all procurement and contracting related queries and processing, including management and compliance with fiduciary requirements have wide experience in conducting procurement (using national and donor procedures) and are staffed to that effect. However, the large number of regional offices coupled with a very heavy control environment could have a negative impact on procurement efficiency and make the coordination more difficult. The Guidelines on Preventing and Combating Fraud and Corruption in Projects Financed by IBRD Loans and IDA Credits and Grants, dated October 15, 2006, and revised in January 2011 and as of July 1, 2016 will apply to project activities.

85. A Project Procurement Strategy for Development (PPSD) has identified the appropriate selection methods, market approach, and type of review required by the World Bank. Most activities under the Project will be carried out through National Competition. An acceptable Procurement Plan was also prepared and will be included in the World Bank's new Systematic Tracking of Exchanges in Procurement system.

## **F. Safeguards**

### **(i) Environmental Safeguards**

86. The Project is classified as Category B. The Project will build and equip preschool classrooms in existing primary schools in 31 selected school districts and rehabilitate and refurbish the same targeted primary schools to ensure that they meet minimum standards such as access to water, electricity, connectivity, buildings, classroom furniture, and outdoor spaces. Rehabilitation works will be estimated concurrently with the construction of preschool classrooms. It will entail small civil works that have the potential to generate site-specific environmental impacts. All the other project subcomponents are primarily concerned with training, acquisition of pedagogical and instructional materials, institutional development, technical assistance and capacity building.

87. The Operational Policy 4.01 on environmental assessment was triggered, and an Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) has been prepared since the exact activities and localizations to be financed for the civil works have not yet been specified. The ESMF will be part of the POM that also includes details on project management and monitoring. This ESMF has developed a negative list of projects excluded from support. Activities with major or irreversible impacts on the environment/health



and safety of students and populations will be excluded. The ESMF has been consulted and discussed with various stakeholders (involving representatives of the main national, regional and local institutions and non-governmental organizations) during a national workshop held in Tunis on February 19, 2018. The final version of the ESMF was disclosed in-country through the MOE website on March 15, 2018 and through the Bank external website on March 16, 2018.

88. **Climate benefits.** The main climate change risks Tunisia is likely to confront are temperature increases, reduced precipitation, rising sea levels and escalating extreme weather phenomena (floods and droughts). These risks are likely to result in major environmental and socio-economic vulnerability. Tunisia is aware of these challenges and has adopted a proactive policy of fighting climate change, both in terms of mitigation and adaptation. Tunisia plans to reduce its energy intensity by 41 percent by 2030 by introducing a 30 percent decrease in energy demand and increasing the renewable energy share in its energy mix by 30 percent. The national plan also advocates increasing the use of renewable energies to raise the share of renewable energies in electricity production to 14 percent in 2020 and to 30 percent in 2030.

89. Sub-components 1.4 and 2.5 support climate mitigation and adaptation co-benefits activities through: (a) integration of efficient architectural designs and energy efficient appliance/equipment in infrastructure; and (b) provision of safe water supply. Construction or rehabilitation of classrooms will integrate efficient architectural designs, energy efficient appliances and equipment, and building techniques. In addition, solar panels will be placed in school buildings in select areas to generate electricity, which will improve the schools' energy efficiency. Any digital equipment procured will be energy efficient and comply with high energy certification schemes. Regarding the above activities, the MOE will coordinate with the Tunisia's National Agency for Energy Conservation (ANME).

## **(ii) Social Safeguards**

90. The Project will support the construction of preschool classrooms and small renovations of school facilities in 31 selected school districts in rural and semi-rural areas. The OP/BP 4.12 on Involuntary Resettlement was triggered in case any of the civil works in primary schools would induce acquisition of land and/or lead to involuntary resettlement. The project has prepared a Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF) to address potential land acquisition issues. The RPF has been discussed with various stakeholders (involving representatives of the main national, regional and local institutions and non-governmental organizations) during a national workshop held in Tunis on February 19, 2018. The final version of the RPF was disclosed in-country through the MOE website on March 15, 2018 and through the World Bank's external website on March 16, 2018.

91. The Project is expected to have a positive social impact as it aims to reduce inequality of opportunities in access to preschools in selected regions in rural areas mostly located in lagging regions. The improvement of learning conditions in primary education nationwide will lead to better education outcomes, particularly among the poor/disadvantaged children.



92. **Gender.** Tunisia is currently ranked 117 out of 144 countries in the latest Global Gender Gap Index.<sup>28</sup> Tunisia has reached parity in primary enrollment. At the secondary level, 78.2 percent of males are enrolled, compared to 82.8 percent of females<sup>29</sup>; male students are also more likely to repeat a grade or dropout. The root cause of this gap begins in primary school, where learning gaps are neither identified nor remediated systematically. Students transition from primary to lower secondary school almost automatically. The two learning assessments planned under the project, the EGRA and the national student learning assessment, will provide stakeholders with empirical information on differences in learning performance between male and female students in primary school. This will allow early detection of gaps. School directors and CREs will come up with action plans at the school and region level, respectively, with attention to address any identified gender learning gaps through targeted remedial activities for teachers and/or students. The Project will ensure that professional development programs for directors, teachers, and instructional support staff will benefit males and females equally. The training modules for teachers will include gender sensitive classroom management, and training contents will be reviewed to ensure gender sensitivity. When possible, communication activities supported by the Project will include gender-balanced examples of female school directors, inspectors and other staff.

93. **Citizen engagement/ beneficiary feedback.** The Project will include mechanisms to incorporate beneficiary feedback from school directors, teachers, and students. Teachers, who represent a large group of project beneficiaries, will be surveyed on an annual basis to provide their feedback on the quality and relevance of professional development provided. This feedback will be considered in adjusting training content and delivery. Measuring their engagement and satisfaction with the professional development activities is paramount to project outcomes. In addition, for the first time, the directors of public primary schools will share student learning assessment results with parents (either through a poster at the school, through a bulletin, and/or through messages sent to parents via the online MOE portal). At the school level, school directors will have received training to lead discussions on school performance with teachers and parents and solicit their feedback for school improvement. The POM will outline the more detailed processes for this engagement as lessons from recent experiences point to the importance of allowing school directors to develop ownership of the process of engaging parents.

## **G. Grievance Redress**

94. Communities and individuals who believe that they are adversely affected by a World Bank supported project may submit complaints to existing project-level GRM or the World Bank Grievance Redress Service (GRS). The GRS ensures that complaints received are promptly reviewed to address project-related concerns. Project affected communities and individuals may submit their complaint to the World Bank's independent Inspection Panel which determines whether harm occurred, or could occur, because of World Bank non-compliance with its policies and procedures. Complaints may be submitted at any time after concerns have been brought directly to the World Bank's attention, and World Bank Management has been given an opportunity to respond. For information on how to submit complaints to the World Bank's corporate Grievance Redress Service (GRS), please visit <http://www.worldbank.org/GRS>. For information on how to submit complaints to the World Bank Inspection Panel, please visit [www.inspectionpanel.org](http://www.inspectionpanel.org).

---

<sup>28</sup> World Economic Forum. The Global Gender Gap Report, 2017. Geneva: World Economic Forum.

<sup>29</sup> World Bank EdStats database, 2014

## V. KEY RISKS

### A. Overall Risk Rating and Explanation of Key Risks

95. **The overall risk is substantial.** Key risks that could adversely affect the achievement of the project development objectives and key mitigation measures are described below.

96. **Political and governance risk is high, given frequent changes in leadership.** Although Tunisia has stabilized politically following the adoption of the new constitution, the post-revolution social context remains fragile. Despite the formation of a new coalition government in August 2016, social tensions continue to flare. It is also worth noting the risk that the “lagging regions”, which are a focal area of this Project, are the areas where the social unrest is most pronounced so the risk is potentially more accentuated. Some risk mitigation measures could include: (a) aiming to ensure a cross-party consensus is built into Project design so that it is more insulated from changes in government; (b) working to institutionalize the program through the government technical cadre and bureaucratic reform champions, who may be less likely to change than the political cadre or ministers; and (c) building a wider societal consensus on the Project interventions through engaging various stakeholders, including the unions and other actors. To further address and mitigate these risks, additional governance and political economy analyses and risk mitigation were undertaken during the preparation phase.

97. **Macroeconomic risk is substantial.** Uncertainty about the economic outlook related to the health of the global economy and the crisis in Libya, as well as the pressure on the fiscal deficit and balance of payments, all pose significant risks to economic and political development in Tunisia. The poor macroeconomic conditions, a large fiscal deficit, a spiraling wage bill, an increase in fiscal risks, and the possibility of slippage in implementation of macroeconomic reforms, could constrain public investment spending during the project implementation.

98. **Sector Strategies and Policies risk is substantial.** The *Plan Quinquennal* for the Education Strategy comprises nine strategic goals and a multitude of global objectives. The *Plan Quinquennal* includes many result indicators, but without any reliable costing. Local school capacity and accountability mechanisms, especially in lagging regions, are relatively limited, but these risks will, at least in part, be addressed by the proposed Project. Finally, a major risk—which was addressed in the MGPEF analysis—is the role and power of the unions in helping or hindering reforms within the sector; the communications and stakeholder outreach (mentioned below) will be an important element in mitigating this risk.

99. Success of the reforms is contingent on MOE’s ability to mobilize all stakeholders, especially school-level actors such as teachers, school directors, inspectors, parents, and students. Several governance and political economy constraints were identified during the project preparation in collaboration with the MGPEF. The 2017 World Development Report on Governance and the 2018 World Development Report on Education highlight the importance of improving education while also addressing the key political economy and institutional issues that shape education delivery. For successful education reform in Tunisia, policies must guarantee credible commitment, support coordination, and promote cooperation. Teacher unions, especially in secondary education, have been resistant to reforms even though teachers have a relatively generous remuneration package and favorable work conditions (World

Bank Tunisia SABER Teachers 2013).<sup>30</sup> In the past, highly unionized teachers have impeded efforts to establish school councils, which engage parents, students, and civil society in the school-level decision-making process (Vogt 2017). Engaging with and identifying champions among teachers within the unionized landscape will mitigate the stakeholder risk. The MOE has already begun to collaborate with teacher unions on key issues, such as the assessment of teachers' French language skills.

100. **Technical Design of Project risk is substantial.** MOE's ability at the central and regional levels to strategically lead, plan, monitor, and evaluate the implementation of the reform agenda will need to be strengthened to achieve the proposed Project outcomes. Previous reforms in Tunisia have failed to mobilize school-level actors when these reforms were perceived as being dictated by international donors, with little to no local leadership in design and implementation of the reforms. It is essential that the Project be entirely led by MOE at both the central and regional levels. Additionally, MOE's ability to monitor and evaluate the progress of implementation will need to be strengthened. MOE personnel at the central and regional levels will require capacity building in planning, financial management, procurement, and monitoring and evaluation functions. The establishment of a coordination committee between MOE and other agencies will also be needed to implement the reforms. Finally, MOE needs to adopt a communications plan and launch a communications campaign to support the reform efforts and provide regular updates on progress. Technology and social media can be leveraged to increase accountability of MOE staff and school-level actors to engage in reforms.

101. **Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability risk is substantial.** The MOE's capacity to implement this Project is untested. The proposed Project will support several important interventions that will require the mobilization of political capital, building ownership at different levels of the education system, and commitment from stakeholders who might have competing interests (that is, teacher unions, MOE, and parents). The institutional capacity for implementation that MOE will be able to mobilize will depend on building consensus among key actors to cooperate to achieve the Project's results.

102. **Fiduciary risk is substantial.** MOE staff are not familiar with financial management and disbursement practices for an IPF with DLIs, particularly as they relate to the selection and verification of DLRs. Two actions to mitigate the fiduciary risk will be intensive and frequent capacity-building and close implementation support once the Project is effective.

103. **Stakeholder risk is substantial.** As detailed in the work undertaken through the MGPEF, powerful teacher unions may have grounds to object to the operation if they perceive that reforms (or specific components) will hurt their interests. Unions have in the past fomented strikes and interrupted instructional time to protest reforms. To mitigate this risk, implementation will be carefully sequenced to advance mutual interests. Proactive and positive communication among the MOE and all branches of the Tunisian General Labor Union (*Union Générale Tunisienne du Travail* [UGTT]) will be important to reduce the risk of teacher union disruption. Other stakeholders, such as parents and the donor community, are not likely to oppose or interrupt implementation of reforms.

---

<sup>30</sup> Secondary teachers in Tunisia have a starting salary that is 1.7 times higher than the national average for public sector jobs, while teaching loads average 493 hours per year, putting Tunisia at first place for starting salary and second lowest for teaching load compared to OECD countries.

104. **Environment and Social Risk is moderate.** The Project activities and outcomes might be affected by extreme temperatures/wildfires and flooding resulting from climate changes. The Environmental and Social Management Framework has considered these risks to avoid and mitigate their impacts on the Project. The Project has taken into consideration these climate and disaster risks. Local stakeholder consultations held during Project preparation will enhance resilience measures and overall success of the Project.



## VI. RESULTS FRAMEWORK

### A. Indicators and Targets

#### Tunisia Strengthening Foundations for Learning Project

**Project Development Objective(s):** The objectives of the Project are to improve learning conditions in public preschools and primary schools, and to increase access to public preschool education in selected districts.

**Table A.1: Results Framework**

Results Indicators		DLI* *	CRI* **	Unit	Baselines	Yearly Cumulative Targets (Optional)				End Targets
						Y1	Y2	Y3	Y4	Y5
PDO Indicators by Sub-objective /Outcome										
Objective /Outcome 1: Increased access to public preschool education in selected districts	PDO Indicator 1: Children enrolled in public preschools in targeted districts (disaggregated by gender and urban/rural areas)			Number	7,416	7,416	7,900	9,000	10,400	12,400
	PDO Indicator 2: Primary school directors demonstrating new school leadership practices after training (disaggregated by gender)			Percentage	0	0	0	30	40	50
Objective/Outcome 2: Improved learning conditions in public preschools and primary schools	PDO Indicator 3: Trained preschool and primary teachers demonstrating skills learned through the core professional development program (disaggregated by gender)	Yes		Percentage	0	0	0	30	40	50



Intermediate Results Indicators (IRI)										
<b>Component 1:</b> Improving quality and increasing supply of preschool education	IRI 1: Preschool teachers trained on the core professional development program for early childhood education			Number	0	0	1,000	2,000	2,000	2,000
	IRI 2: Preschool classrooms that have received teaching and learning materials			Number	0	0	200	1,000	2,000	2,000
	IRI 3: Public preschool classrooms assessed using quality assurance mechanism	Yes		Number	0	0	0	50	200	400
	IRI 4: Preschool classrooms built in selected districts			Number	0	0	50	150	250	250
<b>Component 2:</b> Improving learning conditions in public primary schools	IRI 5: Number of school directors and deputy directors that have completed the new leadership program, disaggregated by gender			Number	0	0	500	1,000	2,500	3,000
	IRI 6: Trained school directors who prepare a school improvement plan			Number	0	0	0	100	200	300
	IRI 7: Teachers who complete the core professional development program			Number	0	0	0	10,000	12,000	14,000



	IRI 8: Teachers who agree that the professional development activities are helping them improve classroom practices, disaggregated by gender			Percentage	0	0	0	65	65	65
	IRI 9: Inspectors and pedagogical counselors trained on coaching techniques, disaggregated by gender			Number	0	50	200	500	800	1,200
	IRI 10: Primary school classrooms equipped with a reading corner			Number	0	0	200	1,000	2,000	2,000
	IRI 11: Grade 2 and/or Grade 3 students who cannot read a single word, as measured by the fluency test in EGRA			Percentage	To be determined in Y1.	Baseline		Midline		Endline
<b>Component 3:</b> Strengthening management practices in the education sector	IRI 12: Information Management System for professional development developed			Text	No		System developed and piloted	System used to monitor and assign professional development activities for	System used to monitor and assign professional development activities for	



								school teachers	school directors	
	IRI 13: National standardized learning assessment conducted in primary schools	Yes		Text	No	Assessment system developed	Assessment conducted in at least two (2) subjects in one grade and results analyzed	Use of assessment results to develop CRE action plans		
	IRI 14: Percentage of public primary school that have shared student learning assessment results with parents	Yes		Percentage	0	0	0	50	80	80

\*\*Disbursement Linked Indicators (for PforR and IPF with DLI).

\*\*\* Corporate Results Indicators.





**Table A.2: M&E Plan for Indicators**

Indicator Name	Definition/Description	Frequency	Data Source	Data collection Method	Responsibility for Data Collection
PDO Indicator 1: Children enrolled in public preschools in targeted districts, disaggregated by gender and urban/rural	Number of children enrolled in public preschool (Année Préparatoire) in the 31 districts identified as the most vulnerable. Data is disaggregated by gender and by school location (urban vs. rural)	Annually	MOE	Enrollment numbers collected by MOE	MOE
PDO Indicator 2: Trained primary school directors demonstrating new school leadership practices, disaggregated by gender and urban/rural	School directors will participate in a leadership development program, which includes both face-to-face and virtual trainings, in addition to in-school coaching. School management practices will be measured periodically by inspectors and/or pedagogical counselors using agreed upon tools developed as part of the coaching/follow-up portion of the leadership development program. The results from the measurement of school leadership practices will be aggregated at the central level. To report on this indicator, a random sample of trained school directors will be selected in agreement with the World Bank and the percentage of school directors demonstrating new leadership practices from this sample will be reported.	Annually	MOE	Yearly reports of school leadership practices will be collected by MOE from inspectors and pedagogical counselors	MOE
PDO Indicator 3: Trained preschool and primary teachers demonstrate skills learned through the core professional development program	Classroom observation tools will be developed based on the core professional development programs. The tools will define rubrics to help measure performance against specific skills. Inspectors and/or pedagogical counselors will be providing continuous coaching and follow up in schools, including regular observation of teacher classroom practices using these measurement tools. Yearly reports of teacher	Annually	MOE	Yearly reports of teacher classroom practices will be collected by MOE from inspectors and	MOE



	classroom practices will be collected by MOE from inspectors and pedagogical counselors. The results from the measurement of school leadership practices will be aggregated at the central level. To report on this indicator, a random sample of trained preschool and primary teachers will be selected in agreement with the World Bank and the percentage of teachers from this sample demonstrating new skills learned through the program will be reported.			pedagogical counselors	
IRI 1: Preschool teachers trained on the core professional development program for early childhood education	MOE will develop the curriculum and content for the professional development programs aimed at preschool teachers. A new preschool curriculum has been developed and preschool teachers will be trained on this curriculum through both face-to-face and distance trainings, in addition to continuous coaching from inspectors and/or pedagogical counselors	Annually	MOE	Collected from the teacher training centers (CREFOCs)	MOE
IRI 2: Preschool classrooms that have received teaching and learning materials	MOE will set minimum requirements for teaching and learning materials for preschools, and will procure these materials to schools	Annually	MOE	Implemented and reported by MOE	MOE
IRI 3: Public preschool classrooms assessed using quality assurance mechanism	Implementation of the quality assurance mechanism through monitoring of education quality in preschools	Annually	MOE	Implemented as per the quality assurance mechanism and reported at the school, regional, and central levels. Final number reported by central level	MOE



IRI 4: Preschool classrooms built in selected districts	MOE will build and furnish preschool classrooms in existing primary schools	Annually	MOE	Implemented and reported by MOE	MOE
IRI 5: School directors and deputy directors who have completed the new leadership program, disaggregated by gender	School directors and deputy directors will participate in a leadership development program, which includes both face-to-face and virtual trainings, in addition to in-school coaching.	Annually	MOE	Collected from the teacher training centers (CREFOCs)	MOE
IRI 6: Trained school directors who prepare a school improvement plan	As part of the new leadership program, school directors will be trained on the process for conducting a school needs assessment and for developing school improvement plans that help the schools improve quality. Schools will develop school improvement plans and corresponding budgets. Schools will then receive financial transfers from the MOE to implement activities. Schools will report on results of activities, in addition to financial reporting on expenditures incurred at the school level.	Annually	MOE	Collected by inspectors and pedagogical counselors and reported to the regional and central levels	MOE
IRI 7: Teachers who complete the core professional development program	MOE will design a core professional development program that will provide the minimum skills required for untrained teachers to be able to teach effectively in the classroom. The core professional development program will include both a face-to-face and a distance learning component, in addition to continuous coaching provided by the inspectors and pedagogical counselors	Annually	MOE	Collected from the teacher training centers (CREFOCs)	MOE
IRI 8: Citizen Engagement. Teachers who agree that professional development activities help them improve their classroom	On an annual basis, teachers will be surveyed by MOE on the effectiveness of teacher professional development activities in which they have participated	Annually	MOE	Collected in a sample of schools as agreed with the World Bank	MOE



practices, disaggregated by gender					
IRI 9: Inspectors and pedagogical counselors trained on coaching techniques, disaggregated by gender	Inspectors and pedagogical counselors will provide continuous pedagogical support to teachers. They will be trained on how to better provide this support.	Annually	MOE	Collected from the teacher training centers (CREFOCs)	MOE
IRI 10: Primary school classrooms equipped with a reading corner	Classrooms will be equipped with a classroom library that include stories in Arabic and French to provide students with opportunities to practice and enjoy reading.	Annually	MOE	Reported by MOE	MOE
IRI 11: Grade 2 and/or Grade 3 students who cannot read a single word, as measured by the fluency test in EGRA, disaggregated by gender	EGRA will be conducted on a representative sample of Grade 2 or Grade 3 students. EGRA will be conducted in Arabic.	Year 1 (baseline). Year 3 (midline). Year 5 (endline)	MOE	Reported by MOE	MOE
IRI 12: Information Management System for professional development developed	An information management system for professional development to coordinate the activities that teachers or school directors have completed or are expected to complete. It will be used to assign teachers to specific professional development activities.	Annually	MOE	Reported by MOE	MOE
IRI 13: National standardized learning assessment conducted in primary schools	Standardized national assessment implemented assessment in at least two (2) subjects in one grade in public primary schools to inform MOE on progress of student learning.	Annually	MOE	Reported by MOE	MOE
IRI 14: Citizen engagement. Percentage of public primary school that have shared student	Schools will communicate and share the results of the learning assessments with parents. Sharing of information with parents should be in written format and should include both results at the school-level	Annually	MOE	Collected from schools by CRE and aggregated at central level	MOE



learning assessment results with parents	and school-specific plans for improving learning outcomes. Poster displayed at the entrance of the primary school to present the school average assessment results. Schools should make available a medium (website/conference/phone number, etc.) for parents to seek clarifications on the results and to share feedback on school-specific actions for improving learning outcomes.				
--	--	--	--	--	--



## B. Disbursement-Linked Indicators (DLI)

Tunisia

### Strengthening Foundations for Learning Project

**Table B.1: DLRs Indicative Timeline**

DLI	Unit of Measure	Indicative Timeline for DLR Achievement				
		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
DLI 1: Quality assurance mechanism for public preschool education established	Text		The MoE has adopted a national plan describing the main challenges identified and outlining key actions to improve quality of public preschool services - <i>US\$2m</i>	The MoE has formally adopted the quality assurance mechanism for public preschool education - <i>US\$2m</i>		
	Number				Number of public preschools that have received feedback on their performance using the quality assurance mechanism - <i>US\$2m (Scalable)</i>	
Total DLI 1 allocation			US\$2m	US\$2m	US\$2m	
DLI 2: Public primary schools receive and manage funds to improve quality	Text Number	The Borrower has adopted the required legislation allowing eligible public primary schools to receive and manage their own budget - <i>US\$1m</i>		The MOE has approved and circulated guidelines for budget preparation to public primary schools and primary schools have prepared budget proposals - <i>US\$1m (Scalable)</i>		
Total DLI 2 allocation		US\$1m		US\$1m		
DLI 3: Improved teacher classroom practices	Text	Core professional development programs for preschool and primary education	The information management system for professional development is fully operational to	Number of trained public preschool and primary school teachers that have demonstrated skills	Number of trained public preschool and primary school teachers that have demonstrated skills	Number of trained public preschool and primary school teachers that have demonstrated skills



		teachers adopted <i>US\$2m</i>	monitor and manage professional development activities for: (a) public preschool and primary school teachers; and (b) public primary school directors - <i>\$2m</i>	learned through the core professional development program approved under DLR#3.1 - <i>US\$0.4m</i>	learned through the core professional development program approved under DLR#3.1- <i>US\$0.6m</i>	learned through the core professional development program approved under DLR#3.1 - <i>US\$1m</i>
<b>Total DLI 3 allocation</b>		<b>US\$2m</b>	<b>US\$2m</b>	<b>US\$0.4</b>	<b>US\$0.6</b>	<b>US\$1m</b>
<b>DLI 4: Strengthened measurement and use of learning outcomes to inform policy</b>	Text		The Borrower has: developed and adopted a policy framework authorizing and providing guidelines for the elaboration of a national standardized learning assessment for public primary schools - <i>US\$2m</i>	Public primary schools that carried out student learning assessment receive report on learning assessment results and guidelines on utilization of results to improve learning outcomes - <i>US\$1m</i>	Results of public primary school student learning assessments have been shared with the parents for public primary schools - <i>US\$2m</i>	
					The Borrower's CREs have developed adequate action plans which shall include the proposed targeted interventions as identified in each student learning assessment - <i>US\$2m</i>	
<b>Total DLI 4 Allocation</b>			<b>US\$2m</b>	<b>US\$2.5m</b>	<b>US\$2.5m</b>	
<b>DLI 5: Key investment programs in the education sector are prioritized</b>	Text		The Borrower has adopted a medium-term expenditure framework (MTEF) which shall include,	The actual expenditures approved in public primary education during the first	The actual expenditures approved in public primary education during the second	



			<i>inter alia</i> , proposed budget allocations per type of expenditure in public primary education for the targeted period - <i>US\$2m</i>	Borrower's fiscal year covered by the MTEF are within 25 percent of the budget allocation approved in the MTEF - <i>US\$0.5m</i>	Borrower's fiscal year covered by the MTEF are within 25 percent of the budget allocation approved in the MTEF - <i>US\$0.5m</i>	
<b>Total DLI 5 Allocation</b>			<b>US\$2m</b>	<b>US\$0.5m</b>	<b>US\$0.5m</b>	





**Table B.2: DLR Verification Protocols**

Definition / Description of achievements	Protocol to evaluate the achievement of DLR and data / results verification		Disbursement	
	Data Source / Agency	Procedure	Scalability	Disbursement Formula
<b>DLI 1: Quality assurance mechanism for public preschool education established</b>				
<b>DLR 1.1: The MoE has adopted a national plan describing the main challenges identified and outlining key actions to improve quality of public preschool services.</b> The plan will be based on an analysis of quality in preschools based on the results produced through the quality assurance mechanism.	DGCP	The verification agency will review the content of the plan for completeness as per the definition. The plan should include an analysis of the challenges identified through the pilot results and through the national consultations, in addition to detailed plan of actions to address all challenges.	No	US\$2,000,000 disbursed upon delivery of the national plan.
<b>DLR 1.2: The MOE has formally adopted the quality assurance mechanism for public preschool education.</b>	DGCP	The verification agency will review the decree and any relevant official circulars and decrees for the implementation of the quality assurance mechanism.	No	US\$2,000,000 is disbursed upon official adoption by MOE of the quality assurance mechanism.
<b>DLR 1.3: Number of public preschools that have received feedback on their performance using the quality assurance mechanism adopted under DLR # 1.2.</b> MOE will assess preschools using the newly developed quality assurance measurement tools. Results from these evaluations will be communicated at the school, region, and central levels to be used to inform policy.	DGCP	For a random sample of schools as agreed with the World Bank and MOE, the verification agency will check with the school directors if they have received the preschool quality assurance evaluation report. The verification agency will also review the reports for the sample of schools and ensure that the tools have been completed as per the quality assurance system adopted.	Yes	Total allocated: US\$2,000,000  For each public preschool that has received feedback on their performance using the newly adopted quality assurance mechanism, US\$5,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower, up to US\$2,000,000.



<b>DLI 2: Public primary schools receive and manage funds to improve quality</b>				
<b>DLR 2.1: The Borrower has adopted the required legislation allowing eligible public primary schools to receive and manage their own budget.</b>	DGAJ	The verification agency will review that the Borrower has passed the necessary legislation and that any needed implementing decrees/decisions/procedures were also issued by the corresponding authority	No	US\$1,000,000 disbursed upon establishment and approval of the legal provision allowing schools to manage a budget at the school level.
<b>DLR 2.2: (a) The MoE has approved and circulated the guidelines for the preparation of budget to eligible public primary schools; and (b) following appropriate training to public primary schools' principals on the budget processes, eligible public primary schools have prepared, and submitted to the Borrower for approval, budget proposals in accordance with the Borrower's approved guidelines.</b>	DGAF	The verification agency will review that MOE has issued approved guidelines for budget preparation and that these guidelines were shared with schools. The agency will also check the budgets prepared by public primary schools and will look for compliance of these budgets with the MOE guidelines.	Yes	Total allocated: US\$1,000,000  For each public primary school having prepared a budget proposal in accordance with the Borrower's approved guidelines, US\$10,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower, up to US\$1,000,000.
<b>DLI 3: Improved teacher classroom practices</b>				
<b>DLR 3.1: The MoE has adopted a core professional development program for: (a) public preschool teachers, and (b) primary school teachers; each (a) and (b) under terms of reference defined in the POM (including a face-to-face and a distance learning component and continuous coaching to be provided by public primary schools' inspectors and pedagogical counselors). They will also cover transversal skills such as time on learning, lesson facilitation, feedback, socioemotional skills, critical thinking, evaluation, remediation, etc. The programs will be</b>	DGPFC	The verification agency will review the professional development programs and ensure that it clearly identifies the scope, content, delivery methods, and outcomes. The scope of the programs will be agreed upon with MOE and the World Bank and defined in the POM.	No	Total allocated: US\$2,000,000  (a) US\$1,000,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower upon the adoption of a core professional development program for public preschool teachers under terms of reference defined in the



based on a needs assessment and an evaluation of teachers' skills and proficiency.				POM; and (b) US\$1,000,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower upon the adoption of a core professional development program for public primary school teachers under terms of reference defined in the POM teachers
<b>DLR 3.2: The information management system for professional development is fully operational to monitor and manage professional development activities for: (a) public preschool and primary school teachers; and (b) public primary school directors.</b> The system should include a list of all teachers and school directors and should include a professional development roadmap, identifying for each staff what professional development activities have been completed or are expected to be completed.	DGCP/CNTE	The verification agency will verify data and reports issued from the system on teacher and school directors' professional development activities. Data should include a list of teachers and school directors, assigned to the list of professional development activities they have completed and activities they should be completing based on the assessment of inspectors and pedagogical counselors. The verification agency will verify for a sample of teachers and school directors the accuracy and completeness of the data generated by the system.	No	Total allocated: US\$2,000,000 (a) US\$1,000,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower upon the use by MOE of the information management system for professional development to monitor and assign professional development activities to public preschool and primary school teachers; and (b) US\$1,000,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower upon the use by MOE of the information management system for professional development to monitor and assign professional development



				activities to public primary school directors.
<b>DLR 3.3 - DLR 3.4 – DLR 3.5: Number of trained public preschool and primary school teachers that have demonstrated skills learned through the core professional development program approved under DLR#3.1 during a given calendar year.</b> Classroom observation tools will be developed based on the core professional development programs. The tools will define rubrics to help measure performance against specific skills. Inspectors and/or pedagogical counselors will be providing continuous coaching and follow up in schools, including regular observation of teacher classroom practices using these measurement tools. Yearly reports of teacher classroom practices will be collected by MOE from inspectors and pedagogical counselor and aggregated at the central level.	CREFOCs - DGPFC	The verification agency will review the yearly classroom observation reports conducted by inspectors and pedagogical counselors for a random sample of trained preschool and primary teachers. The sample will be selected in agreement with the World Bank and the percentage of teachers from this sample demonstrating new skills learned through the program will be reported. At least 50 percent of teachers from this sample will need to have demonstrated acquisition of at least one or more skills as defined by the program.	No	<p>Total allocated: US\$2,000,000</p> <p>Formula: A maximum of US\$400,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower in year 3 when at least 30 percent in a random sample of trained public preschool and primary school teachers have demonstrated skills learned through the program.</p> <p>US\$600,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower year 4 when at least 40 percent in a random sample of trained public preschool and primary school teachers have demonstrated skills learned through the program.</p> <p>US\$600,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower year 5 when at least 50 percent in a random sample of trained public preschool and primary school teachers have</p>



				demonstrated skills learned through the program.
<b>DLI 4: Strengthened measurement and use of learning outcomes to inform policy</b>				
<b>DLR 4.1: The Borrower has: (a) developed and adopted a policy framework authorizing and providing guidelines for the elaboration of a national standardized learning assessment for public primary schools under terms and conditions described in the POM; and (b) carried out such standardized student learning assessment in at least two (2) subjects in one grade in public primary schools.</b>	CIFFIP	The verification agency will verify that the policy framework for the national assessment has been developed and adopted through the necessary administrative channels. The agency will verify through administrative reports produced by MOE that the assessment was carried out in at least two subjects in one grade of primary education in all public primary classrooms with at least 15-20 children enrolled in that grade. The verification agency will also review the results report containing the analysis of the results.	No	US\$2,000,000 disbursed upon achievement.
<b>DLR 4.2: Public primary schools that carried out the student learning assessment have received reports on learning assessment results and guidelines on utilization of results to improve learning outcomes.</b> The national assessment results are analyzed at the school and regional levels. MOE conducts workshops to communicate results to education stakeholders, including school directors. MOE distributes reports on the learning assessment results to all schools participating in the national assessment. Additionally, MOE provides with the report guidelines on how to use said reports to improve learning outcomes.	CIFFIP - DGCP - DGPFC	The verification agency will verify with MOE, and through spot checks in a sample of schools (as agreed with MOE and the World Bank) that results are disseminated to all participating primary schools and that schools have received guidelines on the use of the assessment results to improve teaching and learning.	No	US\$1,000,000 disbursed upon the dissemination of results to schools.
<b>DLR 4.3: Results of learning assessments have been shared with parents of public primary school students.</b> Schools will communicate and share the results of the learning assessments with parents . Sharing of information	CREs - schools	The verification agency will select a random national sample of primary schools. The sampling methodology should be agreed with the World Bank	No	Total allocated: US\$2,000,000



with parents should be in written format and should include comparative school-level results and school-specific plans for improving learning outcomes. Schools should make available a medium (website/conference/phone number, etc.) for parents to seek clarifications on the results and to share feedback on school-specific actions for improving learning outcomes.		and MOE. In this sample of schools, the verification agency will collect written communication sent by the school to parents to verify that schools have shared school-level results on learning assessments, school-specific plans for improving learning outcomes, and at least one medium for parents to seek clarifications and provide feedback.		US\$1,000,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower when 50 percent of public primary schools have shared results of student learning assessments with parents. An additional US\$1,000,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower when 80 percent of public primary schools have shared results of student learning assessments with parents.
<b>DLR 4.4: The Borrower's CREs have developed adequate action plans which shall include proposed targeted interventions to improve learning outcomes based on results of the learning assessment carried out under Component 3.2.</b>	CREs	The verification agency will verify for all CREs that they have developed action plans based on the assessment results and that the action plans set clearly the methodology for how the CREs will identify low-performing schools, in addition to all actions the CREs will take to support those schools.	No	Total allocated: US\$2,000,000  US\$1,000,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower when 50 percent of CREs have developed action plans to support low-performing public primary schools. An additional US\$1,000,000 may be made available for withdrawal by the Borrower when 80 percent of CREs have developed action plans to support low-performing public primary schools.



<b>DLI 5: Key investment programs in the education sector are prioritized</b>				
<b>DLR 5.1: The Borrower has adopted a medium-term expenditure framework (MTEF) which shall include, <i>inter alia</i>, proposed budget allocations per type of expenditures in public primary education for the targeted period.</b>	MOF, MOE	The verification agency will review the expenditure framework to ensure that it considers priority education programs, particularly for pre- and primary education.	No	US\$2,000,000 disbursed upon the development and adoption of a medium-term expenditure framework by decree of the MOE.
<b>DLR 5.2: The actual expenditures approved in public primary education during the first Borrower's fiscal year covered by the MTEF are within 25 percent of the budget allocation approved in the MTEF.</b>	MOF, MOE	The verification agency will verify that MOE budget allocated for primary education during the first year after the adoption of the MTEF is within the 25 percent range of the budget allocation in the expenditure framework.	No	US\$500,000 disbursed if in the first fiscal year after adoption of MTEF, actual expenditures in primary education are within 25 percent of the budget allocation in expenditure framework.
<b>DLR 5.3: The actual expenditures approved in public primary education during the first Borrower's fiscal year covered by the MTEF are within 25 percent of the budget allocation approved in the MTEF.</b>	MOF, MOE	The verification agency will verify that MOE budget allocated for primary education during the second year after the adoption of the MTEF is within the 25 percent range of the budget allocation in the expenditure framework.	No	US\$500,000 disbursed if in the second fiscal year after adoption of MTEF, actual expenditures in primary education are within 25 percent of the budget allocation in expenditure framework



**Table B.3: DLR Disbursement Estimates**

Disbursement Linked Indicators		Disbursement Linked Results	Amount to disbursed in US\$
<b>Retroactive Financing: Upon effectiveness based on EEP 12 months before signing of the loan</b>			<b>6,000,000</b>
DLI 1	Quality assurance mechanism for public preschool education established	DLR 1.1: The MOE has adopted a national plan describing the main challenges identified and outlining key actions to improve quality of public preschool services	2,000,000
		DLR 1.2: The MOE has formally adopted the quality assurance mechanism for public preschool education	2,000,000
		DLR 1.3: Number of public preschools that have received feedback on their performance using the quality assurance mechanism adopted	2,000,000
		<b>Sub-total DLI 1</b>	<b>6,000,000</b>
DLI 2	Public primary schools receive and manage funds to improve quality	DLR 2.1: The Borrower has adopted the required legislation allowing eligible public primary schools to receive and manage their own budget	1,000,000
		DLR 2.2: The MOE has approved and circulated the guidelines for the preparation of budget to eligible public primary schools; and (b) following appropriate training to public primary schools' principals on the budget processes, eligible public primary schools have prepared, and submitted to the Borrower for approval, budget proposals	1,000,000
		<b>Sub-total DLI 2</b>	<b>2,000,000</b>
DLI 3	Improved teacher classroom practices	DLR 3.1: The MOE has adopted a core professional development program for: (a) public preschool teachers, and (b) primary school teachers; each (a) and (b) under terms of reference defined in the POM (including a face-to-face and a distance learning component and continuous coaching to be provided by public primary schools' inspectors and pedagogical counselors).	2,000,000
		DLR 3.2: The information management system for professional development (developed under terms and conditions described in the POM) is fully operational to monitor and manage professional development activities for:  (a) public preschool and primary school teachers; and  (b) public primary school directors	2,000,000
		DLR 3.3: Number of trained public preschool and primary school teachers that have demonstrated skills learned through the core professional development program	400,000





		DLR 3.4: Number of trained public preschool and primary school teachers that have demonstrated skills learned through the core professional development program	600,000
		DLR 3.5: Number of trained public preschool and primary school teachers that have demonstrated skills learned through the core professional development program	1,000,000
		<b>Sub-total DLI 3</b>	<b>6,000,000</b>
DLI 4	Strengthened measurement and use of learning outcomes to inform policy	DLR 4.1: The Borrower has: developed and adopted a policy framework authorizing and providing guidelines for the elaboration of a national standardized learning assessment for public primary schools	2,000,000
		DLR 4.2: Public primary schools that carried out student learning assessment receive report on learning assessment results and guidelines on utilization of results to improve learning outcomes	1,000,000
		DLR 4.3: Results of public primary school student learning assessments have been shared with the parents for public primary schools	2,000,000
		DLR 4.4: The Borrower's CREs have developed adequate action plans which shall include the proposed targeted interventions as identified in each student learning assessment	2,000,000
		<b>Sub-total DLI 4</b>	<b>7,000,000</b>
DLI 5	Key investment programs in the education sector are prioritized	DLR 5.1: The Borrower has adopted a medium-term expenditure framework which shall include, <i>inter alia</i> , proposed budget allocations per type of expenditure in public primary education	2,000,000
		DLR 5.2: The actual expenditures approved in public primary education during the first Borrower's fiscal year covered by the medium-term expenditure framework are within 25 percent of the budget allocation approved in the medium-term expenditure framework	500,000
		DLR 5.3: The actual expenditures approved in public primary education during the second Borrower's fiscal year covered by the medium-term expenditure framework are within 25 percent of the budget allocation approved in the medium-term expenditure framework.	500,000
		<b>Sub-total DLI 5</b>	<b>3,000,000</b>
		<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>30,000,000</b>