



RESULTS-BASED NATIONAL URBAN DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM - NORTHERN MOUNTAINS (P143596)

EAST ASIA AND PACIFIC | Vietnam | Social, Urban, Rural and Resilience Global Practice Global Practice | IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results | FY 2014 | Seq No: 6 | ARCHIVED on 24-Oct-2016 | ISR25293 |

Implementing Agencies: Ministry of Construction

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program-for-Results Appraisal Document)

The proposed program development objective is to strengthen the capacity of participating Northern Mountains cities to plan, implement and sustain urban infrastructure.

Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	● Moderately Satisfactory	● Moderately Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	● Moderately Satisfactory	● Moderately Satisfactory
Overall Risk Rating	● Substantial	● Substantial

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

The Program has completed its first results verification process for Year 1 and works are underway to implement investments planned for Year 2 and to prepare for those under Phase II (Years 3-6). The Independent Results Verification Report for the first year of the Program implementation indicated that majority of the DLI results were achieved except for DLI 2, where 4 out of 7 participating cities did not meet the Program requirements on construction quality. In the mean time, the seven participating cities are continuing their efforts towards the achievement of the Program's DLI targets for 2016 by carrying out the needed designs, procurement and land acquisition. Implementation of civil works is at a critical stage, given delays in land acquisition and lack of IDA and counterpart funds allocated by the central government. Technical support from the Ministry of Construction is therefore crucial in this context to help the cities ensure quality to successfully achieve the 2016 DLIs.

Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	Disbursed
P143596	IDA-54760	Effective	XDR	161.80	161.80	0.00	26.74	135.06	17%

Key Dates (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P143596	IDA-54760	Effective	05-Jun-2014	17-Jul-2014	30-Oct-2014	30-Jun-2021	--



Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	--	● Substantial	● Substantial
Macroeconomic	--	● Substantial	● Substantial
Sector Strategies and Policies	--	● Moderate	● Moderate
Technical Design of Project or Program	--	● Moderate	● Substantial
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	--	● Substantial	● Substantial
Fiduciary	--	● Substantial	● Substantial
Environment and Social	--	● Substantial	● Substantial
Stakeholders	--	● Substantial	● Substantial
Other	--	--	--
Overall	--	● Substantial	● Substantial

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLI)

► Enhanced Annual City Plans approved and disclosed to the public (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	0 Plan approved and disclosed	7 Plans approved and disclosed	7 Plans approved and disclosed
Date	01-May-2014	--	07-Mar-2016

Comments

All 7 participating cities have approved and disclosed their Enhanced Annual City Plans. Actual achievement will be verified by June 2016 for first year results.

► Professionally-staffed management units in place within each Participating City People's Committee (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	0 PMU in place	7 PMUs in place and fully staffed as per POM	7 PMUs in place and fully staffed as per POM
Date	01-May-2014	--	07-Mar-2016

Comments

All cities have confirmed the list of staff as per POM. Actual achievements will be verified by June 2016 for first year results.



► Local urban infrastructure investments delivered as per each Participating City's approved Enhanced Annual City Plan (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	0 sub project completed	4 sub project completed	12 sub project completed
Date	01-May-2014	--	07-Mar-2016

Comments

12/13 investments scheduled for completion in 2015 have been achieved except for the Phay Khat - Na Ngan Road in Cao Bang due to implementation delays. Compliance to PAP Actions 2, 4 and 5 will have to be verified by SAV during verification process to declare results as achieved.

► Asset management plan adopted and local urban infrastructure sub-projects in full service after completion (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	0 Asset Management Plan adopted/0 sub-project completed	0 Asset Management Plan adopted/0 sub-project completed	7 Asset Management Plan adopted/12 subprojects completed
Date	01-May-2014	--	07-Mar-2016

Comments

Under the guidance of MOC, the participating cities have carried out and approved the Asset Condition Assessment Report by December 31, 2015. Actual achievement will be verified by June 2016 for first year results.

► Increased annual own-sources revenue in Participating Cities (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	5 cities with increase annual own-sources revenue of at least 12%	No annual revenue measure taken	7 cities with improved OSR more than 12%
Date	01-May-2014	--	07-Mar-2016

Comments

Cities informed that the collection of OSR has been positive, audit figures will confirm the achievement of this DLI during verification process.

► Implementation Strategy for National Urban Development Program adopted with annual milestones (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	No annual milestone applied	No annual milestone achieved	Policy Note on Vietnam Urban Investment Needs completed and approved by MOC



Date	01-May-2014	--	07-Mar-2016
------	-------------	----	-------------

Comments

MOC has approved the Policy Note on Vietnam Urban Infrastructure Investment demands for 2016-2035 on December 29, 2015. Actual achievement will be verified by June 2016 for first year results.

► Professionally-staffed unit in place in MOC, preparation of Annual Capacity Development Plans, and capacity building support provided to cities in accordance with such plans (Yes/No)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	N	N	Y
Date	01-May-2014	--	07-Mar-2016

Comments

MOC PMU was staffed with adequate personnel as per the POM. Per the Capacity Building Plan approved in May 2015, eight training courses were organized with 405 participants. Actual achievement will be verified by June 2016 for first year results.

► Completed Program Report (Yes/No)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	N	N	Y
Date	01-May-2014	--	31-Mar-2016

Comments

The Program Annual Report was submitted by MOC to SAV on March 30, 2016.

Results

Results Area

Intermediate Results Area

Institutional Strengthening at the City Level

Infrastructure Delivered

Sustainability of Infrastructure

National Policy, Support and Oversight

Project Development Objective Indicators



► Enhanced Annual City Plans approved and disclosed to the public (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	7.00	7.00	7.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Comments

It was verified that all cities had approved and disclosed their respective 2015 Enhanced Annual City Plans prior to December 31, 2014, meeting the annual target for this indicator for the first year of implementation. It has also been reported that results has been achieved for 2016 (but not yet verified until 2017).

► Asset Management Plan adopted and local urban infrastructure sub-projects in full service after completion (Yes/No, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	N	Y	Y	Y
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Comments

Results has been verified as achieved for 2015. Work is underway for 2016.

► Implementation Strategy for National Urban Development Program adopted with annual milestones (Yes/No, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	N	Y	Y	Y
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Comments

Results has been verified as achieved for 2015. Work is underway for 2016.

► Total number of people benefiting from Program (disaggregated by gender) (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	30886.00	2700.00	759300.00



Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021
------	-------------	-------------	-------------	-------------

Comments

Verified results for 2015 confirmed 3/7 cities achieving the infrastructure DLI 2. Achievement exceeded annual target for 2015 is zero.

▲ Number of male beneficiaries from the Program (Number, Custom Breakdown)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	15390.00	1367.00	384431.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

▲ Number of female beneficiaries from the Program (Number, Custom Breakdown)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	15496.00	1333.00	374869.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Overall Comments

Intermediate Results Indicators

► Professionally-staffed management units in place within each Participating City People's Committee (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	7.00	7.00	7.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Comments

All cities have been verified to have professionally-staffed management units in place in 2015, and reported to maintain them in 2016.



► People benefiting from city primary/secondary infrastructure services (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	30886.00	630.00	651500.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Comments

Results verified by SAV as part of the independent results verification process for 2015. Target for 2015 is zero.

► People benefiting from improved tertiary/social infrastructure services (disaggregated by gender) (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	2070.00	107800.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Comments

Results verified by SAV as part of the independent results verification process for 2015. Target for 2015 is zero.

▲ Number of women benefiting from improved tertiary/social infrastructure services (Number, Custom Breakdown)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	1023.00	53275.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

▲ Number of men benefiting from improved tertiary/social infrastructure services (Number, Custom Breakdown)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	1047.00	54525.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

► Ethnic Minority beneficiaries (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
--	----------	-------------------	------------------	------------



Value	0.00	18169.00	634.00	106302.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Comments

Results verified by SAV as part of the independent results verification process for 2015. Target for 2015 is zero.

▾ Male ethnic minority beneficiaries (Percentage, Custom Breakdown)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	9124.00	318.00	53318.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

▾ Female ethnic minority beneficiaries (Percentage, Custom Breakdown)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	9045.00	316.00	52984.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

▸ New and upgraded roads completed (Kilometers, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	11.86	3.28	101.90
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Comments

Results verified by SAV as part of the independent results verification process for 2015. Target for 2015 is 1.5km.

▸ Resettlement areas completed (Hectare(Ha), Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	236.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021



Comments

Results verified by SAV as part of the independent results verification process for 2015. Target for 2015 is zero.

► LIAs upgraded (Hectare(Ha), Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	126.30	54.50	333.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

Comments

Results verified by SAV as part of the independent results verification process for 2015. Target for 2015 is zero.

► Increase in own-sources revenue (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	7.00	6.00	7.00
Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	29-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2021

► Professionally-staffed unit in place in MOC; and capacity support for cities provided as per Annual Capacity Development Plan (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	PMU not consolidated, No capacity development plan or activity is available.	10/10 required staff are in place; Capacity Development Plan delivered as planned.	10/10 required staff are in place; Capacity Development Plan delivered as planned.	100% of staff in place in MOC and capacity support is fully provided as per Annual Capacity Development Plan
Date	01-May-2014	05-Oct-2015	05-Oct-2015	30-Jun-2021

► Completed Program report (Yes/No, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	N	Y	Y	Y



Date	01-May-2014	07-Mar-2016	07-Mar-2016	30-Jun-2021
------	-------------	-------------	-------------	-------------

Overall Comments