

## THE ETHNIC MINORITIES DEVELOPMENT PLAN OF QUANG BINH PROVINCE

### I. OVERVIEW

#### 1.1. Project description

The development objective (PDO) of ‘Vietnam: Improved Land Governance and Database’ Project (VILG) is to improve efficiency and transparency in land administration services in selected provinces of Vietnam. The PDO will be achieved through the development and implementation of the national Multi-Purpose Land Information System (MPLIS), an unified system of Land Registration Offices (LROs), and a system to monitor and evaluation of land use and management, both at national and sub-national levels. The project would comprise three components, as follows:

- **Component 1: Strengthening Quality of Land Service Delivery.** This component will support (a) modernizing and strengthening LROs to provide better land services; (b) training and providing communication systems and awareness raising for stakeholders, including implementation of ethnic minority development plans; and (c) establishing and operating a monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system for land-use management. The investments under this component will support quality enhancement of land service delivery by streamlining service procedures and standards, renovating facilities, and building up the capacity of personnel working in LROs in project provinces. The component will also help monitor the implementation of land use management in accordance with Land Law 2013 and progressively respond to current and emerging economic and social demands for better access to land information and better land services. The component will support unification of business standards and LRO working infrastructure at provincial and district levels. In addition, it will also enhance the participation of the public, corporates, and other stakeholders through communication and awareness campaigns. The activities under this component will facilitate and operationalize the technological advances that will have been brought about in Component 2 of the project and ensure better community participation.
- **Component 2: Establishment of MPLIS.** This component will support the development of the software by funding the IT Expert Panel and implementation of software for the MPLIS; the development and implementation of the national land database through digitizing existing maps and property rights records; verification, updating and integration of cadastral data (both cadastral maps users and land use information), land price data, land use plan data, land disputes and complaints resolution information, and key land resources thematic information. It will also finance limited cadastre surveying and mapping to improve the completeness and accuracy of the existing cadastral information (about 20% of the total project costs); and the enhancement of public engagement in land information services, including the establishment of an MPLIS land portal to facilitate public access to land information based on market demands.
- **Component 3: Project Management** will support overall project management, monitoring and evaluation (M&E) of activities and targets.

The project is expected to take place in two districts in Quảng Bình. The EM populations residing in the project sites in Quang Binh will also be subject to the project’s interventions.

## 1.2. Overview of the socio-economic conditions in Quang Binh Province

Quang Binh is located in the middle of the country, with the largest national highway running through the province. The province has Cha Lo national border gate, KaRoong border gate, and in the future, two national border gates will be opened. On the other hand, Quang Binh is a coastal province, taking advantage of the sea in its economic development and integration. Its geographic location is an advantage in economic development. To the north it shares the border with Ha Tinh. Quang Tri Province is in its south. The province is close to Laos in the west and the East Sea is in its east. This geographical position facilitates Quang Binh in accessing and acquiring advanced technology and management.

The natural area is 805,100 hectares, of which 209,100 hectares (26%) is unused land. In the currently used land, 11.1% is dedicated to agriculture, 84.3% forestry and 4.6% special use. In unused land, the province has 136,700 hectares of flat and hilly land, which is potential for agro – forestry production and new industrial establishments; and 2,388 hectares of unused water surface, which is potential for fresh and brackish aquaculture in the future.

The population was 868,174 people in 2014, the majority of whom is Kinh. Ethnic minorities are mostly Chut and Bru-Van Kieu, who occupy a significant proportion of the residential community in 16 communes and 1 town in five districts (namely Tuyen Hoa, Minh Hoa, Bo Trach, Quang Ninh and Le Thuy). According to 2014 statistics, the province had 22,385 ethnic people, representing 2.58% of the provincial population. Among them, Chut group accounted for 0.67% of the provincial population, Bru-Van Kieu 1.89% and other ethnic minorities 0.01%.

**Table 1: Distribution of Chut and Bru-Van Kieu ethnic groups in Quang Binh Province (in 2014)**

No.	Commune	District	Chut		Bru-Van Kieu	
			Households	Population	Households	Population
1	Thượng Hóa Commune	Minh Hóa	185	779	5	16
2	Hóa Sơn Commune	Minh Hóa	213	914	5	18
3	Hóa Hợp Commune	Minh Hóa	134	459	0	0
4	Dân Hóa Commune	Minh Hóa	377	1.694	374	1.706
5	Trọng Hóa Commune	Minh Hóa	81	478	643	3.359
6	Hóa Tiên Commune	Minh Hóa	155	604	1	3
7	Lâm Hóa Commune	Tuyên Hóa	106	473	0	0
8	Thanh Hóa Commune	Tuyên Hóa	39	144	0	4
9	Thượng Trạch Commune	Bố Trạch	1	7	474	2.291
10	Tân Trạch Commune	Bố Trạch	62	296	17	76
11	Việt Trung Town	Bố Trạch	0	0	76	338

1 2	Sơn Trạch Commune	Bố Trạch	0	0	44	184
1 3	Trường Xuân Commune	Quảng Ninh	0	0	196	740
1 4	Trường Sơn Commune	Quảng Ninh	0	0	605	2.633
1 5	Kim Thủy Commune	Lệ Thủy	0	0	581	2.436
1 6	Ngân Thủy Commune	Lệ Thủy	0	0	325	1.341
1 7	Lâm Thủy Commune	Lệ Thủy	0	0	294	1.280
			<b>1.353</b>	<b>5.848</b>	<b>3.640</b>	<b>16.425</b>

According to data compiled in 2014, the province has 1,353 households of Chut ethnic group with 5,848 people, accounting for 0.67% of the provincial population, and 3,640 households of Bru-Van Kieu ethnic group with 16,425 people, accounting for 1.89% of the provincial population.

**Table 2: List of villages with concentrated ethnic minority populations**

No.	District	Commune	Village
1	Minh Hóa	Thượng Hóa	Phú Minh
2			Ốn
3		Hóa Sơn	Yên Hợp
4			Hóa Lương
5			Lương Năng
6			Đặng Hóa
7			Tăng Hóa
8			Đa Năng
9			Đa Thịnh
10			Tân Tiến
11	Dân Hóa	Tân Bình	
12		Tân Hòa	
13		Tân Thuận	
14		Tân Lợi	
15		Lâm Hóa	
16		Lâm Khai	
17		Cha Lo	
18		K-Ai	
19		K – Vàng	
20		Bãi Dinh	
21		Ốc	
22		K – Reng	
23		Hà vi	
24		Ba Loóc	
25	Y Leng		

No.	District	Commune	Village
26			Ka - Định
27			TàLeng
28			TàRà
29			HàNông
30		TrọngHóa	K -Ing
31			KheRoộng
32			Roộng
33			La Trọng I
34			La Trọng II
35			Lé
36			Hung
37			ÔngTú
38			K -Rét
39			KheCây
40			Pa Choong
41			Ra Mai
42			K. Oóc
43			Sy
44			Dộ
45			Cha Cáp
46			TàVong - Tà Dong
47			Lòm - K.Chăm
48		HóaTiền	Yên Phong
49			Yên Hòa
50			MáLậu
51			Yên thành
52			YênThái
53			La vân
54			Ông Chinh
55			TânTiền
56	Minh Hóa	LâmHóa	Chuối
57			Cáo
58			Kè
59		Thanh Hóa	Cà Xen
60	BốTrạch	ThượngTrạch	Cốc
61			CồnRoàng
62			Nịu
63			Cu Tồn
64			Tuộc
65			Khe Rung
66			NôngMới
67			Bụt
68			CàRòng I
69			CờĐỏ

No.	District	Commune	Village
70			NôngCủ
71			51
72			A Ky
73			Troi
74			Ban
75			CàRòng II
76			Chăm Pu
77			61
78			Cốc
79		TânTrạch	39
80			Đoòng
81		Việt Trung Town	KheNgát
82		Sơn Trạch	Rào Con
83	Quảng Ninh	Trường Xuân	Lâm Ninh
84			KheDây
85			KheNgang
86			Hàng Chuồn
87			NàLâm
88		Trường Sơn	Trung Sơn
89			RìnRìn
90			CâyCà
91			CâySú
92			KheCát
93			Ploang
94			Thượng Sơn
95			DốcMây
96			HôiRáy
97			NướcĐắng
98			ĐáChát
99			BếnĐường
100			Sắt
101			CổTràng
102			ChânTrộng
103	Lệ Thủy	Kim Thủy	Chuôn
104			Bang
105			CônCùng
106			MítCát
107			Ho Rum
108			Trung Đoàn
109			An Bai
110			HàLạc
111			KheKhé
112			CâyBông
113		Ngân Thủy	Cầm Ly

No.	District	Commune	Village
114			KheGiũa
115			ĐáCòi
116			Km 14
117			Khe Sung
118			CửaMẹc
119		Lâm Thủy	Mới
120			TăngKý
121			Tân Ly
122			EoBù – ChútMút
123			XàKhía
124			BạchĐàn

The ethnic minorities in Quang Binh Province live in villages of mountainous and border communes. Some of them intersperse with Kinh people, mostly in districts of Tuyen Hoa, Minh Hoa, Bo Trach, Quang Ninh and Le Thuy. In recent years, thanks to the drastic direction of the Provincial People's Committee (PPC), the strong involvement of various agencies and sectors and the efforts of ethnic minorities in implementing ethnicity and social security policies synchronously, should social life of ethnic minorities become generally stable and increasingly improved. The production in industry, agriculture, forestry and fishery has been recovered and developed in terms of both productivity and output in places of ethnic minorities. The structure of sectors, crops and livestock production has been market-oriented. Services and trading continue to expand, facilitating the exchange of goods by ethnic minority groups. The movement in new rural development has been promoted, improving the prosperity in areas of ethnic minorities.

According to the scheme providing support in forms of housing, residential land, production land and water supply approved by the PPC, 1,121 households need 25 ha of residential land for their living. In recent years, the local authorities have combined housing construction with village planning to allocate residential land based on minimum norms. So far, the need of residential land in ethnic minorities has been basically satisfied.

Regarding production land for ethnic minorities, there has been engagement from the authorities and agencies at all levels and different policies such as making use of unused land, clearing new land, acquiring land from forest farms, maximizing the available land to construct small-size irrigation schemes and secure sufficient production land for ethnic minorities. According to statistics in 2014, the PPC transferred 4,200 hectares of land from forest farms to local governments meeting the need of more than 600 ethnic minority households. Consequently, the number of ethnic minority households lacking land in the province decreased markedly in recent years.

Most disputes and complaints in ethnic minority communities relate to land use rights between those in a family or interrelated families. The dispute settlement complies with current regulations, starting reconciliation at communal level. If the mediation fails, cases are forwarded to the District People's Court (or the competent People's Committee).

On the whole province, there has not been migration. The solidarity among ethnic groups has been tightened and strengthened. This security in rural ethnic minority areas has been relatively stable.

Because the ethnic minorities reside closely in districts of Quang Binh and some of them intersperse with the Kinh community, they do not have a significant gap in terms of language. The fact that village leaders and village elders are all minorities has facilitated the propagation and dissemination of policies and legislation, as well as the implementation of policies and guidelines issued by the Party and the State.

In general, the awareness of ethnic minorities about land policies remains limited. Especially, women are less involved and less concerned about land issues, partly due to their economic difficulties leading to their focus on business and housework, and partly because of their belief that land is on the man's shoulder. Therefore, most of certificates of land use rights (LURCs) granted previously have only the name of either husband or wife. Currently, there are both spouses' names.

## II. IMPLEMENTATION OF EMDP

### 2.1. A summary of the SA consultations in Thai Nguyen

This summary will provide methodology used, issues identified, and potential risks, impacts and project benefits to the EM group in Thai Nguyen.

#### 2.1.1. Methods of consultation

A team of three researchers, including one lead researcher, and two team members, have been employed for this assessment. A number of conventional qualitative research instruments are employed, including focus group discussions, in-depth interviews, note-taking, and photographing, and non-participant observation.

- **Focus group discussions:** Each FGD usually includes 6-8 participants who are recommended and invited by local guides following the requirements of the research team. Gender-disaggregated data are paid attention through the establishment of gender sensitive FGDs. Local guides are the chiefs of the selected residential units who have a very good understanding of the community. In order to understand likely different impacts and their responses to the project, a variety of respondent groups are selected, including land administrators, land user organisations, and land user householders, including local poor/near-poor and representatives from local ethnic minorities groups.
- **In-depth interviews:** The team plans to explore some case studies with more in-depth information. The informants for such in-depth interviews may be selected from the FGDs (researchers may find some discussants who have more interesting details to provide so have him/her for a separate in-depth interview). Also, the interviewees may be recommended directly by local guides after researchers have fully explained the assessment objectives.
- **Triangulation:** A few extra interviews with local officials and land administrators are added under a technique known as 'triangulation' to validate the information we have obtained from local residents/factory workers. They are an additional source rather than a proper sub-group. Also, there are some issues the latter may raise but do not understand why, given their positions. In such cases, the extra interviews would help clarify or supplement what local residents have stated. These interviews serve to validate and, in some cases, supplement the information provided by local residents.

#### 2.1.2. Information on respondents

The fieldwork was conducted in Quang Binh in early November 2015. The mission conducted direct consultations with representatives of provincial departments, organizations and EM people in Dong Hoi City and Dan Hoa Commune in Minh Hoa District. In total, the study team held eight consultative meetings and group discussions with 58 respondents from various stakeholders, including EM groups. The respondents include:

- **Land administrators:** are officials from the Departments of Natural Resources and the Environment (DoNREs), the Divisions of Natural Resources and the Environment

(DivNRE), and commune officials (leaders of the people's committees, cadastral officers and leaders of commune's mass organisations. They are directly or indirectly involved in land administration.

- **Representatives from the related sub-national agencies:** include those from the Departments of Information and Communication, the Departments of Justice, the Tax Administration, the Farmers' Association, the Women's Union, the Commission for Ethnicities, and the Youth's Unions.
- **The EM groups:** include non-poor and poor EM people in the study sites, particularly the Bru Van Kieu and Chut groups in Minh Hoa district.

### **Main findings from the SA consultation**

Most of participants in the consultation, after hearing about the Project for Improvement of Land Governance and Land Database (VILG), expressed their support to the project and expected the project to be implemented soon for them to easily obtain the necessary land information. The consultation with public officials, namely staff of provincial departments and agencies, district bureaus of resources and environment, Chairmen of Commune People's Committee, commune cadastral officers, etc., shows that land information services have been provided to organizations and individuals, including EM people (at Land Registration Offices, Information Centre, Commune People's Committee, etc.), although the land database is incomplete, outdated and not frequently updated. However, the number of information requests has not been significant. Especially, the demand from EM people living in the less developed areas is very low. The Quang Binh PPC has issued a decision stipulating the provision of information (including charges, fees and procedures, among others).

Most of respondents from Bru-Van Kieu and Chut ethnic groups said that they did not have demand and knowledge about the benefits of land information. Land transactions relating to land use rights in these areas are not common.

The consultation with EM people revealed that their awareness and access to technology (i.e., language, literacy, knowledge, access to computers and internet, etc.) are very limited, as compared to other groups. Therefore, during the project implementation, this constraint should be addressed to bring practical benefits to the people.

In addition, the EM respondents provided some stories on the existing formal ineffective grievance redressal mechanism. Some said that they did not have information on where and how to lodge their complaints, if any. Others were not aware of the procedures to settle grievances.

To mitigate unexpected impacts of the project on ethnic minorities, most of the respondents agreed to propose the following options:

- Focus on the awareness raising for ethnic minorities and the poor people with different forms suitable to each audience, custom and tradition;
- Train computer skills for village officials and residents;
- Specific policies are necessary for these groups (e.g., providing information at home or supplying computers in disadvantaged areas, so that people can access and use land information).

## **2. Implementation plan**

The central goal of this Ethnic Minorities Development Plan is to plan a continuous interaction between project staff and ethnic minorities in districts during the VLAP project implementation. The regular dialogues will enhance both understanding about the project and build the public trust on the local land management systems. This discussion will help to implement appropriate activities in public awareness raising. A better understanding of the traditional culture from ethnic minorities will create a better relationship between project staff



and the ethnic minorities in general, and strengthen the effectiveness of public awareness raising in particular.

To accomplish this goal, the Provincial Project Management Unit (PPMU) of VILG in Quang Binh plans to strengthen the communication and the participation of ethnic minorities and other involved groups through the following activities:

**Activity 1: To establish a provincial-level community advisory group and district-level community participatory groups and organize two workshops a year**

To build a channel to receive feedback from land users, especially ethnic minorities, a provincial-level community advisory group and district-level community participatory groups shall be established at district level. The composition, duties and activities of the provincial-level community advisory group and district-level community participatory groups shall follow a decision by the VILG Steering Committee of Quang Binh Province.

Each year, the PPMU will hold a consultation workshop to collect opinions of the community participatory groups at provincial- and district- levels. The group members will share information, discuss and recommend based on their views and experiences on the aspects that the PPMU need consultations, focusing on the following five issues:

- *How do the ethnic minorities understand about land? How their cultural practices are considered during the land measurement process?*
- *How should land officials consider about traditional practices on land in providing land information?*
- *How are interests in issues relating to customary use of land and land used for cultural and community purposes considered?*
- *What are the obstacles of the local ethnic minority groups to understand Vietnamese scripts on communication means or in meetings? How should awareness raising activities be organized to overcome such obstacles?*
- *What are effective channels and methods communication for ethnic minorities groups? What should be done for ethnic minority groups to have the best use of their land and fully register their land?*

During the project implementation, regular consultative activities at the district level regarding the foregoing issues may be linked with planned communication activities and irregular consultations may be held as needed. Consultative activities, regular or irregular alike, should be conducted in a **free, prior and informed** manner to ensure broad community support from EMs. In particular, as a principle of ensuring inclusion, participation and cultural suitability, the PPMU should hold continuous consultations including soliciting feedback from all communities so that remedial actions can be taken to support improved participation and provision of benefits to households including those of EMs. In particular, EM households, which have registered their land in the information system and have any complaints or denunciation on their registered land can lodge these grievances through the existing GRM to be handled according to the existing laws. Meanwhile, free, prior and informed consultation will be conducted with EM households which have not registered their land, before registering their land in the information system.

The consultation methods to be used are appropriate to social and cultural traits of EM groups that the consultations target, with particular attention given to land administrators, household land users, village leaders and other service providers related. The methods should also be gender and inter-generationally inclusive, voluntary, free of interference and non-manipulative.

The process of consultation should be two way, i.e. both informing and discussing as well as both listening and responding. All consultations should be conducted in good faith and in an

atmosphere free of intimidation or coercion, i.e. without the presence of those people who may be intimidating to respondents. It should also be implemented with gender inclusive and responsive approaches, tailored to the needs of disadvantaged and vulnerable groups, enabling incorporation of all relevant views of affected people and other stakeholders into decision making. In particular, land users from EM groups will be provided with relevant information about the project as much as possible in a culturally appropriate manner during project implementation, monitoring and evaluation to promote their meaningful participation and inclusion. The information may include but not be confined to conceptualization, design, proposal, safeguards, execution, and monitoring and evaluation. In particular, all relevant information for consultation will be provided through two channels. Firstly, information will be disseminated to village leaders at their monthly meeting with leaders of commune's people's committees in order to be relayed to villagers in village meetings in a culturally appropriate manner and an accessible language. Secondly, notices in an accessible language will be posted at the commune's people's committee at least a week ahead of a planned consultative meeting. Such early notices ensure sufficient time to understand, assess and analyze information on the proposed activities.

In addition, the project activities and interventions should draw the active participation and guidance (formal and informal) of local leaders that are available in communities, such as heads of villages and extended family networks, and members of mediation panels. The community supervision board at the commune level should be engaged to closely monitor the participation standards of local institutions and officials in various project activities and interventions during the implementation of VILG. inputs/information used for monitoring and evaluation may include EM's access to the land information system established by the project, their benefits from the received information etc.). By enabling participation of relevant EM stakeholders during project planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation, the project can ensure that EM people receive social and economic benefits that are culturally appropriate to them. In doing so, the land information established by VILG can contribute to transparency and efficiency efforts and development outcomes as a whole among EM groups. Capacity should be built for those stakeholders to avoid the existing constraints in conducting local consultations, such as one-way consultation; lack of information; rush time; and coercion.

## **Activity 2: To use effective communication approaches and tools**

### **The communication plan**

It is important to develop an adequate communication plan to boost both demand from EM groups and advocacy for stronger commitment from the local authorities in addressing constraints in supplying adequate land information services for EM groups. The communication plan should take into account the constraints and emerging requirements that have been reflected in the local consultations to avoid exclusion of EM groups from the project and its benefits. The communication plan should facilitate two-way dialogues – it is not only about telling EM people information of the programme, but about listening to and responding to their concerns. The communication plan to support VILG should address following areas:

### **With the supply side**

- How to obtain and increase commitment from the sub-national authorities and implementers for the reform of the current land information system. This is a process known as social mobilization to build trust of land users. As a result of the process, land administrators should engage with EM land users on a regular basis for raising questions and concerns regarding their rights to land use and access to land information; and provide them with reliable local land information. In addition, local facilitators should improve communication skills with

EM groups; know how to create and facilitate platforms and forums for community participation to provide feedback on the VGIL implementation process.

- How to develop a platform for EM community participation to discuss and dialogue with land administrators regarding various issues, including their concerns and claim for their land-use rights, as a result of the land information that they receive from the project system;
- How to develop communication platforms for EM groups at the grassroots levels (e.g. village meetings etc.) to receive feedback on the functioning of the supply side sector and its ability to cope with the increasing demand for land information services as a result of VILG. The procedures on the feedback mechanism should be clear and transparent, especially to the EM groups, e.g. regarding which channels to receive feedback and which stakeholders should be held accountable for responding to feedback, and how long. Timely guidance and responses to EM land users' concerns and recommendations should be provided via these communication platforms, and the progress monitored.

### **With the demand side**

- How to raise demand for and then maintain practices of utilising land information services for EM groups;
- What should be planned for behavior change communication (BCC) amongst EM groups in the project sites. The communication plan and IEC materials should be designed taking into account cultural differences in behaviours among different EM groups and specific behavioral changes to be addressed.
- How to customise VILG's communication activities and local information campaigns to address specific needs of different EM groups in terms of language and cultural relevance. The strategy should take into account differences in how information is disseminated among different EM groups and leverage the presence of credible traditional institutional structures and formal and informal EM organizations in the project areas for dissemination, allowing support and counseling to EM land users in their language and culturally appropriate way. Local facilitators will be actively encouraged to support hard-to-reach groups; and
- To plan how to address bottlenecks, barriers and fears caused by socio-cultural practices and belief and answer questions from stakeholders;

### **Outreach communication**

- **Appropriate IEC materials for dissemination:** Development and dissemination of a package set of printed and audio-visual IEC materials (booklets, leaflets, posters, short documentary films, edu-taining programmes, TV spots, radio, etc with the relevant logos, IEC messages, and slogans) to relevant groups of target audiences as identified in the communication plan, are essential to ensure key messages and knowledge to be delivered to EM groups. The work will contribute to raise awareness for EM groups, change their attitude and behaviour in seeking land information and in the long term, contribute to change and maintain behaviours recommended by the project. The design of these IEC materials should be suitable (socially and culturally accepted) to EM groups following the standards of IEC material development (Clear; Concise; Courteous; Call for actions etc). Materials need to be carefully developed in order to effectively disseminate information to both literate and semi-literate householders and to householders for whom Kinh is a second language, hence a minimal amount of non-technical text and the use of drawings and graphic representations wherever possible will be critical. These materials should be pre-tested with target communities in some of the project provinces to assess their comprehensibility and possible effectiveness. Last but not least, it is important to conduct orientation/training to stakeholders, as identified in the communication plan, on how to use the IEC materials effectively.
- **Media campaigns:** Mass media campaigns may also be appropriate for one-way information dissemination. But given the variability of situations between provinces (and, indeed, even

districts within provinces) and EM land users' interest in information which relates to their own situation, it is advisable that the focus of such campaigns should be predominantly on location-specific information, which can be broadcast through local TV and radio networks. The use of commune loudspeakers may be an effective means of reaching a large number of people at a relatively low cost, but it should be recognised that information broadcast through this medium is not always well retained, and cannot be used in areas where the people live in a scattered manner. Where appropriate, the development of memorable soundbites or slogans may counter this problem to some extent. Public displays of information such as maps, plans and procedures (in an accessible form) at both district and commune level may also be beneficial. Prior to the launch of MPLIS, information campaigns should be conducted amongst EM groups which outline benefits and knowledge of how to access and use land information from MPLIS and associated fees (if any, where relevant). These campaigns should be conducted via meetings, mass media and the dissemination of printed or audio-visual IEC materials, depending on specific local social contexts.

- **Engagement of local information points:** Local authorities are encouraged to use and bring into play the role of village cadres, especially those from community mass organizations/unions. Information contact points should also be village chiefs, given many advantages of this post as identified in many studies. These people and organizations are mainly EM people who are living in EM areas; therefore, they have been active in communicating and popularizing relevant policies/programmes to local people. The final decision on the most relevant and effective information points should be made by the province, depending on current local contexts.
- **Counselling:** As the assessment indicates that many respondents are unaware of the land legislation and how it is applied in practice (interpreting the law), it may be necessary to provide counseling in parallel to MPLIS in some communities.
- **Regular local meetings:** Regular ward/commune meetings, including scheduled question-and-answer sessions, may be one of the most effective ways to update EM local communities on project interventions and receive their comments and feedback. Information for the poor should be provided during a home visit or a meeting for poor people as they usually do not attend common meetings.
- **Modern facilities:** The Vietnamese script in DVD and some communication materials (including video clips) will be translated into languages of ethnic minorities for their use during project implementation based on recommendations made by district community participatory groups. The registration of land use rights for households and communities are chosen together with other information to be included in these communication tools. They will be stored at cultural centers and used for explanation of the project and the land management. Computers may be installed in communes and villages for ethnic people to access information easily and conveniently (training and guidance will be provided). The access to and public disclosure of land information, as well as the active participation of communities in monitoring land law implementation will be facilitated.

### **Activity 3. To train village leaders**

Before village meetings, the PPMU will provide training sessions for village leaders, so that they can support during project implementation.

### **Activity 4. To organize public meetings at villages and communes**

The additional budget is used for meetings to answer questions from the public with interpretation into languages of ethnic minorities in every village and commune. These activities will be started early at the project beginning and sustained during the project life.

Particularly in villages and communes with large ethnic minorities, PPMU and district community participatory groups will organize meetings in each commune or village with the participation of local ethnic people to answer their questions and explain in ethnic languages.

During these meetings, the PPMU staff, with help from local ethnic officials, will describe project activities, settlement mechanism of land disputes (e.g. where and to whom they should make complains, what problems related to land measurement, and registration, etc.), tax incentive policies applicable to households in disadvantaged areas (e.g., tax exemptions for poor households, etc.), emphasize the rights of women to be named on LURCs, as well as recommend the sources of land information.

Besides, the PPMU in collaboration with the mass media (e.g., radio and television) shall communicate this information across the province.

The documents used in public meetings and commune consultations are delivered by the PPMU on the basis of forms, legal documents and communication materials prepared by the VILG Central Project Management Unit (CPMU). All materials are designed with simple messages and clear images. If project funds are available, these documents will be translated into several languages of ethnic minorities to be delivered locally.

### **Activity 5. To train land administrators**

Several orientation workshops for land administrators in working with ethnic minorities will be focussed on (1) special needs of people with language barriers, and (2) importance of local consultation. These issues will be incorporated in project training sessions to improve capacity for land administrators, as well as to enhance the quality of land information services performed by responsible officials.

### **Activity 6. To establish land registration services in remote communities**

District branches of Land Registration Offices (LROs) will perform land registration in these areas.

The project would maintain close engagement with EM beneficiaries, who will have increased and better access to land information and better services with integrated digital data vital for improving land governance. For this purpose, the Project will build on the successful process established under VLAP through Local Facilitators (LFs) to address the needs of targeted beneficiaries. Access to land information and better land services are expected to increase with the improvement of LROs and the promotion of e-governance, and the building of stakeholders' capacity.

The project will promote activities by local mass organisations, such as the youths' unions and women's unions, which involve EM communities in their work, and civil society organisations. These organisations can add value to information transparency efforts in EM communities through introduction of more participatory planning processes, and capacity development, among other areas. Especially, local facilitators may be encouraged to be recruited from local mass organisations, especially the women's unions.

### **Activities 7: Consideration of gender-related issues**

It is essential to increase the participation of women, especially in the EM groups in the project sites, in various project activities and interventions, such as information dissemination and training, local facilitator work, and commune working groups. It is important to raise awareness for women of their rights and benefits in joint husband-and-wife titling and use of land-use rights certificates for bank loans, lease and contributions to joint business, their rights to access to the GRM system and how to lodge their complaints when needs arise.

It should be recognised that engagement of and awareness raising for women, especially EM women, is a time-consuming process which should be planned and phased effectively with clear and practical short-, medium- and long-term objectives to make various steps feasible, with lessons reviewed and learnt as well as plans revised after each phase. Importantly, women from

various groups should be consulted in good faith throughout the project cycle, from the design to the evaluation steps to ensure their voices to be heard and paid due attention to.

There is a risk that female attendance at information workshops and meetings may be low. Specific measures may therefore be necessary to enhance women's current access to information and their associated engagement in VILG. Efforts will be needed to arrange a location and time suitable for the participation of women, and additional promotional activities may also be necessary to maximise attendance by female householders.

Training provided to local land administrators and facilitators as well as project staff should take into account gender sensitivity. The composition of a mobile support team, as suggested earlier in this report, may ideally include a female member to address issues that require gender sensitivity. For instance, some female clients may not feel comfortable in seeking information and advice from male staff as a result of certain cultural and customary barriers. M&E arrangements should include indicators that should allow analysis disaggregated by gender.

### **Activities 8. To provide information about grievance redress mechanism**

Local cadastral officers will be told in project training courses that any land issues related to ethnic minorities must be reported to the PPMU regardless the issues are settled successfully or not.

The mechanism for settling complaints and disputes, receiving and tracking the progress of dispute resolution should be followed as dictated in the Project Operational Manual and guidance of the CPMU.

To support this mechanism, the PPMU shall appoint one official responsible for receiving disputes, monitoring the settlement process, facilitating related institutions to settle disputes and notify the results of settlement and correction measures.

## **III. IMPLEMENTATION ARRANGEMENTS**

### **3.1. Roles and responsibilities**

- The CPMU will be responsible for providing training and guidance on the implementation, and supervising the implementation of the EMDP in the local project sites on a basis of the EMPF and POM.

- Leaders of the Provincial People's Committee will be responsible for providing guidance and supervising the implementation of the EMDP in the province.

- DONRE and PPMU in collaboration with the District's People's Committee shall be responsible for organizing activities under the EMDP and Project Operation Manual (POM);

- The PPMU shall assign one officer to be the focal point on social issues. This staff shall be responsible for supervising the Project District Implementation Group in terms of full implementation of these EMDP activities;

- The periodical reports of PPMU (quarterly and monthly) will include the reports on EMDP implementation which clearly state the EMDP activities already implemented in the project areas, feedback of ethnic minorities related to the project implementation and next activities. The reports should be sent to VILG's CPMU.

- Representatives from the Provincial Committee for Ethnic Affairs, provincial advisory groups and district-level community groups, commune/ward cadastral officers will be responsible for (i) coordinating with VILG's PPMU to organise consultative meetings with local people; (ii) evaluating and consulting with them on issues relating to the project implementation

and ethnic minorities; and (iii) supervising the satisfaction with land management services by EM communities in the project districts.

- EM communities will be responsible for reporting the actual implementation of the project in their local areas as well as its positive and negative impacts on their rights and benefits.

- The Provincial Ethnic Minority Committee, the Provincial Consultative Group, and district participatory groups shall be responsible for reviewing and consulting on issues related to the project implementation and ethnic minorities; cooperating with PPMU to organize consultative meetings, and supervising the levels of acceptance and satisfaction of the community towards land services in the participating districts, including for the Kinh group and other ethnic minorities;

- During the implementation period, if any problem arises, the related members should promptly report to the PPMU, and the Provincial Steering Committee for timely measures.

### **3.2. The grievance redress mechanism (GRM)**

VILG will establish an unit in charge of comments and complaints from the public in general, and from ethnic minorities groups in particular in the project sites regarding the implementation of the project. Complaints will be handled in a timely manner, and written responses will be provided to complainants.

The provincial PMUs and the related agencies at the district and commune levels will record and document the received complaints and resolutions, which will be attached to bi-annual process reports to the central PMU for synthesis and submit to the World Bank.

Forms of comments and complaints: written documents submitted, emails or direct communication (such as through telephones).

Channels for receiving comments and complaints: People can send written texts or present their issues to village elderly, village heads or commune officials. In case of resolution failure, these complaints will be referred to the district level or the provincial PMUs for settlement.

DoNRE would settle cases when complainants do not agree with first-time resolutions provided by VILG's PPMUs.

The procedures to redress grievances follow POM.

### **3.3. The M&E mechanism**

A system to monitor the implementation of EMDP will be established in districts with EM populations.

The district-level community support group will be responsible for supporting the district division for project implementation and the PPMU to regularly monitor satisfaction of EM people, and evaluate whether VILG has improved EM groups' living standards and awareness, or has avoided or mitigated its negative impacts on the latter.

M&E indicators regarding the progress and outcomes in the implementation of EMDPs will be disaggregated by ethnicity. Some stakeholders, such as the Committee for Ethnic Affairs and advisory groups on ethnic minorities can access this information.

The PPMU will appoint an officer as a focal point to receive and monitor results of land-related grievances relating to the implementation of VILG. Progress reports on the implementation of the EMDP will be produced on a monthly, biannual and annual basis.

#### **IV. DISCLOSURE OF EMDP**

EMDP will be publicized in the World Bank's Infoshop, and at the people's committees in districts and communes with ethnic minorities and by many other channels to ensure that ethnic minorities can easily access and understand the plan contents.

#### **V. ESTIMATED COSTS**

The budget for the implementation of EMDP in each province will be estimated on the basis of proposed activities and included in project costs.

Annex One provides cost estimates for implementing EMDPs in four first-year provinces, namely Thai Nguyen, Quang Binh, Ha Tinh, and An Giang. The separate estimated budget for implementing all activities as described in Quang Binh's EMDP is **35,000 USD**.



## Annex one: Cost estimates for implementing EMDPs in four first-year provinces

Activity	Contents	Unit	Quantity	Unit cost	Total
<b>Activity 1</b>	<b><i>Establishing the provincial advisory group and district community group and organising two workshops per annum</i></b>				<b>65,000</b>
-	Payment for the advisory group (from the land sector, the sectors in charge of EM Affairs, Culture, representatives of EM communities, etc) (5 years)				0
+	<i>Thai Nguyen</i>				<i>They take up unpaid additional responsibilities</i>
+	<i>Ha Tinh</i>				
+	<i>Quang Binh</i>				
+	<i>An Giang</i>				
-	Consultative workshops with the provincial advisory group and district participatory community group (1 workshop/province/ year x 5 years)				65,000
+	<i>Thai Nguyen</i>	Workshop	5	5,000	25,000
+	<i>Ha Tinh</i>	Workshop	5	2,000	10,000
+	<i>Quang Binh</i>	Workshop	5	2,000	10,000
+	<i>An Giang</i>	Workshop	5	4,000	20,000
<b>Activity 2</b>	<b><i>Use of modern and effective communication tools</i></b> Preparing communication contents (DVD, video clips); Broadcasting, and production of DVD				
-	<i>Thai Nguyen</i>				<i>Incorporated in sub-component 1.3</i>
-	<i>Ha Tinh</i>				
-	<i>Quang Binh</i>				
-	<i>An Giang</i>				
<b>Activity 3</b>	<b>Training of village heads (2 training workshops )</b>				<b>14,000</b>
-	<i>Thai Nguyen</i>	Workshop	1	5,000	5,000

-	Tỉnh Hà Tĩnh	Workshop	1	2,000	2,000
-	Quảng Bình	Workshop	1	2,000	2,000
-	An Giang	Workshop	1	5,000	5,000
<b>Activity 4</b>	<b>Organising village and commune meetings</b>				<b>90,000</b>
-	Thai Nguyen	Meeting	200	200	40,000
-	Ha Tinh	Meeting	50	200	10,000
-	Quang Binh	Meeting	100	200	20,000
-	An Giang	Meeting	100	200	20,000
<b>Activity 5</b>	<b>Meetings to introduce project sites</b> (in 6 districts, with representatives at the district and commune levels in the project sites)				<b>1,800</b>
-	Thai Nguyen	Meeting	6	300	1,800
<b>Activity 6</b>	<b>Training of land administrators</b> (Orientation workshops for land administrators in working with EM people) (2 workshops/ province)	Workshop	<b>2</b>	<b>25,000</b>	<b>26,000</b>
-	Thai Nguyen	Workshop	2	5,000	10,000
-	Ha Tinh	Workshop	1	3,000	3,000
-	Quang Binh	Workshop	1	3,000	3,000
-	An Giang	Workshop	2	5,000	10,000
<b>Activity 7</b>	<b>Establishing support services for access to land information and registration in communities with EM populations.</b>				<b>37,000</b>

-	Support for LROs to provide support services for access to land information and registration for EM populations in deep and remote areas (once per year)				21,000
+	<i>Thai Nguyen</i>	Session	30	300	9,000
+	<i>Ha Tinh</i>	Session	10	300	3,000
+	<i>Quang Binh</i>	Session	10	300	3,000
+	<i>An Giang</i>	Session	20	300	6,000
-	LROs provide training for commune officials to tap Internet-based land information.				16,000
+	<i>Thai Nguyen</i>	Workshop	1	5,000	5,000
+	<i>Ha Tinh</i>	Workshop	1	3,000	3,000
+	<i>Quang Binh</i>	Workshop	1	3,000	3,000
+	<i>An Giang</i>	Workshop	1	5,000	5,000
<b>Activity 8</b>	<b><i>Providing information on GRM</i></b> Organising training workshops on skills to redress grievances for cadastral officers and members of village mediation teams				<b>14,000</b>
-	<i>Ha Tinh</i>	Workshop	2	2,000	4,000
-	<i>Quang Binh</i>	Workshop	2	2,000	4,000
-	<i>An Giang</i>	Workshop	2	3,000	6,000
<b>Activity 9</b>	<b><i>M&amp;E:</i></b> Monitoring and evaluating implementation of the project in the project sites by ethnicity, near-poverty/poverty/ non-poverty status and gender				<b>2,000</b>
-	<i>Ha Tinh</i>				1,000
-	<i>An Giang</i>				1,000

## **Annex Two: A sample minute of consultation**

Below is a sample minute of consultation with Bru-Van Kieu people in Minh Hoa district, Quang Binh, on November 24, 2015.

### **THÔNG TIN THU ĐƯỢC TỪ CÁC NHÓM THẢO LUẬN TẠI QUANG BINH**

#### ***1. Hiện trạng cung cấp thông tin và nhu cầu thông tin đất của cơ quan quản lý/đơn vị/dịch vụ/người dân (chú trọng tới nhóm nghèo/phụ nữ/DTTS)***

*- Tại Sở Tài nguyên và Môi trường (Cán bộ làm công tác quản lý đất đai):*

Qua trao đổi với người sử dụng đất là các tổ chức sử dụng đất, ngân hàng, luật sư, văn phòng công chứng thì hiện nay khi có nhu cầu về thông tin đất đai thì đối với những thông tin cơ bản như chính sách, pháp luật chủ yếu lấy thông tin qua mạng internet; còn đối với các thông tin liên quan đến quy hoạch, thông tin về thửa đất... thì chủ yếu dựa vào mối quan hệ (quen biết, “cò”) để có được thông tin cần thiết, ít khi lên trực tiếp lên cơ quan nhà nước có thẩm quyền để xin cung cấp thông tin. Việc dựa vào mối quan hệ để được cung cấp thông tin phải mất phí dịch vụ (tiền cho “cò”) và thường cao hơn phí nhà nước quy định, tuy nhiên, khi cung cấp thông tin qua dịch vụ này thì thời gian nhanh hơn và thuận lợi hơn.

Về đánh giá đối với dịch vụ cung cấp thông tin nhà nước: các ý kiến đánh giá đều có chung ý kiến việc tiếp cận thông tin từ các cơ quan nhà nước còn rườm rà mất thời gian, cán bộ còn quan liêu. Chưa có chế định cụ thể về trách nhiệm, cơ quan có thẩm quyền nào cung cấp và những thông tin được cung cấp. Có một số thông tin cung cấp nhưng không đúng với nhu cầu của người dân (chưa đầy đủ chỉ cung cấp một phần).

*- Tại phường Khắc Niệm, thành phố Bắc Ninh (thành phần: PCT xã, cán bộ địa chính và Bí thư, Tổ trưởng tổ dân phố):*

Hiện nay, tại phường Khắc Niệm, đã có bộ phận một cửa, tuy nhiên việc cung cấp thông tin về đất đai cho người dân chủ bằng hình thức trao đổi trực tiếp với cán bộ địa chính xã; qua phản ánh từ đồng chí Tổ trưởng Tổ dân phố thì đối với đất đai người dân ít hỏi qua Tổ trưởng Tổ dân phố.

Thông tin mà người dân thường có nhu cầu là tách hộ, cấp giấy chứng nhận, tặng đất đai cho con. Qua đánh giá của các đối tượng trong nhóm thảo luận thì tâm lý người dân thường ngại lên gặp cơ quan nhà nước (có sự thành kiến) và cũng do không hiểu biết nhiều về các quy định của pháp luật đất đai nên số lượng người dân lên xã đề nghị cung cấp thông tin là không nhiều so với nhu cầu thực tế.

*- Tại xã Trung Nghĩa, huyện Yên Phong (đối tượng là người dân):*

Khi có nhu cầu về thông tin đất đai người dân lên gặp cán bộ địa chính xã hoặc có thể qua trường thôn, một số thông tin có thể hỏi những người đã biết (trước đây đã làm thủ tục).

Số người dân được hỏi đều không biết thông tin về quy hoạch (thông tin về quy hoạch theo quy định của pháp luật đều được công khai tại xã).

Thông tin người dân quan tâm nhất là về cấp giấy chứng nhận và thế chấp (do nhu cầu của người dân tại xã Trung Nghĩa đối với việc thế chấp tại ngân hàng là rất lớn nên họ quan tâm đến việc cấp giấy chứng nhận vì có giấy chứng nhận thì mới được đem đi thế chấp)

Khi hỏi đối tượng là phụ nữ thì đa số là không biết, hoặc không làm các thủ tục và các dịch vụ liên quan đến đất đai, chủ yếu là chồng và con làm thay. Họ cũng không quan tâm và không có hiểu biết đến chính sách pháp luật đất đai.

Theo phản ánh của người dân thì khi thực hiện các thủ tục, dịch vụ liên quan đến đất đai chủ yếu là qua quan hệ (cò), số người được hỏi đa số trả lời thì việc thực hiện thông qua thông dịch vụ bên ngoài thì nhanh và thuận lợi hơn cho dù có mất nhiều tiền hơn (lý do: mất thời gian, để thời gian đi làm việc khác; thủ tục rườm rà và không hiểu hết các quy định của pháp luật nên ngại đi làm). Có cá nhân phản ánh khi tự đi làm sổ đỏ thì cơ quan nhà nước trả lời là chưa làm được (chưa có chủ trương) nhưng khi nhờ qua dịch vụ lại làm được.

## ***2. Kỳ vọng về thông tin đất đai của họ, gồm cả kỳ vọng về các kênh và phương thức truyền thông phù hợp (chú trọng tới nhóm nghèo/phụ nữ/DTTS):***

- Nên có chế định cụ thể về trách nhiệm, cơ quan có thẩm quyền nào cung cấp và những thông tin được cung cấp;

- Hình thức cung cấp thông tin, dịch vụ cung cấp thông tin phải đa dạng hơn. Phải xây dựng từng loại hình dịch vụ phù hợp với từng đối tượng khách hàng khác nhau.

- Việc tuyên truyền phổ biến nên có những hình thức phù hợp hơn: như đối với đối tượng là phụ nữ nên lồng ghép việc tuyên truyền vào các cuộc họp Hội phụ nữ, đối với đối tượng là đàn ông nên tuyên truyền vào khoảng thời gian không phải giờ đi làm (buổi tối), đối với người nghèo nên tổ chức tuyên truyền tận nhà hoặc nhóm họp những đối tượng này với nhau; Ngoài ra, có thể lồng ghép việc tuyên truyền qua các cuộc họp đoàn thể, sinh hoạt chi bộ, họp tổ dân phố hàng Tháng, hàng Quý.

- Nên đơn giản hóa các thủ tục và các loại giấy tờ về cung cấp thông tin để người dân có thể tiếp cận dễ dàng hơn. Người dân sẵn sàng trả thêm phí (tiền) để

được cung cấp thông tin, dịch vụ đất đai được tốt hơn, thuận lợi hơn (tại nhà, tại tổ chức có nhu cầu).

### ***3. Nhận thức của họ về các Văn phòng đăng ký đất***

Đối với các tổ chức thì đa số đều biết và hiểu về vai trò, chức năng và trách nhiệm của Văn phòng Đăng ký đất đai;

Đối với người dân là phụ nữ thì rất ít người biết đến với Văn phòng Đăng ký đất đai, họ chỉ biết Văn phòng Đăng ký đất đai là cơ quan có trách nhiệm cấp sổ đỏ, ngoài ra các chức năng khác của VPĐKĐĐ thì không biết;

Đối với người dân là nam giới thì họ có biết về Văn phòng Đăng ký đất đai và một số người đã từng đi làm các dịch vụ tại Văn phòng Đăng ký đất đai.

### ***4. Những suy nghĩ của họ về các tác động không mong muốn do hoạt động của dự án (chú trọng tới nhóm nghèo/phụ nữ/DTTS):***

Giữa đối tượng người nghèo, phụ nữ về nhận thức, trình độ năng lực và tiếp cận với công nghệ (máy tính, điện thoại, internet...) so với các đối tượng khác là hạn chế hơn, do đó, việc tiếp cận thông tin của đối tượng này sẽ khó khăn hơn. Tuy nhiên, đối tượng người nghèo trên địa bàn tỉnh Bắc Ninh chiếm số lượng rất ít.

Việc xây dựng được một hệ thống cơ sở dữ liệu đầy đủ, xây dựng một hệ thống Văn phòng Đăng ký đất đai hiện đại nhưng không xây dựng được một khung pháp lý phù hợp cho việc vận hành, khai thác, công tác tuyên truyền phổ biến về lợi ích của dự án không đến được với người dân thì dự án khi triển khai sẽ không có hiệu quả.

### ***5. Những đề xuất về phương án giảm thiểu các tác động không mong muốn (chú trọng tới nhóm nghèo/phụ nữ/DTTS)***

Tập trung, tuyên truyền, phổ biến để nâng cao nhận thức đối với những đối tượng DTTS, người nghèo với nhiều hình thức khác nhau phù hợp với từng đối tượng, phong tục tập quán; Tập huấn kỹ năng sử dụng máy tính cho cán bộ thôn và người dân.