

Document of
The World Bank
FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Report No: PP5249

INTERNATIONAL BANK FOR RECONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT *AND/OR*
INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION

PROJECT PAPER

ON A

PROPOSED GRANT

IN THE AMOUNT OF

US\$ {0.5} MILLION

TO THE

{BALKAN GREEN FOUNDATION (BGF)}

FOR A

{KOSOVO GREEN ACTION}

{February 2, 2023}

{Social Sustainability And Inclusion Global Practice}

{Europe And Central Asia Region}

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(Exchange Rate Effective {Nov 03, 2022})

Currency Unit =

= US\$1

FISCAL YEAR
January 1 - December 31

Regional Vice President: Anna M. Bjerde
Country Director: Xiaoqing Yu
Global Director: Louise J. Cord
Practice Manager: Varalakshmi Vemuru
Task Team Leader(s): Ann-Sofie Jespersen, Ifeta Smajic

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CSA	Collaborative Social Accountability
CSO	Civil Society Organization
CPF	Country Partnership Framework
DA	Designated Account
DFIL	Disbursement and Financial Information Letter
ERO	Energy Regulatory Office
FM	Financial Management
FOI	Freedom Of Information
FOL	Lëvizja FOL - FOL Movement
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNI	Gross National Income
GoK	Government of Kosovo
GRM	Grievance Redress Mechanism
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
IDA	International Development Association
IFR	Interim un-audited Financial Reports
MOU	Memorandum Of Understanding
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PPSD	Project Procurement Strategy for Development
SCD	Systematic Country Diagnostic
STEP	Bank's Systematic Tracking of Exchange in Procurement
WBG	World Bank Group



BASIC INFORMATION

Is this a regionally tagged project? No		Country (ies)
Financing Instrument Investment Project Financing		Classification Small Grants
Approval Date 22-Dec-2022	Closing Date 31-Dec-2025	Environmental and Social Risk Classification Low
Approval Authority CDA	Bank/IFC Collaboration No	

Please Explain

Proposed Development Objective(s)

The proposed development objective is to contribute to improving accountability of relevant Kosovo public institutions in the implementation of the Green Agenda.

Components

Component Name	Cost (USD Million)
Development and Support for Collaborative Social Accountability in the Green Agenda.	276,200.00
Stakeholder Engagement and Capacity Building for Collaborative Social Accountability.	153,700.00
Project Management, Monitoring and Learning, and Knowledge Dissemination.	70,100.00

Organizations

Borrower :	Balkan Green Foundation (BGF)
Implementing Agency :	Balkan Green Foundation (BGF) Lëvizja FOL (FOL Movement) Open Data Kosovo (ODK)



PROJECT FINANCING DATA (US\$, Millions)

SUMMARY

Total Project Cost	0.50
Total Financing	0.50
Financing Gap	0.00

DETAILS

Non-World Bank Group Financing

Trust Funds	0.50
Global Partnership for Social Accountability	0.50

Expected Disbursements (in USD Million)

Fiscal Year	2023	2024	2025	2026
Annual	0.00	0.04	0.20	0.26
Cumulative	0.00	0.04	0.24	0.50

INSTITUTIONAL DATA

Financing & Implementation Modalities

Situations of Urgent Need of Assistance or Capacity Constraints

- Fragile State(s)
- Fragile within a non-fragile Country
- Small State(s)
- Conflict
- Responding to Natural or Man-made Disaster

Other Situations

- Financial Intermediaries (FI)
- Performance-Based Conditions (PBCs)
- Alternative Procurement Arrangements (APA)
- Series of Projects (SOP)
- Contingent Emergency Response Component (CERC)
- Hands-on Expanded Implementation Support (HEIS)



Practice Area (Lead)

Social Sustainability and Inclusion

Contributing Practice Areas

Environment, Natural Resources & the Blue Economy

OVERALL RISK RATING

Risk Category

Rating

Overall

● Moderate

COMPLIANCE

Policy

Does the project depart from the CPF in content or in other significant respects?

Yes No

Does the project require any waivers of Bank policies?

Yes No



Environmental and Social Standards Relevance Given its Context at the Time of Appraisal

E & S Standards	Relevance
Assessment and Management of Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts	Relevant
Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure	Relevant
Labor and Working Conditions	Relevant
Resource Efficiency and Pollution Prevention and Management	Not Currently Relevant
Community Health and Safety	Relevant
Land Acquisition, Restrictions on Land Use and Involuntary Resettlement	Not Currently Relevant
Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Management of Living Natural Resources	Not Currently Relevant
Indigenous Peoples/Sub-Saharan African Historically Underserved Traditional Local Communities	Not Currently Relevant
Cultural Heritage	Not Currently Relevant
Financial Intermediaries	Not Currently Relevant

Legal Covenants

Conditions

PROJECT TEAM

Bank Staff

Name	Role	Specialization	Unit
Ann-Sofie Jespersen	Team Leader(ADM Responsible)		SSIGL
Ifeta Smajic	Team Leader		SCASO
Carlos Lago Bouza	Procurement Specialist(ADM Responsible)		EECRU



Jonida Myftiu	Financial Management Specialist(ADM Responsible)		EECG2
Engji Susuri	Social Specialist(ADM Responsible)		SCASO
Alina Frederieke Koenig	Team Member		SSIGL
Aly Zulficar Rahim	Window Manager		SSIDR
Ben Ivan Bakalovic	Team Member		SSIGL
Francisco Lazzaro	Team Member		SSIGL
Justine Morven Sylvester	Team Member		IEEXI
Kushtrim Plakolli	Procurement Team		EECRU
Lundrim Aliu	Team Member		ECREX
Marie Roger Augustin	Counsel		LEGLE
Rajagopala Raghavan	Team Member	WFAFO	WFACS
Roxanne Hakim	Team Member		SAES3
Ruxandra Costache	Counsel		LEGLE
Saad Filali Meknassi	Team Member		SSIGL
Shpresa Kastrati	Environmental Specialist		SCAEN
Extended Team			
Name	Title	Organization	Location



KOSOVO
KOSOVO GREEN ACTION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. STRATEGIC CONTEXT	7
A. Country Context	7
B. Sectoral and Institutional Context	8
C. Higher Level Objectives to which the Project Contributes	11
II. PROJECT DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES.....	13
A. PDO.....	13
B. Project Beneficiaries.....	14
C. PDO-Level Results Indicators.....	15
III. PROJECT DESCRIPTION.....	15
A. Project Components.....	15
B. Project Cost and Financing.....	20
IV. IMPLEMENTATION.....	20
A. Institutional and Implementation Arrangements.....	20
B. Results Monitoring and Evaluation	22
C. Sustainability	23
V. KEY RISKS	24
A. Overall Risk Rating and Explanation of Key Risks.....	24
VI. APPRAISAL SUMMARY	26
A. Legal Operational Policies	28
B. Environmental and Social.....	28
VII. WORLD BANK GRIEVANCE REDRESS.....	29
VII. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND MONITORING	30



I. STRATEGIC CONTEXT

A. Country Context

1. **As one of the youngest countries in Europe, Kosovo faces many opportunities and challenges.** Kosovo enjoyed steady socio-economic progress in the decade before the pandemic. Between 2010 and 2019, Kosovo grew by an average of 4.6 percent a year, which translated into an almost 50 percent increase in per capita income, and a 35 percent poverty rate reduction. Kosovo's growth performance was robust compared to peer countries of similar or higher income per capita; and it accelerated before the pandemic, in part thanks to a steady expansion in consumption and investment—both relying on diaspora financing—public investment in infrastructure, and financial deepening, amid a stable fiscal stance and a low inflation environment.¹ Kosovo anchors inclusive and resilient development in its National Development Strategy 2030 and its overarching political objective of joining the European Union (EU) and is taking steps to improve the economy by addressing the business climate.² However, barriers to stronger economic growth remain, including a narrow production base, a persistent lack of improvement in private sector competitiveness and productivity, over-reliance on domestic consumption fed by remittances and donor investments, and low human capital. Addressing these barriers requires steadier and faster implementation of reforms.³

2. **While Kosovo has made steady economic progress, the COVID-19 pandemic interrupted the upward economic trend, and impacts have been particularly severe for vulnerable groups.** Kosovo registered its first case of COVID-19 in March 2020, and the Government of Kosovo (GoK) put in place measures to halt the spread of the disease. As of 2022, there have been 3,130 COVID-19-related deaths reported, with Kosovo having the lowest death count in surrounding Western Balkan countries.⁴ Following the onset of the pandemic, in 2020 the GDP contracted in real terms by 5.3 percent - the country's first recession since independence - driven by the collapse in diaspora-related exports of travel services and investment despite a sizeable fiscal response package, a surge in remittance inflows and higher base metal prices. Kosovo's health system was unprepared to handle the virus and was overwhelmed at the onset of the pandemic. This situation is expected to further lower human capital accumulation in Kosovo, which already showed a large deficit before the pandemic. After having increased from 21.1 percent in 2019 to 23.2 percent in 2020, the poverty rate is estimated to have fallen below 20 percent in 2021.⁵

3. **While economic recovery is currently underway, downside risks remain high and underscore the urgency of structural reforms.** Growth is estimated to have rebounded to 9.1 percent in 2021 driven by the return of diaspora-related services and investment, remittances and a strong boost to exports, the Government's fiscal support measures, and a recovery in consumer and investor sentiment. Exports of merchandise, albeit from a low base, have increased at record rates since 2020, fueled by the global pickup in demand and nearshoring

¹ Republic of Kosovo. Systematic Country Diagnostic Update. Report No. 169605-XK. World Bank Group. May 2022.

² The NDS is currently in draft, pending final approval by the Government and endorsement by the parliament

³ World Bank. Systematic Country Diagnostic Update, Kosovo, 2022.

⁴ World Health Organization, 2022, Covid-19 Dashboard.

⁵ Concept Note Kosovo - Strengthening Digital Governance for Service Delivery (P178162).



opportunities. However, pandemic associated risks to the outlook remain, and the Russian invasion of Ukraine will weigh on Kosovo's growth outlook and push inflation sharply higher. As a result, in 2022 the GDP growth is projected to slow to 3.9 percent, with risks weighed heavily on the downside. Continued upward pressure on import prices, particularly for energy and food, will certainly lead to further increases in inflation, affecting consumption (especially of the poor), fiscal balances, and Kosovo's competitiveness.⁶

4. **Demographic pressure on the economy is likely to peak in the coming years, and impacts will be exacerbated by stresses created by the uncertainties of the COVID-19 pandemic.** The average age of Kosovo's population is 26, with the highest concentration in the 15-19 and 20-24 age groups. Between 2017 and 2020, the largest demographic cohort (140,000 postwar baby boomers born between 1999 to 2002) entered the labor market.⁷ This transition, combined with the return of 90,000 migrants who left Kosovo in 2014-15, and 120,000 currently active students, will increase pressure on the economy and an already stagnant labor market. Young people have also been disproportionately affected by the COVID-19 pandemic, given that they are engaged in more precarious employment,⁸ with informal jobs still pervasive.⁹

5. **The Government set out a reform agenda aimed at igniting economic growth and ensuring a sustainable and inclusive recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic.** The 2021-2025 GoK Program set out two priorities, within a broader focus on combatting crime and corruption and on the economic and social transformation of the country: (i) minimizing the consequences on public health of the COVID-19 pandemic; and (ii) alleviating the economic and social consequences of the pandemic.¹⁰

B. Sectoral and Institutional Context

6. **Kosovo's pressing environmental and climate change challenges pose significant risks to the sustainability and inclusiveness of growth.** Climate pressures are expected to exacerbate the stress on the economy and impact specific sectors of the economy, including agriculture, infrastructure, energy, and water resources. The main impacts of climate change in Kosovo, beyond an overall average increase in temperature, will be through a decline in rain during the summer, with more frequent droughts projected, and an increase in rain during the winter, resulting in more frequent spring flooding. More frequent forest fires are also expected.

7. **Long-term prosperity requires a strategy to increase environmental sustainability and accelerate the country's climate change adaptation and green transition¹¹.** Like most middle-income economies, Kosovo's natural resources are under increasing pressure from unplanned urbanization, low-productivity agriculture, and climate change. Moreover, Kosovo confronts environmental pressures from mining and coal-based energy production. At the same time, it has committed to implementing green transition policies,¹² which implies that it will have to accelerate decarbonization progress in areas including energy, transport, waste management, and

⁶ Concept Note Kosovo - Strengthening Digital Governance for Service Delivery (P178162).

⁷ Project Information Document/ Integrated Safeguards Data Sheet Report No: PIDISDSC25244.

⁸ UNDP Kosovo. 2021. Youth Challenges and Perspectives in Kosovo. <https://www.ks.undp.org/content/kosovo/en/home/library/poverty/youth-challenges-and-perspectives-in-kosovo.html>.

⁹ UNDP Kosovo. 2020. Public Pulse Analysis: Correlation between Labour Market in Kosovo and Out Migration. <https://www.ks.undp.org/content/kosovo/en/home/>

¹⁰ Government of Kosovo. 2016. Office of the Prime Minister. Kosovo National Development Strategy 2016-2021. p. 20.

¹¹ Green Transition refers to a shift to a low-carbon, sustainable and regenerative economy.

¹² Government of Kosovo, Law No. 03/L-040.



climate adaptation to meet international requirements and to access future resources, especially coming from the EU. This could potentially impact economic inclusion with women and youth accessing new green sector jobs to be created. The transition from the brown economy to a greener economy will impact workers and communities (especially those in coal-dependent regions), who will need support including with upskilling to take advantage of green jobs. Beyond increasing sustainability, a well-implemented green transition strategy can open new opportunities for the private sector and workers, thus increasing economic inclusion.¹³

8. **In October 2020, at the Berlin Process summit in Sofia, the Government of Kosovo (GoK) alongside other governments from the region endorsed the "Green Agenda for the Western Balkans"¹⁴ as a concrete decision to advance the European Green Deal to Southeast Europe.** The Green Agenda foresees joint actions towards achieving sustainable socio-economic development and green recovery of the entire region in the post-pandemic period. The implementation plan for the Green Agenda is based on five pillars: (i) climate action, including decarbonization, energy and mobility; (ii) circular economy, addressing waste, recycling, sustainable production, and efficient use of resources; (iii) biodiversity; (iv) fighting air, water, and soil pollution; and (v) sustainable food systems and rural areas. Through the Sofia Declaration, the GoK also committed to monitoring, promoting, and enforcing compliance with environmental obligations and ensuring effective mechanisms for public participation, access to information, access to justice in environmental matters and environmental reporting.

9. **While Kosovo has made some progress in the energy sector, limited progress has been made in the broader Green Agenda.** Progress has been made notably with the increased investments in renewables (achieving its target share of energy from renewable sources, which rose to 25.7 percent in gross final energy consumption in 2020), but limited progress has been made in the areas of transport, environment, and climate change. The unreliable and health-hazardous energy supply, which relies on coal, remains a concern. Almost all of Kosovo's power supply (880 MW) is produced by two highly polluting and aging lignite power plants, which, in addition to causing serious health and adverse environmental impacts, hinder the country's ability to follow the Green Agenda and achieve its international obligations as one of nine signatories of the Energy Community Treaty.¹⁵ Recently, Kosovo has been forced to import electricity at exceptionally high prices, with a significant financial burden that would have been lower if the country had been more energy efficient. Moving towards a more efficient and cleaner supply of energy in conformity with EU environmental standards is key for Kosovo, as is modernization and compliance with international social and environmental standards since these are preconditions for the energy and mining sectors to be able to attract international financing or direct investments as one of the potential sources of growth.

10. **The GoK has committed to decarbonization and alignment with the principles of a Just Transition¹⁶, but additional efforts are needed to ensure their realization.** Strategies, action plans, and policies in these sectors need to be more consistent internally and in line with the principles and objectives of the Green Agenda. The GoK also lacks coordination among institutions, data-driven decision-making, and data openness as well as the needed capacity to draft and implement policies in line with the Green Agenda. For energy, the GoK focuses on the security

¹³ Kosovo Systematic Country Diagnostic, p. 16.

¹⁴ The Green Agenda for the Western Balkans's main objective is for the region to achieve carbon neutrality by 2050 and align with the European Green Deal's key elements. Hereafter: Green Agenda.

¹⁵ The key objective of the Energy Community is to extend the EU internal energy market rules and principles to countries in the Western Balkans and beyond, based on a legally binding framework.

¹⁶ A Just Transition generally refers to a framework of agreed upon principles and processes that combine political and economic power to shift from an extractive economy to a regenerative economy.



of supply, diversification of the energy mix and affordable and reliable energy. All these undertakings are challenging and require additional assistance from all stakeholders due to the limited capacities of public institutions to implement green packages.

11. **Although citizen trust has improved in recent years, deficient service delivery and perceptions of corruption in state institutions remain common.** Findings of the Public Pulse survey of May 2022 show that the top three issues reported were unemployment (26.7 percent), poverty (24.3 percent) and environment (10.1 percent), whereas unemployment, poverty and corruption were in the top three in May 2021. Compared to May 2021, corruption (9.3 percent) has dropped by 4.5 percentage points.¹⁷ In 2021, satisfaction with governmental institutions remains higher than average over the past years.¹⁸ CIVICUS rated civic space¹⁹ as ‘narrow’ in 2021 meaning the state allows civil society organizations to exercise their freedom of association, peaceful assembly, and expression, but violations of these rights also take place. The rating reflects recent protests staged against gender-based violence, labor rights, and COVID-19 measures.²⁰ Despite these constraints, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) function freely. However, they experience pressure to curtail criticism of the government, though many continue to criticize the authorities and have largely been able to engage in accountability work without interference.²¹ The government has worked to address transparency and in 2017 launched an online platform for public consultation on new legal and policy documents.²² While this has improved transparency and in 2020 more than 98 percent of all draft legal and policy documents were uploaded, engagement on the platform is lacking and municipalities have not utilized it.²³

12. **On the Green Agenda, several barriers hinder citizens and civil society from engaging in meaningful accountability work.** As there are competing energy policy alternatives, there is a need for more evidence-based contextualized, and inclusive policy planning, to ensure decision-makers take all voices and impacts into account. Citizens, and especially directly affected communities, do not have access to information and data on the impact of different decarbonization strategies and the energy transition. This prevents them from engaging meaningfully in energy policy dialogues. Additionally, Kosovo lacks oversight mechanisms on environmental compliance and engagement of directly affected communities.

13. **Civil Society has demonstrated a keen interest in engaging government authorities on climate-related topics.** In a 2019 poll²⁴, 48 percent of polled youth saw the climate crisis as “alarmingly serious”, while another 30 percent viewed it as “very serious”. Civil society has stressed the need for continued capacity building among youth in the digital sphere and stronger partnerships between government bodies and civil society. Social accountability and meaningful participation and engagement of communities, especially those most affected, are key to increased ownership of the Green Agenda and the energy transition among the general population and

¹⁷ UNDP. Public Pulse Brief XXI, November 2021. <https://www.undp.org/kosovo/publications/public-pulse-brief-xxi>

¹⁸ UNDP. Public Pulse Brief XXI.

¹⁹ Civic space refers to the circumstances in which citizens and CSOs can voice concerns and participate in processes affecting them -- in short, open civic space is the enabling environment for citizen engagement.

²⁰ <https://monitor.civicus.org/country/kosovo/>

²¹ Freedom House. Freedom in the World 2022: Kosovo. Washington, DC.

²² See the GoK’s Annual Report on the Public Consultations for further detail, <https://konsultimet.rks-gov.net/Storage/Docs/Doc-5b22588443139.pdf>

²³ In 2020, only one municipality used the digital platform to comment on a legal document. See Office of the Prime Minister. Annual Report on Public Consultations in the Government of Kosovo. 2020.

²⁴ <https://www.gaiakosovo.org/climate-change/>



relevant government authorities.

14. **The proposed project aims to contribute to the mission of the European Green Deal by supporting the GoK and other key stakeholders in the implementation of the Green Agenda** through activities that improve access to information, accountability, transparency, and good climate governance. More specifically, it aims to (i) increase public access and use of data sets and evidence-based assessments on climate issues (transparency), (ii) co-develop appropriate corrective actions with relevant public institutions (see activity 2 component 2) to address gaps in the implementation of the Green Agenda in Kosovo (responsiveness/feedback), and (iii) foster increased engagement and collaboration between stakeholders and public institutions on climate and energy priorities through project-created online platform and activities such as the Green Forums and the Youth Debates (engagement).

15. **The project design draws from the proposal submitted by the Balkan Green Foundation (BGF) to the competitive GPSA Fifth Global Call for Proposals tailored to the Kosovo green transition context.** The Call was launched in November 2021, evaluated technically by an independent roster of experts, and selected by the GPSA Steering Committee in March 2022. The project design has since been enhanced by taking into consideration the GPSA Theory of Action (ToA).²⁵ It draws on lessons learned from past GPSA projects in the health and governance sectors, the project in Moldova²⁶ – Implementing Participatory Social Accountability for Better Health (P150873), focused on improving access to information for the public and creating multistakeholder platforms to co-create solutions to increase accountability of public institutions and improve services. The project aims to contribute to improved transparency, accountability and responsiveness in climate governance using collaborative social accountability²⁷ mechanisms to tackle obstacles that hinder improved service delivery. The project combines two aspects: (i) flexible funding for civil society-led coalitions to work with government to solve problems that local actors have prioritized such as energy efficiency and climate change resilience, and (ii) sustained non-financial support to meaningful engagements, including implementation support, capacity building, facilitation, and brokering. The project uses adaptive learning and management by clearly identifying and understanding the nature of the problem being addressed as well as its political economy factors, and taking small, incremental steps and adjustments toward a long-term goal. The project is designed agilely to be able to accommodate changes in the political landscape.

C. Higher Level Objectives to which the Project Contributes

16. **The proposed project is consistent with the Country Partnership Framework (CPF) for Kosovo from 2017 to 2022 (next CPF is in draft stage).** The CPF has a strategic objective to support Kosovo's move toward more sustainable, export-oriented, and inclusive growth. It contributes to the CPF Focus Area 3 – Promoting Reliable Energy and Stewardship of the Environment – which includes two objectives: (i) Enhancing energy efficiency and renewable energy; and (ii) Improving management of natural resources and addressing environmental

²⁵ The GPSA Theory of Action was updated in 2019.

²⁶ <https://thegpsa.org/projects/implementing-participatory-social-accountability-for-better-health/>

²⁷ Collaborative Social Accountability engages citizens, communities, civil society groups, and public sector institutions in joint, iterative problem solving to tackle poverty and improve service delivery, sector governance, and accountability. The GPSA supports a specific approach to social accountability defined as 'collaborative' which is when civil society actors adopt non-confrontational strategies aimed at collectively solving problems and delivering results. Since 2019 the GPSA promoted an emerging notion of "collaborative social accountability" which involves externally facilitated engagements between state and society to constructively address grievances and co-create solutions.



contamination.

17. **The 2021 Risk and Resilience Assessment (RRA) for Kosovo notes improvements in trust in political institutions in recent years but highlights persistent economic exclusion of youth as one of the greatest risks for Kosovo in the near to medium term.** After the political change in 2021, trust in institutions has improved, but youth unemployment and inactivity remain high, and youth expect further improvements. To ensure trust does not deteriorate, drivers of youth exclusion such as lack of investment in youth infrastructure and services need to be addressed. Within a context of more frequent climate-induced risks, ensuring data-based decision-making and maximizing digital development and delivery of government services and processes through digital means as supported by the activities under the proposed project will be critical. The proposed project aims to reduce fragility risks in Kosovo, such as youth disenfranchisement and dissatisfaction with public institutions, by supporting youth to be involved in the green transition and to develop bottom-up approaches that improve government responsiveness on decarbonization policies that directly affect youth's economic prospects and well-being.

18. **The project aligns with the ECA Climate Change Strategy and aims to ensure the sustainability of CSO-implemented activities.** The project seeks to support systematic efforts to engage citizens in the climate change agenda by establishing mechanisms for proactive disclosure of environmental information. The project will create a digital platform to enable citizens and CSOs (Civil Society Organizations) to monitor the implementation of Green Agenda recommendations and solutions that it will promote. Furthermore, the Green Agenda envisages participatory methods for developing and implementing local sustainable development strategies and plans with active involvement of different sectors in the local community. This project aims to support the participation of local communities and key stakeholders in climate and energy policy dialogues through increased availability of relevant data and information and spaces for direct engagement with decisionmakers through Green Forums, among other activities.

19. **The project design builds upon lessons from a previous World Bank RETF project in Kosovo – the Community Development Fund (CDF) I (P069812) & II (P079259) that had a CSO as an implementing partner.** The projects' objectives were to improve community infrastructure and services in poor and conflict-affected communities, and for the most vulnerable groups; promote institutional capacity building at the community and municipal levels and enhance greater stakeholder participation. To support sustainability of investments, CDF II included a comprehensive capacity building and technical assistance program, which this project will build on.

20. **The project will coordinate closely and integrate lessons from active World Bank and donor supported projects in Kosovo and ECA region.** Relevant World Bank projects may include: (i) the Real Estate and Geospatial Information Project (REGIP) that helps address data gaps and institutional coordination by integrating a green layer to the cadaster and improving disclosure of the data published by the Kosovo Cadaster Agency (KCA), the project's associated Grant, (ii) The Public Information and Awareness Services for Vulnerable Communities in Kosovo (PIAKOS) (P179554) project; (iii) Western Balkans Green Growth ASA (Advisory Services and Analytics) (P174826); (iv) Livable Cities Pillar and the Green and Low Carbon and Climate Resilient Pristina (P176186); and (v) the upcoming Digital Governance for Service Delivery project (P178162). The project will coordinate with these other initiatives to explore options for improving access to and usage of environmental and energy data, including promoting positive impacts among vulnerable communities. Additionally, the project will learn from the experiences of "Green Youth Ambassadors" in the Kyrgyz Community Support Project (CSP, P163592) and from the Serbia project 'Scaling-Up Residential Clean Energy (SURCE, P176770), and the ongoing "Youth



Environmentalist” placements in Kosovo municipalities under the Municipalities for Youth Project (P165485). Through its Steering Committee, comprised of CSO, WB and donor representatives, the project will also collaborate with relevant bilateral donors supporting the green transition in Kosovo (e.g., USAID, UNDP, and the EU delegation).

21. **The proposed project is aligned and contributes to multiple national policies and strategies.** These include the:

- i) Kosovo National Development Strategy (2030) in its pillar one on promoting sustainable economic development through clean environment and efficient use of natural resources. The project directly contributes to the strategic sustainability objectives by enhancing the capacity of relevant government entities to deliver on their Green Agenda commitments.
- ii) Framework Strategy on Climate Change which was adopted in 2014 as a blueprint of actions/measures foreseen and required to create a country resilient to climate change. The strategy was updated in 2019 and a detailed action plan was developed. The project will contribute by supporting the use of public data sets in decision-making.
- iii) Energy Strategy of Kosovo 2022-2031. The project will contribute by making data on energy transformation more accessible.
- iv) The Kosovo Strategy for Youth (2019-23). Through its youth debates, the project will increase engagement and inclusion of youth.

22. **In line with World Bank corporate mandates on climate, citizen engagement and gender, the project prioritizes climate action and citizen engagement with a focus on gender in design and implementation.** The project is fundamentally about citizen engagement, and it contributes to global and regional commitments to support and scale up climate action and increase the climate-related share of development financing. On this, the project will create a digital platform and organize annual multi-stakeholder Green Forums to enable citizens and CSOs to monitor the implementation of Green Agenda recommendations and solutions that it develops. The project aims to deepen citizen engagement on green transition priorities in Kosovo and ensure its sustainability by promoting the role of CSOs in increasing government capacity to implement the Green Agenda. Gender disparities in assets and income can make women more vulnerable to natural disasters and climate shocks. A key target for the project will be to engage and empower women in the ongoing climate dialogue. Lastly, through its focus on transparency and accessible data and government documents, the project will also enhance engagement of public officials with the Open Government Partnership²⁸ thus setting examples for commitments to the future OGP (Open Governance Partnership) Action Plan in Kosovo.

II. PROJECT DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES

A. PDO

The proposed development objective is to contribute to improving accountability of relevant Kosovo public institutions

²⁸ In 2022, the GoK made the decision to become a member of the Open Government Partnership.



in the implementation of the Green Agenda.

B. Project Beneficiaries

23. There are three sets of primary beneficiaries:

- **Public officials:** This project includes cooperation with relevant public institutions and inclusion of public officials in project activities such as research and analytics, capacity building for proactively releasing and using climate and energy data, multi-stakeholder dialogues to co-design solutions in different forums, discussions, roundtables, conferences, as well as different communication and outreach activities. Public institutions and public officials will be the main targets of this project's capacity building and awareness raising activities on the importance of data for public entities, citizens, civil society, and corporations to take informed decisions and contribute to the Green Agenda. As a result, public officials can make better data-based decisions and propose more appropriate green transition policies and interventions. Several public entities have been pre-identified as natural project partners because of their mandates on energy and environmental issues, including the Department of Environmental Protection and Water in the Ministry of Environment, Spatial Planning and Infrastructure, and the Department of Energy in the Ministry of Economy and the Office of the Prime Minister. The project will target both decision makers and technical staff in these institutions. Confirmation and further identification of the government counterparts will be undertaken during the Needs Assessment in the inception phase of the project (see activity 1 under component 1).
- **CSOs and media:** This project targets CSOs as well as traditional media organizations (TV, newspapers, journals) by providing accurate and timely analysis of the government's performance in green transition, and capacity building on the use of climate and energy data to facilitate an evidence-based engagement with the public and key stakeholders.
- **Youth:** To ensure youth voices are reflected in green transition dialogues and decision-making by the government entities, emphasis will be on working with youth and youth networks on climate awareness raising, capacity-building, and civic engagement activities. This proposal targets youth across Kosovo with emphasis on youth living in more affected areas such as environmental hotspots or in the vicinity of coal mines.

24. The project's secondary beneficiaries will be:

- **General public/citizens:** The project will benefit the public by enhancing citizens' access to information and government processes related to the Green Agenda implementation. Enhanced understanding of policy alternatives and their implications creates the enabling environment for citizens to become agents of change by requiring more transparency, accountability, and attention to their priorities in the clean energy transition.
- **Marginalized and vulnerable groups:** To ensure inclusive project design through the project outputs, a specific focus will be given to the needs of minorities, women, children, and individuals at risk of health issues. Additionally, rural and poor communities that are adversely affected by climate hazards and natural disasters, especially those communities that rely on agriculture, forestry and are



vulnerable to floods, droughts, wildfires, and erosion.

C. PDO-Level Results Indicators

The PDO indicators are:

PDO Indicator 1: Number of public institutions providing access to climate and energy data as a result of project activities (transparency)

Unit of measurement: Number

PDO Indicator 2: Corrective actions taken by relevant public institutions to address gaps in the implementation of the Green Agenda in Kosovo identified by the project. (responsiveness)

Unit of measurement: Yes/No

III. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

A. Project Components

The project will consist of three components:

1. Development and Support for Collaborative Social Accountability in the Green Agenda.
2. Stakeholder Engagement and Capacity Building for Collaborative Social Accountability.
3. Project Management, Monitoring and Learning, and Knowledge Dissemination.

25. **Component 1: Development and Support for Collaborative Social Accountability in the Green Agenda** (US\$ 276,200). This component will focus on actions that will assess the current implementation status of the Green Agenda in Kosovo and set the stage for activities that will develop social accountability interventions to monitor Green Agenda progress throughout project implementation and beyond. The project will enhance access to climate and energy data and information through the project-established Green Agenda Online Platform. This is a core contribution of the project to be supported by the organization of multi-stakeholder Green Forums and the data storytelling under Component 2.

Activities of Component 1 will include:

- **Activity 1: Research on Green Agenda Implementation** – At the initial stage of the project, the grant partners will conduct a Green Agenda Implementation and Needs Assessment to deepen the focus of the project and identify the main priority issues and challenges to be tackled through co-creating corrective actions (solutions and recommendations) with targeted key stakeholders. The research will be conducted in consultation with key actors supporting the Green Agenda in Kosovo, including public entities, development partners, private sector, civil society, youth networks, and climate/environmental journalists to solicit multiple perspectives on the



implementation challenges identified and the solutions proposed. This research will lay out possible corrective actions that public institutions could take in response to the project's activities. This exercise will help the grant partners prioritize the actions that the project can support directly, those that will need creating synergies with other stakeholders to be achieved, and those that should be advocated for to be adopted by public and private actors. The analytical work will focus on inclusion of the Green Agenda in Kosovo's legislation, identification of challenges and bottlenecks in its implementation and monitoring of the progress made by key stakeholders in supporting the Green Agenda to seek collaboration and develop synergies to reach all key actors. All research work will be organized in infographics and video animations that will distill main points that need to be understood by the public and presented in activities of component 2. The assessment will lead to the identification of precise solutions for institutional capacity, data and engagement gaps that the project can contribute to addressing. These solutions and activities will be outlined in a context analysis report.

- **Activity 2: Development of a Green Agenda Online Platform** – At present, key datasets, government commitments, policy documents and research papers about the Green Agenda in Kosovo are dispersed across public institutions, CSOs, think tanks and donor agencies. Some are hard to reach, and others are unavailable to the public. For key stakeholders to interact constructively with public entities and contribute to improvements in the government's performance of Green Agenda implementation, they need to be aware of the economic, social and environmental impacts of policy options, the Green Agenda targets, standards and processes committed to by the GoK, and how the Green Agenda implementation performance of Kosovo compares with other countries in the region and the wider international community. Accordingly, the project will develop and pilot an online digital platform to provide public access and facilitate use of climate and energy data and information to enable meaningful engagement of key actors on green transition issues. To ensure that the platform responds to stakeholders' needs, the initial concept will be developed in partnership with relevant public institutions responsible for gathering data and producing reports on climate and energy-related issues. This activity will serve as the building block of the project's collaborative social accountability mechanism by involving relevant public institutions in the design and development of the platform's key functions. The platform's front-end functions will consist of:

- **A2.1: Green Agenda Information Hub.** The platform will serve as a one-stop-shop for information on the Green Agenda, providing user-friendly information and access to datasets on climate and energy. The platform will target public officials, CSOs, students and media representatives. It will include research papers, video animations simplifying data, articles and other journalistic pieces about the energy and climate agenda and applicable legislation regarding climate and energy. The data will be sourced from the government's publication platform for new laws, climate reports and climate-related data sets, among other places.

- **A2.2: "Ask the state" feature.** The platform will have an integrated feature that guides users to easily submit Freedom of Information (Fol) requests, which is a legally established right in Kosovo, for public information related to the Green Agenda. Most citizens do not have the knowledge to file an official request or lack information about where to address those requests and how to cite legislation to ensure the request is answered. "Ask the state" is an easy option to ask specific questions via the platform directly to line ministries to gather information regarding energy and climate issues. This feature will have an automated procedure for requesting official documents and information, while also monitoring the responses of public institutions. All answers will be public, so that the information is shared with anyone who is interested. Confirmation of roles and responsibilities vis-à-vis line ministries on the "ask the state" feature will be included



in the memorandums of understanding (MoU) to be signed with partner public entities. Moreover, a video animation will be produced to provide an explanation of the platform usage for a broader audience, whilst also promoting the platform in general and in the context of education. Similar platforms have been developed in Germany (www.fragdenstaat.de) and at the European level (www.asktheeu.org) which will serve as inspiration.

- **A2.3. Memorandums of Understanding** - To increase buy-in and support for this activity, Memorandums of understanding (MoU) will be signed with pre-identified line ministries (Ministry of Economy, and Ministry of Environment, Spatial Planning, and Infrastructure) and potentially other relevant public entities. The MoU will serve as the basis for cooperation between project partners and partner public institutions during the project implementation phase. Based on agreement during initial stakeholder meetings, the MoU will reflect project partners' commitments to the project, including roles and responsibilities for providing access to public data and answering "ask the state" requests on the Green Agenda Platform. The committed parties could jointly identify feasible measures through adaptive learning and inform knowledge activities of the project at the level of government and CSOs.

26. **Component 2: Stakeholder Engagement and Capacity Building for Collaborative Social Accountability** (US\$ 153,700). This component focuses on implementing social accountability mechanisms designed and piloted within the scope of the first component of this project and enhancing interventions that mobilize key stakeholders in delivering coordinated and data-driven decisions. It is aimed at creating platforms for engagement between all identified stakeholders through activities such as the proposed annual Green Forums, as a channel for multi-stakeholder assessment and prioritization of Green Agenda progress, climate education and engagement of youth specifically through green debates, and capacity building for public officials, media representatives and CSOs on data and evidence-based interventions. The project will enhance the capacity of journalists to convey central insights from Green Agenda thematic priorities informed by the Online Platform and research by supporting storytelling with data.

Activities of Component 2 will include:

- **Activity 1: Collecting Stakeholder feedback on Green Agenda progress and recommendations at the Green Forums.** Stakeholders will articulate their views on Green Agenda implementation in Annual Green Forums which will serve as both a participation space and an accountability mechanism. The forums will take stock of the progress made in the previous year on the Green Agenda and identify climate and energy priority actions, including on capacity building and data, that need to be implemented in the upcoming period. They will contribute to enhancing sector-based collaboration and discuss innovations and future actions on the implementation of the Green Agenda, informed by the Online Platform, key government policy and investment decisions, and processes. The forums' participants will represent government agencies and officials, media, civil society organizations, local level representatives, climate activists, youth, and citizens. This activity will serve as a key gathering and connecting space and will enhance the use of the Green Agenda Online Platform and data sets published by the project through a set of communication events. Each year, the Green Forum will gather more than fifty participants including speakers from public agencies regulating and monitoring the climate and energy issues CSOs, academia and private corporations to share their initiatives and challenges.
- **Activity 2: Development of the Green Forum Commitments Paper.** A set of corrective measures linking each key stakeholder to specific actions designed and discussed during the Annual Green Forum will be organized



in an annual Green Forum Commitments Paper. This iterative activity makes the key stakeholders accountable in terms of their actionable commitments and supports the social accountability process to be initiated by the project to monitor the Green Agenda. Each Annual Green Forum will assess the progress of the commitments co-produced the year before and set corrective measures linked to each key stakeholder (including government institutions, CSOs and the donor community in Kosovo) taking part in the Annual Green Forum. The Annual Green Forums will constitute an opportunity for the grant partners in collaboration with key partners (journalists and academics, public sector entities) to monitor the implementation of the corrective measures presented in the prior edition of the Annual Green Forum and to formulate recommendations for enhancing implementation during the coming year. This will be an opportunity to incentivize key actors to develop their analysis and assessments of the Green Agenda implementation, based on the climate and energy data accessed through the Green Agenda Online Platform. The outcome of each Annual Green Forum will be published on the Green Agenda Online Platform.

- **Activity 3: Capacity building for targeted groups to enhance climate literacy and engagement.** A series of training and interactive learning sessions will be organized to develop the capacity of key stakeholders to act as informed and active agents in the green transition process. These learning events will include capacity building on data for public officials, media representatives and CSOs, including proactive disclosure of climate and energy data and methods of feedback usage to inform public policy and decision-making. The training series will focus on improving public officials' and CSOs representatives' knowledge on climate and energy related issues and how to make climate issues more relevant in public discourse, and how to use the Green Agenda Online Platform to implement data-driven work approaches. Trainings will be adapted to target groups' pre-identified needs and contextual challenges informed by the Green Agenda Implementation and Needs Assessment described under component 1.
- **Activity 4: Youth awareness raising and education for local climate action.** A formal debate format will be used to increase youth knowledge and voices on local green topics, with participation of youth in a national debate tournament as the final activity. The project will organize debate sessions and debate training with youth in selected municipalities to empower youth to think critically and advocate for their strategic climate and energy priorities. This process will include youth and local policymakers, engaging in local consultations and participatory design of solutions to further integrate the Green Agenda locally while drawing on the information provided by the Green Agenda Online Platform. Local policymakers will participate in the debate topics related to sustainability, energy and climate. Youth debates gather high school students to debate a specific topic related to climate, energy and sustainability issues, and target initiatives that local institutions can take/are taking to implement the Green Agenda. After the formal debate by high school students are finished, local policy makers engage with youth in debating specific issues that local governments are doing in the same area as the topic that has been debated. A competition among all participating groups will be launched for selecting the best debating team, which will receive an installation of solar panels in their school.
- **Activity 5: Storytelling with data.** This activity will engage journalists to draft articles and blogs to convey central insights from the thematic priorities of the project, informed by the Green Agenda Online Platform and research activity. Through a series of journalistic pieces on issues targeted by the project, issues and loopholes on environment and government actions will be addressed in an iterative manner, to engage key stakeholders and



the public with issues showcased on the Green Agenda Online Platform after its launch and increase its use.

27. **Component 3: Project Management, Monitoring and Learning, and Knowledge Dissemination (US\$ 70,100)**

The project will be managed and implemented by the Balkan Green Foundation in collaboration with its two partner organizations, Open Data Kosovo and Levizja FOL.

The project will establish an internal knowledge and learning process to regularly adjust and adapt project implementation based on experience and changing contextual factors, and to generate knowledge and learning for external dissemination amongst key stakeholders that may take up lessons from the project to apply, sustain or scale collaborative social accountability and/or inform substantive decisions.

Activities of Component 3 include:

- **Activity 1: Establishment of a Steering Committee.** A Steering Committee will be created and sustained throughout implementation of the project. It will consist of representatives from the CSO consortium, partner public institutions, the World Bank/GPSA team, and relevant donors. The role of the Steering Committee will be to guide the strategic direction and activities of the project and propose recommendations for strengthening project implementation and key stakeholders' collaboration. The committee may include other relevant local and international organizations to ensure synergies. The GPSA ToA encourages the establishment of multistakeholder compacts such as the proposed Steering Committee to facilitate the effectiveness of collaborative social accountability by enhancing the participation of fit-for-purpose stakeholder groups in discussing corrective measures regularly.
- **Activity 2: Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning.** A monitoring, evaluation, and learning (MEL) plan will be developed to monitor the ongoing progress of project implementation and measure impacts and outcomes. The GPSA Secretariat will support the grant partners to develop their MEL system to complete the design of the data collection for the indicators and ensure the localization of the project Theory of Action (ToA). The project will contract an independent evaluator (individual or firm) to conduct the project's evaluation, consisting of the midterm and final evaluation, inform quality bi-annual technical reports, as well as provide support to the project team to develop capacities to adaptively manage the project.
- **Activity 3: Knowledge dissemination.** Knowledge sharing activities will take place regularly throughout the project. A knowledge dissemination plan will be developed to ensure that lessons learned from the project reach key target audiences internally and externally. Dissemination may take place through the Green Agenda Online Platform, blogs by project staff and/or partners on grant partners' websites, and journalistic pieces as described under Component 2 Activity 4. The plan will focus on the uptake of relevant aspects and elements of the collaborative social accountability process and mechanism (implemented by the project) that may be sustained or scaled up and/or inform substantive decisions at the country level. The project will prepare and disseminate learning products and contribute to the GPSA's mandate to broker and promote global knowledge and learning on collaborative social accountability and inform practitioners of lessons learned from this project. The project will also benefit from the GPSA knowledge and capacity building support through its participation in the Annual GPSA Global Partners Forum and the Grant Partners Workshop.



- **Activity 4: GPSA and World Bank implementation support.** The GPSA and Bank team will provide the technical assistance necessary to support the innovative nature of the project and ensure fiduciary and ESF controls. This will likely be more intensive during the early stages of the project and taper off as the project mechanisms and processes become established.

B. Project Cost and Financing

The financing instrument selected for this project is a Recipient Executed Trust Fund (RETF) Grant. The source of financing for this Grant is the Global Partnership for Social Accountability (GPSA), housed within the World Bank. As per World Bank Trust Fund guidelines, given that this Trust Fund is smaller than US\$5 million this Project is subject to World Bank procedures related to project preparation and supervision of Small RETF Grants. The Project cost is estimated to be US\$500,000 to be financed completely by the GPSA grant. Additionally, the World Bank’s CMU will plan to cover supervision costs as part of the annual WPA cycle (suggested annual allocation of US\$20,000).

Project Components	Project cost	Trust Funds	Counterpart Funding
Component 1: Development and Support for Collaborative Social Accountability in the Green Agenda	276,200.00	276,200.00	n/a
Component 2: Stakeholder Engagement and Capacity Building for Collaborative Social Accountability	153,700.00	153,700.00	n/a
Component 3: Project Management, Monitoring and Learning, and Knowledge Dissemination	70,100.00	70,100.00	m/a
Total Costs	500,000.00	500,000.00	

Total Project Costs 500,000.00

Total Financing Required 500,000.00

IV. IMPLEMENTATION

A. Institutional and Implementation Arrangements



28. **The Balkan Green Foundation (BGF)²⁹ will be the recipient of the grant and the responsible implementing agency for the project.** BGF will be responsible for the overall management and coordination of project activities, and monitoring and evaluation. BGF works to advocate and promote sustainable development in Kosovo, and the Western Balkans, by promoting initiatives that support social accountability efforts, as well as developing policies and solutions, which are in line with the national agenda for EU integration on sustainable economic development, environmental protection, energy development, and climate change. BGF has experience in developing and implementing social accountability and civic participation initiatives that address climate issues in Kosovo and the Balkan region partnering up with donors such as the EU and BMZ (Bundesministerium für Wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung), GIZ (Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit), and Heinrich Böll Foundation. BGF's role will be to coordinate and provide quality assurance across all activities, and stakeholder engagement for the targeted priority thematic areas of the project, ensuring learning and publishing information through researched papers/roadmaps and infographics as well as leading thematic awareness raising campaigns.

29. **BGF has two implementing partner organizations with complementary skillsets, which will each receive around 25 percent of the grant.**

- **Levizja FOL (FOL)³⁰** is one of the oldest organizations in Kosovo that specializes in institutional transparency, monitoring and working with public institutions in becoming more transparent, and accountable. In this project, FOL's experience in monitoring the work of public institutions and seeking transparent institutions over the years will be valuable in pushing forward policies and recommendations driven by the research done by BGF. Furthermore, capacity-building activities with public officials as well as cooperation with public institutions will be FOL's role in this project.
- **Open Data Kosovo (ODK)³¹** is one of the few organizations in Kosovo with a primary focus on civic-tech and open government. Accessibility to government data, ICT-educated youth, and active citizenship lie at the heart of ODK's mission. The role of ODK will be to provide their expertise in data-driven activities, more specifically data-driven capacity building activities, as well as the development of the Online Platform.

30. **Partnership arrangement: Partnership relationship between the Recipient (Main CSO) and other Partners CSOs.** In their design, GPSA grants promote cooperation among the grant recipient/implementing agency (Lead CSO) and partner CSOs who receive grant resources to implement activities on behalf of the Recipient. GPSA Projects are co-designed with the Lead CSO and commonly envision Partner CSOs using resources under the partnership's agreement to cover their Operating Costs, with consulting services or other eligible expenses carried out for their benefit by the grant Recipient.

31. **Partnership agreement³².** The Grant Recipient is encouraged to sign a Partnership Agreement(s) with all Partner CSOs implementing activities under the Project. Details of the Partnership Agreement will be contained in the Project's Operations Manual, which shall include, inter alia, the following clauses:

- Respective roles and responsibilities of the Recipient and Partner CSOs in Project implementation as well

²⁹ <https://www.balkangreenfoundation.org/en-us/about/>

³⁰ <https://levizjafol.org/en/about-us/>

³¹ <https://opendatakosovo.org/about/>

³² Partnership Agreements are to be understood as the agreements entered into between the Grant recipient and Partner CSOs.



as the work of scope for each. It will include BGF's financial commitments to FOL and ODK based on their involvement in project implementation.

- Conditions of the Recipient's payment, out of the proceeds of the Grant, of limited operating costs related to the Partner CSO discharge of its responsibilities.
- Obligation of the Recipient to exercise its rights and carry out its obligations under the Partner CSO Agreement in such manner as to protect the interest of the Recipient and of the World Bank to accomplish the purposes of the Financing.
- A covenant indicating that "except as the World Bank shall otherwise agree, the Recipient shall not assign, amend, abrogate, waive or fail to enforce the Partner CSO Agreement or any or their provisions thereof."

32. **Partnership agreement.** Lastly, the project team will inform relevant public officials and key stakeholders about the launch of the project through official letters and invitations to the opening ceremony and other key activities. Contact persons will be identified to be appointed as focal points within relevant public institutions, to be regularly informed and engaged in project activities.

B. Results Monitoring and Evaluation

33. **The BGF will monitor the implementation of activities and the results thereof as defined in the project Results Framework.** The BGF will develop a comprehensive, participatory monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system with Bank support. Progress will be monitored against a baseline collected at the start of the project, which will be the responsibility of the BGF. An independent evaluator will be hired by BGF under the Project to conduct a mid-term and final evaluation of Project results and outcomes. The M&E system will use an adaptive learning and management approach to ensure the timely adjustment of the project's operations, as well as any necessary course-correction in the implementation of Project activities.

34. **In particular, the GPSA project partners adjust traditional project approaches through monitoring and evaluation and build into their projects' good practices from emerging adaptive and agile programming and learning.** Among these lessons:

- Monitoring, evaluation, and supervision should be understood as a relational function, which can and should inform contextually and politically relevant problem-solving and course correction, including changes in plans and budgets at any relevant point in the project cycle. Monitoring is a critical component of implementation; and
- Traditional interpretations of OECD-DAC⁵ criteria and associated benchmarks will be replaced with fit for purpose/context ones, including measures of the targeted problems identified at the local level, as well as the more general challenges of improved problem-solving, collaborative governance and lack of capacity.

35. **Since this project is anchored on an adaptive management approach,** as the BGF and the World Bank monitor progress towards the achievement of PDO level indicators and learn how the project's interventions contribute to it, some component-level indicators may have to be revised or changed. Adaptive learning and politically informed action by all stakeholders, including the GPSA, during the project cycle (from inception to evaluation to sustainability beyond the lifetime of the intervention) are important for effectiveness of collaborative social accountability. After action learning events will be programmed into the project.



36. **Source of data.** Baseline data will be collected at the start of the project and tracked by the M&E officer at BGF.

37. **M&E arrangements: BGF will appoint an M&E officer who will work closely with the GPSA Secretariat and later with the independent evaluator.** The BGF M&E team will collect data for the assessment of the indicators in the results framework. This data will feed into the analysis that the independent evaluator will undertake at mid-term and in the final evaluation. The GPSA Secretariat will support the M&E officer to develop an M&E plan and provide support throughout the implementation of the Project. The GPSA Secretariat as well as the independent evaluator will also facilitate discussions to help the project partners reflect, learn, and adjust from their experiences. In addition, the grant partner will submit bi-annual technical self-assessment reports.

38. **The World Bank will also produce an Implementation Completion Report (ICR)** at the end of the project that will assess the project's achievement against targets and seek to examine if adaptive approaches taken helped to increase accountability among public institutions in the Green Agenda and otherwise, and whether the capacity of individuals, beneficiaries and implementing partners improved under the project.

C. Sustainability

39. **The project will approach sustainability by creating and strengthening collaboration with key actors** (state and non-state actors) for joint problem-solving so that key actors have experience and seek to adapt insights and implement them in other relevant programs. The project aims to sustain or scale innovations and effective interventions through new and/or existing programs or policies beyond the timespan of the GPSA's support. To strengthen the sustainability of the proposed project, the GPSA and the CMU will explore collaboration with active operations in the World Bank portfolio in Kosovo to facilitate the engagement of the CSOs with the relevant public institutions and sustain these relationships through relevant operations and the citizen engagement framework as described under the project context section.

40. **To sustain the project outcomes and achievements, the project will:**

- Identify national/municipality and community levels champions who will be involved in the project and will have a role to play in maintaining the social accountability mechanisms during and beyond the lifespan of this project. BGF and its implementing partners FOL and ODK will be consulting beneficiaries and key partners and developing complementary efforts to strengthen interventions and ensure synergies and complementarity with their initiatives and efforts.
- Build on existing civil society and public sector platforms when possible, that can ensure sustainability of existing social accountability mechanisms at local and regional levels e.g. school committees, sector-based initiatives.
- Involve key stakeholders in the iterative management approach so that learning from the project can benefit the sector and positively influence behavior and practices.
- Ensure institutional anchoring by signing MoUs (Memorandums of Understanding) with committed



public entities and government ministries to jointly agree on feasible corrective measures that can be implemented with CSO support and integrated into their own systems or programs.

- Engage with bilateral and multilateral donors, as well as public representatives through the establishment of a Steering Committee to explore future avenues of financing the Online Platform and Green Forums.

V. KEY RISKS

A. Overall Risk Rating and Explanation of Key Risks

41. **The overall rating is estimated as moderate. The main risks include:**

- **Political instability and shifting government priorities caused by the ongoing energy crisis in Kosovo: moderate.** Political impacts of the war in Ukraine and the subsequent energy crisis may impact the commitments of the targeted institutions regarding the Green Agenda. Key stakeholders are influenced by the developments in the energy crisis (e.g., power cuts, soaring energy prices), and their positions and engagements regarding the Green Agenda could shift considerably. In this context, the need for data-driven decision making and platforms for engagement with public authorities on the impact of the crisis becomes even more important. *Mitigation measures:* The project will mitigate the risk of shifting priorities and commitments by contributing to the transparency of the sector through the development of the Online Platform and participation spaces that will enable citizens and CSOs to monitor public sector and other key actors' corrective measures in the implementation of the Green Agenda. Moreover, the project will train diverse media representatives to cover climate issues, including the energy crisis in a data-driven and factual manner to facilitate public awareness and informed engagement on green transition challenges and priorities. This will further enhance the acknowledgement by key actors of the importance of the Green Agenda and give it more visibility among citizens thus contributing to the sustainability of the project actions.
- **COVID-19 pandemic: low.** The pandemic as such can affect the implementation of the activities planned to occur in person, i.e., the capacity building activities, and other activities which require in-field visits. *Mitigation measures:* If physical restrictions are reimposed, online adaptation of such activities will take place, including through the Green Agenda Online Platform.
- **Institutional capacity and lack of commitment/cooperation from the stakeholders: moderate.** The goal of the proposed project is to bring together the shared interest of different stakeholders from the country engaged in implementing the Green Agenda. Withdrawal of interest, lack of commitment, and support from the identified stakeholders of this project, can affect the quality of results. Considering that the initial project staff might not remain the same throughout the implementation period of the project, and new staff is required to be engaged, this transition could cause risks regarding the deliverables in the expected timeline. *Mitigation measures:* The consortium of partner organizations responsible for implementing the proposed project will utilize its positive partnerships with the identified stakeholders of this project, to maintain a continuous collaboration with them. The use of MoUs and the project's platforms will ensure stakeholder incentives to address climate issues. Immediate replacement by the internal staff is planned as necessary, and good protocols for transferring



knowledge will be kept.

- **The project is expected to entail some minor social and environmental risks as covered by the ESSs (environmental and social standards). See E&S section.**



VI. APPRAISAL SUMMARY

Fiduciary.

42. **An FM assessment was carried out to determine the FM implementation risk and help establish adequate FM arrangements for the proposed operation.** Bank policies and procedures on FM and disbursement require that the Project implementing entities maintain FM systems adequate to ensure that they can provide the Bank with accurate and timely information regarding Project resources and expenditures. The existing financial management arrangements of the BGF and the two CSO's partners were reviewed. All three organizations have adequate FM capacity and a long-standing experience with the implementation of donor-funded projects, including complying with respective fiduciary requirements. The assessment indicates that they lack experience with Bank disbursement and FM requirements, and there is an increased risk due to implementation involving three organizations. To mitigate these risks, the following measures are agreed: (i) on the job training and support will be delivered on disbursement procedures, (ii) Bank's agreement on the interim financial reporting templates which will be used as a basis for disbursement, (iii) enhancement of the financial policy as indicated below, and (iv) Bank's review of the draft Implementation Agreement with Partner CSOs to define roles and responsibilities on financial management, among other things. The assessment concluded that financial management risk after mitigation measures is low.

43. **For the proposed operation, BGF will be responsible for overall financial management, funds flow and disbursements of the grant proceeds.** In practice, the financial management arrangements, including staffing, budget control, accounting system, reporting, internal control, and audit existing in BGFs and the two partner CSOs for similar projects are considered adequate. There is a sound practice in place with respect to the acceptance and authorization of expenditure (payroll, consultants, training, and goods), including internal controls and evidence, as well as contract monitoring and operating cost sharing between active projects. However, the Bank team has noticed that the existing BGF's financial management policy did not provide for such details. There is a need to enhance the existing policy considering the above considerations. These procedures, acceptable to the Bank, will be included as an annex to the existing financial policy of BGF and implemented to all project operations.

44. **The partner CSOs will be responsible for financial management, reporting and auditing of the use of funds on the requirements established in the partnership agreements.** The partnership agreements will be signed between the BGF and the two partner CSOs for the implementation of the specific project parts, and will define the roles and responsibilities, reporting and monitoring requirements for the implementation, including procurement, financial management and disbursement and other safeguards requirements. Funds will be transferred according to the DFIL from BGF to the other two partner CSOs to cover operating costs, while partner CSOs may not procure goods and consulting services. The main fiduciary management responsibility lies with BGF, however, the CSOs would still need to maintain an adequate records and accounts and reporting, around the project expenditure and make documentation available for audit and inspections from BGF and the Bank; such requirements to be defined in the respective partnership agreements.



45. **The grant proceeds will be disbursed based on the regular IPF disbursement mechanism using traditional disbursement methods.** The financing proceeds will be disbursed through a Designated Account (DAs) denominated in Euro, managed by the BGF, maintained in a commercial bank, acceptable to the WB. The BGF will be accountable for withdrawing credit proceeds through its authorized signatures. The Bank's disbursement guidelines would be applicable and related requirements will be defined in the grant agreement and disbursement letter. Quarterly cash-basis interim financial reports (IFRs) covering all Project activities (including partner CSOs activities), in a format acceptable to the Bank, will be submitted for the Bank's review not later than 45 days from the end of the quarter. The unaudited IFRs will include as a minimum the statement of receipts and payments, expenditure by components and categories, and contract monitoring.

46. **BGF's audited annual financial statements prepared in accordance with International Financial Reporting Standards will be required.** The financial statements will contain adequate disclosures on the Project operations, their financial position and financial performance and cash flow statement. The audits of BGF will be conducted annually by independent auditors acceptable to the Bank based on International Standards on Audit (ISA). The audit reports would be provided to the Bank within six months after the end of each fiscal year. A separate financial audit report for the project financial statement covering the entire period of the grant will be needed at its closing. The scope of the audit will be expanded to include the activities implemented through the funds transferred to the partner CSOs. The audit reports would be made publicly available, as per the WBG Policy on Access to Information.

Procurement arrangements.

47. **Procurement will be conducted in accordance with the World Bank's Procurement Regulations for IPF Borrowers for Goods, Works, Non-Consulting and Consulting Services, dated July 1, 2016 (revised in November 2017, August 2018 and November 2020).** The Project will be subject to the World Bank's Anti-Corruption Guidelines, dated October 15, 2006, and revised in January 2011 and as of July 1, 2016. and any provisions stipulated in the Grant Agreement.

48. **A procurement capacity assessment was performed to assess the Balkan Green Foundation (BGF) and the two CSO's partners. BGF will be responsible for all procurement activities under the project.** The assessment included a review of BGF's organizational structure and its partners for the project implementation, as well as staffing and procurement systems that are in place to determine the risk and mitigation measures. The procurement assessment concluded that:

1. The staff of the CSOs involved in procurement have limited experience in procurement in general and lacks experience with the Bank project financing.
2. The agency's procurement regulations differ from the Bank's Procurement Regulations.
3. Hiring additional/external staff with experience under the Bank procedures would not be feasible considering that the project is small, and the procurement packages are of a small value.
4. Kosovo's environment has been identified with considerable risk of corruption; pressure of high-level officials to influence in the results of the selection/tendering process is an issue identified in the Bank's project portfolio.

49. Based on the above, the procurement risk is assessed as Moderate. To mitigate the identified risk, the following measures are proposed to be taken:



- Identify a single staff member (preferably of the Consortium leader – BGF to be assigned the role of the procurement specialist which will support BGF, FOL and ODK on the procurement activities under all three Components.
- The BGF’s team, including the Procurement Specialist and FM specialist shall report to the BGF Project Coordinator.
- The CSOs should set up in timely manner, the evaluation committees for evaluation of proposals, and further, BGF should ensure the committee members should have solid knowledge in the field of the assignment.
- In addition, the Procurement and Finance management staff should attend the procurement trainings/workshops organized by the Bank in the region.
- After the above measures are taken, the risk rating is expected to be Low.

50. **Procurement arrangement: BGF, with support from the World Bank, developed a Project Procurement Strategy for Development (PPSD) identifying the appropriate selection methods, market approach and type of review by the World Bank.** Goods and non-consulting services will be procured following Request for Bids, Request for Quotations and Direct Selection methods, and the procurement documents will be agreed upon with the World Bank. Consulting services will be procured following Least-Cost-Based Selection, Consultant’s-Qualification-Based Selection, Direct Selection, and Individual Consultants methods. The underlying Procurement Plan will be updated at least annually or as required to reflect the actual project implementation needs and improvements in institutional capacity.

51. **Use of STEP (Systematic Tracking of Exchanges in Procurement).** The Project will use STEP to plan, record, and track procurement transactions. All procurement transactions for post and prior contract review under the Project must be recorded in or processed through the World Bank’s STEP platform. This ensures that comprehensive information on the procurement and implementation of all contracts awarded under the whole Project are automatically available. This tool will be used to manage the exchange of information (such as bidding documents, bid evaluation reports, and no-objections) between the implementing agencies and the World Bank. Online tutorials/training for use of the STEP will be made available to the grant recipient.

A. Legal Operational Policies

	Triggered?
Projects on International Waterways OP 7.50	No
Projects in Disputed Areas OP 7.60	No

B. Environmental and Social

52. **The project is expected to entail some minor social and environmental risks as covered by the ESSs** (environmental and social standards). Social risks and impacts might be associated with labor, working conditions, and OHS (Occupational Health and Safety), community health and safety related to installation of solar panels, and inadequate stakeholder engagement. Additionally, low, short-term, local, and reversible environmental impacts can be incurred because of the installation of the two solar panels, such as noise, dust, pollution, health, and safety. Mitigation of the risks will be guided by a generic ESMP checklist to be prepared prior to procurement of civil works and the contractor will be



required to prepare the specific ESMP checklist. Considering their minor significance, no further assessment of E&S (Environmental & Social) risks resulting from the project is considered necessary. The project will monitor and mitigate the identified minor E&S risks based on commitments outlined in the Borrower ESCP (Environmental and Social Commitment Plan) and SEP (Stakeholder Engagement Plan). Special attention will be given to ensure the adequate screening and managing of adverse E&S impacts that might fall upon vulnerable groups, particularly in relation to identifying the barriers contributing to their exclusion from project activities and providing the tools to overcome them. A consortium of CSO will appoint a focal person to oversee social and environmental issues and mitigate potential social and environmental risks in line with the ESF (Environmental and Social Framework). Additionally, WB Environmental and Social specialists will provide support to the consortium on managing and reporting social and environmental risks in line with the ESF.

VII. World Bank Grievance Redress

53. **Grievance Redress.** Communities and individuals who believe that they are adversely affected by a project supported by the World Bank may submit complaints to existing project-level grievance mechanisms or the Bank's Grievance Redress Service (GRS). The GRS ensures that complaints received are promptly reviewed in order to address project-related concerns. Project affected communities and individuals may submit their complaint to the Bank's independent Accountability Mechanism (AM). The AM houses the Inspection Panel, which determines whether harm occurred, or could occur, as a result of Bank non-compliance with its policies and procedures, and the Dispute Resolution Service, which provides communities and borrowers with the opportunity to address complaints through dispute resolution. Complaints may be submitted to the AM at any time after concerns have been brought directly to the attention of Bank Management and after Management has been given an opportunity to respond. For information on how to submit complaints to the Bank's Grievance Redress Service (GRS), please visit <http://www.worldbank.org/GRS>. For information on how to submit complaints to the Bank's Accountability Mechanism, please visit <https://accountability.worldbank.org>.



VII. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND MONITORING

Results Framework
COUNTRY : Kosovo
Kosovo Green Action

Project Development Objectives

The proposed development objective is to contribute to improving accountability of relevant Kosovo public institutions in the implementation of the Green Agenda.

Project Development Objective Indicators

Indicator Name	Corporate	Unit of Measure	Baseline	End Target	Frequency	Data Source / Methodology	Responsibility for Data Collection
Name: Number of public institutions providing access to climate and energy data as a result of project activities (transparency)		Number	0.00	2.00	At mid-term and final evaluation	Memorandums of Understanding	Balkan Green Foundation

Description: Measures the number of public institutions that have taken concrete steps to improve climate and energy data access to the public through the Green Agenda Online Platform. Enhanced data access is measured through the achievement of one or a combination of internationally recognized Open Government Data Principles. Open Government Data standards: <https://opengovdata.org/>

- 1. Complete



Indicator Name	Corporate	Unit of Measure	Baseline	End Target	Frequency	Data Source / Methodology	Responsibility for Data Collection
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - All public data is made available. Public data is data that is not subject to valid privacy, security or privilege limitations. - 2. Primary - Data is as collected at the source, with the highest possible level of granularity, not in aggregate or modified forms. - 3. Timely - Data is made available as quickly as necessary to preserve the value of the data. - 4. Accessible - Data is available to the widest range of users for the widest range of purposes. - 5. Machine processable - Data is reasonably structured to allow automated processing. - 6. Non-discriminatory - Data is available to anyone, with no requirement of registration. - 7. Non-proprietary - Data is available in a format over which no entity has exclusive control. - 8. License-free - Data is not subject to any copyright, patent, trademark or trade secret regulation. Reasonable privacy, security and privilege restrictions may be allowed. <p>Compliance with these principles must be reviewable.</p> <p>Government data shall be considered open if it is made public in a way that complies with these principles. Opportunities for enhancing data and information access per public institution will be identified in the Green Agenda Implementation and Needs Assessment. The data access activities prioritized by the project will be agreed with relevant public entities and confirmed through the respective MoUs.</p>							
Name: Corrective actions taken by relevant public institutions to address gaps in the implementation of the Green Agenda in Kosovo identified by the project. (responsiveness)		Yes/No	N	Y	At mid-term and final evaluation.	Memorandums of Understanding BGF progress reports	Balkan Green Foundation
<p>Description: Measures corrective actions taken by public institutions in line with the actions identified in the Green Agenda Implementation and Needs Assessment. The agreed actions will be included in the Memorandums of Understanding signed with the public entities at the start of the project and any additional/ revised corrective actions will be reflected in relevant documents such as stock taking of Green Agenda implementation, ISRs or AMs.</p>							



Intermediate Results Indicators

Indicator Name	Corporate	Unit of Measure	Baseline	End Target	Frequency	Data Source / Methodology	Responsibility for Data Collection
Name: Number of individuals that engage with climate and energy information through the project-created platform (information access)		Number	0.00	5,000.00	At mid-term and final evaluation.	Online platform traffic.	Balkan Green Foundation.
<p>Description: Measures access to information on energy and climate issues based on platform traffic (total number of visitors to the platform). This includes visitors who browse the website, and/or use the “ask the state” function, and/or download material.</p>							
Name: Multi-stakeholder platforms annually assessing and formulating Green Agenda implementation recommendations for government actors, CSOs and the donor community (engagement).		Yes/No	N	Y	At mid-term and final evaluation.	Balkan Green Foundation progress report.	Balkan Green Foundation.
<p>Description: This indicator measures whether the project has successfully organized Green Forums with multiple stakeholders engaged in stock taking of Green Agenda implementation and identifying of priority actions for the following years. To achieve “yes” on this indicator the BGF must publish annually the Green Forum results on the Green Agenda Online Platform to be launched by the project.</p>							
Name: There is evidence		Yes/No	N	Y	At mid-term and final	Collection of all relevant	Balkan Green



Indicator Name	Corporate	Unit of Measure	Baseline	End Target	Frequency	Data Source / Methodology	Responsibility for Data Collection
of uptake (as defined by the GPSA) by public sector institutions, the Bank or other donor/development actors to which the project has contributed.					evaluation.	data that offers insights into likely uptake by relevant stakeholders as defined in the indicator description.	Foundation team (appoints an external evaluation consultant).
<p>Description: This indicator is a projection of the likelihood of public sector institutions and/or other relevant stakeholders applying or sustaining lessons from, or elements of, the collaborative social accountability process after the project’s lifetime. The GPSA conceptualizes uptake broadly with evidence for uptake including efforts by the government’s own reform program, donor-funded programs, or Bank-financed programs to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) Use substantive lessons for improvements of targeted policies, processes, and mechanisms; (ii) Sustain elements of collaborative social accountability processes after the life of the project; (iii) Adapt insights from GPSA projects to scale them through programs or policies; or (iv) Apply elements of collaborative social accountability processes in additional localities or sectors. <p>The unit of measurement for this indicator is yes/no with a yes requiring a description of what type of uptake there is evidence for and what that evidence is. This indicator is, more than for accountability purposes, included as a reminder to think about and collect information about possible uptake from the project. This information will also feed into a deeper analysis by the external evaluator at the end of the project. Evaluation consultant to use information to verify likelihood of uptake.</p>							
Name: Number of participants (per gender) in project’s collaborative social accountability activities including training for stakeholders.		Number	0.00	275.00	At mid-term and final evaluation.	List of participants in Green Forums, youth debates and training activities.	Balkan Green Foundation.
<p>Description: Measures the engagement of stakeholders in the project’s primary social accountability activities, the Green Forums, youth debates and training activities for key stakeholders. The project’s contribution to building the capacity of target stakeholders (public officials, civil society and media representatives) on the national Green</p>							



Indicator Name	Corporate	Unit of Measure	Baseline	End Target	Frequency	Data Source / Methodology	Responsibility for Data Collection
<p>Agenda commitments and mechanisms for enhancing accountability in the energy and climate sector. The training series will focus on improving their knowledge on climate related issues and how to make climate issues more relevant in the public discourse and how to use the platform to implement data-driven work approaches. The total number of people trained is disaggregated by gender and stakeholder group is calculated by combining all training session participants. Note that this indicator does not include visitors to the project’s platform.</p>							
Name: Grant recipients participate in GPSA Partners learning events.		Yes/No	N	Y	At baseline study, mid-term and final evaluation.	Partners from the project team participate in GPSA Partners learning events.	Balkan Green Foundation.
<p>Description: Measures the project’s contribution to the strengthening of civil society capacity on social accountability in the energy and climate sector. The two main learning events that this indicator intends to capture are i) the annual GPSA Grant Partners Workshop and ii) the annual GPSA Forum.</p>							
Name: The project has course-corrected based on learning and evidence.		Yes/No	N	Y	At mid-term and final evaluation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Steering committee suggestions have been implemented - Monitoring actions have been adjusted as per findings/needs - Topics and capacity-building themes have been adjusted as per results of consultation and direct engagement with stakeholders 	<p>Balkan Green Foundation.</p> <p>Evaluation consultant to use tracked information to verify use of learning and evidence in course correction.</p>



Indicator Name	Corporate	Unit of Measure	Baseline	End Target	Frequency	Data Source / Methodology	Responsibility for Data Collection
						The data will be collected based on evaluation surveys and/or close-ended questionnaires to capture quantitative and qualitative feedback from key stakeholders at baseline, mid-term and closing of the project.	

Description: Course correction refers to changes made in a project in real-time based on emerging knowledge and learning, new data and information, or changes in the context in which the project is implemented. Course correction is considered to have taken place when a grant partner has used timely operational inputs and analysis (including through annual reporting and mid-term review) to alter the strategy and/or implementation of any of the project's components for the purpose of increasing the project's chances of achieving the project development objective. In practice, a course correction may for example take the form of adding, removing, or amending: 1) the locations and composition of multi-stakeholder compacts, 2) the scale and targets of capacity-building efforts, or 3) the collaborative social accountability mechanism(s) that is deployed. Particularly at the later stages of the project, course correction may also involve refocusing attention on those aspects of the project that are most likely to yield positive results within the project's timeframe and dropping aspects that have lower chances of yielding results.



Target Values

Project Development Objective Indicators

Indicator Name	Baseline	End Target
Number of public institutions providing access to climate and energy data as a result of project activities (transparency)	0.00	2.00
Corrective actions taken by relevant public institutions to address gaps in the implementation of the Green Agenda in Kosovo identified by the project. (responsiveness)	N	Yes

Intermediate Results Indicators

Indicator Name	Baseline	End Target
Number of individuals that engage with climate and energy information through the project-created platform (information access)	0.00	5,000.00
Multi-stakeholder platforms annually assessing and formulating Green Agenda implementation recommendations for government actors, CSOs and the donor community (engagement).	N	Yes
There is evidence of uptake (as defined by the GPSA) by public sector institutions, the Bank or other donor/development actors to which the project has contributed.	N	Yes
Number of participants (per gender) in project's collaborative social accountability activities including training for stakeholders.	0.00	275.00
Grant recipients participate in GPSA Partners learning events.	N	Yes
The project has course-corrected based on learning and evidence.	N	Yes

