

TC Document

I. Basic Information for TC

▪ Country/Region:	BELIZE
▪ TC Name:	Evaluation of Global Citizenship Skills
▪ TC Number:	BL-T1177
▪ Team Leader/Members:	Naslund-Hadley, Emma Ingrid (SCL/EDU) Team Leader; Biehl, Maria Loreto (SCL/EDU) Alternate Team Leader; Findlater Emma Catherine (SCL/EDU); Watson, Brodrick Raylando (VPC/FMP); Forero Perez Maria Alejandra (SCL/EDU); Olivares Greta (SCL/EDU); Lunstedt Tapia, Christian (VPC/FMP); De Dobrzynski, Esteban (LEG/SGO); Usher Orchel Lisamarie (CID/CBL).
▪ Taxonomy:	Operational Support
▪ Operation Supported by the TC:	BL-L1044.
▪ Date of TC Abstract authorization:	12 Feb 2024.
▪ Beneficiary:	Ministry of Education Culture Science and Technology (MoECST)
▪ Executing Agency and contact name:	Inter-American Development Bank
▪ Donors providing funding:	OC SDP Window 2 - Social Development(W2E)
▪ IDB Funding Requested:	US\$400,000.00
▪ Local counterpart funding, if any:	US\$0
▪ Disbursement period (which includes Execution period):	36 months
Required start date:	June 1, 2024
▪ Types of consultants:	Consultancy Firm, Individual consultants
▪ Prepared by Unit:	SCL/EDU-Education
▪ Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	SCL/EDU-Education
▪ TC included in Country Strategy (y/n):	Yes
▪ TC included in CPD (y/n):	Yes
▪ Alignment to the Update to the Institutional Strategy 2024-2030:	Diversity; Gender equality; Persons with Disabilities; Social inclusion and equality

II. Description of the Associated Loan

- 2.1 The Skills for the Future Program (S4F) (BL-L1044 and BL-G1008) was approved by the IDB Board of Executive Directors in May 2023. S4F is financed through an investment loan of US\$15 million (BL-L1044) from the IDB ordinary capital and a US\$5 million Multiplier Allocation grant (BL-G1008) from the Global Partnership for Education Fund (GPE).
- 2.2 The development objective is to contribute to the closing of the skills gap to prepare tomorrow's workforce for the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4iR).¹ The specific objectives of the operation are to: (i) increase access to instruction that accelerates learning in foundational skills, including those of Students with Disabilities (Swd); (ii) increase access to instruction that promotes learning in 4iR skills; and (iii) increase access to gender-specific education services to promote inclusive education.

¹ The 4iR is characterized by a range of new technologies that are needed to fuse “the physical, digital and biological worlds, impacting all disciplines, economies and industries”.

- 2.3 This TC will support the S4F Program by evaluating students' global citizenship skills which encompass gender and diversity, green citizenship, civics and human rights and peace education. These skillsets and knowledge support the objective of BL-L1044 to contribute to the closing of the skills gap to prepare tomorrow's workforce for the 4iR. The expected result of this TC is the mapping of students' global citizenship skills in Belize.
- 2.4 **Lessons Learned.** This TC builds on lessons learned from education project evaluations in Belize, including of EQIP I and II (BL-L1018; BL-L1030; BL-L1059). Lessons learned from these evaluations comprise the importance of investing in training for data collectors, using standardized instruments and protocols, and employing triangulation methods to enhance the validity and reliability of data.

III. Objectives and Justification of the TC

- 3.1 Despite substantive efforts made by the Government of Belize (GOB) to provide distance learning, COVID-19 related school closures led to a decrease in the rate of learning. In line with international trends, large losses were recorded in foundational skills. The average mathematics score among 5th graders dropped by 36% between the 2018/19 and 2021/22 school years. In the 8th-grade (standard 6), the average mathematics score dropped by 41%. In English language, the average test score decreased by 26% among 5th graders and 15% among 8th graders (Näslund-Hadley et al., 2023). Pre-pandemic anecdotal evidence already suggested gaps exist between students with learning disabilities and their peers. The link between foundational skill gaps and education attainment is well established. Belize already struggled with some of the region's lowest access rates pre-pandemic at the primary and secondary levels.² In line with international trends, during the COVID-19 pandemic student average repetition and dropout rates increased at the secondary level of education. Grade repetition increased from 6.2% to 10.4% between the 2018/19 and 2021/22 school years among 8th graders. In the same period, the dropout rate increased from 4.9% to 6.1% among 5th graders ([Näslund-Hadley et al., 2023](#)).
- 3.2 **Global Citizenship Skills.** Educational practices and policies worldwide are converging to address the need for learning goals and teaching practices that respond to the conditions of globalization (Stromquist & Monkman, 2014; Suárez-Orozco, 2007). Global citizenship education provides the knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes required by citizens to lead productive lives, make informed decisions, and assume active roles locally and globally in facing and resolving global challenges (UNESCO, 2015). Civic and global citizenship education aim to raise students' knowledge and awareness regarding politics and issues that transcend national borders, as well as influence their attitudes and values towards democracy (Finkel and Ernst, 2005). The Ministry of Education, Culture, Science, and Technology (MoECST) recognizes the significance of global citizenship skills, with one of its objectives being to cultivate secondary students who embody the qualities of "national and global citizens, productive economic agents, and socio-cultural individuals" ([BESPlan](#)). There

2 Gross school enrollment in Belize is 85.1% in primary education and 61.6% in secondary, compared to the regional average of 106.7% and 94.3%, respectively (CIMA). Net school enrollment in Belize is 76.8% at the primary level and 49.6% at secondary, compared to the regional average of 94.5% and 74.5%, respectively (CIMA).

is a limited number of impact evaluations of global citizenship skills, largely due to a lack of standardized evaluation frameworks across diverse cultural and educational contexts. While the S4F operations supports both the development of STEAM skills and global citizenship skills, only the evaluation of the former is included in the evaluation framework. Therefore, the GOB has requested the proposed TC to support the evaluation of global citizenship skills through the Skills for the Future (BL-L1044 and BL-G1008) program.

- 3.3 **Objective.** Within the context of the S4F Program, the objective of this technical cooperation (TC) is to support the Government of Belize (GOB) in the evaluation of global citizenship skills at the primary and secondary levels. The specific objectives are to: (i) develop and validate a global citizenship skills instrument that will allow the GOB to measure the global citizenship skills of their students; and (ii) evaluate the global citizenship skills of students in Belize to assess whether students are obtaining the skills needed to be "national and global citizens, productive economic agents, and socio-cultural individuals" (BESPlan). The expected result of this TC is the mapping of students' global citizenship skills in Belize.
- 3.4 **Beneficiaries.** The beneficiaries of this TC will be primary and secondary school students that participate in the S4F Program.
- 3.5 **Strategic Alignment.** The TC is consistent with the IDB Group Institutional Strategy: Transforming for Scale and Impact ([CA-631](#)) and is aligned with the objective of reducing poverty and inequality by evaluating an operation that seeks to close learning gaps for vulnerable students. The Program is also aligned with the operational focus area of gender equality and inclusion of diverse population groups such as persons with disabilities ([GN-2800-13](#)) as it aims to evaluate a Gender Direct Investment Lending Operation that also includes a component on improving screening for students with special education needs. The TC is also aligned with the Ordinary Capital Strategic Development Program (OC SDP) Window 2 – Social Development ([W2E](#)) – [GN-2819-14](#), as it funds a TC project directly related to a loan operation (BL-L1044) that aims to support the challenge of social exclusion and inequality by supporting investment in human capital and supporting efforts to promote gender equality.
- 3.6 The TC is also aligned with the IDB Group Country Strategy with Belize 2022-2025 ([GN-3086-1](#)), which prioritizes the building of skills for the post COVID-19 economy and closing the skills gap. It is also consistent with the Sector Framework Document for Skills Development ([GN-3012-4](#)) by measuring high-quality learning opportunities. The proposed operation is aligned with the national Belize Education Sector Plan ([BESPlan](#)), which seeks to "produce good, productive citizens"; close learning gaps that widened during the COVID-19 pandemic; and foster digital and STEAM skills.

IV. Description of activities/components and budget

- 4.1 **Component I. Defining and Measuring Global Citizenship Skills (US\$195,000).** The purpose of the Component is to conduct a systematic review of global citizenship skills and develop and validate an instrument for measuring global citizenship skills that are fostered within the S4F Program. Resources will finance contracting of individual consultants to undertake: (i) Defining global citizenship skills; (ii) Conducting a literature review on frameworks, assessments, and interventions on global citizenship skills; (iii) Developing an instrument (e.g., questionnaire, rubric, performance task) to measure global citizenship competencies and skills of high

school students in S4F by referencing from existing instruments that measure capabilities for citizenship and peaceful coexistence³; (iv) Pilot Testing in a sample of high school students to identify any issues with item clarity, response format, or administration procedures and have a finalized version of the instrument ; (v) Conduct focus groups of high school students, teachers, caregivers, and administrators to gather feedback; (vi) Assessing the content validity of the instrument by consulting with experts in global citizenship education; (vii) Evaluating the construct validity of the instrument by examining its relationship with other measures or constructs that are theoretically related to global citizenship skills; (viii) Developing the Criterion Validity, Reliability, and Administration Guidelines for administering the instrument to ensure consistency across different administrations and settings; and (ix) Conducting a systematic review to assess global citizenship skills using experimental and quasi-experimental interventions with a focus on primary and secondary schools in Latin America and the Caribbean. The expected result of this component is a validated instrument for measuring global citizenship skills that will allow GOB to monitor and evaluate how education contributes to foster these skills in Belize.

- 4.2 **Component II. Evaluation Global Citizenship Skills (US\$195,000).** The TC will use resources to finance the contracting of a consultancy firm to support the follow up measurement of the S4F Program to evaluate its impact on global citizenship skills. A phase-in experimental evaluation will measure the impact on children's global citizenship skills at the primary school level. At the secondary level, the quasi-experimental impact evaluation will study the impact of the program on global citizenship skills. Resources from the TC will be allocated towards contracting a consultancy firm for the comprehensive measurement of the S4F Program's impact on global citizenship skills. The evaluation process will employ a phased-in approach, utilizing both experimental and quasi-experimental methodologies to ensure robustness and accuracy in assessing the program's effectiveness. Firstly, at the primary school level, a phase-in experimental evaluation will be conducted to measure the impact of the S4F Program on children's global citizenship skills. This rigorous evaluation will involve randomly assigning participating schools to either the intervention group, which benefits from the S4F Program, or the control group, which does not. By comparing the outcomes of these two groups over time, the evaluation will be able to identify and quantify the program's impact on various dimensions of global citizenship skills, including intercultural competence, empathy, critical thinking, and collaborative problem-solving. At the secondary school level, a quasi-experimental impact evaluation will be implemented to examine the effects of the S4F Program on global citizenship skills among older students. This evaluation will involve comparing outcomes between schools that have implemented the program and those that have not, considering potential confounding variables. The quasi-experimental design allows for a more nuanced understanding of the program's impact in real-world settings, accounting for factors such as school context and student demographics. At both levels of education, the evaluation will include a heterogeneity analysis to assess gender differences in the impact of the program on global citizenship skills, helping to identify any potential disparities and inform strategies for promoting gender equity in

³ The SER Test of Capabilities for Citizenship and Peaceful Coexistence is produced and administered by the Secretariat of Education of the District of Bogotá (SED) since 2014 and applied to all 9th grade students from all public schools. It measures the six capabilities essential for citizenship and peaceful coexistence: (1) identity; (2) dignity and rights; (3) duties and respect for others' rights; (4) sensitivity and emotional management; (5) meaning of life, body, and nature; and (6) participation. <http://www.educacionbogota.edu.co>

education. Additionally, the evaluation will examine the impact of the S4F Program on students with special education needs. Special attention will be given to assessing how the program addresses the unique learning needs and challenges faced by these students, ensuring that the program is inclusive and accessible to all learners. By conducting a thorough analysis of the program's impact on students with special education needs, the evaluation will provide valuable insights into the program's effectiveness in promoting equitable educational outcomes for all students. The expected result of this component is an analysis of students' global citizenship skills.

- 4.3 **Component III. Dissemination (US\$10,000).** This component will finance the dissemination of findings through a publication and presentation to stakeholders. Specifically, the dissemination will include developing a publication and presentation on the evaluation results and the proposed instrument for secondary school students. The expected result of this component is the dissemination of the global citizenship skills measurement instrument.
- 4.4 **Budget.** The total cost of the TC is US\$400,000, which will be charged against the OC SDP Window 2 – Social Development ([W2E](#)). A counterpart funding is not expected.

Table 1. Indicative Budget (US\$)

Activity/Component	Description	W2E	Total Funding
Component 1. Defining and Measuring Global Citizenship Skills	This component will finance the development and validation of the instrument and a systematic review of GCE.	195,000	195,000
Component 2. Evaluating Global Citizenship Skills	This component will finance evaluation.	195,000	195,000
Component 3. Dissemination	This component will finance editing, translation, data analysis and drafting of note.	10,000	10,000
Total		400,000	400,000

- 4.5 **Monitoring.** The Project Team will be responsible for the review of all technical and financial reporting. The Team Leader will be responsible for monitoring activities in the field, and continuous progress meetings with the counterparts and consultants.

V. Executing agency and execution structure

- 5.1 The Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) through the Education Division (SCL/EDU) in collaboration with the country office (CID/CBL) will execute this TC. The Government has requested that the IDB execute the TC due to its long trajectory in education evaluations and history with the program. This is consistent with Appendix 10 in the Operational Guidelines for Technical Cooperations (as modified Annex 2 of [OP-619-4](#)), which identifies the need of a strong institutional, operational, and technical capacity for the execution of the contemplated activities in technical cooperations.
- 5.2 **Execution and disbursement period.** The TC will be executed through the UDR SCL/EDU over a period of 36 months and disbursed over a period of 36 months as of the date of approval.

- 5.3 **Procurement.** The activities to be executed are included in the Procurement Plan (Annex IV) and the Bank will contract individual consultants, consulting firms and other services in accordance with current Bank procurement policies and procedures. The Bank will contract the services of individual consultants in accordance with Section [AM-650](#) of the Administrative Manual “Complementary Workforce”, logistics and other related services in accordance with the IDB Corporate Procurement Policy ([GN-2303-28](#)), and consulting firms for services of intellectual nature in accordance with the Policy for the Selection and Contracting of Consulting Firms for Bank-Executed Operational Work ([GN-2765-4](#)) and its Operational Guidelines ([OP-1155-4](#)).
- 5.4 **Single-source selection (SSS).** Direct contracting is foreseen of Innovations for Poverty Action (IPA) in the amount of approximately US\$195,000 to undertake the impact evaluation of global citizenship skills as it relates to the operation 5749/OC-BL. This entails collecting data on the impact of the S4F program on primary and secondary school students’ global citizenship skills. The SSS of IPA is consistent with 4.1.3(a) of the Policy for the Selection and Contracting of Consulting Firms for Bank-executed Operational Work ([GN-2765-4](#)) which allows for SSS because it’s a task that represents a natural continuation of previous work carried out by the firm, directly for the Bank or in the context of a Bank project, and only this firm is qualified or has the experience of exceptional worth for this assignment and it presents a clear advantage over competition. This contract is currently in execution. This SSS is also in line with 4.1.3 (d) of the same policy. IPA has exceptional value as the non-governmental organization has completed over 900 experimental impact evaluations across the globe and has another 100 RCTs ongoing. Some 100 of these experimental evaluations are in the education sector. To the best of our knowledge, no other consultancy firm has undertaken as many randomized control trials, nor as many in the education sector. As IDB consultants, IPA has successfully conducted a wide spectrum of impact evaluations using a randomized design. Their work is consistently of superior quality.
- 5.5 All deliverables and any other material prepared under this TC are the sole and exclusive property of the Bank, and as such, the Bank has title, rights (including copyrights) and exclusive interests in the ownership of said products.

VI. Major issues

- 6.1 The risks to project execution are reduced by being directly executed by the IDB. Although the evaluation and validation of education tools in a context such as Belize always presents certain logistical challenges, the IDB has years of experience working with schools in remote areas, including service delivery in rural and urban marginalized schools. This risk will be mitigated through measures that have been effectively used in the past when conducting education sector evaluations in Belize. Firstly, pilot testing data collection procedures will be implemented as was done with previous rounds of data collection for EQIP I and II (VL-T1159; BL-L1018; BL-L1030). This involves conducting small-scale trials of data collection methods and tools to identify and address any potential issues before at-scale application. By testing data collection procedures in a controlled environment, the project team can refine the processes and ensure they are efficient and effective. Secondly, communication strategies will be employed to facilitate effective collaboration and coordination among stakeholders. By fostering open and transparent communication, the evaluation team can build trust

and rapport with stakeholders, mitigating potential conflicts and misunderstandings that could impede evaluation implementation.

VII. Exceptions to Bank policy

7.1 There are no exceptions to Bank policies.

VIII. Environmental and Social Aspects

8.1 This Technical Cooperation is not intended to finance pre-feasibility or feasibility studies of specific investment projects or environmental and social studies associated with them; therefore, this TC does not have applicable requirements of the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy Framework (ESPF).

Required Annexes:

[Request from the Client_4912.pdf](#)

[Results Matrix_90458.pdf](#)

[Terms of Reference_24080.pdf](#)

[Procurement Plan_18265.pdf](#)