

TC Document

I. Basic Information for TC

▪ Country/Region:	REGIONAL
▪ TC Name:	Strengthening Social Violence Prevention Initiatives in the Caribbean
▪ TC Number:	RG-T3662
▪ Team Leader/Members:	Wilks, Jason Malcolm (IFD/ICS) Team Leader; De Simone, Francesco (IFD/ICS) Alternate Team Leader; Brathwaite, Neeca N. (CCB/CTT); Graham, Rodolfo (LEG/SGO); Manzur Madariaga, Michelle (IFD/ICS); Mcbean, Althea Deanie (IFD/ICS) Neeca N. (CCB/CTT); Graham, Rodolfo (LEG/SGO); Manzur Madariaga, Michelle (IFD/ICS); Mcbean, Althea Deanie (IFD/ICS) Graham, Rodolfo (LEG/SGO); Manzur Madariaga, Michelle (IFD/ICS); Mcbean, Althea Deanie (IFD/ICS)
▪ Taxonomy:	Client Support
▪ Operation Supported by the TC:	.
▪ Date of TC Abstract authorization:	23 Mar 2020.
▪ Beneficiary:	Governments of Trinidad and Tobago and Jamaica
▪ Executing Agency and contact name:	Inter-American Development Bank
▪ Donors providing funding:	OC Strategic Development Program for Institutions (INS)
▪ IDB Funding Requested:	US\$300,000.00
▪ Local counterpart funding, if any:	US\$0
▪ Disbursement period (which includes Execution period):	24 months
▪ Required start date:	June 2020
▪ Types of consultants:	Individual consultants and firms
▪ Prepared by Unit:	IFD/ICS-Innovation in Citizen Services Division
▪ Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	IFD-Institutions for Development Sector
▪ TC included in Country Strategy (y/n):	Y
▪ TC included in CPD (y/n):	N
▪ Alignment to the Update to the Institutional Strategy 2010-2020:	Social inclusion and equality; Institutional capacity and rule of law

II. Objectives and Justification of the TC

- II.1 Despite continuous efforts and advancements in crime prevention, crime and violence continues to be a development challenge in the Caribbean region. In 2017, the average homicide rate for the region reached 15.1 homicides per 100,000 inhabitants, which almost triples the global average of 6.1 homicides per 100,000 inhabitants. Within this context, Trinidad and Tobago and Jamaica have been among the countries with the highest homicide rates. For instance, in 2017 the homicide rate reached its peak in the two member states with 37.5 and 57 homicides per 100,000 respectively¹.
- II.2 Crime and violence affect mostly vulnerable youth, not only as perpetrators but also as victims of crime. For instance, in Jamaica over 79% of those accused of murder were males under the age of 34 in 2018, and they also account for almost half of all victims of murder. Trinidad and Tobago is not divorced from this reality - victims and perpetrators of violence are predominantly young males between 15 and 34 years of age. In addition, it is estimated that most violent crime is related to gang activity. For

¹ UNODC (2019). Global Study on Homicides, United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime. Vienna.

example, in Jamaica gangs are credited with approximately 70% of all criminal activity in the country, primarily shootings and homicides, and in Trinidad and Tobago police statistics show 27.5% of all murders between 1995 and 2013 were gang related. It is estimated that there are 250 gangs in Jamaica, with a total membership of approximately 20,000 people. In Trinidad and Tobago there are approximately 102 gangs and most of their activities are concentrated in the capital of Port of Spain and surrounding areas. High levels of violent crime and gang activity in these countries therefore constitutes an enormous challenge for both social and economic development.

- II.3 Both Governments have prioritized the reduction of crime and the prevention of violence in order to achieve safer communities, cohesiveness and justice². In order to contribute to this goal, they have piloted multisectoral responses to gang and gun violence, supporting the implementation of promising evidence-based practices, such as [Cure Violence](#) (CV). The CV model is a scientifically proven, cost-effective, public health approach that anticipates and interrupts the transmission of violence while changing social norms and behaviors that perpetuate violence³. Under this approach violence is seen as learned behavior, which means that individuals can also unlearn it and it can also be prevented by using methods and strategies comparable to those used to control diseases⁴. In this sense, the CV model “identifies the individuals most at risk of spreading gun violence, and it intervenes to change their behavior and attitudes. Next, it tries to demonstrate to those individuals, and to the broader community that there are more acceptable and less harmful ways to resolve personal conflicts and disputes”⁵. Due to the model’s adaptive methodology of grassroots engagement and outreach, frontline CV workers are also now been drafted into filling response gaps in under-resourced communities affected by the COVID-19 pandemic⁶.
- II.4 The CV model relies on two types of staff, trained violence interrupters and outreach workers, as key figures to obtain both individual and community change. Interrupters, identify and mediate potentially lethal conflicts in the community and following up to ensure conflict does not reignite. On the other hand, outreach workers work with individual youth in obtaining the support and social services (e.g. education, job training, employment, drug treatment) they need. Providing alternatives for a life outside crime and strengthening the social safety net for youth is an underlying goal of the CV program⁷.
- II.5 Recent studies have documented the impacts and effectiveness associated with the CV program in: (i) Chicago, an independent three-year evaluation scientifically validated Cure Violence success in reducing shootings and killings by 41% to 73% and demonstrated a 100% success rate in reducing retaliatory killings in five of the eight

² Jamaica’s National Development Plan, Vision 2030; Trinidad and Tobago’s National Crime Prevention Program.

³ Butts, J., Gouvis, C., Bostwick, L., and Porter., J. (2015). Cure Violence: A Public Health Model to Reduce Gun Violence. *The Annual Review of Public Health*. 36:39-53.

⁴ Ransford, C., Kane, C., & Slutkin, G. (2012). Cure Violence: A disease control approach to reduce violence and change behavior. In E. Waltermareer & T. Akers (Eds.), *Epidemiological Criminology: Theory to practice* (pp. 232-242). New York, NY: Routledge.

⁵ Butts et al., (2015).

⁶ Southall, Ashley. May 22, 2020. “Police Face Backlash Over Virus Rules. Enter ‘Violence Interrupters.’” *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/05/22/nyregion/Coronavirus-social-distancing-violence-interrupters.html>

⁷ Butts et al., (2015).

communities examined⁸; (ii) Baltimore (the Safe Streets Program), an independent evaluation found that norms on violence were changed – people in target communities were much less likely to accept the use of a gun to settle a dispute; and four times more likely to show little or no support for gun use⁹; (iii) New York City (Save Our Streets, Brooklyn), an independent study showed that average monthly shooting rates decreased by 6%, while increasing in the three comparison areas between 18% and 28%¹⁰; and (iv) more recently, an evaluation of CV implementation in East New York found that gun injury rates fell by 50% while the comparison area experienced a decline of only 5%. In addition, the evaluation found that in the South Bronx neighborhood, CV contributed to significant reductions of gun injuries (37%) and shooting victimizations (63%)¹¹.

- II.6 In Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago, recent evaluations of local adaptations of the CV model also provide promising evidence that the public health approach to reducing violence can contribute to safer and healthier communities. For example, the Jamaican Peace Management Initiative (PMI) contributed to the reduction of homicides by 96.9% in one of its target communities over the 5-year pilot intervention period and that its cost/benefit ratio was approximately JMD \$12.38 saved per dollar spent on intervention¹². In Trinidad and Tobago, Project REASON (Resolve Enmity, Articulate Solutions, Organize Neighborhoods) reduced violent crime by 38% in treatment communities while comparison communities experienced a 16% increase. The evaluation also found that Project REASON was cost-effective, it costs on average US\$3,500 to US\$4,500 for every violent incident it prevented¹³. However, despite these promising results, more needs to be done in institutional capacity building, specialized training, technical assistance and strategic planning to institutionalize the public health approach to gang and gun violence prevention in Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago.
- II.7 **Complementarity.** This TC will complement existing initiatives aiming at preventing violence in Jamaica and more broadly in Caribbean countries. The IDB has been working in the Citizen Security and Justice sector in Jamaica for almost two decades through the Citizen Security and Justice Programme (CSJP) (1344/OC-JA, 2272/OC-JA, 3191/OC-JA) which focuses on social prevention interventions. More recently the IDB complemented the work done under the CSJP by improving the effectiveness of police to prevent, manage and address crime through the Security Strengthening Project (4400/OC-JA). In Trinidad and Tobago, the IDB recently contributed to reducing crime and violence through the financing of the Citizen Security Programme (CSP) (1965/OC-TT) that addressed violence risk factors in high- crime

⁸ Skogan, W., Hartnett, S., Bump, N., & Dubois, J. (2009). Evaluation of CeaseFire-Chicago. Evanston, IL: Institute for Policy Research, Northwestern University.

⁹ Webster, D., Whitehill, J.M., Vernick, J., & Curriero, F. (2012). Effects of Baltimore's Safe Street Program on Gun Violence: A replication of Chicago's Ceasefire Program. *Journal of Urban Health*, 90 (1): 27-40.

¹⁰ Picard-Fritsche, S., & Cerniglia, L. (2013). Testing a Public Health Approach to Gun Violence. New York: Center for Court Innovation.

¹¹ Delgado, S. A., Alsbahi, L., Wolff, K., Alexander, N., Cobar, P., & Butts, J.A (2017). The Effects of Cure Violence in the South Bronx and East New York, Brooklyn. In *Denormalizing Violence: A Series of Reports from the John Jay College Evaluation of Cure Violence Programs in New York City*. New York, NY: Research and Evaluation Center, John Jay College of Criminal Justice, City University of New York.

¹² Ward, E., McGaw, K., Hutchinson, D. et al. (2018). Assessing the cost-effectiveness of the Peace Management Initiative as an intervention to reduce the homicide rate in a community in Kingston, Jamaica. *Int J Public Health* 63, 987–992.

¹³ Maguire, E., Oakley, M., & Corsaro, N. (2018). Evaluating Cure Violence in Trinidad and Tobago. Inter-American Development Bank. Washington, DC.

communities. The program combined support for community-based action, with assistance to the Trinidad and Tobago Police Service (TTPS), and institutional strengthening of the Ministry of National Security. Initially targeting 22 communities, the program was later expanded to 32 communities. A 2015 independent assessment by the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) corroborated government findings of significant declines in crime and violence in intervention communities after program implementation as compared to national levels.

- II.8 **Objective.** The general objective of this project is twofold. First, it will provide support to the Governments of Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago, respectively, in their efforts to better develop and monitor strategies to reduce violent crime through cutting-edge research as well as management and monitoring tools¹⁴. Secondly, it will improve the Governments' ability to scale up and establish systematic public health frameworks for violence prevention.
- II.9 **Alignment.** The proposed TC is consistent with the updated IDB Institutional Strategy (2020-2023) (AB-3190) and it is aligned with the development challenges of social exclusion and inequality, as well as, with the crosscutting issue of institutional capacity and the rule of law. Additionally, the project will contribute to the Corporate Results Framework (CRF) 2016-2019 (GN-2727-6) output indicators of: (i) Government agencies benefited by projects that strengthen technological and managerial tools to improve public service delivery; and (ii) Subnational governments benefited by citizen security projects. Crime prevention is also one of the main areas of the Strategy for Institutions for Growth and Social Welfare (GN-2587) and citizen security was identified as a priority area that contributes to the objectives of the Bank's ninth capital increase (AB-2764). Moreover, the TC aligns with three of the objectives of the Ordinary Capital Strategic Development Program for Institutions (OC-SDP for Institutions) Fund (GN-2819-1). Specifically, to: (i) contribute to public policies and institutions that are more effective, efficient, open and citizen-centered; (ii) improve service delivery to citizens; and (iii) strengthen enforcement of the rule of law, citizen security, and the fight against corruption. The TC is also aligned with the Citizen Security and Justice Sector Framework Document (GN-2771-7), which calls for strengthening institutional capacity and management capabilities of the criminal justice system as well as improve the quality and coverage of programs to prevent and address violence in a targeted and selective manner, by addressing specific risk factors. Finally, this assistance is in line with the IDB Group Country Strategy with Jamaica 2016-2021 (GN- 2868), which includes crime prevention as a cross-cutting theme and the IDB Group Country Strategy with Trinidad and Tobago 2017-2020 (GN-2888), which includes increasing citizen security as an intervention area under the priority area to foster human development.
- II.10 The proposed TC will address two priority areas for the Bank's COVID-19 pandemic response – (i) social safety net for vulnerable populations; and (ii) economic productivity and employment. By delivering institutional infrastructure to streamline public health solutions to violence prevention via the targeting of poor, male youth actively in conflict with the law, this TC will serve as an important element of the social

¹⁴ As of July 10, 2020, the necessary letter of No Objection has been received from the Government of Trinidad and Tobago, which is attached as an annex to this TC document. The Government of Jamaica has submitted a letter of request, also attached, for one of the components of the TC, while the letter of No Objection is being processed, and expected for approval by the end of July, 2020. The project team understands that no activities can be carried out in Jamaica under this TC until the letter of No Objection from the Government of Jamaica is received.

safety net for this sub-population who are unlikely to have resources available to bolster their resilience to the economic fallout from the pandemic. Moreover, the TC will prioritize diversionary mechanisms for the target beneficiaries that provide skills training, job placement and other support for meaningful participation in the formal economy. In so doing, this TC will achieve meaningful improvements to the economic viability of these youth who are often forgotten, while mitigating the risk they pose to the economic productivity and, more broadly, the quality of life of potential victims and other member of the society who would be affected by social violence.

III. Description of activities/components

- III.1 **Component 1: Institutional strengthening of Jamaica's Ministry of National Security (MNSJ) and consolidation of its youth violence prevention initiatives (US\$140,000).** This component seeks to improve the MNS management tools to support sector planning, monitoring, and accountability, as well as implement public health interventions to prevent and address gang and gun violence. The activities that will be financed through this component are: (i) a citizen security sector delivery unit¹⁵ within MNS to support strategic monitoring of the implementation of the Citizen Security Plan (CSP) and other citizen security priorities; (ii) strengthening the implementation of the Peace Management Initiative (PMI) through technical assistance and training activities provided by Cure Violence Global (CVG); and (iii) the production of a mapping exercise of all violence prevention activities currently underway in Jamaica (whether financed by the Government, NGOs, Private Sector or International Financial Organizations) and those which have been implemented in the past 10 years. The mapping of violence prevention activities will provide a platform for accessing and communicating with youth in conflict with the law who are otherwise unlikely to be included in alternate state databases.
- III.2 **Component 2. Strengthening a multi-sectoral approach to crime prevention in Trinidad and Tobago (US\$140,000).** The objective of this component is to support the Ministry of National Security (MNSTT) in its efforts to incorporate innovative approaches to prevent and control violence based on scientific evidence. By applying a dual public health and law enforcement to respond to gun and gang violence as part of regular practice, this component will finance the following activities: (i) provision of technical assistance and training to the Monitoring and Evaluation Unit within the Ministry of National Security and the Crime and Problem Analysis Branch (CAPA) of the Trinidad and Tobago Police Service, in conducting social network analysis (SNA)¹⁶ to better understand and guide gang violence prevention efforts; (ii) organizational assessment of the CV Unit within MNSTT to ensure the CV model is being implemented with fidelity, and training and technical assistance for violence interrupters, outreach workers, managers and supervisor provided by Cure Violence Global; and (iii) design and implementation of a service referral system through the National Crime Prevention Program (NCCP) of MNSTT for youth involved in gang activity to access health and social services, such as basic needs provision, skills training and job placement. This support will help mitigate negative effects on their standard of living in the aftermath of the global pandemic.

¹⁵ Public-sector management tool for monitoring priority government targets for strategic planning (Dumas, Lafuente & Parrado, 2013).

¹⁶ Social Network Analysis is a methodology used to map the relationships between individuals, including flows of information and goods. It helps visualize social structures for strategic crime intervention and prevention (Sierra-Arevalo & Papachristos, 2017).

- III.3 **Component 3. Knowledge and dissemination (US\$20,000).** The objective of this component is to disseminate new knowledge, increase awareness and facilitate dialogue around evidence-based approaches to prevent gun and gang violence in Caribbean countries. A key theme to be examined will be the effectiveness of public health approaches in reducing social violence within the context of an economic and social recovery. The TC will finance the following activities for each beneficiary country: (i) a policy report summarizing the findings of interventions financed in components 1 and 2; and (ii) a national policy dialogue with government, the private sector, and civil society actors.
- III.4 The total budget of the TC will be US\$300,000, financed with resources from ordinary capital of the Strategic Program for the Development of Institutions (INS).

Indicative Budget

Activity/Component	Description	IDB/Fund Funding	Total Funding
Component 1: Institutional Strengthening of the MNS and support of social violence prevention initiatives in Jamaica	1.1 Sector Delivery Unit, including interagency coordination protocols and control panel	US\$60,000	US\$60,000
	1.2 Specialized training to PMI	US\$40,000	US\$40,000
	1.3 Mapping of violence prevention activities	US\$40,000	US\$40,000
Component 2: Strengthening a multi-sectoral approach to crime prevention in Trinidad and Tobago	2.1 Specialized training on social network analysis	US\$30,000	US\$30,000
	2.2 Technical assistance from Cure Violence Global to CV Unit of MNSTT	US\$90,000	US\$90,000
	2.3 NCCP Referral system for youth at-risk	US\$20,000	US\$20,000
Component 3: Knowledge and dissemination	3.1 Country policy dialogues	US\$10,000	US\$10,000
	3.2 Policy report	US\$10,000	US\$10,000
Total		US\$300,000	US\$300,000

IV. Executing agency and execution structure

- IV.1 There is presently no regional entity with legal capacity to execute capacity building activities for national security in the two member states. Moreover, the organizational assessment activities to be undertaken under this operation would be best executed by an actor external to the beneficiary agency, to ensure objectivity and independence in the results. These two justifications are in keeping with conditions enabling the contracting of consultant services by the Bank as set out in the Bank's GN-2629

Guidelines - Annex 10, Section 2 (d). Accordingly, the operation will be implemented by ICS/CJA and ICS/TT in close coordination with MNSJ and MNSTT, and with administrative support from IFD/ICS in the Bank's headquarters. The TC will be implemented over 24 months. All activities to be executed under this TC have been included in the Procurement Plan (see Annex IV) and will be contracted in accordance with Bank policies as follows: (a) AM-650 for Individual Consultants; (b) GN-2765-4 and Guidelines OP-1155-4 for Consulting Firms for services of an intellectual nature and; (c) GN-2303-28 for logistics and other related services.

IV.2 To carry out several activities related with training and assessments, the Bank will hire Cure Violence Global using a single source selection method. In accordance with the Policy for the Selection and Contracting of Consulting firms for Bank-executed Operational Work (GN-2765-1), this single source selection is justified having met two conditions: (i) the NGO Cure Violence Global would undertake tasks that represent a natural continuation of its previous work supporting CV initiatives in the two countries; and (ii) Cure Violence Global's qualifications with exceptional experience in the public health approach to preventing gun and gang violence, being the creator and owner of the Cure Violence Model and Methodology, which presents a clear advantage over competition. Thus, Cure Violence Global is the appropriate organization to provide the training, advisory and support services required. For additional detail please see Annex II.

V. Major issues

V.1 No major risks are expected in the execution of this TC. The Jamaican and Trinidadian governments have requested support through this regional TC and are giving high priority to its activities. Additionally, the previous pilot interventions of the CV model in both countries speaks to the availability of human resources and institutional protocols that will facilitate greater uptake of the proposed capacity building efforts. Therefore, active participation of technical counterparts is expected in order to complement the work carried out by consultants and the Bank team to complete these activities in a timely manner. Given the relatively novel nature of the interventions, dialogue and stakeholder sensitization will be important tasks at the onset of project implementation.

V.2 The attendant risks for inter-personal interaction in light of COVID-19 will be managed due to the delivery of content from training component using digital platforms, whenever appropriate and, in cases where in-person training is required, limits will be placed on the size of the cohorts of trainees to ensure effective social distancing. Additional safeguards for activities under this operation will be undertaken in accordance with the governing public health protocols being enforced by the respective member state at the time.

VI. Exceptions to Bank policy

VI.1 This operation does not foresee any exceptions to Bank policy.

VII. Environmental and Social Strategy

VII.1 There are no environmental or social risks associated with the activities outlined in this operation; therefore, its environmental classification is "C", according to the Environment and Safeguard Compliance Policy (OP-703). (See [Safeguard Policy Filter Report and Safeguard Screening Form](#)).

Required Annexes:

- Annex I: [Request from the client.](#)
- Annex II: [Results Matrix.](#)
- Annex III: [Terms of Reference.](#)
- Annex IV: [Procurement Plan.](#)