

## Draft TC ABSTRACT

### I. Basic project data

▪ Country/Region:	Regional
▪ TC Name:	Crime and violence in informal settlements in Latin America
▪ TC Number:	RG-T2648
▪ Team Leader/Members:	Laura Jaitman, Team Leader (IFD/ICS); Martín Ardanaz, co-Team Leader (IFMM/CNI); Guerrero, Roberto (IFD/ICS); Alvarado, Nathalie (IFD/ICS); Abizanda, Beatriz (ICS/CCR); Fariña, Andrea (IFD/ICS); Florencia Cabral (IFD/ICS)
▪ Indicate if: Operational Support, Client Support, or Research & Dissemination.	Research and Dissemination
▪ Reference to Request: (IDB docs #)	N/A
▪ Date of TC Abstract:	May 29, 2015
▪ Beneficiary:	Uruguay, Chile, Colombia, Nicaragua, Costa Rica and Honduras
▪ Executing Agency and contact name:	IDB through IFD/ICS. Laura Jaitman, Modernization of the State Specialist (ljaitman@iadb.org)
▪ IDB Funding Requested:	US\$500,000
▪ Local counterpart funding, if any:	N/A
▪ Disbursement period:	12 months
▪ Required start date:	July 2015
▪ Types of consultants (firm or individual consultants):	Firm, individual consultants
▪ Prepared by Unit:	IFD/ICS
▪ Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	IFD/ICS
▪ Included in Country Strategy (y/n);	N/A
▪ TC included in CPD (y/n):	
▪ GCI-9 Sector Priority:	Institutions for Growth and Social Welfare; Citizen Security

### II. Objective and Justification

2.1 Crime and violence is the main concern of the population in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC). The region is the most violent in the world, and crime is concentrated in LAC cities<sup>1</sup> where almost 80% of the population lives. LAC is by far the most urbanized region of the developing world, with urbanization rates comparable to OECD countries. UN-Habitat have estimated that 863 million of people today, mostly in the developing world, live in slums characterized with overcrowding, poor quality housing infrastructure, deficient urban services, and crime and violence. In Latin America and the Caribbean, 24 per cent of the urban population was classified as living in slums in 2012 (UN-Habitat, 2013). The traditional “modernization” theory of slums (Frankenhoff, 1967; Turner, 1969; among others) suggest that slums are an urban anomaly mainly present in fast growing economies, where cities tend to sprawl through large peri-urban areas with informal or illegal patterns of land use, combined with a lack of basic services, and public facilities like security and infrastructure. The mismatch between rapid economic

<sup>1</sup> 43 of the most violent 50 cities in the world are in LAC. There are approximately 130 cities in the region with more than 250,000 inhabitants and homicides rates higher than 25 per 100,000 population (a rate higher than 10 is considered as an epidemic by the WHO).

growth (and so cities) and uncoordinated public policies oriented to absorb the incoming mass of poor immigrants have led to the formation of urban ghettos: ungoverned neighborhood where crime, violence, and illegal activities can be organized under informal laws, with limited presence of the State (Marx, Stoker, and Suri, 2013).

- 2.2 Addressing the problem of urban violence in informal settlements is becoming a major challenge for many governments in the region. Some initiatives focused on land titling programs and other slum upgrading initiatives have intended to provide better living conditions to slum dwellers, especially the access to better housing and urban facilities (see, for example, Duflo, Galiani and Mobarak (2012), Galiani and Schargrodsky (2010), Field (2007), among others). Nonetheless, little is known about the effectiveness of interventions oriented to reduce crime, in part because there is still scant, non-systematic information about crime and violence in slums and the effect of different interventions<sup>2</sup>. The few available data sources are typically not informative about the wide variety of dimensions that characterize the violence and insecurity within informal slums, and in the best of the cases, this is just representative of a small fraction of the slums population<sup>3</sup>. As Marx et al (2013) suggests, methodological problems that hamper field research in slums should be addressed. In particular, efforts to enumerate slum populations and to track panel respondents over several generations of slum dwellers could be stepped up, and empirical methods used to deal with survey attrition in other contexts should be more consistently applied. Moreover, the lack of comparability between the sources does not allow for studying the variation of different types of slums population within administrative units (municipalities, states, countries) or between them.
- 2.3 This TC will build evidence on the crime and violence situation and the rule of law in informal settlements of Latin America. This study responds to the need to generate reliable, comparable, and systematic information on the situation in terms of crime in informal areas where the presence of the State is limited. Given the serious citizen security problems affecting the most vulnerable population in marginalized neighborhoods, it is of great relevance to generate evidence that would allow sub-national governments to design more accurate citizen security policies in this context.
- 2.4 The main aim of this TC is to identify which are the most adequate citizen security policies in the context of the marginal neighborhoods of Latin America. To achieve this goal, the intermediate objectives are to: i) generate evidence on the insecurity problems that affect the marginalized population and about which there is no official information, ii) characterize the relationship between violence and marginal living conditions, iii) understand the rule of law and the informal and formal channels that govern the relationships in these informal settlements.

---

<sup>2</sup> For example, data collected by TECHO for 2010 in a sample of urban slums show that in El Salvador 62% of its households feel unsafe outside the house, in Uruguay 69% and in Mexico 47%.

<sup>3</sup> There have been several valuable projects in slums in the region, many led by the Bank but they were not systematic and had other specific purposes different than the knowledge and policy generation objective of this project.

- 2.5 Gaining a clearer view as to how best reduce insecurity and violence in urban slums is in line with the IDB's strategic goal in the GCI-9 to strengthen *institutions for growth and social welfare*. This TC is related to other work that is carried out on crime in cities, in particular: (i) Violent crime in LAC cities (RG-K1366), (ii) Safer Neighborhoods (RG-T2345), and (iii) Gaps between crime information sources (RG-K1405).

### III. Description of activities and outputs

- 3.1 **Component 1: Research Design, Coordination and Data Analysis.** A research team will be in charge of the design, the monitoring and the analysis of the results of all the data collected in Component 2. This component comprises the beginning and the final technical arrangements to carry out this study.
- 3.2 The research team will develop the survey instruments both for the qualitative and quantitative field work. The research team precise the questionnaires such that they can effectively provide answers to the relevant research questions on the relationship between insecurity and marginality.
- 3.3 The research team will develop a sampling design and strategy to ensure comparability and representativeness of the Metropolitan areas of the selected countries. The sampling will be based on comparable slum census data available in the region. To be able to use comparable slum census, the IDB will do a scientific strategic alliance with TECHO, a leading NGO in the region with more than 15 years of experience working in informal slums in 19 countries in LAC. TECHO is the only organization that can provide a source of cross-country comparable census data about slums (including georeferenced maps), which guarantee that the information to be collected from a sample of slums from these census is statistically comparable, increasing the external validity required for a systematic analysis of the violence and crime in LAC slums. As Cronbach (1982), and Shadish, Cook, and Campbell (2002) suggest, the level of generalizability of any statistical evidence depends on the level of comparability of objective populations targeted, instruments used, and times of implementation. This research design will be unique in complying with these three requirements for six countries in the region<sup>4</sup>. A representative sample of urban slums will be selected within six Latin American countries and their main urban areas. The selected regions are Chile (Metropolitan Region), Colombia (Cundinamarca Department), Costa Rica (San José Province), Honduras (Francisco Morazán Department), Nicaragua (Managua Department), and Uruguay (Montevideo Department). The selection<sup>5</sup> of the countries/regions is driven by the their unplanned urbanization processes with expansion and formation of slums, crime dynamics in

---

<sup>4</sup> The census is available for 5 countries but will be developed for Honduras within this project, so there will be a total of 6 countries included.

<sup>5</sup> Citizen security and/or urban development are a priority area in half of the Country Strategies of this study.

the last decade, but fundamentally due to the census level baseline data availability<sup>6</sup>. The availability or possibility to perform such slum census (which is a pre-requisite of this study) may bias the selection of countries. However, as there is a wide range of crime and violence incidence level represented<sup>7</sup>, we consider that this study will be very useful to inform citizen security policies in slums in other countries of the region. One of the main objectives of this study is to answer key policy questions through a systematic and representative study across the region, which can only be achieved in these countries through the availability of comparable sources of census level information about slums. With this data in hand, the research team will select a random sample of 300 slums in the region (an average of 50 slums per metropolitan area). The sample will be stratified in relevant variables to gain representativeness, such as municipality within the country/region and baseline information on crime and urban services coverage.

- 3.4 **Data analysis.** Quantitative and qualitative analysis of the surveys and interviews will be completed after the execution of Component 2, to reach the three intermediate objectives previously described that will, as a result, lead to a proposal of specific citizen security interventions in these areas.
- 3.5 **Component 2: Data collection.** The fieldwork will be implemented by local survey research firms with proved experience in collecting socio-economic information in vulnerable neighborhoods. The competitively selected firms will carry out the data collection in the 300 slums. It is estimated to carry out approximately 4,200 household surveys in total as well as interviews to community leaders. We will use focus groups and extensive piloting to develop the questionnaire and make sure the questions are phrased in a culturally appropriate manner. The local research firms will be contracted by the IDB and TECHO will coordinate their activities in the field, supervised by the research team of this project.
- 3.6 **Component 3: Dialogue and Dissemination – A Policy Outreach Conference** will be organized to share the findings and their potential policy implications to other countries in the LAC region. The report produced will provide fundamental policy implications on crime in marginalized settlements in middle to high crime areas, and it will be unique in its type as it will be the first one to build cross-country comparable and systematic evidence in the region. This study will propose pilot programs oriented to overcome problems of crime and violence in slums and it will generate baseline data to rigorously evaluate them in the future.<sup>8</sup> It is expected that this study can shed light and inform policies in the context of the Norther Triangle strategy to promote better coexistence, as well as complement the work that the Bank is

---

<sup>6</sup> In Honduras, where no census level data is available, we propose to first collect census level data of slums in Francisco Morazán Department and then survey a representative sample of them.

<sup>7</sup> The inclusion of Honduras is critical in this sense.

<sup>8</sup> In the case of Uruguay it is expected to carry out the designed pilot in the areas of Montevideo where there is ongoing a Citizen Security Program (UR-L1062).

carrying out in other sub-regions. As a wide range of countries are included, with different crime and urban characteristics, many other countries will benefit from the findings and policy implications, and may carry out informal settlement census applying comparable methodologies in the future.

#### IV. Indicative Budget

Activity/Component	Description	IDB/Fund Funding	Counterpart Funding <sup>9</sup>	Total Funding
<b>Component 1:</b> Research Design, Coordination and Data Analysis	Sample and questionnaire design. Data analysis and final report.	80,000	30,000	110,000
<b>Component 2:</b> Data collection	Surveys carried out in 4,200 households, interviews to community leaders and focus groups; slum census in Francisco Morazán (Honduras). Data entry and data quality control	390,000		390,000
<b>Component 3:</b> Dialogue and Dissemination	Regional Policy outreach conference	30,000	5,000	35,000
		500,000	35,000	535,000

#### V. Executing agency and execution structure

- 5.1 The Inter-American Development Bank, Institutional Capacity of the State Unit (ICS) is the proposed executing agency for this TC. IFD/ICS has particular technical expertise in citizen security issues; the IDB can ensure that administrative burdens can be reduced in the participating countries, particularly in the contracting of international experts; and the Bank can ensure that other LAC countries can benefit from the findings of this TC.
- 5.2 The IDB will do a scientific and technical alliance which is limited to the provision of access to Slums Census Data within each of the countries selected, as well as logistic support to get contact with slum local leaders, georeferenced information of the slums, and slum maps. TECHO will also support the work of survey firms competitively hired by the IDB in the field to guarantee that the data collection is homogenous.

#### VI. Project Risks and issues

- 6.1 Risks in this type of studies are the self-selection of slums and the impossibility to collect data in this context. The external validity of the findings is guaranteed by TECHO's availability of census of the universe of slums in each region of interest and the random selection of them. By the same token, the external validity of the results at the region level is given by the fact that TECHO's censuses are comparable across countries, being all of them conducted by the same methodology in terms of definition of slums, questionnaire design, and data collection strategies. Also, although TECHO does not work in all the slums within each country, the

<sup>9</sup> The funding will be provided by TECHO in kind. There will be a person of the NGO coordinating this project and the field work, and the logistics for the regional policy outreach conference will be managed by the NGO. TECHO will provide also the slums census of 5 countries and will provide the methodology to develop the census in Honduras.

implementation of the census allowed them to get contact with the leaders of each slum, which will naturally facilitate the entrance to the slums and the data collection process conducted by private survey firms. Furthermore, in order to avoid site selection bias, the slum sampling strategy involves stratification by whether TECHO works or not in a given slum, the crime rate at municipality level, distance to urban centers, slum size, and other relevant variables. By this, we will guarantee the robustness of this study as the sample frame of slums will be highly representative of the wide variety of slums in each case.

## **VII. Environmental and Social Classification**

- 7.1 According to the Environment and Safeguards Compliance Policy (OP-703), the TC has been classified as category C. No potential negative environmental and/or social impacts of the TC were identified and therefore no mitigation strategy is required to address any impact. See IDBDOCS-#39665354.