

# PROJECT INFORMATION DOCUMENT (PID) CONCEPT STAGE

Report No.: PIDC26161

<b>Project Name</b>	Secondary Education and Skills Development (P151047)
<b>Region</b>	AFRICA
<b>Country</b>	Botswana
<b>Sector(s)</b>	Secondary education (70%), Vocational training (20%), Public administration- Education (10%)
<b>Theme(s)</b>	Education for the knowledge economy (80%), Gender (20%)
<b>Lending Instrument</b>	Investment Project Financing
<b>Project ID</b>	P151047
<b>Borrower(s)</b>	Republic of Botswana
<b>Implementing Agency</b>	Ministry of Education and Skills Development
<b>Environmental Category</b>	B-Partial Assessment
<b>Date PID Prepared/ Updated</b>	21-May-2015
<b>Date PID Approved/ Disclosed</b>	22-Jun-2015
<b>Estimated Date of Appraisal Completion</b>	
<b>Estimated Date of Board Approval</b>	17-Mar-2016
<b>Concept Review Decision</b>	Track II - The review did authorize the preparation to continue

## I. Introduction and Context

### Country Context

Botswana has been one of the fastest growing economies over the past 50 years, moving from being among the poorest to upper middle income status. The national poverty rate has continued to fall steadily in the recent decade from over 31 percent in 2003 to less than 20 percent in 2010. While the country's record is in many perspective impressive and unique, the country face important inter-related challenges to continue improvements in livelihoods. These challenges and the role of education for each are summarized below:

Continue poverty reduction and increase shared prosperity. Many Batswana remain poor. Reducing poverty is strongly linked to reduction of inequality in Botswana. Botswana's inequality ranks among the highest in the world, with a national Gini coefficient of about 60 in per capita consumption. Two-thirds of the poverty reduction in the 2000s is explained by a marginal decrease in inequality. Reduction of poverty and inequality can be achieved through improving social

protection programs, small-holder agricultural productivity, broad-based economic growth, enhanced public services, and more human capital for employment and productivity. In particular, lack of education is strongly associated with poverty incidence. For example, household heads with at most primary education are 50 percent more likely to be poor than household heads with post-primary education. Providing more access to secondary education is therefore critical to poverty reduction and shared prosperity.

**Economic growth and diversification.** The Botswana economy heavily relies on the diamond industry. It accounts for more than 70 percent of GDP but employs only 2.5 percent of the total labor force. As the country's diamond deposits are expected to be exhausted between 2025 and 2030, diversification and human-capital-intensive growth have been central to recent National Development Plans in order to enhance productivity and competitiveness in the global economy. While minerals and coal will remain important for the economy, the 10th National Development Plan identified six sectors for diversification: downstream diamond processing, knowledge and financial services, agriculture (especially livestock and downstream leather products), medical services, transport, and hospitality. This diversification strategy is underpinned by transversal actions to promote a stronger private sector and a smaller, more efficient public sector, as well as policies to expand trade and regional integration, improve the business environment, attract Foreign Direct Investment, ease access to finance, and close skills gaps. Skills gaps can be classified in two broad categories: (i) Inadequate supply of semi-skilled/ skilled workers with relevant vocational skills for occupations in demand. For example, master-level construction workers (plumbers, welders, electricians, etc) for the construction, transport, and mining sector and hospitality workers (tour guides, cooks, waiters, and receptionists etc,) for the hospitality; and (ii) Lack of general work competences and attitudes, amongst students leaving the education system at different levels and entering the labor market. A recent employer survey from 2010 indicates that employers highlight the want of traits such as honesty, commitment and hard work, reliability and punctuality, communication and team work.

Increase employment, especially youth employment. The unemployment rate is high at close to 20 percent, and the "broad" unemployment rate that includes discouraged workers is about 30 percent. Labor market inactivity sharply decreases with the level of education: 41 percent for Botswana with primary education compared to 24 percent and 15 percent for citizens with secondary or tertiary education, respectively. The education effect is even more pronounced for women. However, for the age cohort 20-24 and to a lesser extent the age cohort 25-29, more than one in two youth are inactivity. Further, the employment and wage differences between youth with primary education compared to youth with secondary education (junior and senior) have declined over time; but remain significant. In addition, returns to higher education has increased from an already high level. According to analysis of the employment dynamics in Botswana, the youth inactivity is a combination of the structure of labor demand, the characteristics of labor supply, notably driven by the quality and relevance of education, and rigidities of the labor market. In particular, the report emphasizes the importance of better facilitation of transition from school to work.

While Botswana's policy agenda is multifaceted, it is clear that the education sector could make significant contributions to addressing the country's socio-economic challenges by: (i) providing more equal access to secondary education, in particular senior secondary, which is the key level to obtain a more equal distribution of human capital, and thereby increase share prosperity; (ii) endowing learners with more generic higher order competencies which would also preparing school leavers better for the transition to the labor market; (iii) increase relevance of education and training

to fill specifically demanded occupations in Botswana major economic sectors and thereby promote the diversification of the economy, and (iv) facilitating greater access to tertiary education to raise wages of those workers and strengthen firm competitiveness. Achieving these results would require a more performant education sector.

### **Sectoral and Institutional Context**

The government has been the main provider of Botswana's formal education system and provides near universal access to primary and junior secondary education. Early Childhood Education (ECD) is mostly left to the private and non-governmental sectors and covers only around 14 percent of children in the age-group 3-5. Primary school runs for seven years. There are 812 public and private primary schools (less than 10 percent of schools are private) with a total of 337,206 students. Junior secondary education consist of three years enrolling 121,000 learners, of which 97 percent are enrolled in one of the 204 public junior secondary schools. There 52,000 learners in senior secondary school, which runs for 2 years. 8 percent of learners attend private schools, while the remaining 92 percent of learners attend one of the 35 public senior secondary. The curricula in both junior and senior secondary education are general in nature (also called academic or comprehensive) with no vocational streams. Youth not pursuing either junior or secondary education can attend vocational certificate course at 8 technical colleges or 37 vocational institutions (so-called brigades). In 2014, 10,600 enrolled in these vocational certificate courses. There are 43 tertiary-level institutions, and further an important share of students at the tertiary level attend institutions outside of the country.

Botswana has demonstrated commitment to education through high levels of government expenditures in the sector, but lopsided towards tertiary education. As of 2012, government expenditures on education equaled 9 percent of GDP, ranking among the top countries with available data. Tertiary education accounted for 46 percent of government expenditures on education, followed by the junior secondary level at 23 percent, primary at 20 percent, Senior secondary at 10 percent, and ECD at about 1 percent. Achieving lower public unit costs for tertiary education is critical in order to invest more funding to raise quality and access for other levels, as well as raising access to tertiary education it-self.

In terms of education access and outcomes, Botswana compares well to its African neighbors, but underperforms compared to other upper-middle income countries. In terms of pre-primary education, the GER for ages 3-6 increased to 17 percent in 2013, compared with an average GER of about 25 percent for sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) and 69 percent for upper-middle-income countries. In 2012, there was universal access and completion of primary education in Botswana; 98 percent completes primary education in Botswana compared to 70 percent on average for Sub-Saharan Africa. In Botswana, almost all children proceed to the Junior Secondary level with a gross enrolment rate (GER) of 95 percent in 2012. Six 6 out of ten junior secondary leavers continue on to senior secondary education. The GER remains high, 82 percent in 2012, due to a relatively large share of overage learners. The net enrolment rate for senior secondary education is 65 percent. This level of access compares very favorably with the average GER for secondary education in SSA of 41 percent, and around par with the average of 88 percent for middle income countries (MICs). Only one in four senior secondary graduate transitions to tertiary education. The GER at the tertiary level is estimated to 18 percent in Botswana which compares to 8 percent and 34 percent for SSA and MICs respectively. In terms of learning, Botswana compares poorly on learning achievement, placing in the bottom two of participating upper-middle-income countries and in the bottom ten of all participating countries on both grade 4 and grade 8 assessments in the Trends in International

Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) of 2011 (even though, in Botswana, grade 9 learners were tested).

Secondary school, and senior secondary school in particular, tends to be the key stage for improving labor market relevance and inequities in system. It is either immediately pre or post senior secondary school where most youth make their first career-oriented choices and establish their first direct linkage with the labor market. For a diversified and inclusive economy, it is therefore critical to ensure availability at the secondary level of diverse education and training options, as well as of multiple pathways to obtain employable and increasingly advanced skills. Currently Botswana faces a number of challenges in secondary education, which present important opportunities for reforms, and may be classified into five aspects.

i) Unequal access to senior secondary school: For example, the senior secondary gross enrolment rate in 2009 was 83 percent in cities and towns, 59 percent in urban villages, and only 21 percent in rural villages. Moreover, it was 12 percent in Kgalagadi region but 76 in the South East region. At the same time, classrooms in districts with lower enrolment also appear to be more crowded with students than in the other districts. For example, Kgalagadi has an estimated classroom to learner ratio of 55.2 while it is 43.4 in South East. Therefore, the unequal access to education reinforces rather than alleviates the constraints faced by the disadvantaged. The inequalities could be due to various reasons such as lack of schools and classrooms (insufficient supply) or low demand due to lack of targeted financial support to disadvantaged communities and a small tuition fee, low quality foundation at the primary level, poor access to information about the importance of education, or low aspirations due to poor household and social environment. Initial evidence suggests that lack of seat capacity seems to be a key constraint. If confirmed, an appropriate policy response would be to finance construction of classrooms and ensure availability of teachers and material to increase access to senior secondary education in underserved areas.

ii) Low and declining learning achievement. Botswana students consistently score worse on standardized tests than their peers from countries with similar or even lower income, and have also seen decreasing scores on national tests at the end of secondary school in recent years. For example, the pass rate for students for a double award in science was 14 percent. Passing this exam is a requirement for further studies within the sciences or technology. These poor results are partly due to the expansion of enrolment to a broader set of learners of which a greater share are less academically prepared. Changes to teaching-learning techniques are therefore necessary to safeguard learning levels. Some channels to improve achievement could be better teaching techniques and improved school-based management including accountability, planning and support. Further, more attention should be paid to rural districts, as national test results for these districts tend to be considerably lower.

iii) Poor preparation for the labor market. There are important gaps between the quality and type of competences taught in school and those demanded in the labor market. While unemployment rates are high, many firms are reported to desire basic and general skills such as literacy, numeracy, communication, and behavioral skills more than job-specific skills. Although, there are on-going improvements, the secondary education curricula, teaching and examination system still emphasize knowledge and hence rote memorization over generic competences such as learning to learn, and problem-solving, including application of basic scientific and math knowledge. Further, ICT competences are insufficient. Further, the curricula and learning aims were designed for graduates to continue to higher education, but with the growth of access, three out of

four graduates go directly to the labor market. Focus groups have revealed that some elements of the secondary school systems have introduced a broader focus on learning of competences and skills, notably curricula goals, however, most system elements, including examinations, in service-training, and teaching-learning techniques seem concentrated on academic knowledge.

iv) An outdated and unconnected vocational stream of secondary education. The current TVET option for both primary and junior secondary leavers remain certificate courses offered by the Brigades and Vocational Centers. The vocational certificates carry little value for employers seemingly due to lack of acquiring of relevant practical skills; some older tracers studies from 2006-2008 document an employment rate of around 50 percent. According to the draft Sector plan, the TVET options is quite separate from the formal (general) education system, and the certificate does not either help to qualify for entry into senior secondary or tertiary education. Enrolment is therefore small around 10,000, and decline in share of learners, and utilization rates of available seats of only 60 percent. This compares to a global average of 40 percent in vocational secondary education. The way forward would be to introduce a new stream of vocational secondary education with academic contents that prepares the young learner for a specific occupation/sector with relevant practical skills, and at the same time qualify the learner for transition to tertiary professional education. This new stream should use existing infrastructure and teacher resources.

v) High levels but inefficient use of investment in education and training: The poor learning achievement and poor labor market outcomes are in spite of large government expenditures as mentioned above, and relatively adequate inputs such as teachers and textbooks. Scholarships account for a large share of expenditures without much consideration of the merit or needs of the student. Many students from well-off households receive subsidies at the expense of many from disadvantaged households. There does not exist an assessment system that regularly measures and analyzes performance of students, teachers and schools to inform allocation of resources. Little importance is put on accountability and governance at different administration levels, as well as at the school and teacher levels. Allocation of resources is centralized, and schools lack the authority to manage allocated resources in accordance with the specific needs of their schools. School boards have been closed, leading to lack of local accountability.

The draft Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan candidly identify the above challenges and seek to address the shortcomings. In particular, the plan identifies the need for increased learning, especially developing higher order skills in math, science, and communication and languages with a specific focus on increased cooperative learning and creativity. Other priorities include providing increased equitable access to secondary education, improved leadership and management, as well as improvements to information through e-learning.

### **Relationship to CAS**

The proposed project is well aligned with the Country Partnership Framework (CPF) objectives and supports its implementation. “Strengthening Physical and Human Assets” is one of the three strategic pillars of the new CPF in order to improve quality and equity of education as a focus area for eliminating extreme poverty and promoting shared prosperity (Objective 2.3). The CPF builds upon the Bank’s Systematic Country Diagnostic (SCD) which was informed by detailed separate Bank reports on poverty, employment, as well as on skills and education in Botswana. Under this CPF, the Bank would provide financial and technical support to the country through interventions in the areas of improving relevance of education, developing teachers/trainers qualification, upgrading school infrastructure, and increasing efficiency of education resources management.

The proposed project also supports the GoB's on-going program (NDP 10) which calls for strengthening education system to help improve the country's economy and employment. In addition, it supports the GoB's new Education and Training Sector Strategic plan (ETSSP) which sets up 10 strategic priorities including improving quality, relevance, equitable access, learning outcome, M&E and accountability as well as strengthening skills development.

## **II. Proposed Development Objective(s)**

### **Proposed Development Objective(s) (From PCN)**

To improve equitable access and relevance of senior secondary education.

#### **Key Results (From PCN)**

- Improved equitable access to senior secondary education
- Establishment of a professional training stream at the senior secondary education level with pathways to tertiary professional education and training
- Realigned curricula, assessment and teaching/learning in senior secondary schools for better results
- Improved teaching support to accommodate different learners brought about by the expansion of senior secondary education and improve their learning outcome
- Increased capacity and accountability of managing the education system with multiple pathways at the senior secondary and post-secondary levels

#### **C. Proposed PDO Indicators**

The team considers the following PDO indicators which would be modified during preparation:

1. Increase intake into senior secondary schools in Y underserved districts by X thousand – measuring improved equitable access
2. Transition rate from junior secondary to senior secondary education (current 62%), including enrollment in the professional training stream – measuring increased access
3. Average class size at the senior secondary education level (current 47) – measuring reduced overcrowding of classrooms
4. Percentage of senior secondary school leavers from the professional training stream either employed or enrolled in polytechnics 6 months after graduation (current 41% of TVET graduates unemployed) – measuring relevance of the new professional education stream
5. Learners enrolled in the new professional education stream of senior secondary school ending with a qualification that is accepted for admission into tertiary professional education – measuring the successful establishment of the new professional education stream in senior secondary education.

## **III. Preliminary Description**

### **Concept Description**

The proposed project supports the priorities and the sub-sector programs outlined in Botswana's new Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan (ETSSP). Its expected results would be achieved through activities grouped into three components:

Component 1: Expanding general senior secondary education in underserved areas and improve relevance (US\$25 million)

Component 1.1: Expanding senior secondary education in underserved areas. The objective of this subcomponent is to address classroom shortage and overcrowding due to the increased demand for senior secondary education, especially in underserved areas such as the central, central-west and north regions. The envisaged activities would include:

- Identify the underserved areas using geo-mapping with school census data and demographic change forecasts;
- Identify any underutilized existing education and training facilities in the identified underserved areas with an inventory assessment (as part of the infrastructure needs assessment described in the below Component 2.2); and
- Optimize the existing facilities and construct new classroom in existing schools or establish new schools as needed to broaden the provision of senior secondary education in the underserved areas.

Component 1.1: Improve teaching and learning to improve relevance. The objective of this subcomponent is to improve relevance of general competencies of senior secondary school graduates from the general stream in terms of both cognitive and non-cognitive skills required by the labor market and learning capability required by the tertiary education admission. The envisaged activities would include:

- Support the government's efforts in aligning curricula, assessment, and teaching to produce better learning outcomes. This would include a consideration of a reduction in the number of subjects offered to increase efficiency in the use of teacher resources.
- Train and upgrade teachers' pedagogy to serve diverse learning needs of students from disadvantaged backgrounds; and
- Pilot a competency-based teaching and learning approach to ensure relevance;

Component 2: Establish labor market relevant professional education stream for senior secondary education (US\$20 million)

Component 2.1: Develop labor market relevant learning goals and curricula to introduce a professional education stream in secondary education. The objective of this subcomponent is to provide opportunities for young people to develop marketable skills for immediate employment after finishing school and qualify them academically and technically for pursuing further studies in professional tertiary education. By working with the private sector and tertiary institutions/agencies, the envisaged activities would include:

- Identify trades which should be the focus of the new vocational stream with labor market studies;
- Develop competency-based learning goals and curricula. Coordinating with the national qualification authority and tertiary education providers, the new qualification should be an acceptable admission criteria for professional tertiary education;
- Upgrade teachers/trainers' knowledge and practical skills to make the new vocational stream relevant to the labor market;
- Institutionalize an internship program, including development of an appropriate financing mechanism, to help students gain practical skills for enhancing their employability; and
- Launch a public campaign to raise the awareness of and change the biased/negative perception of the society and parents towards TVET.

Component 2.2: Upgrade existing infrastructure for introducing the new vocational stream. The

objective of this subcomponent is to ensure appropriate classrooms, labs and workshops in senior secondary schools for implementing the new vocational stream. The envisaged activities would include:

- Identify needed necessary upgrading of the current infrastructure in either the Brigades, Technical colleges, and/or the existing senior secondary schools for the new stream through a needs assessment; and
- Refurbish the identified labs and workshops to ensure their capacity for delivering teaching and learning under the new stream.

Component 3: Strengthening the capacity and accountability of managing and sustaining the system expansion at the senior secondary and post-secondary levels (US\$5 million)

The objective of this component is to ensure that the fundamental changes to the system brought about by the proposed project could be implemented successfully and sustained for future development. The envisaged activities would include:

- Develop and strengthen school leadership, including school boards, on school-based management for managing their schools better;
- Build M&E capacity at all levels to develop a data-driven, evidence-based, and results-oriented decision-making culture for education improvement;
- Conduct a public expenditure review in education to ensure value for money and efficiency of senior secondary education and support the implementation of the recommendations; and
- Support the implementation of the proposed project.

It is proposed that Component 1 and 2 will be results-based financing, while disbursement for Component 3 for technical assistance will be cost-based. The proposed operation would be financed through the Investment Project Financing (IPF) instrument. Disbursements for component 1 and 2 would be made against selected key education budget line items referred to as Eligible Expenditure Programs (EEPs), such as teacher salaries and class room construction. Disbursements will be based on the achievement of pre-specified results, referred to as disbursement-linked indicators (DLIs). These indicators would be determined in partnership with the Ministry of Education and measure the expected outcomes of Component 1 and 2, such as new curricula for a professional stream in secondary education, students admitted, new classroom meeting agreed standards, school boards established and trained etc. The project also includes a small technical assistance (TA) component which finances capacity building and TA activities.

#### IV. Safeguard Policies that might apply

Safeguard Policies Triggered by the Project	Yes	No	TBD
Environmental Assessment OP/BP 4.01	x		
Natural Habitats OP/BP 4.04		x	
Forests OP/BP 4.36		x	
Pest Management OP 4.09		x	
Physical Cultural Resources OP/BP 4.11			x
Indigenous Peoples OP/BP 4.10			x
Involuntary Resettlement OP/BP 4.12			x
Safety of Dams OP/BP 4.37		x	



Projects on International Waterways OP/BP 7.50		x	
Projects in Disputed Areas OP/BP 7.60		x	

## V. Financing (in USD Million)

Total Project Cost:	50.00	Total Bank Financing:	50.00
Financing Gap:	0.00		
<b>Financing Source</b>			<b>Amount</b>
Borrower			0.00
International Bank for Reconstruction and Development			50.00
Total			50.00

## VI. Contact point

### World Bank

Contact: Andreas Blom  
 Title: Lead Economist  
 Tel: 458-7351  
 Email: ablom@worldbank.org

Contact: Xiaonan Cao  
 Title: Senior Education Specialist  
 Tel: 473-8917  
 Email: xcao@worldbank.org

### Borrower/Client/Recipient

Name: Republic of Botswana  
 Contact: Solomon Sekwakwa  
 Title: Permanent Secretary  
 Tel:  
 Email: ssekwakwa@gov.bw

### Implementing Agencies

Name: Ministry of Education and Skills Development  
 Contact: Richard Matlhare  
 Title: Permanent Secretary  
 Tel: 267-3935341  
 Email: rmatlhare@gov.bw

## VII. For more information contact:

The InfoShop  
 The World Bank  
 1818 H Street, NW  
 Washington, D.C. 20433  
 Telephone: (202) 458-4500  
 Fax: (202) 522-1500  
 Web: <http://www.worldbank.org/infoshop>