BELIZE

SKILLS FOR THE FUTURE
(BL-L1044)

PROJECT PROFILE

This document was prepared by the project team consisting of: Emma Ingrid Näslund-Hadley (SCL/EDU), team leader; Usher Orchel, Alexis Bryant, Emma Findlater (CID/CBL); Ivana Blasco, Emilio Gutierrez, Alejandra Forero, Marie Evane Tamagnan, Maria Fernanda Patino, Maria Luisa Zeta, Greta Olivares, Belen Michel (SCL/EDU); Hugo Us Alvarez (SCL/GDI); Brodrick Raylando Watson, Christian Lunstedt (VPC/FMP); Esteban de Dobrzynski, Alvaro Luis Sanmartin (LEG/SGO).

Under the Access to Information Policy, this document is subject to Public Disclosure.

PROJECT PROFILE

BELIZE

I. BASIC DATA

Project Name: Skills for the Future

Project Number: BL-L1044

Project Team: Emma Ingrid Näslund-Hadley (SCL/EDU), team leader; Usher

Orchel, Alexis Bryant, Emma Findlater (CID/CBL); Ivana Blasco, Emilio Gutierrez, Alejandra Forero, Marie Evane Tamagnan, Maria Fernanda Patino, Maria Luisa Zeta, Greta Olivares, Belen Michel (SCL/EDU); Hugo Us Alvarez (SCL/GDI); Brodrick Raylando Watson, Christian Lunstedt (VPC/FMP); Esteban de

Dobrzynski, Alvaro Luis Sanmartin (LEG/SGO).

Borrower: Belize

Safeguards:

Executing Agency: Ministry of Education, Culture, Science and Technology

Financial Plan: IDB (fund): US\$ 15.000.000

 GPE (tentative amount)
 US\$ 5,000.000¹

 Local:
 US\$ 150.000

 Total:
 US\$ 20,150.000

Policies triggered: ESPS 1; ESPS 2; ESPS 3; ESPS 4;

ESPS 9; ESPS 10.

Classification: C

II. GENERAL JUSTIFICATION AND OBJECTIVES

- 2.1 Aware of the value of skill development, Belize has invested heavily in education, making access at the primary level almost universal and investing in teacher training. Although education reforms take time to translate into achievement gains, some improvements were recorded prior to the COVID-19 pandemic, reducing the skill gap in foundational skills.² Between the 2017/18 and 2018/19 academic years, the proportion of 8th grade (standard 6) students who obtained a competent score in English language improved from 17.7% to 21.6%. In mathematics, over the same period the proportion of 8th grade students with a competent score increased from 23.2% to 25.1% (Näslund-Hadley, Alonzo, Villanueva, Gideon & Flowers, 2023).
- 2.2 Despite substantive efforts made by the Government of Belize to provide distance learning, COVID-19 related school closures led to a decrease in the rate of learning compared to that of previous years. In line with international trends, large losses were recorded in foundational skills. The average mathematics score among

A tentative GPE grant in the amount of approximately US\$5 million may be approved. The final grant amount is subject to further approval by the Board of the GPE, upon the presentation of further project plans. For more information, refer to Par. 5.1 below.

The skills gap in foundational skills is defined as the percentage of students who score below competent in the foundation skills of mathematics, reading and science.

5th graders dropped by 36% between the 2018/19 and 2021/22 school years. In the 8th grade (standard 6), the average mathematics score dropped by 41%. In English language, during the same period, the average test score decreased by 26% among 5th graders and 15% among 8th graders (Näslund-Hadley, Alonzo, Villanueva, Gideon & Flowers, 2023). Pre-pandemic anecdotal evidence already suggested gaps exist between students with learning disabilities³ and their peers. These gaps have likely widened as a result of the pandemic, although data is unavailable.

- 2.3 The foundational skill gap contributes to low retention rates. Belize already struggled with some of the region's lowest access rates pre-pandemic at the primary and secondary levels.⁴ In line with international trends, during the COVID-19 pandemic, student average repetition and dropout rates increased at the secondary level. Grade repetition increased from 6.2% to 10.4% between the 2018/19 and 2020/21 school years among 8th graders. In the same period, the dropout rate increased from 4.9% to 6.1% among 5th graders (Näslund-Hadley, Alonzo, Villanueva, Gideon & Flowers, 2023).
- 2.4 In addition to the gap in foundational skill development, Belize's youth is not equipped with the competencies demanded by the labor market. An IDB-financed employability gap analysis in Belize concludes that Belize's ability to innovate is predicated on the readiness of a large pool of talented individuals with expertise in Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) subjects. The study calls for training not only in STEM, but in Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts and Mathematics (STEAM). According to the study, the abilities that are in highest demand by employers in Belize are those needed to face the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4iR)⁵: STEAM skills, teamwork, social skills, communication, responsibility,⁶ and digital abilities.⁷ These are skills needed in the Information & Communication Technology (ICT) industry; one of the industries with the highest expected growth,⁸ where firms lack digital competencies for middle skill jobs in fields such as software, web development, and database networking (Näslund-Hadley, Navarro & Prada, 2019).

Although no data on disability is available, based on other countries that have applied the <u>Washington Group questions on Disability</u> in their censuses, the prevalence of disability for children ages 6-17 is expected to range between 4-8% (Berlinski et al., 2021).

⁵ The 4iR is characterized by a range of new technologies that are needed to fuse "the physical, digital and biological worlds, impacting all disciplines, economies and industries" (World Economic Forum, 2022).

⁷ In the survey, digital competency was defined as the confident and critical use of electronic media for work, leisure, and communication.

⁴ Gross school enrollment in Belize is 85.1% at the primary level and 61.6% at secondary, compared to the regional average of 106.7% and 94.3%, respectively (CIMA, 2018). Net school enrollment in Belize is 76.8% at the primary level and 49.6% at secondary, compared to the regional average of 94.5% and 74.5%, respectively (CIMA, 2018).

Employers were asked to choose from a list the three most relevant soft skills needed for employees to be successful in their jobs. The complete list mentioned the following 10 skills: (i) social skills (i.e., interpersonal skills, people skills, politeness); (ii) higher-order skills (problem solving, analytical skills, decision-making); (iii) self-control (self-discipline, patience, ability to tolerate frustration); (iv) positive self-concept (self-esteem, self-belief, pride in their work); (v) communication (speaking, writing, expressiveness); (vi) hardworking and dependable (work ethic, diligence reliability); (vii) self-motivation (passion, desire to learn, self-direction); (viii) teamwork (compromise, collaboration); (ix) positive attitude (enthusiastic, enjoying the work they do); and (x) responsibility (i.e., accountability, ownership of the role).

According to the World Development Indicators (WDI) data, ICT services account for 12% of the country's service and it has significantly increased in the last three years from 4.3% in 2019 (WDI, 2022).

- 2.5 While a spectrum of causes contributes to these skill gaps, preliminary findings from a new IDB survey suggest that there are three main determinants of the gaps in foundational and XXI skills (Gupta & Kebaish, 2023). First, research indicates that teacher quality is the main determinant for student learning and skill development (see Kane et al. 2013; Hanushek 2011; Rivkin et al. 2005; Rockoff 2004). In the face of vast foundational skill learning gaps in the pandemic era, the training of teachers in accelerated learning methodologies has become the principal recommended instructional approach. Accelerated learning is not teaching the same curriculum at a faster speed, but rather allows students to learn grade-level content with just-in-time support. The approach focuses on preparing students for the mastery of upcoming grade-level content and skill development. Rather than seeking to cover the entire spectrum of lost content, accelerated learning provides targeted support on specific foundational skills and concepts, which is aligned with current grade-level instruction.9 Currently, no teacher in Belize has been trained in accelerated learning methodologies (Gupta & Kebaish. 2023).
- 2.6 To support the integration of students with learning disabilities, teachers also need training in the use of Individualized Education Programs (IEP) (Browder et al., 2005). However, in Belize initial training prior to entering the teaching profession does not provide preparation in special education. As a result, teachers lack the competencies to manage classrooms that range from high achieving students to those with special education needs. A recent survey of teacher training needs reveals that close to 60% of teachers demand training in instruction of students with special education needs (MoECST, 2022).
- 2.7 Second, there is a mismatch between the skills demanded by employers (¶2.4) and those provided by the education system. While Belize's employers are preparing for the 4iR, and demanding XXI century skills, few secondary and Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) institutions report these skills among their learning objectives. Even at the tertiary level, the few institutions that offer digital competency programs are not adequate to prepare students for middle skill jobs.¹0 Employers also demand STEAM professionals with education and training above a high school diploma but below a bachelor's degree known as 'middle skill jobs.' Currently, the country does not have the capacity to respond to the increasing demand for skilled workers in STEAM-related industries, such as digital transformation, neither in terms of quantity, nor quality (Näslund-Hadley, Navarro & Prada, 2019; Gupta & Kebaish, 2023).
- 2.8 Third, the education system does not sufficiently address specific needs of female students to close the gender gaps. There is no systematic approach to foster gender sensitive instruction (MoECST, 2021). Belizean girls have lower levels of achievement and participation in STEM than their male peers. In Mathematics and Science, gender learning gaps appear to develop over time as gaps are small and significant only in some academic years on the Primary School Examination (PSE). By the time students reach the secondary level of education, the gap is

Sometimes acceleration means going slower. For example, a 7th grade algebra unit may take 30 instead of 20 lessons to allow for just-in-time support and scaffolding for the development of essential skills needed to reach the grade-level learning goals.

Only the University of Belize (UB), the University of West Indies (UWI) and Galen University offer bachelor's degree programs in digital areas.

_

pronounced with boys outscoring girls on the Caribbean Secondary Education Certificate (CSEC) examination by 14.2% and 12.5% in mathematics and science, respectively. Consistent with international trends, Belizean girls also experience higher rates of anxiety around mathematics than their male peers and have lower self-efficacy in mathematics (Näslund-Hadley & Alonzo, 2019). Initial findings from an IDB survey shows that 4% of girls sense that they belong in the exact science fields, compared with 37% of boys (Näslund-Hadley et al., 2023). By the time students reach the tertiary level, fewer women chose to pursue careers in exact sciences. Women represent only 34% of students in exact science fields while they represent almost 60% of students in other fields, making women an untapped resource for economic growth, especially given the demand for 4iR skills (Näslund-Hadley, Navarro & Prada, 2019).

2.9 In response to these challenges, the Government of Belize and the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) have worked together to design and implement Education Quality Improvement Program (EQIP) I and EQIP II. In 2014, the Government of Belize and the IDB designed EQIP I which set out to change what happens in Belize's primary education in science, mathematics, and language arts classrooms (BL-L1018; 3186/OC-BL), rolling out an Inquiry- and Problem-based Pedagogy (IPP) learning approach. IPP creates active problem-solving opportunities in settings that derive meaning to the child. Students learn by collaboratively solving real-life authentic problems, developing explanations, and communicating ideas. Teachers who benefitted from EQIP professional development improved their own knowledge of mathematics, science, and language. The proportion of EQIP teachers who scored an overall grade of B or higher on the Primary School Examination is 7% higher than among teachers who have not been trained. In 2019, the Government of Belize and the IDB set out to foster innovation in STEAM education from the primary through the secondary level through the expansion of the IPP learning approach to the remaining 50% of primary schools that had not yet benefitted from EQIP I, and bring the focus on science and mathematics to the secondary level, including the TVET system, by creating a STEAM Laboratory School 12 (BL-L1030). The vision of the STEAM Laboratory school is to graduate "young people prepared with knowledge, skills, and integrated experiences in science, technology, engineering, arts, and mathematics to build a sustainable future for themselves and their communities." To achieve this ambition The Government of Belize and the IDB have partnered with the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) in the design of a new, forward-looking approach to high school education that prioritizes real-world experiences, community connections, and hands-on, creative learning. The school is located in Belize City and will open its doors to students in 2023. In response to pandemic related school-closures, EQIP II was modified in 2020 to facilitate access to digital devices and train teachers in hybrid IPP education strategies. Through grant funding, EQIP II also provides support to migrant students, including

-

Exact sciences are those whose laws are capable of precise quantitative expression (e.g., physics, chemistry, or astronomy).

A laboratory school is a school that is operated in association with a learning institution – such as a university or teacher training institute – with the purpose of training teachers or experimenting in educational practices that promote innovation. Laboratory schools provide high-quality education for students, while at the same time testing innovative pedagogical approaches and modeling teaching practices for teachers in training, as well as in-service teachers from other schools who visit the laboratory school.

- teacher training in the support of migrant students including immersion English and multiculturalism, and access to eLearning devices (BL-J0002).
- 2.10 Based on the positive results of EQIP I and II, and to respond to the demand of the labor market for 4iR skills, the Government of Belize now wishes to employ a three-pronged approach to expand the pedagogical model of the Belize City STEAM Laboratory school to additional schools and to respond to additional education challenges that emerged during the pandemic. First, work to close the gaps in access and learning that widened during the pandemic. Second, promote STEAM skills nationwide by expanding the reach of the Belize City STEAM laboratory school to other districts. Third, promoting the participation of women in 4iR careers.
- 2.11 Alignment. The program is consistent with the Second Update to the Institutional Strategy (UIS) 2020-2023 (AB-3190-2) and is strategically aligned with the development challenges of Social Inclusion and Equality by targeting vulnerable regions and expanding students' access to quality basic education. The program is aligned with the cross-cutting issues of: (i) gender equality by promoting actions to close the gender gaps in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics; (ii) climate change and environmental sustainability by including climate change in the curriculum redesign; and (iii) institutional capacity and rule of law by improving the Ministry of Education, Culture, Science and Technology's (MoECST) capabilities to equip Belize's youth with the skills required for a successful transition to the labor market. The program will contribute to the Corporate Results Framework (GN-2727-12) by measuring the number of students benefited by education projects. The operation is consistent with the Sector Framework Document for Skills Development (GN-3012-3) by ensuring access to high-quality and relevant learning opportunities throughout life, the IDB Group Climate Change Action Plan 2021-2025 (GN-2848-9), the Climate Change Sector Framework Document (GN-2835-8) by developing educational materials on the blue and green economy and promoting the inclusion of mitigation and adaptation measures for low carbon and resilient schools. It is also aligned with Gender and Diversity Sector Framework Document (GN-2800-10) and with the Employment Action Framework with a Gender Perspective (GN-3057) as it develops digital skills as means to improve educational and labor market outcomes and improves the economic opportunities of women starting at the secondary level, and includes teacher training in the use of IEP to foster the inclusion of students with disabilities. It is aligned with the current IDB Group Country Strategy with Belize 2022-2025 (GN-3086), which prioritizes the building of skills for the post-COVID-19 economy. The proposed operation is also aligned with the national Education Sector Plan 2021-25, which seeks to close learning gaps that widened during the COVID-19 pandemic and foster digital and STEAM skills.
- 2.12 **Objective.** The development objective is to contribute to the closing of the skills gap to prepare tomorrow's workforce for the 4iR. To respond to the above three skill-gap determinants, the specific objectives of the proposed operation are to: (i) increase access to instruction that accelerates learning in foundational skills; (ii) increase access to instruction that promotes learning in 4iR skills; and (iii) increase access to gender-specific education services to promote inclusive education.

- 2.13 Component I Increase Access to Instruction that Accelerates Learning in Foundational Skills (approximately US\$3 million in Ioan and GPE resources). The component aims to contribute to increase access to instruction that accelerates learning in foundational skills at the primary level. To achieve this objective, the operation will finance: (i) coaching of teachers to provide guidance and modeling of quality pedagogical practice in the implementation of accelerated learning to close achievement gaps. The accelerated learning will be delivered to students as part of in-class instruction as well as through after school programs with tutoring; (ii) training of teachers in IEP for children with special education needs; and, (iii) strengthening of the modules of the Belize Education Management Information System (BEMIS) to enhance the capacity to plan based on student and education institution data. New fields of data will include special education needs and home language of students.
- 2.14 Component II – Increase access to instruction that promotes learning in 4iR Skills (approximately US\$13 million loan resources). The component aims to increase access to instruction that promotes learning in 4iR skills by expanding learning environments similar to those of the Belize City STEAM Laboratory School to districts throughout the country. The skills that will be promoted under the 4iR umbrella will include STEAM skills and XXI Century skills. To achieve this objective, the operation will finance: (i) the construction of science labs, maker labs, and workshops at existing secondary schools to increase the focus on STEAM skills; 15 (ii) digital skill development at the primary level, including teacher professional development and potentially the acquisition of digital devices; (iii) 4iR skill development at the secondary level through teacher professional development in the curriculum and pedagogical approach of the Belize City STEAM Laboratory School; (iv) virtual labs for schools with limited physical laboratories; (v) access to international digital skill certification; and (vi) investment in existing TVET institutions to align course offerings with 4iR labor market demands, including infrastructure investments at the Belize City Institute for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (ITVET).
- 2.15 Component III Increase access to gender-specific education services to promote inclusive education (approximately US\$3 million GPE Grant). The component aims to increase access to gender-specific education services to promote inclusive education. To achieve this objective, the operation will finance; (i) the development of a program for primary and secondary level students to promote women's participation in the 4iR fields demanded by Belizean employers, including extracurricular activities, teacher professional development and information outreach that will provide girls with the confidence, tools, knowledge, and support to enter and flourish in the world of coding and STEAM.

¹³ An IEP is a plan to ensure that a child who has a disability identified under the law and is attending an elementary or secondary educational institution receives specialized instruction and related services.

¹⁴ The BEMIS was developed with resources form EQIP I (BL-L1018; 3186/OC-BL) with the purpose to collect, analyze, report and plan based on data related to the management of educational activities.

The design will be guided by sustainability, green principles and innovation, including: climate resilience and green building architecture (incorporation of adaptation, mitigation measures and green building features), safety (hurricane resistance when applicable), low maintenance requirement, universal accessibility, design innovation, among others.

- 2.16 Component IV Project Management and Evaluation (Approximately US\$1.1 Million loan and counterpart resources). The aim of the component is to support project execution and evaluation. This component covers expenses related to the Project Executing Unit (PEU), financial audits, and monitoring and evaluation. It will also finance a vehicle, some office equipment and software to facilitate project execution and monitoring. The impact evaluation will critically examine the program by collecting and analyzing information about activities, characteristics, and outcomes. The operation will finance sampling design, data collection and analysis.
- 2.17 **Beneficiaries.** The program will be nationwide in scope, including investments at the primary (Components I and III) and secondary and TVET (Components II and III) levels. The targeting of school within Components I and III will be defined during project preparation. Component I will tentatively be rolled out nationwide in three phases, allowing low performing students from all publicly financed primary schools to participate. Under Component II, tentatively one high school per district will be equipped with STEAM laboratories similar to those in the STEAM Laboratory school in Belize City. ¹⁶ In Component III, teacher professional development will target all secondary schools. Extracurricular activities will be offered in every district and available to girls with an interest in attending.

III. TECHNICAL ISSUES AND SECTOR KNOWLEDGE

- 3.1 The proposed instrument is an Investment Loan for Specific Project (ESP). This instrument is considered to be appropriate due to its fixed scope, logical interdependence of the components, and its physical and technical individuality. The executing agency is the MoECST through the PEU that has successfully executed EQIP I (BL-L1018) and is currently executing EQIP II (BL-L1030).
- 3.2 The Program is the result of extensive sector work, including: (i) an analysis of learning and access to education in the wake of pandemic-related school closures (Näslund-Hadley, Alonzo, Villanueva, Gideon & Flowers, 2023); (ii) a randomized control trial of all primary education schools in the country, showing that the EQIP I inquiry- and problem-based approach increases student learning (Bando, Näslund-Hadley & Gertler, 2018); (iii) a nationwide assessment of primary education teachers, showing that EQIP teachers improved their subject knowledge content and skills and decreased their mathematics anxiety compared to control group teachers: (iv) a qualitative video study of classroom practices, which showed a more student-centered instruction approach in EQIP schools than in comparison schools; (v) a process evaluation that positively reviewed the implementation of EQIP I; and, (vi) an employability study highlighting the need for STEAM technicians in the economy (Näslund-Hadley, Navarro & Prada, 2019). This sector work led to the decision to expand EQIP horizontally to the primary education schools that had not yet benefitted; and vertically to the secondary and technical education level by establishing a STEAM laboratory school. In addition to the already undertaken sector work, the following technical work will be

1

¹⁶ The criteria to identify the schools will include a student population of at least 300 students, that the school be a publicly funded institution, and that it has a central location in each district to allow nearby schools to access the infrastructure.

conducted during project preparation and initial implementation, financed through transactional and TC resources: (i) an analysis of 4iR skills in Belize; (ii) an analysis of gender and STEAM in Belize; (iii) an ex-ante economic analysis of the Skills for the Future program; (iv) development of a Program Operation Manual; (v) design of the impact evaluation, including sample design; and (vi) an update of the institutional and risk analysis using the Platform for Analysis of Institutional Capacity (PACI) previously conducted of the MoECST.

IV. ENVIRONMENTAL SAFEGUARDS AND FIDUCIARY SCREENING

- 4.1 In accordance with the Environmental and Social Policy Framework (ESPF), the operation was classified as Category "C" as it is expected to cause minimal or no negative environmental or social impacts.
- 4.2 Two medium-high risks were identified: (i) the government salary scale is below market rates, which could decrease the ability of the PEU to attract experienced individuals; and (ii) procurement processes could be delayed if the PEU does not have the necessary qualified human resources that know IDB's procurement policies during the entire execution of the project, leading to delays in the execution of the project. In case of difficulties in contracting PEU staff, including a procurement officer, a mitigation measure is to use international expertise on an as-needed basis. In addition, the IDB will continue to provide training of government employees on the Bank's procurement policies. This worked well for the procurement officer position in EQIP II, ensuring continuation during the search for local staff for the unit.

V. OTHER ISSUES

5.1 In 2022, the IDB became a grant agent of the Global Partnership for Education (GPE) (GN-3097), a fiduciary fund administered by the World Bank, which for nearly two decades has supported solutions to build strong and resilient education systems. Within the context of the proposed operation, the Government of Belize has requested the assistance of the IDB in applying for the GPE multiplier grant. 17 In response to the request, the IDB team has worked with the MoECST and GPE teams in the development of an Expression of Interest for the multiplier grant, approved by the GPE on November 30th, 2022. On March 29th, 2023, the IDB will submit a formal application for the multiplier grant in the amount of US\$5 million to the GPE. The final grant amount is subject to further approval by the GPE, upon the presentation of further project plans. If approved, this individual investment grant (BL-G1008) will be processed as part of the POD package of BL-L1044. The IDB will be the grant agent of this additional financing. The exact amount of the grant will be determined jointly with the GPE team during project preparation.

_

The GPE Multiplier is a grant that enables countries to mobilize additional resources to strengthen their education systems and get more children in school and learning. Eligible countries access the GPE Multiplier by mobilizing at least US\$3 in new and additional external financing for every US\$1 from the Multiplier.

5.2 A local counterpart contribution of US\$0.15 million is foreseen. The counterpart contribution will be in kind through salaries of staff in the PEU.

VI. RESOURCES AND TIMETABLE

6.1 The POD distribution is scheduled for March 2023. The Draft Loan Proposal (DLP) is expected to be submitted to the OPC on April 5th, 2023. The Loan Proposal's presentation Board of **Directors** is planned to the for May 19th, 2023. The administrative budget for preparation is estimated at US\$22,500 for missions and US\$55,000 for consulting services, and US\$50,000 financed through technical cooperation resources (Annex V). The operation is planned to be executed over five years.

CONFIDENTIAL

The information contained in this Annex is confidential and will not be disclosed. This is in accordance with the "Deliberative Information" exception referred to in paragraph 4.1 (g) of the Access to Information Policy (GN-1831-28) at the Inter-American Development Bank.





Operation Information

Operation Name	
Skills for the Future	
Operation Number	BL-L1044

Operation Details

Organizational Unit	IDB Sector/Subsector		
SCL/EDU	TEACHER EDUCATION & EFFECTIVENESS		
Type of Operation & Modality	Original IDB Amount		
LON / ESP	\$15,000,000.00		
Executing Agency	Borrower		
BL-MOEYS	BELIZE		
ESG Primary Team Member	Team Leader		
	Emma Ingrid Naslund-Hadley		
Toolkit Completion Date	Author		
22/11/2022 Jessica Eileen Arango Laws (Esg Guidance Service)			
Applicable ESPSs with requirements			
ESPS 1; ESPS 2; ESPS 3; ESPS 4; ESPS 9; ESPS 10			

Operation E&S Classification Summary

Environmental and Social Impact Categorization (ESIC)		С
Disaster and Climate Change Risk Classification (DCCRC)		Moderate
Environmental and Social Risk Rating (ESRR)	Moderate	

Summary of Impacts / Risks and Potential Solutions

The project has no environmental and social impacts and/or risks therefore no Environmental and Social Assessment (ESA) or Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) process will be conducted for the project during preparation.

There are no contextual risks associated with the project (e.g. political instability, oppression of communities, armed forces in the project area).



The operation will not have direct impacts associated with child labor or forced labor in the workforce.

The operation will not have significant indirect and/or cumulative impacts associated with child labor or forced labor in the workforce.

The Executing Agency or other relevant entity (in relation to the operation) has a proven track record to respect and protect the fundamental principles and rights of workers (including fair treatment, commitment to non-discrimination, equal opportunity, protection of workers including workers in vulnerable situations, work accommodations, migrant workers' rights, collective bargaining and rights of association) and compliance with national employment and labor laws.

The operation will not result in the direct loss of employment (i.e. retrenchment).

The operation will not result in the indirect and/or cumulative loss of employment (i.e. retrenchment).

The Borrower will prepare and operate a Grievance Redress Mechanism for all workers (direct and contracted).

The operation will not cause indirect and/or cumulative impacts associated with accidents, injury, and disease arising from, associated with, or occurring in the course of work.

The operation will promote a sustainable use of resources including energy, water and raw materials.

The operation will not have direct adverse impacts on human health and the environment due to pollution from project activities.

The operation will not generate direct impacts generated by solid waste (hazardous and/or non-hazardous).

The operation will not have direct negative impacts to the environment and human health and safety due to the production, procurement, use, and disposal of hazardous materials such as PCBs, Radiological Waste, Mercury, CFCs, etc.

The operation will not have indirect and/or cumulative negative impacts to the environment and human health and safety due to the production, procurement, use, and disposal of hazardous materials such as PCBs, Radiological Waste, Mercury, CFCs, etc.

The operation will not have direct negative impacts to the environment and human health and safety due to the production, procurement, use, and disposal of pesticides.

The operation will not have indirect and/or cumulative negative impacts to the environment and human health and safety due to the production, procurement, use, and disposal of pesticides.

The operation is not expected to or currently produce directly GHG emissions.

The operation is not expected to or currently produce indirectly-cumulatively GHG emissions.

The operation is not considering alternatives to implement technically and financially feasible and cost-effective options to avoid or minimize project-related GHG emissions during the design and operation of the project.

The operation has no exposure to climate transition risks related with a loss of value of a project driven by



the transition to a lower-carbon economy, result from extensive policy, legal, technology, and/or market changes to address climate change.

There are no direct health and safety risks associated with the design of structural elements or components of the operation (e.g. existing or new buildings, earthworks, bridges, drainage, roadways, power stations, transmission and distribution poles, underground utilities, and dams), and/or road transport activities (e.g. transport of heavy or over-sized equipment) which could result in health and safety impacts to third parties and project-affected people.

There are no indirect and/or cumulative health and safety risks associated with the design of structural elements or components of the operation (e.g. existing or new buildings, earthworks, bridges, drainage, roadways, power stations, transmission and distribution poles, underground utilities, and dams), and/or road transport activities (e.g. transport of heavy or over-sized equipment) which could result in health and safety impacts to third parties and project-affected people.

The project will not directly affect the public (including workers and their families) by exposing them to hazardous materials released by the project, particularly those that may be life threatening.

The project will not indirectly-cumulatively affect the public (including workers and their families) by exposing them to hazardous materials released by the project, particularly those that may be life threatening.

There is no potential for the project or project-related activities (e.g. the influx of temporary or permanent project labor, among others) to directly result in or exacerbate community exposure to water-related (i.e., water-borne, water-based, and vector-borne diseases) and/or communicable diseases (e.g. COVID).

There is no potential for the project or project-related activities (e.g. the influx of temporary or permanent project labor, among others) to indirectly-cumulatively result in or exacerbate community exposure to water-related (i.e., waterborne, water-based, and vector-borne diseases) and/or communicable diseases (e.g. COVID).

The project's direct impacts on priority ecosystem services will not result in adverse health and safety risks and impacts to the project-affected people.

The project's indirect and/or cumulative impacts on priority ecosystem services will not result in adverse health and safety risks and impacts to the project-affected people.

There is no potential for an emergency or unanticipated event to occur in the project area of influence that demands immediate action to prevent or reduce harm to people, property, and/or the environment.

There is no potential direct impacts to workers and project-affected people related to the use or arrangement of security services to safeguard personnel and/or property.

There is no potential indirect and/or cumulative impacts to workers and project-affected people related to the use or arrangement of security services to safeguard personnel and/or property.

The project will not lead to direct impacts related to physical, and/or economic displacement - Impacts include, and are not limited to, relocation; expropriation; loss of shelter; loss of land; loss of assets; restrictions on land and natural resources; loss of income; loss of livelihoods; loss of social safety net.

The project will not lead to indirect and/or cumulative impacts related to physical, and/or economic displacement - Impacts include, and are not limited to, relocation; expropriation; loss of shelter; loss of land; loss of assets; restrictions on land and natural resources; loss of income; loss of livelihoods; loss of social



safety net.

Vulnerable people will not be disproportionately affected by direct impacts related to land acquisition - people may be considered vulnerable by virtue of disability, state of health, indigenous status, gender identity, sexual orientation, religion, race, color, ethnicity, age, language, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth, economic disadvantage, or social condition. Other vulnerable people include the elderly, children, single-headed households, refugees, internally displaced persons, natural resource dependent communities.

Vulnerable people will not be disproportionately affected by indirect and/or cumulative impacts related to land acquisition - people may be considered vulnerable by virtue of disability, state of health, indigenous status, gender identity, sexual orientation, religion, race, color, ethnicity, age, language, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth, economic disadvantage, or social condition. Other vulnerable people include the elderly, children, single-headed households, refugees, internally displaced persons, natural resource dependent communities.

The operation doesn't have the potential to directly impact modified habitat that include significant biodiversity value.

The operation doesn't have the potential, including through the supply chain, to indirectly-cumulatively impact modified habitat that include significant biodiversity value.

The operation doesn't have the potential to directly convert or degrade natural habitat.

The operation doesn't have the potential, including through the supply chain, to indirectly-cumulatively convert or degrade natural habitat.

The operation doesn't have the direct potential to implement project activities in critical natural habitat.

The operation doesn't have the indirect and/or cumulative potential, including through the supply chain, to implement project activities in critical natural habitat.

The operation is not expected to directly impact a legally protected area or an internationally recognized area.

The operation is not expected, including through the supply chain, to indirectly-cumulatively impact a legally protected area or an internationally recognized area.

The project will not directly introduce (intentionally or accidentally) alien, or non-native, species of flora and fauna that have the potential for invasive behavior in areas where they are not normally found.

The project will not indirectly-cumulatively, including through the supply chain, introduce (intentionally or accidentally) alien, or non-native, species of flora and fauna that have the potential for invasive behavior in areas where they are not normally found.

The project is not likely to adversely directly impact ecosystem services.

The project is not likely to adversely indirectly-cumulatively, including through the supply chain, impact ecosystem services.

The project is not expected to cause adverse direct impact on Indigenous Peoples. FPIC is required when there will be (i) impacts on lands and natural resources subject to traditional ownership or under customary use; (ii) Relocation of Indigenous Peoples from lands and natural resources subject to traditional



ownership or under customary use; or (iii) significant impact on Cultural Heritage.

The project is not expected to cause adverse indirect/cumulative impact on Indigenous Peoples.

Indigenous Peoples are not expected to be adversely impacted by direct project related land-acquisition or access restrictions. Note that all impacts on lands and natural resources subject to traditional ownership or under customary law requires FPIC.

Indigenous Peoples are not expected to be adversely impacted by indirect/cumulative project related land-acquisition or access restrictions. Note that all impacts on lands and natural resources subject to traditional ownership or under customary law requires FPIC.

The project doesn't have the potential to cause adverse direct impacts on Indigenous Peoples who live in isolation and initial contact.

The project doesn't have the potential to cause adverse indirect and/or cumulative impacts on Indigenous Peoples who live in isolation and initial contact.

The project is not expected to directly damage or negatively impact cultural heritage.

The project is not expected to indirectly-cumulatively damage or negatively impact cultural heritage.

The project is not expected to directly damage or negatively impact critical cultural heritage.

The project is not expected to indirectly-cumulatively damage or negatively impact critical cultural heritage.

The project will not negatively directly affect people due to their gender, sexual orientation or gender identity.

The project will not negatively indirectly-cumulatively affect people due to their gender, sexual orientation or gender identity.

The project is not expected to lead to direct risks and impacts associated with Sexual and Gender-based Violence.

The project is not expected to lead to indirect and/or cumulative risks and impacts associated with Sexual and Gender-based Violence.

The project will not potentially face direct barriers to equitable gender-based participation.

The project will not potentially face indirect and/or cumulative barriers to equitable gender-based participation.

The project will not deal with a subject matter and/or be implemented in an area where the manipulation, interference, coercion, discrimination, and intimidation of stakeholders has been documented.

ESPS 1 - Assessment and Management of Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts

The Executing Agency will prepare and maintain an Environmental and Social Management System (ESMS) for the operation as defined under ESPS 1.

The Borrower/Executing Agency's has moderate organizational capacity and competency for managing



environmental and social issues.

ESPS 2 - Labor and Working Conditions

The Executing Agency will prepare and maintain an Environmental and Social Management System (ESMS) for the operation with specific elements related to Labor and Working Conditions under ESPS 2.

The operation has the potential to cause minor direct impacts associated with accidents, injury, and disease arising from, associated with, or occurring in the course of work.

ESPS 3 - Resource Efficiency and Pollution Prevention

The operation will have minor indirect and/or cumulative adverse impacts on human health and the environment due to pollution from project activities.

The operation will generate minor indirect and/or cumulative impacts generated by solid waste (hazardous and/or non-hazardous).

ESPS 4 - Community Health, Safety, and Security

Natural hazards, such as earthquakes, droughts, landslides, floods, wildfires, or others, including those caused or exacerbated by climate change, are likely to occur in the project area, and these may moderately impact the project, and/or the project may moderately exacerbate the risk from natural hazards to human life, property, and/or the environment.

ESPS 10 - Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure

The Borrower will prepare a stakeholder engagement framework/plan for the lifetime of the program (including the equal participation of women and men and also take into account Indigenous Peoples, vulnerable groups when relevant).

The Borrower will engage in meaningful consultations and engagement with stakeholders which is free of manipulation, interference, coercion, discrimination, and intimidation.

The Borrower will operate a Grievance Redress Mechanism at the Project level (direct and contracted).



ESRR Report

Operation Information

Operation			
BL-L1044 Skills for the Future			
Environmental and Social Impact Category	ESRR		
С	Moderate		
Country	Executing Agency		
Belize	BL-MOEYS		
Organizational Unit	IDB Sector/Subsector		
SCL/EDU	TEACHER EDUCATION & EFFECTIVENESS		
Team Leader	ESG Primary Team Member		
EMMA INGRID NASLUND-HADLEY			
Type of Operation	Original IDB Amount	% Disbursed	
LON	\$15,000,000.00		
Assessment Date	Author		
2022-11-22	Jessica Eileen Arango Laws (from Toolkit)		
Operation Cycle Stage	Completion Date		
ERM	2022-09-14		
QRR	2022-12-07		
Board Approval	2023-01-25		
Current Last Disbursement Expiration	No Date		
Safeguard Performance Rating			
Rationale			

ESRR Report Page 1 of 2



ESRR Report

Risk Assessment

Cause	Value
Largely related to direct impacts of project footprint, and inherent sector risk including contribution to cumulative risks	Moderate

Comments: The operation has the potential to cause minor direct impacts associated with accidents, injury, and disease arising from, associated with, or occurring in the course of work.

Contribution	Value
Largely related to indirect and induced impacts, third party actions, associated facilities, supply chain aspects, and indirect contribution to cumulative impacts	Moderate

Comments: The operation will have minor indirect and/or cumulative adverse impacts on human health and the environment due to pollution from project activities. The operation will generate minor indirect and/or cumulative impacts generated by solid waste (hazardous and/or non-hazardous).

Context	Value
Largely related to influence and impacts from external operating environment on project setting, including legal framework and practice, vulnerability risk, political and social conflict, cultural context, legacy issues, etc	Moderate

Comments: Natural hazards, such as earthquakes, droughts, landslides, floods, wildfires, or others, including those caused or exacerbated by climate change, are likely to occur in the project area, and these may moderately impact the project, and/or the project may moderately exacerbate the risk from natural hazards to human life, property, and/or the environment.

Performance	Value
Directly related to borrower capacity and organizations, commitments, resources and overall performance during project	Moderate

Comments: The Borrower/Executing Agency's has moderate organizational capacity and competency for managing environmental and social issues.

Please indicate the overall ESRR of the project according to your professional Moderate	Overall Environmental and Social Risk Rating	Value
judgement at this point in time		Moderate

Comments: Due to risk factors cause, contribution, context and performance the overall rating is moderate

ESRR Report Page 2 of 2

INDEX FOR COMPLETED AND PROPOSED SECTOR WORK

Topic	Description	Estimated Dates	References and Electronic Links
Country Priorities	Belize National Education Sector Plan 2021-2025	Completed	<u>Link</u>
	Education Sector Assessment- Naslund-Hadley, Emma, Haydee Alonzo, Neulin Villanueva, Ricardo Gideon & Yvonne Flowers. The Effects of the COVID-19 Pandemic on Education Outcomes in Belize.	Completed. To be published in 2023	<u>Link</u>
	Institutional Assessment of the MoECST	In Process	
Education Sector Diagnostic	Naslund-Hadley, Emma, Alison Elias, Eduardo Café & Haydee Alonzo. Schools at a Crossroad: Integration of Migrant Students in Belize. IDB TN 02045.	Completed	Link
	Naslund-Hadley, Emma, Patricia Navarro-Palau & Maria Fernanda Prada. Skills to Shape the Future: Employability in Belize. IDB TN 01837.	Completed	<u>Link</u>
	Naslund-Hadley, Emma, Rosangela Bando & Paul Gertler. Inquiry and Problem Based Pedagogy: Evidence from 10 Field Experiments. IDB Working Paper Series 958.	Completed	<u>Link</u>

Topic	Description	Estimated Dates	References and Electronic Links
		Completed. To be	
	Belize STEAM Laboratory School Brochure	published in 2023	<u>Link</u>
		In Process.	
	Belize Gender Gap in STEM Analysis	Estimated completion	n/a
		date: January 2023	
		In Process. Estimated	
	4iR Skill Development	completion date:	n/a
		January 2023	
		Pending. Estimated	
Project Design	Operation Manual and Terms of Reference	completion date:	n/a
		January 2023	
		Pending. Estimated	
Economic Analysis	Cost benefit analysis of the proposed investments	completion date:	n/a
		January 2023	

CONFIDENTIAL

The information contained in this Annex is confidential and will not be disclosed. This is in accordance with the "Deliberative Information" exception referred to in paragraph 4.1 (g) of the Access to Information Policy (GN-1831-28) at the Inter-American Development Bank.