Combined Project Information Documents / Integrated Safeguards Datasheet (PID/ISDS)

Appraisal Stage | Date Prepared/Updated: 10-Oct-2018 | Report No: PIDISDSA24643

BASIC INFORMATION

A. Basic Project Data

Country	Project ID	Project Name	Parent Project ID (if any)
Cote d'Ivoire	P160642	Cote d'Ivoire Higher Education Development Support Project	
Region	Estimated Appraisal Date	Estimated Board Date	Practice Area (Lead)
AFRICA	15-Oct-2018	29-Nov-2018	Education
Financing Instrument	Borrower(s)	Implementing Agency	
Investment Project Financing	Republic of Côte d'Ivoire	Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research	

Proposed Development Objective(s)

The PDO has three goals: (a) improve higher education management; (b) increase enrollment in professional programs; (b) improve the quality and labor market relevance of degree programs in participating public tertiary institutions.

Components

Component 1: Strengthening Tertiary Education Management
Component 2: Enhancing short cycle professional programs
Component 3: Improving quality and relevance of education in public universities and INPHB

PROJECT FINANCING DATA (US$, Millions)

SUMMARY

Total Project Cost	100.00
Total Financing	100.00
of which IBRD/IDA	100.00
Financing Gap	0.00

DETAILS

World Bank Group Financing

International Development Association (IDA)	100.00
IDA Credit	100.00

Environmental Assessment Category

B-Partial Assessment

Decision

The review did authorize the team to appraise and negotiate

Other Decision (as needed)

B. Introduction and Context

Country Context

1. **After a decade of sociopolitical instability (2002–11) marked by low economic growth,**[1] Côte d'Ivoire, located in West Africa, is now making economic gains—growth reached 9.2 percent in 2015 and is expected to decrease only to 7.2 percent in 2018 and 2019. However, the poverty rate is still high: in 2015 46.3 percent of Ivoirians were living below the national poverty line. The population of Côte d'Ivoire in 2017 was an estimated 24,295,000. GDP per capita (US$1,495 in 2016) is close to the average (US$1,636) for Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA).

2. **Since the sociopolitical crisis ended in 2011, there has been significant improvement in the business environment and in private sector development, heightening the country's competitiveness.** Côte d'Ivoire moved up from 168th in the 2010 World Bank Doing Business ranking to 142nd in 2016. In addition to a more attractive business environment, it has also improved its infrastructure. The 2016 Global Competitiveness Report ranked Côte d'Ivoire among the top reformers in 2015, when it moved from 115th (already up from 129th in 2011) to 99th; it is now the eighth most competitive economy in Africa. Côte d'Ivoire is among the SSA countries with the most favorable environment for the private sector.

3. **Despite its recent macroeconomic achievements, human development and other social outcomes are still worse than those of most countries with comparable per capita income.** In the 2015 United Nations Development Program (UNDP) Human Development Index, Côte d'Ivoire was ranked 171st of 187 countries. Average years of schooling are 7.68, compared to a regional average of 8.2. Its under-5 mortality rate is 92.6 deaths per 1,000 births, against SSA's 83.2 and the lower-middle-income average of 52.8. Life expectancy at birth is 51.2 years in Côte d'Ivoire but averages 58.1 in SSA and 67 in lower-middle-income countries.

Sectoral and Institutional Context

4. **The performance of education in Côte d'Ivoire is close to the SSA average.** Due to rapid demographic growth, and despite government efforts to push up primary and secondary enrollment, Côte d'Ivoire is still

---

[1] Between 2000 and 2010 r al gross domestic product (GDP) grew 1.1 percent a year, compared to 5 percent in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA).

far from universal primary education. In 2017, at 77 percent for primary and 54 percent for lower-secondary education, the completion rates are slightly higher than the 2015 SSA averages of 73 percent and 49 percent. Gender disparities persist: in 2017 in terms of enrollment the parity index (girls to boys) was 0.98 in primary, 0.87 in lower secondary and 0.81 in upper secondary. According to the 2015 Living Standard Survey, completion of primary schooling varies widely by region and is as disparate as two to seventy-four percent.

Table 1: Indicators on Education in Côte d'Ivoire in 2017 (in percentage)

	Net Enrollment Rate			Completion Rate[2]		
Level of education	Total	Girls	Boys	Total	Girls	Boys
Primary	91	90	92	77	75	80
Lower Secondary	42	39	45	54	49	59
Upper Secondary	16	15	18	27	24	30

5.   **From 2002 through 2011 the delivery of education was drastically reduced by the armed conflict resulting from the political crisis in Cote d'Ivoire.[3]** Tertiary education had immense losses. The three public universities (Felix Houphoüet Boigny University (UFHB), Nangui Abrogoua University (UNA), and Alassane Ouattara University (UAO)), the two public *Grandes Ecoles (Ecole Normale Supérieur (ENS) and Institut National Polytechnique Houphouët Boigny (INPHB))* and the two regional tertiary education centers (in Daloa and Korhogo) lost their equipment, and most academic and social infrastructure was damaged. To address the deteriorated conditions in these institutions, the government adopted a comprehensive reconstruction plan and in April 2011 closed all of them for rehabilitation and re-equipping. They reopened in September 2012 for the 2012–13 academic year.

6.   **In the past 10 years Ivoirian tertiary education has grown significantly, although participation as a proportion of the population remains low.** Tertiary enrollment rose from 146,490 in 2005 to 192,842 in 2016 which is an average annual growth of 2.5 percent, and in absolute terms, there is an increased demand for tertiary education as the result of average population growth of 2.5 percent for the last decade. However, this remarkable increase in tertiary participation in Côte d'Ivoire still represents just 774 enrollments per 100,000 inhabitants, compared with the low-middle-income average of about 3,500.

7.   **The low tertiary participation rate has roots in low enrollment in secondary education (see table 1 above) and the low transition to tertiary education:** only about 45 percent of students completing upper-

---

[2] The completion rate is the ratio of new students in the final grade divided by the total number of children of the group age (11 years for primary, 15 years for lower secondary and 18 years for upper secondary)

[3] In 2002, a mutiny-turned-rebellion led to open armed conflict that split the country in two. The 2007 Ouagadougou Political Agreement between crisis stakeholders eased the political tensions and paved the way for elections in 2010. The refusal of some groups to recognize the elections led to a violent five-month post-election crisis that lasted into 2011.

secondary pass the national end-secondary exam *Baccalauréat* and enroll in tertiary institutions. Enrollments in secondary education are still low because of low access rates due to lack of schools, the pass rate for the national end-primary exam *Certificat d'Etudes Primaires Elementaires (CEPE)* is about 80 percent while the gross intake rate in lower secondary is about 66 percent,the pass rate for the national end-lower secondary exam *Brevet d'étude du premier cycle (Bepc)* is about 60 percent while the gross intake rate is about 35 percent in upper secondary education. To address the increasing secondary education demand, the government has been investing in the construction of new rural lower secondary schools *(Collèges de proximité), on average 30 new schools per year*. In the 2016–25 Education Sector Plan (ESP 2016–025), published in April 2017, enrollments are expected to increase for all levels of education with a projected annual increase of 2 percent for tertiary education.

8.   **To cope with the increasing demand for tertiary education and the potentially larger flow of students completing secondary schooling, the Government has put in place a system where private tertiary institutions play an important role in filling the gap in access to higher education.** Tertiary education in Côte d'Ivoire incorporates four types of institutions: public universities, public elite professional schools (after the French *Grandes Écoles* model), private universities, and private institutions (Table 2). By law the government must ensure that all students who passed the *Baccalauréat* exam have an opportunity to enroll in a tertiary institution. The government has therefore established an orientation system where students with higher scores on the *Baccalaureat* and in the last grade of secondary school are directed to public universities for undergraduate degrees, and the rest are directed to subsidized private *Grandes Ecoles* to enroll in two-year programs for the national Higher Technician Certificate (BTS: *Brevet de Technicien Supérieur*). Students can also apply for (a) the competition for admission to public Grandes Ecoles or (b) pay for courses in private universities. Due to limited capacity in the public institutions, the government has been directing on average 75 percent of new students to subsidized private tertiary education institutions.

Table 2. Structure of the Tertiary Education System, 2015–16

Types of Institutions	Number	Enrollment	Share of Total Enrollment
Public Universities (*)	5	73,020	37.9%
Public Grandes Écoles	44	24,826	12.9%
Private Universities	28	9,323	4.8%
Private Grandes Écoles[4]	211	85,673	44.4%

---

[4] The *Private Grandes Ecoles* are post-secondary institutions delivering a two-year technical education program to prepare students for the national exam for the Higher Technician Certificate (BTS: *Brevet de Technicien Supérieur*). Some also award advanced degrees (Master or Doctorate). There are no conditions or standards that private institutions must meet to use the designation *"Grande Ecole."*

Total	288	192,842	100.0%

Source: MESRS.

Note: (*) Since the rehabilitation in 2011 the two regional tertiary education centers (in Daloa and Korhogo) have been upgraded to universities.

Issues in Higher Education

9. **Tertiary education has in part recovered from the political and economic turmoil of recent years but is now confronted by other critical challenges.** The first is limited access and lack of equal opportunities given the expected trebling of the number of high school graduates by 2030, due to high population growth (about 2.5 percent in 2016) and the likely improvement of the pass rate at the *Baccalauréat* exam (44.9 percent in 2017). The second arises from the poor quality and lack of relevance of many programs, particularly the BTS programs, delivered primarily by private institutions, and the difficulties universities must face in implementing the License-Master-Doctorate system as stipulated in the Bologna Process. The third is the need for favorable governance sector-wide, a sustainable financing strategy and improved management.

10. **Until now, the government has centralized coordination and development of the tertiary system;** both budgets and staffing were centrally managed. Tertiary institutions were not allowed to undertake initiatives to address their most pressing needs or introduce innovations to improve program quality and relevance. The Government carried out a participative process to revise the law relevant to higher education, to define and establish the autonomy of public tertiary institutions. The government is now in the process of adopting the revised law.

Access and Equity

11. **Tertiary education participation in Côte d'Ivoire is not only still low but there are significant disparities by gender and income**. The number of enrollments per 100,000 inhabitants dropped from 808 to 774 between 2005 and 2016 and the gross tertiary enrollment rate decreased similarly, from 9.3 to 8.3 percent. In SSA, Côte d'Ivoire's education statistics are about average (about 700 to 900), but they are below the middle-income country average (about 3,500 tertiary enrollments per 100,000 inhabitants). In addition to low participation, the gender and income inequalities seen among primary and secondary students are exacerbated at the tertiary level. At 10.1 percent, male enrollment is significantly higher than female, which is only 6.7 percent. The proportion of girls ranges from 33 percent in public universities to 51.4 percent in private universities. As for income-based disparities, data from 2015 illustrates a tertiary enrollment rate of just 7 percent for the poorest students, compared to 41 percent from the richest quintile. Between 2008 and 2015, tertiary enrollment rose by 2.4 percent for the former group and 2.3 percent for the latter, which meant virtually no change in the access gap. An estimated 60 percent of the students come from the highest income quintile.

12. **To improve access and equity in tertiary education the government is focusing on (a) expanding secondary education in underserved areas, and (2) building new universities in other regions.** To increase secondary enrollment, with partners *Agence Française de Développement (AFD)* and the Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC) the government has begun to add secondary schools (*Collèges de proximité*) in rural areas. This strategy is based on the fact that, in order to increase access to tertiary education, increasing

enrollment in secondary education is crucial with measures to ensure better students retention..Today, tertiary education is highly concentrated geographically: 218 of the 288 tertiary institutions are in Abidjan, with far fewer options for students in other regions. The government has launched an ambitious plan to expand the two new universities, Daloa and Khorogo, and construct new universities in Man, San Pedro, and Bondoukou by 2020 with foreseen financial support from other international partners.

Quality and Relevance

13. **Despite government efforts to recover from the impact of the political crisis, conditions for improving the learning environment are still not in place**. Most public universities still have a truncated academic calendar and many faculties and departments have yet to return to the regular academic year (from October to June). Aligning the school calendar for all universities and departments with the official academic year is a pre-requisite for such major reforms as part of the transition to the LMD system. This would require investing in labs and financing operational costs for the delivery of practical courses. The digital infrastructure remains inadequate and many institutions have no access to broadband. This undermines the quality of teaching and learning and prevents universities from ramping up research activities.

14. **Both the quality and relevance of tertiary education are of major concern.** Data on efficiency, quality and relevance are fragmented and lacking, but what data do exist paint a dismal picture. Because the academic year is still truncated for many faculties, many three-year undergraduate programs last five to six years. Based on available data, in public universities about 40 percent of students have been in the system for more than 10 years. For private institutions, one quality measure is the low: the pass rate for the *BTS* exam about 25 percent.

15. **The high proportion of qualified academics suggests that quality in tertiary education could be improved by enhancing pedagogical practices and revising the content of most programs**. While finding academically qualified faculty does not appear to be a problem—97 percent of lecturers in public universities and 77 percent in private have a PhD or a master's degree —program content and pedagogical practices need to be modernized and the student: lecturer ratio need to be adjusted. Traditional lectures and rote memorization still tend to be the norm. This leaves little room for developing inquisitive minds, critical thinking, and the analytical competencies needed in today's global economy. In addition, since many courses emphasize theory rather than real-life application, many graduates finish their studies with few professional and job-relevant skills.

16. **The share of domestic resources devoted to higher education is higher than average in SSA**. Côte d'Ivoire allocates about 20 percent of its domestic resources to education, which amounts to 5 percent of GDP. Allocation to secondary and tertiary education is relatively high with 57 percent of the education budget, although they represent only 33 percent of total enrolments. In particular tertiary education benefits about 25 percent of the education budget with only 4 percent of total enrolment. In SSA countries, the share of education budget to tertiary education averages 19 percent. Therefore, primary education with 43 percent of the education budget in Côte d' Ivoire is comparatively low and moreover in a country where Universal Primary Objective is yet to be achieved. Capital spending in higher education has risen slightly in recent years to address reconstruction after the political troubles. From 2008 to 2010 it grew from 6 to 8 percent of the higher education budget, and from 2012 to 2015 from 10 to 28 percent.

17. **Research is central to the quality of tertiary education, but the scientific production of Ivoirian universities is low and of poor quality**. The country has no more than 400 scientific articles published in international journals every year, which puts Côte d'Ivoire among the least productive African nations per capita. With 8 million fewer people, Senegal produces twice the number of scientific articles. It is also worrisome to observe that the gap between Côte d'Ivoire and its comparators has widened in recent years in the area of research. A new measure of progress in scientific production, developed by a team working for the journal *Nature*, shows that Côte d'Ivoire is absent from the African scientific map.[5] From a regional perspective, no Ivoirian research institution has the capacity to produce high-quality research in quantity. In addition to 15 research institutions in South Africa, the *Naure* list includes 4 from Morocco, 2 from Tunisia, and 1 each from Algeria, Burkina Faso, Kenya, and Senegal.

18. **Tertiary graduates, particularly those who hold a BTS, are also having considerable difficulty finding jobs**. There are several signs of a mismatch between what they learn in tertiary education and what the economy needs. In 2013, for example, 19 percent of graduates aged 25–34 were unemployed, and of those who were employed, only 25 percent had a professional job. The high proportion of unemployed master's degree holders is also of concern. It takes new graduates an average of two years to get their first job. Employers question the relevance of many tertiary programs, especially BTS programs—there is a higher percentage of BTS holders among unemployed graduates, even though in most countries, graduates of shorter professional programs like the BTS find it easier to get a job than job-seekers with a general bachelor's degree. However, it is important to mention that Ivoirian technicians trained by the *Institut National Polytechnique Houphouët-Boigny* (INPHB) are highly regarded.

Table 3. Training and Jobs Mismatch, 2014, Percent

Degree Categories	Students	Unemployed Graduates
Brevet de Technicien Supérieur (BTS), Diplôme de Technicien Supérieur (DTS), Diplôme d'Etudes Universitaires Générales (DEUG); Diplôme Universitaire de Technologie (DUT) : 2 years	35.1	61.7
Bachelor and engineering degree (4 years)	44.9	17.7
Master's (6 years)	11.5	20.1
Doctorates	2.5	0.5
Total	100.0	100.0

Source: MESRS

Note : DEUG: *Diplôme d'Etudes Universitaires Générales;* DUT: *Diplôme Universitaire de Technologie.* Both are

---

[5] *Nature's* 2016 Index of Rising Stars identifies rising performers in science, using the Nature Index, which tracks the high-quality research of more than 8,000 global institutions. The 2016 index profiles universities, research institutions and countries that have significantly improved their scientific output, often without the longevity and resources that benefit more established institutions that are prominent in international academic rankings. From 2012 to 2015, reviewed institutions and countries significantly increased their contributions to a selection of top natural science journals—a metric known as weighted fractional count (WFC). https://www.natureindex.com/supplements/nature-index-2016-rising-stars/index#ni-articles.

awarded by Universities,

19. **Most current programs are not responsive to labor market demand**. Most tertiary students (78 percent) are specializing in humanities or social sciences; only 15 percent seek a science, technology, engineering, or math (STEM) degree; 5.2 percent are in agricultural sciences; and just 0.6 percent enroll are in medical sciences. Reversing the current trend will require time, because fewer than 3 percent of secondary students pass the *Baccalauréat* examination in science and math programs. The AFD is supporting actions to enhance secondary teaching and learning in science and math.

20. **Beside the low percentage of tertiary programs in STEM there is a severe disconnect between the learning outcomes of most tertiary education institutions and what the economy is demanding.** This is probably because employers are rarely involved in design and revision of curricula to prepare students, especially students of humanities and the social scientists, for the job market. Similarly, university research and development (R&D) activities are rarely linked to industry. The 2017 World Economic Forum Global Innovation Index ranks Côte d'Ivoire 86th out of 140 countries on collaboration between universities and industry—and 107th on registering new patents and licenses.

21. **Tertiary education has very little institutional differentiation**. About 82 percent of the students are enrolled in either a public university (37.9 percent) or a private institution (44.4 percent). Côte d'Ivoire does not have non-university institutions like the North American community colleges or the French technology institutes, which can train mid-level technicians and managers, and options for student mobility are nonexistent. With enrollment averaging about 400 students, most private institutions are inefficient, being unable to take advantage of economies of scale. Internationally, enrollment in small tertiary institutions ranges from 2,000 to 5,000 students.

22. **To address these quality and relevance issues, the government in 2009 launched a transition to the License-Master-Doctorate (LMD) system, in line with the Bologna Process[6] and the goals of Network for Excellence of Higher Education in West Africa (*Réseau pour l'Excellence de l'Enseignement Supérieur en Afrique de l'Ouest (REESAO)).[7]* The transition to the LMD system, though complex, is expected to enhance system and institutional efficiency. The process requires sector-wide reforms of the allocation and use of resources (labs, equipment, and staff) and of curriculum and student management. The transition in Côte d'Ivoire is still underway. Because universities have been making the necessary changes at different paces according to their capacities, how much they have achieved also differs. Some key elements of the LMD system (e.g., pooling of resources, student and lecturer mobility, and establishment of doctoral schools [DS] to deliver PhD programs) are not yet in place; several require changes in regulation and reinforcement of central and university institutional capacity.

23. **Quality assurance, which is central to the LMD system, is at present only embryonic in Côte d'Ivoire**. In the transition to the LMD system, improvements in the quality of teaching and learning will to a large extent

---

[6] The Bologna Process is a series of agreements between European countries to ensure that the quality of higher-education qualifications are comparable. According to the African and Malagasy Advisory Committee for Higher Education (CAMES: *Conseil Africain et Malgache pour l'Enseignement Supérieur*) each university is expected to introduce a series of measures, among them harmonizing a three-level certification system and providing for credits (60 credits per semester for REESAO **[[see next footnote]]**), student and lecturer mobility, quality assurance mechanisms, and lifelong learning.

[7] The Network for Excellence of Higher Education in West Africa **(**REESAO: *Réseau pour l'Excellence de l'Enseignement Supérieur en Afrique de l'Ouest*) includes Benin, Togo, Niger, Mali, Burkina Faso, Senegal, and Cote d'Ivoire; the objective is to facilitate establishment of common standards for the transition to the LMD sytem.

hinge on there being a solid and comprehensive quality assu   rance (QA) system from national to individual institutions. Very few tertiary institutions have an internal QA unit and the new Ministry Quality Assurance Department has only recently begun operations.

Governance and Financing

24.   **There is a need for more appropriate governance systems if the performance of Ivoirian tertiary education is to improve**. Public institutions have little institutional autonomy, performance-based management instruments and processes are lacking, and there are no follow-up mechanisms to monitor how well graduates are integrating into the labor market. Public universities have no control over the number of students they must enroll, the tuition fees they are allowed to set, or the use of self-generated income. As for modern management practices, the first performance-based contracts (PBCs), signed a few years ago, could not be honored because the Ministry was unable to commit the additional resources PBCs called for.

25.   **Because the monitoring system is not effective, there is an acute lack of data for analysis of internal and external efficiency and total institutional performance**. The Ministry collects basic data by institution, but these do not cover such important variables as access, retention, and achievement rates. The disruption of the school year for some departments and programs may be partly to blame, but in any case, as the LMD system is gradually adopted, the increased student and faculty mobility across institutions and programs and the resources pooling system will require a more comprehensive, computerized management system. Finally, although training an adequately qualified workforce is one of the main functions of tertiary education, the government has not yet put in place a comprehensive way to monitor graduate employment, which makes it difficult if not impossible to match university programs to labor market needs. The only current mechanism is the national information system on the labor market managed by the Ministry of Employment and Social Protection, but it is limited to monthly analysis of employment and provides no data on employment of graduates.

26.   **Research funding has plunged in recent years**. Between 2012 and 2015, public spending on research went from 0.03 percent of GDP to less than 0.02 percent. Without adequate resources, universities are unlikely to ramp up research in any meaningful way. The reality is that Côte d'Ivoire, like most SSA countries, will be confronted by severe financial tensions and difficulty in finding trade-offs as the government attempts to reconcile the three fundamental objectives for tertiary education: quantitative expansion, quality improvements, and R&D strengthening, Within recurrent spending, the share of salaries grew steadily between 2008 and 2015, from 31 to 48 percent.[8] Considering that social transfers (scholarships, meals and dormitories) represent 37 percent of recurrent spending, this leaves few resources for the non-salary spending that is important to create a favorable learning environment and operate and maintain science labs and computers.

Government Strategy and Commitment

27. **Tertiary education can directly support three of the five priorities of the National Development Plan**: (a) institutional strengthening and improved governance; (b) accelerated human capital development, and (c) structural transformation of the economy through industrialization. Moreover, the 2016–25 ESP is

---

[8] World Bank, 2017, Public Expenditures Review.

designed to support government efforts to make Côte d'Ivoire "an emerging country with a solid industrial basis by 2020." For this purpose, the Ministry envisages achieving the following four objectives: (a) establish a Strategic Unit for Competencies; (b) match the stock of qualified workers with the structural transformation objective to make the economy more competitive by creating new Institutes of Professional Training and Technology (ISFPT); (c) improve access to quality programs; and (d) develop a pool of national researchers contributing effectively to technological innovation. The Government of Côte d'Ivoire has also made it clear that tertiary education is a priority for improving the quality of primary and secondary education because it trains qualified teachers.

28. **The government, in collaboration with development partners, has launched reforms to (a) expand access to tertiary education, (b) improve the financing of public tertiary institutions, and (c) give more institutional autonomy to public universities**. The first reforms are pedagogical, in preparation for the transition to the LMD system, and institutional, with revision of tertiary education governance. By 2020, the Ministry plans to (a) build new universities in San Pedro (supported by the Islamic Development Bank) and in Bondoukou; and (b) expand the capacity of two existing universities, in Daloa and Khorogo. Furthermore, with AFD support, the Ministry has launched a process to establish a results-based financing system for public tertiary institutions. This reform requires that all public tertiary institutions draw up a three-year Development Plan and sign a PBC with the Ministry to mobilize national and external resources. Finally, the Ministry intends to grant public universities full autonomy as long as they put in place adequate accountability mechanisms.

Table 4: Contribution of Development Partners to Public Tertiary Education prior to this operation

Theme	Partner	Activities
Access	AFD (France)	Construct dormitories to enhance access at INPHB.
	Islamic Development Bank	Construct two new universities, in San Pedro and Bondoukou.
Quality	AFD (France)	Enhance research capacity (doctoral schools, grants for research, etc.)
		Create a virtual university.
		Provide scientific equipment to public universities and *Grandes Ecoles.*
		Rehabilitate INPHB infrastructure and equipment
		Support INPHB constituencies (e.g., partnerships with *Grandes Ecoles* in France, etc.)
		Extend the higher education Internet network.
		Support curriculum revisions, for transition to the LMD.
		Create two new Higher Institutes for Vocational Training and Technology.

Theme	Partner	Activities
	World Bank	Support three universities under the regional Africa Higher Education Centers of Excellence Project (P126974) to promote regional specialization among participating universities in areas that address regional challenges in training and applied research.
Governance	AFD (France)	Support a study of tertiary education governance.
		Support drafting of an institutional strategic plan and performance-based contacts.
		Support public-private partnership initiatives.

C. Relevance to Higher-Level Objectives

29. **The project is anchored in Focus Areas 2 and 3 of the 2016–19 Country Partnership Framework (CPF), which deal with (a) building human capital for economic development and social cohesion; and (b) reinforcing public financial management (PFM) and accountability.** To help build human capital, the project will provide students with skills relevant to the labor market, which should help reduce high youth unemployment. It will also adopt options and measures to ensure that the qualifications of tertiary graduates are better aligned with labor market needs. As for enhancing PFM, the project, in coordination with AFD, will support the government's higher education reform strategy by making public funding more efficient, granting more institutional autonomy, and enhancing institutional accountability.

30. **The proposed project is fully aligned with Côte d'Ivoire's National Development Plan (NPD 2016–20) to transform tertiary education into a high-performing system that can effectively support the development of the country by building knowledge and high-level skills**. The government recognizes that a high-performing tertiary system is fundamental to its economic and social development agenda because it can (a) train a qualified and adaptable labor force, especially high-level scientists, professionals, technicians, teachers in basic and secondary education, and future government, civil service, and business leaders; (b) generate new knowledge through basic and applied research, and (c) be a conduit for tapping stores of global knowledge and adapting it to local use. Tertiary institutions also have a unique ability to integrate and create synergy among the three dimensions. Sustainable transformation and growth throughout the economy depend heavily on the capacity-building contributions of an innovative tertiary system, especially in developing countries with inadequate institutional capacity and limited human capital.

31. **By supporting tertiary education the Bank will help Côte d'Ivoire achieve the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).** In addition to the essential contribution that tertiary education can make to the goals of sustainable economic growth (SDG 8) and poverty reduction (SDG 1), there can be no progress on all the other dimensions, from developing a vibrant agricultural sector and building up a resilient infrastructure to mitigating the devastating effects of climate change and preserving the environment, without the participation of scientists and other well-trained professionals and the application of leading-edge research to finding solutions to the major challenges faced by humans. To diminish inequality (SDG 10),

tertiary education is vital for promoting social mobility through equal educational opportunities for all, especially the most vulnerable groups (e.g., low-income groups, minorities, and people with special needs). Achieving the SDGs also requires sound institutions for designing and carrying out policy, and well-prepared citizens who care about inclusion and sustainability.

Proposed Development Objective(s)

32. **The PDO has three goals: (a) improve higher education management; (b) increase enrollment in professional programs; (b) improve the quality and labor market relevance of degree programs in participating public tertiary institutions.**

Key Results

PDO Indicators

33. To measure progress on all three components of the PDO, the indicators are
   a- Number of universities supported by the project that achieve at least 80 percent of the annual targets set in PBCs (number)
   b- Number of professional programs (short-term and degree) supported by the project (number)
   c- Increase in employment rates for graduates of programs supported by the project (percentage)
   d- Students benefitting from direct interventions to enhance learning, of which women - Core indicator (number)

D. Project Components

34. **The proposed instrument for the Project is an Investment Project Financing (IPF) with a duration of 5 years, with total financing of US$100 million (IDA credit).** The project will support a series of investments combined with policy reforms of tertiary governance and public financing. The project will support government plans to expand and improve the tertiary system with appropriate incentives to improve the quality of education in Côte d'Ivoire. The ultimate goal is to put in place programs that are more relevant to the job market. The project will also help achieve this by strengthening systems of governance and the financing of the system.

Component 1: Strengthening Tertiary Education Management (US$15 million)

35. **The objective of Component 1 is to support the government as it modernizes governance of tertiary education to give individual institutions much more autonomy**. Activities will be carried out in the context of the government's decentralization policy (Decree n°114/PM/CAB March 10, 2014), which for tertiary education will mean granting more autonomy to public institutions but also requiring more accountability for their results and the use of public resources. The component will help prepare the universities to implement governance changes allowed in the revised law on higher education.

36. **The project will support the government as it identifies and adopts all the requisites for granting more autonomy to public tertiary institutions;** it will, for instance, help (a) establish an appropriate financing mechanism, the PBC; (b) reinforce sector management by, e.g., sector analysis, strategic planning, and monitoring and evaluation (M&E); (c) develop a QA system; and, (d) reinforce management capacity as institutions become autonomous.

Subcomponent 1.1: Establishing Performance-Based Contracts (US$1 million)

37. **The Ministry is currently working on a new financing system rooted in PBCs between the Ministry and public tertiary education institutions**. The objectives are to (a) ensure strong university ownership and commitment to the reforms, with a multiyear action plan for their implementation; and (b) enhance university accountability. The new system will be based on (a) funding commitments for the first year, with proposed activities and objectives costed; (b) funding projections for subsequent years; (c) agreed performance targets; and (d) indicators to monitor progress. Adjustments will be made every year based on how well targets are achieved. Under this subcomponent, the project will provide technical assistance (TA) and support for the contracting process. It will cover the drafting of manuals of procedures, training, and development of tools for M&E.

38. **By using PBCs, in addition to responding to a results-based financing system, the Ministry expects to achieve three objectives:** (1) Reach a consensual and shared approach to necessary reforms. (2) Empower and commit public tertiary institutions to meeting social and labor market needs. (3) Ensure that all public tertiary institutions and programs are aligned with the official academic year, which is crucial to the success of the planned reforms.

Subcomponent 1.2: Reinforcing Sector Management Capacity (US$9 million)

39. **The objective of this subcomponent is to build up Ministry analytical, planning, and evaluation capacities and to strengthen institutional management capacities**. The Ministry will enhance its analytical capacity to monitor and evaluate reforms in tertiary education, and a vision for the future of tertiary education will be elaborated. This will help to determine a sustainable financing strategy to absorb the rising demand for tertiary education. Each institution will be guided to develop managerial capacities appropriate to the new context of institutional autonomy.

40. *At the system level*: To achieve these results, the project will support (a) set-up of a new Ministry Policy Analysis Unit, with the necessary human and financial resources to produce high-quality policy studies and to evaluate policy measures and reforms; (b) capacity building in policy analysis and evaluation methods; (c)

capacity building for designing and implementing communication strategies to reach out to all stakeholders, such as trade unions and civil society organizations; and (d) developing management information system. The project will finance TA, equipment and materials, workshops, training missions, and printing services.

41.   The project will emphasize M&E capacity to gather data about internal efficiency and institutional performance and employment of graduates. For internal efficiency and institutional performance, the project will support the development of a comprehensive national Tertiary Education Management Information System (TEMIS) from the institutional to the central level, including the new management system to give students and professors the mobility required by the LMD system. The TEMIS will be essential for allocating and mobilizing resources. For employment of graduates the project will support the Ministry as it establishes a Labor Market Observatory (LMO), complemented by national tracer surveys. Rather than being an agency or institution per se, the LMO will be a national network (including industries and economic sectors) brought together by a common purpose and methodology. It will inform decisions about closing or transforming programs and degrees. The project will finance TA, tracer surveys, equipment and materials, workshops, training missions, and printing services.

42.   ***At the institutional level:*** To achieve higher performance, autonomous tertiary institutions need strong leadership, supportive governance arrangements, and modern management practices. Based on each institution's performance contract, the project will help build its general management capacity. It will also build capacity for strategic planning, benchmarking and self-evaluation, fund-raising, project design, implementation and M&E, efficient and transparent procurement, and effective communications.

43.   To achieve these results, under this subcomponent the project will support actions that benefit all the universities and *Grandes Ecoles*, among them (a) training and capacity building for university officers, deans. and department heads in strategic planning, benchmarking, evaluation, and communication; (b) training of academics in project design, implementation, and monitoring; (c) training of specialists in income diversification and fund-raising[9]; and (d) training of procurement specialists.

44.   ***For project management***: This is the first Bank-funded project the Ministry is managing, and its directorates will be responsible for preparing project technical documents, implementation, and monitoring. The project will provide capacity-building activities for Ministry departments working on the project, including TA, study tours, training, and equipment. The Ministry will draft and implement a comprehensive communication plan to ensure ownership and support of project reforms by all stakeholders.

45.   To ensure that the project is managed in compliance with World Bank financial and fiduciary standards, project coordination and fiduciary, environmental, and social safeguards, and M&E responsibilities will be assigned to a Project Implementation Unit (PIU) within the Ministry. Dedicated staff will be recruited for project coordination, financial management, procurement, M&E, and communication.

---

[9] This is good practice for autonomous universities, "*Grandes Ecoles*" of engineers, and the Bank-funded African Centers of Excellence. For instance, Tunisia is creating an academy of new professions in higher education and research, including training of "intrapreuneurs."

Subcomponent 1.3: Quality Assurance System (US$5 million)

46.   **The objective of this sub component is to support the Ministry in establishing a new QA Agency and QA units** in individual universities. It will provide resources for formulating self-evaluation and external evaluation reference guides, establishing the internal quality units, and carrying out pilot evaluations. The project will finance the necessary capacity building and training at all levels (e.g., QA Agency personnel, university leaderships, deans, department heads, and coordinators of internal QA units).

47.   *The Quality Assurance Agency*. Elaboration of a new national QA strategy that defines its main orientations will determine the agency's elements, among them (a) overall objectives; (b) functions (accreditation, evaluation, audit, inspection); (c) whether its strictures are voluntary or obligatory; (d) what it covers (institutions, programs, public or private institutions or both; (e) minimum standards and referents (thresholds, good practices, dimensions of flexibility); (f) self-evaluation and peer evaluation criteria (membership, decision-making, roles of experts and the Agency, appeal procedures, publication of results); and (g) governance of the QA system (status of the Agency, governance setup, accountability, allocation of roles, and interaction between administrative and technical units).

48.   The project will thus support (a) an inventory of QA approaches in higher education institutions and the initiatives and projects supporting it, to ensure pooling of resources and creation of synergies; (b) identification and validation of the strategic choices of the national QA policy; (c) development of a quality reference system (evaluation benchmarks and external evaluation guides); (d) raising the awareness of tertiary institutions, through a broad communication program, about how to use QA tools; (e) building the capacity of external evaluators and process administration staff; and (f) conducting pilot external evaluations, institutional and program. The project could also finance logistical and material support, consistent with the capacity building plan (e.g., training for presidents, directors, deans, and department heads).

49.   *For Internal Quality Assurance*, which is vital for the strategic management of higher education institutions and should be integral to the national QA policy, this subcomponent, aligned with the national QA strategy, will finance through the PBCs the creation of QA units within the universities, including (a) TA for preparing the structure for organizing the functioning of an internal QA unit, e.g., drafting certification standards and producing procedure manuals and ethical guidelines; (b) training specialists to work in internal QA units; (b) reinforcing their capacities; (d) designing internal QA projects tailored to a given institution; and (e) equipment and materials.

Component 2: Enhancing Short-cycle Professional Programs (US$30 million)

50.   **The objective of this component is to make short-duration tertiary programs more effective in order to help push up graduate employment.** The component will (a) finance a new category of short professional programs that will be more relevant and demand-driven; and (b) review current programs for opportunities to adjust them to labor market needs.

Subcomponent 2.1. Creation of Higher Institutes of Professional Training and Technology (US$25 million)

51. **The objective of this sub component is to provide alternative programs for new tertiary students, so that they will be better prepared for work and have a path to move to undergraduate and advanced degrees.** The ISFPT—the Higher Institute of Professional Training and Technology—is a new category of higher education for Côte d'Ivoire. It will deliver two-year professional diplomas (*Diplôme National Supérieur de Technologie*) and three-year professional degrees (*licence professionnelle*). The ISFPT is being created in response to private-sector needs for well-qualified young graduates, trained and with good command of new technologies and with the core and technical skills in demand in the labor market. The private sector will be well represented on the ISFPT Management Board and will be closely involved in defining curricula and practical exercises. The ISFPT will also integrate experienced industry professionals as full-time faculty, with an appropriate status and an attractive remuneration package, to be paid from the ISFPT budget

52. **Under this sub component the project will finance the creation of two new ISFPTs.** A pre-feasibility study, the consultations and workshops held in preparation for the project identified some priority areas for the economy. The first ISFPT will therefore be multi-sectoral and the second mono-sectoral. The first ISFPT would be established in the third year of the project to allow time to prepare the curriculum, recruit and train teachers, purchase equipment, recruit students and to build classrooms, dormitories and offices. Therefore, at most two cohorts will graduate during the project. For each ISFPT total enrollment will be 100 students in year 1, 200 in year 2, and 400 in year 3; the average cost of each ISFPT is about US$12 million. Among other things, the project will finance feasibility and technical studies, construction, consultants, training, equipment, and operational costs for the first year, and for the second year and thereafter the government will finance the operating costs. ISFPTs are designed to generate their own revenue by providing, e.g., in-service training, maintenance, and advisory services to industry.

Subcomponent 2.2. Strengthening and Upgrading BTSs (US$5 million)

53. **The objective of this sub component is to review current BTS programs in order to adapt them to better respond to labor market needs and job requirements.** Creating the two ISFPTs will not be enough to fill all labor market needs. The project will therefore support the government's plan in the NPD to improve BTSs, where most tertiary students are enrolled, to push up their pass and employment rates. A BTS is granted on the basis of a national examination in different areas of specialization; students are trained in public and subsidized private institutes. The revision will, e.g., update course content and teaching practices; review the areas of specialization; integrate professionals into the process; and train trainers on the new content and any new areas of specialization. The project will finance TA for curriculum revision, including content and teaching training practices, thematic studies, workshops, and training of trainers for public and private institutions.

Component 3: Improving Education Quality and Relevance in Public Universities and INPHB (US$55 million)

54. **The objective of this sub component is to help public tertiary institutions make the transition to the LMD system and support measures to enhance the quality and relevance of their programs.** The project will therefore help the government to (a) respond to the need for a qualified workforce by increasing the number of professional programs; (b) promote lifelong learning opportunities by diversifying modular programs and promoting student mobility between programs; (c) promote research and training through establishing model Doctoral Schools, and (d) reinforce STEM programs.

55. **The project will provide grants to each university and to INPHB based on PBCs.** Public tertiary institutions are currently preparing Strategic Development Plans (SDPs), which will be the basis for their PBCs. Depending on its specificities and capacities, each university will commit in the PBC to specific performance indicators. Since the situation differs by university, and between universities and the INPHB, Component 3 has two subcomponents.

Subcomponent 3.1. Improving the Quality and Relevance of Public University Programs (US$30 million)

56. **Through the PBCs, to improve quality and relevance the project will have two priorities: improving academic programs and establishing Doctoral Schools (DS)**. Both, combined with the QA system in Component 1, will support the transition to the LMD.

57. *For the improvement of academic programs*, the universities have several options (see Box 1 below). The project will support the universities as they implement (a) their preferred options for improving quality and relevance of programs and (b) activities to reinforce the LMD system by diversifying modular programs to allow cross-enrollment across programs and promote in-service training. The project will finance TA, workshops, training, materials, equipment, small rehabilitation of labs, classrooms and offices, and printing services.

Box 1: Options to enhance academic program relevance and professionalization

1) Joint programs with sectors of the economy to address specific labor market needs
2) Curricula based on state-of-the-art teaching and learning practices (e.g., simulation, inquiry-based, ICT-based self-learning)
3) Joint programs and joint certification with reputable foreign tertiary institutions
4) Twinning and networking of institutions and programs for synergy, coherence, and complementarity
5) Creation and transformation of professional programs (licenses) and degrees (master's), developed jointly with expert representatives from program areas
6) Establishment of interfaces and support for professionalization, such as internships and career centers
7) Putting in place support services for pedagogical innovation, such as in-service training, skills certification, alternate training, entrepreneurship training, publicizing graduates' reports, and innovation research, such as centers of expertise (e.g., FabLab), incubators, and technology-

---

58. The project will provide TA to the Ministry for drafting a regulatory framework for joint programs, in particular participation of professionals; production of methodological guides for the design, certification and external evaluation of professional programs; and training of external auditors. The project will also provide TA for (a) elaboration of regulations related to the creation of structures for professionalization of different programs and (b) capacity building for management teams

59.   For ***Doctoral Schools (DS)***, the project will work toward a more efficient model for enhancing applied research. It will provide direct support to the Ministry for (a) drafting a national policy to define the vision and mission of these schools; (b) structuring regulation for DS creation, organization, and operation; (c) building the capacity of DS coordinators, thesis supervisors, and specialists in research innovation; (d) constructing an ecosystem to enable the collaboration of academic researchers with socio-professional sectors; and (e) for better visibility and performance, accrediting DS. The project will finance TA, workshops, training, and printing services.

60.   At the university level, through the PBCs the project will support DS creation. The project will finance TA for the establishment and review of doctoral curricula, training of trainers, and provide for equipment and materials, small rehabilitation of labs, classroom and offices***,*** partnerships, doctoral student and faculty exchange programs, and joint academic and research programs.

Subcomponent 3.2: Building Up INPHB, the Polytechnic Institute (US$25 million)

61.   **The objective of this subcomponent is to support the evolution of the INPHB into a world-class engineering school**. Transforming the INPHB, the main school of engineering in Côte d'Ivoire, is crucial for promotion of STEM in the Ivoirian tertiary system.

62.   The project will address the following problems confronting INPHB in raising the quality and relevance of STEM education: (a) inadequate teaching and learning facilities, especially for science and technology programs; (b) insufficient links to industry; (c) absence of institutional QA, particularly in pedagogical performance and student support services; (d) lack of integration of member schools; and (e) inadequate planning and management capacity for institutional development.

63.   The project will finance activities covered in the PBC that deal with (a) modernization of governance based on increased autonomy for and better integration of member schools; (b) improvement in the quality and relevance of academic programs (training and orientation of faculty, adoption of innovative programs, modernization of curricula and instructional methods, internationalization of curricula, international accreditation); (c) strengthening research and innovation (exchange of high-quality researchers, upgrading of scientific equipment and research infrastructure, international research partnerships); and (d) development of research-fueled entrepreneurship and focus on research impact (establishment of a startup incubator, training, support for technology transfer). These activities will require TA, training, workshops, missions, equipment, materials, and small rehabilitation.

64.   To ensure the quality of instructional facilities and approaches for a modern learning environment that meets world-class standards, the following quality and management-enhancing activities will be supported: (a) upgrading basic classroom facilities and Internet connectivity; (b) modernizing programs, curricula, and instructional tools and approaches; (c) improving the market-relevance of programs and curricula by training students in soft skills and ensuring close links with industry; and (d) emphasizing QA in teaching. The first five of the following measures will all be financed by the project under the PBC.

   a.   ***Ensuring Internet connectivity:*** securing high-bandwidth last-mile connectivity; establishing a campus intranet that gives students, faculty, and staff secure and reliable high-speed WIFI Internet access in all academic and residential spaces.

b. ***Modernizing instructional approaches.*** adopting project-based and hands-on learning using advanced technologies; designing new curricula integrated with the research focus areas outlined in the INPHB strategic plan; adopting a course and learning management system that streamlines access to curriculum content, enables management, delivery, and tracking of online and blended learning, and follows best practices and current standards (EdX, MIT OpenCourseware, etc.; facilitating faculty professional growth, collaboration, and mentoring related to instructional methods through a robust visiting faculty/lecturer program; and offering bilingual programs.

c. ***Institutionalizing QA self-assessments (SA):*** setting up an SA committee, hiring experts to review SA strategy and its integration into pedagogical approaches; arranging for training faculty on SA (including systematic use student course evaluations); conducting surveys; and publishing SA reports. This goal is to support INPHB in meeting internal QA standards and applying for international accreditation.

d. ***Building soft skills and industry links:*** establishing internship programs and job placement services; making programs more relevant through partnerships with industry; conducting tracer studies; formulating training courses and course content for improving analytical, cognitive capacity, and presentation skills; and ensuring English language proficiency (writing and speaking) and Information Communication Technology (ICT).

e. ***Upgrading university administrative processes and systems****:* elaborating and implementing a plan to better integrate INPHB member schools and put in place a university Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) system so that INPHB can (a) better manage financial, personnel, and facilities resources; (b) improve internal communications; (c) provide one-stop access to student, faculty, and personnel services (e.g., payroll, enrollment, registration, transcripts); and (d) inform decision-making by tracking key performance indicators and providing regular analytic reports.

f. ***Upgrading and modernizing academic facilities and infrastructure****:* renovate and refurbish classrooms, lecture rooms, auditoriums, laboratories, and libraries; procure curriculum-related scientific and laboratory instruments, and classroom multimedia equipment and instructional aids; renovate libraries and restock them with reference books and journals; provide access to online library resources and journals; set up computer labs and rooms for students; and define Internet-connected study spaces.

Project Beneficiaries

65. The direct beneficiaries of the project are the students enrolled in the institutions and programs supported by the project. These include programs for which QA mechanisms will be set up, PBC beneficiaries, the new vocational training institutes (ISFPTs) to be created, and the DSs the project will support.

66. To enhance the quality of tertiary institutions, the project will support the establishment of internal QA units and funding of PBCs for six public universities (Félix Houphouët-Boigny University (UFHB) of Cocody; Nangui Abrogoua University (UNA) of Abobo-Adjamé; Alassane Ouattara University (UAO) of Bouaké ; Jean Lorougnon Guédé University (UJLG) of Daloa ; Péléforo Gon Coulibaly University (UPGC) of Korhogo—the University of Man; and the INPHB. Thus, each year of the project, it should benefit about 80,000 students, 1,500 professors trained and 400 administrators.

67. Finally, the project will benefit students enrolled in the DSs. Assuming that 50 students are enrolled every year in each DC, by project end the DSs should have 250 direct beneficiaries a year.

E. Implementation

Institutional and Implementation Arrangements

68. ***Steering Committee (SC)***: It will oversee project strategy and activities to ensure that (a) the project is aligned with national policies and (b) is well-coordinated with other donors and government resources. The Minister of Higher Education and Scientific Research will have overall responsibility for sector and policy coordination, and will designate the SC chair. The SC will consist of university rectors, representatives from the private sector generally, the General Directors for Higher Education and for QA, representatives of private education providers, and a representative of the Ministry of Economy and Finance. The Project Coordinator will be the SC Secretary.

69. ***Technical Committee:*** It will be created within the Ministry and cover all projects in higher education. For this project, it will be responsible for preparing technical documents for implementation of all project components and will provide technical expertise as requested. It will manage negotiation of PBCs, supervise how they operate in practice, be responsible for mapping of new institutions, and support development of the information and statistics system. It will thus coordinate the whole tertiary education reform program. The TC will include a technical coordinator and specialists from the Ministry, the universities, and other tertiary institutions, each to be in charge of one component or subcomponent.

70. ***Tertiary Education Institutions (TEIs):*** TEIs will be responsible for implementing all project activities at their institution. The reform to establish autonomous tertiary systems is being prepared and will improve how they use government grants. Each will set up a PBC management team reporting to the entity president and comprising (a) a general coordinator, (b) a procurement coordinator, (c) a financial management specialist, and (d) an M&E specialist who will also be responsible for safeguards compliance. Once the government and the World Bank approve the PBC, each TEI will be in charge of procurement and financial management for their PBC. The project will provide training to reinforce procurement capacities.

71. ***Project Implementation Unit (PIU):*** As part of the Ministry the PIU will ensure that all project activities comply with Bank procedures and fiduciary and M&E standards. The PIU will be responsible for project technical management and day-to-day implementation, such as overall procurement, financial management, and disbursements. However, the universities will manage minor procurement activities as they relate to the PBCs. The PIU will be comprised of a project coordinator; financial management, procurement, and M&E specialists; and a few assistants. TA would be provided upon request. The Ministry will provide material, equipment, an operational budget, and office space for the PIU.

Results Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements

72. **The project will support improvements of the Ministry information system that will be needed for project M&E**. Similarly, each participating tertiary institution will develop its own subsystem to link to the general system (EMIS: the Education Monitoring Information System). Subsystems can be used to monitor

how well each tertiary institution is adhering to its PBC. For PBCs, a dictionary of indicators is being drawn up, along with the methodology for data collection and calculation. The project will provide TA and IT equipment to build up the system. A central condition for the EMIS is stabilizing the academic year for all tertiary institutions, which will also allow production of internal efficiency indicators. The project will provide support to improve the quality of the tertiary statistical yearbook and its production. A comprehensive action plan will be prepared to ensure that M&E and project activities are well-coordinated.

73.   Each participating tertiary institution will house a project unit (the PBC management team) to supervise and monitor all PBC-related activities; the TEI will mobilize the necessary human resources. Training will be provided to project unit staff and TA will be available upon request.

74.   Since no information is currently available, when the project begins, for the PDO indicators on graduate employment rates, when the project begins, to establish baseline values for priority programs, a tracer survey of 2015 and 2016 graduates will be carried out by the *Ecole National des Statistiques Appliquées à l'Economie (ENSEA).* [10] As the LMO evolves, these indicators will be updated regularly. The project will finance TA to develop the LMO and provide support as required.

75.   *Reports*: The project will support production of the following reports:

- A semi-annual Ministry project progress report that will also consolidate semi-annual PBC progress reports produced by each university
- The annual report on tertiary graduates produced by the LMO
- Reports on thematic studies, such as evaluations of policy measures and reforms, implemented by the Policy Analysis Unit (Component 3)
- The Project Mid-Term Evaluation report.

76.   *Safeguards*: The Ministry has primary responsibility for monitoring safeguards compliance. Quarterly project progress reports will contain specific information on the status of safeguards measures. University rectors have responsibility for social safeguards compliance in their own institutions. Each university project unit will therefore have an M&E specialist to manage day-to-day safeguards compliance, and compliance status will be included in the semiannual university progress reports. The Ministry will designate a safeguards focal point in its staff and TA will be provided as needed to ensure compliance with project safeguards conditions.

Sustainability

77.   **One major condition for project sustainability is how committed the Côte d'Ivoire government is to reform of tertiary education**. The government has launched a broad consultation on revision of the 1995 law on tertiary education in order to establish the autonomy of public education institutions and introduce a new financing mechanism. The revised law is in the process for government adoption and it will expand the financing mechanism developed for the project to become the normal procedure for all public tertiary institutions. Moreover, with autonomy it is expected that public tertiary institutions will generate additional revenue, so that they can expand applied research and collaborate more closely with economic sectors.

---

[10] The ENSEA has long experiences in national and international surveys on employment, health and in impact evaluation.

78. **To reinforce project sustainability, close collaboration between the government, stakeholders, the World Bank, and other development partners was established during the project preparation process**. The goal was and is to ensure broad communication and shared information about sectoral policies and strategies so that all constituents of tertiary education institutions are fully involved and committed to reform. Through the process the government expects that participating universities and the INPHB will align their strategic plans with national sectoral policies and therefore project objectives and approaches.

79. **The PBC process is part of a national reform initiative to establish a performance-based budgeting system (PBBS) led by the Ministry of Finance and Economy**. The main stakeholders and representatives of other ministries has been involved during its preparation. The education Ministry has launched a participative approach for the revision of the tertiary education law; one objective is to establish the PBC as the only mechanism for recurrent and capital budget allocations for public tertiary institutions. To that purpose, project support is crucial to providing TA for a smooth transition to PBC financing.

80. **Building central and institutional capacity to help the PBC mechanism to succeed is also an important aspect of sustainability.** Reinforcing institutional QA mechanisms and central quality management systems, as foreseen by the project, would contribute a great deal to PBC success. Similarly, reinforcement of the information system for data collection and production of indicators, and regular communication on progress and implementation issues, would enhance transparency and promote acceptance of the PBC**.**

I. PROJECT APPRAISAL SUMMARY

A. Technical, Economic, and Financial Analysis

81. **Investments in any level of education, especially for girls, generally produce high economic returns.**[11] However, in most countries private returns are higher than public. Tertiary education is also generally associated with certain social outcomes in, e.g., demography and citizenship. However, merely having enrolled in tertiary education is not enough; the quality and relevance of the skills acquired also matter— indeed, students have to really acquire the skills they are supposed to have learned. Furthermore, these skills should match the needs of the economy and the labor market, if the individuals and the society are to actually earn the resulting economic and social benefits. Internationally, actual skills are more closely associated than mere school attendance with higher labor market productivity and earnings. The economic and financial analysis will be completed by appraisal.

B. Fiduciary

Financial Management

82. **The financial management (FM) arrangements designed for the project recognize the country's post-conflict situation** and also the minimum requirements of the World Bank Policy and Directive for IPF, which describes general World Bank FM policies and procedures.

83. **In 2014, the government adopted a strategic framework for reforming public financial management (PFM),** but recent assessments of the PFM system have noted some continuing problems. Thus, at this point

---

[11] Psacharopoulos, G., and H. Patrinos. 2018. "Returns to Investment in Education: A Decennial Review of the Global Literature." Global Education Practice, Policy Research Working Paper # 8402, World Bank, Washington DC.

the World Bank cannot fully rely on the public expenditure framework for this project. The government has requested a ring-fenced financing mechanism for the fiduciary aspects of the project; it has proposed that the project be managed by a new Ministry PIU reporting to the Coordinator for the Higher Education Development Support Project (HEDSP). The FM team of the PIU to be established would manage the FM aspects of the project.

84.   **During project preparation, the Ministry Directorate of Administration and Finance (DAF) was assessed in May 2018 to determine whether it could manage the proposed project.** The main finding was that no one at the DAF is familiar with World Bank-financed project procedures and requirements. However, the DAF follows the country public expenditure chain for budget execution and financial reporting through the government budget and accounting software, SIGFIP (Integrated Financial Management Information System) and ASTER (the accounting information system). The DAF has the same challenges and weaknesses described in various reports on Côte d'Ivoire's PFM systems. However, the assessment also revealed that the procurement plan and the budget of the project preparation advance (PPA - US$3.5 million) managed by FM team of the Emergency Youth Employment and Skills development PIU (P122546) included recruitment of the necessary staff and design and use of FM tools. such as a manual of procedures. accounting software, and training for key PIU staff.

85.   **The overall FM risk is rated Substantial.** This is due to (a) Ministry DAF's lack of familiarity with Bank FM procedures; and (b) design of the project, which has several subcomponents and activities and a multiplicity of actors, with beneficiaries in remote and geographically dispersed locations. Supervision of the project will be risk-based.

86.   **Due to the critical areas for operationalizing the PIU FM team that are associated with the risk, it was concluded that the Ministry could manage World Bank funds once the following measures are implemented before and after the project becomes effective:** (a) appoint, on a competitive basis, the FM head of accounts, an accountant, and one assistant accountant; (b) draft the FM procedures manual; and (c) acquire and install the accounting software and train its users. In line with the Use of Country Systems stipulated in Côte d'Ivoire decree n° 475 governing donor-financed projects, (a) a financial controller and a public accountant (both from the Ministry of Finance) will be assigned to the new PIU; and (b) the project internal audit function will be managed by the General Inspectorate of Finance (IGF: *Inspection Générale des Finances*). Finally, the Ministry will be required to submit (a) an annual work plan and budget (AWPB) not later than November 30 of the year preceding the year the AWPB will be operative; (b) quarterly interim unaudited financial statements (IFRs); and (c) audited annual financial statements (e.g., audit reports prepared by independent external auditors).

87.   **A designated account (DA) managed by the Directorate of Debt (DGTCP: *Direction Générale du Trésor et de la Comptabilité Publique*) will be opened at the central bank**. A project account (PA), managed by the public accountant assigned to the PIU, will be opened in a commercial bank under conditions acceptable to the World Ban and will be used to pay for all expenditures related to Components 1, 2, and 3. IDA funds will be transferred through memoranda of understanding (or PBCs) to other agencies, such as universities undertaking project activities, so that they can pay expenditures directly. University FM capacities will be assessed before funds are transferred from the DA/PA to the commercial bank accounts opened by universities and other implementing entities. Interest on the PA will be deposited into a commercial bank subaccount and used according to the FM procedures manual.

Procurement

88. **Guidelines:** Procurement for the project will conform to the World Bank's *Procurement Regulations for Borrowers*, as revised in November 2017.

89. **Procurement documents:** Procurement would use the Bank's Standard Bidding Documents (SBD) for all international competitive bidding (ICB) for goods and works and for Standard Requests for Proposal (RFPs) to select consultants through competitive procedures. The recipient will draft standard documents based on the Bank's SBDs for national competitive bidding (NCB) for goods and works and the Bank's RFP for consultants recruited through methods other than quality and cost-based selection (QCBS), with any modifications submitted to the IDA for prior approval.

90. **Procurement Framework:** Procurement and consultant selection methods, the need for prequalification, estimated costs, prior review requirements, and schedule will be agreed as needed between the recipient and the Bank in the Procurement Plan aligned with the Procurement Project Strategy for Development (PPSD). The plan will be updated at least annually or as required to reflect actual project needs at the time and improvements in institutional capacity.

91. **Procurement risk is assessed as Substantial because the Ministry and tertiary institutions have no experience with Bank-financed projects.** Project procurement will be managed both centrally at the Ministry and at the universities and INPHB. It was realized during the project preparation assessment that the Ministry, the universities, and the INPHB are not familiar with Bank procurement procedures, although each has a Directorate for Financial Affairs (DAF) to manage procurement following national procedures. The Ministry will be responsible for procuring major works, goods, services, and consultants, and the universities and INPHB will be responsible for PBC procurement activities; the manual of procedures will establish the categories and the maximum amounts for those procurements.

92. **To address the risks, the PIU at the Ministry will manage procurement generally and participating universities and the INPHB will each create a unit to manage project activities, including procurement.** The project will finance (a) recruiting consultants for elaboration of an administrative, procurement, accounting, and financial procedures manual, and PCB implementation; (b) purchase of equipment; (c) training staff and technical experts working on the project in World Bank basic procurement procedures, and (d) recruiting a procurement specialist for the PIU and one such specialist for each site.

C. Safeguards

Environmental Safeguards

93. **Côte d'Ivoire Higher Education Project activities are expected to provide environmental benefits to people in the project area**, among them better waste management, improvement in health and sanitation conditions, and the safety of students, teachers, and staff. Among negative impacts could be loss of vegetation, production of solid waste, risks of soil erosion and pollution, water and air pollution due to dust, risks of construction and traffic accidents, and noise nuisance.

94. **The project, rated as category B, triggers three safeguards policies:** OP 4.01 " Environmental Assessment," OP 4.11 "Physical Cultural Resources," and OP 4.12 "Involuntary Resettlement." To address the potential negative impact, the government is preparing two safeguards instruments, an Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) and a Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF).

95. The ESMF outlines a process for environmental and social screening of project activities. It contains Guidelines for an Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA); Environmental Guidelines for Contractors and subcontractors; and a summary of World Bank safeguard policies. Chapters will take into account matters related to physical and cultural resources matters, and similar guidance will be included in the ESMF.

96. The ESMF was prepared in full compliance with national laws and regulations and World Bank safeguard policies, including broad consultation with all relevant stakeholder groups, both public and private, and civil society. After consultations, the ESMF was circulated within Côte d'Ivoire on September, 2018 and was published at the World Bank website on September, 2018.

97. Specific details will be prepared during investment activities for contractors who will bring in workers and operators from outside the area, who are likely to be housed in work camps during construction. The project will establish guidance and rules for contractors, and worker contracts will include measures for managing the potential impact of an outside workforce on the local community.

98. To ensure that safeguard instruments prepared in line with policies triggered by the project are carried out properly, the PIU will hire an environmental and a social safeguards specialist. The environmental safeguards specialist must have experience in environmental/occupational health and safety (EHS/OHS) , and the social specialist in gender-based violence (GBV), social inclusion, and any other labor-related risk. Both specialists will be fully in charge of all aspects of the project related to their areas and will regularly monitor all safeguard requirements. In particular, the two specialists, the PIU, the implementing entities, and the other stakeholders will ensure that children are not employed. World Bank support missions will also have environmental and social safeguards specialists to ensure that all such issues are addressed properly and promptly.

99. The Financing Agreement will require that the government submit to the Bank for prior approval and disclosure any required ESIAs in accordance with the ESMF for the activities proposed. Finally, the government, through the PIU, will report quarterly to the World Bank through an environmental Safeguard Monitoring Report and each report will be summarized in the periodic project progress reports

Social Safeguards

100. ***Involuntary Resettlement, OP/BP 4.12.*** Although the project's ultimate social impacts are expected to be positive, some expected activities may involve land acquisitions that would lead to involuntary resettlement. The construction of training institutes will require land acquisition that would lead to negative adverse such as restrict access to livelihoods for some individual or group people. As the specific sites or impacts of physical investments are not yet known, the borrower was developed a Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF) as part of a due diligence required by the OP4.12. The RPF was consulted upon, approved

and disclosed both within the country and on the World Bank external website, on September 25, 2018. The RPF will be used as a guide to elaborate any needed RAPs that must be submitted to the Bank for approval prior payment of compensation and the commencement of any civil works.

101. *Labor Influx.* To ensure proper management of potential labor immigrants, the project will establish clear rules as part of the ESMF for workers' contract to ensure that they include measures for managing the possible impacts of outside workers on the local community; contractors who bring in employees must meet specific conditions, such as housing workers in adequate camps. To protect local host communities, preparation and active management of an HIV/AIDS prevention plan will be among the contractual obligations. Contractors will also be required to institute codes of conduct for their workers and related measures to mitigate the possibility of GBV in project sites; supervision missions will closely scrutinize their compliance.

102. *Citizen Engagement,* which was taken into account in the project preparation phase, will be maintained where relevant throughout the project. All stakeholders in education and vocational training, the public sector, and civil society, will be consulted on the objectives of the project and the conditions for its success. Citizen engagement will be monitored, e.g., through surveys of beneficiary satisfaction with project interventions. The project will also establish robust mechanisms to ensure that feedback triggers responses. Regular supervision missions and the social safeguard specialists to be recruited will monitor compliance.

103. World Bank implementing support missions will include a social safeguards specialist to ensure that the social including safeguards issues are addressed properly, in a timely manner.

F. Project location and Salient physical characteristics relevant to the safeguard analysis (if known)

The project is nationwide.

G. Environmental and Social Safeguards Specialists on the Team

Abdoul Wahabi Seini, Social Specialist
Fatoumata Diallo, Social Specialist
Abdoulaye Gadiere, Environmental Specialist

SAFEGUARD POLICIES THAT MIGHT APPLY

Safeguard Policies	Triggered?	Explanation (Optional)
Environmental Assessment OP/BP 4.01	Yes	The project will finance the setting up of one or two public Technology Institutes. That means civil work will be part of the project with potential adverse

		impacts on Environment. However, it is expected that those impacts be moderate, site specific and reversible. As future investments sites are unknown to date, an Environmental and Social Management Framework(ESMF) was developed by the borrower. Thereafter, that ESMF was reviewed, consulted upon and disclosed within Cote d'Ivoire and at the World bank's web site on September 25, 2018.
Performance Standards for Private Sector Activities OP/BP 4.03	No	The project does not trigger this policy.
Natural Habitats OP/BP 4.04	No	The project does not involve natural habitats
Forests OP/BP 4.36	No	The project does not involve forest
Pest Management OP 4.09	No	The project does not involve pest management
Physical Cultural Resources OP/BP 4.11	Yes	Activities supported by the ongoing bank's funded operation such as classrooms construction will unquestionably involve excavations with possibilities to underscore Physical cultural resources. However, the triggering of this policy does not entail the preparation of a specific safeguard instrument. To provide guidance in case physical cultural resources will be discovered, a specific chapter was developed and included in the ESMF
Indigenous Peoples OP/BP 4.10	No	There are no Indigenous People as defined by the Bank's policy
Involuntary Resettlement OP/BP 4.12	Yes	The project will contribute to strengthening the institutional environment of higher education by setting up one or two public technological institutes. At this stage of preparation of the project, the sites of realization of these investments are not known. Thus, the establishment of such institutes could involve land acquisitions that may lead to involuntary resettlement of populations and / or restrictions on access to resources and sources of income or livelihoods. Therefore, to anticipate these negative social impacts, a Policy Framework for Resettlement (RPF) was prepared by the Client. The document was reviewed, consulted and publicly disclosed within Côte d'Ivoire and on the World Bank website the same date, on September 25, 2018.
Safety of Dams OP/BP 4.37	No	The project will not finance dams nor rely on dams.
Projects on International Waterways OP/BP 7.50	No	The project is not expected to affect international waterways.
Projects in Disputed Areas OP/BP 7.60	No	The project will not be located in a Disputed Area.

KEY SAFEGUARD POLICY ISSUES AND THEIR MANAGEMENT

A. Summary of Key Safeguard Issues

1. Describe any safeguard issues and impacts associated with the proposed project. Identify and describe any potential large scale, significant and/or irreversible impacts:

The adverse environmental impacts associated with the project activities, especially Component 1 are inter-alia the loss of plant species, the production of waste, the risks of soil pollution, surface water and air pollution, involuntary resettlement, risks of work and traffic accidents, health risks, social conflicts between local populations and companies' employees coming from other regions or cities due to non-recruitment of local populations , noise nuisance, the risks of gender-based violence (GBV) involving minor girls, poor widows.

With respect to health, the mismanagement of the toilets of these future infrastructures could lead to the proliferation of certain vectors of diseases whose propagation could quickly be out of control considering the public character as well as the negligence of the students in the matter of hygiene and protection against diseases.

The project's overall social impacts are expected to be positive. However, some activities may generate adverse social impacts because of land acquisition or restriction of access to resources used by the population.

2. Describe any potential indirect and/or long term impacts due to anticipated future activities in the project area:

No potential indirect or long term impacts are foreseen.

3. Describe any project alternatives (if relevant) considered to help avoid or minimize adverse impacts.

N/A

4. Describe measures taken by the borrower to address safeguard policy issues. Provide an assessment of borrower capacity to plan and implement the measures described.

The project was rated as EA category" B" and triggers three (0) safeguards policies which are OP/BP 4.01; OP/BP4.11, and OP/PB 4.12. Because the exact geographic locations are not yet determined with certainty, the Government has prepared an Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) and a Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF) in compliance with the core requirements of the triggered safeguards policies: OP/BP 4.01 (Environmental Assessment), and OP/BP 4.12 (Involuntary Resettlement).

The ESMF lays out procedures for screening and mitigating impacts from construction and operation of the irrigation schemes, and includes the following: (a) checklists of potential environmental and social impacts and their sources; (b) procedures for participatory screening of proposed sites and activities and the environmental and social considerations; (c) procedures for assessing potential environmental and social impacts of the planned project activities; (d) institutional arrangements for mitigating, preventing, and managing the identified impacts; (e) typical environmental management planning process for addressing negative externalities in the course of project implementation; (f) a system for monitoring the implementation of mitigation measures; and (g) recommended capacity building measures for environmental planning and monitoring of project activities.

The RPF document outlines the principles and procedures for resettlement and or compensation of subproject-affected people, and establishes standards for identifying, assessing and mitigating negative impacts of program supported activities. In addition, the RPF will guide the preparation and implementation of RAPs for each individual sub project that triggers the involuntary resettlement policy. That specific RAP will be prepared for relevant activities

before the civil works commence on the ground.

A Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) was set up to allow stakeholders and interested parties to bring up any concern regarding the project to the PIU with the aim of finding a solution.

Safeguards documents include guidelines on Occupational, Health and Safety(EHS/OHS), and clearly mention that the Works- Environmental and Social Management Plan (Works-ESMP) must be approved by the PIU and their partners prior to the works commencement. Moreover, the bidding documents and the contracts for main contractors as well as the sub-contractors must also include sections related to EHS/OHS.

With respect to potential labor influx, the project will establish guidance and rules for (i) contractors to enhance the ESMPs and workers contracts will include measures for managing the potential impacts of such an outside workforce on the local community. Specific details will be prepared during the investment activities for contractors who will bring in workers and operators from outside the area, and these are likely to be housed in work camps during construction.

To ensure that the safeguard instruments prepared in line with policies triggered by the project are implemented properly, the PIU will hire an environmental safeguard specialist and a social safeguards specialist. The environmental safeguards specialist must have additional experience in EHS/OHS, and the social safeguards specialist in GBV, Social inclusion and any labor related risk. Both specialists will be fully in charge of all aspects of environmental and social safeguards aspects and will regularly monitor all safeguard requirements. More specifically, the two specialists, the whole PIU, the implementing agencies as well as the other stakeholders will ensure that children are not employed in civil works as labor force.

World Bank implementing support missions will also include environmental and social safeguards specialists to ensure that all safeguard issues are addressed properly, in a timely manner.

5. Identify the key stakeholders and describe the mechanisms for consultation and disclosure on safeguard policies, with an emphasis on potentially affected people.

The key stakeholders are the populations, the Ministry of Education and its relevant departments, the NGOs, etc. One of the key principles of this project from the outset was to foster participation of all relevant stakeholders. This approach will be sustained throughout project implementation. The environmental and social assessment studies, namely the ESMF and the RPF, were carried out according to the same principle, using broad-based public consultation approach, involving the above stakeholder groups. The objective was to raise awareness of project activities and impacts and foster ownership on their part. All the relevant bodies have been adequately informed of the Project. Concerns of the communities and some details of consultations have been taken into account in the body of the report and other results provided as Annexes in the ESMF and the RPF. The key concerns raised during the consultation process included: (i) permanent information and sensitization of the population, (ii) compensation process for those impacted by the project, (iii) participation of local population as employees on works they qualify for, etc. All these concerns have been addressed in the alternatives proposed through the ESMF and the RPF.

B. Disclosure Requirements

Environmental Assessment/Audit/Management Plan/Other

Date of receipt by the Bank	Date of submission for disclosure	For category A projects, date of distributing the Executive Summary of the EA to the Executive Directors
18-Jun-2018	25-Sep-2018	

"In country" Disclosure

Resettlement Action Plan/Framework/Policy Process

Date of receipt by the Bank	Date of submission for disclosure
18-Jun-2018	25-Sep-2018

"In country" Disclosure

C. Compliance Monitoring Indicators at the Corporate Level (to be filled in when the ISDS is finalized by the project decision meeting)

OP/BP/GP 4.01 - Environment Assessment

Does the project require a stand-alone EA (including EMP) report?
Yes
If yes, then did the Regional Environment Unit or Practice Manager (PM) review and approve the EA report?
Yes
Are the cost and the accountabilities for the EMP incorporated in the credit/loan?
Yes

OP/BP 4.11 - Physical Cultural Resources
Does the EA include adequate measures related to cultural property?
Yes
Does the credit/loan incorporate mechanisms to mitigate the potential adverse impacts on cultural property?
Yes

OP/BP 4.12 - Involuntary Resettlement

Has a resettlement plan/abbreviated plan/policy framework/process framework (as appropriate) been prepared?
Yes
If yes, then did the Regional unit responsible for safeguards or Practice Manager review the plan?
Yes

The World Bank Policy on Disclosure of Information

Have relevant safeguard policies documents been sent to the World Bank for disclosure?
Yes

Have relevant documents been disclosed in-country in a public place in a form and language that are understandable and accessible to project-affected groups and local NGOs?
Yes

All Safeguard Policies

Have satisfactory calendar, budget and clear institutional responsibilities been prepared for the implementation of measures related to safeguard policies?
Yes

Have costs related to safeguard policy measures been included in the project cost?
Yes

Does the Monitoring and Evaluation system of the project include the monitoring of safeguard impacts and measures related to safeguard policies?
Yes

Have satisfactory implementation arrangements been agreed with the borrower and the same been adequately reflected in the project legal documents?
Yes

CONTACT POINT

World Bank

Patrick Philippe Ramanantoanina
Senior Education Specialist

Borrower/Client/Recipient

Republic of Côte d'Ivoire

Implementing Agencies

Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research
Aka Fulgence Nindjin
Director of Higher Education
nindjinaka_fulgence@hotmail.com

FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT

The World Bank
1818 H Street, NW
Washington, D.C. 20433
Telephone: (202) 473-1000
Web: http://www.worldbank.org/projects

APPROVAL

Task Team Leader(s):	Patrick Philippe Ramanantoanina

Approved By

Safeguards Advisor:		
Practice Manager/Manager:	Meskerem Mulatu	11-Oct-2018
Country Director:	Pierre Laporte	15-Oct-2018