

Public Disclosure Authorized

STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN
SINDH EARLY LEARNING ENHANCEMENT THROUGH
CLASSROOM TRANSFORMATION
(SELECT)

March 05 2020

Contents

List of Acronyms..... 3

1. Introduction/Project Description..... 4

2. Summary of Previous Stakeholder Activities 6

3. Stakeholder Identification and Analysis..... 7

4. Stakeholder Engagement..... 30

5. Roles, Responsibilities, and Resources for Stakeholder Engagement Plan 43

6. Grievance Mechanism 44

7. Monitoring and Reporting 45

List of Acronyms

ASC	Annual School Census
CE	Citizen Engagement
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
CPM	Chief Program Manager
DCAR	Directorate of Curriculum, Assessment, and Research
DDMA	District Disaster Management Authority
DEOs	District Education Officer
DSE	Directorate of School Education
DTG M&E	Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation
EGRA	Early Grade Reading Assessment
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GBV	Gender Based Violence
HDI	Human Development Index
HMs	Head Masters/Mistresses
IDI	In-Depth Interview
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OIPs	Other Interested Parties
OOSC	Out of School Children
PD&F	Planning Department and Finance
PDMA	Provincial Disaster Management Authority
PITE	Provincial Institute of Training and Education
POM	Project Orientation Manual
RSU	Reform Support Unit
SELD	Sindh Education and Literacy Department
SELECT	Sindh Early Learning Enhancement Through Classroom Transformation
SEPA	Sindh Environment Protection Agency
SEP	Stakeholder Engagement Plan
SMC	School Management
STEDA	Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority
TA	Technical Assistance
TEOs	<i>Taluka</i> Education Officer
TTI	Teacher Training Institute
UC	Union Council
WASH	Water, Sanitation, and Hygiene
WB	World Bank

1. Introduction

1.1 Project Description

Sindh Early Learning Enhancement through Classroom Transformation (SELECT) is a five-year US\$ 129.99 million project. Sindh Education and Literacy Department (SELD) is the implementing agency. The project offers a multipronged approach to aligning school-level factors that will lead to improvement in the quality of teaching and learning practices for grades 1 through 3 in public schools across Sindh. An overwhelming majority of the children enrolled in public schools in rural Sindh belong to lower socio-economic classes. The project has four components as illustrated in Table 1.1.

Table 1: Project Components

Components	Sub Components
Component 1: Transforming teaching practices in the early grades	1.1 Implementation of a Continuous Professional Development (CPD) model for improved literacy skills in the early grades 1.2 Behavioral Nudges for Improved Learning
Component 2: Developing an effective learning environment	2.1 School Upgradation to Elementary Schools
Component 3: Improving system capacity for better school leadership and management support	3.1 Establishing a technology-based student attendance monitoring system 3.2 Capacity building for school leadership and local education office management to mitigate student dropout
Component 4: Technical assistance and project management	4.1 Technical assistance for institutional strengthening 4.2 Monitoring and Evaluation and project management

1.2 Project Objective

The development objective is to improve reading and math skills of early grade primary students and support student retention in primary schools in the following 10 select districts:

Table 2: List of Pre-Selected Target Districts, Regions, and Number of Primary Teachers

	Districts	Regions	Number of Primary School Teachers
1	Kashmore	Larkana	2,559
2	Ghotki	Sukkur	2,764
3	Tando Muhammad Khan	Hyderabad	1,228
4	Badin	Hyderabad	3,256
5	Jacobabad	Larkana	3,482
6	Mirpur Khas	Mirpurkhas	3,172
7	Sujawal	Hyderabad	2,924
8	Thatta	Hyderabad	
9	Sanghar	Shaheed Benazirabad	5,053
10	Tharparkar	Mirpurkhas	-

1.4 Summary of Potential Environment Impacts

The proposed Project is to be implemented in ten selected districts¹ of Sindh, which have been identified based on scoring across six indicators². Within these districts, schools in approximately 100 union councils (administrative planning unit of the lowest tier) will be specifically supported by the Project activities. Approximately 500 schools will be rehabilitated and will receive full package of interventions from all the project components. The rehabilitation activities would include refurbishing of existing classrooms and adding new classrooms to existing schools, provision of furniture, and adequate Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH) facilities. Where relevant, solar panels will also be added to meet the electricity demands. The remaining schools in the same union councils and/or districts will receive enhanced service provision through improved teacher training and administrative systems supported under components 1 and 3.

Major environmental issues common in the selected districts are health hazards stemming from a lack of access to safe drinking water and from poor sanitation and hygiene. The main factors associated with this environmental health risk are limited household water supply coverage, distance to the drinking water source, poor household water quality, limited treatment of drinking water at the point of use, limited access to sanitation facilities, and lack of hygiene. There is also no proper solid waste management system available in any of these districts. Seven out of ten selected districts (Jacobabad, Kashmore, Ghotki, Sanghar, Jamshoro, Thatta and Tando Muhammad Khan) are prone to risk of high floods, three (Badin, Thatta and Sajawal) are prone to risk of cyclones, while one (Tharparkar) is prone to

¹ Kashmore, Ghotki, Tando Muhammad Khan, Badin, Jacobabad, Mirpur Khas, Sujawal, Thatta, Sanghar, Tharparker

² (i) gross enrollment ratio (GER) in primary education, (ii) standard achievement test (SAT) scores of grade 5, (iii) gender parity index in enrollment rate, (iv) ratio of primary to elementary schools, (v) dropout rates from grade 5 to 6, and (vi) percentage of schools with 2 classrooms or less.

drought. Sindh Wildlife Department recognizes 13 game reserves and 45 wildlife sanctuaries exists across different districts of Sindh Province.

1.5 Summary of Potential Social Impacts

Primary social issues in the selected districts relate to labor and working conditions, community health and safety especially that of school children and staff, GBV in the form of sexual exploitation and harassment of school children, lady teachers and district-level female staff of School Education and Literacy Department (SELD), gender (boys versus girls education), and vulnerable people. Sindh is home to religious and ethnic minorities, with at least three of the selected districts having high Hindu and low caste populations. Students with disabilities are present across Sindh, and equity and inclusion challenges associated with targeting and selection of union councils are the major social risk associated with vulnerable groups needs to be considered. Rural union councils in all these zones/areas have low HDI scores and incomes, due to historical neglect and remoteness, which still remains the case. Most often, there is a tendency to ignore these areas due to their locations, low political influence and higher costs of engagement/transaction costs. This can be the case in this project unless mitigated through project design.

4 Summary of Previous Stakeholder Activities

Table 3: Previous Activities Under SELECT Preparation

S.N	Activity	Description
1	Sindh Education Sector Plan and Road Map – 34 th Meeting of the Local Education Group (LEG) 19 Aug 2019 Karachi	Briefing on Program Development Grant Proposal
2	Sindh Education Sector Plan Implementation Grant (ESPIG), Consultative Workshop 26 Sep 2019 Karachi	Details of program development procedure under GPE guidelines; Review of key sector indicators, current constraints and issues; Review of updated and endorsed priority programs in SESP&R 2019-23
3	School Education Sector Map and Road Map for Sindh – 36 th Meeting of the Local Education Group (LEG) 30th Jan 2020 Karachi	Briefing & Discussion on “Sindh Early Learning Enhancement through Classroom Transformation Project (SELECT)”
4	EdTech Consultation 4th Feb 2020 Karachi	Sessions focused on individualized student attendance and learning monitoring and digital solutions teacher training and reference resources. EDTech startups, SELD representatives, and development agencies participated

5	Innovative School Design workshop 6th Feb 2020 Karachi	Discussions on creating conducive learning environments to be implemented through Component 2. Sessions attended by architects, civil engineers, furniture suppliers, interior designers, Sindh Disaster Management Authority, development agencies, and SELD representatives
---	--	---

5 Stakeholder Identification and Analysis

For the purpose of the SEP, the term “affected parties” includes “those likely to be affected by the project because of actual impacts or potential risks to their physical environment, health, security, cultural practices, wellbeing, or livelihoods. These stakeholders may include individuals or groups, including local communities” (World Bank, 2018b). The “**Affected Parties**” in the SELECT context refer to all those stakeholders who are either involved in direct implementation of the project components, who are recipients of the project benefits, or/and those who are likely to be adversely impacted by it. Stakeholder mapping of project components and listing of implementing agencies and project beneficiaries in other components through secondary review of the project documents and initial consultations with the Reform Support Unit (RSU) have guided in identifying the stakeholders under this category.

The **Other Interested Parties (OIPs)** refer to individuals, groups, or organizations with an interest in the project, which may be because of the project location, its characteristics, or matters related to public interest. They may include regulators, government officials, the private sector, private academics, associations, educational organizations, and other civil society organizations. In the context of the project the relevant SELD’s “Allied Institutes,” local and international non-government organizations working independently or in conjunction with SELD on similar components within the selected districts, community based organizations representing minority groups as well as the environment protection authorities are being considered as OIPs. These stakeholders are not going to be directly responsible for execution of any project component. However, based on their experience and knowledge they can either assist in informed decision making for different components of SELECT or directly benefit from project activities for improved outcomes through collaboration. In some cases, due to lack of information about the project components, the OIPs can play a negative role in hindering the project progress.

Disadvantaged/vulnerable individuals or groups are potentially disproportionately affected and less able to benefit from opportunities offered by the project due to specific difficulties to access and/or understand information about the project and its environmental and social impacts and mitigation strategies. In this project **individuals or groups of individuals** who should be the direct beneficiaries of the project, but are at risk of being alienated/marginalized are vulnerable. Socio-cultural demand-side barriers combined with economic factors and supply-related issues (such as availability of school facility), together are likely to hamper enrolment and retention of certain marginalized groups, in particular girls, differently abled children and children of ethnic and religious minorities, in acquiring and continuing primary and secondary education. Annual school census reports by RSU of the past 3 years will be reviewed to identify trends for the vulnerable and disadvantaged groups, district and gender

wise. As this group consists of minors too, most effective and appropriate means of engagement needs will be determined in consultation with relevant parties during the course of SEP development.

5.1 Affected Parties

Table 4: Level of Impact on Affected Parties

S.N	Affected Party	Level of Impact
1	Primary students (1-5) and their parents	+ High: Will positively benefit through improved teaching pedagogies and availability of learning tools and improved facilities
2	Elementary students (6-8) and their parents	+ High: Expected to increase retention. Opportunity, especially for girls to continue education
3	Primary teachers	+ - High: Increased capacity and access to teaching resources for improved learning outcomes, but are unlikely to advance in career
4	Primary headmasters/mistresses	- High: In case of up gradation of “ hub schools,” there is a likelihood of transfers
5	Elementary headmasters/mistresses (HMs)	+ High: Fresh recruitment through third party and promotions of senior teachers to Grade 17 in this post
6	Taluka Education Officers (TEOs)	+ - High: Redefined roles and responsibilities for engagement on academic matters rather administrative.
7	District Education Officers (DEOs)	+ - High: Bifurcation of responsibilities between DEOs, Deputy DEOs, and TEOs will lead to result based management. Might cause displeasure and conflict over new roles
8	Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority (STEDA)	+ Moderate: Improved coordination between STEDA, PITE and TTIs
9	Provincial Institute of Training and Education (PITE)	+ High: PITE will lead in managing all the CPD activities in the field
10	Teacher Training Institutes (TTIs)	+ High: Strengthened through Public Private Partnerships
11	Directorate of Curriculum, Assessment, and Research (DCAR)	+ High: Increased implementation capacity and TA for establishing EGRA/EGMA instruments
12	Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation (DTG M&E)	+ Low to Moderate: Continue in its existing role
13	Directorate of School Education and Civil Works	+ High: Financial resources to undertake civil works in 300 hub schools and 600 satellite schools
14	Reform Support Unit	+ High: Technical assistance will strengthen SELD’s and implementing entities’ capacity through RSU
15	Provincial Disaster Management Authority, Sindh (PDMA)	+ High: Technical assistance for disaster proofing of school designs and on disaster zoning across the selected districts

5.1.1 Issues to be Addressed for Effective and Inclusive Engagement with Affected Parties

Based on primary consultations with teachers, HMs and Curriculum Wing some important points inferred are listed below:

- a) **Primary Teachers:** With limited space, inadequate facilities, over-sized classes, and multi-grade teaching, teachers are forced to enroll more students. In case of non-compliance they are threatened with transfers. This pressure has to be reduced amicably without affecting school and teacher's performance
- b) Teachers in public schools are given "Scheme of Studies" by Sindh Textbook Board, based on which they develop grade wise timetables. As majority of the primary schools in the selected districts are one to two classroom schools with single teachers, multi-grade teaching is a common practice. A single primary teacher is expected to cover syllabi of grades 1 to 5 simultaneously in approximately 125 academic days in a year. If Scheme of Studies for each syllabus of each grade is broken down it makes a total of 27 to 28 subjects with numerous chapters. Added to this, syllabus of Early Childhood Education (ECE) is combined with grade 1 syllabus. A cursory review of grade 1 text books show that progression from comprehension of letters, to reading, and ultimately writing is too swift for such an early grade. Teachers in FGDs bemoaned that learning outcomes are poor because they are bound to follow the Scheme of Studies that itself is flawed. **Before developing resource material and teaching aids Scheme of Studies needs to be reviewed and revised to factor in time and number of days required to explain concepts properly. Chapters designed should focus on reinforcing concepts rather than introducing new ones in quick successions**
- c) **Senior Teachers:** Many of the primary teachers are senior by age and close to retirement. They are likely to show disinterest in new pedagogies. It is important to identify, shortlist, and target young and new recruits for the CPD program. This will probably demonstrate the efficacy of the program in a shorter span and discourage negative discourse against it by senior staff within the system
- d) **Reporting and Communication between and amongst School Staff and Taluka/District Management:** Teachers and HMs though communicate with DEOs and TEOs through written application, phone calls, and WhatsApp messages. However, a formal system of filling and maintaining official correspondence is non-existent, making complaint tracking and handling obscure. In an FGD with HMs of Tando Mohammad Khan, all expressed dissatisfaction over DEOs' role in responding to their grievances and complaints
- e) **Teacher transfers** are a common practice. It is usually done at the behest of DEOs. HMs in most instances are not notified of these transfers in advance nor do have any powers to stop them. Allocating a replacement requires arcane procedures. In the project, if trained teachers are transferred, the entire "district center" can be adversely affected and would experience delays in devolving support to "cell schools".
- f) **Selection of Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators:** To date the CPD model has been implemented by different development organizations, like the British Council, Rupali Foundation etc. However, the process of nominating Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators varied. Where the British Council carried out their program, they themselves nominated Guide Teachers and

Subject Coordinators. In some instances TEOs directly made the nominations and in other instances HMs were asked to send their recommendations. In some cases HMs were not consulted when teachers were sent to trainings by TEOs or DEOs. Since Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators are to play a crucial role in devolving training at the Union Council (UC) level, it is important to standardize the selection process based on teachers' performance. At the same time, gender sensitivities in terms of training timings and personal security need to be factored in

- g) **TEOs and DEOs:** TEOs and DEOs Terms of Reference are being reviewed as part of SEP development. Each taluka has four TEOs. It is worth looking into how the roles of TEOs can be bifurcated by making two TEOs responsible for administrative and legal issues and the other two TEOs can be dedicated to academic matters

- h) **Teaching resource material development** involves several agencies. The Curriculum Wing develops the guidelines, DCAR and PITE draft content, STEDA accredits resource material, without which it cannot be formally used. Finally the Sindh Textbook Board publishes and distributes resource materials. Delays in the entire process are common without holding any agency responsible. The success of the project depends on making relevant teaching resource and aid materials timely available. To meet the stated challenges, it is important that all agencies engaged in this process collaborate and mutually decide on set timelines by developing annual plans and calendars.

3.2.2 Description of Affected Parties

Stakeholder Group	Identified Party	Key Characteristics	Needs/Issues	Preferred Notification and Frequency	Specific Needs
Affected Parties	Primary students (Grades 1-5) and their parents	Represent 42 percent of the student population in the selected districts at the primary level; mostly enrolled in one to two room schools and learning through multi grade system; belong mainly to lower socio-economic classes; One School Management Committee (SMC) consisting of parent members are required by law for each school in Sindh, which have been constituted to help improve school performance, spending enrollment etc.	Poor reading and numeracy skills; At risk of dropping out before completing primary education due to low interest in school activities; low levels of comprehension; Assessment tools in most cases redundant for timely intervention; No proper way of tracking and bringing back dropouts; SMCs are dysfunctional in most cases as the members are mostly unclear about their role and the Head Teacher (can be the HM or otherwise), takes all the decisions; SELECT may want to use these platforms for mobilizing communities for improved project results	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO representing children's rights <u>Operation Phase:</u> Participation of Children's Rights NGOs in LEG meetings; Annual meeting of SMCs	School in close proximity to home; Availability of basic infrastructure and furniture (chairs, desks, washrooms etc ; modern learning tools; libraries
	Elementary Students (Grades 6-8)	Represent 33 percent of the student population in the select districts at the elementary level;	The ratio of primary to elementary schools is 16:1 respectively; Enrolment of girls drastically drops at the elementary level; Outreach	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO representing children's rights	School in close proximity to home; Transport; Availability of

		belong mainly to lower socio-economic classes; SMCs are required for Elementary Schools as well	programs/mechanisms to encourage parents to enroll children, especially girls, in elementary do not exist or are very weak; Alternate economic uses of child labor also contribute; As in the case of primary schools, SMCs at the Elementary School level are mostly dysfunctional as well; They can play a critical role if mobilized and revitalized.	<u>Operation Phase:</u> Participation of Children's Rights NGOs in LEG meetings; Annual meeting of SMCs	basic infrastructure and furniture (chairs, desks, washrooms etc ; modern learning tools; libraries
Primary Teachers	27,788 primary teachers in the selected districts are on the payroll; minimum qualification requirement as of 2014 is graduate but majority of the in-service primary teachers were appointed in the late eighties and early nineties and are matriculated	Majority of the teacher appointments in the late eighties and early nineties were political; Qualification criterion of Intermediate in that period was flouted; Appointees of the eighties and nineties did not go through induction training and are now close to retirement; Number of teachers (in all 29 districts of Sindh) to be retired on superannuation between 2020 and 2026 is estimated at 27,738; In 2014-2015 new teachers were recruited through third party validation; New recruits are young graduates and more open to learning and capacity development; CPD model has yet to be affectively announced and rolled out in all project districts; Primary	<u>Design Phase:</u> 6 FGDs; Participation in Consultative Workshops <u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur Annual Training for different batches of teachers (can be at PITE or District TTI); Monthly review meetings of	Training aid materials; Transport facilities for teachers commuting from urban districts to schools in rural districts; TA/DA for participation in annual meetings and trainings; Refreshment budget for review and weekly meetings; Daytime training hours	

			teachers have repeatedly expressed that multi-grade teaching is ineffective and expectations of the existing curriculum are very high and unreasonable	Guide and Subject Coordinators at Hub schools; Bi-weekly meetings of Subject Coordinators and teachers at satellite schools; Weekly mentoring by Subject Coordinators to teachers at satellite schools	to ensure female teachers' participation
Primary Headmasters/Headmistresses (HMs)	# of hub/campus schools have notified HMs; hired at 17 Grade level; promotions are based on seniority	HMs need to play a more proactive role in implementing the student attendance monitoring program; Managing basic administration and school improvement in the new school clusters; Implementation of the CPD model; Managing student transfers from satellite to upgraded elementary schools and successful transition from Class 5 to 6; SMC annual fund amounts to PKR 22,000 regardless of school size and enrolment	<u>Design Phase:</u> 3 FGDs; Participation in Consultative Workshops <u>Operation Phase:</u> Quarterly review meetings with DEOs; monthly meetings with TEOs	Transport facilities for HMs commuting from urban districts to rural districts; Funds for school maintenance; Need to revise SMC funding based on enrolment	
Taluka Education Officers (TEOs)	Each taluka has 4 TEOs: 1 Primary School (Male), 1 Elementary and Secondary (Male), 1	A TEO can have up to 400 schools but lacks capacity to provide instructional guidance and professional development support to schools; TEOs are	<u>Design Phase:</u> 4 FGDs; Participation in Consultative Workshops	Transport allowance or vehicles to cover rural schools; Field	

		Primary School (Female), 1 Elementary and Secondary (Female);	likely to visit urban based schools and skip rural schools because of long distances; Need to develop capacity, supported by data to engage school administration, teachers and parents for retention to implement Component 3	<u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Monthly planning and review meetings on competitive selection of Guide Teachers and their progress with HMs at cluster hub/campus schools; Monthly reporting to DEOs	support; TA/DA for participation in Annual Project Planning Meetings; Refreshment budget for planning and review meetings; Daytime sessions to ensure participation of female TEOs
	District Education Officers	Present in all districts; each district has 2 DCOs: 1 Primary School, 1 Elementary and Higher Secondary	DEOs can have up to 2500 schools; Their functions overlap with TEOs: They have dual responsibility of managing administrative and academic matters, but most of their time and energy are spent on administrative and legal issues; No joint or collective sessions with school heads and teachers for problem solving; Need to	<u>Design Phase:</u> 5 IDIs; Participation in Consultative Workshops <u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur;	Better communication channels especially with DTG M&E to manage updates of teacher transfers in DTG M&E system;

			build their capacity to engage school administration to timely intervene for retention of students, especially girls as required in Component 3; Trouble getting teacher transfers updated on DTG M&E system	Bi-annual Review Meetings at Divisional Headquarters; Quarterly review meetings of DEOs with primary teachers/HMs, 4 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Quarterly meetings with HMs, PITE, and TTIs for selection and training of Guide Teachers and Subject Coordinators	Instituting proper reporting system; Refreshment budget for meetings
	Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority (STEDA)	A sub-institute of SELD; reports directly to Secretary Education; accrediting body for all teacher resource and learning materials; learning manuals and modules by PITE and TTIs have to be first approved by STEDA;	STEDA has developed a CPD model and implemented projects including Pakistan Reading Program and Sindh Reading Program; Has to further develop the program to institutionalize it within the system; Needs to institute a sustainable training mechanism for pre-service and in-service training under Component 1	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Director STEDA; Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the project; 4 Annual	Notification of approved materials by STEDA as needed

				Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE and TTIs for planning and review of training;	
	Provincial Institute of Training and Education (PITE)	Located in Nawabshah with a segregated hostel capacity of 250; responsible for training in-service teachers	PITE primarily provides training to in-service teachers; Needs to work in close coordination with STEDA and TTIs in arranging and facilitating training as articulated in Component 1	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 Telephonic Interview with Director PITE; Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE and TTIs for planning and review of training;	Monetary remuneration for Master Trainers; TA/DA for Master Trainers; TA/DA for participation in annual and review meetings

Teacher Training Institutes TTIs	25 TTIs are spread across Sindh, one in almost each district; offer 2 years of Associate Degree in Education. It makes students eligible for Junior Elementary in official Grade 14; 4 years of B.Ed Honours. This makes students eligible for appointment in senior elementary in Grade 16; affiliated with Karachi University, Sindh University, Khairpur and Benazirabad Universities	Training of teachers has to be delivered through the Master Trainers of TTIs using the course content developed within the project; Master Trainers will be responsible for building capacity of “Guide Teachers” and “Subject Coordinators”; Capacity development of TTIs is needed through Public Private Partnerships;	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 4 In-Depth Interviews with TTI Principals; Participation in Consultative Workshops</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE and TTIs for planning and review of training;</p>	Monetary remuneration for Master Trainers; TA/DA for Master Trainers
Directorate of Curriculum, Assessment, and Research (DCAR)	Preparation of Scheme of Studies; Development and review of curricula; in-service training of Master Trainers; Development of Teacher Guides, Lesson Plans, Test items;	Need to timely develop learning aid and resource materials students and teachers; Needs technical assistance in establishing Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA) instruments and developing their implementation capacity	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Director DCAR</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the</p>	To be decided in detailed consultations

				project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE and TTIs for planning and review of training;	
Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation (DTG M&E)	Present in all districts; collects thumb impressions of school staff; maintains data on teachers	Currently, the DG of M&E leads biometric teacher attendance monitoring and regular school visits for the purpose of checks and balances; Under Component 3 DTG M&E will manage app-generated student attendance reports to be used by DEOs and TEOs to plan targeted visits to at-risk students		<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Director DTG M&E <u>Operation Phase:</u> Monthly reporting	New Tablets; Training in developing, managing and upgrading M&E apps
Directorate of School Education & Civil Works	Responsible for construction activities	Construction and rehabilitation of schools as part of Component 2 might interfere with academic activities; Improper safeguards can make construction sites hazardous		<u>Design Phase:</u> Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> As needed	To be decided in detailed consultations
Reform Support Unit	Su-institute of SELD; responsible for project implementation, financial management; and M&E activities	Require technical assistance in implementing the project		<u>Design Phase:</u> 2 IDIs; meetings as required; Participation in Consultative workshops	Technical Assistance (TA)

				<p><u>Operation Phase:</u> 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad; participation in quarterly meetings; monthly updates on websites; development of project material as required</p>	
	Provincial Disaster Management Authority, Sindh (PDMA)	Implement policies and plans for disaster management in the province; examines the construction and ensure compliance of such standards	Needs to assist district and school authorities in disaster preparedness and responsiveness	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Director PDMA</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> Annual Reviews</p>	To be decided in detailed consultations

5.2 Other Interested Parties (OIPs)

Engagement with the listed stakeholders is to be done through IDIs with senior management of the organizations or those directly engaged in implementation of relevant activities under SELECT. These include relevant government departments and development agencies and NGOs as given below. The Design Phase of SEP includes consultation. In the Operation Phase engagement will continue in the Local Education Group (LEG) meetings as well as in other events as required by RSU.

Table 5: Level of Impact on OIPs

S.N	Other Interested Parties	Level of Impact
1	The British Council	+ Moderate: CPD implementation knowledge and experience
2	Sindh Education Foundation (SEF)	+ Moderate: Has high enrolment functioning schools in the select districts
3	The Citizens Foundation	+ Moderate: Has functioning schools and strong teachers' training program and modules
4	Sindh Text Book Board	+ -ve High Responsible for publishing and distributing textbooks. Disagreement with changes suggested and slow/untimely distribution can adversely impact learning outcomes; opposite of the same can be an opportunity
5	Curriculum Wing	-ve High: Develops guidelines for content of curriculum and teachers' resource materials
6	Sindh Environment Protection Agency (SEPA)	+ High: SEPA is responsible to monitor construction impacts on the environment

5.2.1 Issues to be Addressed for Effective and Inclusive Engagement with Affected Parties

Based on secondary research, discussions with RSU and Curriculum Wing and informal meetings with HMs of schools in Hyderabad the following concerns need to be addressed:

- a) The first three organizations are autonomous and independent of SELD. Their setups and systems are more advanced and organized and do not require assistance from SELD. The implementing agency needs to be proactive in reaching out to them for technical advice and support
- b) In 2007 the National Textbooks and Learning Materials Policy and Plan of Action was introduced by Government of Sindh to produce quality textbooks through a competitive process among private sector publishers. Due to a number of factors including uncertainties within Provincial Textbook Boards about their future role, the textbooks for the new curriculum could not be introduced till Academic Year 2012-13. Although the project does not directly engage Sindh Text Book Board, but this agency is responsible for printing and publishing of text books and resource materials. Timelines for making printed materials available need to be stringently followed

3.3.2: Description of Other Interested Parties

Stakeholder Group	Identified Party	Key Characteristics	Needs/Issues	Preferred Notification and Frequency	Specific Needs
Other Interested Parties	The British Council	International organization for cultural relations and education opportunities; has undertaken educational projects in urban and rural Sindh	The British Council has already supported in the implementation of the CPD model in some districts of Sindh and Punjab; has resource material and planning documents; the project can benefit from their knowledge and experience in planning activities and timelines	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with CPD Project Staff</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> LEG; As needed</p>	To be decided in detailed consultations
	Sindh Education Foundation	Sub Institute of SELD; operates SELD's schools in target districts	SEF is running multiple programs in the project districts, like Adopt a School Program and SEF Assisted Schools. Their experience in restructuring can offer tried and tested models and examples in defining expectations from teachers, introducing ICT Based methods, and set up of Early Childhood systems. Some of their schools are adopted SELD schools and can be selected first for demonstrating project outcomes	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Executive Director SEF</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> LEG; As needed</p>	To be decided in detailed consultations

	The Citizens Foundation	Not for Profit Organization providing quality education to the underprivileged; purpose built campuses; 1567 school units with 252,000 enrolment all over Pakistan	TCF has all female faculty and 50 percent student gender ratio; their customized textbooks and in depth teacher training reflect in assessments; their resource material can be looked into or used in the project for CPD	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with CEO TCF <u>Operation Phase:</u> LEG; As needed	To be decided in detailed consultations
	Sindh Textbook Board	Based in Hyderabad; development, printing, and publication of textbooks from grades I to XII	Has delayed publishing and printing of curriculum and resource materials in the past;	<u>Design Phase:</u> Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> As needed	To be decided in detailed consultations
	Curriculum Wing	Sub Institute of SELD; provides guidelines for curriculum and resource material development	It is a one-person set-up; needs to work in close coordination with DCAR, PITE and STEDA to give feedback and develop timely resource materials;	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with Advisor; Participation in Consultative Workshop <u>Operation Phase:</u> As needed	To be decided in detailed consultations
	Sindh Environment Protection Agency	Responsible to implement the Pakistan Environmental Protection Act, 1997	Project needs to coordinate effectively with SEPA for compliance to provincial environment standards	<u>Design Phase:</u> Participation in Consultative Workshop	To be decided in detailed consultations

				<u>Operation</u> <u>Phase:</u> As needed	
--	--	--	--	--	--

5.3 Disadvantaged / Vulnerable Individuals or Groups

Disadvantaged in this context refers to individuals or groups of individuals who should be the direct beneficiaries of the project, but are at risk of being alienated. Socio-cultural demand-side barriers combined with economic factors and supply-related issues (such as availability of school facility), together are likely to hamper enrolment and retention of certain marginalized groups, in particular girls and differently abled children in acquiring and continuing primary and secondary education. Similarly religious minorities and female teachers are at risk of being sidelined. NGOs like School of Leadership Foundation, Primary School Teachers Association, Kiran Foundation, Karachi Down Syndrome Program, Pakistan Institute for Labor Research, Thardeep Foundation, Sahil Foundation, and Aurat Foundation are working with the identified groups in various capacity. The first four NGOs have been contacted for their feedback and IDIs with the remaining are scheduled in March 2020.

Table 6: Level of Impact on Disadvantaged/Vulnerable Groups

S.N	Disadvantaged Groups	Level of Impact
1	Out of School Children (OOSC)	-ve High: Many likely to be excluded because of their poor socio-economic status and limited schools
2	Differently Abled Children	-ve High: Lack of facilities and services for specific learning needs
3	In School Children	-ve High: No checks and balances on physical and sexual abuse
4	Religious and Ethnic Minorities	-ve High: Low caste Hindus and ethnic groups of <i>haris</i> (farm labour) are discriminated against
5	Female school staff	-ve High: No effective mechanisms on reporting harassment and abuse

3.3.1 Issues to be Addressed for Effective and Inclusive Engagement with Affected Parties

- a) The world's second-highest numbers of out-of-school children (OOSC) are in Pakistan. It is estimated that 22.8 million children aged 5-16 are not attending school, representing 44 per cent of the total population in this age group³.
- b) Interventions on including differently abled persons in mainstream systems are limited in urban areas and non-existent in rural ones.
- c) On-campus physical and sexual harassment against minors (boys and girls) is assumed to be rampant, however, grossly unreported. Civil society considers it to be one of the main reasons for early drop outs.
- d) Tharparkar has the highest Hindu population in Sindh and Pakistan, and has second highest number of non-functional and ghost schools⁴ in Pakistan (858). Thatta is one of the lowest HDI in Pakistan, is

³ <https://www.unicef.org/pakistan/education>

⁴ Ghost schools refer to schools which exist on paper but the infrastructure is either not physically present or the building is used for other purposes

home to coastal and estuarine fishing communities, suffering severely from fish-stoke shortage, polluted shoreline and shortage of freshwater. Thatta has the highest number of non-functional and ghost schools in Pakistan (897). (Source: Alif Ailan)

- e) Sujawal, Thatta, Tharparker, Tando Muhammad Khan fall “very low” on HDI. This implies low enrolment, stunted children, ghost schools, low skilled teachers, dilapidated school infrastructure barring basic facilities, whereby girl children, lady teachers and girls school are further disadvantaged.
- f) No means of counseling or therapy exists for victims of abuse or trauma. Children experiencing bullying and abuse are likely to skip school or drop out. CPD needs to include counselling training of teachers to manage students experiencing different levels of harassment and abuse; sessions for students on good and bad ‘touching’, and intervention strategies also need to be conducted with students and their parents through Parent Teacher School Councils, or any other means.
- g) Although incidents of GBV in schools are often reported on media and that there is an acknowledgement of their widespread occurrence, nonetheless quantitative data and evidence does not exist to support the claims. This is more due to socio-cultural taboo associated with anything related to sex, even if it is abuse, reporting it is considered shameful. Systemic analysis of abuses by stakeholders in positions of power is required to make grievance systems more effective.
- h) TCF schools operating in the same areas as SELD are reporting better girl enrolment (almost 50 percent) and retention. It is worth comparing the gender sensitivities employed by them to support retention, especially of girls in primary and elementary schools
- i) SELD is preparing a five-year strategic plan with key performance indicators and standard operating procedures to sensitize the Department on issues related to gender discrimination and equality; enhancing girl child enrolment; promotion of female staff of the department including lady teachers; and amendment to curriculum and syllabus to reflect gender issues in the entire education system. As SELECT reviews this strategic plan and supports the implementation of components relevant to the project objective, GBV action planning needs to be addressed.
- j) Many of the project districts are prone to natural disasters, like droughts, storms, and flooding. Schools are often used formally or informally to shelter animals or affected families. Guidelines need to be developed to ensure proper use of buildings and school resources in an event of a disaster or emergency to maintain structural integrity of the buildings.
- k) SEP will also provide guidance on citizen engagement activities especially with parents and families of the in-school and out of school children (of school going age) and will focus on suggestions for improving enrolment and retention. Citizen engagement activities will also include regular beneficiary feedback and community satisfaction surveys for the intervention schools, as per PDO indicator 12 of the Results Framework.

3.4.2 Description of Disadvantaged / Vulnerable Individuals or Groups

Stakeholder Group	Identified Party	Key Characteristics	Needs/Issues	Preferred Notification and Frequency	Specific Needs
Disadvantaged/ Vulnerable Individuals or Groups	Out of School Children and their parents	In Sindh around 80 percent of OOSC have never been to school; 20 percent are drop outs; children are from the poorest families	Girls make more than half of OOSC; majority of girls' parents do not allow them to study, while boys are mostly not willing to go to school; older children are more likely to be out of school as they participate economically in the household by earning wages as child labor; survival rate up till class five is 43 percent (<i>Source: Alif Ailan</i>); Targeted interventions, as envisaged in Component 3, by school and district administration can lower the risk of drop outs at primary levels, especially of girls	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> 2 IDIs with an NGO working with OOSC</p> <p><u>Operation Phase:</u> Annual recruitment campaigns by DEOs, TEOs, HMs and Teachers; Bi-annual CE activities</p>	Placards and campaign materials in native language
	Differently Abled Children and their parents	Differently abled persons make up 13.4 percent of the population	No provisions exist to include differently abled children in mainstream schools; appropriate learning materials not available; sensitization on how to behave around differently abled persons required	<p><u>Design Phase:</u> IDI with an NGO working with differently abled children</p> <p><u>Operation</u></p>	Sensitization materials incorporated in teaching aids to promote diversity and inclusion

				<u>Phase:</u> To be decided	
	In School Children (Primary)	Represent 42 percent of the student population in the select districts at the primary level; mostly enrolled in one to two classroom schools and learning through multi grade system Belong mainly to lower socio-economic classes	Civil society reports suggest physical and sexual abuse of minor boys and girls is rampant in schools; no hearing or action against perpetrators is taken; in multi-grade set ups instances of bullying by older children is high; GBV Action Plan needs to be prepared to safeguard children from predators, and to raise awareness and capacity of parents, teachers, village elders, etc. into responding and reporting GV cases;	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO working on Children's Rights <u>Operation Phase:</u> Classroom annual/bi-annual training on sexual abuse prevention	Developing age appropriate awareness materials on sexual abuse prevention in local language
	Children and parents of Religious and Ethnic Minorities	13.56 percent of Sindh's rural population is Hindu; At least two of the 10 districts has major Hindu population; Haari's across the 10 districts and all Sindh are mostly <i>Kohlis</i> and <i>Bheels</i> (low castes); there are Christian communities residing in these districts as well (check numbers)	Majority of the select districts fall under low or very low HDI where the Hindu and Christian children, and children of low castes are discriminated against; in some cases, schools deny admission to underprivileged children due to bias of the teachers themselves, majority community pressures, etc.; there have been incidences reported where the low caste children were deputed by teachers to clean the schools, wash the toilets, etc. which are otherwise considered 'not worthy' of the Muslim and/or	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO working on religious and ethnic minorities <u>Operation Phase:</u> CE activities	To be decided in detailed consultation

			higher tribe children; SELECT needs to pay heed to these discriminations, and find practical and relevant solutions		
	Female Staff	There is a total of 77,811 primary school teachers out of which 20,681 are female	Cases of on job harassment not reported; a robust GBV Action Plan needs to be developed which will not only address how to minimize GBV but also guide SELECT on responding and reporting on GBV cases	<u>Design Phase:</u> 1 IDI with an NGO working on Women's Rights <u>Operation Phase:</u> To be decided	Transport for female teachers and TEOs commuting from urban districts to rural districts

4 Stakeholder Engagement

Stakeholder engagement activities need to continue throughout the project life, and need to keep specific stakeholder groups updated on relevant information imperative for transparency and disclosure, successful implementation of project activities, provision of means to exchange and propose better ideas on ongoing activities, flag concerns, and stay updated on outcomes.

The proposed engagement plan has been developed keeping in mind stakeholders' importance in the process and degree of influence.

Table 7: Degree of Influence

		DEGREE OF INFLUENCE	
		←	
		High influence	Low influence
DEGREE OF IMPORTANCE	↑	<p>Box A: Stakeholders who stand to lose or gain significantly from the project BUT whose actions can affect the project's ability to meet its objectives</p> <p>Primary School Teachers</p> <p>DEOs</p> <p>TEOs</p> <p>PITE</p> <p>TTIs</p> <p>DCAR</p> <p>Directorate of School Education & Civil Works</p>	<p>Box B: Stakeholders who stand to lose or gain significantly from the project BUT whose actions cannot affect the project's ability to meet its objectives</p> <p>Primary and elementary students (Grades 1-8) and their parents</p> <p>Elementary School Teachers</p> <p>Elementary Headmasters/mistresses</p>
	↓	<p>RSU</p> <p>PDMA</p> <p>SEPA</p>	

4.1 Proposed Stakeholder Engagement Plan

Stakeholder engagement for SELECT is divided into the following two phases:

Phase I - Project Design: This formulation as presented in Table 8 is based on IDIs, FGDs, and consultations with high influence stakeholders: RSU, Director STEDA; Director DTG M&E; Advisor Curriculum Wing; Directors Primary and Secondary Schools of Hyderabad and Mirpurkhas; DEOs and TEOs of Tando Mohammad Khan, Badin, Mirpurkhas, Tharparker; HMs and Primary Teachers of 2 districts; Principal TTI Mirpurkhas; Secretary Primary Teachers Association Mirpurkhas, Former Primary School Teacher of a Private School; CEO of The Citizens Foundation; Director School of Leadership Foundation and Coordinator Kiran Foundation working on OOSCs; Head Karachi Down Syndrome Program. Consultations with more stakeholders are scheduled and are expected to be completed by the end of the second week of March 2020.

Phase II - Project Operation: The draft SEP for this phase has been developed by the RSU Social Safeguards Consultant based on the feedback received so far through IDIs, FGDs, and literature review in Phase I. It will continue to be updated till all planned consultations in Phase I are completed. Two consultative workshops are planned in the end of March in which the draft SEP for Project Operation Phase will be validated and endorsed in the presence of stakeholders. Their feedback and suggestions will be incorporated in the final document that will henceforth be filed with RSU to be used as a reference document. As SEP is a living document RSU might update or make changes to it throughout the project life cycle.

Table 8: Project Design Phase

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN						
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	and	Roles and Responsibilities
Affected Parties	Director Primary and Director Secondary Schools	DEOs and TEOs report to Director Primary and Director Secondary Schools of their respective Divisional Headquarters. Project orientation explaining key roles and responsibilities of DEOs and TEOs under the project will be given; Understanding of Recruitment process of DEOs, TEOs, HMs, and Teachers; Appraisal and reward systems; Capacity development	Workshops, consultative sessions and IDIs using semi-structured discussion guide	Divisional Headquarters at Mirpurkhas and Hyderabad 4 IDIs 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur		RSU Social Safeguards Consultant

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		opportunities within the system; Reporting hierarchy and grievance mechanisms; Gender issues and inclusion of vulnerable groups in hiring			
	DEOs	Defining roles, responsibilities and outreach requirements under SELECT; Level and frequency of engagement with schools and other departments; Handling of complaints; Means of communication, reporting and grievance mechanisms; Gender issues and inclusion of vulnerable groups	Workshops, consultative sessions and FGDs using semi-structured discussion guide	Divisional Headquarters at Mirpurkhas and Hyderabad 5 IDIs 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	TEOs	Understanding Terms of Reference and outreach capacity; Level and frequency of engagement with schools and DEOs; Means of communication, Reporting and grievance mechanisms; Gender issues and inclusion of vulnerable groups	Workshops, consultative sessions and FGDs using semi-structured discussion guide	Thatta and Mirpurkhas 4 FGDs 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Primary School Teachers	Existing teaching pedagogies; awareness about CPD, training opportunities; availability of teaching resource materials; reward or performance appraisal frequency and level of interaction with DEOs and TEOs, and grievance mechanisms;	Consultative sessions and FGDs with rural and urban school teachers using a semi-structured discussion guide	Hyderabad (Tando Muhammad Khan), Thatta, Mirpurkhas 6 FGDs 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
				SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	
	Primary HMs	Scope of responsibilities; level and frequency of communication with DEOs and TEOs; interaction with teachers on their capacity development; course of corrective action for teachers in case of non-compliance or misconduct; grievance mechanism	Consultative sessions and FGDs with Hub and satellite school HMs using a semi-structured discussion guide	Hyderabad (Tando Muhammad Khan), Thatta, Mirpurkhas 3 FGDs 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	STEDA, PITE, TTIs, DCAR, and Curriculum Wing	Role in developing and executing the CPD model; means of communication and engagement for developing resource materials; in-house capacity to roll out training; level and frequency of engagement required with other departments; challenges; reporting and grievance mechanisms	IDIs and telephonic interviews with heads of the departments using a semi-structured discussion guide	Karachi, Jamshoro 3 IDIs 4 Telephonic Interviews	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Directorate General of Monitoring and Evaluation (DTG M&E)	Inclusion of grievance mechanisms in reporting	IDI with head of the department using a semi-structured discussion guide	Karachi 1 IDI 1 Workshop for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Reform Support Unit	Capacity development to implement the project; coordination for information	Meetings, workshops, LEG meeting, and informal consultation	Karachi 2 IDIs Meetings (as needed)	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		sharing and setting up meetings with other departments; logistical support for meetings; data on school and district/ <i>taluka</i> level stakeholders	sessions	2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur	
	Provincial Disaster Management Authority, Sindh (PDMA)	District level disaster responsiveness plans;	IDI with senior management of PDMA using a semi-structured guide	Karachi 1 IDI 2 Workshops for Validation of Project Implementation Phase SEP: Hyderabad and Sukkur (District Officers to attend)	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
Other Interested Parties	British Council	Experience in implementing CPD model in Sindh; resource material developed and used, criteria for guide and subject coordinators selection; challenges	Face to face interview using a semi structured checklist	Karachi 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Sindh Education Foundation	Project approach, pedagogies applied, enrolment strategies, teachers' training resources	Face to face interview using a semi structured guide	Karachi 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	The Citizens Foundation	Project approach; pedagogies applied; enrolment strategies; teachers' training resources	Face to face interview using a semi structured checklist	Karachi 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	Curriculum Wing	Role and responsibilities; resource material development cycle; reasons for delays; how to improve the process	Face to face interview using a semi structured checklist	Karachi 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant

PHASE I: PROJECT DESIGN					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods Being Used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
	Sindh Environment Protection Agency (SEP)	Necessary requirements; existing compliance for school construction; impact on environment due to construction; systems for managing electronic waste;	IDI with Director General using a semi structured checklist	Karachi 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
Disadvantaged /Vulnerable Individuals or Groups	NGOs Representing Out of School Children and their Parents	Data and figures; successful interventions to enroll OOSC; retention	Interview using a semi structured checklist	Karachi 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	NGOs Representing Differently Abled Children and their Parents	Data and figures on enrolment in mainstream schools; barriers to entry; successful interventions; grievance system	Interview using a semi structured checklist	Karachi 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	NGOs representing minority and ethnic groups in Sindh	Data and figures on school level employment and enrolment; means of discrimination; grievance system	Interviews with rural based NGOs using a semi structured checklist	2 Project Districts 2 telephonic interviews	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	NGOs working on children's and women's rights in Sindh	Data and figures on school level; informal and formal grievance systems' successes and failures;	IDIs/telephonic interviews with organizational head using a semi structured checklist	Karachi and Project Districts 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant
	All Sindh Primary School Teachers' Association	Issues in teaching; satisfaction or dissatisfaction over facilities and perks; capacity development opportunities;	IDI using a semi structured checklist	Karachi 1 IDI	RSU Social Safeguards Consultant

Table 9: Project Operation Stage

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
Affected Parties	Primary Students (Grades 1 – 3) ; Parents; SMCs	Level of interest in education; proficiency in reading and numeracy; attendance	Assessments; monitoring of attendance through Unique Student ID	Quarterly and annual assessments; Daily attendance; Annual Citizen Engagement Surveys	Subject coordinators will take quarterly assessments to evaluate learning outcomes and share results with TEOs in monthly meetings; WB
	Directorate Primary and Directorate Secondary Schools	Project orientation; outlining of key roles and responsibilities; project planning and setting timelines; dedicating focal persons for coordination and reporting vertically and horizontally; project review and performance appraisal;	Training and Planning workshops; meetings with DEOs on CPD model and school upgradation; instituting effective online systems for receiving and reviewing suggestions, complaints, and grievances; regular hearings of grievances by grievance committees	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad; bi-annual review meetings of Directors with DEOs at Divisional Headquarters; monthly review and action on attendance reports and reported grievances	Directorates of School Education and Project Directorate at RSU
	DEOs	Formats and frequency of engagement with HMs and teachers to identify learning needs and gaps; means of coordination and communication	Review meetings with HMs and project partners; report possible changes in school status and	Bi-annual Review Meetings at Divisional Headquarters; quarterly review meetings of DEOs with primary	DEOs of the select 10 districts responsible for maintaining and filing plans;

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		with HMs, PITE and TTIs for selecting and training Guide Teachers; reporting to Directors and RSU on project progress and upgradation of primary schools to elementary; announcing and implementing grievance mechanisms; outreach programs for disadvantaged groups; gender training and inclusive approaches	transfer of teachers through written notification; share knowledge of grievance reporting system through printed posters/notices; placement of complaint boxes in schools	teachers, 1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of the project; 3 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad HMs, PITE, and TTIs for selection and training of Guide Teachers; monthly checking and filing of complaints in complaint boxes	consolidating monthly and quarterly project documents and sharing timely with Project Directorate at RSU copying their respective School Directorates
	TEOs	Formats and frequency of engagement with primary teachers and HMs; performance appraisal indicators and formats; gender training and inclusive approaches	Joint meetings with HMs; performance appraisal of primary teachers; reporting to DEOs	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of the project; 3 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad Monthly planning and review meetings on competitive selection of Guide Teachers and their progress with HMs at cluster hub/campus schools; monthly reporting to DEOs	TEOs to share monthly reports with DEOs. The latter is to review, consolidate with monthly report and share with Project Directorate at RSU copying their respective School Directorates
	Primary School Teachers	Willingness to learn and apply new pedagogies and assessments; means of communication with Guide Teachers and Subject	Training in new pedagogies Developing Teaching guides	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of the project; 3 Annual	PITE to develop Training Calendar and share it with TTIs, DEOs, TEOs,

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		Coordinators; participation in training; reporting progress and grievances	available in Sindhi and Urdu in hard and soft copies at Hub Schools; training calendar developed and hard copies shared with DEOs, TEOs, HMs; soft copy to be made available on website; Online link training resource material developed and shared on school's notice boards	Review Meetings in Hyderabad Annual Training for different batches of teachers (can be at PITE or District TTI); monthly review meetings of Guide and Subject Coordinators at Hub schools; bi-weekly meetings of Subject Coordinators and teachers at satellite schools; weekly mentoring by Subject Coordinators to teachers at satellite schools	HMs, Project Directorate at RSU Monthly/bi-weekly/weekly reports developed and shared by teachers with TEOs. DEOs to review and shared monthly with Project Directorate at RSU copying their respective School Directorates
	Primary HMs	Scope of responsibilities; level and frequency of communication with DEOs and TEOs; interaction with teachers on their capacity development; course of corrective action for teachers in case of non-compliance or misconduct; grievance mechanism	Monthly meetings with written agenda and action points	Quarterly review meetings with DEOs; monthly meetings with TEOs	Maintain meeting minutes
	Elementary HMs	Capacity development to provide better academic support to teachers; maintenance of school building; effective use of learning resources and facilities	Review meetings with DEOs on the state and use of facilities	Quarterly meetings with DEOs	DEOs to share quarterly reports with Project Directorate at RSU copying their

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
					respective School Directorates
	STEDA, PITE, TTIs, DCAR, and Curriculum Wing	Role in developing and executing the CPD model; determining the training development cycle; means of communication and engagement for developing resource materials; in-house capacity to roll out training; level and frequency of engagement required with other departments; challenges; reporting and grievance mechanisms	Planning and review workshops; joint working groups; official notification	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad/Sukkur at start of the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad/Sukkur; Joint quarterly review meetings by PITE and TTIs for planning and review of training; notification of approved materials by STEDA as needed	PITE to take lead on planning and consolidating reports to be shared quarterly with Project Directorate at RSU
	Directorate General of Monitoring & Evaluation (DTG M&E)	Improving monitoring and evaluation systems	Regular reporting on attendance of teachers	Monthly reporting	DTG M&E
	Directorate of School Education & Civil Works	Planning and mobilization of construction activities; timelines; guidelines for ensuring environmental and social safeguards, making building friendly for the use of the differently abled	Feasibility assessment of schools for construction; approval and written notice from Secretary Education	As needed	PD&F will conduct the feasibility assessment; Civil Works to undertake construction activity
	Reform Support Unit	Capacity development to implement the project; coordination for information	Develop on-line project materials; disclosure of project	1 Annual Project Planning Meeting in Hyderabad at start of	Overall project management and coordination

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		sharing and setting up meetings with other departments; logistical support for meetings; data on school and district/ <i>taluka</i> level stakeholders	documents; organizing and participating annual planning and review meetings; maintain project activity calendar and sending reminders to other departments; Developing publicity materials and case studies for electronic and social media	the project; 4 Annual Review Meetings in Hyderabad; participation in quarterly meetings; monthly updates on websites; development of project material as required	
	Provincial Disaster Management Authority, Sindh (PDMA)	Coping strategies in case of disasters, communication plans in an event of a disaster, use of schools as shelters	District level plans; emergency drills; awareness posters	District level Bi-Annual meetings with DEOs; schedule of training drills; sharing of posters	District Disaster Management Authority (DDMA)
Other Interested Parties	British Council	Experience in implementing CPD model in Sindh; resource material developed and used, criteria for guide and subject coordinators selection; challenges	Face-to-face meetings; trainings/workshops; invitations to public consultations	As needed	DCAR, Curriculum Wing and PITE to coordinate for relevant input
	Sindh Education Foundation	-Strategies for high enrolment and retention of girls; teaching pedagogies and resource materials used	Face-to-face meetings; trainings/workshops; invitations to public consultations	As needed	DCAR, Curriculum Wing and PITE to coordinate for relevant input
	The Citizens Foundation	Strategies for high enrolment and retention of girls; teaching pedagogies and resource	Face-to-face meetings; trainings/workshops;	As needed	DCAR, Curriculum Wing and PITE to coordinate for

PHASE II: PROJECT OPERATION					
Type of Stakeholders	Target Stakeholders	Topics of Engagement	Methods to be used	Location and Frequency	Roles and Responsibilities
		materials used	invitations to public consultations		relevant input
Disadvantaged /Vulnerable Individuals or Groups	NGOs Representing Out of School Children and their Parents	Factors contributing to attract girls and OOSCs to join school; key lessons learnt from the projects	Participation in Local Education Group (LEG) meetings; Citizen Engagement Surveys	As planned; CE annual	WB; RSU
	NGOs Representing Differently Abled Children and their Parents	Learning needs; teaching pedagogies; sensitization required through different channels	Participation in Local Education Group (LEG) meetings; Citizen Engagement Surveys	As planned; CE annual	WB; RSU
	NGOs representing minority and ethnic groups in Sindh	How to facilitate enrolment of the poorest of the poor; Understanding stereotypes to develop teaching materials for inclusion	Learning aids on inclusion; Public awareness drives through publication and printing of posters and banners; radio and TV shows; Citizen Engagement Surveys	As planned; CE annual	Curriculum Wing, DCAR, STEDA
	NGOs working on Children's and women's rights in Sindh	Factors contributing to attract girls; key lessons learnt from the projects;	Participation in Local Education Group (LEG) meetings	As planned; CE annual	RSU
	All Sindh Primary School Teachers' Association	Issues in teaching; satisfaction or dissatisfaction over facilities and perks; capacity development opportunities;	Participation in Local Education Group (LEG) meetings	As planned	RSU

4.2 Proposed Strategy to Include Vulnerable Groups

The project will take special measures to ensure that disadvantaged and vulnerable groups have equal opportunity to access information, provide feedback, or submit grievances. Civil society organizations, including NGOs working on ethnic groups, children's rights, women's rights, teachers' associations will be treated as representatives of these groups. Their engagement will allow a two-way communication channel to factor in opportunities for the identified vulnerable groups. TEOs and HMs will help to ensure proactive outreach to OOSC and differently abled children in their *talukas* for awareness and enrolment. Complaint boxes in schools will be placed near school entrance for vulnerable groups to drop complaints. Open house sessions organized will demonstrate to children and parents alike better learning outcomes. Education projects from other donors and development agencies targeting vulnerable groups will be encouraged.

4.3 Strategy for Consultation (Design Phase)

4.3.1 In-Depth Interviews

Face-to-face interviews using semi-structured guides have already been held with CPM and Deputy CPM RSU, Director STEDA, Director Primary School Hyderabad, Director Secondary School Hyderabad, Director M&E, and Advisor Curriculum Wing. Further IDIs with the other identified stakeholders are planned and will remain the core method of data collection for the design phase.

A total of 25 IDIs will be undertaken covering all relevant parties and ensuring their feedback.

4.3.2 Focus Group Discussions

2 FGDs have been held with primary school teachers and HMs from District Tando Mohammad Jam. 5 FGDs with primary teachers and 2 more FGDs with HMs from two project districts are planned. Gender split in FGDs will be ensured to cover sensitive topics of harassment comfortably. 4 FGDs with TEOs in Thatta and Mirpurkhas with an equal gender split will be conducted.

A total of 13 FGDs are planned to be covered in the design phase. In each FGD minimum 6 and maximum 10 respondents will participate.

4.3.3 Telephone Interviews

Telephonic interviews using semi structured guides will be carried out with Director PITE, and 4 Directors of TTIs in the project districts

4.3.4 Workshops for Validation of Proposed SEP – Implementation Phase

The consultations in the design phase will culminate in an augmented proposed SEP for the implementation phase. Ideas, suggestions, and views of the stakeholders will be well documented and presented in workshops attended by the representatives of the identified stakeholders. The workshops will be divided into reviewing, brainstorming, and planning sessions to finalize a mutually agreed upon Stakeholder Engagement Plan.

To encourage participation, 2 workshops will be held: one in divisional region of Hyderabad and the other in the divisional region of Sukkur.

4.4 Information Disclosure

SELD and WB websites will be used to disclose project documents, locally and internationally, including those on environmental and social performance in Urdu and English. SELD will create a webpage on the Project on its existing website. All future project related environmental and social monitoring reports, listed in the above sections will be disclosed on this webpage. Project updates (including news on construction activities and relevant environmental and social data) will also be posted on the homepage of RSU's website. An easy-to-understand guide to the terminology used in the environmental and social reports or documents will also be provided on the website. All information brochures/fliers will be posted on the website. Details about the Project Grievance Resolution Mechanism will be posted on the website. An electronic grievance submission form will also be made available on RSU's website. Contact details of the Project Coordinator will be made available on the website. RSU will update and maintain the website regularly (at least once a quarterly basis).

4.5 Timelines of SEP

Tables 7 and 8 present frequencies for different types of stakeholders. Frequency of engagement is dependent on expected deliverables. Annual meetings and reviews are to help stay course the planned activities. Quarterly, monthly, bi-weekly, and weekly engagement are relevant for effective implementation, brainstorming, addressing glitches and potential road blocks. In case of change of plans the stated timelines and frequencies will continue throughout the project life cycle. The project will review its engagement against the SEP annually, and this review will be a part of the progress report that will be shared with the client management and with the World Bank

4.6 Review of Comments

Developing easy project reporting formats is going to be the output of stakeholder engagement. All implementing agencies are expected to send their monthly, quarterly, and yearly reports to RSU. RSU will compile comments and suggestion from various sources. Where RSU is meant to address the comments, it will promptly do so, where others agencies are involved, RSU will redirect the comments to relevant agencies for response.

5 Roles, Responsibilities, and Resources for Stakeholder Engagement Plan

5.3 Implementation Arrangements

The Project aims to work closely with SELD and the RSU under the leadership of Secretary SELD to ensure project sustainability. The Project expects the SELD directorates to be the technical leads of the activities, and the RSU to lead the fiduciary and safeguard administration based on its extensive institutional experience in implementing various donor projects.

A full-time Social Specialist will oversee the implementation of the project SEP with support from RSU. In addition, RSU will designate full time environment and social focal points within the department. The project will also undertake measures for institutional capacity building including for the implementation of the SEP and will regularly organize trainings for the Project Directorate and RSU staff.

5.4 Management Functions and Responsibilities

RSU will be responsible for implementation and monitoring of the project through provision of Technical Assistance (TA) support for strengthening the SELD's and implementing entities' capacity. RSU will be headed by the Chief Program Manager (CPM) and will carry out the following tasks: (a) procurement activities under the Component 4 and procurement support for other components, (b) financial management and audit for the overall project, (c) safeguards monitoring and reporting for the entire project, (d) project specific M&E, including impact evaluation and Annual School Census (ASC), to ensure regular data collection for the entire school education sector in Sindh.

The CPM will be supported by a Deputy CPM and staff officers. Consultants and assistants will be hired for supporting financial management, procurement, M&E, social and environment safeguards. Technical consultants with specialty including but not limited to teacher training, diagnostic assessments, monitoring systems, infrastructure management and EdTech solutions will be hired to support institutional strengthening of implementing entities. Detailed staffing plan will be explained in the Project Orientation Manuals (POM).

The main implementing government counterparts for Component 1 will be STEDA, PITE, TTIs and Directorate of School Education (DSE). Component 2 will be coordinated by the Planning, Development and Finance (PD&F) within the SELD, and third-party civil works agency to manage civil works would be engaged. Component 3 will be mainly led by DSE with DTG M&E monitoring student attendance for verification purposes. The RSU will engage necessary technical assistance and consultants and assign them to the relevant directorates for supporting implementation as envisaged in Component 4

5.5 Budget

To be added

6 Grievance Mechanism

RSU has online complaints system. However, upon clicking the Launch Complaint tab, the requested URL was not found on the server. Similarly the list of launched complaints was not updated and showed data of 2013. The status of the complaints report mentions the name of the complainant, nature of complaint, date of complaint, responding agency, date of complaint forward, and remarks by RSU, but it does not state whether the responding agency acted on the complaint or not. The existing system seems to have been designed for only teachers and HMs, whereas it needs to be accessible to a wider audience, to whom the internet is not that easily available.

The effectiveness of the entire system described above needs to be evaluated for its timely response, engagement process and frequency of communication with the complainant, complaint handling time and resolution process.

Grievance mechanism needs to be audience appropriate and more accessible. It is suggested to place complaint boxes in schools near entrance. The complaint boxes should be locked and opened by M&E Officers on their monthly visits. They will record the complaints in a log and forward it to respective DEOs, School Directors, and RSU. The grievance log should be reviewed monthly for swift action.

Similarly, a hotline line can be instituted at Directorate M&E free of cost to encourage vulnerable individuals to report misconduct by staff within the system

SEP will also provide guidance on citizen engagement activities especially with parents and families of the in-school and out of school children (of school going age) and will focus on suggestions for improving enrolment and retention. CE activities will also include regular beneficiary feedback and community satisfaction surveys for the intervention schools

7 Monitoring and Reporting

7.1 Involving of Stakeholders in Monitoring Activities

The RSU will play the overall monitoring role and undertake M&E activities, including (a) regular supervision of project implementation sites; (b) preparing biannual implementation progress reports; (c) monitoring and verification of DLIs by involving third-party entities; (d) carrying out assessment and impact evaluation studies; and (e) conducting citizens' engagement surveys for ensuring beneficiaries' and communities' satisfaction. Necessary TA support will be provided to RSU for carrying out the listed M&E activities. Project documents and reports shared by stakeholders throughout the life cycle will provide necessary reference data for monitoring and evaluation.

Moreover, ESCP and SEP require regular consultations with stakeholders. Six-monthly ESCP compliance monitoring reports would be prepared and submitted by the Environment and Social specialists of the project throughout the project life

7.2 Monitoring Grievance Mechanism

Existing systems are ineffective in monitoring grievances. Complaint registration is to be documented by developing a monthly log at the school level and collected by Directorate M&E. It is important that in addition to sharing the log with relevant School Directors for action, monthly complaints are shared with RSU. RSU will instate systems to monitor the effectiveness of the comment response and, grievance mechanism. Appropriate measures/KPIs for this will include monthly reporting on the number of grievances received, resolved and outstanding. As part of the annual review, analyzing the trends and time taken for grievance resolution will help evaluate the efficacy of the comment response and develop more robust grievance mechanism.

