TC Document

I. Basic Information for TC

Country/Region:	JAMAICA/CCB - Caribbean Group		
■ TC Name:	The Direct and Indirect Long-Term Impacts of PATH in Jamaica		
■ TC Number:	JA-T1233		
■ Team Leader/Members:	Beuermann Mendoza, Diether Wolfgang (CCB/CCB) Team Leader; Stampini, Marco (SCL/SPH) Alternate Team Leader; Hobbs, Cynthia Marie (SCL/EDU); Castellon Narvaez Juan Ramon (CCB/CCB); Mendoza Benavente, Horacio (LEG/SGO); Tejerina, Luis R. (SCL/SPH); Mancilla, Elton Alexander (RES/RES); Molina, Silvana (VPS/VPS); Roseth, Benjamin David (IFD/ICS); Ibarraran, Pablo (SCL/SPH)		
■ Taxonomy:	Research and Dissemination		
Operation Supported by the TC:			
Date of TC Abstract authorization:	26 Aug 2024.		
Beneficiary:	Jamaica		
Executing Agency and contact name:	Inter-American Development Bank		
Donors providing funding:	OC SDP Window 2 - Social Development(W2E)		
IDB Funding Requested:	US\$337,500.00		
Local counterpart funding, if any:	US\$0		
 Disbursement period (which includes Execution period): 	42 months disbursement (36 months execution)		
Required start date:	December 13, 2024		
Types of consultants:	Individual Consultants/Consulting Firms		
Prepared by Unit:	CCB-Caribbean Group		
Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	CCB-Caribbean Group		
TC included in Country Strategy (y/n):	у		
■ TC included in CPD (y/n):	n		
• Alignment to the IDB Group Institutional Strategy 2024-2030:	Social inclusion and equality		

II. Objectives and Justification of the TC

- 2.1 This TC seeks to gather robust evidence on the long-term effectiveness of the Jamaican Conditional Cash Transfer Program (PATH) by answering two primary questions: (1) What are the long-term direct impacts of PATH on academic achievement, fertility rates, criminal behavior, and labor market outcomes?; and (2) What underlying mechanisms might account for the reduced effectiveness of the education system among PATH beneficiaries compared to similar non-beneficiaries?
- 2.2 The IDB financed the design and implementation of the "Programme of Advancement through Health and Education (PATH)" since its inception (operations JA-L1037 and JA-L1053). PATH is the Jamaican Conditional Cash Transfer program which currently serves about 350,000 beneficiary households. It encompasses a dual aim of alleviating current poverty (through income support) and developing children's human capital (through health and education conditionalities). The main lessons learned from previous operations (JA-L1037 and JA-L1053) are that although the conditionalities

- for cash transfers had increased school attendance and graduation rates, learning has remained a challenge that is imperative to tackle.
- 2.3 PATH's main objectives are directly aligned with the IDB's strategic objectives of reducing poverty and inequality, and to bolster sustainable growth. Therefore, this TC by evaluating the effectiveness of an anti-poverty program is directly aligned with one of the main objectives in terms of reducing poverty and inequality of the IDB Group Institutional Strategy (CA-631).
- 2.4 The theory of change connecting the PATH to expected improvements on long-term productivity relates to the conditionalities imposed to receive the transfers (i.e., school attendance and preventive health visits). These conditionalities seek to alter the incentives of poor households to increase their demand for human capital investments in their children in ways that may confer long-term productivity benefits.
- 2.5 Nonetheless, although the PATH has been scaled-up significantly, we still do not have causal evidence of its effectiveness over the long-term. Furthermore, there is evidence of undesirable indirect effects of PATH operating through the reduction of the effectiveness of the educational system among boys (Beuermann et. al., 2024: IDB WP 1598). Understanding the mechanisms behind these undesirable indirect gendered effects is of utmost importance to implement adequate interventions that could mitigate them.
- 2.6 This TC aligns with the One Caribbean Program (GN-3201-5) by integrating and linking diverse sources of administrative data to evaluate the effectiveness of a landmark social protection program in the Caribbean. Therefore, this project aligns with the cross-cutting focus of One Caribbean, ensuring sustainable social progress and reduced inequality, consistent with regional development goals. The administrative data to be systematized will strengthen the evidence-based activities to be done under the different ONE Caribbean pillars. In terms of Citizen Security, the integration of social protection registries with police data will allow an estimation of effectiveness in terms of crime reduction. In terms of Food Security, the integration of social security registries will allow an estimation of the effectiveness of educational systems in fostering increased labor market success and consequent reductions in long-term poverty.
- 2.7 This TC has close ties and synergies with ONE Caribbean Data and Research for Impact Phase 1 (RG-T4588). Specifically, while the current TC does not include a capacity strengthening component for the standardization of administrative data, RG-T4588 envisions such activities. Therefore, the current TC complements the administrative data baseline mapping and capacity strengthening considered under RG-T4588 with additional resources to systematize and analyze such data to produce a state-of-the-art impact evaluation of the PATH program.
- 2.8 This TC is aligned with the IDB Group Country Strategy with Jamaica 2022-2026 (GN-3138) within its pillar of Addressing Social Gaps. The TC will provide novel evidence on the effectiveness of Jamaica's main social protection program in terms of human capital development, crime, and longer-term productivity. This with a special focus on gender equality given the previous results of gendered impacts with diminished effectiveness among boys.

2.9 This TC is aligned with The Ordinary Capital Strategic Development Program (GN-2819-14) as it seeks to provide evidence towards addressing the challenges of social exclusion, inequality, and innovation through support for policies aimed at increasing the effectiveness of education services.

III. Description of activities/components and budget

- 3.1 Component 1: Matching PATH applications data with other administrative databases (\$50,000). This component will finance the organization and individual-level matching of several administrative databases.
- 3.2 The main activities include matching the PATH applications registry with the following administrative records:
 - 3.2.1 Live births records of the Jamaican Civil Registry. This will be used to assess the impacts of PATH on teen pregnancies and fertility, an issue that evidence has shown to limit women's educational attainment, labor market participation and long-term productivity.
 - 3.2.2 Arrests records from the Jamaican Police Service. This will be used to assess the impact of PATH on juvenile crime. An issue that has been shown to be more prevalent among boys and that severely restrain long-term productivity.
 - 3.2.3 Retirement fund contributions records from the Jamaican National Insurance Scheme. This will be used to assess the impacts of PATH on adult labor market employment and earnings differentiated by gender.
- 3.3 Component 1 will finance an individual consultant to assist with the data work to match the different records at the individual level.
- 3.4 The expected result will be an organized and matched database including the mentioned administrative records.
- 3.5 Component 2: Primary data collection in a random sample of 200 secondary schools (\$250,000). This component will finance the design and application of instruments aimed at measuring the pedagogical and administrative practices of each school. This will also assess, for example, curricula design and whether and how the contents may have a gender bias. The component will also finance the application of the 5-essentials instrument developed by the Chicago Consortium to measure the different aspects of school climate through the application of standardized questionnaires to teachers and students.
- 3.6 The expected timeline for Component 2 is 6 months executed within the second half of the academic year in Jamaica.
- 3.7 The expected result will be a database at the school level including all the collected information.
- 3.8 **Component 3: Data analysis** (\$37,500). This component will finance an individual consultant to perform the data analysis for the estimation of the direct and indirect

- impacts of PATH using the administrative and primary data to be collected under Components 1 and 2.
- 3.9 The expected result will be a report including the results of the analysis together with the programming files developed for such analysis.

Indicative Budget

Activity/Component	Description	IDB/Fund Funding	Counterpart Funding	Total Funding
Component 1	Matching PATH applications data with other administrative databases	US\$50,000.00	US\$0.00	US\$50,000.00
Component 2	Primary data collection in 200 secondary schools	US\$250,000	US\$0.00	US\$250,000.00
Component 3	Data Analysis	US\$37,500.00	US\$0.00	US\$37,500.00
	TOTAL	US\$337,500.00	US\$0.00	US\$337,500.00

- 3.10 If under any of the components of this TC, the Bank receives, manages, or uses information that may contain personal data or sensitive information, the Bank's Personal Data Privacy Policy (GN-3030) will be followed in coordination with the IDB Privacy team.
- 3.11 The UDR for this TC will be CCB/CCB. The Team Leader is Diether Beuermann (CCB/CCB) and the Alternate Team Leader is Marco Stampini (SCL/SPH).

IV. Executing agency and execution structure

- 4.1 This operation will be executed by the IDB through CCB/CCB in close collaboration with SCL/SPH, given their expertise in this type of research. The research has complementarities with Bank operations and research. The Country Department Caribbean (CCB/CCB) will be responsible for the preparation, execution, and supervision of Components 1, 2 and 3 following the policies established by the Bank. The team leader will be responsible for the execution and monitoring of the operation in collaboration with the alternate team leader and the rest of the team members. The team leader will directly supervise consultants and track that deliverables are completed according to the project's planned timeline with the support of the team members of the project.
- 4.2 The IDB Country Office of Jamaica will be advised of the results and policy implications. They will be informed and consulted about missions and the main activities related to the implementation of the TC.
- 4.3 The research implemented as part of this TC will be in collaboration with the government of Jamaica through their ministries of education and labor and social security.

4.4 The Bank will contract individual consultants, consulting firms, and non-consulting services to carry out the activities described. The activities to be executed are included in the Procurement Plan and will be contracted in accordance with Bank policies as follows: (a) AM-650 for Individual consultants; and (b) GN-2303-33 for Consulting Firms for services of an intellectual nature and for other non-consulting services related to dissemination. The knowledge products generated from Bank-executed activities within this technical cooperation will be the property of the Bank and may be made available to the public under a Creative Commons license. However, at the request of the beneficiaries, in accordance with the provisions of AM-331, the intellectual property of said products may also be licensed through specific contractual commitments that shall be prepared with the advice of the Legal Department. The knowledge products that will be generated as part of this TC will be produced and disseminated in accordance with AM-331 and AM-325.

V. Major issues

5.1 The main risk to successful and timely execution of this TC is that the team may not receive the data/information needed to complete the project with enough time according to the planned timeline. To minimize that risk, we will engage closely with counterparts in the government of Jamaica to discuss the planned research questions, methodology to be used in the project, and the data/information required.

VI. Exceptions to Bank policy

6.1 This TC does not involve exceptions to Bank policy.

VII. Environmental and Social Aspects

7.1 This Technical Cooperation is not intended to finance pre-feasibility or feasibility studies of specific investment projects or environmental and social studies associated with them; therefore, this TC does not have applicable requirements of the Bank's Environmental and Social Policy Framework (ESPF).

Required Annexes:

Request from the Client 72661.pdf

Results Matrix 34852.pdf

Terms of Reference 48625.pdf

Procurement Plan 35576.pdf