



## Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable Services (P151432)

AFRICA | Ethiopia | Social Protection & Labor Global Practice |  
 IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results | FY 2016 | Seq No: 3 | ARCHIVED on 28-Dec-2016 | ISR26114 |

Implementing Agencies: Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation (Channel One Coordination Directorate)

### Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program-for-Results Appraisal Document)

The objective ESPES program is to improve equitable access to basic services and strengthen accountability systems at the decentralized level. The program ensures the whole population benefits from basic services delivery by focusing in particular on the bottom 20% of income groups and most poorly performing woredas. Building on almost 10 years of support for basic services delivery, the ESPES focuses on leveraging the government's broad program of service delivery support to promote equity, enhance capacity, and institutionalize critical systems for service delivery, especially at the woreda level.

### Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	● Satisfactory	● Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	● Satisfactory	● Satisfactory
Overall Risk Rating	● Substantial	● Substantial

### Implementation Status and Key Decisions

Following the approval of the Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable Services (ESPES) program by the World Bank's Board of Executive Directors on September 15, 2015, the Financing Agreement was formally signed between the World Bank (WB) and Government of Ethiopia (GoE) at the end of October, 2015 and ratified by the Ethiopian Parliament (House of Peoples' Representatives) on December 8, 2015. The ESPES is a USD 600 million IDA loan to the GoE over a three-year period and is expected to run until May 2019. The current disbursement rate, which is at 34%, is being effected based on successful achievement of the Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) that were agreed for the reporting period and verified according to agreed verification protocols. The GoE has shown pro-active engagement with concerned implementing and verifying agencies in reporting on the due DLIs. Recent program supervision efforts have seen strong engagement with regional counterparts. The total cost of the ESPES is estimated to be 8.01 billion dollars out of which 73.4% or 5.87 billion will be covered by the Government of Ethiopia.



## Data on Financial Performance

### Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	Disbursed
---------	----------------	--------	----------	----------	---------	-----------	-----------	-------------	-----------



P151432	IDA-57160	Effective	XDR	431.50	431.50	0.00	145.63	285.87	<div style="width: 34%; height: 15px; background-color: #28a745;"></div>	34%
---------	-----------	-----------	-----	--------	--------	------	--------	--------	--	-----

**Key Dates (by loan)**

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P151432	IDA-57160	Effective	15-Sep-2015	22-Oct-2015	11-Dec-2015	01-May-2019	--

**Risks****Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool**

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	--	● Substantial	● High
Macroeconomic	--	● Substantial	● Substantial
Sector Strategies and Policies	--	● Low	● Low
Technical Design of Project or Program	--	● Low	● Moderate
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	--	● Moderate	● Moderate
Fiduciary	--	● Substantial	● Substantial
Environment and Social	--	● Moderate	● Moderate
Stakeholders	--	● Substantial	● Moderate
Other	--	--	--
Overall	--	● Substantial	● Substantial

**Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLI)**

## ▶ DLI 1 Per capita increase in federal block grants transfer to regions (Number (Thousand))

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	588.00	--	962.00
Date	14-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016

## ▶ DLI 3 Health extension workers who have graduated with a Level 4 qualification (Number (Thousand))

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	2123.00	--	11735.00



Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016
------	-------------	----	-------------

► DLI 7 Enhanced transparency and accountability through citizen engagement (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	<p>FTA budget disclosure happening in all woredas, with informal pre-budget discussions during budget literacy training,</p> <p>Standard GRM structures in 4 regions, including assigned staff at regional and woreda levels,</p> <p>SA Operational in 223 woredas</p>	--	The Nov 2016 DLI achieved by reaching 37.2% of woredas from the planned 15%, and achieving women participation about 46.3% from planned 25%
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016

► DLI 9 Oversight function of Regional Procurement regulatory bodies has been improved (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	N/A	--	Indicator related data collection, based on the customized PPM Guideline, has commenced, in each of Oromia, Amhara, SNNP, and Tigray regions.
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016

► DLI 10 Strengthened capacity of woredas to effectively respond to fraud and corruption complaints (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	Ethics officers are assigned in 179 Woredas in 2 regions	--	Ethics officers have been assigned in 76% of WoFEDs. 80% if you also count zonal level officers.
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016



► DLI 8 Establishment of a government system for benchmarking Woreda PFM performance (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	Not applicable	--	Delayed, status not included in December 2016 DLI report received.
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016

► DLI 11 Improved development information and data for service delivery (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	N/A	--	Delayed, status not included in December 2016 DLI report received.
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016

► DLI 5a3 Improved geographic equity in education service delivery outcomes, based on Net Enrollment Rate indicator for the bottom 10% of Performing Woredas (Percentage)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	21.00	--	0.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016
Comments	Report under preparation by the sector.		

► DLI 5a4 Improved geographic equity in health service delivery outcomes, based on Penta 3 Vaccine indicator for the bottom 10% of Performing Woredas (Percentage)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	44.00	--	0.00
Date	01-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016
Comments	Complete data not yet available. DLI not due until November 1, 2017.		

**► DLI 5b1 Improved wealth equity in education service delivery outcomes, based on Net Attendance Rate indicator for the bottom wealth equity group (Percentage)**

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	62.10	--	0.00
Date	01-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016
<b>Comments</b> Data not yet available. DLI not due until November 1, 2017.			

**► DLI 5b2 Improved wealth equity in health service delivery outcomes, based on penta 3 vaccination indicator for the bottom wealth equity group (Percentage)**

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	37.00	--	37.60
Date	01-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016
<b>Comments</b> DLI not due until May 1, 2018.			

**► DLI 2 Increases proportion of qualified female agricultural development agents (Percentage)**

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	15.00	--	19.90
Date	01-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016

**► DLI 4 Increases in the total number of students enrolled (net) in grades 5-8 in all regions, except Addis Abeba (Number)**

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	51721.00	--	142000.00
Date	01-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016
<b>Comments</b> Baseline is EC2005. Target is to increase enrollment by 50,000 students per year compared to the previous year Dec 2016 actual value is based on EC2008 school year report.			



► DLI 6 Improved environmental and social management capacity at woreda level (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	No EMSC operational manual	--	Status December 2016. EMSC operational manual developed. Training modules under development. Consultant hired to provide training. Training expected by April 2017.
Date	--	--	21-Dec-2016

## Results

### Results Area

#### Intermediate Results Area

Ensuring equitable access to basic services

Enhancing Citizen Engagemetrn, Environmental and Social Managment Capacity

Deepening Fiduciary Aspects of Service Delivery

Results and Data Quality Assurance

### Project Development Objective Indicators

► Per capital increase in budgeted federal government block grant transfers to regions, excluding Addis Ababa (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	588.00	820.00	962.00	761.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

► Improved geographic equity in NER Outcomes: NER in bottom 10% of woredas (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.21	0.21	0.00	0.26
Date	01-May-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

Comments



Report under preparation by the sector.

► Improved geographic equity in Penta3 Outcomes3: penta3 coverage in bottom 10% of woredas (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	44.00	44.00	0.00	53.40
Date	01-May-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-May-2018

Comments

Data not yet available.

► Increased # of women household heads receiving agricultural advisory services (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	14.60	14.60	0.00	16.60
Date	01-May-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-May-2018

Comments

Data not yet available.

► Increased # of woredas screening projects for their environmental and social effects (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	200.00
Date	01-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-May-2018

Comments

The actual status in December 2016 of the indicator is: Training modules under development. Consultants hired to provide training. Training expected to take place by April 2017





► Increased # of woredas conducting pre-budget discussions (%) (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	37.20	15.00
Date	01-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2016

► PFM Benchmarking Rating system established in all regions (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	0.00	11.00
Date	01-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-May-2018

Comments

PFM benchmarking has begun but it has not been verified in all regions. Report note yet published.

Overall Comments

**Intermediate Results Indicators**

► Increases in total number of students enrolled (net) in grades 5-8 in all Regions excluding Addis Ababa (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	51,721.00	51,721.00	142,000.00	50,000.00
Date	15-Sep-2015	16-Dec-2015	21-Dec-2016	28-Jun-2019

► Increased proportion of qualified female agricultural development agents (Diploma level) (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	15.00	19.90	19.90	20.00



Date	16-Dec-2015	01-May-2016	01-May-2016	01-May-2018
Comments	There is an error in the end target. The legal agreement stipulates the end target at 18%.			

► Increased number of health extension workers who have graduated with a Level 4 qualification (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	2,123.00	--	11,735.00	8,248.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	19-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

► Improved wealth equity in education based on Net Attendance Rate (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	62.10	--	0.00	70.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

Comments

Data not yet available from DHS to calculate the NAR by wealth equity.

► Improved wealth equity in health service delivery outcomes based on Penta 3 Vaccine indicators for the Bottom Wealth Quintile group (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	37.00	--	37.60	39.50
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-May-2018

► Assignment of ethics officers at woreda level (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	15.00	--	76.00	75.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	19-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

Comments



In December 2016 76% of woredas have assigned ethics officers. If zonal level officers are included the total is 80%.

► Woredas in 6 regions have assigned staff/officers in GRM (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	0.00	90.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

Comments

Baseline blank in PAD.

The percentage achievement is not calculated at this time but it is reported that by December 2016 GRM staff are assigned in woredas of 5 regions and 2 City Administrations (Amhara, Tigray, Oromia, SNNPR, Benishangul Gumuz, Dire Dawa and Addis Ababa).

► 25% share of women participating in pre-budget discussion at woreda level (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	46.30	25.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	30-Dec-2016

Comments

Baseline blank in PAD.

► Expansion of Social Accountability activities in existing and into new woredas (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	223.00	--	223.00	300.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-May-2018

► Improved environmental and social management capacity at local level (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	0.00	200.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017



## Comments

Status in December 2016: Training modules under development. Consultant hired to provide training. Training expected by April 2017.

► Lowest-performing woredas based on PFM Benchmarking Rating are supported for FM reform (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	--	Bench marking process started but not yet completed and fully verified.	Yes-MoFEC supports the lowest-performing woredas for capacity building, based on a completed evaluation of the woreda PFM Benchmarking Rating
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

► Oversight function of Regional procurement regulatory bodies has been improved (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	Oromia, Amhara, SNNP, and Tigray have commenced data collection	Oromia, Amhara, SNNP, Tigray and 10% of their woredas reported in agriculture, education and health sectors
Date	30-Sep-2015	--	19-Dec-2016	01-May-2018

► Strengthened capacity of woredas to effectively respond to fraud and corruption complaints (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	Baseline not available in PAD.	--	Ethics officers have been assigned to 76% of all woredas. 80% if zonal officers are included.	Fraud and corruption complaints registered by WoFEDs are recorded in accordance with REACC/FEAC



				C complaint registration formats (incl. disaggregation by sector and type of case) in at least 75% of woredas.
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	19-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

► HIES survey published (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	--	Yes	Yes- Household Income Consumption and Expenditure Survey has been published, with gender disaggregated data.
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-May-2018

► DHS survey published (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	--	No	Yes-DHS has been carried out and the results published
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-May-2017

► Completion of Agricultural Census with revised methodology (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	--	No	Yes
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2018



## ▶ Implementation of DQA recommendations for different sectors (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	2.00	3.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

## ▶ Pregnant women receiving antenatal care during a visit to a health provider (number) (Number, Core)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	41.20	--	62.00	50.00
Date	16-Dec-2015	--	21-Dec-2016	01-Nov-2017

Overall Comments