

**ADMINISTRATIVE AGREEMENT**

**between**

**THE GOVERNMENT OF FINLAND**

**and**

**THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK**

**regarding**

**Contribution to the Inter-American Development Bank to Co-  
finance the Program in Haiti titled, "Support to the  
Implementation of the Education Plan and Reform in Haiti"**

**HA-L1060/HA-X1032**

**Washington, D.C.  
October 2, 2013**

## ADMINISTRATIVE AGREEMENT

October 2, 2013

With reference to the Amended and Restated Cooperation Framework Arrangement (the "Amended and Restated Framework Arrangement") dated as of December 6, 2010 between the Government of Finland (the "Donor"), and the Inter-American Development Bank (the "IDB" or the "Bank"), I am pleased to authorize you, subject to a parliamentary approval, to assign from the Donor Account a contribution of five million Euros (EUR5,000,000.00) (the "Contribution"), to be administered by the IDB to co-finance the IDB program in Haiti entitled: "Support to the Implementation of the Education Plan and Reform in Haiti", as set forth substantially in the IDB Project Document (HA-L1060), including its annexes and required electronic links (the "Project Document"), attached hereto as Annex A.

The provisions of the Amended and Restated Framework Arrangement will apply to this Administrative Agreement. The IDB will administer the Contribution in accordance with the provisions of the Amended and Restated Framework Arrangement, except as otherwise provided herein. The financial reporting will be expressed in U.S. dollars.

Pursuant to Section 4.1.2 of the Amended and Restated Framework Arrangement, the Donor will deposit the Contribution, upon written request from the IDB, into an account denominated in euros identified by the IDB in accordance with the following schedule:

- (1) Upon formalization of the requirement set forth in paragraph 1.17 of the Grant Proposal (defined below): EUR2,500,000.00 (two million five hundred thousand Euros)
  
- (2) Following the presentation to the Donor by the IDB of a second progress report and no later than twelve months from the time the first tranche of the Contribution is deposited: EUR2,500,000.00 (two million five hundred thousand Euros)

Upon receipt of the Contribution from the Donor, and pursuant to Section 4.1.1 of the Amended and Restated Framework Arrangement, the Bank will convert the Euros into United States dollars and will deposit the resulting amount into an account denominated in U.S. dollars that has been set up to administer resources provided as grant funds by other donors for this and other Bank projects. The Contribution will be administered in the account without distinction from other donors' contributions.

The amount resulting from the conversion of the Contribution into U.S. dollars will be administered by the IDB as a PSG and will be exclusively used as set forth in the grant proposal identified as document HA-X1032 (the "Grant Proposal"), attached hereto as Annex B. In accordance with Section 4.2.2 of the Amended and Restated Framework Arrangement, the IDB will not be responsible for any exchange rate risk related to exchange rate transactions.

The IDB shall provide the Donor with the mutually agreed reports contemplated in Section F of the Grant Proposal.

Notwithstanding Sub-paragraph 4.2.7 of the Amended and Restated Framework Arrangement, an Administrative Fee will not apply to this Contribution and will not be charged upon conversion of the Contribution.

This Administrative Agreement satisfies the requirement of a Contribution Letter for the purposes of Section 4.1.1 of the Amended and Restated Framework Agreement.

The officers responsible for coordination of all matters related to this Administrative Agreement are:

For the Donor:

Attention: Director  
Unit for Latin America and the Caribbean  
Department for the Americas and Asia  
P.O. Box 513, FI-0023 Government, Finland  
Tel.: +358 295 350 000  
E-mail: [asa-30@formin.fi](mailto:asa-30@formin.fi)

For the IDB:

- a. All communications pertaining to Donors relations and resource mobilization will be directed to:

Attention: Manager  
Office of Outreach and Partnerships  
Inter-American Development Bank  
1300 New York Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20577 U.S.A.  
Tel: + 202 623-2107  
Fax: + 202 623-4072  
E-mail: [partnerships@iadb.org](mailto:partnerships@iadb.org)

- b. Day-to-day communications regarding the implementation of this Administrative Arrangement shall be directed to:

Attention: Chief, Grants and Co-financing Management Unit  
Office of Outreach and Partnerships  
1300 New York Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20577  
Tel.: + 202 623-2019  
Fax: + 202 623-3171  
E-mail: [orp-gcm@iadb.org](mailto:orp-gcm@iadb.org)

Capitalized terms used but not defined in this Administrative Agreement shall have the meanings ascribed to them in the Amended and Restated Framework Arrangement.

I would like to propose that this letter, upon your confirmation where indicated below, constitutes an Administrative Agreement under the Amended and Restated Framework Arrangement between the Donor and the IDB.

Sincerely yours,

By:   
\_\_\_\_\_  
Roy Eriksson

Director, Unit for Latin America and the Caribbean  
**Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Finland**

Confirmed and accepted:



\_\_\_\_\_  
Luis Alberto Moreno  
President  
**Inter-American Development Bank**

## ANNEX A

SIMULTANEOUS DISCLOSURE

DOCUMENT OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

### HAITI

#### SUPPORT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EDUCATION PLAN AND REFORM IN HAITI

(HA-L1060)

#### GRANT PROPOSAL

The project team consisting of: Julien Hautier (EDU/CHA), Project Team Leader; Antine Legrand and Anouk Ewald (EDU/CHA); Sabine Rieble Aubourg, Carlos Herrán, and Tania Vera (SCL/EDU); Fabiano Cruz (SCL/SCT); Yannú Cruz Aguayo and María Cristina Cárdenas (SPD/SDV); Ximena Herbas (VPS/ESG); Aurélie Gilles (VPC/HRC); Taos Aliouat (LEG/SGO); Emilie Chapuis and Marise Salvane (PDP/CHA); Maria Fernanda Garcia Rincon (ORP/ORP); Pierre-Emmanuel Couralet and Taea Calcut (consultants); prepared this document.

This document is being released to the public and distributed to the Bank's Board of Executive Directors simultaneously. The Board may or may not approve the document, or may approve it with modifications. If the document is subsequently updated, the updated document will be made publicly available in accordance with the Bank's Access to Information Policy.

## CONTENT

PROJECT SUMMARY .....	1
I. DESCRIPTION AND RESULTS MONITORING.....	2
A. Background, problem addressed, justification.....	2
B. Objective, components and cost .....	5
C. Key results indicators .....	11
II. FINANCING STRUCTURE AND MAIN RISKS.....	12
A. Financing instruments.....	12
B. Environmental and social safeguard risks .....	13
C. Fiduciary risk .....	13
D. Other key issues and risks.....	14
III. IMPLEMENTATION AND MANAGEMENT PLAN .....	14
A. Summary of implementation arrangements.....	14
B. Summary of arrangements for monitoring results .....	16
C. Significant design activities post approval .....	16

ANNEXES	
ANNEX I:	Summary Development Effectiveness Matrix (DEM)
ANNEX II:	Results Framework
ANNEX III:	Fiduciary Arrangements

ELECTRONIC LINKS	
<b>REQUIRED</b>	
1.	POA (Plan of activities for first disbursement and the first 18 months of implementation) <a href="http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36407832">http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36407832</a>
2.	Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements <a href="http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36401364">http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36401364</a>
3.	Complete Procurement Plan <a href="http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36407838">http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36407838</a>
4.	ESMR (Environmental and Social Management Report) (If required and as specified in the guidelines for OP-703 and Disaster Risk Management Policy) <a href="http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36407966">http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36407966</a>
<b>OPTIONAL</b>	
1.	Economic Analysis <a href="http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36408107">http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36408107</a>
2.	Haiti Education Sector Note <a href="http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36275381">http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36275381</a>
3.	School district deprived of public schools <a href="http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36408203">http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36408203</a>
4.	Sport for Development Pilot Project – Note <a href="http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36439750">http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36439750</a>
5.	Haitian Education Plan 2010-2015 <a href="http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36228454">http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36228454</a>

## ABBREVIATIONS

AECID	<i>Agencia Española Cooperación Internacional Para El Desarrollo</i>
AFD	<i>Agence Française de Développement / French Development Agency</i>
AOP	Annual Operation Plan
ASER	Annual Status of Education Report
BNC	<i>Banque Nationale de Crédit</i>
CDB	Caribbean Development Bank
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
COH	<i>Comité Olympique Haitien / Haitian Olympic Committee</i>
ECD	Early Childhood Development
EFA	<i>Education pour Tous / Education for All</i>
EMIS	Education Management Information System
ESMR	Environmental and Social Management Report
FAES	<i>Fonds d'Assistance Economique et Social / Fund for Economic and Social Assistance</i>
GoH	Government of Haiti
HRF	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
IHRC	Interim Haitian Reconstruction Commission
IHSI	<i>Institut Haïtien de Statistique et d'Informatique / Haitian Statistical and Computing Institute</i>
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INFP	<i>Institut National de Formation Professionnelle / National Institute of Professional Training</i>
IRP	Interactive Radio Program
MEF	Ministry of Economy and Finance
MENFP	Ministry of Education and Professional Training
MO	Manual of Operations
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MTPTC	<i>Ministère des Travaux Publics, des Transports et Communications / Ministry of Public Works and Telecommunication</i>
MYSKA	Ministry of Youth, Sports and Civic Action / <i>Ministère de la Jeunesse, des Sports et de l'Action Civique</i>
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organization
ORP	Office of Outreach and Partnerships
PEFA	Public Expenditure & Financial Accountability
PEMFAR	Public Expenditure Management and Financial Accountability Assessment Report
PNCS	<i>Programme National des Cantines Scolaires / National School Canteen Program</i>
PRODEV	Progress and Development Foundation
PSG	Project Specific Grant
SIIGPP	Système Intégré d'Information et de Gestion de Programmes et Projets
SMC	School Management Committee



TVET      Technical and Vocational Education and Training  
UCP      *Unité de Coordination des Projets* / Project Coordination Unit  
UNESCO    United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization  
WB        World Bank

**PROJECT SUMMARY**  
**HAITI**  
**SUPPORT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EDUCATION PLAN AND REFORM IN HAITI**  
**(HA-L1060)**

Financial Terms and Conditions				
Beneficiary: Republic of Haiti			Amortization period:	N/A
Executing Agency: Ministry of Education and Professional Training (MENFP) and Fund for Economic and Social Assistance ( <i>Fonds d'Assistance Economique et Social-FAES</i> )			Grace period:	N/A
			Disbursement period:	36 months
<b>Source</b>	<b>Amount US\$</b>	<b>%</b>	Interest rate:	N/A
IDB (GRF)	50,000,000	88%	Supervision and inspection fee:	N/A
Parallel financing (Southcom)	4,190,000	7%	Credit fee:	N/A
Co-financing (of component 3)	2,600,000	5%	Currency:	US\$
Total	56,790,000	100%		
Project at a Glance				
<b>Project objective/description:</b> This operation will contribute to the Bank five-year program supporting the following objectives of the Haitian Education Plan: (i) improving access to education; (ii) improving the quality of education; (iii) improving Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) opportunities; and (iv) strengthening MENFP institutional capacities and governance (see ¶1.13).				
<b>Special contractual clauses:</b> <b>Conditions prior to first disbursement:</b> (i) The Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF) and FAES shall enter into and provide the Bank a copy of, an agreement in form and substance satisfactory to the Bank, pursuant to which MEF will transfer resources from the Bank and local contributions, as applicable, to FAES for the execution of the project (¶3.1); (ii) MENFP shall provide, to the satisfaction of the Bank, an updated memorandum of understanding with FAES to account for the activities developed under this project (¶3.1); (iii) FAES, UCP and EFA shall approve, to the satisfaction of the Bank, revisions to their respective manual of operations to account for the activities presented in this project and also include, in the case of FAES and UCP, the environmental and social recommendations outlined in the ESMR (¶3.1); (iv) FAES must show evidence satisfactory to the Bank that its procurement unit is staffed with three procurement specialists (¶2.6); (v) UCP must show evidence satisfactory to the Bank that its procurement unit is staffed with one procurement specialist (¶2.6). <b>Special Execution Conditions:</b> (i) prior to the execution of Component 1, FAES must show evidence satisfactory to the Bank that: (a) it has extended its existing memorandum of understanding with the Ministry of Public Works, Transportation, and Communication (MTPTC) establishing the terms of its collaboration with the MTPTC's laboratory which is responsible for assessing the conformity of construction materials (¶3.2); and (b) it has contracted an independent engineering firm to ensure compliance with anti-seismic and hurricane-safe norms during the design and execution of new constructions (¶3.2); (ii) under Component 1, prior to contracting consultants to conduct the technical studies on the new construction sites and contracting firms for the rehabilitation works, the selection criteria applicable for the construction of new schools and the rehabilitation of schools financed by the Bank contribution must be met to the satisfaction of the Bank (¶3.2); (iii) under Component 1, prior to financing the equipment for 8 schools to be built by a partner, the Bank shall receive evidence to its satisfaction that such schools will be built (¶1.16); (iv) prior to the execution of the tuition waiver program of Component 2, EFA shall implement, to the satisfaction of the Bank, a new accounting system and prepare an accounting manual (Annex III ¶4.1.e); and (iii) prior to the execution of the sports center activity of Component 3, (a) all necessary co-financings, estimated at an amount of at least US\$2.6 million shall have been secured in a timely manner to the satisfaction of the Bank; and (b) FAES, the Ministry of Youth, Sports and Civic Action (MYSCA) and the Comité Olympique Haitien (COH) shall enter into and provide the Bank a copy of, a memorandum of understanding establishing the terms and conditions pursuant to which COH will be directly contracted by FAES to coordinate this activity under the supervision of MYSCA (¶1.26).				
<b>Exceptions to Bank policies:</b> N/A				
<b>Special Aspects:</b> 1. Additional cofinancings are contemplated to support the components of this project without seeking further Board approvals, to the extent certain Board approved conditions are met (¶2.2 and ¶2.3). 2. PNCS and COH will be hired directly pursuant to Bank procurement policies (¶3.6).				
<b>Project qualifies for:</b> SEQ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PTI <input type="checkbox"/> Sector <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Geographic <input type="checkbox"/> Headcount <input type="checkbox"/>				

## I. DESCRIPTION AND RESULTS MONITORING

### A. Background, problem addressed, justification

- 1.1 **Education in Haiti: main constraints and opportunity.** At the time of the earthquake, Haiti had just begun to recover from a series of hurricanes and other external shocks that impacted the country in 2008 and taxed a chronically underperforming education system. Limited access, uneven and low quality of education, as well as insufficient regulatory and supervision capacity of the public sector characterizes a system in which 90% of the supply comes through non-public providers. The earthquake exacerbated these challenges, rendering inoperable an estimated 25% of basic and secondary schools, 70% of technical and vocational centers and most universities. The education sector sustained damages and destruction estimated at US\$480 million. Parents' ability to pay for schooling was also affected, as the share of two income households has fallen from 66 to 17.5%. The Ministry of Education and Professional Training (MENFP) whose building collapsed, continues to operate with reduced staff in temporary structures or tents.
- 1.2 Despite a high demand for education, many Haitian children remain out of school, mainly due to an insufficient public supply of education (8% of the grade 1-9 schools) and the cost of private alternatives. About 500,000 primary school-aged children were out of school prior to the earthquake. The future of Haitian children is also undermined by the low transition and completion rates. About 94% of children enrolled in primary schools are over-aged, resulting in low net enrollment rates (estimated between 50 and 60% depending on sources) and high gross enrollment rate exceeding 120%. This specificity is explained by late entry (53% of grade 1-6 students), combined with high dropout rates (12%), resulting in low completion rates (79% at primary level; DHS 2005) and low literacy. At the preschool level, total enrollment represents two third of the school age population; this falls to 22% at the secondary level (MENFP, 2010).
- 1.3 For most children, non-public schools, representing around 90% of the supply of education and characterized by highly variable quality and cost, are the only option available when families can afford paying. The most recent estimate of the annual cost of tuition at non-public institutions (US\$120 at preschool, US\$160 at grade 1-9, and US\$350 at secondary level) represents a significant expense for the 76% of the population living on less than US\$2 a day, resulting in no education or a few years of schooling that does not prevent them from illiteracy. Indeed, the household socioeconomic level, besides its structure and the education of parents, are the most important determinants of schooling in Haiti (World Bank, 2010).
- 1.4 Children who have access to education are generally provided with a low quality education, especially in the 92% of non-public schools lacking accreditation. Haitian adults have the highest illiteracy rate (57%) of the Caribbean region. According to a study on 2,500 students, literacy skills are extremely poor in

French and not much better in Creole. Third graders are not able to read more than 25 words per minute while the international standard is set to 60. They deliver correct answers to less than 10% of the questions related to a short and simple text in French and 17% in Creole. The same study (GoH, 2010) also highlights that students owning at least one book perform significantly better in reading and up to five times better in comprehension. Such as for access, repetition and drop out, there is no significant gender difference in terms of literacy skills.

- 1.5 Though further analysis on the determinants of learning in Haiti is required, teachers' motivation and skills might explain a significant share of the low quality of education. Out of the 60,000 teachers at the grade 1-9 level, 80% teach without having received a relevant diploma and any initial training. The low qualification and motivation of teachers is mainly explained by the lack of training opportunities, the low level of remuneration (US\$150 to US\$225 monthly in the public sector, less in the private sector; Leignel 2010), combined with a lack of adequate space and materials, and supervision and support from the administration.
- 1.6 Technical and Vocational Training (TVET) opportunities for Haitians are scarce, mainly supply-side driven, and little is known about the quality of the training. Training centers are usually under-equipped and operate in the absence of standards and regulations. The capacity of the *Institut National de Formation Professionnelle* (INFP, under the MENFP) to regulate the TVET sector has long been hampered by the lack of resources (US\$4 million annually) and shortcomings in management; for instance, until now INFP operates without a senior manager. Furthermore, the effectiveness of the training programs is undermined by their weak alignment with the private sector demand, while best practices encourage the involvement of entrepreneurs in the definition of programs, as well as on site trainings with workers directly learning the skills needed by the private sector (IDB, 2010).
- 1.7 The education sector governance rests on a Ministry which receives 10% of the total Government of Haiti (GoH) budget, controls 8% of the grade 1-9 schools, operates with highly centralized procedures and management, and has little regulatory power over both public and non-public schools. In addition to an insufficient budget allocation, MENFP has limited technical and administrative capacity to operate those resources. Since human resources management is restricted to routine administration (MENFP, 2011), the personnel is not necessarily distributed according to the needs of the education system and not held accountable for results. Decentralized offices have limited power and capacity to supervise and support schools, especially outside urban areas. Results of a recent institutional analysis highlight that better governance requires: (i) information systems for policy making and monitoring; (ii) a revised legal and organizational framework for management; (iii) operational norms and procedures; (iv) improved public capacity to regulate the non-public sector; and (v) the decentralization of capacities and decision making.

- 1.8 Planning, monitoring and evaluation are hampered by the scarcity of relevant, timely, and structured information. Basic statistics on the education system and the population, such as on the number of schools, their location, the number of teachers and students by level or the school age population,<sup>1</sup> are scarce and not reliable. The last population and school censuses were conducted in 2003 and the last household survey in 2000. A multi-donor effort is currently supporting the 2011 school census; preliminary results are expected by October 2011. Nevertheless, routine data collection and analysis still need to be implemented. Hence, reducing the knowledge gap on critical issues, such as the most cost-effective strategy to reach free and universal education, the determinants of education quality, the effectiveness of TVET programs and the sustainability of the education policy, among others, would considerably improve policy making and monitoring.
- 1.9 **Government strategy for the sector.** An opportunity has emerged out of the horrendous 2010 earthquake for the government to develop a comprehensive plan for education reform and long-term donors' commitment. The plan, approved by the Interim Haitian Reconstruction Agency (IHRC) in October 2010, lays out the framework for achieving a tuition-free, well-managed education system open to all children and providing quality educational services. The 2010-2015 plan combines the reconstruction of educational infrastructure with lasting reforms of system management and accountability. The newly elected President of Haiti which top priority is education, has defined the following three priorities for the implementation of the Education Plan: (i) free education for 6-12 year old students combined with a special attention on 4-5 year old (preschool) kids, through an increase in the public supply of education, subsidies and partnership with the non-public sector; (ii) the provision of TVET opportunities nation-wide; and (iii) the reform of the current teacher training system. The implementation of this plan, estimated to cost US\$4.3 billion, implies a massive investment supported initially by grants from the international community and over time by a progressive rise in the GoH's contribution, as public finances are placed on a sounder footing and domestic revenues increase as a result of the IMF's Extended Credit Facility Program.
- 1.10 **Program strategy.** In 2010, the Bank pledged US\$500 million to support the government's education plan over the 2010-2015 period. Of this amount US\$250 million will be provided as grant resources from the IDB's Haiti Grant Facility and an equivalent amount will be co-financed by other donors. In November 2010, the Bank approved its first operation for US\$50 million (HA-L1049). In the first six months of implementation, US\$13 million has been disbursed from this operation and fund-raising efforts have generated an additional US\$31.4 million in co-financing from CIDA (CAD\$20m), the Haiti Reconstruction Fund (HRF, US\$10m) and Trinidad and Tobago First Citizens Bank (US\$1m), as well as 10 million Euros in parallel financing from *Agencia Española Cooperación*

---

<sup>1</sup> Refer to the [UNESCO Institute of Statistics website on Haiti](#). All other countries provide data.

*Internacional Para El Desarrollo* (AECID) and US\$400,000 from the Barefoot Foundation. Out of 37 schools to be built within HA-L1049, 10 construction works, 20 technical studies and 7 site identification processes have already started (school map); 30,000 schools kits have been delivered; 70,000 other children have benefitted from free tuition for the past and current school year; consultants have been contracted to support MENFP in the implementation of the Education Plan. Since most of HA-L1049 resources will be absorbed in 2012 and the current operation will start disbursing in 2012, the strategy of overlapping operations allows for continuous and massive investments over time to respond to the reconstruction needs.

- 1.11 This operation will further support the transformation of the education system in Haiti by: (i) consolidating the necessary investments initiated within HA-L1049 (Grant 2464/GR-HA), in particular to increase education supply, subsidize education costs and strengthen MENFP executing and regulatory capacity; and (ii) intensifying qualitative improvements of the system, especially through innovative teaching and learning tools in the classrooms, learning measurement systems and public-private partnership for the management of TVET centers. Rigorous impact evaluation and monitoring to be conducted within this operation, will allow for further qualitative reforms within the next Bank's operations. The Haiti Education Sector Note, especially its annex II, provides a more detailed framework of the IDB annual contribution to the Education Plan objectives.
- 1.12 **Consistency with Country Strategy and IDB-9.** The proposed project is fully aligned with the Country Strategy Update (2010-2011) (GN-2465-2), regarding the strategic objectives of improving the access and quality of education, reforming TVET and strengthening the MENFP's institutional capacity. Finally, the project will contribute to the following GCI-9 targets: (i) small and vulnerable countries; and (ii) poverty reduction and equity enhancement.

**B. Objective, components and cost**

- 1.13 This operation will contribute to the Bank's five-year program supporting the following objectives of the Haitian Education Plan: (i) improving access to education; (ii) improving the quality of education; (iii) improving TVET opportunities; and (iv) strengthening MENFP institutional capacities and governance. More specifically, HA-L1060 objectives are to: (i) increase the public supply of education benefitting 15,000 children annually; (ii) reduce education costs for 75,000 primary students; (iii) improve education quality through educational and technological innovations benefitting 13,500 children; (iv) improve TVET opportunities through a sustained investment effort and innovations in managing the sector and training centers benefitting at least 600 youth annually; and (v) increase MENFP's capacity to implement the Education Plan and regulate the education sector.

- 1.14 **Component 1. Increased public supply of education from preschool to grade 9 for 15,000 children annually** (US\$23.8 million). This component contributes to the objective of increasing public education supply. Key activities to be financed are: (i) the construction and equipment of 20 public schools in areas deprived of schools; (ii) the rehabilitation of 15 public schools damaged by the earthquake or needing upgrades and the equipment of eight schools financed by a partner; and (iii) the operational costs of two schools in a relocation area near Port-au-Prince. In total, this operation will benefit 45 schools and 15,000 children annually.
- 1.15 At the end of this operation, 20 new public schools will be functional in districts that are deprived of any type of school. Each school will operate with at least 11 teachers and 410 children in two preschool classrooms and nine grade 1-9 classrooms. All schools will have an administration building, including an office for the director and a working room for teachers, an equipped library, sanitary facilities, a school canteen and kitchen. Each school will also be equipped with energy and water systems, individual chairs and desks, and be accessible for disabled children. This operation will also finance the identification of 120 new sites for construction, on the basis of objective and consistent criteria, to prepare for co-financing and subsequent Bank operations.
- 1.16 Rehabilitation works and equipment will target 15 schools that have been damaged by the earthquake and needing upgrades for safety reasons or to comply with MENFP standards,<sup>2</sup> in particular ensuring that the schools offer continuous education from grade 1 to 6 at least. Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF) and MENFP must commit to allocate the necessary administrative and teaching staff before the beginning of works for all new and upgraded schools. All new constructions will comply with building codes against natural disasters currently in use in Haiti and MENFP design guidelines. All school directors and committees benefitting from the project will be trained and provided with a maintenance plan. Additionally, equipment will be provided after eight schools are built with parallel financing from the partner Southcom (US Army).
- 1.17 The project will support the operation of two schools being built under prior project (HA-L1049) in the Zoranje area (near Port-au-Prince), where the Bank is also financing the construction of 400 houses for displaced population. A locally based NGO will operate the schools benefitting at least 800 preschool to grade 9 students. It is expected that by 2014, MENFP will be able to operate the two schools.
- 1.18 **Component 2. Tuition-free and quality primary education for more 75,000 children annually** (US\$8.8 million). The objective of this component is to support the demand for education by subsidizing households' education expenses, thus encouraging access and retention. This operation will contribute to the government's strategy to provide universal and free education to all 6-12 years

---

<sup>2</sup> Following the MENFP standards: (i) eight classrooms from preschool (25 students each) to grade 6 (40 students each); or (ii) 11 classrooms from preschool to grade 9.

old by 2015. Key activities to be financed are: (i) tuition waivers for 35,000 children attending non-public schools; (ii) free school materials, uniforms and textbooks for 30,000 children; and (iii) teaching materials for 2,000 teachers.

- 1.19 As with HA-L1049, this operation will support the free enrollment of 35,000 children in 200 non-public schools for two additional years of primary education.<sup>3</sup> Since 2007, the tuition waiver program has consisted of the transfer of US\$90 per child to 1,223 non-public schools, comprised of US\$69 for administrative expenses, including teachers' salaries, and US\$21 for textbooks and learning materials. Reports indicate that beneficiary schools mostly comply with selection criteria, including accreditation, textbooks per child (three), class size (45 students per class), student enrollment targets, and fee abolition. Reports also note the need to improve program management to ensure timely payments, schools' support for compliance with technical standards and financial reporting, and the definition of sanctions. The program will use the same mechanisms as for HA-L1049, and contribute to the tuition waiver program along with the GoH, Caribbean Development Bank (CDB), Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) and the World Bank (WB). In addition, technical assistance will be provided to develop a database<sup>4</sup> on beneficiary schools to improve targeting, retention, quality and accreditation.
- 1.20 Subsidizing education costs will be completed by the provision of basic school materials (school kits), uniforms (two per students) and textbooks (four per student) to 30,000 children from preschool to grade 6 in approximately 100 public and non-public schools, including 50 schools built under the Bank's operations and 50 other public schools offering education from grade 1 to 6 at least, and located in the poorest districts (*Poverty Map, 2004*). School kits and uniforms will be provided individually and comply with the standards defined by MENFP. Textbooks will be provided to schools that commit to implement the textbook rental system already implemented in some schools by MENFP, ensuring an average book life of three years. In the same schools, 2,000 teachers will be provided with teaching materials to improve their motivation.
- 1.21 **Component 3. Improved learning opportunities for 13,500 children annually (US\$7.1 million).** The objective of this component is to provide opportunities for improved literacy and mathematics skills in early grades through innovations. Key activities to be financed are: (i) an interactive radio program to assist teaching in language and math benefitting 12,000 children; (ii) a competitive fund for educational innovations benefitting at least 1,500 children; (iii) technical

---

<sup>3</sup> The program started in 2007 in two departments (out of ten in Haiti) and 580 schools selected on a voluntary basis; it was extended in 2008 to six additional departments (for a total of eight out of ten) and 643 schools selected according to a competitive process. In summary, beneficiary schools need to show evidence of accreditation by MENFP, a qualified body of teachers and adequate infrastructure. Schools also sign a contract committing to use the subsidy to provide three textbooks per child and pay teachers' salary. Beneficiary children are selected by the schools.

<sup>4</sup> Compiling data from different sources, including the school census, reading assessment to be financed by the World Bank in 250 beneficiary schools, and technical/verification audits.



assistance for the development of a national testing system; and (iv) extra-curricular activities for 6-14 years old in one sport center.

- 1.22 The quality of teaching and learning will be supported through alternative methods of delivering education, including radios or preloaded MP3 players (in remote areas). While the MENFP, with UNESCO and CIDA support, is developing a unified teacher training system to be operational by 2013, this program will provide a transitional solution to transform classrooms into interactive learning environments. Traditional math and reading lessons will be supplemented by half-hour programs broadcasted daily into classrooms and designed to guide teachers through the use of songs, dramas, and interactive learning activities. This program known in Haiti as *Edikasyon a Distans* and officially recognized by MENFP, will be reactivated after an interruption in 2008 due to lack of funding. Impact evaluations have shown that after two years, the average scores of beneficiaries in Haiti significantly exceeded those of non-beneficiaries in math and comprehension; students also spent more time on task. Teaching techniques, such as encouraging student participation, also improved.
- 1.23 At the end of the project, 12,000 children from grades 2-4 in 100 schools will have improved their literacy and math skills. This operation will support the upgrade of the interactive radio program, following a rigorous monitoring and evaluation protocol. For grades 2-4, the existing programs in math and Creole will be revised and implemented in 100 public and non-public schools randomly selected within one department. Technical support and training will be provided to MENFP-Radio Educative unit for the implementation of the program. Future operations and potential co-financing will support the development of the program for other grades, introduce the use of other interactive devices (mobile phones, tablet, etc.) and expand it to an increased number of schools.
- 1.24 Competitive Fund for Educational Innovations (the Fund). The objective of the Fund (US\$1 million) is to improve the quality of education through the use of digital technology in 20 schools built or rehabilitated under HA-L1049 and HA-L1060 and benefitting at least 1,500 children (two grades per school).<sup>5</sup> The selection process and supervision will be driven by a steering committee comprised of MENFP experts and technical partners' representatives. The Fund will finance proposals based on a competitive process and specific technical criteria, including demonstrated impacts on learning, applicability within the local context, number of beneficiaries and potential for scaling up. The selection process will be open to public institutions, Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), and private groups. Among other issues, proposals should include the definition of modalities for capacity building within MENFP, and monitoring and evaluation plans.

---

<sup>5</sup> Within the framework of the National Education Technology Strategy under the reformulated HA-T1093.

- 1.25 This project will contribute to starting the development of a national testing system that would provide regular data on learning in Haitian schools. Technical assistance will be provided to MENFP to define the most cost-effective methodology. The testing system will inform general policy design. At the end of the project, the tools will have been developed and tested to enable implementation within the Bank's next operation and in coordination with other donors.
- 1.26 This operation will also support the development of extra-curricular sports activities in the Port-au-Prince area. The project aims at providing 7,500 children aged from 6 to 14 with enjoyable sport and activity-based learning opportunities that enhance their physical, cognitive and emotional development, in an existing sports center in Carrefour. The Bank, along with co-financing partners, will finance the rehabilitation of the center, equipment, operational costs and the provision of snacks. The Bank will finance the provision of nutritious snacks if, to its satisfaction: (i) all necessary co-financings have been secured in a timely manner to execute this activity; and (ii) FAES, Ministry of Youth, Sports and Civic Action (MYSCA) and *Comité Olympique Haitien* (COH) have entered into a memorandum of understanding (MOU) establishing the terms and conditions under which COH will be directly contracted by FAES to coordinate this activity under the guidance of a steering committee led by MYSCA. The pilot program is intended to inform the design of a national sport for development program.
- 1.27 **Component 4. Increased TVET opportunities for more than 600 youth annually** (US\$8.2 million). This component aims at improving TVET opportunities and employment for at least 600 youth annually and providing skilled workers for the Northern Industrial Park (NIP). Key activities to be financed under this component include: (i) technical assistance to INFP to develop and implement the national TVET policy; (ii) the engineering of training programs in key economic sectors; and (iii) construction, rehabilitation, equipment and management upgrades in six public centers, including three in the NIP area.
- 1.28 Technical and legal assistance will be provided to INFP to develop and start the implementation of the TVET national policy. The policy will identify the needs of the economy and effective implementing and coordination mechanisms of training programs across Ministries, with the involvement of the private formal and informal sector. In particular, this operation will continue the accreditation of private training centers started under Grant 2385/GR-HA (HA0017). A study will inform on the feasibility of a skills certification system (*validation des acquis de l'expérience*), aimed at certifying skills acquired empirically by workers in both formal and informal sectors. To improve the relevance of training, the project will finance market studies and technical assistance to develop new programs in five key sectors of the economy, involving relevant private sector stakeholders. New programs will provide for more flexibility by being organized by modules and greater efficiency by reducing their length and introducing double shifts in the centers.

- 1.29 This project will contribute to sustain the public provision of training and increase its relevance in six public centers. To increase the TVET supply, HA-L1060 will finance the construction and equipment of two centers in the north of the country, one in the south<sup>6</sup> and the rehabilitation of the center in Carrefour (Port-au-Prince). Each center will be equipped with at least four workshops meeting the needs of the local economy. To sustain and improve the effectiveness of the TVET supply, this operation will pilot the implementation of a new management model in four centers<sup>7</sup> consisting in: (i) an innovative scheme for management, involving the private sector; and (ii) a self-sustainable business model to be developed over a period of no more than two years and supported by decreasing subsidies for maintenance and operation costs. To improve policy design, this operation will support the development of a tracking study of trainees six months after graduation.
- 1.30 **Component 5. Strengthening MENFP's executing and regulating capacity** (US\$6.7 million). At the end of the project, it is expected that MENFP will count with: (i) a better implementing and regulatory capacity; (ii) an improved information system for policy design, implementation and monitoring; and (iii) a stronger coalition of public and private partners supporting the Education Plan. The project will mainly finance technical assistance to MENFP.
- 1.31 To improve MENFP execution capacities, technical support will be provided, in coordination with other donors, for the implementation and monitoring of the Education Plan. Grant resources will also be used to support MENFP in the implementation of an accountability system aligning individual and collective incentives with the plan objectives. A particular emphasis will be given to the definition of annual work plans and performance objectives, at the central and decentralized levels. To improve performance and accountability, this operation will support the creation of a pool of highly qualified General Inspectors responsible for auditing the education system and supporting the implementation of upgraded procedures and management schemes. In coordination with the WB and USAID, resources will be targeted to the revision of the legal framework and procedures for regulating and subsidizing non-public providers.
- 1.32 To improve policy design, monitoring and evaluation, HA-L1060 will also co-finance the design and operation of an upgraded information system using available and future school census data (2012, 2013 and 2014) and other available data. Technical assistance and training will be provided to MENFP on data collection and analysis to ensure greater availability and publicity of relevant data. Finally, technical assistance will be provided to ensure an adequate monitoring of the plan's performance, and deepen knowledge on critical issues such as the system internal efficiency, the sustainability of the education policy, and necessary pedagogical reforms, including the secondary level.

---

<sup>6</sup> Cap Haitien and Jérémie (to be equipped) and Trou du Nord (to be built and equipped).  
<sup>7</sup> In Cap Haitien, Gonaives, Carrefour and Jérémie.

- 1.33 The operation will also contribute to MENFP communication on results in order to keep the momentum around the Education Plan, within the civil society, the private sector and the international community. This activity will support the implementation of MENFP communication plan developed under HA-L1049. At the end of the project, eight short documentaries on critical issues in the education sector will have been produced for the national and international audience.
- 1.34 **Cost.** The total cost of this operation is US\$56.79 million of which US\$50 million will be financed by the Bank, US\$4.19 million by Southcom for the construction of eight schools and US\$2.6 million by partners to be identified for the development of the extra-curricular activities in Carrefour (see Table I-1 for details). As indicated, the project is open for additional co-financing arrangements.

Table I-1: Cost table (in US\$)

Categories	Source of financing		Total	%
	IDB	Parallel & Cofinancing		
<b>Component 1. Increased public supply of education</b>	<b>19,560,000</b>	<b>4,190,000</b>	<b>23,750,000</b>	<b>42%</b>
Construction of schools	14,349,025	4,190,000	18,539,025	33%
Rehabilitation and equipment of schools	5,070,975		5,070,975	8%
Operational expenses for schools in relocation areas	140,000		140,000	0%
<b>Component 2. Tuition-free and quality primary education</b>	<b>8,790,000</b>		<b>8,790,000</b>	<b>15%</b>
Tuition waiver program / school subsidy	6,300,000		6,300,000	11%
School kits and uniforms	1,850,000		1,850,000	3%
Textbooks	600,000		600,000	1%
Teachers' kits	40,000		40,000	0%
<b>Component 3. Improved learning opportunities</b>	<b>4,450,000</b>	<b>2,600,000</b>	<b>7,050,000</b>	<b>12%</b>
Interactive radio program	2,500,000		2,500,000	4%
Competitive Fund for Educational Innovations and technical assistance	1,200,000		1,200,000	2%
Development of a national testing system	350,000		350,000	1%
Extra-curricular activities in a sport center	400,000	2,600,000	3,000,000	5%
<b>Component 4. Increasing TVET opportunities</b>	<b>8,170,000</b>		<b>8,170,000</b>	<b>14%</b>
Development and implementation of a national TVET policy	510,000		510,000	1%
Implementation of an innovative management model in training centers	1,060,000		1,060,000	2%
Construction and rehabilitation of training centers	3,000,000		3,000,000	5%
Equipping of training centers	3,600,000		3,600,000	6%
<b>Component 5. Strengthening MENFP's executing and regulating capacity</b>	<b>6,680,000</b>		<b>6,680,000</b>	<b>12%</b>
Technical assistance for the implementation of the Education Plan	1,580,000		1,580,000	3%
Information systems, M&E of the Education Plan	1,430,000		1,430,000	3%
Implementation of the communication strategy	270,000		270,000	0%
Executing units costs	3,400,000		3,400,000	6%
<b>Audit, Monitoring and Evaluation</b>	<b>850,000</b>		<b>850,000</b>	<b>2%</b>
Financial audit	300,000		300,000	1%
Technical audit of the tuition waiver program	250,000		250,000	0%
Monitoring and evaluation	300,000		300,000	1%
<b>Contingency</b>	<b>1,500,000</b>		<b>1,500,000</b>	<b>3%</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>50,000,000</b>	<b>6,790,000</b>	<b>56,790,000</b>	<b>100%</b>

### C. Key results indicators

- 1.35 At the end of the 30-month execution period of the project, it is expected that:  
 (i) 15,000 children from preschool to grade 9 benefit annually from additional and

improved learning space; (ii) 35,000 primary students will annually benefit from primary education for free (tuition waiver) and 30,000 at reduced cost (school kits); (iii) 12,000 children will increase their literacy skills and performance in math and 1,500 will receive improved technology-based education; (iv) 600 youth will benefit from TVET programs better aligned with the labor market demand; and (v) MENFP will have improved capacities to implement the Education Plan and regulate the education sector, both at the central and decentralized level.

## II. FINANCING STRUCTURE AND MAIN RISKS

### A. Financing instruments

- 2.1 The present operation is the second of five annual projects constituting the Bank's US\$250 million commitment to support the Haitian Education Plan. As for HA-L1049, a partnership strategy will be developed with Office of Outreach and Partnerships (ORP) to raise the targeted amount in co-financing. Partners such as the Happy Hearts Foundation and HRF have already expressed interest in co-financing this operation.
- 2.2 In November 2010, during its consideration of HA-L1049, the Board approved a proposal that allows Management to receive contributions from donors to support any approved component in the form of a Project Specific Grant (PSG) or through a trust fund contribution (including HRF), each administered by the Bank up to the aggregate amount of US\$250 million, without the preparation and approval of a separate project proposal. Consistent with the mechanisms created for HA-L1049, co-financing resources raised in support of this operation will be incorporated in accordance with the corresponding co-financing agreements and channeled towards HA-L1060 components, thus increasing their reach and impact. The approval of a separate project proposal would only be required if the above mentioned aggregate amount is exceeded or if a donor wishes to finance a component not included in a Board approved operation or if a proposed co-financed operation falls outside established Bank policies and procedures. As in the case of the HRF co-financing (GN-2586, paragraph 8.2), Management will not charge an administrative fee for donor contributions co-financing a Bank approved operation with Haiti.
- 2.3 The Board is therefore requested to authorize the President, or such representative as he shall designate, to enter into such agreements as may be necessary with donors and with the Republic of Haiti to receive, administer, and allocate to this operation any co-financing resources aimed at supporting and executing the components of this operation. Each operation presented to the Board will report on co-financing results to date.

**B. Environmental and social safeguard risks**

- 2.4 This operation will have a net positive social impact as targeted communities benefit from an increased supply of quality education and professional training. This operation is classified as Category "B" according to the IDB's Environmental Safeguards Policy. The key impacts and risks are associated with the construction and rehabilitation of 35 schools and two training centers in Components 1 and 4. These impacts are expected to be minor, highly localized, typical of small to medium scale construction sites, and readily manageable through the implementation of environmental, health and safety mitigation measures. Though, Haiti is prone to natural hazards and has historically lacked construction codes or agencies regulating the construction and rehabilitation of civil infrastructure. Given these considerations, the IDB reviewed the capabilities, processes, and tools for environmental and social impact assessment and management by the responsible executing agencies, FAES and UCP. The Environmental and Social Management Report (ESMR) describes recommended mitigation measures to be included in this operation, as well as monitoring and supervision activities to oversee environmental and social performance.

**C. Fiduciary risk**

- 2.5 Based on an updated assessment of financial management and internal and external control systems done in August 2011, the proposed operation is expected to have a low fiduciary risk for components executed by FAES given the strength of its financial management and control systems, and experience in executing Bank projects. The same assessments completed in December 2010 and August 2011 for UCP and EFA respectively, concludes to a medium risk for both, due to weaknesses in financial reporting in the first case and a lack of appropriate computerized accounting software and information systems in the second. The ex-post methodology is recommended for the disbursement process for all three executing agencies/units. The fiduciary staff of the Bank will conduct at least two annual visits per executing agency and unit to review execution of financial plan, recording of transactions and overall management of project documentation.
- 2.6 In 2011, the Bank conducted an institutional assessment and a procurement analysis of FAES which recommended: **(i) the staffing of the procurement unit with three procurement specialists, as conditions prior to first disbursement;** and **(ii) keeping FAES under ex-post review for procurement related duties.** The specific thresholds for ex-post review are specified in an Aide-Memoire and in Annex III to this document. Supervision plans will be prepared accordingly and include semi-annual ex-post reviews of all procurement processes. **The procurement analysis of UCP concluded to the need of contracting one procurement specialist, as conditions prior to first disbursement.**

**D. Other key issues and risks**

**Table II- 1: Risks and mitigation**

Risk	Mitigating measure
Lack of financing hampers the Education Plan implementation and performance.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Technical assistance on sector financing and policy sustainability.</li> <li>• Support to MENFP's communication policy to show achievements.</li> <li>• Partnerships and co-financing strategy developed with ORP.</li> </ul>
MENFP and executing agencies/units' institutional capacity constrain execution and resource absorption.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Financial and technical assistance to MENFP and executing agencies/units'.</li> <li>• Institutional assessments of executing agencies.</li> <li>• Close coordination with other donors financing capacity building.</li> </ul>
Limited availability of data for progress monitoring.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Technical and financial support to the MENFP's information system.</li> </ul>

**III. IMPLEMENTATION AND MANAGEMENT PLAN**

**A. Summary of implementation arrangements**

3.1 This operation will have two executing agencies, MENFP and FAES. FAES will execute all components with the exception of Component 4 and the payment of the Tuition Waiver Program (TWP) under Component 2. MENFP will execute the TWP within Component 2 through its executing unit EFA and Component 4 through its executing unit UCP. FAES, EFA and UCP will report to the MENFP, which will organize regular meetings with the Bank to review progress. **As conditions prior to first disbursement: (i) MEF must sign an agreement with FAES for the transfer of Bank and local resources to FAES for the execution of the project; (ii) FAES, UCP and EFA must approve updates to their current manual of operations to account for this project's activities and also include, in the case of FAES and UCP, the environmental and social recommendations outlined in the ESMR; (iii) MENFP must update its existing MOU with FAES to account for the activities developed under this operation; and (iv) the procurement recommendations set forth in ¶2.6 above must be met.**

3.2 **Site selection and safety norms.** The site selection for the 20 new public schools financed by the Bank contribution will be performed by the MENFP and respond to the following criteria, among others: (i) absence of school in a district; (ii) availability of land for integration into the public domain; (iii) school age population from preschool to grade 9 in the district as per official statistics equal or greater than 800, assuming double shift; and (iv) formal commitment of MEF and MENFP to finance and allocate the required teaching and administrative personnel on site.<sup>8</sup> The selection of public schools for rehabilitation financed by the Bank contribution will respond to at least two of the following criteria: (i) evidence of safety risks at existing school; (ii) lack of classrooms to ensure continuous education from grade 1 to 6 at least; and (iii) lack of equipment to ensure proper learning conditions. As with HA-L1049, grant resources will be

<sup>8</sup> If criteria are not met, the resources will be redirected to the reconstruction of existing schools in poor conditions and already provided with the necessary personnel.

used to contract at least one structural engineer to ensure that all new construction meets the new requirements. FAES will also extend its MOU with the MTPTC's laboratory establishing the terms of its collaboration to review construction materials. Proof of compliance with these criteria and conditions will be a condition prior to the execution of Component 1.

- 3.3 **Competitive Fund for Educational Innovations.** Result-based contracts will be used for the transfer of funds to beneficiaries upon delivery. The operational details for the Funds' management will be developed in a specific manual of operation.
- 3.4 **Execution capacity.** In the event that additional co-financings representing more than 20% of the initial project cost are made available during project execution, the Bank and GOH will evaluate the executing agencies/units' readiness prior to disbursing the new resources and make recommendations for further institutional strengthening, if necessary. To finance institutional strengthening activities, co-financing will systematically include a budget line for project execution.
- 3.5 Procurement of works, goods and services, as well as contracts for consulting services will be executed in accordance with the Bank's procurement policies, rules and procedures (GN-2349-9 and GN-2350-9), complemented by the special procurement provisions to address the emergency caused by the 2010 earthquake (OP-387-3).
- 3.6 **Sole source contracts.** Sole source selection is proposed for the following partners and services: (i) the public agency *Programme National des Cantines Scolaires* (PNCS) for the distribution of school kits, uniforms, textbooks and teachers kits given its unique distribution network throughout the country, and for an amount not exceeding US\$100,000 from the Bank contribution;<sup>9</sup> and (ii) COH, a non-profit organization, given its unique expertise in the implementation of sports programs in Haiti, for the operation of the extracurricular activities of Component 3 for an amount to be determined according to the amount of co-financing raised for this activity; this contract will be signed only if the conditions set forth in ¶1.26 are met.<sup>10</sup> Refer to annex III, 5.4.
- 3.7 **Project financial management.** Project financial management will be executed according to OP-273-2. EFA, FAES and UCP will open separate bank accounts for the management of the grant and co-financing resources provided under this operation. Each executing unit will maintain proper financial management systems and will prepare an Annual Operation Plan, a procurement plan and a twelve-month detailed financial plan indicating cash flow needs for the project

---

<sup>9</sup> PNCS was created in 1997 and placed under the MENFP authority. It has developed a unique distribution network of food, deworming pills and vitamins in the schools of the 10 departments of the country. PNCS has also already delivered schools kits within previous operations of the Bank, including HA-L1049.

<sup>10</sup> Sole source is justified by COH's experience in the implementation of similar activities with UN agencies funding at the national level, to the satisfaction of these agencies. Also, the COH has developed a long-term relationship with MYSCA in the implementation of similar programs.



execution and serving as the basis for advance of funds disbursements. Advances of funds will be for the equivalent of funding needs required for six months of project execution for FAES, four months for UCP and three months for EFA.

- 3.8 **Tuition Waiver Program (TWP).** Payments will be based on established EFA procedures for providing funding for the tuition program. Payment will be made in two tranches during the school year. Payment of the first tranche (60%) will be subject to the receipt of the approved school listing and will be deposited in the EFA Central Bank Account opened to that effect. EFA will then transfer funds from the Central Bank account to an account of the approved School Management Committees (SMC) opened at the *Banque Nationale de Cr dit* (BNC). Payment of the second tranche (40%) will be subject to the receipt of the verification agency reports as required by established EFA procedures. SMCs which have not complied with established procedures will be excluded in the second payment.
- 3.9 **Financial audits.** FAES will be responsible for contracting an external auditor eligible to the Bank to perform the audit of the program, including all co-financing resources, as follows: one annual financial audit including the review of procurement and disbursement processes of each executing agency/unit (FAES, EFA and UCP) to be submitted within 120 days of the end of each fiscal year, and a final financial audit to be submitted within 120 days after the last disbursement date. For the TWP executed by EFA, a financial audit of the use of funds by the SMCs, for schools financed by IDB and co-financing partners, will be performed based on agreed upon procedures and submitted to the Bank within 90 days following the disbursement of the second tranche.

**B. Summary of arrangements for monitoring results**

- 3.10 Building on the Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) arrangements developed under HA-L1049, FAES, UCP and EFA will present to the MENFP and to the Bank a biannual progress report on the indicators included in the results framework. A comprehensive set of monitoring and capacity building activities has been integrated into project design and funds have been budgeted accordingly. A number of individual evaluation frameworks are described in the M&E plan and include: (i) a plan for a rolling-out of the Bank's school construction intervention via the selection of at least 120 sites for schools to be financed in the next three Bank's operations; (ii) follow up surveys for graduates of TVET centers; and (iii) the impact evaluation of the interactive radio program, via testing of learning outcomes on treatment and control groups. In addition, the Bank will conduct quarterly missions to monitor progress.

**C. Significant design activities post approval**

- 3.11 The following activities will be completed after approval: (i) collection of baseline data for missing values; (ii) development of the operational manual for the management of the Fund; and (iii) development of the operational manual for the implementation of the extracurricular activities in Carrefour.

Development Effectiveness Matrix Summary

Development Effectiveness Matrix Summary			
<b>I. Strategic Alignment</b>			
1. IDB Strategic Development Objectives	Aligned		
Lending Program	(i) Lending to small and vulnerable countries; and (ii) Lending for poverty reduction and equity enhancement.		
Regional Development Goals	(i) Extreme poverty rat, and (ii) Share of youth ages 15 to19 who complete ninth grade.		
Bank Output Contribution (as defined in Results Framework of IDB-9)	(i) Students benefited by education projects (girls, boys), and (ii) Individuals (all, men, women, youth) benefited from programs to promote higher labor market productivity.		
<b>2. Country Strategy Development Objectives</b>			
Country Strategy Results Matrix		Aligned	
Country Program Results Matrix	GN-2617	The project is included in the 2011 Country Program Document.	
Relevance of this project to country development challenges (if not aligned to country strategy or country program)			
<b>3. Development Outcomes - Evaluability</b>			
	Highly Evaluable	Weight	Maximum Score
3. Evidence-based Assessment & Solution	8.4		10
4. Ex-ante Economic Analysis	7.1	25%	10
5. Monitoring and Evaluation	9.5	25%	10
6. Risk & Mitigation Monitoring Matrix	10.0	25%	10
Overall risks rate = magnitude of risks*likelihood		Medium	
Environmental & social risk classification		B	
<b>4. IDB's Policy Additivity</b>			
The project relies on the use of country systems (VPC/PDP criteria)			
The project uses another country system different from the ones above for implementing the program			
The IDB's involvement promotes improvements of the intended beneficiaries and/or public sector entity in the following dimensions:			
	Gender Equality		
	Labor		
	Environment	yes	The executing unit have already integrated in their operational manuals environmental and social management tools to ensure social and environmental friendly constructions and rehabilitations of infrastructure. Energy will also mostly be provided to the schools via solar panels.
Additional (to project preparation) technical assistance was provided to the public sector entity prior to approval to increase the likelihood of success of the project			
The ex-post impact evaluation of the project will produce evidence to close knowledge gaps in the sector that were identified in the project document and/or in the evaluation plan.			

The document presents a proposal to finance with non-reimbursable funds a US\$50 million grant for Haiti, that is complemented with parallel financing and co-financing for an additional US\$6.79 million. The project contributes to support small and vulnerable countries, to reduce poverty and enhance social equity, and is aligned with the Bank's strategy in Haiti.

This project represents the second installment of five that the Bank has planned for its support of the education sector in Haiti after the 2010 earthquake. In the present context, this is a highly relevant project with potentially significant effects for the community. HA-L1060, in line with the Ministry's Plan, has four significant objectives: (i) improving access to education; (ii) improving the quality of education; (iii) reforming technical and vocational training; and (iv) strengthening MENFP institutional capacities and governance. The proposal describes the very challenging situation faced by the country in general and the education sector in particular, and presents a diagnosis of key aspects of the sector, the main issues to be solved and their contributing factors. The project has adequate logic, as for each component it very clearly specifies the objective to be accomplished, linking it to the Ministry's Plan. The results matrix includes adequate indicators for outputs and outcomes. The ex-ante cost benefit analysis is adequate. The analysis is done over prominent components of the project, the assumptions are clear and appropriate, as is the sensitivity analysis that is presented. The project includes an adequate monitoring and evaluation plan that proposes an experimental design for the impact evaluation of the radio/MP3 intervention. The risk matrix is adequate includes mitigation measures and related metrics to track their implementation.

**RESULTS FRAMEWORK**

<b>Project objective</b>	This operation will contribute to the Bank five-year program supporting the following objectives of the Haitian Education Plan: (i) improving access to education; (ii) improving the quality of education; (iii) improving TVET opportunities; and (iv) strengthening MENFP institutional capacities and governance. More specifically, HA-L1060 will result in: (i) increased public supply of education benefitting 15,000 children annually; (ii) reduced education costs for 75,000 primary students; (iii) improved education quality through educational and technological innovations benefitting 13,500 children; (iv) improved TVET opportunities through a sustained investment effort and innovations in managing the sector and training centers benefitting at least 600 youth annually; and (v) increased MENFP's capacity to implement the Education Plan and regulate the education sector.
--------------------------	--

Components	Base 2011	Year 1 (2012/2013 school year)	Year 2 (2013/2014 school year)	Target (end of project/2014)	Comments/Sources
<b>Component 1: Increased public supply of education from preschool to grade 9 for 15,000 children annually</b>					
<b>Outcomes</b>					
Gross enrollment rate from preschool to grade 9 in the districts (sections communales) targeted by the project.	TBD 2011	TBD 2012-2013	TBD 2013-2014	TBD 2013-2014	Baseline to be collected from the 2011 census / Annual censii, IHSI population projections and upgraded FAES reports.
Number of preschool to grade 9 students benefitting annually from additional and improved learning space.	4,000	6,200	15,000	15,000	Baseline to be confirmed / FAES ex-ante and ex-post evaluations of rehabilitated and newly construction schools.
Boys	2,000	3,100	7,500	7,500	
Girls	2,000	3,100	7,500	7,500	
<b>Outputs</b>					
Number of new schools open for enrollment in areas deprived of school.	0	0	20	20	FAES progress report/PV of reception by MENFP, FAES and external supervision cabinets.
Number of rehabilitated schools open for enrollment in targeted areas (according to criteria defined in the POD).	0	5	10	15	
Number of schools equipped and open for enrollment.	0	8	0	8	
Number of schools open for enrollment in Zoranje.	1	2	2	2	

Component 2: Tuition-free and quality primary education for more 75,000 children annually					
<b>Outcomes</b>					
Average grade 1-6 retention/dropout rates in beneficiary schools.	TBD 2011	TBD 2012-2013	TBD 2013-2014	TBD 2013-2014	Baseline to be collected from the 2011 census/Improved EPT progress reports and school censii.
<b>Outputs</b>					
Number of tuition waivers benefitting grade 1-6 students (same cohort over two school years).	35,000	35,000	35,000	35,000	EPT progress reports and technical verification/audit of the TWP.
Number of school kits (basic material), uniforms sets (2 uniforms per child) and textbooks sets (four per child) delivered to children from preschool to grade 6.	0	30,000	0	30,000	PNCS report and FAES reports.
Number of teacher kits delivered to schools.	0	2,000	0	2,000	PNCS report and FAES reports.
Component 3: Improved learning opportunities for 13,500 children annually					
<b>Outcomes</b>					
Learning outcomes for students (grade 2-4) benefitting from the interactive radio program (% of standard deviations).	TBD in Impact Evaluation (base 2012)	TBD in Impact Evaluation (IE)	-	TBD in IE	Data provided by the test implemented within the impact evaluation.
<b>Outputs</b>					
Number of children (grade 2-4) benefitting from the interactive radio program.	0	0	12,000	12,000	Progress report from the IRP implementing agency and verification from Impact Evaluation data.
Number of children benefitting from the Fund for Educational Innovation in 20 schools built under HA-L1049 and HA-L1060.	0	0	1,500	1,500	FAES progress reports.
One diagnostic tool for learning achievements in French and Creole to be developed and tested for early grades (1-6).	0	0	1	1	FAES progress reports.
Number of children benefitting from three hour sessions of personal and physical development at least once a week activities.	0	3,000	7,500	7,500	COH reports and FAES progress reports.
Component 4: Increasing TVET opportunities for more than 600 youth annually					
<b>Outcomes</b>					
Number of certified trainees annually in the six TVET centers.	TBD	400	600	600	Trainees database of TVET centers.
% of trainees employed six months after training.	n/a	n/a	TBD 2013	TBD 2013	Graduate trainees tracking survey.

<b>Outputs</b>					
Bill ( <i>Projet de loi</i> ) on TVET policy and correlative financing law submitted to the Parliament.	0	0	1	1	UCP bi-annual progress reports.
TVET programs reengineered in five key economic sectors, redefining TVET curricula to the market labor demand and reducing training time.	0	5	0	5	
Public centers operating with a public-private board and financially sustainable.	0	0	4	4	Financially independent from subsidies i.e operational and administrative costs of TVET centers are integrated and centers are self-sufficient.
TVET centers rehabilitated or built, equipped and operational.	0	1	2	3	
Database with administrative data on TVET trainees available in all six centers.	0	1	1	1	
<b>Component 5: Strengthening MENFP's executing and regulating capacity</b>					
<b>Outcomes</b>					
Percentage of non-public schools accredited.	TBD 2011	TBD 2012-2013	TBD 2013-2014	TBD 2013-2014	Baseline to be collected from the 2011 census / Annual censii.
Institutionalized information system operational and providing updated and timely data.	0	1	1	1	Indicator is a proxy for the MENFP capacity to use relevant data for policy making and monitoring/ FAES progress reports.
<b>Outputs</b>					
Eight workplans monitored bi-annually corresponding to each one of the thematic working groups in charge of the Education Plan implementation.	0	4	8	8	Mid term evaluation report/bi-annual evaluation of the Education Plan progress and annual workplans implementation.
Annual Education Statistical Report produced and published.	Census	1	1	2	Censii and MENFP information system.
MENFP decrec, revising the legal framework for the regulation of the non-public school and accreditation procedures, is prepared and circulated within the administration.	0	1	0	1	Progress report from MENFP / Mid term evaluation report.
Thematic video-documentaries on the education sector published on the internet.	0	3	5	8	Progress report from MENFP.

## FIDUCIARY ARRANGEMENTS

**COUNTRY:** CCB/CHA

**PROJECT N°:** HA-L1060 - **NAME:** Support to the Implementation of the Education Plan and Reform in Haiti

**EXECUTING AGENCY**<sup>1</sup>: Ministry of Education and Professional Training (MENFP), through Education for All (EFA) for the tuition waiver program within component 2 and *Unité de Coordination des Projets* (UCP) for component 4, and "*Fonds d'Assistance Economique et Sociale*" (FAES).

**PREPARED BY:** Marise E. Salnave and Emilie Chapuis

### I. Executive Summary

1.1 The latest evaluation reports of the Republic of Haiti's Public Financial Management (PFM) systems are: a) the Haiti – *Public Expenditure Management and Financial Accountability Review* (PEMFAR IDB – WB, January, 2008) and the "Haiti-Amélioration de la Gestion Financière et Comptable" (FMI, 2009). Additionally, a PEFA evaluation was conducted in 2007 and currently a new evaluation is being carried out at the request of the Government of Haiti (GoH) and with the financial and technical support of the European Commission (EC); results are expected in the third quarter of 2011. The latest assessment of the procurement system in Haiti was undertaken in the context of the 2007 PEMFAR and conducted in accordance with the methodology for assessment of national procurement systems based on the OECD/DAC-World Bank Working Group indicators. Country financial management systems and external control mechanisms, as evidenced by recent diagnostics, would require further improvements prior to conform to levels consistent with their utilization for the fiduciary management of IDB funded projects. To mitigate these weaknesses the Bank will continue in the foreseeable future to: (i) rely on special project execution units for all projects; and (ii) to conduct close operational supervision of executing agencies/units and activities to strengthen MENFP institutional capacity. External control will be performed for all Bank operations by independent audit firms acceptable to the Bank.

### II. Executing Agency's Fiduciary Context

#### A. *Fonds d'Assistance Economique et Sociale* (FAES)

2.1 FAES has extensive experience in executing Bank financed projects. The *Direction Administrative et Financière* (DAF) is responsible for the administrative and financial management of FAES. Modified cash basis is used for accounting purposes. FAES has recently upgraded its accounting software with a new version of TOMPRO, FINPRONET. FAES will therefore be able to better monitor its budget execution. FAES

---

<sup>1</sup> References to executing agencies throughout the document mean indistinctly such executing agencies or, to the extent applicable, their executing unit(s) named in this document.

is in the process of completing the implementation of SIIGPP which will ensure a closer monitoring of advances of the various projects including the management of contracts. FAES has in place a process for budget execution follow-up. The achievements are compared with the budget estimates on a quarterly basis.

- 2.2 On 1 May 2007, it was considered that FAES had the capacity to perform procurement related duties for goods, works and services in conformity with the Bank's procurement rules and procedures and FAES was placed under ex-post review rather than ex-ante for all procurement processes other than the international biddings. Also, FAES has created an internal workflow governing all procurement processes and ensuring compliance with Bank's rules and Procedures. These guidelines describe clearly all the steps of the procurement process, from checking the availability of funds until contract signature and monitoring. To date FAES counts with one Procurement Specialist based at its Head Quarters; an institutional analysis performed in July 2011 recommends that the procurement function should be reinforced to count with 3 procurement specialists.

**B. Education for All (EFA)**

- 2.3 This operation will be the second IDB project executed by the MENFP through its executing unit EFA. The financial management of project resources is done by the Coordinator and the Financial Specialist of the EFA. They are assisted by, a Financial Specialist Assistant, two accountants and an internal control specialist. EFA does not have an information system (server). The accounting software currently used by EFA is the GESCOMPT. The latter presents limitation in the recording of transactions and the management of various operation components and lacks minimum information security requirements. To mitigate software shortcomings, EFA will be replacing GESCOMPT with TOMPRO which is the same software that was used by FAES. EFA uses double entry accounting for the recording of transactions. Aside from its operating manual, EFA does not have in place an administrative and accounting manual.
- 2.4 According to an evaluation performed in August 2011, all mechanisms are in place from the establishment of the procurement duties within the institution to contract management, contemplating all the different steps of the procurement process. It is also worth noting that the World Bank just finished a general evaluation where it was decided that EFA would be placed under ex-post procurement review starting August 2011. EFA counts with one procurement specialist and one procurement associate, both very familiar with Bank's rules and procedures. It should be noted that EFA will be responsible for only one procurement process under the present operation (recruitment of the firm for the technical verification of the tuition waiver program).

**C. *Unité de Coordination des Projets (UCP)***

- 2.5 UCP is the executing unit for one of Bank projects (2385/GR-HA) since November 2005. The financial management and procurement services are managed by the: *Coordination Administrative and Financière*. The accounting software currently used by UCP is QuickBooks. Modified cash basis is used for accounting purposes. The auditors expressed a qualified opinion on the financial statements for the period ending December

31, 2010 and June 30, 2011. This decision is based on the fact that the auditors noted unexplained differences for an amount of \$2,625 between the expenditure presented in the statement of investments and the cumulated expenses sent to Bank for period ending December 31, 2010. According to the auditors this is mainly due to weaknesses in internal control in the preparation of disbursement requests sent to the Bank and errors in the recording of the expenditure. UCP is currently addressing auditor's comments.

- 2.6 UCP has extensive experience in managing Bank financed procurement activities under project 2385/GR-HA which amounts to US\$22 millions. An evaluation was performed during the preparation of the present operation in order to better assess UCP's capacity to execute all procurement duties foreseen under Component 4. The results of the analysis show that UCP has the structural capacity to undertake all procurement duties corresponding to Component 4 of the operation. Indeed, the procurement function is incorporated in the Administrative and Financial Coordination and the procurement responsibilities are clearly defined through the already existing operation manual that will be updated for the execution of the present operation. As of today, since UCP does not count with a procurement specialist, UCP will have to recruit a new procurement specialist and ensure his/her training to Bank procurement procedures within the best delays.

### **III. Fiduciary risk evaluation and mitigation actions**

#### **A. *Fonds d'Assistance Economique et Sociale (FAES)***

- 3.1 An update of the financial management and internal control assessment performed in September 2010 was completed on August 30th, 2011 by Financial Specialist and based on results; Bank believe that the proposed operation is expected to have low fiduciary risk for components executed by FAES due to the strength of its financial management systems and internal and external control procedures and FAES lengthy experience in the execution of Bank projects. Bank recommends that ex-post review methodology continued to be used for procurement and disbursements purposes.
- 3.2 The FAES will be the main Executing Agency who will perform procurement related activities under all project components, except for the tuition waiver program in Component 2 and Component 4. On 8 September 2010, an analysis was performed by the Bank to evaluate FAES's procurement capacities and it was found that FAES had the capacities to be placed under ex-post supervision. The decision was renewed on February 2011 under Grant 2464/GR-HA. It is therefore recommended that FAES remained under ex post review for the execution of this operation in order to maintain coherence with the modalities of execution of the other operations. The same conditions will apply. Given the workload placed on the institution as a whole, the recruitment of at least two additional procurement specialists should be anticipated as preliminary condition to the first disbursement. It is essential that the present context be considered as presenting a medium risk to the good execution of the operation and more specifically of the procurement processes.



**B. Education for All (EFA)**

3.3 An assessment of EFA financial management and internal and external control procedures was completed by Financial Specialist on August 31, 2011. Based on the results, the Bank considers EFA overall risk rating to be medium due to lack of appropriate computerized accounting software and information systems. The Bank recommends that ex-post review methodology to be used for disbursements purposes.

Risks identified	Mitigating measures
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Absence of internal control mechanisms in current structure where one accountant manages all aspects pertaining to financial management for one project.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>EFA has hired during the month of August 2011 a Financial Specialist Assistant and is in the process of reorganizing its accounting unit. Instead of having an accountant per project, there are currently distributing accounting functions among the two Accountants, the Financial Specialist Assistant and the Financial Specialist. An accounting manual will also be in place by the end of the year.</li> </ul>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Unreliable financial accounting and financial reporting due to the lack of appropriate computerized accounting system and information systems.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>EFA is currently in the process of implementing new accounting software (TOMPRO) which will be used for the financial management of funds. Implementation is scheduled to start during the month of September 2011. Servers have been purchased on should be installed within two months. An IT specialist is also to be hired.</li> <li>Quarterly financial reports including budget execution will be required. The operation's AOP and financial plans will be used as a basis for the monitoring of project execution.</li> <li>Bank Fiduciary staff will conduct at least two inspection visits to review the recording of transactions and the proper documentation of financial records.</li> </ul>

Bank recommends that ex-post review methodology to be used for disbursements purposes.

3.4 As mentioned above, EFA will be responsible for only one procurement process. Given the existing structure and the nature of the procurement duties that will be performed by EFA under this new operation, there is no specific anticipated risk in terms of procurement management and execution. EFA has adequate capacity to perform in accordance with Bank's rules and procedures, and given also the nature of the procurement process that will be taking place, EFA will be placed under a supervision ex-ante.

**C. Unité de Coordination des Projets (UCP)**

3.5 An assessment of UCP's financial management and internal and external control procedures was completed by fiduciary financial management specialist on December 14, 2010. Based on the results, the Bank considers UCP overall risk rating to be medium in the following areas:

Risks identified	Mitigating measures
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Weak financial reporting due to undocumented adjustment accounting entries and incorrect accounting entries.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recruitment of qualified accountant. The Executing Unit has recently replaced its accountant and is in the process of correcting several incorrect accounting entries.</li> <li>Bank Fiduciary staff will conduct at least two inspection visits per year to review the recording of transactions and the proper documentation of financial records.</li> </ul>

Bank recommends that ex-post review methodology to be used for disbursements purposes.

- 3.6 Based on the experience the Bank has had with that specific Executing Agency and the results of the said analysis, the Bank considers UCP overall risk rating to be medium in the following areas:

Risks identified	Mitigating measures
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Execution of the procurement processes.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Recruitment and training of qualified procurement specialist who will need to familiarize with Bank procurement rules and procedures.</li> <li>• Bank Procurement Specialist will assist in the training phase and will perform supervision as needed in order to ensure good and efficient execution of the operation.</li> </ul>

The Bank recommends that ex-ante review methodology be used for procurement purposes.

#### IV. Aspects to be considered in the Special Conditions of Contract

- 4.1 Special conditions precedent to first disbursement:
- a. Special Accounts and authorized signatures: FAES, EFA and UCP will open separate bank accounts at the Central Bank of Haiti for the management of grant resources and also for additional resources from co-financing partners.
  - b. Listings of authorized signatures are to be provided to Bank for each executing unit.
  - c. All Executing Units will have to update their chart of accounts to reflect current operation.
  - d. FAES, EFA and UCP will update their manual of operations to reflect current activities and HA-L1060 resources.
  - e. Implementation of the accounting system and preparation of an accounting manual for EFA will be required as a condition to first disbursement for Component 2.
  - f. FAES will have to recruit two procurement specialists. UCP will have to recruit one procurement specialist, as prior condition for disbursement.
- 4.2 **Audit special requirements:** External auditors eligible to the Bank will be hired to perform the audit of the program as follows: (i) one annual financial audit of the program (FAES, EFA and UCP) including an annual review of procurement and disbursement processes of each executing unit to be submitted within 120 days following the closing of each fiscal year; (ii) an independent verification of funds disbursed by the Bank and Co-financing partners for school subsidies provided under Component 2 to be submitted to the Bank within 90 days following the disbursement of the second tranche of school subsidies; and (iii) a final financial audit of the program (FAES, EFA and UCP) to be submitted within 120 days after the date of the last disbursement. FAES will be responsible for the audit process and the hiring of the audit firm. Bank recommends that the audit firm which performs the audit of HA-L1049 also be used for the audit of HA-L1060.

#### V. Fiduciary Arrangements for Procurement Execution

##### A. Procurement Execution

- 5.1 All project related procurement activities will be performed by FAES, UCP and EPT following Bank's Procurement Policies: Policies for the Procurement of Goods and

Works financed by the Inter-American Development Bank (GN-2349-9) and Policies for the Selection and Contracting of Consultants financed by the Inter-American Development Bank (GN-2350-9) and the *Disposiciones Especiales sobre adquisiciones para atender la emergencia causada por el terremoto del 12 de enero de 2010 en la Republica de Haiti* (OP-387-1).

- 5.2 **Procurement of Works, Goods and Non-Consulting Services:** The contracts for Works, Goods, and Non-Consulting Services<sup>2</sup> generated under the project and subject to International Competitive Bidding will be executed through the use of the Standard Bidding Documents (SBDs) issued by the Bank. The processes subject to National Competitive Bidding (NCB) will be executed through the use of National Bidding Documents agreed to by the Bank. The technical specifications review during the preparation of the selection process, is the responsibility of the project sector specialist.
- 5.3 **Selection and Contracting of Consultants:** The consulting services contracts generated under this project will be executed through the use of the Standard Request for Proposals (SRFPs) issued or agreed to by the Bank. The terms of reference review for the selection of consulting services is the responsibility of the project sector specialist.
- 5.4 **Direct Contracts:** The justification for the two foreseen direct contracts is given below in accordance with the Bank's Procurement Rules and Procedures.
- i. **PNCS:** The public agency National School Feeding Program (*Programme National de Cantine Scolaires - PNCS*) will be for contracted on a sole source basis for the distribution of school kits, uniforms, textbooks and teachers kits. The total amount of this contract will not exceed US\$100,000 from the Bank contribution. PNCS was created in 1997 and placed under the authority of the MENFP. It has developed a unique distribution network of food, deworming pills and vitamins in the schools of the 10 departments of the country. PNCS has also already delivered schools kits within previous operations of the Bank, including HA-L1049 (in execution). PNCS provides distribution services under programs financed by the Education For All Fund, the World Food Program and the World Bank (school canteens). PNCS contract is expected to be signed by June 2012 for a delivery of the materials in the schools before the beginning of 2012/2013 school year.
  - ii. **COH:** The Comité Olympique Haitien (COH), a non-for-profit organization, will be for contracted by FAES on a sole source basis for the implementation of the sports program in Carrefour (Component 3). Bank resources for this activity (not exceeding US\$400,000) will be eligible as soon as the co-financing required for the implementation of the entire program have been secured. Bank resources will finance the nutritious snacks provided to the beneficiaries; co-financing will finance the rehabilitation of the infrastructure, the sports equipment for the beneficiaries and the program implementation by COH (sports and educational program development and trainers salaries). The amount of COH's contract will be determined according to the amount of co-financing raised for this activity. COH will be responsible for the coordination of the activities related to Sports Center in Carrefour only, while FAES will

---

<sup>2</sup> Policies for the Procurement of Goods and Works Financed by the Inter-American Development Bank (GN-2349-9) paragraph 1.1: The services different to consulting services have a similar process as procurement of Goods.

be responsible for all fiduciary aspects (disbursement / procurement) of the program. Sole source is justified by COH's experience in the implementation of similar activities with UN agencies funding at the national level, to the satisfaction of these agencies. Also, the COH has developed a long-term relationship with Ministry of Youth, Sports and Civic Action (MYSCA) in the implementation of similar programs. For further information, please refer to the Annex II of the optional link of the main document on the sport center activities. The contract is expected to be signed in June 2012 and end in June 2014.

- 5.5 **Selection of Individual Consultants:** The selection will be made in accordance with Bank's Procurement rules and procedures and will consist in evaluating the capacity of at least three candidates against set and agreed Terms of References.

**B. Thresholds (miles US\$)**

Works			Goods <sup>3</sup>			Consulting Services	
International Competitive Bidding	National Competitive Bidding	Shopping	International Competitive Bidding	National Competitive Bidding	Shopping	International Advertising	100% National Short List
= / > 1,000	100-1,000	<100	= / > 100	25 -100	<25	>200	<100

- 5.6 However, the thresholds applied to the procurements of this operation follow the ones established in the Appendix 1 of the *Disposiciones Especiales sobre adquisiciones para atender la emergencia causada por el terremoto del 12 de enero del 2010 en la Republica de Haiti (OP-387-1)*.

ICB (Works)	Shopping or NCB(Works)	ICB (Goods)	Shopping or NCB (Goods)	International Advertising (Consulting Services)	Short List 100% National(Consulting Services)
=> 1.000.000	<1.000.000	=> 250.000	<250.000	>200.000	<100.000

**C. Main Procurement Activities**

Description	Cost US\$	Procurement method	Control (Ex-ante/ Ex-post)	Dates	
				Publication	End of contract
Water and Energy	1,700,000.00	ICB	Ex-ante	Jan-13	Apr-13
School textbooks	600,000.00	DC	Ex-ante		
Equipment of 3 centers	3,600,000.00	ICB	Ex-ante	Apr-12	Jul-12
Construction Works	9,500,000.00	ICB	Ex-ante	Jul-12	Apr-13
Rehabilitation Works	3,000,000.00	ICB	Ex-ante	Jul-12	Apr-13
Construct. & Rehad of two centers	2,900,000.00	ICB	Ex-ante	Jul-12	Apr-13
Material distribution	100,000.00	DC	Ex-ante		Oct-12
Update of the program and implementation	2,000,000.00	SBQC	Ex-ante	Mar-12	Jun-14
Implementation of technology solutions in 20 schools.	700,000.00	SBQC	Ex-ante	Apr-13	Jun-14
Technical and legal assistance for the development and implementation of the TVET policy.	105,000.00	SIC	Ex-ante	Mar-12	Mar-13
International technical assistance for the implementation of the Plan.	210,000.00	SIC	Ex-ante	Feb-12	Jun-14

\*To access the 18 month procurement plan, click [here](#) Link to procurement plan

<sup>3</sup> Including different services other than consulting.

**D. Procurement Supervision**

- 5.7 As explained above, procurement related activities performed by FAES will be subject to an ex-post review in conformity with the dispositions agreed by FAES and the Bank on 9 February 2011. Procurement activities performed by EFA and UCP will be subject to an ex-ante review.

**Threshold for Ex-Post Review**

Works	Goods	Consulting Services	Individual Consultants
= / < US\$1,000,000	= / < US\$250,000	= / < 200,000	= / < 30,000

**E. Special Stipulations**

- 5.8 **Measures to reduce the probability of corruption:** Use of IDB standard bidding documents and IDB approved standard documents in Haiti knowing that all contract models include special provisions addressing the issue of the prevention and sanction of fraud and corruption in Bank financed activities.
- 5.9 **Records and Files:** The executing agencies/units will be required to keep files and track records of all procurement related activities financed by the Bank in their office in accordance with the Bank's Procurement Rules and Procedures and to the Project's Operational Rules in such a way that it be available for supervision visit by the fiduciary team.

**VI. Financial Management****A. Programming and Budget**

- 6.1 Country budgets for investment and current expenditures are elaborated separately. Budget execution is affected mainly by the lack of cash-flow planning and monitoring and the weak capacity of the line ministries. Programming and budget planning, execution and monitoring at the project level will rely on IDB's project financial management formats and procedures.

**B. Accounting and Information Systems**

- 6.2 One of the major weaknesses of the PFM systems in Haiti is that the country lacks a sound accounting system, including clear standards and a related automated system. A double entry system of accounting is observed by the Service Central de Comptabilité. Financial management systems used by the executing units and FAES will be applied for the financial management of the project.

**C. Disbursements and Funds Flows**

- 6.3 The use of a Single Treasury Account is not implemented in Haiti. The implementation of a Single Treasury Account is currently been considered. Such innovation would allow for improved management of the government's cash position on a daily basis. Project financial management will be executed according to OP-273-2. Each executing unit will open separate bank accounts (US\$ and Gourdes) at the Central Bank for the management of the grant resources provided under this operation, as well as additional resources from

co-financing partners. Listing of authorized signatures on those accounts are to be provided to the Bank. All executing agencies/units will use the exchange rate valid at the day of disbursements to record all expenses made in local currency. The Central Bank exchange rate will be used as the reference rate.

**D. Internal Control and Audit**

- 6.4 The internal audit units of FAES is comprised of only one agent. Due to the increase in the volume of activities, additional staffing should be considered. We also recommend that the audit unit report directly to the Board as opposed to the General Manager of FAES. In the case of EFA, an internal control specialist was recruited in September 2010 who reports directly to the Coordinator and ensures mainly the financial control at the level of the Unit. UCP does not have an internal audit unit due to the size of the executing unit. External control will be performed for all Bank operations by independent audit firms acceptable to the Bank.

**E. External Control and Reporting**

- 6.5 The Court Supérieur des Comptes et du Contentieux Administratif (CSCCA), has the constitutional mandate to exercise external control over the government PFM. The CSCCA has developed an audit manual with the support of foreign consultants but does not formally apply International Standards on Auditing. The effectiveness of the CSCCA was severely affected by the January 2010 earthquake. External control will continue to be performed for all Banks financed projects by independent public accountant firms acceptable to the Bank. Audits will be performed in accordance with Bank's Guidelines for Financial Reports and External Audits. FAES will be responsible for contracting an external auditor eligible to the Bank to perform the audit of the program as per described in Section IV (Aspects to be considered in special conditions) above. Financial audit cost including the independent verification of SMC used of funds for schools financed by IDB and co-financing partners is estimated at US\$300,000. Bank will also be co-financing the technical verification of SMC use of funds according to established EFA procedures which is estimated to cost US\$250,000.

**F. Financial Supervision Plan**

- 6.6 **FAES:** Bank Fiduciary staff will conduct annual financial inspection visits to review execution of financial plan. **EFA:** Bank Fiduciary staff will conduct at least two financial inspection visits to review execution of financial plan and to make sure that project documentation is properly kept. **UCP:** Bank Fiduciary staff will conduct at least two financial inspection visits to review the recording of transactions and the execution of financial plan and to make sure that project documentation is properly kept.

**G. Execution Mechanism**

- 6.7 Each executing agency/unit will maintain proper financial management systems and will prepare an annual operation plan (AOP) and procurement plan and a twelve-month detailed financial plan indicating cash flow needs for the execution of project's activities stemming from AOP and procurement plans. The twelve-month financial plan will serve as the basis for advance of funds disbursements. Disbursement of advances of funds will

be for the equivalent of funding needs required for six months of project execution for FAES, four months for UCP and three months for EFA. For the tuition subsidies, payments will be based on established procedures of the EFA for providing funding for the tuition programs. Payment will be made in two tranches (60% and 40%) each school year. Payment of the first tranche (60%) will be subject to the receipt of the approved school listing and will be deposited in the EFA Central Bank Account opened to that effect. The EFA would then transfer funds from the Central Bank account to accounts of the approved School Management Committees (SMC) opened at Banque National de Credit (BNC). Payment of the second tranche (40%), will be subject to the receipt of an interim financial report and the integrated technical/verification report of the verification agency as required by established EFA procedures. SMC which have not complied with established procedures will be excluded in the second payment.

POA (Plan of activities for first disbursement and the first 18 months of implementation)

<http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36407832>



PLAN ANNUEL D'OPERATION

Support to the Implementation of the Education Plan and Reform in Haiti  
HA-L1060

Components / Products/Activities		Type of contract	Unit Cost	Unit cost description	Number of Units	Total cost	Year 1	Year 2	
<b>Project results (outcomes)</b>									
Result I	Increased public supply of education from preschool to grade 9 for 15,000 children annually								
Result II	Tuition-free and quality primary education for more 75,000 children annually						\$ 19,560,000.00	\$ 5,264,875.00	\$ 14,295,125.00
Result III	Improved learning opportunities for 13,500 children annually						\$ 8,790,000.00	\$ 5,590,000.00	\$ 3,200,000.00
Result IV	Increased TVET opportunities for more than 600 youth annually						\$ 4,450,000.00	\$ 2,185,000.00	\$ 2,265,000.00
Result V	Strengthening MENFP's executing and regulating capacity						\$ 8,170,000.00	\$ 2,530,000.00	\$ 5,640,000.00
	Project Management					\$ 6,680,000.00	\$ 3,130,000.00	\$ 3,550,000.00	
	Contingency					\$ 850,000.00	\$ 425,000.00	\$ 425,000.00	
						\$ 1,500,000.00	\$ 750,000.00	\$ 750,000.00	
					<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$ 50,000,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 19,874,875.00</b>	<b>\$ 30,125,125.00</b>	
<b>Component 1.</b>	<b>Increased public supply of education from preschool to grade 9 for 15,000 children annually</b>						<b>\$ 19,560,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 5,264,875.00</b>	<b>\$ 14,295,125.00</b>
Product 1.	Works of 20 primary schools						\$ 14,049,025.00	\$ 3,305,025.00	\$ 10,744,000.00
Activity 1.1	Geotechnical studies	Consultant	\$10,001	cost / School	20	\$ 200,020.00	\$ 200,020.00		
Activity 1.2	Standard design of schools ( Fundamental 1 & 2 and Fundamental 1, 2, 3)	Consultant	\$15,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00		
Activity 1.3	Design / Adaptation	Consultant	\$20,000	cost / School	20	\$ 400,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	
Activity 1.4	Implementation environmental and social plans	Works	\$2,500	cost / School	20	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	
Activity 1.5	Execution of works	Works	\$475,000	cost / School	20	\$ 9,500,000.00	\$ 2,375,000.00	\$ 7,125,000.00	
Activity 1.6	Drinking Water and Energy	Goods and services	\$85,000	cost / School	20	\$ 1,700,000.00		\$ 1,700,000.00	
Activity 1.7	Supervision of works	Consultant	\$35,000	cost / School	20	\$ 700,000.00	\$ 350,000.00	\$ 350,000.00	
Activity 1.8	Anti-seismic and anti-cyclonic supervision (LMTPTC and consultant)	Consultant	\$4,000	cost / School	20	\$ 80,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	
Activity 1.9	Equipment and furniture (classes, canteen, library, etc.)	Goods and services	\$68,500	cost / School	20	\$ 1,370,000.00		\$ 1,370,000.00	
Activity 1.10	Training and implementation of maintenance plans	Workshop	\$1,700	cost / School	20	\$ 34,000.00		\$ 34,000.00	
Product 2.	Rehabilitation of 15 primary schools						\$ 4,617,375.00	\$ 1,196,250.00	\$ 3,481,125.00
Activity 2.2	Design	Consultant	\$10,000	cost / School	15	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 75,000.00	\$ 75,000.00	
Activity 2.3	Implementation environmental and social plans	Goods and services	\$2,500	cost / School	15	\$ 37,500.00	\$ 18,750.00	\$ 18,750.00	
Activity 2.4	Execution of works	Works	\$200,000	cost / School	15	\$ 3,000,000.00	\$ 900,000.00	\$ 2,100,000.00	
Activity 2.5	Supervision of works	Consultant	\$15,000	cost / School	15	\$ 225,000.00	\$ 112,500.00	\$ 112,500.00	
Activity 2.6	Anti-seismic and anti-cyclonic supervision (LMTPTC and consultant)	Consultant	\$4,000	cost / School	15	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	
Activity 2.7	Equipment and furniture	Goods and services	\$74,625	cost / School	15	\$ 1,119,375.00		\$ 1,119,375.00	
Activity 2.8	Training and implementation of maintenance plans	Workshop	\$1,700	cost / School	15	\$ 25,500.00		\$ 25,500.00	
Product 3.	Equipment 8 primary schools						\$ 493,600.00	\$ 493,600.00	\$
Activity 3.1	School furniture	Goods and services	\$55,000	cost / School	8	\$ 440,000.00	\$ 440,000.00		
Activity 3.2	Training and implementation of maintenance plans	Workshop	\$1,700	cost / School	8	\$ 13,600.00	\$ 13,600.00		
Product 4.	Operation of two schools in the area Zaranje						\$ 140,000.00	\$ 70,000.00	\$ 70,000.00
Activity 4.1	Payment of operational costs for one year in two schools	Consultant	\$70,000	cost / School	2	\$ 140,000.00	\$ 70,000.00	\$ 70,000.00	
Product 5.	120 New Works sites Identified and Feasibility studies						\$ 300,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$
Activity 5.1	Feasibility studies	Mission	\$2,500	cost / site	120	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 300,000.00	\$	
<b>Component 2.</b>	<b>Tuition-free and quality primary education for more 75,000 children annually</b>						<b>\$ 8,790,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 5,590,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 3,200,000.00</b>
Product 6.	Tuition waiver paid for primary students						\$ 6,300,000.00	\$ 3,150,000.00	\$ 3,150,000.00
Activity 6.1	Payment of the tuition waivers for 2 school year		\$180	cost / student	35000	\$ 6,300,000.00	\$ 3,150,000.00	\$ 3,150,000.00	
Product 7.	Educational inputs subsidized						\$ 2,490,000.00	\$ 2,440,000.00	\$ 50,000.00
Activity 7.1	Technical assistance for improving the free education strategie	Individual Consultant	\$100,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	
Activity 7.2	Production and delivery of school kits	Goods	\$15	Cost/Student	30000	\$ 450,000.00	\$ 450,000.00		
Activity 7.3	Production and delivery textbook	Goods	\$20	Cost/Student	30000	\$ 600,000.00	\$ 600,000.00		
Activity 7.4	Production and delivery of uniforms (2 per student)	Goods	\$40	Cost/Student	30000	\$ 1,200,000.00	\$ 1,200,000.00		
Activity 7.5	Production and delivery of teachers Kits	Goods	\$20	Cost / teacher	2000	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00		
Activity 7.6	Distribution of materials (100 schools)	Consultant	\$100,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 100,000.00		
<b>Component 3.</b>	<b>Improved learning opportunities for 13,500 children annually</b>						<b>\$ 4,450,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 2,185,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 2,265,000.00</b>
Product 8.	Interactive radio program delivered in 100 schools						\$ 2,500,000.00	\$ 1,450,000.00	\$ 1,050,000.00
Activity 8.1	Update of the program and Implementation	Consultant	\$2,000,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 2,000,000.00	\$ 1,200,000.00	\$ 800,000.00	
Activity 8.2	Impact evaluation in 100+100 schools	Consultant	\$500,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	
Product 9.	National testing system designed assessment of learning						\$ 350,000.00	\$ 105,000.00	\$ 245,000.00
Activity 9.1	Technical assistance for the development of a national testing system	Consultant	\$350,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 350,000.00	\$ 105,000.00	\$ 245,000.00	
Product 10.	Implementation of TIC strategy						\$ 1,200,000.00	\$ 350,000.00	\$ 850,000.00
Activity 10.1	Implementation of ICT strategy	Consultant	\$200,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	
Activity 10.2	Competitive Fund for Educational Innovations	Consultant	\$50,000	Cost/school	20	\$ 1,000,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 750,000.00	
Product 11.	One sports center offering extra curricular activities at Carrefour						\$ 400,000.00	\$ 280,000.00	\$ 120,000.00
Activity 11.1	Provision of meals in the sports center	Goods and services	\$400,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 400,000.00	\$ 280,000.00	\$ 120,000.00	
<b>Component 4.</b>	<b>Increased TVET opportunities for more than 600 youth annually</b>						<b>\$ 8,170,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 2,530,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 5,640,000.00</b>
Product 12.	National TVET policy developed and being implemented						\$ 450,000.00	\$ 235,000.00	\$ 225,000.00
Activity 12.1	Technical and legal assistance for the development and implementation of the TVET policy	Individual consultant	\$105,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 105,000.00	\$ 73,500.00	\$ 31,500.00	
Activity 12.2	Feasibility study for the implementation of a VAE system	Consultant	\$80,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 80,000.00	\$ 24,000.00	\$ 56,000.00	
Activity 12.3	Market studies	Individual consultant	\$20,000	Lump sum	5	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	
Activity 12.4	Reengineering of programs in five priority areas	Individual consultant	\$35,000	Lump sum	5	\$ 175,000.00	\$ 87,500.00	\$ 87,500.00	
Product 13.	New management model implemented in four centers						\$ 1,060,000.00	\$ 340,000.00	\$ 720,000.00
Activity 13.1	model in 4 public institutions	Consultant	\$60,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00		

PLAN ANNUEL D'OPÉRATION

			Workshops & missions	\$20,000	Lump sum	4	\$ 80,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00
Activity 13.2	Subsidies for centers' operation (raw material, energy, maintenance, etc.) for up to two years		Goods	\$200,000	Cost / center	4	\$ 800,000.00	\$ 240,000.00	\$ 560,000.00
Activity 13.3	Trainees tracking study		Consultant	\$120,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 120,000.00	\$ 120,000.00	\$ 120,000.00
Product 14	Construction, rehabilitation and equipment of training centers						\$ 6,695,000.00	\$ 1,955,000.00	\$ 4,695,000.00
Activity 14.1	Technical studies and supervision		Consultant	\$150,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00
Activity 14.2	Construction and rehabilitation of two centers		Works	\$1,450,000	Cost / center	2	\$ 2,900,000.00	\$ 725,000.00	\$ 2,175,000.00
Activity 14.3	Equipment of 3 centers (4 workshops by center)		Goods	\$1,200,000	Cost / center	3	\$ 3,600,000.00	\$ 1,080,000.00	\$ 2,520,000.00
Component 5	Strengthening MENFP's executing and regulating capacity						\$ 6,680,000.00	\$ 3,130,000.00	\$ 3,550,000.00
Product 15	Education Plan being implemented and incentives aligned						\$ 1,080,000.00	\$ 375,000.00	\$ 705,000.00
Activity 15.1	Operation of the Strategic and Technical Committee of the Plan		Workshops and missions	\$40,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00
Activity 15.2	International technical assistance for the implementation of the Plan		Individual Consultant	\$800	Man/days	262.5	\$ 210,000.00	\$ 105,000.00	\$ 105,000.00
Activity 15.3	National technical assistance for the implementation of the Plan		Individual Consultant	\$5,000	Man/mouth	60	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00
Activity 15.4	Collective incentives based on the system designed under HA-L1049		Price	\$10,000	Price/Structure	15	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00
Activity 15.5	Development of a law proposal for the reform of the secondary and strengthening of DES		Consultant	\$200,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 100,000.00
Activity 15.6	Feasibility study for the rebuilding of MENFP's offices		Consultant	\$180,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 180,000.00	\$ 180,000.00	\$ 180,000.00
Product 16	Planning, monitoring and evaluation system operational						\$ 1,430,000.00	\$ 590,000.00	\$ 840,000.00
Activity 16.1	Development of information systems		Training and goods	\$400,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 400,000.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 200,000.00
Activity 16.2	Support to 2012 and 2013 census		Lump sum	\$500,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 250,000.00
Activity 16.3	Support to school mapping 2013		missions	\$250,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 250,000.00
Activity 16.4	Technical assistance for monitoring the education plan		Individual Consultant	\$100,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00
Activity 16.5	Study of the determinants of internal efficiency at the school level		Consultant	\$100,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00
Activity 16.6	Study on effective teaching time		Consultant	\$80,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 80,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00
Product 17	Improved framework for the regulation of the non-public sector						\$ 150,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 50,000.00
Activity 17.1	Technical assistance to MENFP for implementation of ONAPE		Individual Consultant	\$100,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00
Activity 17.2	Technical assistance on the legal framework regulating the non-public sector and development of standard contracting modalities		Individual Consultant	\$50,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00
Product 18	General Inspection operational			\$350,000			\$ 350,000.00	\$ 155,000.00	\$ 195,000.00
Activity 18.1	Equipment of General Inspection		Goods	\$100,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 70,000.00
Activity 18.2	Training of Inspectors General		Training	\$250,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$ 125,000.00
Product 19	Implementation of communication strategy						\$ 270,000.00	\$ 210,000.00	\$ 60,000.00
Activity 19.1	Equipment of MENFP-Radio Educative		Goods	\$150,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00
Activity 19.2	Technical assistance for the production of eight documentaries		Consultant	\$15,000	Lump sum	8	\$ 120,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00
Activity 19.3	Newsletter on the Operational Plan		Goods	\$60,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00
Product 20	Strengthened execution capacity						\$ 3,400,000.00	\$ 1,700,000.00	\$ 1,700,000.00
Activity 20.1	Management fees FAES			\$2,200,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 2,200,000.00	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 1,100,000.00
Activity 20.2	Management fees EFA			\$400,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 400,000.00	\$ 200,000.00	\$ 200,000.00
Activity 20.3	Management fees UCP			\$800,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 800,000.00	\$ 400,000.00	\$ 400,000.00
Audit, monitoring and evaluation							\$ 350,000.00	\$ 425,000.00	\$ 425,000.00
Activity 20.4	Financial Audit		Consultant	\$300,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00
Activity 20.5	Technical audit of the tuition waiver program		Consultant	\$250,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$ 125,000.00
Activity 20.6	Monitoring and Evaluation		Individual Consultant	\$300,000	Lump sum	1	\$ 300,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00
Contingency							\$ 1,500,000.00	\$ 750,000.00	\$ 750,000.00

**Support to the Implementation of the Education Plan and Reform in Haiti**  
**HA-L1060**

PRODUCTS	Source of financing		TOTAL	%
	IDB - CO	Parallel & Co-financing		
<b>Component 1. Increased public supply of education from preschool to grade 9</b>	<b>19,560,000</b>	<b>4,190,000</b>	<b>23,750,000</b>	<b>42%</b>
Construction schools	14,349,025	4,190,000	18,539,025	33%
Rehabilitation of schools	5,070,975		5,070,975	9%
Operational expenses for schools in relocation areas	140,000		140,000	0%
<b>Component 2. Tuition-free and quality primary education</b>	<b>8,790,000</b>		<b>8,790,000</b>	<b>15%</b>
Tuition waiver program / school subsidy	6,300,000		6,300,000	11%
School kits and uniforms	1,850,000		1,850,000	3%
Textbooks	600,000		600,000	1%
Teachers' kits	40,000		40,000	0%
<b>Component 3. Improved learning opportunities</b>	<b>4,450,000</b>	<b>2,600,000</b>	<b>7,050,000</b>	<b>12%</b>
Interactive radio program	2,500,000		2,500,000	4%
Competitive Fund for Educational Innovations and technical assistance	1,200,000		1,200,000	2%
Development of a national testing system	350,000		350,000	1%
Extra-curricular activities in a sport center	400,000	2,600,000	3,000,000	5%
<b>Component 4. Increasing TVET opportunities</b>	<b>8,170,000</b>		<b>8,170,000</b>	<b>14%</b>
Development and implementation of a national TVET policy	460,000		460,000	1%
Implementation of an innovative management model in training centers	1,060,000		1,060,000	2%
Construction and rehabilitation of training centers	3,050,000		3,050,000	5%
Equipping of training centers	3,600,000		3,600,000	6%
<b>Component 5. Strengthening MENPP's executing and regulating capacity</b>	<b>6,680,000</b>		<b>6,680,000</b>	<b>12%</b>
Technical assistance for the implementation of the Education Plan	1,580,000		1,580,000	3%
Information systems, monitoring and evaluation of the Education Plan	1,430,000		1,430,000	3%
Implementation of the communication strategy	270,000		270,000	0%
Executing units fees	3,400,000		3,400,000	6%
<b>Project Management</b>	<b>850,000</b>		<b>850,000</b>	<b>1%</b>
Financial audit	300,000		300,000	1%
Technical audit of the tuition waiver program	250,000		250,000	0%
Monitoring and evaluation	300,000		300,000	1%
<b>Contingency</b>	<b>1,500,000</b>		<b>1,500,000</b>	<b>3%</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>50,000,000</b>	<b>6,790,000</b>	<b>56,790,000</b>	<b>100%</b>

Monitoring and Evaluation Arrangements

<http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36401364>

DOCUMENT OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK  
NOT FOR PUBLIC USE

**HAITI**

**SUPPORT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE  
EDUCATION PLAN AND REFORM IN HAITI**

**(HA-L1060)**

**MONITORING AND EVALUATION PLAN**

This document was prepared by: Julien Hautier, Project Team Leader; Antine Legrand (EDU/CHA), Yyannú Cruz Aguayo and María Cristina Cárdenas (SPD/SDV).

## CONTENT

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	3
II.	MONITORING .....	5
	A. Indicators .....	5
	B. Data Collection, Instruments and Reporting .....	6
	C. Capacity Building for Monitoring .....	7
	D. Additional monitoring tools which will be designed under the project.....	8
	E. Audits.....	9
	F. Monitoring and Evaluation Risks .....	9
	G. Monitoring Coordination, Work Plan and Budget .....	9
III.	EVALUATION .....	11
	A. Objective and Main Evaluation Questions .....	11
	B. Main outcome and impact indicators.....	11
	C. General Evaluations.....	12
	D. Impact Evaluation of Interactive Radio Program (IRP) .....	14
IV.	REFERENCES .....	19

### ABBREVIATIONS

AOP	Annual Operation Plan
CDP	Cellule de Pilotage
DPCE	Direction de la Plannification et de la coopération externe
EFA	Education for All
EMIS	Education Management Information System
ESMR	Environmental and Social Management Report
FAES	Fonds d'Assistance Economique et Social
GOH	Government of Haiti
GSE	Groupe Sectoriel de l'Education – Sector Group in Education
INFP	Institut National de Formation Professionnelle / National Institute of Professional Training
IRP	Interactive Radio program
MENFP	Ministry of Education and Professional Training
MO	Manual of Operations
NTCI	Nouvelles technologies de la communication et de l'information.
PNCS	Programme National des Cantines Scolaires / National School Canteen Program
PRODEV	Progress and Development Foundation
RCT	Randomized control trial
SMC	School Management Committee
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
WB	World Bank

## I. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 This operation will contribute to the Bank's five-year program aiming to support the Haitian Education Plan's following objectives: (i) improving access to education; (ii) improving the quality of education; (iii) reforming technical and vocational training; and (iv) strengthening MENFP institutional capacities and governance. Specifically, the current operation aims at (a) increasing the public supply of education by building 20 new primary schools, rehabilitating 15 primary existing schools, and equipping an additional 8 schools, (Component 1, US\$23.8 million); (b) reducing education costs for grade 1-6 students in non-public schools through the continuation of a tuition waiver program, and distributing 30,000 school kits to students and teachers from preschool to grade 6 (Component 2, US\$ 8.8 million); (c) improving teaching practices and learning outcomes by implementing an interactive radio program in 100 schools, and developing a national testing system for regular performance monitoring (Component 3, US\$ 7.1 million); (d) increasing vocational training opportunities (Component 4, US\$ 8.2 million); (e) and strengthening MENFP's executing and regulating capacity (Component 5, US\$ 6.6 million).
- 1.2 **Execution.** This operation will have three executing agencies. The Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF) through FAES will execute all components with the exception of the payment of the tuition waiver program (TWP) under component 2 and component 4. The MENFP will execute the TWP within Component 2 through its executing unit "Education for All" (EFA) and component 4 through its executing unit "Unité de Coordination des Projets" (UCP). The three units will report to the MENFP, which will organize regular meetings with the Bank to review progress.
- 1.3 The monitoring and evaluation framework will include: (i) the Procurement Plan (PP); (ii) the Annual Operational Plans (POA); (iii) the annual verification of compliance with targets set in the Results Matrix; and (iv) progress reports each semester. Those bi-annual reports contain: (i) activities conducted in the program, progress in implementation, problems encountered and measures taken; (ii) assessment of progress based on the results matrix; (iii) assessment of the PP; (iv) evaluation of the POA; (v) evaluation of the Risk Matrix; (vi) monitoring and evaluation of institutional strengthening plan; and (vii) any other information requested by the IDB. Program performance will be evaluated taking into account the indicators established in the Results Matrix. In addition, a consultant will be contracted to perform: (i) a mid-term evaluation at 15 months following the date of signing of the grant funding, or when it has committed 50% of program resources, and (ii) a final evaluation report when it has committed 90% of program resources.
- 1.4 **General context on Haiti's educational data and statistics.** At the time of the earthquake, Haiti had just begun to recover from a series of hurricanes and other external shocks that impacted the country in 2008 and taxed an already challenged



education system. The systems for collection and safekeeping of educational statistics, which were notoriously scant old and incomplete previous to the earthquake, suffered as much as the rest of the country. The Ministry of Education was partly destroyed. Today, governmental work has resumed under very challenging conditions. Nevertheless, given the population and education data available it is impossible to calculate even basic educational indicators such as gross and net enrollment rates can be calculated. Decisions have to be based on projections from the latest available population<sup>1</sup> and school census in 2003. The last household survey dates from 2000. The most recent survey, the demographic and health survey (DHS) 2005-2006 provides some data on education, especially on attendance, repetition and dropout rates. These sets of data are not only outdated, but have been made increasingly irrelevant with the 2008 and 2010 natural shocks, which have caused many schools destructions, closures or relocations.

- 1.5 As part of the reconstruction process, the donor community has pledged considerable amounts to the education sector, including technical assistance to help rebuilt a better, meaningful and more comprehensive way to inform decision-making in the this sector. In March 2011, a school census was launched by the MENFP, with support from UNESCO and UIS in order to collect information on the approximately 21,000 schools in the country, as well as a teachers' census estimated to 80 000<sup>2</sup> nationwide, to identify effects the earthquake may have had on teachers and alumni population (it is estimated that 1400 teachers might have died in the earthquake and an estimated 4268 schools have been destroyed or damaged<sup>3</sup>). This nation-wide exercise will be completed by October 2011 and will provide a better snapshot of the current education challenges. Quality permitting, it will allow to make better informed decisions and previsions.
- 1.6 The 2011 School Census is the largest data collection attempt in Haiti in recent years, and it will help fill loopholes and factually-support problems which are suspected but not clearly measured. Nevertheless, the quality of the Census should be carefully reviewed before defining all political and investment decisions based on this new information. The Census was carried out from a list of approx 21,000 schools provided by the *Directions Departementales de l'Education* (DDE). Elaborated just after the 2010 earthquake, this list may not have been exhaustive, in the chaos and destruction following the January 2010 earthquake, some schools might never have been identified. Nevertheless, some attempts were made to complete the list by additional mechanisms, for example, an awareness campaign via Educative Radio was launched to incentive self and voluntary identification of the remaining schools. Again, even when this data is currently the most informative nation-wide exercise carried out on the education system, it should still be considered with care for decision-making purposes.

---

<sup>1</sup> Next population census is planned for 2013.

<sup>2</sup> This figure comes from the general Inspection assessment done immediately after the Earthquake, as the preparatory work to the 2011 Census, 80 000 teachers questionnaires have been distributed in the country via the DDE, and so far approx. 50 000 have been filled and returned.

<sup>3</sup> Plan Opérationnel 2010-2015, Vers une refondation du système éducatif haïtien, MENFP, Avril 2011, p.37.

- 1.7 From the questionnaires of the 2011 School and Teachers Census, it is possible to have a fairly good idea of which data and indicators will be readily available upon their completion. The current operation's monitoring and evaluation framework is partially based on such indicators. The results matrix has been established taking into account the difficulty of collecting comprehensive data, the lack of information to provide fully reliable baselines at time of project design, and the low capacity in the Ministry to internalize monitoring processes.
- 1.8 Funds have been allocated under this operation (additional to pledges from other donors) to support the 2012 and 2013 Schools Census, as the nation-wide exercise will, potentially, be replicated every year, in order to inform an Education Monitoring and Information System (EMIS), which is currently at its early stage of development.
- 1.9 In parallel, the new Haitian president, Michel Martelly, has launched a nationwide initiative to identify all children currently out of the school system. The methodology used to collect this data, and the data itself, has not been released yet. Nevertheless, this data should be made public in the upcoming weeks and help to inform the education sector stakeholders, as well as this operation.
- 1.10 Additional surveys, carried out by different donors, may also help fill the current void of educational statistics. For example, an ongoing technical verification/audit<sup>4</sup> carried out by independent firms will provide relevant information on the operation of the Tuition Waiver program, operational since 2008. Also, a diagnostic of basic reading skills financed by the World Bank will be conducted in 250 beneficiary schools. The results of this exercise should inform the MENFP on the quality of education and learning outcomes.

## II. MONITORING

### A. Indicators

- 2.1 Table II-1 includes product indicators that will be monitored during the operation.

**Table II-1. Summary of monitoring indicators, frequency and sources**

Monitoring Indicators	Frequency of Measurement	Source of Verification
Number of new schools open for enrollment in areas deprived of school and beneficiary students.	Bi-annually	FAES progress reports.
Number of rehabilitated schools open for enrollment in targeted areas and beneficiary students.		Reception contracts by MENFP, FAES and external architectural cabinets.
Number of schools open for enrollment in Zoranje and beneficiary students.		

<sup>4</sup> Including data on the number of beneficiaries, the number of books per children, the physical condition of the school, etc.

Number of schools benefitting from the tuition waiver program. Number of students benefitting from the tuition waiver program. Dropout rates in school benefitting from the TWP.	Bi-annually	EPT progress reports.  Technical verification/audit of the Tuition Waiver Program Upgraded EPT progress reports; education censii.
Number of school kits (basic material), uniforms sets (2 uniforms per child) and textbooks sets (4 per child) delivered to children from preschool to grade 6. Number of teacher kits delivered to schools.	Bi-annually	FAES Progress reports.  PNCS regular report on delivery.
Number of students exposed to the Interactive Radio program. Number of children benefitting from the Fund for Educational Innovation.	Bi-annually	Progress report from the radio program implementing agency.
Number of youth employed 6 months after training.	Bi-annually	UCP- INFP progress reports. Tracking database
Annual Education Statistical Report produced and published.	Annually	FAES progress reports.

To consider the complete set of indicators, refer to the results matrix.

## **B. Data Collection, Instruments and Reporting**

- 2.2 The current operation will monitor the construction of 20 new schools and the rehabilitation/upgrade of 15 existing schools, and their opening in the imparted time, the total number of enrolled students in the schools and the number of newly enrolled children after construction/renovation, owing to (i) external supervision consultants contracted by FAES; (ii) ex-ante socio-economic assessments of all construction/rehabilitation sites; and (iii) FAES bi-annual progress reports.
- 2.3 MENFP, with FAES technical support, has agreed to conduct at least an additional 120 socio-economic and demographic assessments of potential sites for construction under upcoming operations and co-financing. Once the eligibility and characteristics of these sites is determined the MENFP, with FAES and Bank's support, will establish a plan of annual interventions for the operations to come. This plan will provide the necessary conditions to implement an evaluation of the long term construction efforts, within the next operations (see Evaluation section).
- 2.4 FAES will also monitor the timely production and delivery of school kits, in coordination with the delivery contractor PNCS and provide all monitoring information in their progress reports.
- 2.5 The Tuition waiver program (TWP), will be implemented by EPT/EFA, who currently collected data on beneficiary schools, but not at the student level. In order to introduce a performance-rewarding scheme, currently in the design phase, and improve its current monitoring standards, EPT, in accordance with an IDB's request, will track information at the pupils' level, using all relevant sources of information, including school census and revised technical verification/audit. Hence, the qualitative changes in the program will only be

made within the next operation (academic year 2013-2014). The monitoring framework on this component includes (i) EPT bi-annual progress report, (ii) an upgrade of the current EPT questionnaire and monitoring tools in order to include student level data of beneficiary schools; (iii) communication to current beneficiary schools on upcoming changes in the program, (iv) a co-financing by the Bank to capitalize on the technical audit of the TWP, currently financed by the World Bank and IDB and carried out by the *Fondation Haitienne de l'Enseignement prive (FONHEP)*, and the *Fonds de Parainage de l'Education (FPE)*. This exercise will assess the project efficiency and the results of the changes in program operative structure on beneficiary schools and kids. The IDB proposed to finance complementary qualitative surveys with a particular focus on the variation in quality of teaching.

- 2.6 Regarding TVET opportunities, UCP will (i) monitor the timely reconstruction and reengineering of training programs in their bi-annual progress reports, (ii) ensure the constitution of a comprehensive beneficiary database (name, age, date of birth and other background information). Additionally, detailed and regularly updated contact information will be collected for each student, including phone numbers, cell phone numbers and emails. In order to monitor effects of the newly created centers and the changes in TVET curricula and management, this operation will also finance a follow-up survey of trainees 6 months after graduation (see Evaluation section).
- 2.7 In the case of the capacity building component of the program, the responsibility falls on the bi-annual progress reports from FAES with inputs from the MENFP.
- 2.8 As already stated in this document, bi-annually, all executing agencies will present to the Bank a progress report informing on the accomplishments and progress made on the indicators included in the results framework. All progress report should be submitted within 60 days following June 30 and December 31 of each year, and should follow on a bi-annual basis. The M&E manual developed under the previous operation, HA-L1049 and updated to reflect the changes in the current operation, will contain description of M&E procedures and requirements, in order to give all implementing agencies guidance on how to carry out mid-term and final evaluations, calculate indicators and to fill up the progress matrix, etc. In the case of the EFA/EPT, the indicators for monitoring will be harmonized with the World Bank.
- 2.9 Monitoring tools and indicators for the Bank's subsequent operations will be articulated with those of the Education Plan that the Bank is supporting with technical assistance to MENFP.

### **C. Capacity Building for Monitoring**

- 2.10 In order to capitalize on the ongoing efforts of data collection and information gathering initiatives, the project will (i) support the staffing and the training of Planning and External Cooperation Direction (DPCE) personnel; (ii) provide

technical assistance to DPCE on data input, data cleaning and data analysis of the 80,000 teachers questionnaires, and the collection of the 2012 and 2013 Educational Census, in order to build, in the long term, an Education Management Information System (EMIS); (iii) support the development of a common statistical platform and (iv) promote the use of Information technology (ICT); (v) technical assistance to work and finalize a nation-wide school mapping; and (vii) finance additional technical assistance to monitor activities implemented by MENFP. All of these initiatives will be monitored by the MENFP and included in FAES progress reports.

**D. Additional monitoring tools which will be designed under the project.**

- 2.11 In order to increase the MENFP capacity to monitor the construction and reconstruction efforts, and to improve the planning of construction of new schools to fit educational needs, this operation will finance the identification of at least 120 potential sites for new school constructions to be built under the next 3 operations, based on objective and verifiable criteria to be defined with the MENFP in accordance with the IDB. Additionally, this work could prepare the ground for a potential rigorous evaluation on new school buildings impact on access and quality of schooling and inform policy-making on the actual impacts of school construction. The measurement unit<sup>5</sup> for those assessments will be carefully defined between MENFP and IDB. The MENFP will have to work closely with the DDE to identify the precise potential sites to receive a new school over the next 3 years. Because data is often scarce, incomplete or not refined enough for evaluation purposes, FAES will conduct, with financial support from this operation, socio-economic and demographic assessments in order to complete the baseline of data on the sites.
- 2.12 Selection criteria for the at least 120 sites could include, but should not be limited to: (i) poverty index in the measurement unit; (ii) number of operative public and non-public schools, (iii) the school age population from preschool to grade 9; (iii) the number of children in school from preschool to grade 9; (iv) teachers/pupils ratio; and (v) the number of kids already enrolled at no cost (in public or subsidized schools). FAES assessments should include any additional information which may be required once the evaluation design is prepared. Precise selection criteria and methodology should be discussed between MNEFP and IDB in order to ensure balance in the treatment groups, as this is the prerequisite for a rigorous evaluation. If proper selection methodology can be insured, the new schools to be built under the next IDB operations will then be randomly selected within that universe, on a rolling basis.

---

<sup>5</sup> Which will have to be smaller than the current smallest administrative sub-division (“communal section”) in the 2011 Census. Those could be the communities, villages or localities, or even a defined geographical perimeter around the potential sites.

**E. Audits**

- 2.13 **Audits.** FAES will be responsible for contracting an external auditor eligible to the Bank to perform the audit of the program as follows: one annual financial audit of the program including the review of procurement and disbursement processes of each executing unit (FAES, EFA and UCP) to be submitted within 120 days of the end of each fiscal year, and a final financial audit to be submitted within 120 days after the date of the last disbursement. For the tuition waiver program (TWP) executed by EFA, an independent verification of the use of funds by the SMCs, for schools financed by IDB and co-financing partners, will be performed based on agreed upon procedures and submitted to the Bank within 90 days following the disbursement of the second tranche. The selection and contracting process of the verification firm will be based on Terms of Reference (TOR) previously agreed with the Bank and the other contributors to the TWP. Verification costs will be co-financed with the other contributors. The satisfactory audit of the utilization of the resources from the first tranche is a condition for disbursing the second tranche.

**F. Monitoring and Evaluation Risks**

- 2.14 An important risk of this operation, and fully taken into consideration in the risk assessment and in the risk matrix is the limited availability of educational and administrative data for progress monitoring, this due, among other issues, to outdated data collection processes, and a lack of M&E framework at the sector level. The current document is based on the systems and data that are planned to become available, as well as on the capacity building that the program itself involves.

**G. Monitoring Coordination, Work Plan and Budget**

- 2.15 In terms of monitoring and evaluation activities, the project team will provide continuous support to FAES and the MENFP (in particular to the Cellule de Pilotage and DPCE), organizing bi-monthly meetings on implementation progress and to ensure that agreed indicators are timely met.
- 2.16 As described above, a comprehensive set of monitoring activities and capacity building for such activities, has been integrated in project design and funds have been budgeted accordingly. Additional funding has been allocated whenever baselines, surveys, action-research or impact evaluation designs was judged necessary and outside of the immediate competence or financial means of MENFP.

Table II-2. Monitoring Work Plan

Key monitoring activities / Products per activities	Year 1				Year 2				Year 3		Responsible	Cost (\$US)	Funding
	T1	T2	T3	T4	T1	T2	T3	T4	T1	T2			
bi-annual progress report on School construction		■		■		■		■		■	FAES	-	HA-L1060
bi-annual progress report on TWP											EPT	-	
bi-annual progress report on TVET implementation											UCP	-	
School construction supervision	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■			Consultant / FAES	\$740,000	
Assessment of the 120 sites		■	■	■	■	■	■	■			MENFP / FAES	\$300,000	
Technical audit/verification of subsidy program						■				■	EPT	\$250,000	
EPT bi-annual progress report		■		■		■		■		■	ETP	-	
Tracking survey of TVET graduates					■						UCP	\$120,000	
Financial audit of the project			■				■			■	Consultant	\$300,000	
Support to education Census 2012 and 2013	■	■	■	■	■	■	■	■			MENFP - DPCE	\$500,000	
Development of a data system platform											MENFP - DPCE	\$400,000	
Development and pilot of a testing tool							■				MENFP	\$350,000	
School mapping	■	■									MENFP - DPCE	\$250,000	
General monitoring support to 5 year Plan			■		■		■			■	MENFP - C. pilotage	\$100,000	
General monitoring support		■	■		■		■			■	Consultant	\$150,000	
Mid-term and final evaluation					■					■	Consultant	\$150,000	

### III. EVALUATION

#### A. Objective and Main Evaluation Questions

- 3.1 The objective of the medium and long term evaluations and the impact evaluation proposed in this section, as well as the frameworks for future evaluations described in the monitoring section, is to measure the achievement of the objectives of the program, fundamentally based on what is established in the results matrix. For this reason not only a regular measurement of the indicators in the results matrix will be conducted but a series of evaluations are being planned and budgeted.
- 3.2 Some of the questions that these evaluations ultimately aim at responding are, among others<sup>6</sup> (all the questions refer to the Bank's interventions and their targeted areas):
- a. Are there any changes, and of which magnitude, of enrollment in the targeted areas?
  - b. Are there any changes, and of which magnitude, of internal efficiency measures?
  - c. Are there any changes, and of which magnitude, of learning outcomes?
  - d. Are there any changes, and of which magnitude, of employability measures and wages for the participants in the TVET program?
- 3.3 It has to be noted that the challenges regarding the quantity and quality of information described in other parts of this document and in the POD are also extremely relevant for the development of the responses to such evaluation questions, and the methods to answer them. The very scarce evidence of our interventions in Haiti, and those of other international organizations, coupled with the necessity to produce sound and efficient policy, make it extremely relevant to conduct rigorous evaluations that would sheer light on the efficiency of the projects planned for the country.

#### B. Main outcome and impact indicators

- 3.4 The impact and outcome indicators that will be measured as part of the evaluations of this program include, among others:

---

<sup>6</sup> All the questions refer to the Bank's interventions



**Table III-1. Outcome and Impact Indicators**

Indicator	Frequency of Measurement	Source of Verification
Number of new students enrolled under the project	Annually	FAES Assessments
Retention/dropout rates, newly enrolled students and teachers qualifications in tuition waiver beneficiary schools	EPT Upgraded progress reports	Surveys at beneficiary schools XX
Learning outcomes of beneficiary students in interactive radio program	Beginning and end of school year	Early grade reading and math assessments.
Time on task measurements of beneficiary classrooms of interactive radio program	End of school year	Class observation as part of specialized surveys.
Number of new TVET trainees	Annually	Administrative records of the TVET centers
Employment rates for TVET trainees	End of program	Administrative records and follow up survey on trainees
Income level for Increase in revenue and employment for TVET trainees	End of program	Administrative records and follow up survey on trainees

**A. General Evaluations**

**1. Existing knowledge**

3.5 An ex-ante economic analysis has been conducted during the preparation of the program. This analysis, based on limited available information, is focused on components 1 and 2. It is a cost-benefit analysis where most of the benefits rely on returns to education (increased expected future incomes). The analysis suggests that the programs' benefits are likely to outweigh its costs, although (i) construction and rehabilitation costs are high; and (ii) the targeting of the tuition waiver program cannot fully be assessed at this point (additional analysis is needed). Most of the benefit/cost ratios are slightly higher than 1, which is an acceptable return to an educational investment (considering that education affect other outcomes than expected future incomes). However, the sensitivity analysis shows that the robustness of the results is weak (because of many "uninformed" assumptions and the long-term benefits/short-term costs weighing): some benefit/cost ratios are inferior to unity when some parameters are modified. It is then recommended for next years' programs that: (i) a comprehensive cost-benefit analysis is employed to answer the question of the buildings' specification to be constructed (a few high quality ones versus more less expensive ones); and (ii) programs aimed at loosening the households' budget constraint should be improved, considering the implementation of targeting at the household level.

**2. Evaluation Methodology**

3.6 A general midterm and final evaluations will be conducted as part of this program. Each evaluation will measure the evolution of the indicators included in the results matrix, as well as any additional indicators of interest negotiated with

the MENFP. The mid-term evaluation will take place at 15 months following the date of signing of the grant funding, or when it has committed 50% of program resources, whatever happens first, and it will contain, among others:

- a. Progress reports in terms of the programs objectives according to the Results Matrix.
- b. Analysis of implementation procedures.
- c. Analysis of the efficiency of the internal monitoring and supervision system of the Bank.

3.7 The final evaluation will take place once 90% of the program resources have been committed. This final evaluation will also function as a reflexive evaluation, a before-and-after analysis, of the program. This evaluation should include, among others:

- a. Degree in which the objectives of the program were fulfilled with respect to the expected results, as well as and the reasons for potential variations from the expected to the realized results.
- b. Detailed before-and-after comparison analysis of indicators' baselines with respect to indicators' values at the end of the program.
- c. Sustainability analysis of the activities financed by the program.
- d. Lessons learned that could be applied to future operations.

### **3. Evaluation Frameworks**

3.8 A number of individual evaluation frameworks will be placed within this operation; these are described in the monitoring section of this document, and specifically include:

- a. A plan for a rolling-out of the Bank's school construction intervention. Selection criteria of at least 120 sites will be determined; these sites will correspond to the full number of school constructions that will be financed in the next three Bank's operations. The selection criteria will include considerations of unattended demand and land availability, among others. The selection of which sites will be intervened in every specific year will be based on a methodology that will allow the conduction of a rigorous impact evaluation (see paragraph 2.11 above for information about eligibility criteria).
- b. Follow up surveys for graduates of TVET. These surveys will include retrospective information on the characteristics that determine selection into the program and outcome variables, as well as eligibility, such as: age, education levels, employment status, history of employment, etc. This

information might allow to potentially considering conducting a quasi-experimental evaluation of the program, this given that a valid comparison group could be built.

## **B. Impact Evaluation of Interactive Radio Program (IRP)**

### **1. Existing knowledge**

- 3.9 Interactive Radio Instruction (IRI), developed in the early 1970s, is a teaching methodology in which a radio broadcast guides to teacher and students. While listening to the radio, learners actively participate in the lesson by singing, reading, writing, answering questions and solving problems in ways that ensure active learning.
- 3.10 A number of evaluations of IRI have been produced in order to measure the impact of those types of programs, and from these exercises there is some evidence of the positive, cost-effective impact of IRI on a variety of low-income communities in developing countries. In the particular case of Haiti, a series of studies have also been produced. In 1997, Morin and Moyer conducted an impact evaluation of the original "Distance Learning" project (1995-1996). During the pre-pilot year some pre and post-tests were applied to a selected sample of treatment and control schools, to measure the learning gains achieved. Later on, the schools were followed up with further tests plus some administrative data collection (1996-1997). Treatment schools manifested learning gains that significantly surpassed those of control schools in the first case, and similar favorable results were obtained during the pilot phase, though reading achievement seemed the element least affected by the interactive radio method.
- 3.11 Yasín K. and Luberrisse Y. (1999) evaluated the "Advancing Basic Education and Literacy Project (ABEL2)"<sup>7</sup>. The evaluation consisted of 10 treatment and 10 control schools from the public and private sector. Using the 3rd grade math curriculum objectives, approximately 500 students were pre and post-tested. Using an analysis of variance (ANOVA), the treatment group scored significantly higher in math than the control group. Moreover, students in rural areas, which traditionally score lower than urban ones, showed the greatest gains in results. Results in reading were not as impressive, although this outcome was expected, given the new format (teaching reading via radio) and the limited number of lessons (16).
- 3.12 J. Royer (2003) conducted a pre and post-test evaluation of the "Formation à Distance project" during its last year. The work evaluated 2nd, 3rd and 4th grade Haitian students in 12 schools (approximately 360 students tested at each grade level) trying to demonstrate if students of 6 schools receiving an interactive radio instruction treatment would achieve greater gains in reading and math than students receiving a traditional educational experience. In this study only reading

<sup>7</sup>

The ABEL2 project was evaluated by the Creative Associates International, Inc. with some logistical assistance from EDC and technical assistance from the University of Massachusetts.

gave evidence of significantly greater learning gains in project schools (Math gains were similar between treatment and control groups).

- 3.13 A more recent study in Haiti was conducted for the project “Distance Education for Haiti”. The study, which was funded by USAID and implemented by the Education Development Centre, was undertaken in the 4th year of the life of the project. Though the study was originally conceived as an “impact evaluation,” the time frame was not conducive for it, nevertheless, using the available data it was possible to compare current conditions and operation in schools– as well as certain dimensions of their recent evolution before and after the intervention of the project of 115 schools during the period from mid-October to mid-December 2007. This included 81 schools presently or formerly affiliated with the EDA Project and 34 roughly similar ones that had no such experience.

## **2. Evaluation Methodology**

- 3.14 As presented in the previous section, a number of studies have been conducted on the experience of interactive radio programs in Haiti. Nevertheless, the small samples available, the variations in results in math and reading learning outcomes, and other implementation differences in this studies point out to the importance of conducting a rigorous impact evaluation on the application of IRP that is considered as part of this program. An experimental evaluation, a randomized control trial (RCT), will be conducted as part of the monitoring and evaluation plan of this operation, with the objective of thoroughly identifying the impacts of IRI on learning outcomes, time-on-task measurements and internal efficiency variables, among others.
- 3.15 RCTs are often considered the gold standard of evaluation because they consistently have produced the most accurate results. In RCTs a valid counterfactual is constructed, eliminating potential selection bias, through the random assignment of potential beneficiaries to the group receiving a specific treatment and the group functioning as the control group.
- 3.16 For this evaluation we take the opportunity of employing the most rigorous impact evaluation technique while in the first phase of the introduction of the program to the country, the results of this evaluation will serve as inputs for the decision of the expansion of this particular intervention to other departments. In the current operation IRP is set to be introduced in 100 schools, for the purpose of this evaluation, a universe of approximately 250 eligible<sup>8</sup> schools will be identified in one department (for execution and cost purpose), no later than March 2012, in order to allow time to setup and effectiveness by academic year 2012/2013. From this universe 100 schools would be randomly selected into the treatment group, which will receive IRP for grades 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup>, and another 100 schools will be selected into a pure control group which will not receive IRI

---

<sup>8</sup> The eligibility criteria are being currently defined with the Ministry.

during this operation. As data permits, the randomized selection will be done in blocks.

- 3.17 A baseline will be conducted at the beginning of school year 2012-2013, that is October of 2012, for the 200 schools in the treatment and control groups, and follow up measurements and surveys will take place at the end of the same school year.

### 3. Technical aspects of Selected Methodology

- 3.18 Given that the selection process into treatment and control groups will be conducted randomly, we expect that, on average, the characteristics between the two groups will be balanced. Balance analyses will be conducted as part of the report following the collection of baseline information.
- 3.19 Within each school selected, 10 children from each of 2nd, 3rd, and 4th grade will be randomly selected to participate in reading and math assessments in each wave.
- 3.20 The following table presents assumptions and power calculations:

**Table III-2**

<b>Assumptions and Power Calculations</b>	
Number of schools in treatment group	100
Number of schools in control group	100
Total number of schools in evaluation	200
<hr/>	
Statistical power	0.8
Significance level	0.05
Minimum detectable effect size	0.21-0.32
Intra-class correlation	0.2-0.6
Children per school (10 per grade)	30
<hr/>	
Total sample	6,000

- 3.21 The data collection instruments per wave include:

**Table III-3. Impact Evaluation Survey Instruments**

Instrument	Specifications	Application	Baseline	Follow Up
Reading and Math Individual Assessments	10 students per grade (30 students per school)	One on one assessments	X	X
Classroom observation instrument	One per classroom (3 classrooms per school)	Observation/video		X
Teacher questionnaire	One teacher per classroom (3 teachers per school)	Individual interview	X	X
Student questionnaire	5 students per grade (15 per school)	Individual interview	X	X
Principal questionnaire with associated factors	One per school	Individual interview		
Parent/tutor questionnaire	5 parent/tutor per grade (15 per school)	Individual interview		X
Administrative information form	One per school	Enumerator with administrative data		X
Control of instruments list	One per school	Enumerator	X	X

3.22 The budget for this impact evaluation is of US\$500,000. Specialized firms will be engaged to produce and validate the instruments for the reading and math assessments, as well as for the class-observation instruments, taking into consideration instruments that have already been applied in the country and in coordination with other donors.

#### **4. Results Analysis**

3.23 Once completed, a separate report for each evaluation will be prepared. The results of these exercises will be presented to the Bank and the MENFP; their findings will serve as inputs for official Bank reports, and to inform the design and implementation of future operations and eventual scale-up of the program.

3.24 It is estimated that reports from the three evaluations, impact, medium-term and final evaluations will be available six months after each evaluation is completed (see work plan below).

#### **5. Coordination, work plan and evaluation budget**

3.25 For the elaboration of the three evaluations, medium-term, final and impact evaluations, independent consultants, or consulting firm (see section on impact evaluation) will be hired with the resources of the program. The Bank will support the MENFP in the definition of Terms of Reference for the consultancies, in the supervision of the evaluations, and in the analytical work associated with them.

Table III-4. Evaluation Work Plan

Key evaluation activities / Products per activities	Year				2012				2013				Responsible	Cost currency	Source
	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4			
<b>Impact Evaluation IRI</b>															
Hiring of Specialized Firm to Develop and Validate Diagnostics Instruments				X									MENFP/ IDB	US\$40.000	HA-L1060
Validation of Diagnostic Instruments (2 weeks)					X								Specialized firm hired by program/ Supervision MENFP- BID		
Hiring of firm to conduct field work				X									MENFP / IDB		
Design of questionnaires (one week)					X								Field work firm hired by program/MENFP/IDB		
Piloting questionnaires/training for diagnostics instrument (two weeks)					X								Field work firm hired by program/Specialized firm hired by program / Supervision MENFP- BID		
Final design questionnaires (one week)					X								Field work firm hired by Program/MENFP/IDB		
Field work (4 weeks)						X	X						Field work firm hired by MENFP/Supervision MENFP- BID		
Data analysis and preparation of baseline report (6 weeks)								X					BID		
Revision of questionnaires (one week)								X					Field work firm hired by MENFP/MENFP/IDB		
Piloting and retraining for diagnostics instrument (2 weeks)								X					Field work firm hired by program/Specialized firm		
Final design questionnaires (one week)								X					Field work firm hired by program/MENFP/IDB		
Field work (4 weeks)									X				Field work firm hired by program/Supervision MENFP- BID		
Data analysis and preparation of final report (6 weeks)										X			BID		
<b>Midterm and Final (Reflexive) Evaluation</b>															
Hiring Consultant Midterm Evaluation				X									MENFP- BID	US\$150.000	
Elaboration of Midterm Evaluation				X	X								Consultant hired by program/Supervision		
Hiring Consultant Final (Reflexive) Evaluation										X			MENFP- BID		
Hiring Consultant Final (Reflexive) Evaluation										X	X		Consultant hired by program/Supervision MENFP- BID		
<b>TOTAL COST:</b>													<b>US\$650.000</b>		

#### IV. REFERENCES

- Easton, P., 2008. "Final Report on the Evaluation of the EDA project", Florida State University and the EDA Project Evaluation Team.
- Martino, J. & Locher, B., 2003, "Etude préliminaire sur les effets à moyen terme du programme FAD". Port-au-Prince: EDA Project Office.
- Morin, R. & Moyer, J., 1997, The Haitian Distance Education Project: Evaluation of the Pilot Phase. Washington, DC: Creative Associates.
- Royer, J., 2003, EDA: "Final Report for the 2002-2003 Project". Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts.
- Yasín, K. and Luberrisse, Y., 1999, "Meeting the Needs of a New Democracy Multichannel Learning and Interactive Radio Instruction in Haiti", Haitian Foundation for Private Education.
- Ho, J. & Thukral, H., 2009, Tuned in to student success assessing the impact of interactive radio instruction for the hardest to reach"



Complete Procurement Plan

<http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36407838>

SUPPORT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EDUCATION PLAN AND REFORM IN HAITI  
HA-L1060

Procurement Plan: From March 2012 to June 2014

Component	Activity	Description	Cost USD\$	Procurement method	Control/Ex-ante / ex-post	Source & percentage		Préqual. yes / no	Dates	
						IDB (%)	Other (%)		Publication	End of contract
<b>Goods and services</b>										
Component I	Activity 1.6	Drinking Water and Energy	\$ 1,700,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jan-13	Apr-13
	Activity 1.9	Equipment and furniture (classes, canteen, library, etc.)	\$ 1,370,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jan-13	Apr-13
	Activity 2.7	Equipment and furniture	\$ 1,119,375.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jan-13	Apr-13
	Activity 3.1	School furniture	\$ 440,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Feb-12	Apr-12
Component II	Activity 7.2	Production and delivery of school kits	\$ 450,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Feb-12	Jun-12
	Activity 7.3	Production and delivery textbook	\$ 600,000.00	DC	ex ante	100%	0%	No		
	Activity 7.4	Production and delivery of uniforms (2 per student)	\$ 1,200,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Feb-12	Jun-12
	Activity 7.5	Production and delivery of teachers Kits	\$ 40,000.00	CP	ex post	100%	0%	No	Feb-12	Jun-12
Component III	Activity 11.1	Provision of meals in the sports center	\$ 400,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	Jun-13
Component IV	Activity 13.2	Subsidies for centers' operation (raw material, energy, maintenance, etc.) for up to two years	\$ 800,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Sep-12	Jun-14
	Activity 14.2	Equipment of 3 centers (4 workshops by center)	\$ 3,600,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Apr-12	Jul-12
Component V	Activity 18.1	Equipment of General Inspection	\$ 100,000.00	PC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Feb-13	May-13
	Activité 19.1	Equipment of MENFP-Radio Educative	\$ 150,000.00	PC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	Jul-12
	Activity 19.3	Newsletter on the Operational Plan	\$ 60,000.00	PC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Oct-12	Jan-13
<b>Works</b>										
Component I	Activity 1.4 & 2.3	Implementation environmental and social plans	\$ 87,500.00	PC	ex post	100%	0%	No	Jun-12	Oct-12
	Activity 1.5	Execution of works (construction)	\$ 9,500,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jul-12	Apr-13
Component IV	Activity 2.4	Execution of works (rehabilitation)	\$ 3,000,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jul-12	Apr-13
	Activity 14.1	Works and rehabilitation of two centers	\$ 2,900,000.00	ICB	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jul-12	Apr-13
<b>Consultant</b>										
Component I	Activity 1.1	Geotechnical studies	\$ 200,025.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	Jun-12
	Activity 1.2	Standard design of schools ( Fundamental 1 & 2 and Fundamental 1, 2, 3)	\$ 15,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex post	100%	0%	No	Feb-12	Apr-12
	Activity 1.3	Design / Adaptation (construction)	\$ 400,000.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Apr-12	Jun-12
	Activity 1.7 & 2.5	Supervision of works	\$ 925,000.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jul-12	Apr-13
	Activity 1.8 & 2.6	Anti-seismic and anti-cyclonic supervision (LMTPTC and consultant)	\$ 140,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex post	100%	0%	No	Jul-12	Apr-13
	Activity 2.2	Design (rehabilitation)	\$ 150,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex post	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	Jun-12
	Activity 4.1	Payment of operational costs for one year in two schools	\$ 140,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex post	100%	0%	No	Mar-13	Jun-14
Component II	Activity 7.6	Distribution of materials (100 schools)	\$ 100,000.00	DC	ex post	100%	0%	No		Oct-12
Component III	Activity 8.1	Update of the program and implementation	\$ 2,000,000.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	Jun-14
	Activity 8.2	Impact evaluation in 100+100 schools	\$ 500,000.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	Sep-13
	Activity 9.1	Technical assistance for the development of a national testing system	\$ 350,000.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	Mar-13
	Activity 10.1	Implementation of ICT strategy	\$ 200,000.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jun-12	Jun-14
	Activity 10.2	Implementation of technology solutions in 20 schools	\$ 1,000,000.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Apr-13	Jun-14
	Activity 11.1	Implementation of the sports program in Carrefour	TBD	DC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jun-12	Jun-14
Component IV	Activity 12.2	Feasibility study for the implementation of a VAE system	\$ 80,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Nov-12	Mar-13
	Activity 13.1	Definition and implementation of a public-private management	\$ 60,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Apr-12	Jun-12
	Activity 13.3	Trainees tracking study	\$ 120,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Jun-12	Jun-14
	Activity 14.1	Technical studies and supervision	\$ 150,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	May-13
	Activity 15.5	Development of a law proposal for the reform of the secondary and strengthening of DES	\$ 200,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex post	100%	0%	No	Sep-12	Sep-13

Component V	Activity 15.6	Feasibility study for the rebuilding of MENFP's offices	\$ 180,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex post	100%	0%	No	May-13	Nov-13
	Activity 16.5	Study of the determinants of internal efficiency at the school level	\$ 100,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex post	100%	0%	No	Oct-12	Dec-12
	Activity 16.6	Study on effective teaching time	\$ 80,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex post	100%	0%	No	Oct-12	Dec-12
	Activity 19.2	Technical assistance for the production of eight documentaries	\$ 120,000.00	CML / SBQC	ex post	100%	0%	No	May-12	Jun-14
Project Management	Activity 20.4	Financial Audit	\$ 300,000.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Oct-12	Jun-14
	Activity 20.5	Technical audit of the tuition waiver program	\$ 250,000.00	SBQC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	Jun-14
Individual consultant										
Component II	Activity 7.1	Technical assistance for improving the free education stratégie	\$ 100,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Feb-12	Feb-13
Component IV	Activity 12.1	Technical and legal assistance for the development and implementation of the TVET policy	\$ 105,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Mar-12	Mar-13
	Activity 12.3	Market studies	\$ 100,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Aug-12	Aug-13
	Activity 12.4	Reengineering of programs in five priority areas	\$ 175,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Sep-12	Sep-13
Component V	Activity 15.2	International technical assistance for the implementation of the Plan	\$ 210,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Feb-12	Jun-14
	Activity 15.3	National technical assistance for the implementation of the Plan	\$ 300,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Feb-12	Jun-14
	Activity 16.4	Technical assistance for monitoring the education plan	\$ 100,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Feb-12	Jun-14
	Activity 17.1	Technical assistance to MENFP for implementation of ONAPE	\$ 100,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Nov-12	Apr-13
	Activité 17.2	Technical assistance on the legal framework regulating the non-public sector and development of standard contracting modalities	\$ 50,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Aug-12	Aug-13
Project Management	Activity 20.6	Monitoring and Evaluation	\$ 300,000.00	SIC	ex ante	100%	0%	No	Dec-12	Jun-14

ESMR (Environmental and Social Management Report) (If required and as specified in the guidelines  
for OP-703 and Disaster Risk Management Policy)

<http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getDocument.aspx?DOCNUM=36407966>

DOCUMENT OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

## HAITI

### SUPPORT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EDUCATION PLAN AND REFORMS IN HAITI

(HA-L1060)

#### ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL MANAGEMENT REPORT

Project Team: Julien Hautier (EDU/CHA), Julien Hautier (EDU/CHA), Project Team Leader; Antine Legrand, and Anouk Ewald (EDU/CHA); Sabine Rieble Aubourg, Carlos Herrán, and Tania Vera (SCL/EDU); Fabiano Cruz (SCL/SCT); Yyannú Cruz Aguayo and María Cristina Cárdenas (SPD/SDV); Ximena Herbas (VPS/ESG); Aurélie Gilles (VPC/HRC); Taos Aliouat (LEG/SGO); Emilie Chapuis and Marise Salvane (PDP/CHA); Maria Fernanda Garcia Rincon (ORP/ORP); Pierre-Emmanuel Couralet and Taea Calcut (consultants); prepared this document.

## CONTENT

I.	INTRODUCTION .....	- 1 -
II.	OPERATION DESCRIPTION .....	- 3 -
	A. Component 1. Increase the Public Supply of Schools .....	- 3 -
	B. Component 2. Reduce Education Cost for Students in Public and Non-Public Schools .....	- 5 -
	C. Component 3. Improve Education Quality .....	- 5 -
	D. Component 4. Improve TVET Opportunities .....	- 5 -
	E. Component 5. Increase MENFP's Capacity to Implement the Education Plan and Regulate the Sector .....	- 6 -
III.	ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SETTING .....	- 6 -
IV.	ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL IMPACTS AND RISKS .....	- 8 -
	A. Institutional Capacity .....	- 9 -
	B. Site Selection Phase .....	- 10 -
	C. Construction Phase .....	- 10 -
	D. Operational Phase .....	- 11 -
V.	MANAGEMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL, SOCIAL, HEALTH AND SAFETY .....	- 11 -
	A. Institutional Capacity .....	- 11 -
	B. Operational Procedures .....	- 12 -
	C. Assessment and Mitigation Measures .....	- 12 -
VI.	PUBLIC CONSULTATION .....	15
VII.	OPERATION COMPLIANCE EVALUATION .....	- 16 -
	A. Regulatory and Institutional Context .....	- 16 -
	B. IDB Requirements .....	- 17 -
VIII.	RECOMMENDATIONS .....	- 20 -
	A. Recommendations for FAES .....	- 20 -
	B. Recommendations for UCP .....	- 20 -
	C. Recommendations for Both FAES and UCP .....	- 21 -
	D. Recommendations for the IDB .....	- 22 -

**ABBREVIATIONS**

DINEPA	Direction Nationale de l'Eau Potable et de l'Assainissement
DPRI	Direction de Promotion et de Renforcement Institutionnel (FAES)
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
ESMF	Environmental and Social Management Framework
ESMP	Environmental and Social Management Plan
ESMR	Environmental and Social Management Report
FAES	Fond d'Assistance Économique et Sociale
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
INFP	Institut National de Formation Professionnelle
LNBTB	Laboratoire National du Bâtiment et des Travaux Publics
MEF	Ministry of Economy and Finance
MENFP	Ministry of Education and Professional Training
MPWTC	Ministry of Public Works, Transportation, and Communication
PARIE	Reconstruction of Educational Infrastructure Program (IDB)
PURES	Emergency School Reconstruction Program (World Bank)
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UCP	Unité de Coordination des Projets

## I. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 At the time of the 2010 earthquake, Haiti had just begun to recover from a series of hurricanes and other external shocks that impacted the country in 2008 and taxed a chronically underperforming education system. Limited access, uneven and low quality of education, as well as insufficient capacity of public institutions for regulation and supervision, characterize the sector. The 2010 earthquake exacerbated these challenges, affecting and rendering inoperable an estimated 25% of basic and secondary schools, 70% of technical and vocational centers, and most universities. Almost all services were suspended in the affected areas until April 2010. The education sector sustained damages and destruction estimated at US\$480 million.
- 1.2 Available statistics for 2008-2009 indicate that net school enrollment rates in Haiti were 67% in early childhood programs, 76% in primary education, 22% in secondary education, and 10% in higher education. Approximately 1 million school-aged children did not attend school – 500,000 of which were primary-aged children – and about 1.5 million children, or 72%, of children enrolled in primary schools were over-aged (i.e., below the average school grade for someone their age).
- 1.3 Provision of education by the public sector accounts for only about 8% of Haiti's grade 1-9 schools, often making non-public schools the only alternative, even for poor families. 92% of non-public schools lack accreditation and, despite the uncertain quality of education provided, the annual average cost of tuition at these institutions is US\$117 at the preschool level, US\$156 at the grade 1-9 level, and US\$350 at the secondary level – in all cases, a significant expense for a country with an annual per capita income of US\$650 in 2008. The prohibitive cost of tuition and other school-related expenses contribute significantly to the low enrollment rate of children in schools. Since the earthquake, families have faced even greater challenges to meet tuition payments as now only 17.5% of families have at least one family member employed compared to 66% prior to the disaster.
- 1.4 More than half of all schools in Haiti are located in buildings not originally designed for educational purposes, and most lack access to basic services. Prior to the 2010 earthquake, the majority of school buildings were in poor condition, due to both damages caused by earlier natural disasters as well as a historical lack of maintenance. This neglected school infrastructure often creates unsafe conditions for children and teachers. In 2008, news reports showed a number of schools collapsing and killing the students inside due to poor construction/maintenance. Furthermore, about 145 communities did not have any schools.
- 1.5 Beyond primary and secondary education, technical and vocational training opportunities are scarce in Haiti. Training centers are often under-equipped and operate in the absence of standards or regulations. As with schools and other infrastructure, many training centers also suffered complete or partial damage during the earthquake, decreasing access to an already limited education service.
- 1.6 The proposed Operation (HA-L1060) builds upon a series of recent projects funded by the IDB and other efforts to support Haiti's education sector in the



wake of its recent natural disasters. The evolution of programming for the sector is outlined below.

- i. In 2009, the IDB initiated a project (HA-L1040 - PARIE) to rehabilitate or reconstruct at least 50 schools in 8 of 10 departments in Haiti following the hurricanes of 2008. At the same time, the World Bank, jointly with the government of Haiti, initiated the Emergency School Reconstruction Program (PURES) with the specific purpose of restoring access to schools in the remaining two departments (Nippes and Sud-Est) and disseminating improved methods of building safe schools.
  - ii. As an immediate response to the January 2010 earthquake and at the request of the Ministry of Education and Professional Training (MENFP), PARIE funds were re-directed to an emergency program aimed at getting children and teachers back in school by building temporary shelters.
  - iii. In May 2010, under the mandate of former President René Préval, the MENFP and Presidential Commission on Education developed an overall plan for reorganizing the education sector. The Education Plan establishes a framework for achieving a publicly financed, tuition-free, well-managed education system open to all children and providing quality educational services as well as a set of social services. Specific activities include the creation of 2,564 new “basic schools” (*écoles fondamentales*) and setting up an institutional body to develop and enforce standards and construction codes. Implementation of the Education Plan is estimated to cost US\$4.3 billion over the next five years.
  - iv. In November 2010, the IDB initiated a new Operation (HA-L1049 – ARSÉ) to support the Education Plan through financing activities originally included under PARIE, which also complemented the activities of PUREs. The Operation was envisaged as the first of five operations to be conducted over five years at a total financial commitment of US\$250 million. Key activities for the Operation include the construction of 30 permanent schools and 25 temporary schools as well as the provision of equipment and supplies, training, tuition waivers, and technical guidance and support to MENFP to enhance access to and good governance of quality education. For the first 6 months of the implementation of ARSÉ, US\$13 million of US\$50 million have been disbursed.
  - v. In 2011, newly-elected President Michel Joseph Martelly reinforced political support for the Education Plan by making education his first priority. The Groupe Sectoriel en Education, a coalition of donors chaired by UNESCO, has in turn developed a partnership framework to align funding to the Education Plan and enhance coordination.
- 1.7 The purpose of the present Operation is to build upon the foundation of HA-L1049 and provide the second US\$50 million disbursement of the planned US\$250 million to support the government’s vision of reconfiguring the country’s education sector. In line with Education Plan objectives, the Operation’s planned activities aim to improve access to education, improve the quality of education,

reform technical and vocational training, and strengthen MENFP institutional capacities and governance.

- 1.8 The Operation will have a net positive social impact as the communities targeted and involved will benefit from better schools and training centers and an increase in the supply of quality public education. The key environmental impacts and risks are associated with Component 1 and Component 4 of the Operation (see Section II), which involve the construction (i.e., new buildings) and rehabilitation (i.e., repair, partial or full replacement of damaged existing buildings) of a total of 35 schools and two training centers. These impacts are expected to be minor, highly localized, and typical of small to medium scale construction sites. Rehabilitation works will take place on existing sites, which may mitigate potential impacts, unless the existing sites are found to be unsafe, unsanitary, or inappropriate through environmental and geotechnical assessments. The other risks associated with the Operation are related to health and safety, taking into consideration that Haiti is prone to natural hazards and has historically lacked construction codes or agencies that regulated the construction and rehabilitation of civil infrastructure.
- 1.9 Because these potential risks are considered minor and readily manageable through the implementation of environmental, health and safety mitigation measures, the project has been classified as Category "B" under IDB's Environmental Policy (OP-703). Specific IDB Policies and directives applicable to the project include B.5 (Environmental Assessment), B.6 (Consultation), B.7 (Supervision and Compliance), and B.11 (Pollution Prevention and Abatement). Actions will also be taken to ensure compliance with the IDB's Disaster Risk Management Policy (GN-2354-5) and Operational Policy on Gender Equality in Development (OP-761). If the need for resettlement becomes evident during program implementation, IDB Policy OP-710 will be applied.

## II. OPERATION DESCRIPTION

- 2.1 The specific objectives of this operation are to support the Haitian Education Plan to improve access to education, improve the quality of education, reform technical and vocational training, and strengthen MENFP institutional capacities and governance. Support will be realized through five program components: (i) increase the public supply of schools; (ii) reduce education cost for students in public and non-public schools; (iii) improve education quality; (iv) improve TVET opportunities; and (v) increase MENFP's capacity to implement the Education Plan and regulate the sector.<sup>1</sup>
- A. Component 1. Increased public supply of education from preschool to grade 9 for 15,000 children annually**
- 2.2 The objective of this component is to increase the supply of public education and support the Bank's commitment to build 200 new schools within its five-year program. Key activities to be financed include: (i) the construction and equipment

---

<sup>1</sup> This ESMR presents a summarized Operation Description. A more thorough Operation Description can be found in the HA-L1060 Proposal for Operation Development.

of 20 public schools in areas deprived of public schools; (ii) the rehabilitation and equipment of 15 public schools damaged by the earthquake or needing upgrades; and the equipment of 8 schools financed by a partner; and (iii) the operational costs of two schools in a relocation area in Zoranje, near Port-au-Prince. These actions will amount to a total of 37 schools benefiting approximately 15,000 children annually. The sub-components of relevance to this ESMR are further described below:

- i. **Construction and Equipment of 20 Public Schools.** This sub-component will support the construction of 20 new public schools in areas deprived of public schools. Pending the finalization of new building codes by the Ministry of Public Works, Transportation, and Communication (MPWTC), construction will comply with international building codes against natural disasters currently in use in Haiti (American, Canadian, and French) as well as new MENFP design guidelines. These new guidelines provide for a reduced teacher student ratio (1:40 instead of 1:50), and space for pre-school education (4 and 5 year olds at a 1:25 teacher/student ratio). Each school will operate with at least 11 teachers and 410 children in 2 preschool classrooms and nine grade 1-9 classrooms. All schools will also have an administration building, including an office for the director and a working room for teachers, an equipped library, sanitation facilities, and a school canteen and kitchen to allow the preparation and serving of food in the school. Each school will be equipped with energy and water systems adapted to the site (with connection to the local network or solar panels and a water tank) and individual chairs and desks (as opposed to benches) to facilitate team work. Schools will be accessible to handicapped children.
- ii. **Rehabilitation and Equipment of 15 Public Schools.** Rehabilitation works will target 15 schools damaged by the earthquake or needing upgrades for safety reasons and/or to comply with the standards described above in Part (i).

2.3 **Site selection.** The site selection for the 20 new schools to be constructed will be performed by MENFP and respond to the following criteria: (i) absence of a school in the district; (ii) availability of land for integration into the public domain; (iii) school age population from preschool to grade 9 in the district is equal to or greater than 800, assuming double shift, as per Haitian Institute for Statistics and Computing statistics; (iv) MENFP and FAES existing capacity for work supervision in the area; and (v) formal commitment of MEF and MENFP to finance and allocate the required teaching and administrative personnel on site.<sup>2</sup> The selection of 15 schools to be rehabilitated will respond to at least two of the following three criteria: (i) evidence of safety risks at the existing school; (ii) lack of classrooms to ensure continued flow from at least grade 1 to 6; and (iii) lack of equipment to ensure proper learning conditions; *and to* (iv) MENFP and FAES

---

<sup>2</sup> If (ii) and (v) are not reached, the resources will be redirected to the rehabilitation of existing schools destroyed by the earthquake and already provided with the necessary personnel.

existing capacity for work supervision in the area.<sup>3</sup> **Proof of compliance with these criteria will be a condition prior to the beginning of technical studies.**

**B. Component 2. Reduce Education Cost for Students in Public and Non-Public Schools**

2.4 The objective of this component is to support demand for education by subsidizing its cost for families and improving its quality by providing: (i) tuition waivers benefiting 35,000 children attending non-public schools; and (ii) free school materials, uniforms, and textbooks for 30,000 children and (iii) teaching materials for 2,000 teachers.

**C. Component 3. Improved learning opportunities for 13,500 children annually**

2.5 The objective of this component is to implement tools to monitor and improve the efficiency and quality of the education system, and in particular to improve completion rates, as well as literacy and mathematics skills. Key activities to be financed include: (i) an interactive radio program to assist teaching in language and maths benefitting 12,000 children; (ii) a competitive fund for educational innovations benefitting at least 1,500 children, (iii) technical assistance for the development of a national testing system; and (iv) extra-curricular activities for 6-14 years old in one sports center.

**D. Component 4. Increased TVET opportunities for more than 600 youth annually**

2.6 The objective of this component is to improve TVET opportunities and employment for 600 youth annually and provide a skilled workforce for the Northern Industrial Park (NIP). Key activities to be financed include: (i) technical assistance to INFP to develop and implement the national TVET policy; (ii) reengineering training programs in key economic sectors; and (iii) infrastructure and management upgrades in 6 public training centers, including three in the NIP area. The sub-components of specific relevance to this ESMR is further described below:

i. **Infrastructure and management upgrades in 6 public training centers, including three in the NIP area.** The operation will finance the construction and equipment of two centers in the North, one in the South<sup>4</sup> and the rehabilitation of the center in Carrefour (Port-au-Prince). The public training center in Trou-du-Nord will undergo full rehabilitation (i.e., demolition and replacement with a new building on the existing site) and the center in the Carrefour area of Port-au-Prince will undergo repair and structural upgrades as deemed necessary. As with the construction of schools (see Component 1), rehabilitation of the public centers will comply with international building codes against natural disasters currently in use in Haiti (American, Canadian, and French) pending the finalization of new

---

<sup>3</sup> If existing schools and training centers planned for rehabilitation are found to be on sites deemed unsafe, unsanitary, or inappropriate through environmental and geotechnical assessments, a replacement building may be placed on a new site, to be selected following the criteria (ii) and (iv) for new construction listed above.

<sup>4</sup> Cap Haitien and Jacmel (to be equipped) and Trou du Nord (to be built and equipped).

Haitian building codes. There are no MENFP design guidelines for training centers. Each center will be equipped with at least four workshops corresponding to the needs of the local economy. Based on plans of other public training centers and professional schools (*ecoles professionnelles*) in Haiti, the centers may also include an administration building, an auditorium, a courtyard, a kitchen and canteen, sanitation facilities (including a toilet block and a laundry room), and a caretaker's residence. Each center will be equipped with energy and water systems adapted to the site, which may include connection to public networks, supplemented by a water tower, water well, and generators.

**E. Component 5. Increase MENFP's Capacity to Implement the Education Plan and Regulate the Sector**

- 2.7 The objective of this component is to improve MENFP capacity to implement the Education Plan and regulate the education sector. Financed activities are expected to provide MENFP with (i) a better implementing and regulatory capacity; (ii) an improved information system for policy design, implementation and monitoring; and (iii) a stronger coalition of public and private partners supporting the Education Plan.

**III. ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SETTING**

- 3.1 A small Caribbean nation with a surface area of 27.750 km<sup>2</sup>, Haiti occupies the western half of the island of Hispaniola, shared with its eastern neighbor, the Dominican Republic. Port-au-Prince, the capital of Haiti, is home to approximately 37% of the country's growing population of 10 million. Haiti is divided into ten departments, which are in turn divided into 41 districts and 133 communes.
- 3.2 Geographically, Haiti is located in the path of hurricanes and subject to severe tropical storms. From May to November, Haiti is vulnerable to storms that can cause considerable damage due to high winds, flooding, landslides and mudflows. Haiti has the highest hurricane risk index of all the small, developing island states. In 2008, Haiti was impacted by 4 successive hurricanes.
- 3.3 Haiti is also located in a seismically active zone, with major earthquakes occurring in 1751, 1771, 1842, 1887, 1904, 1946, and most recently in 2010. Four fault lines capable of producing high magnitude shocks cross its territory. The recurrence interval is estimated at 150-200 years, with the country's two biggest towns, Port-au-Prince and Cap Haïtien situated directly on fault lines. Other provincial towns like Les Cayes, Jacmel, Léogâne, Fort Liberté and Ouanaminthe are also very close to fault lines.
- 3.4 Generally, the environmental setting in Haiti is characterized by an extremely damaged environment. The country has experienced rapid deforestation over the last century: in 1923, forests covered nearly 60% of the territory but only 2% today. Stripped of vegetation, Haiti's topsoil has become vulnerable to erosion by water and wind and degradation in quality.

- 3.5 In addition, Haiti has recently been identified as one of the countries most vulnerable to climate change. This makes the country's resources more vulnerable, and the increasing vulnerability in turn worsens the impact of the next crisis, leading to disruption and constant deterioration of the productive space.
- 3.6 Before the earthquake, the construction sector was characterized by rapid, unregulated development. Neither construction techniques nor the location of dwellings on steep slopes made due allowance for the various risks like floods, landslides, or earthquakes. Deforestation and the presence of communities (including inner city and coastal slums) living at the foot of drainage basins susceptible to flooding contribute to the country's vulnerability to storms and landslides. Similarly, Haiti's high urban population density, coupled with the absence of earthquake-resistant materials in construction and the overall fragility of the infrastructure, contributes to its vulnerability to earthquakes.
- 3.7 The environmental crisis in Haiti is underpinned by poverty, which has had a profoundly negative impact on the environment and residents' quality of life. 80% of Haitians live below the poverty line, and 40.6% of its labor force of 4.81 million is unemployed. Two-thirds of Haitians depend on the agricultural sector for a living, primarily through small-scale subsistence farming.
- 3.8 Poor levels of health and education can further compound poverty for current and future generations. The country ranks in the world's lowest quartile for life expectancy (62 years) and infant mortality (54 out of 1,000 births). 36% of Haiti's population is under 14 years of age, but many of its youth lack the opportunity to attend and complete school. Only 52.9% of Haiti's population (54.8% of males and 51.2% of females) is estimated to be literate.
- 3.9 Prior to the earthquake, a cycle of vulnerability had emerged in Haiti whereby environmental deterioration and natural disasters decreased agricultural productivity, increased rural poverty, and resulted in population migration, which in turn contributed to the increase in urban poverty and environmental deterioration. The 2010 earthquake aggravated and amplified these problems at a time when environmental indicators were already critical.
- 3.10 **Solid Waste.** The Metropolitan Solid Waste Collection Service (SMCRS), overseen by the Ministry of Public Works, Transport and Communications (MTPTC), is responsible for solid waste collection in Haiti's largest city, Port-au-Prince. Other large towns do not have sufficient budget to manage solid waste and the rate of collection vary from 7 to 40%. When refuse is collected, it is taken to *dépotoirs sauvages* (dumps, in ravines, along the coastline, etc.). Non-controlled incineration of piles of waste is common in practically all municipalities, even close to residential areas, leading to constant air pollution in these areas, and exposure of local residents to smoke, dioxins and other harmful substances. The earthquake has worsened this situation; currently, refuse is often piled in the streets, obstructing vehicular and pedestrian traffic and blocking storm drains, thereby making the towns even more vulnerable to flooding. Landslides will also exacerbate the problem of blocked drains and endanger vulnerable populations. The SMCRS equipment was damaged by the earthquake, further reducing its

capacity to collect waste, and the installation of camps in previously undeveloped areas has created uncontrolled sources of pollution. In addition, the migration of some 600,000 "earthquake refugees" from Port-au-Prince in the Ouest Department to other departments across the country has caused an increase in waste generation in those areas.

- 3.11 **Debris.** Before the earthquake, uncontrolled demolition, excavation and disposal of debris had been a long-term cause of significant environmental damage, significantly compromising the quality of drinking water sources in particular. The earthquake generated 40 million m<sup>3</sup> of debris. Loose debris is currently being stockpiled at random and without control, creating obstructions in streets and making access to humanitarian aid and reconstruction difficult. The ad hoc location of debris has also led to deterioration in disposal practices, leading the population to mix domestic waste with urban debris. Hazardous/polluting materials may be mingled with the debris, including fuel, ammonia, pesticides, lead, heavy metals, medical waste, asbestos, etc., constituting a potentially significant source of soil and groundwater pollution.
- 3.12 **Wastewater.** Haiti does not have any form of modern sewage collection network or wastewater treatment systems. Sanitary facilities are connected to septic tanks or pit latrines. The latrines either connect to rainwater drainpipes or drain directly to the ground. Septic tanks are usually emptied into waterways or holes/dumps close to the towns. In one way or another, wastewater is discharged to the natural environment without any prior treatment. The rainy season (May-July) can exacerbate these sanitation and environmental problems.
- 3.13 The earthquake significantly worsened sanitary conditions in a nation already at high risk for infectious disease, especially in the camps, which in August 2011 still remained home to nearly 600,000 Haitians displaced by the earthquake. In the camps, even minimum sanitary installations such as pit latrines are often unavailable due to concrete or tarmac ground surfaces, a lack of space, and because the camps lack the capacity to properly empty and maintain them. Since October 2010, cholera, a water-borne disease that thrives in poor sanitary conditions, has spread throughout the country. As of July 2011, there have been 419,511 reported cases (representing roughly 5% of Haiti's total population) and 5,968 deaths.
- 3.14 The Operation will target communities that lacked adequate access to quality schools and training centers prior to 2010 and were further devastated by the earthquake. Works will occur mainly at sites of existing, but damaged, schools and training centers or other areas previously impacted by human development. It is expected that sites will be selected across the country, including in many rural communities that are especially vulnerable due to high levels of poverty.

#### IV. ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL IMPACTS AND RISKS

- 4.1 The Program's net social impacts are likely to be positive for those communities which will benefit from better schools and training centers and an increase in the public supply of education. Environmental impacts are expected to be minor and highly localized and are typical of small to medium scale construction, including

the generation of debris, dust, noise, and other health and safety risks to workers and any surrounding communities during construction, and the generation of domestic waste and wastewater during the school's operation. Rehabilitation works will take place on existing sites, which may mitigate potential impacts, unless the existing sites are found to be unsafe, unsanitary, or inappropriate through environmental and geotechnical assessments. The main risks include the lack of institutional capacity of the executing units to manage environmental and social impacts and risks and the operation of the schools and the risk of additional natural disasters. Impacts and risks can be minimized and/or mitigated through standard mitigation measures that will be specified in an Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP) for each site.

**A. Institutional Capacity**

- 4.2 One of the components of this Operation is aimed at strengthening the institutional capacity of the MENFP and thereby strengthening the governance of the education system as a whole. The institutional capacity of the Operation's other executing units, FAES and the Unité de Coordination des Projets (UCP; an executing unit of the MENFP), also requires strengthening.
- 4.3 During the PURES process in 2009, it was suggested that additional capacity building of FAES would be beneficial to ensure effective implementation of the PURES ESMF. In particular, the following were suggested: (i) assistance and technical strengthening of the Environmental Unit of FAES, including recruitment of additional staff and consultants; and (ii) funds for the development of potential Environmental and Social Management Plans (ESMPs). During an analysis mission in August 2011, the Bank noted that there continues to be a need for these two capacity-building measures, given the still limited number of Environmental Unit staff (currently two) and growing number of school sites requiring ESMPs under past and present Bank Operations (i.e., 37 ESMPs – covering 30 schools financed by the IDB and an additional 7 schools co-financed by the Haiti Reconstruction Fund – are required under HA-L1049 alone).
- 4.4 Based on a review of FAES forms for conducting environmental and social assessments for proposed sites (further described in Section 5), FAES staff may require additional training on how to correctly complete the forms to ensure that the analysis of findings adequately ranks and reflects the level of risk.
- 4.5 The Bank further understands that the UPC does not currently have environmental and social assessment tools and mitigation procedures at its disposal. Moreover, the UPC does not have a designated department or specialized staff for conducting environmental and social impact assessments. While the UPC has rehabilitated eight training centers and professional schools in Haiti through projects funded by the IDB (under 2385/GR-HA), European Union, and Caribbean Development Bank in recent years, it has not been required to systematically evaluate environmental and social impacts or develop ESMPs for the works.



**B. Site Selection Phase**

- 4.6 **Risk of natural disasters.** Poor site selection may result in school and training center construction on land that is periodically flooded or subject to land slides.
- 4.7 **Land use conflicts.** Although site selection criteria require that construction and rehabilitation works only occur on existing sites or alternative publicly-owned property, there could be land use conflicts if these procedures are not followed and the land selected does not belong to the MENFP or the municipality.
- 4.8 Similarly, the large number of donors contributing to the construction of schools and other structures in Haiti and poor communication and coordination between the MENFP and the municipality can and has previously resulted in the assignment of sites to multiple donors. Overlapping assignments can result to delays to the construction schedule and heightens the risk for the misuse of funds.
- 4.9 **Community tensions.** There may be tensions between communities selected to receive a new/rehabilitated school or training center and those that are not if a reasonable justification is not provided.

**C. Construction Phase**

- 4.10 **Construction waste.** Demolition and construction waste, which may include asbestos, will be generated from clearing rubble and debris on existing building sites. Machinery maintenance activities at the construction site and the storage and disposal of used oil, may result in accidental releases or spills. This waste needs to be disposed of appropriately to avoid ground and water contamination, water course siltation, propagation of disease vectors and potential human health impacts.
- 4.11 **Land clearing.** Land cleaning and leveling activities may require cutting trees and compacting soil, potentially contributing to deforestation and disruptions to natural drainage patterns and increasing the risk of erosion and siltation.
- 4.12 **Dust emissions.** Dust will be generated from demolition and land clearing activities and released from inadequate storage and handling of volatile construction material.
- 4.13 **Work accidents.** Hazards to construction site workers include falling material, electrical faults, dangers from power tools and other dangerous machinery.
- 4.14 **Traffic.** There may be interruptions and road deviations due to the circulation of trucks/construction machine and also an increased risk of road accidents, injuring people and/or livestock.
- 4.15 **Noise.** Noise will be generated during construction and may represent a nuisance to neighbors.
- 4.16 **Procurement of construction material.** Required construction and rehabilitation material for the sites will most likely include wood (plywood and hardwood), concrete, cement, sand, cinder blocks, glass, and galvanized sheet metal. If the selection of vendors and awarding of procurement contracts for construction

material as well as labor is not a transparent process, there may be community tensions.

**D. Operational Phase**

- 4.17 **Domestic solid waste.** School and training center operations will generate organic/food waste (kitchen and canteen) and paper (from education and administrative activities). These wastes have to be disposed of appropriately to prevent environmental pollution and the propagation of disease vectors.
- 4.18 **Wastewater.** On-site kitchens, bathrooms, and laundry facilities will generate wastewater that must be disposed properly. If disposed in improperly sited, constructed or managed septic tanks, the wastewater can seep into and contaminate groundwater and propagate disease vectors, including the current cholera epidemic.
- 4.19 **On-site water supply.** Potable water will be supplied by the municipality and stored on-site in water tanks. If improperly stored and treated, the water supply in the on-site water tower and tank may become contaminated and result in the spread of waterborne diseases.

**V. MANAGEMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL, SOCIAL, HEALTH AND SAFETY**

**A. Institutional Capacity**

- 5.1 This Operation will have three executing agencies. FAES – which falls under the authority of the Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF) – will execute all components with the exception of tuition waivers under Component 2 and Component 4. The MENFP will execute Component 2 (tuition waiver, baseline definition and impact evaluation) through its executing unit “Education for All” (EFA) and Component 4 through its executing unit, the UCP. The three units will report to the “Cellule de Pilotage” of the MENFP.
- 5.2 All three entities have been in operation for years and have strong track records in developing small-scale social infrastructure associated with several Bank projects (e.g., 854/SF-HA, 983/SF-HA, 1491/SF-HA, HA-L1040, 2385/GR-HA, HA-1049, 1016/SF-HA). FAES has a long established relationship with the MENFP. Since 1995, the Bank has contributed to the building, replacement, and repair of 406 schools through five Bank operations executed by FAES – 76 of which are currently underway through HA-L1049. UCP, established in 2005, has managed the rehabilitation of eight training centers and professional schools in Haiti since 2007, including rehabilitation works under 2385/GR-HA.
- 5.3 FAES, EFA, and UCP have existing operations handbooks and are familiar with the procedures of both the MENPF and the Bank. As a condition prior to the first disbursement, each entities’ manuals will be updated to reflect relevant activities under this Operation; in the case of FAES and UCP, operations handbooks will include the environmental and social conditions outlined in this ESMR.
- 5.4 In 2009, FAES recruited an environmental engineer to set up an Environmental Unit within the organization and has developed tools and specification for

environmental and social appraisal to ensure high level and uniform quality standards of its entire civil works. This engineer has since been joined by a second staff member specializing in the management of natural disaster risks.

- 5.5 Unlike FAES, UCP does not have a dedicated department or staff specializing in environmental and social appraisal. However, its staff does include a Deputy Coordinator who is an engineer qualified to assess natural disaster risks.
- 5.6 Under the requirements of the PURES program supported by the World Bank, an Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) was developed in June 2010 for use by FAES to guide the environmental and social management activities associated with the construction of schools in compliance with national legislation and World Bank safeguards. The PURES ESMF guides FAES' current impact assessment and planning activities under HA-1049 and will guide activities under the present Operation. If made available by FAES and/or the World Bank, the UCP may also look to the Framework for guidance, but is otherwise advised to contract a consultant for the completion of assessments and ESMFs under this Operation (see Section VIII).

#### **B. Operational Procedures**

- 5.7 The MENFP will propose selected sites for the schools sub-component of the Operation, and has already selected two pre-existing sites for the training center subcomponent at Trou-du-Nord and the Carrefour area in Port-au-Prince. FAES and UCP are to conduct geotechnical studies and an environmental and social assessment of each site prior to the commencement of construction and rehabilitation, validating the site with the MENFP or the municipality prior to project design. Infrastructure is to be designed with the aim to withstand natural elements such as hurricanes and earthquakes, and to be climate and energy efficient to the extent possible and practical.
- 5.8 The following approach will be followed for this Operation to implement the necessary mitigation measures for environmental and social risk management, which builds on the existing process of FAES and is based on the PURES ESMF: (i) screening process to identify potential and environmental and social impacts; (ii) checklists for environmental and social mitigation measures to reduce impacts during project implementation; (iii) environmental and social clauses to be inserted during works; (iv) capacity building; (v) monitoring and implementation of mitigation measures; and (vi) estimated costs and implementation schedule.

#### **C. Assessment and Mitigation Measures**

- 5.9 **Environmental assessment.** FAES uses two forms for evaluating environmental risks associated with a site: (i) Environmental Evaluation of Schools (*Guide d'Evaluation Environnementale des Infrastructures Scolaires*) and (ii) Risk Evaluation of School Sites (*Guide d'Evaluation des Risques des Sites des Infrastructures Scolaires*).
- 5.10 The Environmental Evaluation of Schools considers impacts of the infrastructure on the community; vulnerability of the site to natural disasters; surrounding impacts on the school; impacts on the environment; waste management; access to

drinking water; and sanitation. A system of weights and points is to be used, such that a minimum of 65 points (out of 100) is required for a school to be eligible under the Operation.

- 5.11 The Risk Evaluation of School Sites considers in further detail the vulnerability of the site to natural disasters through identification of potential risks, frequency of occurrence of risks, and evaluation of the consequences of a potential impact. This includes use of risk analysis matrix to identify risks; assign a rating for frequency of occurrence, vulnerability, and potential impacts; and determine if the site is suitable.
- 5.12 At this time, UCP does not have environmental assessment forms for use in construction and rehabilitation projects.
- 5.13 **Social assessment.** To complement the findings of the environmental assessment, FAES' Direction de Promotion et de Renforcement Institutionnel (DPRI) evaluates the social context of a site using the Framework for the Social Analysis of Communities (*Grille d'analyse sociale de communauté*). The framework considers community demographics, sources of income, existing infrastructure, and community organizations. Information obtained from the assessment is presented alongside the environmental assessment in an evaluation report as well as used to inform ongoing public consultation activities.
- 5.14 At this time, UCP does not have social assessment forms for use in construction and rehabilitation projects.
- 5.15 **Geotechnical studies.** To further reduce the risks of natural disasters, FAES and UCP are to request a geotechnical study for each school and training center to ensure that the technical specifications for building foundations are appropriate to withstand potential seismic activity. To this end, FAES and UCP are to employ the services of the Laboratoire National du Bâtiment et des Travaux Publics (LNBTP), as they have for other recent projects. LNBTP is an autonomous agency, the only national institution responsible for monitoring the quality of infrastructure construction in Haiti. The LNBTP will perform geotechnical studies through field and laboratory tests for each of the selected sites. Findings and data will be compiled into a report to enable architects to make calculations of the loads, structural elements and building foundations according to earthquake standards. The equipment needed to conduct the tests in situ and laboratory will be made available to the project. To overcome any logistical problems of transporting work materials and samples of materials collected, the LNBTP will be supported by FAES and UCP.
- 5.16 **Land clearing.** FAES environmental evaluation procedures include noting the presence of trees on the project site and the PURES ESMF guidelines call for the re-planting of any trees removed by project activity. At this time, the UCP is not known to have avoidance and mitigation procedures related to land clearing.
- 5.17 **Procurement of construction material.** Both FAES and UCP are to apply the Bank's procurement policy to the procurement of work, supplies, and services. In the case of FAES, its FAES Operations Manual provides sample tender

documents and outlines its steps for a transparent, competitive, and fair process, assisted by a Procurement Specialist working under the Direction Administrative et Financière (DAF). All contracts rewarded by FAES and UCP will be reported to the Bank for periodic review.

- 5.18 **Energy sources.** In the case of schools, electricity will be generated by solar panels. To ensure their optimal and lasting operation, FAES has developed a Solar Panel Maintenance Plan. The Plan states that the solar panel supplier is responsible for maintenance and bi-annual inspections. Users are to call the supplier for maintenance requests. The Plan advises the supplier on purchasing panels from reputable sources and using components that minimize upkeep (e.g., gel batteries). The Plan also outlines key maintenance tips, including tools required for cleaning and repair and cleaning precautions to properly care for and maximize the life of the panel.
- 5.19 In the case of the two training centers, UCP will supply electricity through a connection to the public grid, supplemented by generators when the local network is considered unreliable or unable to meet workshops' energy needs.
- 5.20 **Water & sanitation.** In May 2011, FAES signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with the Direction Nationale de l'Eau Potable et de l'Assainissement (DINEPA), a state entity established in 2009 that is responsible for providing potable water and sanitation services. Under the MOU, DINEPA – following the provision of applicable site information and pre-evaluation studies from FAES – will conduct surveys and design, construct, install, and maintain potable water and wastewater systems for FAES projects. The MOU further notes that DINEPA will guarantee water quality and service (e.g., quality, pressure, availability) as well as wastewater collection, treatment, recycling, and elimination. The FAES-DINEPA partnership will be implemented in HA-1049 and is also expected to be used in the present Operation to protect the health of students.
- 5.21 FAES has also taken steps to improve wastewater management under HA-L1049 by developing technical specifications for septic tanks associated with the bathrooms at each school to ensure that they are sited and constructed to prevent groundwater contamination. These technical specifications include an analysis of the site's physical characteristics (e.g. topography, soil, presence of ground water), number of expected users, location relative to other infrastructure and communities, and requirements for design and construction (e.g. size, materials used, ventilation).
- 5.22 UCP does not have an MOU with DINEPA. Its current procedures for potable water involve connecting centers to the public network, supplemented by a water tank. Sewage disposal is managed through septic tanks, though it is unknown whether the agency has developed technical specifications for their management. Contractors must submit plans for the supply and management of portable toilets during the construction phase.
- 5.23 **Waste treatment services.** The current procedures of FAES stipulate that construction waste should be disposed of at officially designated (and preferably

pre-existing) sites in sealed bins. Waste should be collected on a regular basis; daily collection is recommended, particularly during the hot season. Contractors are to develop waste management plans, which include considerations for the different types of waste, storage, and the method and location of disposal developed in coordination with local municipalities.

- 5.24 Current UCP procedures require that contractors supply a waste management plan.
- 5.25 **Land tenure.** MENFP, working with the IDB, will assign school sites to FAES using site selection criteria that include considerations of the availability of land to be integrated into the public domain. FAES confirms public land tenure by requesting at least one of the following documents: a certified affidavit from the Directorate General of Taxes (La Direction Générale des Impôts; DGI), a certificate from the mayor, a gift deed, a survey plan, or property title. UCP activities will occur on existing, publicly-owned training center sites; should the centers require relocation to new sites due to geotechnical and environmental assessment findings, UCP is to validate land ownership by the MENFP or municipality prior to subsequent technical studies.
- 5.26 **Impacts associated with construction.** The current procedures of FAES and UCP specify the mitigation measures that have to be inserted into contracts for constructing and rehabilitating the schools and training centers. These are to address the health and safety of employees and any surrounding communities at the construction site and reduce to the extent possible the generation of noise, dust, and traffic during construction. FAES and UCP are to visit the sites during the construction period to confirm the implementation of these contractual commitments.

## VI. PUBLIC CONSULTATION

- 6.1 FAES is experienced in community engagement, which it employs as one of its outreach strategies. Local communities likely to be affected will be consulted and their input will be considered during implementation of the project. Public consultations will be conducted with stakeholders at the identification phase of the project and throughout the project's execution.
- 6.2 As part of HA-L1040 and HA-L1049, FAES has conducted community consultations for schools proposed by the MENFP. The purpose of the consultations was to present the program and methods used for site selection, understand community expectations, and answer any questions of general interest. The meetings ended with a vote by the community on whether to proceed with the project. Public consultations are to be conducted for all 35 schools to be constructed or rehabilitated.
- 6.3 UCP does not have a formal public consultation procedure but engages with the INFP and key stakeholders of the specific training centers to be constructed or rehabilitated. The UCP is to develop a public consultation plan and implement it for the training centers to be rehabilitated.

## VII. OPERATION COMPLIANCE EVALUATION

### A. Regulatory and Institutional Context

- 7.1 The Decree on Environmental Management (*Décret sur la Gestion de l'Environnement et de la Régulation de la Conduite des Citoyens et Citoyennes pour un Développement Durable*) of 2005 regulates environmental impacts and necessary mitigation measures in Haiti. It stipulates the need for an EIA for all projects likely to have environmental impacts as well as public disclosure of its findings.
- 7.2 The Decree N. 199/PRG/SGG/89 codifies requirements for conducting an Environmental Impact Assessment, which specifies circumstances and conditions requiring the preparation of an EIA. However, it is unclear whether an EIA is required under this Decree for building school or training center infrastructure, as the decree does not include a detailed categorization of subprojects that would require an EIA but only a list of sector activities. The Ministry of Environment has a designated EIA Unit that does not have sufficient capacity to fulfill its mandate. For the purposes of this Operation, a full EIA will not be required for each site; however, FAES procedures specify the need for an Environmental Assessment of the sites prior to final selection and the start of construction.
- 7.3 Building permits are required and authorized by municipalities once construction plans have been approved by the Public Ministry of Labor, Transportation and Communication (TPTC) or at the departmental level.
- 7.4 Until the earthquake of January 2010, Haiti had no national building codes. Technical standards that were used were determined by the educational background of the engineers responsible for the design of those projects. Most common norms were, in order of importance: French norms, American norms (American Society of Civil Engineers) and Canadian norms. The Government has taken the following actions to address the absence of national construction codes. The LNBTP is in the process of developing new construction codes and finalizing building guidelines to cover short-term needs. LNBTP has already issued guidelines regarding the quality of construction materials to be used. The project HA-L1048 (*Support to the National Building and Public Works Laboratory [LNBTP]*) provided partial financing to improve the quality of design and construction of new buildings, and to ensure the safety of the repairs to surviving buildings.
- 7.5 The government also created through the MENFP a commission for school infrastructure in charge of overseeing school design and school construction. The commission is currently formed on an ad-hoc basis and includes representatives of the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Public Works. MENFP design guidelines developed to date define standards for two types of school: (i) 8 classrooms for preschool (25 students per classroom) to grade 6 (40 students per classroom) and (ii) 11 classrooms for preschool to grade 9. All schools are to have an administration building, including a director's office and teachers' room, an equipped library, sanitary facilities, a school canteen, and a kitchen.

- 7.6 Haiti does not have environmental and disaster risk management entities that regulate construction and rehabilitation activities.
- 7.7 **FAES.** The Environmental Unit of FAES will ensure that the impact assessment conforms with the requirements of relevant ministries, specifically: (i) the Law Decree of 2005 regarding environmental management and the guidance for conducting an EIA of the Ministry of the Environment; (ii) the standards for school buildings being developed by the MENFP; (iii) other official standards including standards for the acquisition of building permits and LNBTP guidelines; (iv) FAES Operations Manual approved by the Bank; and (v) the PURES ESMF.
- 7.8 **UCP.** As with FAES, UCP will ensure that the impact assessment conforms with the requirements of relevant ministries, specifically: (i) the Law Decree of 2005 regarding environmental management and the guidance for conducting an EIA of the Ministry of the Environment; (ii) other official standards including standards for the acquisition of building permits and LNBTP guidelines; and (iii) the UCP Operations Handbook approved by the Bank. If made available by FAES and/or the World Bank, the UCP may also look to the PURES ESMF for guidance, but is otherwise advised to contract a consultant for the completion of assessments and ESMFs under this Operation (see Section VIII).

#### **B. IDB Requirements**

- 7.9 Based on a review of current FAES and UCP operational procedures, this Operation will comply with the following Bank directives of the Environmental and Safeguard Compliance Policy, Disaster Risk Management Policy, and Operational Policy on Gender Equality in Development, following the implementation of recommendations made in this ESMR:
- i. **B.5 (Environmental Assessment).** The Environmental Unit of FAES and UCP are responsible for ensuring that environmental impact assessment studies are conducted for each site prior to the execution of projects against specified social and environmental criteria, including natural disasters risks. Criteria include: (i) impact of infrastructure on the community; (ii) vulnerability of the sites to natural disasters (given geographical and topographic characteristics); (iii) respecting buffer zones around water resources and others; (iv) protecting areas and/or habitat of endangered species; (v) installing structures to prevent impacts on soil and drainage areas of the selected zone; (vi) and protecting cultural and historical sites. FAES and UCP are to conduct technical studies including an analysis of the soil and a land survey, to be performed either by FAES and UCP staff or by external consultants depending on the complexity of the task.
  - ii. The Environmental Unit of FAES and UCP are to conduct site visits and analyses of environmental and social risks as well as vulnerability to natural disasters. The entities will also consider environmental mitigation measures as stipulated in a set of Guidelines that were created as part of the HA-L1040 (Annex 1), environmental monitoring and commitment of the community. FAES and UCP may reject existing sites if these are not deemed to be secure and based on the findings of the risk analysis and/or if proposed risk mitigation measures are insufficient or too expensive.



- iii. As UCP does not have existing staff or tools for environmental and social appraisal, it may look to the PURES ESMF (if made available by FAES and/or the World Bank), which outlines procedures for the identification, review, and validation of impacts and mitigation measures and the preparation of Environmental and Social Management Plans (ESMPs). The PURES ESMF has been similarly used by FAES as a guide in Operation HA-L1049. Otherwise, the UCP is advised to contract a consultant for the completion of assessments and ESMPs under this Operation (see Section VIII).
- iv. **B.6 (Consultation).** FAES has a process in place for evaluating each site prior to project design, which includes meeting with the beneficiaries (communities). FAES uses its Framework for the Social Analysis of Communities (*Grille d'analyse sociale de communauté*) to collect information on demographics, sources of income, existing infrastructure, and community organizations. The presence of FAES satellite offices across the country, each staffed by "promoteurs" responsible for public engagement who work under the DPRI, also provides for continuity in public consultation efforts between FAES and communities during and after site construction.
- v. As UCP does not have a formal public consultation process, it may look to the PURES ESMF for guidance (if made available by FAES and/or the World Bank), which outlines procedures for public consultation. Otherwise, the UCP is advised to contract a consultant for the design and implementation of public consultation activities (see Section VIII).
- vi. **B.7 (Supervision and Compliance).** The Head of the Environmental Unit of FAES and a designated Environmental Specialist at, or contracted by, UCP will monitor and evaluate the implementation of environmental management measures and ensure that all sites are visited. FAES and UCP will submit regular reports to the Bank at each stage of the project every six months, which will include information on the status of implementation of social and environmental mitigation measures, findings of the annual operation plan and follow-up site visits, and any concerns or problems related to environmental or social issues.
- vii. **B.11 (Pollution Prevention and Abatement).** The Environmental Unit of FAES and UCP are responsible for developing Environmental and Social Management Plans for each site, which will: a) confirm that the evaluation of the impacts is adequate, b) minimize, as much as possible, any impact resulting from construction and operations, and c) propose mitigation measures to limit identified negative impacts as stipulated in the Guidelines provided under project HA-L1040 (Annex 1 and Annex 2), which have been incorporated into the FAES Operations Manual and are to be incorporated in the UCP Operations Handbook. Both FAES and UCP are to further insert all social and environmental requirements during the construction phase into work contracts.
- viii. **Disaster Risk Management Policy.** This Operation will not require a Disaster Risk Assessment (DRA) Report given the relatively minor risks associated with the construction activities outlined in Components 1 and 4. However, as under

Safeguard B.5 (Environmental Assessment), FAES and UCP are responsible for incorporating natural disasters risk considerations (e.g., vulnerability of site, materials, equipment, and communities to hurricanes, flooding, landslides, earthquakes, etc.) into environmental and social assessments and ESMPs, adopting mitigation measures that reduce vulnerabilities where possible.

- ix. **Operational Policy on Gender Equality in Development.** This Operation presents an opportunity to promote gender equality and the empowerment on women through education and vocational training. All activities captured under the Operation components should take into account specific gender needs of both men and women to minimize potential barriers to participation or benefit. Executing entities recording numbers of project beneficiaries are to also disaggregate project beneficiaries by sex.

## VIII. RECOMMENDATIONS

### A. Recommendations for FAES

- 8.1 Incorporate the following recommendations for improvement into the FAES Operations Manual:
- i. Procedures to conduct checks with the mayor's office in local municipalities following site assignments by the MENFP to confirm the sites' award to only one party, thereby minimizing potential land conflicts. The Operations Handbook should also outline the process to be followed if the site is found to have been assigned to more than one party.
  - ii. Revisions to the Solar Panel Maintenance Plan developed under recommendations for HA-L1049, including requirements that suppliers are to: (i) provide maintenance service contact details (e.g., phone number) to school stewards; (ii) clearly outline any limitations to maintenance service due to certain repairs by unauthorized persons; (iii) describe anti-theft measures; and (iv) provide guidance on the placement of solar panels to maximize cleaning accessibility and the receipt of sunlight while minimizing potential damage from exposure.
  - iii. Any revisions to Septic Tank Guidelines, developed under recommendations for HA-L1049 to improve wastewater management, based on FAES discussions with DINEPA, which is responsible for the provision and management of sanitation services.
- 8.2 Develop and submit to the IDB for review a Staffing Plan that describes the Environmental Unit's capacity to manage tasks under this Operation given current assessment and ESMP commitments, noting the number of staff required and resource requirements.
- 8.3 In coordination with the IDB, develop and submit to the IDB for review a guidance document and template for a Comprehensive Environmental and Social Management Plan (CESMP). Two Operation-specific CESMPs, informed by the PURES ESMF, are to replace FAES ESMPs for individual school rehabilitation and construction projects funded under HA-L1049 (currently numbering 37) and HA-L1060, but will also include sections outlining site-specific issues as necessary.

### B. Recommendations for UCP

- 8.4 *Based on its review of available documentation as of September 2011, the Bank understands that the UCP does not have a process for assessing, mitigating, and managing environmental and social risks and impacts presented by construction and rehabilitation projects. A process must be in place to meet IDB standards for a Category B project.*
- 8.5 Develop and submit to the IDB for review a plan that includes tools, procedures, schedule, and staff to: (i) assess environmental and social impacts; (ii) develop Environmental and Social Management Plans (ESMPs); (iii) conduct public consultation; and (iv) monitor UCP and contractor performance against the

ESMPs. The plan should account for assessing and managing risks including those outlined in Sections IV and V, and incorporate measures to comply with national legislation and IDB directives of the Environmental and Safeguard Compliance Policy as outlined in Section VII. In developing the plan, the UCP may look to FAES and the PURES ESMF as well as other documented Bank guidance for environmental and social appraisal.

- 8.6 Develop, and submit to the IDB for review general environmental and social requirements to be inserted into work contracts for contractors.
- 8.7 Incorporate the plan and requirements outlined in 8.5 and 8.6 into the UCP Operations Handbook.
- 8.8 Contract at least one consultant familiar with the IDB Environmental and Safeguard Compliance Policy and other international standards for the assessment and management of environmental and social impacts in construction and rehabilitation projects, as well as public consultation, to develop and implement the environmental and social impact assessments, public consultation activities, and ESMPs required by this Operation.

**C. Recommendations for Both FAES and UCP**

- 8.9 Contract at least one structural engineer to ensure that construction and rehabilitation works meet national and institutional requirements.
- 8.10 Create or expand an MOU with the Laboratoire National du Bâtiment et des Travaux Publics establishing the terms of collaboration to review construction materials.
- 8.11 Incorporate into the operations handbooks procedures for the avoidance of tree removal or damage at project sites to the extent possible and practical. The procedures should require a written justification when removal is necessary and outline mitigations measures (e.g., replanting) to be followed.
- 8.12 Incorporate into operations handbooks the guidelines provided under project HA-L1040 (Annex 1) and recommendations made under HA-L1049.
- 8.13 Train key staff are trained on changes to the FAES and UCP operations handbooks with regards to environmental and social impact assessment and management.
- 8.14 Submit to the IDB for review:
  - i. Schedules for implementing environmental and social assessments, undertaking public consultation, and developing ESMPs for each site.
  - ii. Design guidelines for the construction and rehabilitation of the schools and training centers for withstanding natural elements (e.g., hurricanes and earthquakes) and be climate and energy efficient to the extent possible and practical.
  - iii. Completed forms, checklists, reports, and the geotechnical studies for the environmental and social assessments as well as the Comprehensive Environmental and Social Management Plan (CESMP) for the constructed and

rehabilitated schools (in the case of FAES) and the two Environmental and Social Management Plans (ESMP) for the rehabilitated training centers (in the case of UCP).

**D. Recommendations for the IDB**

- 8.15 Review all documentation required in these recommendations and conduct follow-on actions as appropriate.
- 8.16 Perform direct supervision actions (e.g., site visits) on a semiannual basis to support the compliance with all the environmental and social requirements of the loan.

## **ANNEX B**

### **GRANT PROPOSAL HA-X1032**

#### **CO-FINANCING OF THE GOVERNMENT OF FINLAND TO THE SUPPORT TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF EDUCATION PLAN AND REFORM IN HAITI PROJECT (HA-L1060)**

##### **A. BACKGROUND**

- 1.01 As approved by the Board of Directors and pursuant to paragraph 2.2 and 2.3 of the grant proposal for operation HA-L1060, the second operation of the five year Bank supported education program in Haiti (Program), donors may contribute resources to support any of the project's components listed in any of the operations of the Program, such as operation HA-L1060, in the form of a trust fund contribution or a Project Specific Grant (PSG), as it is contemplated herein. The IDB (hereafter the Bank) may establish a commitment from each donor through an administrative agreement without the requirement of preparing or approving a separate project proposal.
- 1.02 The Government of Finland (GOF) will provide co-financing resources to support selected sub-components of Components 1, 3 and 5 of operation HA-L1060 as further detailed in this Annex B.

##### **B. THE OPERATION TO BE CO-FINANCED (HA-L1060)**

- 1.03 Operation HA-L1060 contributes to the Bank's Program supporting the following objectives of the Haitian Education Plan: (i) improving access to education; (ii) improving the quality of education; (iii) improving Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) opportunities; and (iv) strengthening Ministry of Education and Professional Training (MENFP's) institutional capacities and governance.
- 1.04 More specifically, operation HA-L1060 objectives are to: (i) increase the public supply of education benefitting 15,000 children annually; (ii) reduce education costs for 75,000 primary students; (iii) improve education quality through educational and technological innovations benefitting 13,500 children; (iv) improve TVET opportunities through a sustained investment effort and innovations in managing the sector and training centers benefitting at least 600 youth annually; and (v) increase MENFP's capacity to implement the Education Plan and regulate the education sector.

## C. PROPOSAL FOR GOF CO-FINANCING OF OPERATION HA-L1060

- 1.05 **The co-financing of GOF will support and upscale the objectives of operation HA-L1060 and in particular its Components 1 and 3 which objectives are to: (i) increase public supply of education, and (ii) improve learning opportunities and in particular for literacy and mathematics skills in early grades through innovations.** More specifically, this co-financing will allow an expansion of the following key activities: (i) the construction of 5 additional public schools in areas deprived of schools, under Component 1, and (ii) an interactive radio program to assist teaching in language and math benefitting 12,000 children and (iii) a competitive fund for educational innovations benefitting at least 1,500 children, both under Component 3<sup>1</sup>. Also it will cover the administrative cost of the Executing Agency (FAES) as part of Component 5 to manage the additional activities.

### Component 1. Increased public supply of education

- 1.06 **Increasing the public supply of education by constructing and equipping public schools in areas deprived of schools.** Key activities to be financed are the construction and equipment of 5 additional public schools in areas deprived of schools, benefitting 2,050 more children annually. These schools will each follow the constructions norms defined by MENFP in November 2010. Each school will accommodate 410 children in two preschool classrooms and nine grade 1-9 classrooms. All schools will also have an administration building, including an office for the director and a working room for teachers, an equipped library, sanitary facilities, a school canteen and a kitchen. Each school will also be equipped with energy and water systems, individual chairs and desks, and be accessible for disabled children.
- 1.07 The site selection for the 5 new public schools will be performed by the MENFP and respond to the following criteria, among others, for this project: (i) absence of school in a district; (ii) availability of land for integration into the public domain; (iii) school age population from preschool to grade 9 in the district as per official statistics equal or greater than 800, assuming double shift; and (iv) formal commitment of Ministry of Finance (MoF) and MENFP to finance and allocate the required teaching and administrative personnel on site<sup>2</sup>.

### Component 3. Improved learning opportunities

- 1.08 **The Interactive Radio Program (IRP) will provide a transitional solution to transform classrooms into interactive learning environments.** Traditional math and reading lessons will be supplemented by half-hour programs broadcasted daily into classrooms and designed to guide teachers through the use of songs, dramas, and

---

<sup>1</sup> Details regarding strategic approach in sector, implementation sequencing, harmonization and alignment, participation and ownership as well as social and environmental safeguards, among other are detailed in Annex A.

<sup>2</sup> If criteria are not met, the resources will be redirected to the reconstruction of existing schools in poor conditions and already provided with the necessary personnel.

interactive learning activities. This program known in Haiti as *Edikasyon a Distans* and officially recognized by MENFP, will be reactivated after an interruption in 2008 due to lack of funding. Impact evaluations have shown that after two years, the average scores of beneficiaries in Haiti significantly exceeded those of non-beneficiaries in math and comprehension; students also spent more time on task. Teaching techniques, such as encouraging student participation, also improved.

- 1.09 At the end of operation HA-L1060, including this co-financing, 12,000 children from grades 2-4 in 100 schools will have improved their literacy and math skills. IDB and GOF resources will support the upgrade of the interactive radio program, following a rigorous monitoring and evaluation protocol. IDB resources will finance the revision of the existing programs in math and literacy for grades 2-4 and their implementation in 100 public and non-public schools randomly<sup>3</sup> selected within one department. The GOF resources will support the adaptation of a new literacy and math program for preschool that will be tested in at least 10 additional preschools, benefitting at least 300 additional children.
- 1.10 **Competitive Fund for Educational Innovations (the Fund).** The objective of the Fund is to improve the quality of education through the use of digital technology in schools. The IDB and GOF resources will finance the implementation of innovative solutions in at least 20 schools built or rehabilitated under operations HA-L1049 and HA-L1060 benefitting at least 1,750 children (two grades per school)<sup>4</sup>. The selection process and supervision will be driven by a steering committee comprised of MENFP experts and technical partners' representatives, as further detailed in the Competitive Fund's operating manual. The Fund will finance proposals based on a competitive process and specific technical criteria, including demonstrated impacts on learning, applicability within the local context, number of beneficiaries and potential for scaling up. The selection process will be open to all public institutions, Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), and private groups. Among other issues, proposals should include the definition of modalities for capacity building within MENFP, and monitoring and evaluation plans. These initiatives will be anchored within the MENFP National Education Technology Strategy, which is currently being developed, with the support of the technical cooperation HA-T1093.

### **Component 5. Strengthening executing capacity**

- 1.11 The MENFP will execute this co-financed operation using FAES. The GOF will support the additional cost of FAES, strengthening its capacity for supervision of

---

<sup>3</sup> An experimental evaluation, a randomized control trial (RCT), will be conducted as part of the monitoring and evaluation plan of this operation, with the objective of thoroughly identifying the impacts of interactive radio on learning outcomes, time-on-task measurements and internal efficiency variables, among others. A baseline will be conducted at the beginning of school year 2013-2014, for the 200 schools in the treatment and control groups, and follow up measurements and surveys will take place at the end of the same school year. Schools will be randomly selected according to the evaluation design, which is part of the implementation of operation HA-L1060.

<sup>4</sup> Within the framework of the National Education Technology Strategy under the Bank financed technical cooperation HA-T1093.



works and services. Such costs include: consultants and supplies required for the execution of the expanded activities.

**D. TOTAL COST OF CO-FINANCING BY GOF**

**1.12 The total cost of the proposed co-financing by GOF will be 5 million euros for Components 1, 3 and 5 of operation HA-L1060.**

1.13 The GOF commits to provide, 5 million euros to support the activities of operation HA-L1060 in accordance with section C above. Final resources in US dollars will be dependent on the exchange rate of the date when the resources are received by the Bank from the GOF in euros and converted into US Dollars. If a significant adverse movement in exchange rates reduces the amount of US dollars contemplated in this budget from GOF and such amount cannot be covered by the contingency line item, the activities contemplated in Section C above and the budget will be decreased and adjusted accordingly by the project team.<sup>5</sup>

1.14 The GOF will provide co-financing resources for the components identified as part of operation HA-L1060 “Support to the Implementation of the Education Plan and Reform in Haiti” (in the amount of US\$56,790,000) that was approved by the Board of Executive Directors of the Bank on November 23, 2011. As described above, all activities proposed to be financed pursuant to this Administrative Agreement are supporting certain components of operation HA-L1060.<sup>6</sup>

**BUDGET TABLE**

Categories	GOF Co-financing (Euros)
<b>Component 1. Increased public supply of education</b>	<b>2,500,000</b>
Construction of 5 schools	2,500,000
<b>Component 3. Improved learning opportunities</b>	<b>2,200,000</b>
Interactive radio program	500,000
Competitive Fund for Educational Innovations and technical assistance	1,700,000
<b>Component 5.</b>	<b>200,000</b>
Executing unit cost	
<b>Audit, Monitoring and Evaluation</b>	<b>100,000</b>
Financial audit	

<sup>5</sup> For IDB internal and reference purposes only, the 5 million euro contribution, as of 26 March 2013 is equivalent to US\$6.48 million based on the exchange rate 1.29. However all donor contributions will be made in Euros and the exact exchange rate may vary according to the disbursement date as stated in 4.1.1. of the Amended and restated cooperation Framework Arrangement between the GoF and IDB.

<sup>6</sup> Relevant sections of operation HA-L1060 (Annex A) related to the implementation (including procurement, social and environmental safeguards, among others) are applicable.

Monitoring and evaluation	78,000
Contingency	22,000
<b>Total</b>	<b><u>5,000,000</u></b>

**E. EXECUTION AND MANAGEMENT PLAN**

- 1.15 **Implementation timeline.** The co-financing will be implemented according to the timeline established for operation HA-L1060.
- 1.16 FAES is the execution agency for operation HA-L1060 and this co-financing. The execution arrangements for the schools construction contemplates a partnership with Finn Church Aid (FCA), whereby FCA would support FAES for the implementation of the activities contemplated in Component 1 of the present co-financing by GOF. FCA's partnership with FAES and MENFP will cover 10 schools (5 schools to be financed by GOF and 5 others to be financed by operation HA-L1060). With this arrangement, operation HA-L1060 would additionally benefit of up to 1 million euros as an in-kind contribution from FCA. The final amount of FCA's in-kind contribution depends on the selected sites and the support from FCA's partners. MENFP, FAES, FCA and IDB will work together in order to ensure the smooth implementation of the Project.
- 1.17 The roles and responsibilities of MENFP, FAES, and FCA will be agreed upon, under an MOU agreement signed between them, in which the scope of their collaboration will be determined.
- 1.18 **Financing arrangements.** The resources to be granted by the GOF will be provided to the Bank through a Project Specific Grant (PSG). A PSG is administered by the Bank according to the "Report on COFABS, Ad-Hocs and CLFGS and a Proposal to Unify Them as Project Specific Grants (PSGS)" (Document SC-114).
- 1.19 **Gender considerations.** As stated in "Environmental and Social Management Report" of Annex A: Operation HA-L1060 presents an opportunity to promote gender equality and the empowerment on women through education and vocational training. All activities captured under the Operation components takes into account specific gender needs of both men and women to minimize potential barriers to participation or benefit, such as building toilets for both girls and boys. Executing entities recording numbers of project beneficiaries are to also disaggregate project beneficiaries by sex.
- 1.20 **Conditions for disbursement of the Contribution to the Government of Haiti (GOH).** Unless the Bank and GOF agree otherwise in writing, the grant agreement whereby the Bank transfers the Contribution of the present co-financing to GOH (referred to as the Additional Financing agreement) for the implementation of the activities contemplated in this Administrative Agreement and its Annex B, will be

subject to the following condition precedent to disbursement to the satisfaction of the Bank: that FAES , MENFP and FCA have signed a memorandum of understanding in form and substance satisfactory to the Bank, which will include site selection for the construction of the 10 schools.

**F. REPORTING**

- 1.21 **Reporting.** The Bank shall provide the Donor with a copy of bi-annual progress reports regarding this Contribution within 90 days following the end of each semester (that is by the end of September and by the end of March) as well as a copy of the Project Monitoring Report. The Bank will also provide the Donor with a copy of the project annual financial audit including the review of procurement and disbursement processes within 120 days following the end of each fiscal year, and a final project financial audit to be submitted within 120 days following the last disbursement date. A final evaluation will be conducted as part of operation HA-L1060 and will be delivered to the Donor upon completion. The executing agency will be responsible for the preparation of the report. The Bank will be responsible for the submission to the donor.

## UPDATED RESULTS FRAMEWORK

Components	Base 2012	Year 1 (2013/2014 school year)	Year 2 (2014/2015 school year)	Target (end of project /2015)
<b>Component 1. Increased public supply of education from preschool to grade 9 for 15,000 children annually</b>				
<b>Outcome</b>				
Gross enrollment rate from preschool to grade 9 in the districts (sections communales) targeted by the project.	TBD 2011	TBD 2013/2014	TBD 2014/2015	TBD 2015/2016
Number of preschool to grade 9 students benefitting annually from additional and improved learning space.	4,000	3000 (BID)	15,000 (BID) 1000(FCF)*	15,000 (BID) 2050 (FCF)
Boys	2,000	1500 (BID)	7,500 (BID) 500 (FCF)	7,500 (BID) 1025 (FCF)
Girls	2,000	1500 (BID)	7500 (BID) 500 (FCF)	7500 (BID) 1025 (FCF)
<b>Output</b>				
Number of new schools open for enrollment in areas deprived of school.	0	0	15 (BID) 5 (FCF)	20 (BID) 5 (FCF)
<b>Component 3. Improved learning opportunities</b>				
<b>Outcomes</b>				
Learning outcomes for students (grade 2-4) benefitting from the interactive radio program (% of standard deviations).	TBD in Impact Evaluation	TBD in Impact Evaluation	-	TBD in Impact Evaluation
<b>Outputs</b>				
Number of children (grade 2-4) benefitting from the interactive radio program.	0	0	12,000 (BID) 300 (FCF)	12,000 (BID) 300 (FCF)
Number of children benefitting from the Fund for Educational Innovation in 20 schools built under HA-L1049 and HA-L1060.	0	0	1,500 (BID) 250 (FCF)	1,750

\*FCF: Finnish Co-Financing