



Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program Phase 3 PforR (P148927)

AFRICA | Rwanda | Agriculture Global Practice |
IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results | FY 2015 | Seq No: 6 | ARCHIVED on 21-Nov-2016 | ISR25579 |

Implementing Agencies: Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Resources

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program-for-Results Appraisal Document)

The objective of the PforR operation is to increase and intensify the productivity of the Rwandan agricultural and livestock sectors and expand the development of value chains. The operation supports the Government of Rwanda's strategic objectives of the Transformation of Agriculture Sector Program Phase 3 with aims to enhance food security and nutrition contributing to reduction in poverty and inclusive economic growth. The operation supports four broad program areas: (i) agriculture and animal resource intensification; (ii) research, technology transfer and professionalization of farmers; (iii) value chain development and private sector investment; and (iv) institutional development and agricultural cross-cutting issues.

Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	● Satisfactory	● Moderately Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	● Moderately Satisfactory	● Moderately Satisfactory
Overall Risk Rating	● Low	● Low

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

Progress towards achievement of the PDO and implementation progress is Moderately Satisfactory. This assessment is based on the World Bank's review of the available evidence pertaining to the 15 core indicators of the PSTA 3, including the performance trends of the 7 DLR&Is and the overall assessment of the PforR support operation.

In reviewing the current PforR indicators and targets, the mission team: a) assessed progress towards the delivery of existing indicators and targets, while noting any issues that may significantly impact on progress; b) reached agreement on adjustments to the relevant DLIs and/or supporting targets; and c) agreed on targets for 2016/2017. Reaching agreement on target for 2016/2017 (PSTA year 4) is both relevant and important due to the fact that the DfID will continue to finance the PforR instrument via the Multi Donor Trust Fund until December, 2017 and the GoR has requested additional financing for the Agriculture PforR instrument.















Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	Disbursed
P148927	IDA-55480	Effective	USD	100.00	100.00	0.00	90.05	3.30	 90%
P148927	TF-19208	Effective	USD	50.60	50.60	0.00	29.11	21.49	 58%

Key Dates (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P148927	IDA-55480	Effective	31-Oct-2014	11-Nov-2014	11-Dec-2014	31-Mar-2017	--
P148927	TF-19208	Effective	31-Oct-2014	06-Mar-2015	08-May-2015	31-Mar-2018	--

Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	--	 Moderate	 Moderate
Macroeconomic	--	 Moderate	 Moderate
Sector Strategies and Policies	--	 Low	 Low
Technical Design of Project or Program	--	 Low	 Low



Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	--	● Low	● Low
Fiduciary	--	● Moderate	● Moderate
Environment and Social	--	● Low	● Moderate
Stakeholders	--	● Low	● Low
Other	--	● Low	● Low
Overall	--	● Low	● Low

Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLI)

► DLI 1(a): Increased soil erosion control based on agreed technical standards and sustainably maintained - Progressive (Hectare(Ha))

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	802292.00	894213.00	913212.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Target annual increase of 33,649 ha/yr for Progressive.

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014), actual increase of 44,184 ha progressive for a total of 846,476 ha achieved against year 1 target of 835,941 ha. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015) actual increase of 47,737 ha progressive for a total of 894,213 ha achieved against year 2 target of 869,590 ha. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3 (July 1, 2015 - July 30, 2016) actual increase of 18,944 ha progress for a total of 913,212 ha achieved against a year 3 target of 903,240. Year 3 disbursement target not met, but overall 3-year target met.

► DLI 2 (a): Increased land developed according to agreed technical standards and sustainably maintained - Marshlands. (Hectare(Ha))

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	24721.00	29277.00	35161.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016



Comments

Target annual increase of 1,800 ha for marshlands.

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014), actual increase of 2,284 ha marshlands for a total of 27,005 ha achieved against year 1 target of 26,521 ha. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015), actual increase of 2,272 ha marshlands for a total of 29,277 ha achieved against year 2 target of 28,321 ha. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3 (July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2016), actual increase of 5,884 ha marshlands for a total of 35,161 ha achieved against year 3 target of 30,121 ha. Year 3 disbursement target met.

► DLI 2 (b): Increased land developed according to agreed technical standards and sustainably maintained - Hillsides (Hectare(Ha))

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	3075.00	6130.00	8392.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Annual increase of 1,000 ha for hillsides.

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014), increase of hillsides put under irrigation is 1,732 ha for a total of 4,807 ha achieved against year 1 target of 4,075 ha. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015), increase of hillsides put under irrigation is 1,323 ha for a total of 6,130 ha achieved against year 2 target of 5,075 ha. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3 (July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2015), Increase of hillsides put under irrigation is 2,262 ha for a total of 8,392 ha achieved against year 3 target of 6,075 ha. Year 3 disbursement target met.

► DLI 3.2: Increased average crop yields per ha for key export crop – Coffee (Kg) cherry/tree/year (Hectare(Ha))

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	2.20	2.60	2.84
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014), increase of 0.2 kg for a total of 2.40 kg achieved against year 1 target of 2.30 kg. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015), increase of 0.2 kg for a total of 2.60 kg achieved against year 2 target of 2.50 kg. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3 (July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2016), increase of 0.24 kg for total of 2.84 kg achieved against year 3 target of 2.70 kg. Year 3 disbursement target is met.



► DLI 4.2: Percentage of enhanced innovation technologies introduced & released by public and/or private sectors and adopted by farmers (with targets for each year). (Percentage)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	25.00	65.00	61.80
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014) adoption rate of 27% of enhanced technologies achieved against year 1 target of 25%. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015), adoption rate of 45% of enhanced technologies achieved against year 2 target of 40%. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3 (July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2016), adoption rate of 61.8% of enhanced technologies achieved against year 3 target of 50%. Year 3 disbursement target met.

Results for year 2 achievement of DLI 4.2 was incorrectly inputted into ISR. The text above has been corrected to provide the achieved results in year 2 (45%)

► DLI 1(b): Increased soil erosion control based on agreed technical standards and sustainably maintained - Radical (Hectare(Ha))

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	46246.00	82565.00	103918.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Annual increase of 7,798 ha/yr for Radical

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014), actual increase of land protected against soil erosion was 18,344 ha for a total of 64,590 ha achieved against year 1 target of 54,044 ha. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015), actual increase of 17,976 ha for a total of 82,565 ha achieved against year 2 target of 61,842 ha. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3 (July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2016), actual increase of 21,352 ha for a total of 103,918 ha achieved against year 3 target of 69,640 ha. Year 3 disbursement target met.

► DLI 3.1: Increased average crop yields per ha for key food crop - Cassava (MT/Ha) (Metric ton)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	15.00	17.80	18.97
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014) increase of 1.3MT/ha for a total of 16.30 MT/ha achieved against year 1 target of 16.0 MT/ha. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015) increase of 1.50 MT/ha for a total of 17.80 MT/ha achieved against a year 2 target of 17.00 MT/ha. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3 (July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2016) increase of 1.17 MT/ha for a total of 18.97 MT/ha. MT/ha achieved against a year 3 target of 18.00



MT/ha. Year 3 disbursement target met.

► DLI 3.3: Increased average daily yields of milk per cow (ltrs/day) (Liter)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	4.00	5.70	5.70
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014), increase of 1.00 ltr/day for a total of 5 ltrs/day achieved against year 1 target of 4.5 ltr/day. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015) increase of 0.60 ltr/day for a total of 5.7 ltrs/day achieved against year 2 target of 5.0 ltrs/day. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3 (July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2016) increase of 0.70 ltr/day for a total of 5.7 ltrs/day achieved against year 3 target of 5.5 ltrs/day. Year 3 disbursement target met.

► DLI 4.1: Number of enhanced innovation technologies introduced & released by public and/or private sectors (with targets for each year). (Number)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	5.00	14.00	5.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014), incremental increase of 5 enhanced technologies achieved for a total of 10 technologies. Exceeds year 1 target of 3 additional technologies. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015), incremental increase of 4 enhanced technologies achieved for a total of 14 technologies against year 2 target of 3 technologies. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3 (July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2016) incremental increase of 5 enhanced technologies achieved for a total of 19 technologies against year 3 target of 4 technologies. Year 3 is disbursement target met.

Baseline, year 2 results and end target estimate was corrected in this ISR.

► DLI 5: Increased agricultural finance lending for agriculture sector (production and agroprocessing) (% of total) (Percentage)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	3.60	6.60	6.60
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

**Comments**

Year 1 (July 1, 2013-June 30, 2014), increase of lending for agriculture sector to 6.1% of total lending achieved against year 1 target of 4.8%.

Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015), increase of lending for agriculture sector to 6.6% of total lending achieved against year 2 target of 5.9%.

Year 2 disbursement target met. Significant progress has been made in the delivery of this DLI and the budget allocation has almost been fully disbursed.

Year3. Verification Report delayed. No disbursement made.

► DLI 6: MIS for Agriculture Sector. Updated Gender-Sensitive MIS Framework and Action Plan for the agriculture sector: Completed, Approved, Implementation initiated and Fully Operational (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	Draft M&E Framework/partially operational	Framework and Action Plan completed (C)/approved (A) and initiated (I)	--
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Year 1 (July 1, 2013 - June 30, 2014), a draft M&E/MIS framework prepared and year 1 target was achieved. Year 1 disbursement target met.

Year 2 (July 1, 2014 - June 30, 2015), M&E/MIS Framework and Action Plan completed, approved and initiated. Year 2 disbursement target met.

Year 3, (July 1, 2015 - June 30, 2016), M&E/MIS Framework and Action Plan operational. Year 3 disbursement target met.

► DLI 7.1: Approval of Seeds policy, prepare action plan, begin implementation of action plan (based on agreed milestone(s)) (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	None exists	Policy, action plan and implementation underway Policy process for access to finance underway	Policy, action plan and implementation underway Policy process for access to finance underway
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016

Comments

Seeds policy is a Year 2 deliverable. However, a draft seeds policy has been prepared and is being validated with stakeholders. Action plan is also under preparation.

In Year 2, the Seeds policy has been developed and validated by the Agriculture Sector Working Group making this target achieved. It will be sent to Cabinet and fully implemented. However, MINAGRI is seeking to update the existing Agricultural Policy (from 2004) to ensure greater alignment and compatibility with relevant developments, macro-policies, and recent sub sector policies, including those that are currently a DLI (e.g. Fertilizer, Seed and Access to Finance). A terms of reference (TOR) outlining the scope and process for developing the new Agricultural Policy will be developed by MINAGRI (by end-June, 2016).

In Year 3, the seed and fertilizer policies are awaiting final approval. There has been progress towards the development of the Agriculture Finance Policy. Advance payment has been made. Full payment will be made when policy is finalized.

► DLI 7.2: Approval of fertilizer policy, prepare action plan, begin implementation of action plan (based on agreed milestone(s)) (Text)



	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	Initial draft exists	Policy Approved, Action Plan Implementation underway	Policy Approved, Action Plan Implementation underway
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016
Comments			
<p>Year 1 target was fertilizer policy prepared, approved, action plan prepared and implementation begun of implementation plan. This target was met at 85%. The reason for 85% completion was that during preparation it was agreed that the approval of the policy would be by the Minister of MINAGRI and the Ag. Sector Working Group. This was done. However, the policy has since been sent to Cabinet for approval where it is awaiting final approval. However, MINAGRI is seeking to update the existing Agricultural Policy (from 2004) to ensure greater alignment and compatibility with relevant developments, macro-policies, and recent sub sector policies, including those that are currently a DLI (e.g. Fertilizer, Seed and Access to Finance). A terms of reference (TOR) outlining the scope and process for developing the new Agricultural Policy will be developed by MINAGRI (by end-June, 2016).</p> <p>Year 3. Key parts of the new Policies are currently being implemented. However, full implementation cannot be accomplished until the National Agricultural Policy has been formally approved.</p>			

► DLI 7.3: Approval of agricultural finance policy, prepare action plan, begin implementation of action plan (based on agreed milestone(s)). (Text)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)
Value	None exists	Policy under preparation	Policy under preparation
Date	30-Jun-2013	--	30-Sep-2016
Comments			
<p>The agriculture finance policy is a Year 3 target. The policy is currently under implementation.</p> <p>However, MINAGRI is seeking to update the existing Agricultural Policy (from 2004) to ensure greater alignment and compatibility with relevant developments, macro-policies, and recent sub sector policies, including those that are currently a DLI (e.g. Fertilizer, Seed and Access to Finance). A terms of reference (TOR) outlining the scope and process for developing the new Agricultural Policy will be developed by MINAGRI (by end-June, 2016).</p>			

Results

Results Area

Intermediate Results Area

Agriculture and animal resource intensification: (i) Soil erosion reduced and land sustainably managed; (ii) Land productivity for priority crops increased; (iii) Animal productivity increased and ani

Research, technology transfer and organization of farmers: (i) Improved technologies which are responsive to Rwanda's agro-ecological potential, men and women farmer needs and resources, and market

Private sector-driven value chain development and expanded investments: (i) Enhanced business environment for expanded agricultural investments and value addition; and (ii) Competitive and private sec

Institutional results-focused development and strategic cross-cutting issues: (i) Enhanced capacity of sector and its institutions to deliver efficient and effective agricultural services; (ii) Streng



Project Development Objective Indicators

► Increased agricultural land under modernized agricultural technologies (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	24.00	29.00	44.00	34.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	30-Sep-2015	26-Oct-2016	31-Mar-2017

► Increased agriculture exports (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	22.00	21.00	6.00	5.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	30-Sep-2015	26-Oct-2016	31-Mar-2017

Overall Comments

There are two issues involving the PDO indicators. First, the actual performance of the agricultural export revenues is well below the original target for 2015/16 (6 % vs. 25%), which was foreseen during the March 2016 review mission. This shortfall is due to significant decreases in global market price trends of Rwanda's main exports. Second, as also pointed out in the March 2016 mission, MINAGRI agreed it would enhance the methodology for measuring PDO 1 (Collecting data to measure the percent of agricultural land under modernized agricultural technologies). The revised methodology will be applied for 2016/2017 (and may require a retrospective adjustment for previous years, to reflect a consistent and comparable indicator).

Intermediate Results Indicators

► Increased total milk production (Metric ton, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	503000.00	724624.00	776284.00	780000.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	30-Sep-2015	26-Oct-2016	31-Mar-2017

► Increased % of cooperatives/farmers' organizations which are graded A and B (includes gender dimension) (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	5.00	18.00	18.00	30.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	30-Sep-2015	30-Sep-2016	31-Mar-2017



► Increased value (total production and exports) of major competitive value chains (Amount(USD), Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	132000000.00	272000000.00	289500000.00	198000000.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	30-Sep-2015	26-Oct-2016	31-Mar-2017

► Increased agri-finance lending for: (a) farmers (including gender targets); & (b) Ag. enterprise investments (value chain activities) (Amount(USD), Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	3600000.00	6600000.00	6793000.00	7600000.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	30-Sep-2015	26-Oct-2016	31-Mar-2017

▲ Increased agri-finance lending for: (a) farmers (including gender targets); & (b) Ag. enterprise investments (value chain activities) (Percentage, Custom Supplement)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	65.00	66.50	66.50	75.00

► Increased private sector investments in ag. sector (domestic and foreign) (Amount(USD), Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	513.00	621.60	621.60	670.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	30-Sep-2015	30-Sep-2015	31-Mar-2017

► Increased % of agric. production marketed (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	28.00	21.10	22.00	22.00
Date	31-Dec-2012	30-Sep-2015	26-Oct-2016	31-Mar-2017



► Enhanced results-focused institutional capacity development of MINAGRI & Districts: Action Plan (AP) updated/ prepared; AP implementation initiated & AP fully operational (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	Minagri Plan not available	MINAGRI draft strategy completed; approval pending	MINAGRI draft strategy completed; approval pending	Minagri Action Plan Fully Operational
Date	30-Jun-2013	31-Dec-2014	30-Sep-2016	31-Mar-2017

▲ Enhanced results-focused institutional capacity development of MINAGRI & Districts: Action Plan (AP) updated/ prepared; AP implementation initiated & AP fully operational (Text, Custom Supplement)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	Districts Plans Not available	Districts Strategies completed; pending formal approval	Districts Strategies completed; pending formal approval	District Action Plans Fully operational

► Increase in Women's Empowerment in Agriculture Index for Rwanda (Index (%)) (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	91.00	91.00	91.00	92.50
Date	30-Jun-2013	30-Sep-2015	30-Sep-2016	31-Mar-2017

► Increased % of households with acceptable levels of food consumption (Food consumption score (%)) (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	79.00	77.00	77.00	82.00
Date	30-Jun-2013	30-Sep-2015	30-Sep-2016	31-Mar-2017

Overall Comments