

OFFICIAL
DOCUMENTS LN-8620-PK

ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN
PROVINCE OF PUNJAB

August 31, 2016

International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
1818 H Street NW
Washington, DC 20433
United States of America

**Re: Loan Number 8620-PK
(Third Punjab Education Sector Project)
Performance Monitoring Indicators**

Dear Sir/Mesdames:

We refer to Section II A of Schedule 2 of the Loan Agreement (Third Punjab Education Sector Project) between the Islamic Republic of Pakistan the "Borrower" and the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development "Bank" and Section II A of Schedule to the Project Agreement between the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development and Province of Punjab (Project Implementing Entity) of even date herewith for the above-mentioned Project.

We hereby agree that the Performance Monitoring Indicators to monitor and evaluate the carrying out of the Project and the achievement of the objectives thereof are those set forth in the Attachment to this letter.

Very truly yours,

ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN

By


Authorized Representative

PROVINCE OF PUNJAB

By


Authorized Representative

Attachment

Results Framework and Monitoring

PAKISTAN: Third Punjab Education Sector Project

Results Framework							
Project Development Objectives							
PDO Statement							
To support Punjab to improve school participation, completion, and teaching-learning practices with a particular focus on low-performing districts.							
These results are at	Project Level						
Project Development Objective Indicators							
Indicator Name	Baseline	YR1	YR2	YR3	YR4	YR5	End Target
School participation rate (6–15 years) (Percentage), disaggregated by:	75.8	–	–	77	–	79	79
Girls (6–10 years)	77.8			79		80	80
Boys (6–10 years)	85.4			86		87	87
Girls (11–15 years)	64.6	–	–	66	–	68	68
Boys (11–15 years)	75.4			77		79	79
LPDs	68.5			70		73	73
Completion rate, Grade 5 (Percentage), disaggregated by gender:	67	–	–	68	–	70	70
Boys	69	–	–	70	–	71	71
Girls	66	–	–	67	–	69	69
Quality score of primary teaching-learning practices	To be determined by December 2016. (See notes in the indicator description table)	–	–	–	–	Improvement over baseline	Improvement over baseline

Level of school readiness	To be determined by December 2016	-	-	-	-	Improvement over baseline	Improvement over baseline
Intermediate Results Indicators							
		Cumulative Target Values					
Indicator Name	Baseline	YR1	YR2	YR3	YR4	YR5	End Target
Number of additional children of age 6–16 years to whom a voucher is provided to pay low-cost private school tuition fees (Number), disaggregated by gender:	0	0	10,000	130,000	270,000	420,000	420,000
Girls	0	0	5,000	65,000	135,000	210,000	210,000
Boys	0	0	5,000	65,000	135,000	210,000	210,000
Number of additional children enrolled in PPP initiatives supported by the PEF under a quality assurance system (Number), disaggregated by gender:	0	180,000	360,000	540,000	720,000	900,000	900,000
Boys	0	90,000	180,000	270,000	360,000	450,000	450,000
Girls	0	90,000	180,000	270,000	360,000	450,000	450,000
Number of additional schools covered by PPP initiatives supported by the PEF under a quality assurance system (Number)	0	225	450	675	900	1,125	1,125

Number of children of age 3–5 years enrolled in an ECE classroom that meets quality standards (Number), disaggregated by gender:	0.00	0	30,000	75,000	135,000	210,000	210,000
Boys	0	0	15,000	37,500	67,500	105,000	105,000
Girls	0	0	15,000	37,500	67,500	105,000	105,000
Percentage of new teachers recruited based on merit, for all vacant posts under the initial recruitment quota reallocated to schools according to the recruitment policy (Percentage)	100	100	100	100	100	100	100
Number of districts in which at least 85% of primary public schools are covered by strengthened package of field-based CPD (Number)	0	0	4	8	12	18	18
Grades 5 and 8 PEC (revised) results are analyzed and widely disseminated in actionable form (Text)	PEC instruments do not use equated items or measure higher-order cognitive skills, and results are not disseminated in actionable form	Instruments revision	Revised instruments piloted	Grades 5 and 8 PEC (revised) administered to all public school children.	Grades 5 and 8 PEC results are analyzed and reported in actionable form.	Grades 5 and 8 PEC results are analyzed and reported in actionable form.	PEC results from previous year are analyzed and disseminated in actionable form.
NSB execution rate	TBD	–	–	Increase of 2 percentage points over baseline	–	Increase of 5 percentage points over baseline	Increase of 5 percentage points over baseline
Number of Executive District Offices (EDOs)-Education that analyze and act on revised district education report card	0	0	3	12	36	36	36

generated from integrated database (Number)							
Number of SC members reached through citizen engagement initiatives	80,000	80,000	96,000	128,000	212,000	212,000	212,000

Indicator Description

Project Development Objective Indicators

Indicator Name	Description (indicator definition and so on.)	Frequency	Data Source/Methodology	Responsibility for Data Collection
School participation rate	Measures the number of children in the relevant age group who are enrolled in school (regardless of grade), expressed as a percentage of the number of children in the relevant age group.	Years 3 and 5	PSLM. Baseline data are from 2013–14, with the exception of the LPDs (2012–13).	Pakistan Bureau of Statistics
Completion rate, Grade 5	An indicator of the extent to which children who enroll in Grade 1 then go on to successfully complete Grade 5. The data will cover only government schools. The rate is calculated using the number of children enrolled in Grade 5 as a percentage of the number of children enrolled in Grade 1, four years earlier.	Years 3 and 5	School census data, which are collected from all government schools using a standardized format at the midpoint of the academic year. The baseline is calculated using data from 2010 and 2014.	PMIU/SED/MEAs
Quality score of primary teaching-learning practices	A score that measures the quality of teaching-learning practices at the primary level. The quality of practices is scored based on data derived from an observation format that covers different domains of teaching-learning practice, such as classroom organization, instructional support, and emotional support. The practices observed are those known to be related to student learning.	Baseline and year 5. The baseline value is scheduled to be determined by December 2016.	Independent third party. Derived from observations of a representative sample of teachers or classrooms targeted under DLI 6. The observation format will be aligned with the teaching-learning practices targeted by the DSD. Once the instrument has been designed and validated, and a team of observers has been trained to	PMIU/DSD/third party

			reliably collect data, the baseline data collection will be undertaken to determine the baseline value.	
Level of school readiness	Measures the child's readiness for primary school. The level is a score derived from the child's performance on a preschool readiness measurement tool that assesses preliteracy, prenumeracy and fine motor skills, as well as the child's level of language and socioemotional development.	Baseline and year 5	Independent third party. The MELQO tool (or a similar one) will be used, and administered to a representative sample of children who have completed the preschool year at schools targeted under DLI 4.	PMIU/DSD/third party

Intermediate Results Indicators

Indicator Name	Description (indicator definition and so on.)	Frequency	Data Source/Methodology	Responsibility for Data Collection
Number of additional children of age 6–16 years to whom a voucher is provided to pay low-cost private school tuition fees	Measures the number of children to whom a voucher is provided to pay for low-cost private school tuition at a school that maintains quality standards as contractually defined between the school and the PEF. This indicator will include only those children who participate in the EVS that uses a strengthened quality assurance system designed under the project; and who are in addition to the children enrolled in the EVS schools as captured in the DLI baseline	Annual	PEF, using own and PEF-validated partner school data	PEF. Partner schools are responsible for providing attendance data. The PEF is responsible for administering QAT.
Number of additional schools covered by PPP initiatives supported by the PEF under a quality assurance system	Measures the number of additional schools covered by a PPP initiative and for which there is a quality assurance system strengthened by the project. 'Additional' means schools that are in addition to the schools included in the DLI baseline.	Annual	PEF	PEF. Based on PEF-validated data provided by partner schools.
Number of additional children enrolled in PPP initiatives supported by the PEF under a quality assurance system	Measures the number of children enrolled in additional schools covered by a PPP initiative and for which there is a quality assurance system strengthened by the project. These	Annual	PEF	PEF. Based on PEF-validated data provided by partner schools.

	children are in addition to children enrolled in PPP schools already operating at baseline, as captured in the DLI.			
Number of children of age 3–5 years enrolled in an ECE classroom that meets quality standards	Measures the number of children enrolled in the classrooms that meet all the quality standards, as stipulated in DLI 4	Annual	DSD. DTE data to be validated on a sample basis in years 3 and 5 by a third party evaluation.	PMIU/DSD
Percentage of new teachers who are recruited based on merit, for all vacant posts under the initial recruitment quota reallocated to schools according to the recruitment policy	Measures the number of new teachers recruited based on merit for all vacant posts (which are to be filled by initial recruitment of teachers and not by promotions) reallocated to schools based on the recruitment policy, as a percentage of all new teachers recruited for those vacant posts	Annual	EDOs/District Monitoring Officers (DMOs). The data will be validated in year 3 by a third party.	PMIU
Number of districts in which at least 85% of primary public schools are covered by strengthened package of field-based CPD	Measures the number of districts in which at least 85% of primary public schools receive all elements of the strengthened package. The elements are those that are stipulated in DLI 6.	Annual	DTEs. The data will be validated on a sample basis in years 3 and 5 by a third party.	PMIU/DSD
Grades 5 and 8 PEC (revised) results are analyzed and reported in actionable form	Revised instruments will include instruments that measure higher-order cognitive skills and contain items that are designed for inter-year equitability. The reporting of data in actionable form means that the data are analyzed, tailored, and disseminated to relevant stakeholders (teachers/trainers, curriculum and textbook developers, and decision makers) in a form that is useful to them in deciding what actions can be taken to improve the quality of education.	In years 4 and 5	TPV Report	PMIU/PEC
NSB execution rate	Equivalent to the funds expended by schools against the NSB funds received by schools, as a percentage of the NSB funds received by schools	To establish baseline, and in years 3 and 5	Third party surveys will be conducted to establish baseline, and in years 3 and 5	PMIU
Number of EDOs-Education that analyze and act on revised district education report card	Measures the number of EDOs-Education that analyze the revised District Report Cards generated from the integrated database, and	Annual	PMIU	PMIU

<p>generated from integrated database</p>	<p>that take action based on the analysis. Evidence of analysis and action will be based on minutes of the District Review Committee (DRC), using a protocol to be elaborated during the first 6 months of the project implementation period. Only those DRCs will be analyzed that have received training through the project on how to analyze and act on the data in the revised district education report card. 'Revised' refers to revisions to be made to the report card as described in annex 2. 'Integrated' means that the report card is generated from a master database that incorporates data sets as agreed in the Memorandum of Understanding to be elaborated in year 1 of project implementation.</p>			
<p>Number of SC members reached through citizen engagement initiatives</p>	<p>Measures the number of members of a SC (mostly parents) who are given a forum through either a school mobilization program (on going) based on information and communication technology (ICT) or any other forum to voice their service delivery related needs and/or complaints. This will be measured through the data collected by the PMIU on the SC mobilization program(s).</p>	<p>Annual</p>	<p>PMIU</p>	<p>PMIU</p>