#### Land Acquisition and Livelihood Restoration Plan Corrective Action Plan Implementation Audit Part Two

Project Number: 47919-014

January 2015

Document Stage: Final

# Adjaristsqali Hydropower Project (Georgia)

Prepared by Adjaristsqali Georgia LLC (AGL) for the Asian Development Bank

The final report is a document of the borrower. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent those of ADB's Board of Directors, Management, or staff, and may be preliminary in nature. Your attention is directed to the "Terms of Use" section of this website.

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.







# Shuakhevi Hydropower Cascade

LALRP Corrective Action Plan Implementation Audit Part Two January 2015

Adjaristsqali Georgia LLC (AGL)



# Shuakhevi Hydropower Cascade

LALRP Corrective Action Plan Implementation Audit Part Two January 2015

Adjaristsqali Georgia LLC (AGL)

1 Adbashidze Street 6, 6010 Batumi, Georgia



#### Issue and revision record

Revision	<b>Date</b>	Originator	Checker	Approver	<b>Description</b> First draft
A	19 December 2014	H Mills	I D Scott	I D Scott	
В	22 January 2015	H Mills	I D Scott	I D Scott	Final

#### Information Class: Standard

This document is issued for the party which commissioned it and for specific purposes connected with the above-captioned project only. It should not be relied upon by any other party or used for any other purpose.

We accept no responsibility for the consequences of this document being relied upon by any other party, or being used for any other purpose, or containing any error or omission which is due to an error or omission in data supplied to us by other parties.

This document contains confidential information and proprietary intellectual property. It should not be shown to other parties without consent from us and from the party which commissioned it.



### Contents

Chapter	Title	Page
List of Abb	reviations	
1	Introduction	1
1.1 1.2 1.3	Summary of Findings	1
2	Updated CAP Audit Findings	3
2.1	Overview	3
2.2	Action 1 – Compensation	3
2.3	Action 2 – Detailed Livelihood Restoration Plan	4
2.4	Action 3 – Internal Monitoring	4
2.5	Action 4 – Data Management	5
2.6	Action 5 – Addendum LALRP	5
2.7	Action 6 – Completion Audit	5
3	Conclusions and Follow-up Actions	7
Appendic	ces	9
Appendix A	. Updated CAP – September 2014	10
	. AGL's Internal Monitoring Report for November 2014	11



#### List of Abbreviations

ADB Asian Development Bank AGL Adjaristsqali Georgia LLC

AH Affected Household AP Affected Person

CAP Corrective Action Plan

EBRD European Bank for Reconstruction and Development

GEL Georgian Currency (Lari)

IC Information Centre

IFC International Finance Corporation

LALRF Land Acquisition and Livelihood Restoration Framework

LALRP Land Acquisition and Livelihood Restoration Plan

LRP Livelihood Restoration Plan SPS Safeguard Policy Statement



#### 1 Introduction

#### 1.1 Summary of Findings

This section presents a summary of the findings of this audit report; the findings are presented in detail in section 2.

This audit report concludes that all of the key actions due to be completed at the present time (December 2014) have been completed satisfactorily by AGL. This includes the actions on preparation of the Detailed LRP, preparation of an internal monitoring report for November 2014 and updating the data spreadsheets to ensure that AHs are listed correctly according to whether they lost more or less than 10% of their productive land. Regarding the payment of outstanding compensation, AGL has paid all of the underpayments due, with the exception of 37 payments of less than 50 GEL (the greatest of these was 37 GEL and the second highest was 17 GEL). In case the persons concerned express an interest in receiving the outstanding compensation AGL has set the money aside and will pay any genuine outstanding amount requested, however small. We have concluded that for the purposes of the CAP, the compensation action on AGL should be closed.

There are a small number of ongoing actions, or actions that were not due at the present time, which are presented in a updated CAP in section 3 and summarised as follows:

- Implementation of the Detailed LRP
- Monthly internal monitoring reports on resettlement to be submitted to ADB
- Organisation of AHs into correct categorisation on data spreadsheets
- Preparation of an Addendum LALRP when new land needs to be acquired
- Updating the spreadsheets (or creation of new spreadsheets) when new land is acquired
- Preparation of a Completion Audit when all land has been acquired

#### 1.2 Background and Scope

Adjaristsqali Georgia LLC (AGL), a subsidiary of Clean Energy Invest AS, <sup>1</sup> is the Project Developer of the Adjaristsqali Hydropower Cascade Project ('the project') which is made up of three hydropower schemes, namely Shuakhevi, Koromkheti and Khertvisi in Georgia. In the early stages of project development, AGL prepared a Land Acquisition and Livelihood Restoration Framework (LALRF) to guide the preparation of Resettlement Action Plans (RAP) and Livelihood Restoration Plans (LRP) for each of the three schemes and to meet the requirements of the 2012 International Finance Corporation (IFC) Performance Standard 5 (PS5): Land Acquisition and Involuntary Resettlement; and, the 2008 European Bank of Reconstruction and Development (EBRD) Performance Requirement 5 (PR5): Land Acquisition, Involuntary Resettlement and Economic Displacement. Prior to this a feasibility study, including an environmental and social impact assessment, was completed for the Adjaristsgali Hydropower Cascade Project.

Using the LALRF, a Land Acquisition and Livelihood Restoration Plan (LALRP) was prepared for the Shuakhevi Scheme. The LALRP, which complies with Georgian land law and other relevant legislation as well as with IFC PS5 and EBRD PR5, was disclosed on the AGL website in September 2013.

<sup>1</sup> CEI was established in 2010 as a single purpose company to develop the project. It is a joint venture between Norsk Mineral AS (Norsk Mineral) and Clean Energy Group AS (CEG).



Implementation of land acquisition and livelihood restoration for the Shuakhevi Scheme commenced in 2013 with the payment of compensation to affected households (AHs) and implementation of livelihood restoration measures via the AGL training centre. In January 2014, the LALRP for Shuakhevi dated September 2013 and already endorsed by IFC and EBRD, was submitted to Asian Development Bank (ADB) for review and comments. Following ADB's review, several revisions were made to address ADB's SPS, Safeguard Requirement 2: Involuntary Resettlement. The latest version of the LALRP is dated 04 April 2014.

A detailed external review of LALRP implementation was required by ADB prior to Board approval. AGL commissioned Mott MacDonald to undertake the external audit and a final version of the report was submitted to ADB on 10 May 2014. The purpose of the external audit was to determine whether AGL's actions were in line with the LALRP, to identify outstanding compliance issues and actions to address these. Where non-compliances were identified, actions to address these and associated timeframes were presented in a Corrective Action Plan (CAP). Under the CAP, AGL was required to complete all actions prior to the first disbursement of funds. As well, an external monitor was required to review, sign off and advise ADB of the status of the implementation of the CAP prior to the disbursement taking place. The 'LALRP CAP Implementation Audit' report (Revision B, dated 5 September 2014) presents the findings of the first external monitoring audit of the implementation of the CAP. The LALRP CAP Implementation Audit identified six areas for improvement in an 'Updated CAP' and the present report reviews progress against those six areas. The Updated CAP is presented in full in Appendix A.

#### 1.3 Structure of Report

This implementation audit report focusses exclusively on the implementation of the Updated CAP. For an overview of the applicable national and international standards for land acquisition, LALRP and project description please refer to the external audit report of 10 May 2014. The audit findings for each Updated CAP topic are covered in Section 2. Conclusions and follow up actions are summarised in Section 3.



# 2 Updated CAP Audit Findings

#### 2.1 Overview

Mott MacDonald has reviewed the Updated CAP presented in the LALRP CAP Implementation Audit for completion and the implementation status of each of the actions is presented in the subsections below.

#### 2.2 Action 1 – Compensation

In the LALRP CAP Implementation Audit, the action relating to compensating for underpayments was given high priority. Table 2.1 below outlines the activities undertaken and evidence produced by AGL to close-out the corrective action related to compensation. AGL has not taken forward contracts for land and trees in Patchka and Kvatia as the Company no longer needs land there due to design changes. As a result the total number of underpayments is 17 fewer than was reported in the CAP Implementation Audit report.

Table 2.1: Compensation action

Table 2.1. Compensation action				
#	Action	KPI	Measures undertaken by AGL to meet requirement/Comment	Action closed
1	Pay outstanding amounts as	Payment transcripts	AGL sent bank transcripts to show that underpayments have been paid to affected households as follows:	Yes
identified o short and le spreadshee (described Section 3 c	identified on both short and long spreadsheets (described in Section 3 of LALRP CAP		<ul> <li>Short spreadsheet - All of the underpayments of 50 GEL and over on the short spreadsheet (listing those losing more than 10% of productive land and the 'newly affected households as of May 2014') have been paid. There are six payments under 50 GEL, the maximum is 9.5 GEL and the average is 5.53 GEL. We consider the underpayments on the short spreadsheet closed.</li> </ul>	
			<ul> <li>Long spreadsheet – on the long spreadsheet (which covers land losses of less than 10% of productive land) all underpayments of 50 GEL and higher have been paid, with the following three exceptions:</li> </ul>	
		passed a allowed it money as bank tran is in the p deducted owed to t  One of th bank tran in the pro has dedu	One of the AH heads² was paid compensation but subsequently passed away. The bank initially held up the payment but later allowed it to go through and in the meantime, AGL paid his son the money as well. As a result, the AH was paid the money twice (both bank transcripts have been reviewed by Mott MacDonald). The AH is in the process of returning the overpayment and AGL has deducted the amount it owed the AH (1,030 GEL) from the amount owed to the Company.	
				<ul> <li>One of the AHs<sup>3</sup> was paid twice by mistake for the same land (both bank transcripts have been reviewed by Mott MacDonald). They are in the process of returning the overpaid money to AGL and AGL has deducted the amount they underpaid on the original amount (5,000 GEL).</li> </ul>
			<ul> <li>There is an apparent underpayment of 7,000 GEL due to one AH<sup>4</sup>.</li> <li>This contract has not yet been signed. The contract signing and payment are expected by the end of December 2014.</li> </ul>	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Identity number ending \*\*4687

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Identity number ending \*\*1652

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Identity number ending \*\*4030



#	Action	KPI	Measures undertaken by AGL to meet requirement/Comment	Action closed
			On the long spreadsheet there are 31 payments of under 50 GEL which have not been paid. The maximum is 37 GEL and the second highest is 17 GEL. The average is 7.31 GEL. We consider the underpayments on the long spreadsheet closed.	
			In case the persons concerned express an interest in receiving the outstanding compensation AGL has set the money aside and will pay any genuine outstanding amount requested, however small.	

#### 2.3 Action 2 – Detailed Livelihood Restoration Plan

In the LALRP CAP Implementation Audit, the action relating to preparation of a Detailed Livelihood Restoration Plan (LRP) was given high priority. Table 2.2 below outlines the activities undertaken and evidence produced by AGL to close-out the corrective action related to the Detailed LRP.

Table 2.2: Detailed LRP action

#	Action	KPI	Measures undertaken by AGL to meet requirement/Comment	Action closed
2	Prepare and implement Detailed LRP as per Action 5 of CAP. The Detailed LRP should put in place mechanisms for managing any return of land use rights during operations.	Detailed LRP Internal Monitoring Reports on progress	A Detailed LRP has been prepared and approved by both AGL and ADB.	Yes

#### 2.4 Action 3 – Internal Monitoring

In the LALRP CAP Implementation Audit, the action relating to preparation of a monthly internal monitoring report was given high priority. Table 2.3 below outlines the activities undertaken and evidence produced by AGL to close-out the corrective action related to the internal monitoring report.

Table 2.3: Internal monitoring action

#	Action	KPI	Measures undertaken by AGL to meet requirement/Comment	Action closed
3	Monthly internal monitoring reports to be produced, commencing in October 2014. Issues to be covered include but should not be limited to:	Monthly reports sub-	An internal monitoring report for November 2014 has been prepared by ADL covering all	Yes – reports due
	<ul> <li>Implementation of livelihood restoration measures</li> <li>Employment for severely affected households identified by AGL as due to be offered work in inaccessible/ unproductive land review (names can be supplied by Mott MacDonald)</li> </ul>	mitted to ADB	of the topics identified in the Updated CAP. A copy of the report is in Appendix B.  Monthly reports using the same format and reporting on the same or similar topic areas	monthly from December 2014 onwards
	<ul> <li>Return of land to those severely affected households identified by AGL as part of inaccessible/unproductive</li> </ul>		should be forwarded to ADB for their review and kept on file	



#	Action	KPI	Measures undertaken by AGL to meet requirement/Comment	Action closed
	land review (names can be supplied by Mott MacDonald, details not expected until operations phase)		by AGL for future audits, such as the Completion Audit (see	
	<ul> <li>Number of APs employed on the Project</li> </ul>		section 2.7.	
	<ul> <li>Types of grievances raised in the previous month, total number raised for month and construction phase and number outstanding</li> </ul>			
	Communications log for the month			
	<ul> <li>Training carried out during the month</li> </ul>			

#### 2.5 Action 4 – Data Management

In the LALRP CAP Implementation Audit, the actions relating to data management were given high priority. Table 2.4 below outlines the activities undertaken and evidence produced by AGL to close-out the corrective actions related to data management.

Table 2.4: Data management action

#	Action	KPI	Measures undertaken by AGL to meet requirement/Comment	Action closed
4a	Ensure that the excel database of information is kept up to date with all AHs and plots affected, contract numbers, amount of compensation paid, date of payment, payment transcript numbers, whether severely affected or significantly affected (losing 50% or 10% or more of land), whether plot is needed temporarily or permanently (when this information becomes available in operations).	Database updates as more land is acquired	No new land has been acquired since the last audit, therefore this action is not due at present and will carry forward into the future actions described in section 3.	Not due
4b	AGL to ensure that each AH is listed correctly on the 'short' or the 'long' spreadsheet according to whether they lost more or less than 10% of their land. AGL to integrate the 25 'newly affected' into one or other of the main lists	Organisation of AHs into correct categorisation	This work is underway as of 19 December 2014.	Work on- going

#### 2.6 Action 5 – Addendum LALRP

In the LALRP CAP Implementation Audit, the action relating to preparation of an Addendum LALRP was given low priority and is not due until May 2015. Therefore this action will carry forward into the future actions described in section 3.

#### 2.7 Action 6 - Completion Audit

In the LALRP CAP Implementation Audit, the action relating to preparation of a Completion Audit was given low priority and the due date is not known at present as there is some uncertainty regarding when



the last remaining plots of land will be purchased.	Therefore this action will carry for	ward into the future
actions described in section 3		



# 3 Conclusions and Follow-up Actions

This audit report concludes that all of the key actions due to be completed at the present time (December 2014) have been completed satisfactorily by AGL. This includes the actions on preparation of the Detailed LRP, preparation of an internal monitoring report for November 2014 and updating the data spreadsheets to ensure that AHs are listed correctly according to whether they lost more or less than 10% of their productive land. Regarding the payment of outstanding compensation, AGL has paid all of the underpayments due, with the exception of 37 payments of less than 50 GEL (the greatest of these was 37 GEL and the second highest was 17 GEL). In case the persons concerned express an interest in receiving the outstanding compensation AGL has set the money aside and will pay any genuine outstanding amount requested, however small. We have concluded that for the purposes of the CAP, the compensation action on AGL should be closed.

There are a small number of ongoing actions, or actions that were not due at the present time, which are as follows and summarised in:

- Implementation of the Detailed LRP
- Monthly internal monitoring reports on resettlement to be submitted to ADB
- Organisation of AHs into correct categorisation on data spreadsheets
- Preparation of an Addendum LALRP when new land needs to be acquired
- Updating the spreadsheets (or creation of new spreadsheets) when new land is acquired
- Preparation of a Completion Audit when all land has been acquired

Table 3.1: Updated CAP (December 2014)

#	Topic	Priority	Action	KPI	Timeframe
1	Detailed LRP	Medium	Implement Detailed LRP. Include discussion of implementation in monthly monitoring reports (see row 2 of this table).	Internal Monitoring Reports	On-going
2	Internal Monitoring	Medium	Monthly internal monitoring reports on resettlement activities to be produced.	Monthly reports submitted to ADB	On-going
3a	Data manage- ment	Medium	Ensure that the excel database of information is kept up to date with all AHs and plots affected, contract numbers, amount of compensation paid, date of payment, payment transcript numbers, whether severely affected or significantly affected (losing 50% or 10% or more of land), whether plot is needed temporarily or permanently (when this information becomes available in operations).	Database updates as more land is acquired	On each occasion that land is acquired
4b	Data manage- ment	Medium	AGL to ensure that each AH is listed correctly on the 'short' or the 'long' spreadsheet according to whether they lost more or less than 10% of their land. AGL to integrate the 25 'newly affected' into one or other of the main lists	Organisation of AHs into correct categorisation	Organisation of AHs into correct list by January 2015
5	Addendum LALRP	Low	Once the land required for the Didachara access road and the 35kV Skhalta Transmission Line has been identified and measured, AGL to commission an Addendum to the LALRP to cover the additional impacts	Addendum LALRP	Expected May 2015
6	Completion Audit	Low	Following the purchase of land and implementation of mitigation measures for the last remaining AHs for Shuakhevi, AGL to commission a Completion Audit	Completion Audit	Unknown at present





# **Appendices**

Appendix A.	Updated CAP – September 2014	10
Appendix B.	AGL's Internal Monitoring Report for November 2014	11



# Appendix A. Updated CAP – September 2014

Table A.1: Updated CAP (September 2014)

Table	A.1: Updat	leu CAr	September 2014)			
#	Topic	Prio rity	Action	KPI	Timeframe	
1	Compen- sation	High	Pay outstanding amounts as identified on both short and long spreadsheets (described in Section 3 of LALRP CAP Implementation Audit)	Payment transcripts	Complete by end October 2014	
2	Detailed Livelihood Restoration Plan (LRP)	High	Prepare and implement Detailed LRP as per Action 5 of original CAP.  The Detailed LRP should put in place mechanisms for managing any return of land use rights during operations	Detailed LRP Internal Monitoring Reports on progress	Detailed LRP by end October 2014 Monitoring reports	
3	3 Internal Monitoring		Monthly internal monitoring reports to be produced, commencing in October 2014. Issues to be covered include but should not be limited to:	Monthly reports submitted to ADB	From October 2014	
			<ul> <li>Implementation of livelihood restoration measures</li> <li>Employment for severely affected households identified by AGL as due to be offered work in inaccessible/ unproductive land review (names can be supplied by Mott MacDonald)</li> </ul>	fied by AGL as due to be offered work in essible/ unproductive land review (names can be		
			<ul> <li>Return of land to those severely affected households identified by AGL as part of inaccessible/unproductive land review (names can be supplied by Mott MacDonald, details not expected until operations phase)</li> </ul>			
			<ul> <li>Number of APs employed on the Project</li> </ul>			
			<ul> <li>Types of grievances raised in the previous month, total number raised for month and construction phase and number outstanding</li> </ul>			
			<ul> <li>Communications log for the month</li> </ul>			
			Training carried out during the month			
4a	Data manage- ment	High	Ensure that the excel database of information is kept up to date with all AHs and plots affected, contract numbers, amount of compensation paid, date of payment, payment transcript numbers, whether severely affected or significantly affected (losing 50% or 10% or more of land), whether plot is needed temporarily or permanently (when this information becomes available in operations).	Database updates as more land is acquired	On each occasion that land is acquired	
4b	Data manage- ment	High	AGL to ensure that each AH is listed correctly on the 'short' or the 'long' spreadsheet according to whether they lost more or less than 10% of their land. AGL to integrate the 25 'newly affected' into one or other of the main lists	Organisation of AHs into correct categorisation	Organisation of AHs into correct list by November 2014	
5	Addendum LALRP	Low	Once the land required for the Didachara access road and the 35kV Skhalta Transmission Line has been identified and measured, AGL to commission an Addendum to the LALRP to cover the additional impacts	Addendum LALRP	Expected May 2015	
6	Completion Audit	Low	Following the purchase of land and implementation of mitigation measures for the last remaining AHs for Shuakhevi, AGL to commission a Completion Audit	Completion Audit	Unknown at present	



# Appendix B. AGL's Internal Monitoring Report for November 2014



# Land, Social, Environmental & Accounting Monthly Inspection 27th November 2014

Comments	Following the Mott MacDonald CAP, and the recommendations contained within, filing is now maintained at a suitable standard that complies with Lenders requirements and ISO Standards. This also includes the filing of land transactions in a more proficient manner.	This internal November Inspection revealed that the outstanding payments, 90 in total for trees and 40 AH's were concluded between late September and mid-November 2014 This satisfies Item No.1 of the CAP. AGL will now liaise with MML to compile a 'CAP Audit' as per the Lenders requirements to act as guarantee that obligations and	Additional training was given on the 17th November to the Georgian land valuation Consultant, Expert XXI on Lenders requirements for land acquisition and the need for a 'negotiated settlement' for future land acquisition if required. Additional training covering the LALRP specification, ISO Standard filing and the SEP will be given by the LSE Director with support from the AGI HSF Manager in January 2015.	The Grievance Log was reviewed to ensure proper closure of complaints and for trend analysis. The Log was found to be well managed. Weekly social meetings are held between the AGL & Contractor Social Teams whereby complaints are discussed along with grievances, methods for grievance closure and a review of new grievances – good practice.	At present there are 12 grievance outstanding and November recorded 4 new grievance for cracked walls in houses.	After analysis, the grievance log revealed the most common grievance were:	<ul> <li>allegations of cracked houses due to tunnel works</li> <li>Use of land after construction</li> </ul>
Direct Staff or Consultant	Direct		Direct & Consultant				
Department	Accounting		Land, Social & Environment (LSE)				
Scrutiny Activity	Land Payments completion and Filing		Grievance Log & Consultant Training				
Inspection Location	Batumi Office	4	Main Camp				
Item No.	-		8				



AGE have investigations ongoing with support from the Engineer. Vibration stations and noise stations have been established in the problematic area Chankhalo – data collation is ongoing.  Through the mayors and village leaders, AGL: has communicated that in due course land will be suitably rehabilitated with a view to allowing grazing cattle access to temporarily used land. In most cases these are spoil disposal areas that, before the Project was poor quality land. Post rehabilitation the affected villages will have access to far greater land for cattle.	The filing system in the Batumi has been improved but is still in need work. An archiving system is now required to file superseded documents away in a confidential and restricted manner. This will be achieved in late December 2014 and early January 2015.	The information Centre's (IC's) are in need of updating with current site activities. The display videos and photographs are need of renewal.	<ol> <li>The IC officers require a briefing on site activities to ensure that the information they relay is current and accurate.</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>The Project requirement for a Ban on Hunting is not promoted and should be as per the Overarching CEMP.</li> </ol>	4. The IC officers should be promoting the use of the video display and communicate deficiencies with messages and display items effectively to support line management.	5. IC officers should, though, December 2014 and January 2015
	Direct	Direct				
	Accounting	LSE				
	Filing	Information Display				
	Batumi Office	Information Centre's				
	ი .	4				

# Shuakhevi Hydropower Project

# Shuakhevi Hydropower Project

CSR Projects such as road widening, bridge repair and drainage upgrades for the affected villages. The combined total for Affected Person's approximately 120; dependent on current work demands and CSR activities ongoing during the month.	UNDP are now assisting AGL in reaching a conclusion on the final numbers of persons and communities for appropriate restoration measures. At present, AP's are either dropping out of the restoration schemes or not showing enough interest.	Negations with AH's has been ongoing since August 2014, expected completion is January 2015.	A total of 14 entries were made into the Communications Log. All 14 were direct requests for employment. 4 of these requests were received through the Main Camp office and 10 were through the IC's in Khulo and Shuakhevi.	These requests were passed on to the HR department in the civils Contractor, AGE.	Date: 27 <sup>th</sup> November 2014 Department: LSE	Date: 27 <sup>th</sup> November 2014 Department: Accounting	
	Direct		Direct		国造	A som	
	LSE		LSE		Signature:	Signature:	
	LRP Measures		Communications Log		amidze	Ramadurai Chandrasek	
	Main Camp		Main Camp & IC's		Name: Zviad Diasamidze	- 1	
	7		∞		Name	Name:	