## RP1726 v3

## HO CHI MINH CITY PEOPLE'S COMMITTEE URBAN-CIVIL WORKS CONSTRUCTION INVESTMENT MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY OF HCM (UCCI)

HO CHI MINH GREEN TRANSPORT DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

# SOCIAL ASSESSMENT

November 2014

1. INTRODUCTION
2. OBJECTIVES
3. METHODS1
3.1. Focus group discussion and individual interview:
3.2. Field observation:
3.3. Review of secondary data
4. FINDINGS
4.1. Findings from review of secondary data:
4.1.1. Demographic features
4.1.2. Ethnic groups
4.1.3. Occupation and incomes
4.1.4. Incomes:
4.1.5. Education and health
4.2. Findings from review and analysis of primary data (collected as per techniques mentioned under the section 3 -Methods)
5. RECOMMENDATIONS
6. CONCLUSIONS12
APPENDICE

### LIST OF TABLE

Table 1: Sampling as per affected households	2
Table 2: Wards/Communes/Townlets observed	2
Table 3: General features of population by district in the project area	3
Table 4: Structure of population by working age	4
Table 5: Types of employment within the project area	6
Table 6: Poor household rate within the project area	7

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

Ho Chi Minh City Green Transport Development Project includes the following two components: (i) Development of a demonstration Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) line on the Vo Van Kiet – Mai Chi Tho Highway (VVK-MCT); and (ii) Institutional strengthening.

- BRT line on the VVK-MCT Highway has an estimated total length of 23 kilometers, passing through districts 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 8, Binh Tan.
- According to Document No. 268/VB-VP to announce the conclusion of Mr. Nguyen Huu Tin, Vice Chairman of the HCMC PC, at a meeting on issues related to the project " Ho Chi Minh City Green transport development", dated April 15, 2014, while the new Mien Tay Bus station is in unused phase, the BRT line route will start from the Cat Lai intersection (Rach Chiec) to Mai Chi Tho - Vo Van Kiet Highway and u-turned in front of An Lac roundabout, Binh Tan District.
- According to the technical design in Technical Study Report of HCMC BRT Project, submitted in June 2014, the project will have three main construction items: (1) a priority route for buses, (2) the construction of 28 bus shelters along the route, and (3) the construction of terminals, depots and a modern management system.
- Apart from infrastructure investment to build the BRT line and other ancillary works, the project will also strengthen finance institutions and capacities of state managers and public-transport operators (including subway, bus rapid transit (BRT) and bus; general planning of land use and urban transport planning.

The project is financed by ODA loan from World Bank and has designated by the Urban - Civil Works Construction Investment Authority of Ho Chi Minh City (UCCI) as the Project owner.

#### 2. OBJECTIVES

- Assessing the potential project impacts, focusing on two groups: a) those who are adversely affected as a result of land acquisition, and b) those who potentially benefit from the BRT (bus users).
- Assessing the project potential impact from gender perspective. This aims to ensure a gender consultation is done to inform a gender action plan as well as gender monitoring and evaluation as per World Bank's requirements.

#### 3. METHODS

This SA used the following methods, including focus group discussion, individual interviews, field observation, and review of secondary data. The details of methods are below:

#### 3.1. Focus group discussion and individual interview:

This method aims to gather general information, clarify and gather views on specific issues with groups as presented in the table below:

	Potentially affected as a result of land acquisition	Potential project beneficiaries (BRT users)
Focus group discussion	<ul> <li>10 people</li> <li>Place: Rach Chiec area, An Phu ward</li> <li>Time: 30 th August, 2014</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>10 people</li> <li>Place: line 30, Nhi Dong II bus station</li> <li>Time: 15 th September, 2014</li> </ul>
Individual interview	<ul> <li>15 people</li> <li>Place: Rach Chiec area and Thu Thiem area in An Phu ward</li> <li>Time: 28 th August,2014</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>20 people (10 men and 10 women)</li> <li>Place: line 30, Nhi Dong II bus station</li> <li>Time: 15 &amp; 16 th September, 2014</li> </ul>

#### Table 1: Sampling as per affected households

This method also interviewed the local authority and UCCI for supporting to people who potentially benefit from the BRT and for reducing the impacts to people who potentially affected as a result of land acquisition

#### **3.2. Field observation:**

This method aims to gather useful information through observation in the given survey area from October to December, 2014. The consultants have directly observed the route, the current use of land and housing of affected households, and users of the existing bus routes.

Districts	Wards/Communes/ Townlets
District 1	The wards of Nguyen Thai Binh, Cau Ong Lanh, Ben Thanh, Co
	Giang, Cau Kho
District 2	The wards of Binh Khanh, An Loi Dong, Thu Thiem, An Phu
District 5	The wards of No. 1, 5, 6, 10, 13
District 6	The wards of No. 1, 2, 3, 7, 10
District 8	Ward No. 16
Binh Tan District	An Lac A Ward

#### Table 2: Wards/Communes/Townlets observed

#### **3.3. Review of secondary data**

This method aims to understand the development and activities history of the local area in the project area through analysis of documents relevant to the area. Consultants have been working with concerned people at city, district and commune/ward levels to collect reports on socioeconomic development, statistics available at ward/commune. In addition, the data in the Statistical Yearbook of HCM City in 2012 can also be used for analysis in this report

#### 4. FINDINGS

#### 4.1. Findings from review of secondary data: 4.1.1. Demographic features

#### Population and labor

A total population of 21 wards and communes within 06 districts that BRT line will pass by is approximately 284,023 people of around 70,695 households.

As shown in the results, the population density of the wards in Districts 1, 5, 6 and Binh Tan where Vo Van Kiet BRT route will be set up, is much higher than that of the An Loi Dong, An Phu, Thu Thiem, Binh Khanh wards in District 2 where Mai Chi Tho BRT route will be established (See Table 3). The average density over the full route is about 8,929 people per square kilometers. Female rate of the total population in the wards and communes is higher than the male rate.

In particular, the entire area of An Loi Dong Ward and Thu Thiem Ward\*, according to Decision No. 3165/QD - UBND of HCMC PC, are planned as the Thu Thiem New Urban Area. Most of people in the area handed over their land and moved to other places. However, they remain their households in the ward for the convenience of administrative transaction.

Districts	Wards/Communes	Total area (km <sup>2</sup> )	Total population (person)	Population density (Person/km <sup>2</sup> )	Households (HHs)	Female rate (%)
District						
1						
1	Ben Thanh	0.9298	17,761	19,102	4,602	52.8%
2	Cau Kho	0.3424	23,796	69,498	6,396	51.5%
3	Cau Ong Lanh	0.2302	15,146	65,795	3,122	54.3%
4	Co Giang	0.3568	13,749	38,534	3,919	53.9%
5	Nguyen Thai Binh	0.4932	16,043	32,528	4,011	54.3%
District						

 Table 3: General features of population by district in the project area

2						
6	An Loi Dong	3.5963	428	119	72	59.8%
7	An Phu	10.2124	27,089	2,653	7,116	50.4%
8	Binh Khanh	2.152	1,878	873	523	32.1%
9	Thu Thiem	1.35	388	287	4	98.7%
District 5						
10	Ward 1	0.4279	17,968	41,991	4,000	53.8%
11	Ward 5	0.2265	12,279	54,212	2,904	53.6%
12	Ward 6	0.2332	8,746	37,504	2,145	52.6%
13	Ward 10	0.2334	7,552	32,356	1,729	51.1%
14	Ward 13	0.2743	8,460	30,842	2,243	50.7%
15	Ward 14	0.2763	14,295	51,737	3,195	51.9%
District 6						
16	Ward 1	0.293	12,109	41,328	2,760	52.8%
17	Ward 2	0.2444	9,544	39,051	2,504	52.9%
18	Ward 3	0.2287	10,267	44,893	2,417	52.1%
19	Ward 7	0.4734	14,654	30,955	3,413	51.8%
20	Ward 10	1.5486	23,065	14,894	6,419	51.7%
Binh Tan	District					
21	An Lac A	1.1555	28,806	24,929	7,201	51.5%
Total (21	wards/communes)	25.2783	284,023	32,099	70,695	54.01%

(Source: Socioeconomic Report by the People's Committees of various wards and HCMC Statistical Yearbook 2012)

In the wards where census data by working age is available, the majority of their population are between 18 and 60 years old, accounting for 60% whereas people under 18 accounts for 25% and people over 60 (beyond working age) is about 15%. There is an approximate balance between the rate of men and women at the age of 18 to 60, i.e. 29% and 31% respectively out of total population

District	Wards/Communes	Total population (Person)	Rate of population under 18	Rateofpopulationbetween18and 60	Rate of population over 60
District I					
1	Ben Thanh	17,761	N/A	N/A	N/A
2	Cau Kho	23,796	N/A	N/A	N/A

3	Cau Ong Lanh	15,146	N/A	N/A	N/A
4	Co Giang	13,749	19.4%	64.7%	15.9%
5	Nguyen Thai Binh	16,043	N/A	N/A	N/A
District 2					
6	An Loi Dong	428	31.3%	63.8%	4.9%
7	An Phu	27,089	N/A	N/A	N/A
8	Binh Khanh	1,878	0%	100%	0%
9	Thu Thiem	388	0%	77.6%	22.4%
District 5					
10	Ward 1	17,968	N/A	N/A	N/A
11	Ward 5	12,279	N/A	72.4%	N/A
12	Ward 6	8,746	N/A	64.9%	N/A
13	Ward 10	7,552	N/A	N/A	N/A
14	Ward 13	8,460	26.0%	40.1%	33.9%
15	Ward 14	14,295	10.2%	68.3%	21.5%
District 6					
16	Ward 1	12,109	18.3%	70.1%	11.5%
17	Ward 2	9,544	N/A	N/A	N/A
18	Ward 3	10,267	N/A	65.6%	N/A
19	Ward 7	14,654	52.1%	43.6%	4.3%
20	Ward 10	23,065	N/A	N/A	N/A
Binh Tan Di	strict				
21	An Lac A	28,806	N/A	61%	N/A

(Source: The People's Committees of wards HCMC Statistical Yearbook 2012)

#### 4.1.2. Ethnic groups

The majority of households living in the wards passed by BRT line are composed of such ethnic groups as Kinh (86.4%) and Hoa (12.5%); most distributed in District 5 and District 6, specifically in the following wards: Ward 1 (District 6) 62.3% of total households, Ward 3 (District 6) 57.0% and Ward 6 (District 5) 52%. According to the study of Chinese's culture in HCMC (Vu Le, 2009), the Chinese exist as a particular social group, has both integrated with other communities and the Chinese exists as a particular social group, who has integrated with other communities yet still kept their own characteristics, their economy also developed equal or even higher than Kinh people in HCMC. Specifically, the Chinese came to HCMC in the early seventeenth century, they have created a bustling urban center in the city center, especially in Cho Lon area, where waterway links trade center through Ben Nghe canal to Nha Rong Harbor, the city center and radiate to the Southwest provinces.

As surveyed, no ethnic minority household is found to live within the acquired land area for site clearance.

#### 4.1.3. Occupation and incomes

#### **Occupation:**

In the wards of District 1 passed by the BRT line, major economic activities comprise Trade and Service joined by almost 100% of households, except for Cau Ong Lanh and Co Giang wards (with 76% and 20.5% of households working in the business field, respectively). Though agriculture is not prioritized in Ho Chi Minh City, about 12.2% of households in An Phu Ward (District 2) are implementing agricultural production. The wards of District 5 and District 6 are majorly featured by Trade & Service as well as seasonal/unskilled workers (See Table 5).

			Key economic sectors (%)			
District	Wards/Communes	Households (HHs)	Trade and Service	Agriculture	Others (Seasonal/ Unskilled workers)	
District I						
1	Ben Thanh	4,602	100.0	0.0	0.0	
2	Cau Kho	6,396	100.0	0.0	0.0	
3	Cau Ong Lanh	3,122	75,9	0.0	24.1	
4	Co Giang	3,919	20.5	0.0	79.5	
5	Nguyen Thai Binh	4,011	100.0	0.0	0.0	
District 2						
6	An Loi Dong	72	16.7	5.6	77.8	
7	An Phu	7,116	82.0	12.2	5.8	
8	Binh Khanh	523	N/A	N/A	N/A	
9	Thu Thiem	4	25.0	0.0	75.0	
District 5						
10	Ward 1	4,000	37.8	0.0	62.3	
11	Ward 5	2,904	N/A	N/A	N/A	
12	Ward 6	2,145	5.8	0.0	94.2	
13	Ward 10	1,729	95.0	0.0	5.0	
14	Ward 13	2,243	41.8	0.0	58.2	
15	Ward 14	3,195	49.9	0.0	50.1	
District 6						
16	Ward 1	2,760	51.9	0.0	48.1	
17	Ward 2	2,764	N/A	N/A	N/A	
18	Ward 3	2,417	57.7	0.0	42.3	
19	Ward 7	3,413	79.8	0.0	20.2	

#### Table 5: Types of employment within the project area

20	Ward 10	6,419	27.9	0.0	72.1
Binh Tan District					
21	An Lac A	7,201	N/A	N/A	N/A
	Total	70,955	55.7	1.0	42.0

(Source: Socioeconomic Report by the People's Committees of various wards and HCMC Statistical Yearbook 2012)

#### **4.1.4.** Incomes:

The average income of urban citizens in Ho Chi Minh City is estimated to be 3,540,000 VND per month, much higher than that of urban people across the country (2,129,700 VND per month). Main sources of income are trade and service activities. The poverty level applied in HCMC for the period of 2009 and 2015 is 12,000,000 VND per capita per year (40,000 VND per capita per day). The survey results show a big gap of poor household rate between various places passed by the BRT line. While the wards of District 5 are featured by the lowest poverty rate, some wards of District 6 experience a relatively high rate; especially in An Loi Dong Ward (District 2) the poverty rate is 18.06% respectively (See Table 6).

District	Wards/Communes	No. of households (HHs)	No. of poor households (HHs)	Rate of poor households (%)
District I				
1	Ben Thanh	4,602	68	1.48
2	Cau Kho	6,396	N/A	N/A
3	Cau Ong Lanh	3,122	N/A	N/A
4	Co Giang	3,919	159	4.06
5	Nguyen Thai Binh	4,011	N/A	N/A
District 2				
6	An Loi Dong	72	13	18.06
7	An Phu	7,116	194	2.73
8	Binh Khanh	523	19	3.63
9	Thu Thiem	2,331	0	0.0
District 5				
10	Ward 1	4,000	14	0.35
11	Ward 5	2,904	5	0.17
12	Ward 6	2,145	39	1.82
13	Ward 10	1,729	1	0.06
14	Ward 13	2,243	0	0
15	Ward 14	3,195	0	0

#### Table 6: Poor household rate within the project area

District 6				
16	Ward 1	2,760	163	5.91
17	Ward 2	2,764	N/A	N/A
18	Ward 3	2,417	15	0.62
19	Ward 7	3,413	153	4.48
20	Ward 10	6,419	411	6.40
Binh Tan District				
21	An Lac A	7,201	N/A	N/A
	Total	66,081	1,254	3.11

(Source: Socioeconomic reports by the People's Committees of wards within BRT Project area)

#### 4.1.5. Education and health

#### Education

The information on educational levels of local people are only available at some surveyed wards/communes such as Co Giang Ward (District 1), An Loi Dong Ward (District 2) and the Wards 1, 7, 10 (District 6). The data shows that people in some project areas have a rather high level of education, 53% of the population of such wards graduated from High School or higher, in which 22.7% of the population graduated from colleges and universities. However, 23.7% of the population just passed elementary school, in which An Loi Dong Ward has about 56% of the population having primary education, and only 4% of the population with a university degree.

#### Health

According to the data from Statistical Office in Ho Chi Minh City in 2012, there is a total of 449 clinical units within the city, including 99 hospitals and 322 medical stations of communes/wards (each commune/ward has one medical station).

District 1 has 26 medical units, including 14 hospitals with many major ones like Children's Hospital No.2 (Ben Nghe Ward), Tu Du Hospital (Pham Ngu Lao Ward); 2 preventive medicine centers and 10 medical stations of communes/wards. District 2 has 13 medical units, but hospitals are located mainly in Thao Dien Ward and An Phu Ward. District 5 has 17 hospitals, including many major hospitals like Cho Ray Hospital (Ward 12), Orthopedic Trauma Hospital (Ward 1), University Medical Centre (Ward 11), Nguyen Tri Phuong Hospital, Hung Vuong Hospital, Pham Ngoc Thach Hospital, Hospital for Tropical Diseases, Psychiatric Hospital (on Vo Van Kiet), 1 preventive medicine center and 10 ward medical stations. There are not many major hospitals in District 6 but District 6 Hospital (Ward 11) and ward medical stations. Similarly, there is Trieu An Hospital (near Mien Tay Bus Station) in Binh Tan District and as for Binh Chanh District, there are not many major hospitals here but district hospitals and medical stations of communes/wards.

## 4.2. Findings from review and analysis of primary data (collected as per techniques mentioned under the section 3 -Methods).

#### a) **Project affected people**

On the basis of the Feasibility Study, consultation with UCCI, and potentially affected households (due to land acquisition), the adverse project impact due to land acquisition is small. As estimated by the social survey, 15 households and two private companies would be potentially affected – at two project locations (Thu Thiem and Rach Chiec sites).

For the Thu Thiem site, an area of 1,77 ha land is planned for Thu Thiem Technical Facility. The survey showed that there are 3 households and 2 private companies that would be potentially affected. Most of the affected land is at the moment for agricultural purpose. Other assets will be affected are structures and trees/crops. No households would be severely affected (losing more than 20% of their productive land), or have to relocated.

For the Rach Chiec Terminal Station (0.58 ha), this station is expected to be within the area planned for the Rach Chiec Complex Sport Center project. The survey showed that there are 12 affected households would be potentially affected. Of those, 12 HHs would be severely affected due to losing more than 20% of their agricultural land. Eight households will have to relocate. Besides, six households would have their businesses affected.

The results of the group discussion (10 people) and individual interview (15 people) with affected HHs to get people's opinions and needs for appropriate livelihood restoration programs, are as below:

- All HHs said that they are supportive to the project and are willing to move to another location if the compensation price and support are appropriate.
- For HHs who are likely to relocate, most preferred being resettled in a resettlement area within the City. Their current living conditions are poor, characterized with lack of infrastructures for instance internal roads are small and narrow alleys, an incomplete drainage system, the place is flooded in rainy season, and constant lack of sanitation due to unclean water.
- As for two vulnerable HHs: They said the land acquisition will affect their livelihood but it won't be hard for them to restore their livelihood.

Other potential impacts along the BRT route:

*Construction stage*: The construction of BRT bus stops may affect the economic activities within the project area such as the business of shops, restaurants and companies along the route. During the construction of the project, it may cause the air and noise pollution for residents. In

addition, for a large number of construction employees working in the construction stage, the project may result in some adverse impacts related to social issues and local security. These impacts have been unidentified and the project has developed measures to minimize these impacts on people.

*Operation stage*: The operation of BRT line will occupy the roadway due to its requirement of a separate line. It can be expected that the BRT line will attract a large number of passengers; thus, noisy conversations by some groups during the time of waiting at the station, transit station or terminal may influence to the surrounding people.

#### b) BRT Beneficiaries

Opinions of potential beneficiaries have been collected by group discussion and individual interviews are summarized as below:

The BRT will improve the quality for the bus seats for convenience, non-shocking transportation and mitigate the shock of transportation. Moreover, it will reduce odor on the bus due to common nausea symptom of passenger. The project should increase the number of bus routine in order to reduce pending timing between 2 buses.

*Developing the network of green space and public utilities:* According to local people, Green Transport Project is the first project that developed for public transport with the aim of environmental safety are deployed HCM City. The project should develop green spaces, use modern equipments and design suitable public facilities such as terminals, pedestrian bridges and parks into the public network located near the BRT bus shelters.

*Enhancing the traffic capacity and reducing travel cost:* People hope that BRT project will provide the service of passenger transport by the rapid bus, contributing to enhance the traffic capacity, reducing traffic jam, congestion and shortening the travel time. Especially, they think that BRT will be a transport mean with high safety and low cost, suitable with the different kind of people and students.

*Motivating the socio-economic development:* The result of group discussions shows that local authorities support the BRT project because it will contribute to the socio-economic development of the project's service area. Moreover, the construction of BRT line also creates more job opportunities and income for the people within the project area.

*Improving living standards:* According to interviews with local authorities, using the BRT system will help to reduce the energy consumption, greenhouse gas emission, noise, traffic accidents and improve the environmental pollution on the East – West route.

#### c) Gender and Disability:

According to project affected people, the land acquisition may affect the daily activities of the affected households. From a gender perspective, for households affected with land acquisition, it is likely that women in resettled households would be affected more since they will be expected to participate in the resettlement process which may affect their existing income generation activities as well as their other daily household work. Women from affected households indicated that they need additional support in case they have to take care of the resettlement in the absence of their husband who may be away during the resettlement period.

For BRT users, the focus group discussion indicates that bus should be designed with the priority seats and convenient access to the bus, particularly for people with disability, and women who are pregnant. For example, the bus of project should have 4 seats dedicated to these peoples. On the bus, there should be a notice board indicating the priority area for these peoples. These suggestions are also in line with the international good practices on design of bus with specific requirement of some groups of users in mind.

#### 5. RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the results of the survey, desires and demands for compensation and assistances of affected people, it can be divided into the following groups:

- For those whose livelihood are not affected or insignificantly affected: Besides to be compensated at replacement cost, they should also receive other assistances for the damages caused by land acquisition.

- For those whose livelihood greatly affected: In addition to the compensation and assistance in cash, this group should be involved in project's programs, measures to restore their livelihood. Based on local conditions and the ability of households, local authorities should cooperate with the PMU and the stakeholders to monitor and arrange an appropriate rehabilitation program for these households. This activity requires a combination of the availability of local labor and the needs of these households.

- For vulnerable group: Although the results of the consultation show that this group won't have problems for restoring their livelihood, PMU and local authorities should continue to consult with this group and give them priorities in the rehabilitation activities to ensure that they will not be worse off as a result of the implementation of the project.

- For resettlement group: local authorities and PMU staffs should continue to consult them in the time of project implementation, to provide comprehensive information and details about the new resettlement areas. In case they have aspirations, local authorities and PMU staffs should take

these households to visit new places. The preparation for household's resettlement should be conducted before the land acquisition for the project.

- For Gender and disabilities: The income restoration program preparation will have separate consultation with women for needs assessment and develop relevant livelihood program to address needs of women affected by resettlement. The women have to be noticed prior to prepare their resettlement. Moreover, international best practices on design of bus that should have 4 seats of a priority area (usually located near the front of the bus), priority introduction signboard and stop bell are reserved for persons with disabilities and women.

- Communication activities to be implemented under the project should ensure support for women – both those affected as a result of land acquisition, and BRT users, should be communicated consistently to the target groups of the project. Information, Education, and Communication materials prepared under the Project should keep gender perspective in both IEC materials and communication activities to promote gender equality among two affected groups - as mentioned above.

- The above recommendations should be considered and reflected in the Feasibility Study of the Project to ensure timely and appropriate implementation.

#### 6. CONCLUSIONS

The project does minimize land acquisition and resettlement by exploring project and design alternatives so that it causes very little impact or almost none to the local region. A Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF) that complies with the requirements of the Bank's OP4.12 on Involuntary Resettlement needs developing in this stage.

The BRT project of VVK - MCT lines goes through 24 wards and 7 districts that are the areas with high population density (average of 8,929 people/km<sup>2</sup>), especially Vo Van Kiet Highway. The main economic activity of households within the project area is Commerce - Services, with approximately 73% of the population participating in this sector, particularly in areas of District 1 and District 5.

In the survey area, there is a big difference in the ratio of rich and poor. The poverty rate in District 1 and District 5 remains low, but in some wards/communes under Binh Chanh District and District 6, the rate is rather high; especially in An Loi Dong Ward in District 2 and An Phu Tay Ward in Binh Chanh District, the poverty rate is 18.06% and 29.27% respectively. The income per capita in the survey area is 3,540,000 VND/person/month.

Local authorities and people acknowledge that the project will bring many benefits to the local region hope it will soon be implemented. The BRT should be developed with green spaces and

public facilities. The project would reduce traffic jam and travel costs for local households, create a background for socio-economic development and improve the life quality for residents. Beside the acknowledgement, some people have still considered and expected the followings:

+ Compensation price: Local people and authorities pay a special attention to the compensation price and wish for an appropriate compensation to restore their livelihood opportunities in the future.

+ Resettlement: AP desire to be resettled in the resettlement areas of the city and there should be better infrastructure conditions at the new place.

+ The training and changing career activities have not yet been pointed out in this preparation stage of the project.

+ Local authorities and people are also concerned on issues related to social security and sanitation, especially in the construction and operation phase.

Important recommendations related to resettlement and social development (no resettlement) based on the consultation:

#### • Resettlement:

- The local authorities and PMU will provide detailed information about the resettlement sites for affected households to choose their preference. The resettlement arrangement needs to be conducted before the land acquisition. For those whose livelihood affected, to ensure their new livelihood will be safe and sustainable, the local authorities and PMU will cooperate with the households to help them identify the suitable livelihood.

- PMU and the contractors must coordinate with local authorities to have action plans to mitigate the social evils and accidents in the construction and operation phases of the project.

#### • Social development:

The project is designed to meet the transportation needs of a developed and civilized city. This is a modern model bus route, then the technical design of the project should consider to enable the vulnerable group of the elderly, disabled, children and pregnant women to easier access to this service. The bus shelters was designed to have the ground at the same height with the bus floors so the vulnerable group can easily get in the bus; the overpasses have extra stair lifts to facilitate these groups move from the street to the shelter. Besides, the project should design priority area or seats for this group inside the bus so they can get the most favorable conditions in the moving bus.

### APPENDIX

## 1. Consultation summary

	Potentially affected as a result of land acquisition	Potential project beneficiaries (BRT users)
Focus group discussion	<ul> <li>10 people</li> <li>Place: Rach Chiec area, An Phu ward</li> <li>Time: 30 th August, 2014</li> <li>Result of consultation summary: <ul> <li>The potentially affected people will be willing to move to another location if</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul> <li>10 people</li> <li>Place: line 30, Nhi Dong II bus station</li> <li>Time: 15 th September, 2014</li> <li>Result of consultation summary:</li> <li>The project will increase the fast safely bus for public transportation</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>move to another location if the compensation price and support are appropriate</li> <li>At Thu Thiem site, no households have to resettle or will be seriously affected by project.</li> <li>The basic infrastructure in Rach Chiec area is inconvenient especially lack of water, pollution environment, lack of transportation and flooding in rainy season</li> <li>The local people in Rach Chiec want to be relocated as well as the project should be built soon</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>transportation</li> <li>The project will support the bus which is friendly to environment</li> <li>The project will help to reduce the motorcycle, reducing traffic jam, congestion and shortening the travel time</li> <li>The labor will be easy to travel to the other province to find the new work as well as increase of job opportunities and income for the people within the project area</li> <li>The project will reduce traffic accidents and improve the environmental pollution on the East – West route</li> <li>BRT Bus should be designed at least 4 priority seats for women, children and disability person</li> <li>The BRT system should be adequate equipment and public facilities</li> </ul>
Individual	• 15 people	• 20 people (10 men and 10 women)
interview	Place: Rach Chiec area and Thu Thiem area in An Phu ward	Place: line 30, Nhi Dong II bus station

•		<ul> <li>Time: 15 &amp; 16 th September, 2014</li> <li>Result of consultation summary:</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>The affected people in Rach Chiec area want to relocate near the current place in order to go to work, close relationship and access to social services;</li> <li>Local people want an appropriate compensation to restore their livelihood opportunities in the future.</li> <li>The income restoration program preparation will have separate consultation with women for needs assessment and develop relevant livelihood program to address needs of women affected by resettlement</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The BRT bus should be designed with the priority seat and the way to access the BRT for the people are disable, pregnant or less able to stand</li> <li>The bus of project should have 4 seat of a priority area, priority introduction signboard, a stop ring</li> <li>Improving the seat quality for a convenience</li> <li>Mitigating the shock of transportation</li> <li>Reducing odor on the bus due to common nausea symptom of passenger</li> <li>Increasing the number of bus routine in order to reduce pending timing between 2 buses</li> </ul>

## 2. Lists of Individual interview

No.	Name	Address
Potentia	lly affected people	·
1.	Nguyễn Thị Tố Quyên	Thu Thiem site, An Phu ward, District 2
2.	Nguyễn Thị Xuân Thu	Thu Thiem site, An Phu ward, District 2
3.	Nguyễn Thị Tiết	Thu Thiem site, An Phu ward, District 2
4.	Nguyễn Thanh Trọng	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
5.	Nguyễn Văn Nghiêm	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
6.	Trần Thị Ó	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
7.	Phan Thị Mai	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2

8.	Đinh Thị Ánh Hồng	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
9.	Đinh Thị Thùy Trang	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
10.	Châu Minh Phượng	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
11.	Phan Trọng Thiện	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
12.	Phan Tuấn Anh	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
13.	Lê Chí Vịnh	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
14.	Nguyễn Văn Tám	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
15.	Lê Tám Nhị	Rach Chiec site, An Phu ward, District 2
Potentia	l project beneficiaries	
1.	Lê Khắc Kiệt	Student of University International
2.	Huỳnh Tấn Cường	192/41/21 Ton That Thuyet Street, Ward 6, District 1.
3.	Võ Long Dĩ	18/9 Dong Hoa Commune, Di An District, Binh Duong province
4.	Vũ Đức Vinh	385th Street, Tang Nhon Phu A Ward, District 9
5.	Lao Vĩ Quyền	90/15, Ta Uyen Street, Ward 4, District 11
6.	Đặng Hà Ký	University Of Science Ho Chi Minh City
7.	Cao Hoài Nhơn	University Of Science Ho Chi Minh City
8.	Trần Vĩnh Hoàng	120, 4th Street, Do Thanh housing, District 3
9.	Huỳnh Bá Trọng	143/19 Nguyen Thi Tan Street, Ward 13, District 8
10.	Hoàng Dương Thiện	37/32/7 Le Van Sy Street, Ward 13, Phu Nhuan District
11.	Nguyễn Thị Mỹ Hạnh	90/15 Ta Uyen Street, Ward 4, District 11
12.	Trương Thị Ngọc Thủy	Phu Xuan Commune, Nha Be District
13.	Đõ Thị Khao	51 Duong Ba Trac Street, District 8
14.	Đỗ Thị Kim Huê	90/15 Ta Uyen Street, Ward 4, District 11
15.	Hoàng Dương Thiện	47/42/11 Bui Dinh Tuy, Ward 24, Binh Thanh District

16.	Trịnh Thị Mỹ Dung	20A, A2 Lot, Tam Binh Ward, Thu Duc District
17.	Võ Thị Thu Thủy	90/15 Ta Uyen Street, Ward 4, District 11
18.	Nguyễn Thị Diễm	18/9 Dong Hoa Commune, Di An District, Binh
	Hương	Duong province
19.	Nguyễn Thị Thúy	90/15 Ta Uyen Street, Ward 4, District 11
20.		43/3C Phan Xich Long Street, Ward 3, Phu
	Phạm Thị Ngọc Liên	Nhuan District