DOCUMENT OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

ΗΑΙΤΙ

## SUPPORT TO THE HAITI EDUCATION SECTOR PLAN 2.0

(HA-J0006/HA-G1055/HA-G1059)

**PROJECT PROFILE** 

This document was prepared by the project team consisting of: Marie Evane Tamagnan, Team Leader (SCL/EDU); Sabine Rieble-Aubourg (SCL/EDU) Alternate Team Leader; Zoe Routhier Drab, Gabriela Gambi, Soledad Bos, Emma Naslund-Hadley and Ivana Blasco (SCL/EDU); Jeff Schleiden Colo, Caroline Pidoux, and Marie Edwige Baron (CID/CHA); Ana Gonzalez Vidales, Michelene Lamothe, and Marie Orisme Roc Passard (VPC/FMP); Aurelie Gilles, Mathieu Cros and Giulia Lotti (CID/CID); Sara Vila Saintetienne (LEG/SGO).

Under the Access to Information Policy, this document is subject to Public Disclosure.

### **PROJECT PROFILE**

#### COUNTRY

		I	•	BASIC DATA				
Project Name:			Support to the Haiti Education Sector Plan 2.0					
Project Number:			HA-J0006					
Project Team: Beneficiary:		Marie Evane Tamagnan, Team Leader (SCL/EDU); Sabine Rieble-Aubourg (SCL/EDU) Alternate Team Leader; Zoe Routhier Drab, Gabriela Gambi, Soledad Bos, Emma Naslund-Hadley and Ivana Blasco (SCL/EDU); Jeff Schleiden Colo, Caroline Pidoux, and Marie Edwige Baron (CID/CHA); Ana Gonzalez Vidales, Michelene Lamothe, and Marie Orisme Roc Passard (VPC/FMP); Aurelie Gilles, Mathieu Cros and Giulia Lotti (CID/CID); Sara Vila Saintetienne (LEG/SGO). Republic of Haiti						
Grant Modality:		Specific Operation Investment (ESP)						
Executing Agency:			Project Implementing Unit – Ministry of National Education and Professional Development (MENFP)					
Financial Plan:			GRF) Co-fu Educa Found Co-fu	Grant Facility- : nding: HA-G1055 ation Above All dation <sup>1</sup> nding: HA-G1059 al Partnership for	; - ) -	US\$ US\$ US\$	ę	15,000,000 9,500,000 18,050,000
			Educa Total	ation <sup>2</sup>		US\$		42,550,000
Safeguards:			Risk Classification:		ESPS 1, 2, and 10 activated			
		Impact classification:			C			
Processing track:		Standard			0	I	🔀 Special	
Country Strategic Alignment:								
Strategic Alignment:								
Challenges:	Social Inclusion		Produc ovatior	-		Economic Integration		
Crosscutting:	⊠ Gender Equality	🛛 Dive	ersity	Environmental sustainability	_	Climate Change		stitutional Capacity Ind Rule of Law

#### II. **GENERAL JUSTIFICATION AND PROJECT STRATEGY**

Haiti continues to face persistent chronic poverty and inequality. Haiti ranked  $11^{th}$  out of 179 countries in the 2022 Fragile States Index (FSI), making it one of 2.1

<sup>1</sup> 

https://www.educationaboveall.org/ https://www.globalpartnership.org/ 2

the most fragile states in the world.<sup>3</sup> In 2022, Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capita (in purchasing-power-parity international dollars) was US\$3,161.3 versus US\$18,538.8 in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC).<sup>4</sup> Almost 60% of the population lives below the national poverty line and 28.9% live in extreme poverty (less than US\$2 a day) compared to less than 10% in LAC.<sup>5</sup> The arrival of COVID-19 in early 2020 has negatively impacted an already fragile state, where political instability and a deteriorating economic environment were already threatening post-earthquake gains. In the past years, Haiti has been marked by worsening insecurity and increasingly persistent social unrest that have resulted in the fourth consecutive year of economic contraction, estimated at 1.7% in FY2022.<sup>6</sup>

- 2.2 The multifactorial crisis that the country is going through has limited supply and pushed up prices of basic goods, translating into higher levels of food insecurity. According to the National Coordination on Food Security (CNSA) and according to the latest Integrated Food Security Phase Classification (IPC),<sup>7</sup> 4.9 million people (50% of the population) are classified in acute food insecurity (IPC 3 and above), of which 1.8 million people are considered in Emergency phase (IPC 4) for the period of March to June 2023. This represents an increase of 9% compared to the period of March to June 2022. The growing fragility throughout the country, which is forcing the most vulnerable to prioritize the purchase of food, is further reducing access to education and basic social services. The supply side of education has also been affected, as fewer schools are able to operate in fragile areas where publicly funded schools are already lacking.
- 2.3 **Sectoral Context**. Over the last decade, the Ministry of National Education and Professional Development (MENFP) has improved its education sector. The period of the early 2000's to 2015 was characterized by growing net primary enrollment rates, from 60% to about 70% respectively. However, student attainment remains low, with limited access to quality public education[1]. At all levels of education, the public sector plays a limited role in the provision, quality assurance, and regulation of the sector. Public supply of education is insufficient to meet demand and private providers have stepped in to fill the gap, operating over 90% of preschools and more than 80% of primary schools[2].
- 2.4 Since the start of COVID-19, more than 2.4 million children have been prevented from returning to school.<sup>8</sup> Although the current school year was planned to start in early September 2022, the beginning of the school year was pushed and the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Fragile States Index is based on a conflict assessment framework – known as "CAST". Twelve conflict risk indicators are used to measure the condition of a state at any given moment. The indicators provide a snapshot in time that can be measured against other snapshots in a time series to determine whether conditions are improving or worsening. For more information consult: https://fragilestatesindex.org/indicators/.

<sup>4</sup> https://www.imf.org/external/datamapper/PPPPC@WEO/HTI/WE

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> https://data.worldbank.org/country/haiti

<sup>6</sup> https://www.imf.org/external/datamapper/PPPPC@WEO/HTI/WE

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The IPC is a common global scale for classifying the severity and magnitude of food insecurity and malnutrition. This tool allows classification of areas with acute food insecurity: 1/Minimal, 2/Stressed, 3/Crisis, 4/Emergency and 5/Famine. In Haiti, IPC is led by the National Coordination on Food Security (CNSA). All the information referring to the IPC cited in this document is available at: <u>https://www.cnsahaiti.org/haiti-mise-a-jour-de-projection-de-lanalyse-de-septembre-2022/</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The 2020 education sector diagnostic (IIEP) identified that approximately 11 743 017 children are of school age. Of those. About 2,200 are between the ages of 6 and 14.

MENFP published a revised 2022-2023 school calendar for the period from January-August 2023.

2.5 Despite the decrease in access to education due to the current context, the Government of Haiti has steadfastly prioritized the improvement of public schools, which are often considered to be of low quality and disproportionately serve the poor. After decades of unfettered growth in the non-public sector, the MENFP has taken steps to put in place a set of quality standards (the Quality Assurance System (SAQ)),<sup>9</sup> that non-public and public schools must meet to be able to be accredited to operate. The SAQ has been implemented in public schools at the national scale and those experiences have informed the continued improvement and growth of the system.



#### Image 1: Vertical Logic of the HA-J0006.

- 2.6 **Project Strategy.** Strengthening the Ministry of Education's governance is critical for maintaining oversight over the education sector and improving attainment of students in schools. A growing body of evidence shows that education outcomes can be substantially improved by improving governance, aligning decision-making authority, capacity, and financing[4].
- 2.7 The Haitian curriculum has had no significant updates to any of its dimensions since its development in 1980. To better prepare its students to meet the challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> century and prepare the sector to adapt to emerging technological needs and opportunities, the MENFP approved the Haitian Curriculum Orientation Framework in January 2021, which serves as a framework for the upcoming curricular reform. In 2023, the MENFP announced that the curricular reform would be a priority reform through 2030. With the <u>5279/GR-HA</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The Quality Assurance System is a system developed and validated by the MENFP for measuring and tracking school quality.

developing the action plan for the implementation of the reform, a need for the financing of the action areas of the reform has been identified.

- 2.8 In parallel, the Haiti Education Information Management System (EMIS) has been identified as a critical pillar in supporting the MENFP governance priorities. The lack of reliable, valid, and relevant data on the education sector is at the center of the complex web of challenges in providing access to high-quality learning opportunities to students in Haiti[5]. The EMIS, a system designed to collect and produce data on the education sector, is in its third year of operationalization under the <u>5279/GR-HA</u> and has begun to publicly present educator sector information.<sup>10</sup> However, the presence of the EMIS has yet to be fully maximized to effectively support the policy development and programming work of the wider ministry.
- 2.9 School feeding (SF) programs contribute to accessing education and have a significant impact on educational performance indicators such as learning improvement, school retention, graduation rates, regular attendance, school dropout, and food and nutritional awareness<sup>[6]</sup>. For example, a study that examined SF programs in nine low-income countries found that students receiving SF attended 4 to 6 more days of school per year on average. In addition, school health and nutrition programs have been shown to increase school retention by between 0.5 and 2.5 years. In addition, these programs increase enrollment and attendance, with an average increase of 9% in school attendance. In this same sense, children who receive adequate nutrition have better academic performance, which is especially relevant in vulnerable areas where many students face food insecurity at home [7]. In 2017, Haiti validated a National School Feeding Policy which guides the quality SF efforts in the county. In 2020 the 2863/GR-HA found qualitative evidence suggesting that schools receiving SF services experienced fewer dropouts during the Peyi-Lok and COVID-19 school vear than schools who did not have SF services.
- 2.10 The low average quality of education provided by both public and non-public schools, coupled with the deprivations associated with poverty, contribute to the low levels of achievement. Classroom observations of primary school teachers in the Nord and Nord Est departments found that most teachers use ineffective pedagogical approaches and often struggle with content[8]. Student learning is also very weak, for example, a recent national assessment of 6<sup>th</sup> graders in 2022 found that while students were performing slightly better in Creole than in previous national assessment administrations students continue to perform just slightly above what is expected by random guessing in French and Mathematics (with students scoring about 31% and 26%, respectively)[9]. Finally, the average Haitian child enters first grade nearly two years late, due to a combination of household financial constraints that delay school entry and schools often demanding that children receive at least one year of pre-primary to prepare for first grade. Once in school, 13% of first graders repeat the year, and only about half will reach the sixth grade<sup>[11]</sup>.
- 2.11 At the same time, gender and diversity continue to be a challenge in Haitian classrooms. Data indicates that most girls in primary classrooms are significantly overaged, with most 4<sup>th</sup> grade girls being 13 years or older (compared to the average age of boys in 4<sup>th</sup> grade of 11 years), which is a barrier to regular school attendance[12]. Given the frequency of over-aged girls in primary schools, special

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> <u>https://sigeee.menfp.gouv.ht/#/dashboard/school</u>

attention must be paid to encouraging regular school attendance for girls through addressing barriers through simple inputs such as trash bins in latrines, having female role models, teacher training and more. Regarding diversity, while there is very little data on children with disabilities in Haiti, approximately 3.5% of children with disabilities in Port-au-Prince have access to education,<sup>11</sup> indicating that attention must be paid to creating inclusive school environments and engaging with parents and communities on access to education for students with disabilities (SWD)[3]. Moreover, a 2017 study shows that of the SWD in schools, they are mixed into the regular classrooms and do not receive differentiated pedagogy or support, contributing to low learning outcomes[10].

- 2.12 Strategic Alignment. The project is consistent with the Second Update to the Institutional Strategy (UIS)(AB-3190-2) and is strategically aligned with the development challenge of social inclusion and equality by targeting vulnerable regions and expanding students' access to quality basic education. The project is also aligned with the cross-cutting themes of: (i) Gender Equality and increase the participation of SWD in primary schools (Component 3) through actions to close the gender and disability gap; (ii) Institutional Capacity and Rule of Law by improving the state's capabilities to provide public services with adequate supply, accessibility, and quality (Component 1); and (iii) climate change through the acquisition of equipment for low-emission kitchens and actions to implement composting and local production orchards in the SF program (Component 2). Additionally, the project will contribute to the Corporate Results Framework (CRF) 2020-2023 (GN-2727-12) since it seeks to improve the following indicators: (i) students benefited by education projects and (ii) agencies with strengthened digital technology and managerial capacity.
- 2.13 Moreover, the operation is fully aligned with the current IDB Haiti Country Strategy 2017-2021(GN-2904)<sup>12</sup>, which prioritizes improved access to quality education and institutional strengthening. The IGR is also aligned with the Skills Development Sector Framework Document (GN-3012-3).
- 2.14 **Sectoral alignment.** The project is consistent with the three pillars of governance, access, and quality of MENFP Decennal Education Plan 2020–2030 (PDEF); the MENFP *Priority Reform* which has been identified as the curriculum reform and outlined in the upcoming *Pacte de Partenariat*. As per the pre-existing request from the MENFP, the project interventions will continue to focus on the departments outlined in paragraph 2.22 while other partners intervene in the southern departments.
- 2.15 **Objectives and components of the project**. The objective of the project is to improve basic education attainment. The specific objectives of the project are to: (i) institutional strengthening of the MENFP (ii) Maintaining attendance in selected primary schools; (iii) strengthening the capacity of (selected) schools to improve quality and promote equality.
- 2.16 Component 1: Institutional capacity of the MENFP (US\$11.2 million: US\$5 million IDB/US\$6.2 million GPE). This component will continue to strengthen the governance and capacity of the MENFP at centralized and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> We know that this is an underrepresentation given the age of the data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> The GN-2904 document is still in force and extended until December 15, 2023 (GN-2904-2)

decentralized levels by: (i) implementing the curriculum reform action plan including supporting modifications to the teacher training and learning evaluation policies at the governance level; and (ii) continuing the MENFP integrated EMIS implementation plan, through infrastructure and training, to enable planning, accreditation, and quality assurance at various levels of the system, and extending EMIS implementation to the departmental education directorates (DDEs).

- 2.17 **Component 2: Access to school feeding in primary education (US\$10,070,000 GPE).** This component will finance SF for primary school-aged children living in areas with a high level of food insecurity as well as in beneficiary public primary schools under the <u>5279/GR-HA</u> for 110 school days for 2024/25, 2025/26, and 2026/27 school years.<sup>13</sup> The component will finance a holistic home-grown SF model and will prioritize local production in both public and non-public schools. This component will be aligned with climate change through financing for energy-efficient stoves and reforestation efforts at the school level.
- 2.18 **Component 3: Continuity of learning (US\$ 17 million: US\$8 million IDB/US\$9 million EAA).** This component will support the long-term vision of the MENFP in increasing the quality of public education services in Haiti by scaling the scope of the SAQ quality package in time to cover two additional school years after the end of the <u>5279/GR-HA</u><sup>14</sup> and will increase the scope of community-based approaches under the SAQ to include socio-emotional support, remedial support, and school connectivity to internet/hybrid education. Retention of students at risk of dropping out of school will be supported. The component will finance an external firm to conduct data collection of school data and progress in quality and learning.
- 2.19 Component 4: Closing gender and disabilities gaps in education. US\$2 million: US\$1 million IDB / US\$1 million GPE). This component will directly support improving access to quality education services in primary public schools for girls and children with disabilities. Public primary schools under the <u>5279/GRHA</u>, will benefit from (i) teacher and school director training in screening tools; (ii) support to visually impaired students; and (iii) safe space initiatives for girls. This component will finance: (i) data collection to tackle the lack of data on gender and SWD; (ii) attracting out of school children (OOSC) to school.
- 2.20 **Project management, monitoring and evaluation (US\$2,280,000:US\$1 million IDB/US\$500,000 EAA/US\$780,000 GPE).** The project will finance (i) operational costs of the project executing unit; (ii) annual financial audits (iii) a midterm and end-term evaluation; and (iv) a quantitative evaluation of the SF program.
- 2.21 **Expected results.** Several project results will be measured including: (i) EMIS providing timely data; (iii) percentage of schools with improvement reports approved; and (iii) maintain attendance in primary schools.
- 2.22 The direct project beneficiaries would include current and future teachers and students in primary public and non-public schools.<sup>15</sup> The IDB's education sector

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> 110 days represents the average number of days that children spend in class during the school year in Haiti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> The <u>5279/GR-HA</u> ends after school year 2025/2026 in June 2026. The proposed operation will continue the SAQ for 2026/27 and 2027/28 school years.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Primary schools include 2 years of pre-primary through grade 9, called *ecole fondamentale* in Haiti.

will work in six departments in Northern Haiti,<sup>16</sup> where the IDB is already investing heavily across sectors. These departments are home to 23% of Haiti's preschools (2,512 of 10,836) and 28% of primary schools (4,855 of 17,036) with a total of 1,032,123 students.<sup>17</sup> These departments are where the most vulnerable populations are located. The Nord-Ouest and Nord-Est have the highest poverty (77%, 72%) and extreme poverty (57%, 52%) rates in the country,<sup>18</sup> and all target departments have poverty rates exceeding 48%.<sup>19</sup>

2.23 **Financing instrument:** The proposed investment grant is financed by: (i) a specific operation investment of US\$15 million from the Haiti Grant Facility; (ii) a project specific grant of US\$9.5 million financed by *EAA*; and (iii) a project specific grant of US\$18,050,000 financed by the *Global Partnership for Education (GPE)*. The project is structured around four components and will disburse over a period of five (5) years.

### III. SECTOR KNOWLEDGE AND PREPARATION PLAN

- 3.1 The Project is the result of extensive sector work, including: (i) PCRs of the <u>3355/GR-HA</u> and the ongoing PCR of the <u>2863/GR-HA</u>; (ii) an external verification of the SF program; (iii) ongoing data analysis of the quality assurance system; and (iv) an analysis of the national student learning assessment.
- 3.2 This project maintains the flexibility to respond to operations within a fragile context, including responding to emerging needs due to natural disasters, school closures due to socio-political unrest, or deteriorating economic conditions. The Project will draw main lessons from previous operations. First, sequencing and scaling of elements that have been successful in the Haitian context, including, inter alia: SF, learning assessments, curriculum reform, and the SAQ (2863/GR-HA, 5288/GR-HA, 5279/GR-HA). Second, given the fragility context and the need to engage providers with proven capacity in the Haitian context, the project EU, will hire specialized operators and nongovernmental organizations to provide technical assistance to project activities (5279/GR-HA, 5288/GR-HA). Third, the project will not finance the continuation of the tuition waiver program due to the school feeding program serving as a successful intervention for enrolment, retention and learning in schools (5288/GR-HA/5279/GR-HA). Fourth, the project will use successful M&E methodologies such as a call center to ensure that beneficiaries are reached by project interventions. Finally, the IDB is the head of the Local Education Group (LEG) in Haiti, a position which supports the preparation and execution of the operation in a coordinated and synergized way with partners operating in the sector. Further lessons learned will be outlined in the POD.
- 3.3 In attention to the new Environmental and Social Policy Framework, the operation was classified as Category "C" since no significant negative environmental or social effects are to be expected.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Nord, Nord-Est, Nord-Ouest, Artibonite, Centre and Ouest.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> 2013 School Census Data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> IDB calculations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> The lowest poverty rate is in the department of the Ouest, however when data is disaggregated between the capital and the rest of the department the rates are vastly different, 44% and 63% respectively.

#### IV. TECHNICAL ASPECTS, ENVIRONMENTAL RISKS AND EXECUTION AND FIDUCIARY ASPECTS

- 4.1 The Project would be executed by MENFP, the Ministry in charge of all levels of education in Haiti. The institutional and implementation arrangements of the Project would be based on the arrangements currently in place for the <u>5279/GR-HA</u> that is executed by the executing unit known as *Unité de Coordination de Projet* (UCP) which has demonstrated satisfactory results to date. A PACI will be conducted during project preparation to identify areas for improvements of staffing and processes of the executing unit and project resources will contribute to the necessary strengthening of the unit to allow it to successfully execute two operations in parallel.
- 4.2 Project financial management will be executed according to OP-273-12. Procurement of works, goods, and services, as well as contracts for consulting services will be executed in accordance with the Bank's procurement policies, rules, and procedures (GN-2349-15 and GN-2350-15). Single Source Selection is proposed for the implementation of key project areas, as follows: (i) UNESCO will be responsible for the technical assistance support to curricular reform under Component 1; (ii) the WFP will be responsible for Component 2 SF activities; and (iii) Starlink will be responsible for supporting the connectivity of schools to the internet under Component 3. There will be no exception to Bank rules.
- 4.3 At the profile stage, 3 high risks are identified. <u>Political: (i)</u> If there is a change in Minister of Education during the execution of the operation, priority governance activities may change, thereby affecting the execution of Component 1 activities. This risk will be mitigated by prioritizing activities that appear in the sector-validated education sector plan. (ii) If socio-political unrest leads to school closures, quality activities under Component 3 may experience delays in execution and impact the achievement of the results matrix. This risk will be mitigated by planning for hybrid/distance education alternatives in the case of school closures. <u>Financial:</u> (iii) if inflation continues at the current rate, and/or if the HTG depreciates during project execution, the real cost of activities may be higher than the estimated project budget. This risk will be mitigated by, whenever possible, signing contracts in dollars and estimating a conservative budget during project preparation.

#### V. RESOURCES AND TIMETABLE

- 5.1 POD distribution is scheduled for August 22, 2023. The Loan Document's presentation to the Board of Directors is planned for October 25, 2023. The operation will benefit from two separate co-funding grants from the Education Above All Foundation and the Global Partnership for Education, in addition to the grant from the IDB Haiti Grant Facility. The operation is planned to be executed in 60 months.
- 5.2 The operation will be prepared and sent for Board approval between April and October 2023. The operation, benefiting from two separate co-financing in addition to the IDB-financing, requires time to be prepared while meeting donor and Bank requirements, nevertheless it is not expected that the preparation time will exceed regular Bank timelines.

#### Annexes

- Summary of the Environmental and Social Review Timetable and Preparation Resources Filters for determining the processing track Ι.
- II.
- III.

#### Annex I - Environmental and Social Annex of the PP for Cat. C operations

- 1.1 In accordance with the Environmental and Social Policy Framework of the Bank, the operation was classified as Category "C" because only minimum or no negative environmental or social effects are to be expected.
- 1.2 Component 1 will continue to strengthen the governance and capacity of the MENFP at centralized and decentralized levels by: (i) implementing the curriculum reform action plan including supporting modifications to the teacher training and learning evaluation policies at the governance level; and (ii) continuing the MENFP integrated EMIS implementation plan, through infrastructure and training, to enable planning, accreditation, and quality assurance at various levels of the system, and extending EMIS implementation to the departmental education directorates (DDEs).
- 1.3 Component 2 will finance a holistic home-grown SF model and will prioritize local production in both public and non-public schools. This component will be aligned with climate change.
- 1.4 Component 3 The component will finance an external firm to conduct data collection of school data and progress in quality and learning.
- 1.5 Component 4 will finance: (i) data collection to tackle the lack of data on gender and SWD; (ii) attracting out-of-school children (OOSC) to school.
- 1.6 In order to comply with the requirements of the ESPF and especially those of the Environmental and Social Performance Standards 1, 2 and 10, during preparation any existing environmental and social management instrument in the Executing Unit and/or in the applicable local regulations will be reviewed.

# CONFIDENTIAL

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The information contained in this Annex is confidential and will not be disclosed. This is in accordance with the "Deliberative Information" exception referred to in paragraph 4.1 (g) of the Access to Information Policy (GN-1831-28) at the Inter-American Development Bank.

# CONFIDENTIAL

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The information contained in this Annex is confidential and will not be disclosed. This is in accordance with the "Deliberative Information" exception referred to in paragraph 4.1 (g) of the Access to Information Policy (GN-1831-28) at the Inter-American Development Bank.