



# Combined Project Information Documents / Integrated Safeguards Datasheet (PID/ISDS)

Appraisal Stage | Date Prepared/Updated: 03-May-2019 | Report No: PIDISDSA26551



**BASIC INFORMATION**

**A. Basic Project Data**

Country Pakistan	Project ID P170305	Project Name Balochistan Education Project	Parent Project ID (if any) P144454
Parent Project Name Global Partnership for Education - Balochistan Education Project	Region SOUTH ASIA	Estimated Appraisal Date 29-Apr-2019	Estimated Board Date 27-May-2019
Practice Area (Lead) Education	Financing Instrument Investment Project Financing	Borrower(s) Islamic Republic of Pakistan	Implementing Agency Secondary Education Department of Balochistan

Proposed Development Objective(s) Parent

To increase school enrollment and retention in project supported schools, with a special focus on girls’ participation, and to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for improved management of education.

&nbsp;

Components

Component I: Access and Equity

Component II: Quality and Increased Accountability

Component III: TA for improved capacity for management and monitoring

**PROJECT FINANCING DATA (US\$, Millions)**

**SUMMARY**

<b>Total Project Cost</b>	10.71
<b>Total Financing</b>	10.71
<b>of which IBRD/IDA</b>	0.00
<b>Financing Gap</b>	0.00

**DETAILS**

**Non-World Bank Group Financing**



Trust Funds	10.71
Miscellaneous 1	10.71

Environmental Assessment Category

B-Partial Assessment

Decision

The review did authorize the team to appraise and negotiate

Other Decision (as needed)

## B. Introduction and Context

Pakistan, the sixth most populous country in the world, is at a crossroads. The economy accelerated with GDP growth of 5.8 percent in FY18 but is projected to slow to 3.4 percent in FY19 as fiscal and external imbalances are addressed. Poverty declined from 64.3 percent in 2001 to 24.3 percent in 2015, but inequality persists. The country ranks low on the 2018 Human Capital Index, at 134 out of 157 countries. Gender disparities continue, and female labor force participation was only 20.1 percent in 2018. Natural disasters and unreliable water and power supply constrain progress. Growth is expected to recover as structural reforms take effect and macroeconomic conditions improve. Pakistan will need to protect gains made for the vulnerable during the projected deceleration in growth. Over the near to medium term, with increased and better targeted investment in physical and human capital and improved tax administration and business environment, Pakistan can achieve its poverty reduction and shared prosperity goals.

This Additional Financing (AF) seeks approval to provide an additional grant of US\$11.8 million to the Global Partnership for Education - Balochistan Education Project (GPE-BEP) (P144454).

The Government of Balochistan and the Ministry of Finance, Revenue and Economic Affairs Division (EAD), have reached an agreement with the European Commission to add a grant of US\$11.8 million to the Balochistan Education Project through an additional financing. The funds of the AF will (a) increase the scope of some activities to increase the development impact of the Project, (b) incorporate a limited number of new activities that complement existing activities in the Project, and (c) cover cost overruns experienced under Subcomponent 1.2. due to higher construction costs. The Government has also requested the restructuring of the Project to consider adjustments to the Result Framework agreed and approved by the GPE towards the end of 2017.

These changes aim at scaling up some Project activities and cover financial gaps, through new funding, to ensure that more girls and young women have access to education in Balochistan. In particular, the EU grant will focus on scaling up access for girls under the Project by advocating for girls' education, expanding the supply of educational



opportunities in existing schools to higher levels, and working with communities for improved parental participation on school activities.

Pakistan ranked 134 out of 157 countries assessed for the index that measures the productivity of the average worker in the future, as compared to the benchmark of effective investments in human capital, meaning full health (zero stunting and zero child mortality) and full education (full enrollment and no drop-outs until age 18, with learning levels at the 'advanced level' in international assessments), given the risks of poor health and education outcomes prevalent in the country. The education indicators within the Human Capital Index (HCI) show that of the 8.8 years that a child starting school at the age of 4 can expect to complete, only 4.8 years of learning are acquired, showing the low efficiency of the education system to bring children to school and, once there, promote learning. These figures contribute to the conclusion of the HCI for Pakistan, which states that a child is only 39 percent as productive as she potentially could be if she had access to adequate healthcare and had completed her education. Given that Balochistan consistently shows worse educational outcomes, the situation in the province is likely worse than for Pakistan overall.

The aim of the AF is to fine-tune current Project activities, learn from 3 years of implementation, and add activities that would complement and tackle the pressing obstacles that of girls face to attend schools. AF will expand the scope of the Project to include transportation services for female teachers and young female students, in addition to the financial gap. Distance to schools is one of the main reasons parents and teachers mention as an obstacle for young girls and women to regularly attend school. Hence, the provision of transportation services for both young female student and female teachers will complement and deepen the potential impact of Project activities to ensure access to education for girls. The project with its AF will contribute to reduce a sizeable enrollment gap between boys and girls in Balochistan.<sup>1</sup>

Given the Bank's and other development partners commitment to Fragility, Conflict, and Violence-affected (FCV) contexts, further investment in Balochistan's education sector would be critical to promoting continued support to a region facing substantial development challenges. For example, Balochistan has experienced several periods of internal conflict arising from a mixture of issues linked to politics, geography, religion and ethnicity, with a marked lack of basic services and economic opportunities. The security situation is exacerbated by environmental challenges and natural disasters (floods and earthquakes) that have added to the vulnerability of the province and negatively affected Balochistan's human capital indicators.

### **C. Proposed Development Objective(s)**

#### Original PDO

To increase school enrollment and retention in project supported schools, with a special focus on girls' participation, and to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for improved management of education.

---

<sup>1</sup> Twenty-two and half million, or 44 percent of children between the age 5 and 16 years, are out of school (OOSC) in Pakistan, contributing to the low levels of human capital in the country. In fact, Pakistan is the second largest contributor to the 263 million children, adolescents and youth who are out of school worldwide, contributing 11.7 percent of that figure. Despite progress in the last decade in bringing more children to school, especially in primary education, the challenges in higher levels of the system are still daunting.



## Current PDO

The AF and Restructuring will not change the original PDO and the Project will retain all existing implementation arrangements.

## Key Results

The PDO indicators are as following:

- I. Student retention in project schools (Percentage)
- II. Boys enrolled in grades 1-5 of project supported government schools (Number)
- III. Girls enrolled in grades 6-10 of project supported government schools (Number)
- IV. Regular reports generated and made public annually on selected indicators for schools (Number)
- V. Girls enrolled in grades 1-5 of project supported government schools (Number)

## D. Project Description

To contribute to the PDO of the original Project, this Additional Financing will scale up activities and incorporate a few changes to the Project through its restructuring.

The following new activities will be incorporated:

- I. Component 1, "Access and equity," Subcomponent 1.1: This will continue to support improved access and equity by advocating education for girls by incorporating access to existing schools through transport services. The AF will finance, among others, the acquisition and/or rental of vehicles, insurance, tracking devices, the salaries of support staff and any other expense geared towards maintaining vehicles in good mechanical condition. These activities will enhance the capacity of the Secretary of Education to offer transport services to student who do not easy access to schools.

The following activities will be scaled up:

- II. Component 1, "Access and equity," Subcomponent 1.2: This will finance existing activities to support transition to higher level of education. To this end the AF will make classrooms functional at selected primary, middle and high schools. This includes, among others, the construction of new classrooms in existing schools, minor repairs and civil works, the procurement of furniture and other school equipment, teacher and student learning materials, including sports goods, and other goods to make classrooms functional. The school where classrooms are to be provided and/or made functional will be determined through an established criterion by the Project.
- III. Component 3 ("Technical assistance for improved capacity for management and monitoring"): In addition, and in order to Mobilize and engage communities in siting, and supporting Primary schools and the Selection of Female teachers through test based recruitment, the AF will fund activities to



actively involve and create capacity of Parent-Teacher School Management Committees (PTSMCs) to identify viable school for expansion under Components 1 and 2. The PTSMCs will play an active role in ensuring teacher presence and availability and providing the necessary safe and secure environment for girls and female teachers. Additionally, the schools to be expanded and upgraded will also have additional teacher requirement. Teacher needs will be fulfilled through a test-based teacher recruitment system. The teacher recruitment will focus mainly on ensuring availability of Mathematics, English and Science teachers. The AF will fund teacher salaries while the education system nominates them, capacity building for teachers, training activities, and other supporting activities. As in the original Project, the AF will fund activities of monitoring and compliance of legal agreements, such as procurement, safeguards, financial management. This will include, among others, third party validation and monitoring, internal audits, citizen engagement, awareness and advocacy activities, technical assistance activities for management and monitoring to improve school governance, operational costs, including salaries of staff at the Project Management Unit (PMU), and other activities that ensures the quality implementation of other activities of the project. This is also part of mobilizing and engaging communities. As part of the technical assistance activities, the Project will also fund a functional analysis of the programs to facilitate transport for students and teachers.

The Project closing date will be extended for 10 months, until April 30, 2020, to allow for the implementation of activities under the AF.

## **E. Implementation**

The proposed AF will use the existing implementation and institutional arrangements of parent Project. New and expanded activities will be implemented through existing mechanism as described in the relevant sections above. The transportation activity will be based on previous analysis of the geographical distribution of schools in Balochistan, the transportation activities already ongoing and managed by the Education Department. The PMU will continue to be responsible for project implementation and key elements of current implementation such as contracting of firm for independent verification or to provide technical assistance to school will be maintained. The Project Director to report to the Education Departments and carry out implementation and supervision of each project component, working closely with the Department to ensure that project activities are aligned with related Department's activities.

## **F. Project location and Salient physical characteristics relevant to the safeguard analysis (if known)**

The project will be implemented in the entire province of Balochistan, which is an arid, mostly mountainous province of Pakistan. The area exhibits a great variety of physical features, consisting of vast rocky deserts with extremes of climate and very low rainfall. The northern most areas of Balochistan are dominated by high relief and a rugged landscape. From here, towering mountain ranges arc southward. The Toba Kakar Range forms the boundary with Afghanistan, while the Sulaiman Range forms the boundary with the Indus valley. From the central region of the Province, the mountains sweep south and west, reaching almost to the sea. Elevations exceed 2,000 m in many areas, with peaks reaching to 3,500 m around Quetta. Primarily due to vastness of the province and predominantly rural setup, Balochistan has a low population density, compared to the rest of the country. Most parts of Balochistan face water scarcity, a problem which has



been further exacerbated due to the frequent droughts. While this is the overall geographic context in the province, the project investments will not be directly affecting the type of described landscapes as well the before mentioned problems. In fact, the ESIA will identify the mechanism to reduce, for example, the school’s exposure to severe climate events.

**G. Environmental and Social Safeguards Specialists on the Team**

Marcelo Hector Acerbi, Environmental Specialist  
Babar Naseem Khan, Social Specialist

**SAFEGUARD POLICIES THAT MIGHT APPLY**

Safeguard Policies	Triggered?	Explanation (Optional)
Environmental Assessment OP/BP 4.01	Yes	The physical activities under Component 1, subcomponent 1.2, of the AF are mostly of similar type (schools upgrading and rehabilitation) as for the parent Project. Potential adverse impacts arising from the implementation of these activities would also remain the same as for original Project. These impacts are of low to moderate in significance; and include such as soil erosion, water and soil contamination, air quality deterioration, limited damage to vegetation, and safety and health hazards for students, teachers, workers and surrounding population. Implementation of mitigation under the parent project has been satisfactory. The new activity proposed under Subcomponent 1.1, like the provision of vehicles, may have additional adverse environmental impacts such as related to air pollution, noise and vibration; if vehicles are not properly maintained. Most of these impacts are however temporary in nature, site specific and easily reversible by taking appropriate mitigation measures. The Environment Category B is maintained for AF as for the original project. The existing safeguard documents including ESIA and ESMP identified the potential environmental impacts and suggested appropriate mitigation measures, while proposing the institutional set up and



monitoring mechanism. For this AF, the project has prepared an ESIA– an addendum to and largely based on existing safeguard documents – and has incorporated the additional environmental impacts likely to arise from implementing new activities; and proposed mitigation measures in it ESMP. The ESIA further highlighted the lessons learned and areas of improvement- strengthening E&S safeguard monitoring and in compliance reporting mechanism – and capacity building through trainings and awareness sessions.

Performance Standards for Private Sector Activities OP/BP 4.03	No	Not triggered.
Natural Habitats OP/BP 4.04	No	The proposed construction activities will be done in existing schools under the AF that are already established within the built-up areas; and as such they will not affect natural habitats. Hence this OP is not triggered
Forests OP/BP 4.36	No	The proposed project activities under AF will be done in in the already built-up areas; and would not involve Forests. Hence this OP is not triggered
Pest Management OP 4.09	No	The project activities do not involve pesticides and hence this policy is not triggered.
Physical Cultural Resources OP/BP 4.11	No	The proposed construction activities will be done in existing schools under the AF that are already established within the built-up areas; and as such there unlikely to disturb any cultural resources. the Hence the this OP is not triggered. However the safeguard documents prepared sets out the “Chance Finding Procedure” to cater any likelihood and in case schools contain an intangible value that needs to be considered.
Indigenous Peoples OP/BP 4.10	No	The only designated Indigenous community lives in KP province; and that is not the project area under AF. Hence this policy is not triggered.
Involuntary Resettlement OP/BP 4.12	No	The proposed construction activities will be done in existing schools under the AF that are already established within the built-up areas; and as such no involuntary resettlement is involved. Hence this OP is not triggered.
Safety of Dams OP/BP 4.37	No	The project activities do not involve dams and do not rely on the performance of existing dams. The policy is not triggered.





Projects on International Waterways OP/BP 7.50	No	The project activities do not disrupt or involve international waterways; as such this policy is not triggered.
Projects in Disputed Areas OP/BP 7.60	No	The project activities are to be implemented under settled areas of Sindh Province and do not involve disputed areas. Hence this policy is not triggered.

**KEY SAFEGUARD POLICY ISSUES AND THEIR MANAGEMENT**

**A. Summary of Key Safeguard Issues**

1. Describe any safeguard issues and impacts associated with the proposed project. Identify and describe any potential large scale, significant and/or irreversible impacts:

The proposed construction activities and rehabilitation of existing schools under the AF; as well as operation of these schools may potentially cause negative environmental and social impacts, such as soil erosion, competing demand for water for various uses like drinking vs. construction, water and soil contamination, air quality deterioration, damage to vegetation, and safety and health hazards for students, teachers, workers and surrounding population. However, most of these impacts are similar as in original project and not likely to be irreversible, wide-spread, or unprecedented, and can be addressed with the help of appropriately designed and effectively implemented mitigation plan. Therefore Environment Category B has been maintained for AF, in accordance with the WB Operational Policy 4.01. No other environment and social safeguard policies will trigger.

2. Describe any potential indirect and/or long term impacts due to anticipated future activities in the project area: No potential indirect and/or long-term impacts are expected to take place.

3. Describe any project alternatives (if relevant) considered to help avoid or minimize adverse impacts. Because of the type of project an interventions, the analysis of alternatives to avoid adverse social and environmental impacts is not critical. However, the addendum to the parent project’s ESIA prepared for AF has considered many options (Chapter 7 – Analysis of Project Alternatives) as project alternatives. Of these: “No Project” option, as analyzed, would keep the status-quo situation, if not further worsened the current challenges related to quality and access to education; and low level of literacy rate (barely 50 per cent, with that for females being 35 per cent; about 6.8 million primary school age children are out of school; primary education completion rate is 70 per cent for male and 53 per cent for females). Hence the option was rejected.

The other options considered and rejected on merits include: (i) site alternative (as construction activities are planned in existing schools but suggested some guidelines); (ii) design alternatives; (iii) technological alternatives; and (iv)management alternatives.

4. Describe measures taken by the borrower to address safeguard policy issues. Provide an assessment of borrower capacity to plan and implement the measures described. GoB through Secondary Education Department had conducted a project-specific Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) and developed an ESMP for the parent education project. Because of the similarities in most of the project activities and scope of work proposed in AF an addendum has been prepared to the same by the project.. The addendum (including a revised ESIA/ESMP) adequately identified the potential negative environmental and social



impacts that are likely to be caused by the project during its various phases, and propose mitigation measures to address these impacts. The addendum also identified the potential adverse social and environmental impacts due to new activity proposed in AF – provision of transport services under component 1 “Access and Equity”. The Addendum also proposes the institutional arrangements, while having reviewed and assessed the current setup, to manage the environmental aspects of the project, and has identified environmental monitoring requirements to ensure the effective implementation of the mitigation measures, describing the lessons learned, strengthening E&S monitoring mechanism including environmental training needs, and specifying the reporting and documentation requirements.

The Project Management Unit already established for the original project, has designated a senior officer as Environmental and Social Focal Point (ESFP) and retained a dedicated Safeguard Officer, to ensure the effective implementation of safeguard instruments during the Project implementation, and to coordinate with the Bank and other stakeholders, such as with provincial EPAs, on matters relevant to environmental management and sharing periodic compliance reporting for their possible auditing. For AF, the existing E&S instructional setup shall continue to be used and would be further strengthened through capacity building of project staff, other related project personnel (such as the field officers), and through awareness raising and training of contractors and PTSMCs members for better management of environmental and social aspects of the Project, particularly the effective implementation of the ESIA and ESMP.

5. Identify the key stakeholders and describe the mechanisms for consultation and disclosure on safeguard policies, with an emphasis on potentially affected people.

Key project stakeholders include the beneficiary communities, PTSMCs, Education Department of GoB, EPA, local NGOs, construction contractors and supervision consultants. During course of preparation of ESIA addendum, consultations were carried out with key stakeholders while conducting both formal and informal consultation sessions. The objective of the consultation was, among others, to take stock of any additional suggestions/concerns that might have emerged during implementing the original project and required to be addressed in AF. Consultations took place in Quetta in March 29, 2019.

The ESIA/ESMP has been disclosed and uploaded on the project website and its executive summary has been translated into Urdu.

**B. Disclosure Requirements (N.B. The sections below appear only if corresponding safeguard policy is triggered)**

**Environmental Assessment/Audit/Management Plan/Other**

Date of receipt by the Bank  24-Apr-2019	Date of submission for disclosure  03-May-2019	For category A projects, date of distributing the Executive Summary of the EA to the Executive Directors
--	--	--

**"In country" Disclosure**

Pakistan  
25-Apr-2019

Comments



In country disclosure has been completed by the client, on the website of Department of Secondary Education, Balochistan on 25th April 2019. (<http://emis.gob.pk>) (<http://emis.gob.pk/website/InitiativeDOE.aspx>)

**If the project triggers the Pest Management and/or Physical Cultural Resources policies, the respective issues are to be addressed and disclosed as part of the Environmental Assessment/Audit/or EMP.**

If in-country disclosure of any of the above documents is not expected, please explain why:

**C. Compliance Monitoring Indicators at the Corporate Level (to be filled in when the ISDS is finalized by the project decision meeting) (N.B. The sections below appear only if corresponding safeguard policy is triggered)**

**OP/BP/GP 4.01 - Environment Assessment**

Does the project require a stand-alone EA (including EMP) report?

Yes

If yes, then did the Regional Environment Unit or Practice Manager (PM) review and approve the EA report?

Yes

Are the cost and the accountabilities for the EMP incorporated in the credit/loan?

Yes

**The World Bank Policy on Disclosure of Information**

Have relevant safeguard policies documents been sent to the World Bank for disclosure?

Yes

Have relevant documents been disclosed in-country in a public place in a form and language that are understandable and accessible to project-affected groups and local NGOs?

Yes



### All Safeguard Policies

Have satisfactory calendar, budget and clear institutional responsibilities been prepared for the implementation of measures related to safeguard policies?

Yes

Have costs related to safeguard policy measures been included in the project cost?

Yes

Does the Monitoring and Evaluation system of the project include the monitoring of safeguard impacts and measures related to safeguard policies?

Yes

Have satisfactory implementation arrangements been agreed with the borrower and the same been adequately reflected in the project legal documents?

Yes

### CONTACT POINT

#### World Bank

Juan Baron  
Senior Economist

#### Borrower/Client/Recipient

Islamic Republic of Pakistan

#### Implementing Agencies

Secondary Education Department of Balochistan  
Fateh Khan Bhangar  
Secretary Education  
afbqta@gmail.com



**FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT**

The World Bank  
1818 H Street, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20433  
Telephone: (202) 473-1000  
Web: <http://www.worldbank.org/projects>

**APPROVAL**

Task Team Leader(s):	Juan Baron
----------------------	------------

**Approved By**

Safeguards Advisor:	Maged Mahmoud Hamed	06-May-2019
Practice Manager/Manager:	Cristian Aedo	06-May-2019
Country Director:	Melinda Good	07-May-2019