

Social Monitoring Report

Project Number: 45007
Period Covered: January–March 2017
April 2017

Mongolia: Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program (Tranche 1)

Prepared by the Ulaanbaatar Program Management Office for Mongolia and the Asian Development Bank.

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(as of 31 March 2017)

Currency unit	–	togrog
MNT1.00	=	\$0.000408
\$1.00	=	MNT2,452.90

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
AP	–	affected people
BC	–	business council
CAP	–	community action plan
CPP	–	consultation and participation plan
CDC	–	community development council
CS	–	consulting service
EGM	–	effective gender mainstreaming
FGD	–	focus group discussion
GAP	–	gender action plan
HH	–	household
IEC	–	information education and communication
MUB	–	Municipality of Ulaanbaatar
MSME	–	micro, small, and medium enterprise
PG	–	primary group
PMO	–	project management office
SDC	–	sub-center development council
SAP	–	social action plan
SPS	–	Safeguard Policy Statement
USGDIP	–	Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program

NOTE

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

This social monitoring report is a document of the borrower. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent those of ADB's Board of Directors, Management, or staff, and may be preliminary in nature.

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

Social Safeguards Monitoring Report

First Quarter, 2017

Project No. 45007
Period Covering January to March 2017
April 2017

Mongolia: Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program

This social monitoring report is a document of the borrower. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent those of ADB's Board of Directors, Management, or staff, and may be preliminary in nature.

Table of Contents

1. Background and Project Description.....	4
2. Social Safeguard Activities during the Period.....	5
i Resettlement	5
ii Compensation to land and properties.....	5
3. Implementation of Social Action Plan (SAP).....	5
4. Implementation of Gender Action Plan (GAP).....	7
5. Grievance Redress Mechanisms.....	8
6. Monitoring Results-Finding and Recommendation	8
Annex 1. Social Action Plan Monitoring Matrix.....	10
Annex 2: Gender Action Plan Monitoring Matrix.....	21
Annex 3: Detail of Public Consultation	26

Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AP	Affected people
BC	Business Council
CAP	Community Action Plan
CPP	Consultation and Participation Plan
CDC	Community Development Council
CS	Consultant services
EGM	Effective Gender Mainstreaming
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GAP	Gender Action Plan
HH	Household
IEC	Information Education and Communication
MUB	Municipality of Ulaanbaatar
MSME	Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise
PG	Primary Group
PMO	Project management office
SDC	Sub-Center Development Council
SAP	Social Action Plan
SPS	Safeguard Policy Statement
USGDIP	Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program

1. Background and Project Description

1. Ulaanbaatar peri-urban area (ger areas) are characterized by unplanned settlement of low- and medium-income households with unserviced plots, inadequate and mostly unpaved road networks, and a severe lack of social and economic facilities and basic infrastructure and services for water, sewerage, and heating. Poor sanitation—households almost exclusively rely on open pit latrines—and poor waste collections have created highly unsanitary living conditions. Air pollution is among the most severe in the world, particularly during winter because of inadequate household heating systems and unpaved roads. The ger area population is estimated at 800,000, representing 60% of Ulaanbaatar or 30% of the country population. Despite their size, ger areas have until recently been considered temporary settlements.
2. The multi tranche financing facility (MFF) program will support the Ulaanbaatar city master plan in upgrading priority service and economic hubs (sub-centers) in ger areas. The program implementation time will be up to 9 years and will comprise three tranches. The program is geographically targeted with multisector interventions. It proposes an integrated solution to respond to the urgent demand for basic urban services and establish a network of well-developed urban sub-centers providing economic opportunities, housing, and urban services as catalysts for growth in the ger areas.
3. The impact of the program is improved living conditions in Ulaanbaatar. Its outcome is a network of livable, competitive, and inclusive sub-centers in Ulaanbaatar's ger areas providing economic opportunities and urban services, leading to a healthier urban environment. The program is divided into three projects and has four outputs: (i) roads and urban services are expanded within the targeted sub-centers and connectivity between sub-centers is improved; (ii) economic and public services in sub-centers are improved; (iii) service providers become more efficient; and (iv) institutions and capacity for urban development, program management, and service delivery are strengthened.
4. The main proposed components for Tranche-1 are
 - i. Construction of sewerage network extension of 6.1 kilometers (km) collector main, sewerage pumping station along with 2.09 km of sewer pipe extension;
 - ii. Within the sub-centers, 15 km of priority roads, 18.6 km of water supply, 20 km of sewerage, 21 km of district heating network pipes, and 5 heating facilities;
 - iii. Social and economic facilities, including two kindergartens, green areas and small squares, and two business incubators associated with two vocational training centers;
 - iv. Multi-interventions in the Ulaanbaatar Water Supply and Sewerage Authority to improve its operations and service delivery efficiency; and
 - v. Institutional strengthening and capacity development to prepare detailed design and construction supervision, support community participation and small and medium enterprise development, improve urban planning and sub-center development, strengthen the capacity of the PMO, and support service providers' reforms.

2. Social Safeguard Activities during the Period

i Resettlement

5. In order to identify the social impact, the detailed design was finalized by the CS1 Consultants on 15 March 2017. The identification of the Affected People has not been finalized due to delays in final detailed design.
6. The Socio-economic Survey (census) among Affected People conducted in 2016 is based on the preliminary design. Therefore, CS2 going to revise and update SES among Affected People based on final detailed design.

ii Compensation to land and properties

7. Compensation process has not yet commenced. The decision on land value is pending and waiting for MUB decision on the baseline value for compensation per square meter of land.
8. Inventory of losses need to be prepared.
9. Real estate valuation is done only for households affected by construction impact. Yet, some residents affected have not yet negotiated with business entities for the purchasing rate.

3. Implementation of Social Action Plan (SAP)

10. The mid-term review report on Social, Gender and Community Participation for overall Tranche-1 for period of July 2015-February 2017 was submitted to ADB MTR mission. During the ADB MTR Mission, targets and indicators for monitoring SAP were reviewed and updated.
11. During the Project Preparation Phase, the Community Engagement Consultants conducted series of consultative meetings and information campaign at the kheseq level on (i) project objectives and investments, and (ii) redevelopment options and preferences. Up to 1Q 2017, 55 of community consultation meetings were held with 49.7% of women participation to ensure outreach of information on project objectives and redevelopment options and preferences.
12. All level consultation meeting minutes are documented and enclosed in the CS3 quarterly reports. The implementation progress of the SAP is attached in Annex 1 for reference.
13. Community needs on physical infrastructures were identified including 30 suggestions for roads, 29 suggestions for outside the social facilities and 39 suggestions inside the buildings. These requirements and needs by women and vulnerable social groups on internal and external environment of the construction, road and facilities were integrated and documented in the design of the project facilities. PMO engineers will monitor and ensure the construction of the facilities.
14. A Database for all consultation meetings and trainings including sex-disaggregated data has been established and shared with ADB in Drop box.
15. Up to the monitoring reporting period, two types of information materials such as brochure on overall project objectives and investment (1000 copies), 1st and 2nd volume of Project Update Newsletter (5000 and 2000 copies respectively) on project

implementation progress were prepared and published. In total, 5400 copies of above information materials disseminated to the communities.

16. According to the feasibility study in 2013, 94 PGs in Bayankhoshuu and 57 PGs in Selbe were set up, yet it has taken 2 years to formally organize groups until the launch of the project; thus majority ended up as inactive. In general, the formation of such group often requires much effort to get to know each other including the coordination of citizens, streamlining of their mind-setting, frequent meetings and so on. Therefore, extensive efforts and timing have been spent. For instance, only two PGs in Bayankhoshuu reactivated during the 1Q 2017. In total, 58 PGs (29 PGs in each sub-center) have been reactivated and functioning with 43% of female members in two sub-centers. Reactivation of PGs is ongoing slowly.
17. Up to the monitoring reporting period, 7 Khoroo level CDCs and 1 sub center CDC have been activated. 3 BCs were established and are functioning. 3 CDCs, 1 BC and 1 SDC are registered as NGO and functioning with their charters and action plan. Trainings and other activities on capacity building of CDCs and BCs are ongoing.
18. 58 PGs are re-activated and restructured as per the revised boundaries of the sub-centers and revised road alignments. The initial information on saving group was given to the communities. As a saving group formation should be based on the willingness and commitment of the community members. CS3 is waiting for community decision for formation of savings group. CS3 have been continued advocating the saving group establishment to enable their participation in the neighborhood development.
19. Due to delays in final design finalization, no consultation was conducted on scope and engineering design. However, up to 1Q 2017, CS3 organized 9 meetings since the project beginning on the existing designs of proposed water supply, sanitation, sewerage and heating facilities. In total, 242 persons were involved with 48.3% of women, 7% of PWDs, 5.8% of FHH and 13.2% of Elderly persons attendance.
20. Final detailed design proposed project confirmed by affected persons and families.
21. CS3 prepared draft of the comprehensive IEC plan. Due to the project implementation delay, a comprehensive IEC plan development was delayed. However, existing available IEC materials on basic hygiene practices, water conservation and guides for improved sanitation are being disseminated to the community. Block wise redevelopment handouts prepared under ADB AHURP project are being disseminated to some areas in the sub centers.
22. Training needs assessment already started to facilitate and support implementation of SME development plan. Skills Survey and Demand mapping completed to justify the need for business incubator and vocational training centers. Inventories of Local Businesses, MSME want to get SME loan and MSME to supply a product for the project were prioritized. Training modules on Total 8 consultations provided legal supports for NGO establishment and operation have been provided to the CDCs and BCs in both sub centers. Training modules on Household Finance Management, Start-up your business and Business proposal development trainings were developed. In total, 7 CDCs have been trained with 150 community members and 50 were awarded with certificate of attendance.
23. The 40 business runners received basic training on loan from Xas bank. Additionally, 2 female business owners have linked with Asia Foundation Female entrepreneurs' project and both completed the business training package under Asia Foundation.
24. 6 types of training designs including Leadership, Team Building, Savings movement, NGO management and sustainability, Resources mobilization for NGOs, Start-up business are prepared and documented.

25. The community meetings data and documentation have been established including sex disaggregated attendance to monitor SAP and GAP. Please refer to Annex 3 for more reference.

4. Implementation of Gender Action Plan (GAP)

1. As per ADB gender classification, this project (investment program) has been classified as Effective Gender Mainstreaming (EGM). During the ADB MTR Mission, targets and indicators for monitoring GAP were reviewed and updated. The implementation progress of the updated GAP is attached in Annex 2 for reference.
2. Community needs in the detailed design phase of the project have been identified and prioritized through FGDs with vulnerable HH integrated into the design. Out of total 65 interviewees attended in FGDs, 64.6% account for females. Community needs on physical infrastructures identified such as 30 suggestions for roads, 29 suggestions for outside the social facilities and 39 suggestions inside the buildings. Community needs were documented and needs integrated into infrastructure designs. PMO engineers will monitor and ensure the installation of the facilities.
3. Both CS2 and CS3 have been collecting and updating some sex-disaggregated data on socio-economic macro data (secondary data), community and business profiles, community needs assessment, and small access infrastructure through participatory research approaches. A Database has been established and updated.
4. GAP activity #3.1 related to Output 3: Service providers become more efficient, have not commenced due to revision of project objective with no connection to households and unavailability of budget to conduct the Affordability analysis.
5. The customer survey on existing services in two sub-centers is under way by CS3 to establish baseline for the post project impact assessment. The survey covers 10% of population with 63.6% female participation in both sub centers. In parallel with the survey, the mapping of existing trade and services in the sub-centers has been done. The survey report will be finalized in 2Q 2017.
6. Institutional Capacity Building is moving on track and the re-activation of primary groups and gender mainstreaming training are well in progress. So far, 7 Khoroo CDCs have been re-activated and are functioning with the female members' participation as 58%. Two Business Councils have been formed with 77% of active female participation. With the immense involvement of women participation CAP SME Action Plan prepared in collaboration with CDCs, BCs and was updated during the monitoring period.
7. Sex disaggregated data is being collected on participants for all community consultation meetings and was reported on quarterly and semi-annual project implementation reports. Up to the monitoring reporting period, 95 community consultations were conducted with 2652 persons, of whom 56% were women. The set target for women participation is 50%.
8. Women participation in Primary Groups activities are well ahead of the target. Up to now, 58 PGs were reactivated with 43% women participation. In addition, 7 khoroo level CDCs and 1 sub-center CDC have been reactivated and are functioning with 58% female representation.
9. Up to the monitoring period, 9 meetings were held since the project beginning on the existing designs of proposed water supply, sanitation, sewerage, heating facilities. In total, 242 persons involved with 48.3% of female attendance, 26% of participants were vulnerable groups (PWDs-7%, FHH-5.8% and Elderly persons-13.2%).

10. A database for the meetings was established and is being updated regularly and share with ADB in Drop box.

5. Grievance Redress Mechanisms

11. The project has no project specific Grievance handling mechanism. PMO adopted the formal system of MUB as a GRM for this project.
12. Task forces for Community Grievance Handling were established under the CDCs to support the Project GRM. TOR of the CDCs has been developed.

6. Monitoring Results-Finding and Recommendation

- i. Social monitoring for Tranche-1 is based on preliminary design. The identification of the Affected People has not been finalized due to delays in final detailed design. Resettlement impacts need to cover all affected people and to be reviewed in line with the final detailed design to update the Resettlement Plan.
- ii. Final list of Affected People have not been identified as per the final layout of the detailed design. Therefore, final layout needs to be presented to the all affected stakeholders. The consultant should arrange the meeting with adequate hands-on information to avoid issues with Affected People.
- iii. PMO adopted the formal system of MUB as GRM for the project. Due to unavailability of project specific GRM, it is the priority to involve the GRM members of CDC in capacity building trainings to build legal competence.
- iv. According to the final detailed design, slight changes have been made to the number and location of affected households and population, thus, it is required to accelerate the management within the scheduled time frame of the consultative meeting.
- v. Specific commitment is required to finalize the comprehensive IEC plan and accelerate the IEC campaign. Plus, it is required to timely renew the hand-outs and information to better inform the residents of sub-centers.
- vi. Women participation in the project related meetings and FGD is significant and contributing as equal as the males. With continued current tendency, ensure female participation towards the end of the project to achieve the set targets in SAP and GAP.
- vii. GAP activity #1.2 related to Output 1: Assess impact of improved roads, water, sanitation and hearing, the indicator revised based on ADB MTR mission. According to 2016 HSES conducted by NSO, the household income, expenses and poverty level will be reported within 2Q 2017. Therefore, it is required to estimate the UB city household expenses and poverty level as per ger and residential area and gender of household head.
- viii. GAP activity #3.1 related to Output 3: Service providers become more efficient, have not been commenced due to revision of project objective with no connection to households and unavailability of budget to conduct the Affordability analysis. Thus, it is mandatory to immediately resolve whether to conduct the survey or not.
- ix. Data on community meetings and training have been established including sex disaggregated attendance for monitoring implementation of SAP, GAP and CAP.

Database was created and updated at macro and micro level for two sub-centers based on the existing secondary data by sex disaggregated. There are essential needs required on job-training for data processing on simple statistics to CS3 and PMO social specialists (how to use existing social-economic data, results of consultation meeting participation for analyzing and monitoring project activities and preparing indicators for project progress implementation reports).

Annex 1. Social Action Plan Monitoring Matrix

MON: Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program, Tranche-1

SOCIAL ACTION PLAN IMPLEMENTATION MONITORING MATRIX

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
Conduct series of consultative meetings and information campaign at the <i>kheseg</i> level on (i) project objectives and investments, and (ii) redevelopment options and preferences.	1. Number of community meetings, sex disaggregated	20 meetings conducted organized with primary groups, CDCs and SDCs attended by 50% women	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 55 community consultation meetings conducted with 49.7% female participation have been organized. • The consultation meetings ensured the outreach of information on project objectives and investment, redevelopment options and references. 	No challenge.
	2. Number and type of community needs integrated to the detailed design.	Community needs integrated to the preliminary design of the physical infrastructures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community needs on physical infrastructures identified- 30 suggestions for roads, 29 for outside the social facilities and 39 inside the buildings. • Community needs were documented and needs integrated into infrastructure designs. PMO engineers will monitor and ensure the installation of the facilities. 	
	3. Database for meetings established	Documentation of meeting minutes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meeting minutes were documented and attached in the CS3 Quarterly Report. • A Database for meetings has been established and shared with ADB in Drop box. 	
	4. Number and type of information materials distributed to the communities		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two types of information materials such as brochure on overall project objectives and investment, 1st and 2nd volume of Project Update Newsletter on project implementation progress were prepared, published and disseminated. • In totally, 5400 copies of above information materials disseminated to the communities. 	

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
Continuing organizational formation and strengthening of primary groups, community development councils, SME development councils, and savings groups.	5. Number of Primary Groups reactivated/ organized, sex disaggregated	90 primary groups in Bayankhoshuu and 70 in Selbe organized and functioning with by-laws, policies, systems, and plans	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Out of existing 94 PG in Bayankhoshuu and 57 PG in Selbe, 58 PGs have been re-activated and functioning now in the sub-centers. • In Selbe sub-center, 29 groups were re-activated and functioning with 371 members /female-172/. • While, in Bayankhoshuu, 29 groups were re-activated and functioning with 466 members /female-186/. • Reactivation of PGs is ongoing. 	PGs were set up throughout the feasibility study analysis, yet it has taken 2 years to formally organize groups until the launch of the project; thus majority ended up as inactive. In general, the formation of such group often require much effort to get to know each other including the coordination of citizens, streamlining of their mind-setting, frequent meetings and so on. Therefore, extensive efforts and timing have been spent. It is observed that group member could be a wife, though registration takes place in the name of her husband following the traditional practice.
		50% women members for each groups and CDCs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 43% of 58 PG members are women. • 58% of 8 CDC members are women 	
	6. Number of CDCs organized and functioning with by-laws, policies, systems, and plans, sex disaggregated	5 khoroo level CDCs and 1 sub-center CDC organized and functioning with by-laws, policies, systems, and plans	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 7 Khoroo level CDCs (2 in Selbe and 5 in Bayankhoshuu) and 1 Sub center CDC have been re-activated and functioning with 58% of female members. • 2 CDCs in Selbe and 1 CDC in Bayankhoshuu are registered as NSO and are functioning with their charters and action plans. • Activities on Capacity building of CDCs (NGOs) are ongoing. 	
	7. Number of Business Councils formed in the sub centers, sex disaggregated		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 BC in Bayankhoshuu and 2 BCs in Selbe are established and functioning. • 1 BC in Selbe has been registered as NGO and functioning with its charter and action plan. • In total, 103 members of BCs 36.8% are women in Selbe, while out of 5 BC Steering Committee members 20% are women in Bayankhoshuu. 	
	8. Number and type of training conducted	Documentation of organizational strengthening activities and training/OJT modules	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Capacity building trainings on Marketing, Mentorship program development, Trainers for community job brokers were conducted 14 times for MSMEs. • Documentation of trainings is being kept regularly and attached in the CS3 Quarterly Report. 	
	9. Number of participants, sex disaggregated	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In total, 489 participants involved in the capacity building trainings and meetings with 68% of female participants. 		

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
	10. Number of saving groups formed, sex disaggregated	Savings groups formed and functioning with policies, systems, and ongoing micro-credit project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The initial information was given to the communities. As a saving group formation should be based on the willingness and commitment of the community members. CS3 is waiting for community decision for formation of savings group. • CS3 have been continued advocating the saving group establishment to be make people to be able to participate in the neighborhood development. 	There are past failure cases of the saving groups which hinders the process. For instance, many saving groups were formed and bankrupted under the World vision and Adra's project.
Conduct series of consultations on the scope and technical/engineering design of proposed water supply, sanitation, sewerage, heating facilities, and affordable apartments.	11. Number of consultation, sex disaggregated	15 meetings conducted, attended by 50% women	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 9 meetings were organized since the project beginning on the existing designs of proposed water supply, sanitation, sewerage, heating facilities. • In total, 242 persons involved with 48.3% of women attendance. 	Due to delays in final design finalization no consultation was conducted. People express their concerns and it has been challenge for the CS3 to continue ' activities on the sites.
	12. Number and percentage of people consulted including vulnerable groups, sex disaggregated		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 26% of participants (n=242) in 9 meetings were vulnerable groups (PWDs-7%, FHH-5.8% and Elderly persons-13.2%). 	
	13. Number of consultations, sex disaggregated	Final detailed design of proposed projects confirmed by the beneficiaries, women, elderly, differently-abled persons, and affected persons/families.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Final detailed design proposed projects confirmed by affected persons and families. 	

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
Conduct consultations with households, businesses, and public institutions affected by the construction/right of way requirements for project 1/tranche 1	14. Number of meetings in both sub-centers attended by all affected stakeholders	24 meetings in both sub-centers attended by all affected stakeholders	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 4 meetings were organized with potential affected people according to the preliminary designs of planned infrastructures. In total 148 persons from affected HHs involved in the meetings with 47.3% of women attendance. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Final layout needs to be presented to the affected people. As changes were made to the number and location of those affected, it is required to accelerate the meetings within the scheduled timeframe.
	15. Number and type of meeting minutes	Documentation of meeting/consultation minutes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 4 meeting minutes are documented and attached to CS3 Quarterly Report. 	
Comprehensive IEC campaign on the final redevelopment schemes, land valuation, engineering designs, resettlement plan, etc.	16. Number of IEC plan	Comprehensive IEC plan developed	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Draft of the IEC plan is prepared by CS3. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Due to the project implementation delay, a comprehensive IEC plan development was delayed.
	17. Number and type of IEC materials distributed	Printed IEC materials distributed (i.e., project leaflets/ brochures on FAQs, posters, etc.)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Brochure on Project-1 published by 1000 copies. Project Update Newsletter Vol.1 (January- July, 2016) published by 5000 copies. Project Update Newsletter Vol.2 (July 2016-January 2017) published by 2000 copies. 	
	18. Number of IEC campaign meetings	IEC campaign meetings in both sub-centers conducted; documentation of meeting minutes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In total, 102 project introductory meetings including progress update session were organized and documented. During the block development consultations and capacity building trainings the project introductory and progress update session were introduced by 5 times. 	
Setting up of grievance or feedback mechanisms in the community	19. Number of resolved community grievance/feedback	System for resolution of grievance/feedback established	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> PMO adopted the formal system of MUB as a GRM for this project. 	No Project specific GRM is available.

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
	20. Number of resolved community grievance through CDCs	CDCs function as the grievance committee with guidelines on handling grievances	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Task forces for Community Grievance Handling were established under the CDCs to support the Project GRM. 	
Preparation and Finalization of the proposed SME development plan	21. Number of meetings of BC with CDC, sex disaggregated	16 meetings of SDC with CDCs in both sub-centers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SME Action plans were prepared by BCs on annual basis with 55% of women representative. 	No reflection of the SME action plans into the sub center redevelopment plans.
	22. Number and type of reports	Skills survey and demand mapping completed and documented	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Skills Survey and demand mapping completed to justify the need for business incubator and vocational training centers. Inventories of Local Businesses, MSME want to get SME loan and MSME to supply a product for the project were prioritized. Business mapping was done. The survey report will be complete in 2Q 2017. 	
	23. Number of meeting minutes	Documentation of meeting minutes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Database established and meeting records documented. 	
Capacity building of the CDCs on how to engage meaningfully in the sub-center redevelopment process	24. Number and type of cases received legal support	Legal support for the CDC to guide them in their engagement in the SRA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Total 8 consultations provided legal supports for NGO establishment and operation have been provided to the CDCs and BCs in both sub centers. Legal support will be provided during the project implementation. 	
	25. Number of developed Terms of references	Terms of reference of the CDCs in the SRA well defined and understood by them	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Terms of reference of the CDCs have been developed. 	
	26. Number and type of training for CDC engagement in the SRA	Curriculum/training design for CDC engagement in the SRA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 7 CDCs with percentage of members' participation have been trained. 3 curriculum/training designs are prepared. 	

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
	27. Number of Documentation	Documentation of capacity building approach and modules	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 training modules and reports are prepared and documented. 	
Facilitate consultative meetings for resettlement/relocation	28. Number of meetings, sex disaggregated	20 meetings in both sub-centers attended by all affected stakeholders	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4 meetings are organized for affected families (n=148) with 47.3% of women participants. 	LARP has not yet finalized.
Facilitate and support implementation of SME development plan	29. Number of trained community members, sex disaggregated	1,000 community members trained so various skills and partnership with SMEs and other institutions developed for employment or contracting for goods and services	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 40 business runners received basic training for business loan from Xas bank. • 2 female business owners have been linked with Asia Foundation Female entrepreneur's project. • Household Finance Management, Start-up your business and Business proposal development trainings were conducted, 150 community members involved and 50 were awarded with certificates. • Training on Marketing was conducted and attended for 100 businesses in the sub centers. 	
	30. Number of community members linked with business incubators (Type of linkage)	Trained community members linked with the business incubators for services like work space, business advisory, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 female business owners are linked Asia Foundation Female entrepreneurs project and they completed the business training package under the Asia Foundation. • 8 meetings with support organizations under the Ministry and Municipality have been organized in order to link MSMEs in the sub centers with training and support organizations. 	
	31. Database for poverty, social and gender indicators established	Documentation of process and results - # of employed, entered into self-employment, recorded increases in income, # of employees generated	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Database for trainees of business trainings has been established. • Mapping of local businesses is done in GIS. • A Database (on poverty, social and gender indicators based on existing secondary resources) of sub-centers updated by 2016. 	

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
Conduct community-led monitoring of construction works for quality control	32. Number of System, tools, and templates developed and used for community-led construction project monitoring	System, tools, and templates developed and used for community-led construction project monitoring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Task forces are established for monitoring of construction work under the CDCs. • TOR for the Task Force has been formulated. 	
	33. Number of trainings for CDCs for construction project monitoring, sex disaggregated	Trained CDCs with structure on construction project monitoring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training will start in line with construction time frame. 	
Facilitate and support consultations on the implementation of relocation plan from temporary housing to new apartments	34. Number of households provided with transfer assistance to new apartments	Affected households provided with transfer assistance to new apartments	As agreed with ADB, this needs to be removed.	
Continuous capacity building for the CDC and primary groups	35. Number and type of capacity building trainings/works conducted in both sub-centers	20 capacity building trainings/workshops and learning exchange conducted in both sub-centers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4 capacity building workshops were organized in each of sub-centers for CDCs and PG leaders on NGO management and sustainability and resources mobilization. • Small capacity building meetings were organized in the PGs for their re-activation, re-structuring and review of charters 	

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges	
	36. Number and type of learning exchange conducted in both sub-centers		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> An Event for Network building and experience sharing for community organizations has been organized in Dec 2016 and helped the community members to establish their network and exchange experiences within similar community organizations. During the event products of micro businesses have been presented to the audience. 		
	37. Number and percentage of people participated, sex disaggregated		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In total 303 persons with 65.3% of women were participated. 		
	38. Number and type of training designs		Training designs of capacity building interventions on Leadership, Team building, Community contracting, participation in the SRA, contracts negotiation, business planning, savings movement, etc.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 6 type of trainings such as Leadership, Team Building, Savings movement, NGO management and sustainability, Resources mobilization for NGOs, Start-up business are prepared and documented. 	
	39. Number of registered NGOs		Registration of the CDCs as NGOs with the State Registration Authority of the Ministry of Justice	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1 BC, 1 khoroo CDC in Selbe and 1 SDC in Bayankhoshuu are registered as NGO. 	
Documentation of good practices, lessons learned, feedback, complaints, or grievance issues	40. Number and type of reports and documents produced	Documented good practices, lessons learned and community feedback shared with all stakeholders and reflected in major reports	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Template for documentation of good practices was prepared by CS3. Community feedback on the proposed infrastructure designs has been collected through consultations and submitted to PMO and CS1 for their integration in the project designs. Community needs were documented and integrated into infrastructure designs. 		

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
	41. Number and type of documented and resolved cases of complaints	Complaints and grievance issues documented and resolved.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In total, 58 complaints and grievance issues documented (constructing and expanding-44, quality and safety issues related to the constructing-2, construction reference information and specifications-12). 	
IEC program for (i) basic hygiene practices, (ii) water conservation, (iii) community involvement on the ger redevelopment, and (iv) SME development program, etc.	42. Number and type of IEC materials distributed	IEC materials developed and disseminated	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existing available IEC materials on basic hygiene practices, water conservation and guides for improved sanitation are being disseminated to the community. Block wise redevelopment handouts prepared under ADB AHURP project are being disseminated to the some areas in the sub centers. 	
Capacity development activities for CDCs or small neighborhood associations for redeveloped lots on (i) operations and maintenance of new facilities, (ii) estate management, etc.	43. Number of Curriculum on O&M and estate management developed and implemented	Curriculum on O&M and estate management developed and implemented	As agreed with ADB, this needs to be removed.	
	44. Number of trainings on O&M, etc. conducted and documented, sex disaggregated	4 trainings on O&M, etc. conducted and documented	As agreed with ADB, this needs to be removed.	

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
Conduct series of consultations on the scope and technical/engineering design and implementation arrangements for proposed social and environmental projects (i.e., kindergarten, clinics, bus station, market, khoroo building, vocational training centers, public spaces/open parks)	45. Number and type of consultations, sex disaggregated	Consultation plans and minutes documented	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6 FGDs organized for communities' special needs identification of social facilities (55 participants with 49% of women) during the detailed design phase. • 24 Block redevelopment consultations organized with 557 participants (47% of women). • A Database of Meetings and Consultations is established. 	
	46. Number and type of community suggestion and recommendation incorporated into the designs	Designs reflect the needs of the vulnerable groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community needs on physical infrastructures identified- 30 suggestions for roads, 29 suggestions for outside the social facilities and 39 suggestions inside the buildings. • Community needs were documented and integrated into infrastructure designs. PMO engineers will monitor and ensure the installation of the facilities. 	
	47. Number and type of inputs of the CDCs and community members especially the women and other vulnerable groups considered in the implementation	Implementation arrangements reflect inputs of the CDCs and community members especially the women and other vulnerable groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The challenges of the community members during the construction work especially women and other vulnerable groups were identified during the FGDs and submitted to PMO and Design team for their reflection to the implementation arrangement of respective works. 	
Documentation of schemes/approaches that worked (good practices), feedback, lessons	48. Number and type of documentation	Documented good practices and lessons learned on the approach shared with all stakeholders	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Template of documentation of good practices on community needs integrated into infrastructure design was prepared. 	

Activity	Indicators	Targets	Implementation progress from July 2015 to March 2017	Challenges
learned, complaints, or grievance issues.	49. Number and type of complaints and grievance issues documented and resolved	Number of complaints and grievance issues documented and resolved	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In total, 58 complaints and grievance issues documented (constructing and expanding-44, quality and safety issues related to the constructing -2, construction reference information and specifications-12). 	
Conduct community-based monitoring and evaluation of new basic infrastructure and services for the community empowerment and SME development.	50. Number of community based monitoring and evaluation exercises	Community empowerment and SME development component developed and agreed upon by all stakeholders	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Task force is established under CDCs for community monitoring. 	
	51. Number and type of monitoring reports and final evaluation reports	Monitoring reports and final evaluation reports done according to quality standards of ADB and submitted on time	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To be done after the completion of proposed infrastructure. 	

Annex 2: Gender Action Plan Monitoring Matrix

MON: Ulaanbaatar Urban Services and Ger Areas Development Investment Program, Tranche-1

GENDER ACTION PLAN IMPLEMENTATION MONITORING MATRIX

Activity	Indicators/Targets	Progress Updates (1 July 2015–31 March 2017)	Challenges
Output 1: Roads and urban services are expanded within the targeted sub-centers and connectivity between sub-centers is improved			
1.1 Integrate gender inclusive design measures into road infrastructure to ensure safe and security mobility and access	1. Number and types of gender-inclusive design features integrated into road infrastructure <i>(Revised the indicator based on ADB MTR mission)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community needs in the detailed design phase of the project have been identified and prioritized through FGDs with vulnerable HH integrated into the design. Consultants together with UN Habitat and Egis organized 4 FGDs on safety and design features amongst vulnerable groups in project implementing areas. Out of total 65 interviewees in FGDs, 64.6% (n=42) account for females. Provision of lighting and sidewalks were integrated into detailed design. The community needs were assessed and prioritized as follows: (i) Street lighting; (ii) Sidewalks; (iii) Traffic lights in pedestrian crossings; and (iv) Overhead bridge and underground crossing. • Community needs on physical infrastructures identified: 30 suggestions for roads, 29 for outside the social facilities and 39 inside the buildings. • Community needs were documented and needs integrated into infrastructure designs. PMO engineers will monitor and ensure the installation of the facilities. • Upon finalization of the design, length of roads are decreased to 7.3 km in Selbe, but increased to 7.4 km in Bayankhoshuu. Technical expertise was conducted on 27 December 2016. • Landscaping including pedestrian pathways was integrated into detailed design. Technical expertise was conducted on 14 December 2016. 	No challenge.

<p>1.2 Assess impact of improved roads, water, sanitation and heating on population.</p>	<p>2. Social and gender indicators are included in the PPMS (sex-disaggregated). Qualitative assessment of project impacts will be also conducted. Focus group discussions will also be conducted to further assess impact.</p> <p><i>(Revised the indicator based on ADB MTR mission)</i></p>	<p>Both CS2 and CS3 have been collecting some sex-disaggregated data on socio-economic macro data (secondary data), community and business profiles, community needs assessment, and small access infrastructure through participatory research approaches.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social indicators such as sex disaggregated by population, water borne diseases, share of women’s participation in meetings and women’s representation in CDC/BC have been proposed for inclusion into the PPMS. • Available baseline data that were collected so far include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. 15.7% of FHH in Bayankhoshuu and 19.5% in Selbe sub-centers. ii. <table border="1" data-bbox="863 560 1608 657"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Households</th> <th>Business Units</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Water from public USUG/kiosks</td> <td>86%</td> <td>66.1%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Own heating</td> <td>54.5%</td> <td>97.8%</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p><i>(Source: Baseline 2013 Generated through SES)</i></p> iii. The most prevailing diseases include the respiratory and digestion system diseases. In sub centers 81.9% had severe and light cough/colds, and 4.6% had pneumonia or other respiratory diseases. As Health Statistic, water borne diseases per 10.000 persons as follow: <table border="1" data-bbox="863 836 1449 958"> <thead> <tr> <th>Year</th> <th>Dysentery</th> <th>Viral hepatitis</th> <th>Diarrhea</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>2012</td> <td>14.6</td> <td>22.9</td> <td>0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2015</td> <td>17.1</td> <td>3.8</td> <td>0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2016</td> <td>17.5</td> <td>2.5</td> <td>0</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p><i>(Source: MoH statistics)</i></p> • Qualitative data will be collected through FGDs after the completion of roads construction to assess overall benefits of the project 		Households	Business Units	Water from public USUG/kiosks	86%	66.1%	Own heating	54.5%	97.8%	Year	Dysentery	Viral hepatitis	Diarrhea	2012	14.6	22.9	0	2015	17.1	3.8	0	2016	17.5	2.5	0	<p>The household income, expenses and and poverty level, the findings of 2016 HSES conducted by NSO will be reported within 2Q 2017. Thus, it is required to estimate the UB city household consumption expenses and poverty level as per ger district or residential area and household head gender from the data.</p>
	Households	Business Units																										
Water from public USUG/kiosks	86%	66.1%																										
Own heating	54.5%	97.8%																										
Year	Dysentery	Viral hepatitis	Diarrhea																									
2012	14.6	22.9	0																									
2015	17.1	3.8	0																									
2016	17.5	2.5	0																									
<p>Output 2: Economic and public services are improved</p>																												
<p>2.1 One kindergarten facility in each sub-center with 1,800 m² of floor areas of classrooms, administration and services, and 500 m² of playground (baseline 0 in 2012)</p>	<p>3. At least two kindergartens operating by 2018 (number of students served and staff sex disaggregated)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The CS2 has conducted mapping of community social facilities including kindergartens and findings reveals that the available number of kindergartens (n=18) in the sub-centers cannot accommodate the demand of children. It is recommended to at least 50% of the children should be enrolled in the proposed kindergartens. The technical expertise was completed on 23 September 2016. The construction is expected to complete in July 2018. 	<p>No challenge.</p>																									

<p>2.2 One business incubator and vocational training center in each subcenter with 1,800 m² floor area and 500 m² of open green area (baseline 0 in 2012)</p>	<p>4. At least two business incubators and vocational training centers operational by 2018 (number of students and staff served annually, sex disaggregated)</p> <p>5. At least 20 MSME's, 50% of which are women led graduated from incubation program (baseline 0 in 2012)</p> <p>6. At least 1,000 beneficiaries, 50% of whom are women, receiving vocational training (baseline 0 in 2012)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Skills survey and demand mapping exercise were conducted by CS3 to justify the need for business incubator and vocational training center. The CS2 has also conducted mapping of community social facilities including VTCs and registered business enterprises. From the key findings, no VTC is available in two sub-centers. • The detailed architectural design of the vocational training center was prepared as per given specification. Technical expertise was conducted on 26 Sept.2016. • Expected completion date of BI is July 2018. • It has been resolved that the Recruitment Office of Ulaanbaatar city will be in charge of O&M of business incubator (1Q, 2017). 					
<p>Output 3: Service providers become more efficient</p>							
<p>3.1 Report on affordability and subsidies included in tariff assessment (disaggregated by income quintile and if possible looking at female-headed households as a special group)</p>	<p>7. Report by 2018</p>	<p>The baseline Socio-Economic and Willingness to Pay for Services Survey was conducted in 2013 during the PPTA. Yet, the data required (e.g. sex-disaggregated, income quintile) is not provided. Data on household income expenditure was collected based on national statistics to check affordability of the utility tariff:</p> <p><u>Consumption per capita per month in Ulaanbaatar, 2014</u></p> <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Heating (includes central and local heating, firewood, coal and dung)</td> <td style="text-align: right;">10 312MNT</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Utilities (includes water, electricity and lighting)</td> <td style="text-align: right;">9 010 MNT</td> </tr> </table> <p>(Source: NSO, 2015. Household Socio-Economic Survey, 2014)</p>	Heating (includes central and local heating, firewood, coal and dung)	10 312MNT	Utilities (includes water, electricity and lighting)	9 010 MNT	<p>There is no budget to conduct the Affordability analysis which triggers GAP activity #3.1.</p> <p>No connection to households will be done under the Project, thus it is not significant to measure the project impact.</p>
Heating (includes central and local heating, firewood, coal and dung)	10 312MNT						
Utilities (includes water, electricity and lighting)	9 010 MNT						
<p>3.2 Customers satisfaction survey</p>	<p>8. Survey report (providing sex disaggregated data where possible)</p>	<p>The customer survey on existing services in two sub-centers is under way by CS3 to establish baseline for the post project impact assessment. The consumer survey on existing services in two sub-centers has been done by CS3 to establish baseline for the post project impact assessment. The survey covers 10% of population with 63.6% female participation in both sub centers. In parallel with the survey, the mapping of existing trade and services in the sub-centers has been done. The survey report will be finalized and submitted by 2Q 2017.</p>					
<p>Output 4: Institutional capacity building</p>							

4.1 Establishment of Khoroo CDCs and SDCs with women's representation	9. Khoroo CDCs and SDCs fully functioning in targeted areas, with at least 40% women participating actively	Seven khoroo CDCs (2 in Selbe and 5 in Bayankhoshuu) and one sub-center SDC have been reactivated and functioning with 58% (n=74) women representation. Two SDCs have been formed with 77% (n=38) of active female participation. Their activities are continued.	No challenge.
4.2 Establishment and agreement on community, gender and MSME plans	10. Community, gender, and MSME action plans accepted and regularly updated in each sub-center	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CAP and MSME Action Plans are prepared by CDCs and BCs on annual basis and updated, with 55% female participation (1Q 2017). • MSME Action Plans were prepared in collaboration with Business Council and updated (1Q 2016). 	No challenge.
4.3 Targets established for and sex disaggregated data collected on participants for all community consultations on urban planning and project activities (see SAP activities) collected and reported on in the GAP	<p>11. GAP progress report with targets and sex-disaggregated data prepared quarterly</p> <p><i>(Revised the indicator based on ADB MTR mission)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sex disaggregated data is being collected on participants for all community consultation meetings and reported on semi-annual project implementation reports. In total, 95 community consultations were conducted with 2652 persons, of whom 56% were women. The set target for women participation is 50%. • 58 PGs were reactivated with 43% women participation. 7 khoroo level CDCs and 1 subcenter CDC have been reactivated and is functioning with 58% women representation. • 9 meetings were organized since the project beginning on the existing designs of proposed water supply, sanitation, sewerage, heating facilities. In total, 242 persons involved with 48.3% of women attendance, 26% of participants were vulnerable groups (PWDs-7%, FHH-5.8% and Elderly persons-13.2%). • A semi-annual social monitoring report covering the GAP implementation (1st half of 2016) was submitted by PMO and was disclosed on ADB website. • Social, gender and community participation report as of Feb 2017 prepared and submitted to ADB MTR Mission. During the ADB MTR Mission, targets and indicators for monitoring of SAP and GAP have been reviewed and renewed. • Sex disaggregated data collection has been continued. A database for the meetings was established and is being updated regularly. • A Database for meetings has been established and shared with ADB in Drop box. 	No challenge.

4.4 Sub-centers plan and redevelopment process are prepared and endorsed by all the stakeholders through community consultation including at least 50% of women's participation	12. Consultation meeting attendance and SAP monitoring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 24 consultation meetings by CS3 and CS4 were conducted in two sub-centers with 47% (n=557) women participation. Further consultations will be conducted to design sub-center development plans with active participation beneficiaries. • The SAP is monitored semi-annually and reported. Consultation meeting details are enclosed in the SAP implementation report quarterly. 	No challenge.
4.5 Establishment of PMO with 30% gender representation	13. PMO is fully functioning with trained staff at least 30% women	Project implementation units have recruited 13 officers 7 of whom are females (54%). In addition to 1 male project coordinator and 2 female deputy project coordinators, 5 out of 10 officers in program implementation unit are females.	No challenge.

CDC = community development council, CS = consultant services, FHH= Female headed household, GAP = gender action plan, HH=Household, MSME = micro-small- and medium- enterprise, MUB = Municipality of Ulaanbaatar, PMO = Program management office, FGD=Focus group discussion, CAP=Community action plan; SDC = Subcenter development council; PG = Primary Group; VTC = Vocational training center, USUG=Water Supply & Sewerage Authority, PWD=People with disabilities, SES= Socio Economic Survey, RP=Resettlement Plan,

Annex 3: Detail of Public Consultation

Table A1: Public meetings and trainings according to type, by sub-centers

	Tranche -1	Sub-center	
		Selbe	Bayankhoshuu
Community consultation	55	28	27
Number of total participants	1836	940	896
Percent of female participants to total (%)	49.7%	52.9%	46.4%
Community Organization	12	3	9
Number of total participants	121	32	89
Percent of female participants to total (%)	57.0%	65.6%	53.9%
Community Capacity building	9	6	3
Number of total participants	303	189	114
Percent of female participants to total (%)	65.3%	66.7%	63.2%
MSME Capacity building	19	8	11
Number of total participants	392	157	235
Percent of female participants to total (%)	78.1%	77.7%	78.3%
Total	95	45	50
Number of total participants	2652	1318	1334
Percent of female participants to total (%)	56.0%	58.1%	54.0%

Table A2: Community consultation meetings by type

Community consultation	Tranche -1	Sub-center	
		Selbe	Bayankhoshuu
Project preparation phase (number)	18	9	9
Number of total participants	889	470	419
Percent of female participants to total (%)	52.2%	60.2%	43.2%
Detailed design (number)	9	4	5
Number of total participants	242	112	130
Percent of female participants to total (%)	48.3%	33.0%	61.5%
Land and resettlement (number)	4	3	1
Number of total participants	148	97	51
Percent of female participants to total (%)	47.3%	45.4%	51.0%
Re-development (number)	24	12	12
Number of total participants	557	261	296
Percent of female participants to total (%)	47.0%	51.0%	43.6%