PROCUREMENT CAPACITY ASSESSMENT

Project Number: 46079

January 2014

People's Republic of China: Guangdong Chaonan Water Resources Development and Protection Demonstration Project

TABLE OF CONTENTS

A.	General1
B.	Procurement Capacity Assessment Questionnaire for both Executing Agency and
	Implementing Agency1
C.	Summary of Assessment and Recommendations for Project Implementation2
D.	Procurement Capacity Assessment Report and Recommendations3
Annex 1:	The National Procurement Environment (PRC)7
Annex 2:	Executing Agency Capacity Assessment Questionaire: Chaonan Project Management Office – Guangdong Chaonan Water Resources Development and Protection
	Demonstration Project Office
Annex 3:	Implementing Agency Capacity Assessment Questionnaire - Chaonan Water Supply
	Company16
Annex 4:	Procurement Capacity Questionnaire of Implementing Agencies21

PROCUREMENT CAPACITY ASSESSMENT

A. GENERAL

- 1. Procurement of goods, works, and consulting services is a key element of implementation of the project. It is considered that if the executing and implementing agencies have the capacity to undertake procurement efficiently, this will contribute significantly to the overall project objectives.
- 2. Hence, the Asian Development Bank (ADB) requires an assessment of the procurement capacity of the executing and implementing agencies during the project preparatory technical assistance (PPTA) stage and recommendations to be made on actions required to overcome weaknesses or constraints. Specifically, the assessment process seeks to (i) evaluate the adequacy of the executing and implementing agencies' existing processes adopted for procurement and their ability to comply with ADB's Procurement Guidelines (2013, as amended from time to time), (ii) identify the need for capacity building and training for the executing and implementing agencies during project implementation to develop the staff's competence in areas relating to procurement, and (iii) define the appropriate level of review either prior or post by ADB.

B. PROCUREMENT CAPACITY ASSESSMENT QUESTIONNAIRE FOR BOTH EXECUTING AGENCY AND IMPLEMENTING AGENCY

- 3. To facilitate the assessment of procurement capacity of an executing agency and the implementing agencies, ADB has developed a questionnaire for completion by the executing and implementing agencies. The questionnaire is divided into two parts: part one—specific assessment and ratings; and part 2—general rating. Both parts 1 and 2 consist of the following five contents:
 - Organizational and staff capacity
 - Information management
 - Procurement practices
 - Effectiveness
 - Accountability Measures
- 4. The Chaonan district government (CDG) will be the executing agency responsible for overall project planning and management. A project leading group has been established to provide overall policy guidance, facilitate inter-agency coordination, and resolve any institutional problems affecting project preparation and implementation. A project management office (PMO) has been established to be responsible for overall guidance, supervision, coordination, and management of project preparation and implementation. There will be six implementing agencies, which include (i) the Chaonan Water Supply Company (CWSC); (ii) (ii) the Chaonan Education Bureau (CEB); (iii) the Chaonan Environmental Protection Bureau (CEPB); (iv) the Chaonan Forestry Bureau (CFoB); (v) the Chaonan Urban Management Bureau (CUMB); and (vi) the Chaonan Water Affairs Bureau (CWAB, through its Water Conservancy Construction and Management Center). The first implementing agency, CWSC, is a revenue-generating company; while the last five implementing agencies—CEB, CEPB, CFoB, CUB, and CWAB—are nonrevenue-generating ones.
- 5. The questionnaire was issued to the PMO and was then completed. The completed questionnaire for the national procurement environment is presented in Annex 1. The completed questionnaire for the PMO is shown in Annex 2. The completed questionnaire for CWSC is given

in Annex 3. The five nonrevenue-generating implementing agencies—CEB, CEPB, CFoB, CUB, and CWAB—only involve minor and routinary purchase activities, and are not responsible for main procurement process; as a result, the procurement capacity questionnaire of the five implementing agencies is simplified and summarized in Annex 4.

C. SUMMARY OF ASSESSMENT AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

- 6. The PMO, with assistance of implementation consulting firm, tendering company, design institutes, and the implementing agencies, will undertake procurement of consultancy services, goods, and works for the project; but the implementing agencies will sign contracts with successful bidders. The PMO has certain technical and human resources to undertake procurement of consultancy services, goods, and works. The PMO, with the assistance of the PPTA consultants and loan implementation consultants, will establish arrangements for handling various stages of procurement activities from preparation of bid documents, tender invitation, bid evaluation, contract award, to construction supervision and contract performance monitoring.
- 7. The PMO does not have extensive experiences with foreign-funded project. As this is the first ADB project for Chaonan PMO and all the implementing agencies, engagement of an excellent and experienced team of international and national loan implementation consultants to build project management capacity, including procurement capability, during project implementation is highly recommended. The consultants will review the detail design, specifications, operation and maintenance requirements, bid document contractual conditions, and bid evaluation reports, including addressing ADB's comments on relevant documents, and implementation management. The consultants will transfer experience to selected individuals of the executing and implementing agencies through the on-the-job training activities. Moreover, the consultants will also provide a series of workshops and seminars to the executing agencies during the entire implementation period regarding bid document preparation, ADB bidding procedures, bid evaluation methods, construction supervision, financial management, environment monitoring, and resettlement monitoring and evaluation (M&E) requirements.
- 8. Based upon the assessment of the current capacity of the executing and implementing agencies and ADB's Procurement Guidelines, it is also recommended that ADB will require "Prior Review" to be applied to the following categories of procurement:
 - > all international competitive bidding (ICB) contracts,
 - the first national competitive bidding (NCB) contract for works,
 - > the first NCB contract for goods, and
 - consultancy recruitment by quality- and cost-based selection.
- 9. "Post Review" will be adequate for subsequent NCB goods and works, shopping for works, as well as shopping for goods.

D. PROCUREMENT CAPACITY ASSESSMENT REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Proposed Project Name: Guangdong Chaonan Water Resources Development and Protection Demonstration Project	Proposed Amount: US\$ 100 million (ADB financing)	
Executing Agency: Chaonan district government	Source of Funding: ADB/PRC Funds	
Assessor:	Date: October 2013	

Expected Procurement

The project involves a broad range of procurement contracts covering consulting services, goods, and works for water treatment plants, raw water pipelines and distribution pipelines, water supply dispatching center, water quality monitoring center, three-prevention dispatching center, solid waste disposal, reforestation within reservoir areas, and public sanitary and environmental activities. For goods and works contracts, the main procurement method for works will be NCB; ICB may be used for major items while shopping will be applied for minor items. For consulting services for loan implementation, QCBS will be adopted. The project will also involve individual consultant recruitment for specific short-term assignments.

General Procurement Environment Assessment

- (i) Two national procurement laws:
 - ✓ Borrower's Law of Tendering and Bidding of the People's Republic of China (the Bidding Law) effective 1 January 2000, and
 - ✓ Government Procurement Law, effective 29 June 2002.
- (ii) Neither law accommodates procurement of consulting services; neither law differentiates between processes for consulting services and goods/works.
- (iii) No national standard mandated for use for quality control purposes.
- (iv) Procurement rules and regulations require registration of goods and works suppliers.
- (v) No procurement accreditation program.

Organizational and Staff Capacity

The PMO is established at district level.

- (i) 16 staff in the PMO oversees various aspects of the project, including procurement;
- (ii) The PMO will prepare, update, and implement a procurement plan in consultation with the IAs and the design institutes;
- (iii) The PMO and IAs all have engineering sections with staff experienced in design and construction of works;
- (iv) A loan implementation consultant will be engaged to assist in procuring the goods and works under the project in line with ADB requirements; and
- (v) A procurement agent will be recruited to assist the PMO and IAs in handling procurement.

Procurement Practices

Procurement of Goods and Works

- The design institutes, with the assistance of implementation loan consultants, will prepare the design, specifications, and technical part of bid documents;
- (ii) The PMO will hire a procurement agent experienced in externally funded projects to prepare the commercial part of bid documents;
- (iii) The procurement agent will analyze the bids and present the information to a tender evaluation committee for consideration. The committee is composed of the client's representatives and independent tender experts selected at random from a national database;
- (iv) Responses to the questionnaire show a systematic procedure in inviting bids, bids evaluation, and contract award; and
- (v) Each IA will hire a construction supervision company to supervise the works on site and check for progress and works quality.

Procurement of Consulting Services

Three consultancy packages financed from the loan will be let to assist the EA and IAs in project implementation, and selection of the consultant will be done using the QCBS method. The PMO have experiences in procurement of consultants for domestic projects, but does not for ADB project. The EA will gain the procurement experience through the first consultancy package that will benefit to the remaining consultancy packages.

Effectiveness and Accountability Measures

From responses to the questionnaire, it appears that adequate controls are in place: (i) separate agencies are involved in approving bid documents, tender evaluation, etc.; (ii) contractual performance is consistently monitored and reported upon; and (iii) there are procedures for dealing with invoicing, payment, and non-payment. Hence, the additional process controls required will be ADB interventions to ensure compliance with ADB procurement principles by means of review of procurement documents and bid evaluation reports through ADB's "Prior Review" or "Post Review".

Information Management

A reasonable record system will be adopted for safekeeping of the original contract, copies of bids and bids evaluation reports, and contract administration papers.

Summary Assessment and Recommendations

The EA/PMO has certain technical and human resources to undertake procurement of consultancy services, goods, and works with arrangements for handling the various stages of procurement activities from preparation of bid documents, tender invitation, bid evaluation, contract award, to construction supervision and contract performance monitoring. Checking and control of the procurement processes will be also provided for. A procurement agent will be recruited to assist the PMO in carrying out procurement. As this is the first ADB project for the PMO and all the IAs, engagement of a team of international and national loan implementation consultants to build project management capacity, including procurement capability, during project implementation is recommended. The consultants will review the detail design, specifications, O&M requirements, bid document contractual conditions, and the bid evaluation report, including addressing ADB's comments on relevant documents. Necessary training on procurement and project management is also needed.

Specific Recommendations, Project Implementation

Risks/Capacity Constraint	Recommended Action	Responsibility and Comment
All the IAs are unfamiliar with ADB procurement requirements as detailed in ADB's Procurement Guidelines (2013, as amended from time to time) and payment procedures in accordance with ADB's Loan Disbursement Handbook.	 ADB specialists to conduct seminars to the EA, IAs, and the PMO on procurement and disbursements; Loan implementation consultant to provide on-the-job training during bid document preparation (technical and financial aspects) and bid evaluation, and in addressing ADB's comments ADB to require the following: Prior Review: all ICB contracts, first NCB contract (works), first NCB contract (goods), recruitment of consultants; and Post Review: Shopping (goods and works) 	ADB/EA

General Recommendations, EA Capacity				
Risks/Capacity Constraint	Recommended Action	Responsibility and Comment		
The PMO is ADB's contact point on the borrower's side. The constraint is that the PMO and IAs do not have any work experience for ADB-financed project.	Implementation loan consultants and tendering agency be involved as soon as possible to assist the PMO and IAs in the preparation of bidding documents and entire procurement and bidding process.	PMO/IAs		
	2. More experienced staff is suggested to be recruited in the PMO and sub-PMOs to smoothly carry out the procurement transactions and contract management to refrain from delay.			
	A working procedure may have to be developed to streamline communications for the sake of efficiency.			
General Recommendations, Prod	curement Environment			
Risks/Capacity Constraint	Recommended Action	Responsibility and Comment		
Although the EA is experienced in domestic projects, current harsh competition among bidders result very complicated procurement situation, under	As bid evaluation is complicated procedure and it requires knowledge of contract management, familiarity with technology and procurement procedures and principles.	Chaonan PMO, tendering company, design institute, loan implementation consultants		
General Recommendations, Prod	curement Environment			
Risks/Capacity Constraint	Recommended Action	Responsibility and Comment		
this situation, capacity to organize the evaluation efficiently without compromising economy and	The procurement agent and design institute should furnish this kind of capacity.			
transparency during biding should be strengthened.	2. Experienced procurement consultant is suggested to be recruited under the area of capacity building to help the PMO in reviewing the bidding documents and BERs to ensure the quality of procurement.			

ADB = Asian Development Bank, BER = bid evaluation report, EA = executing agency, IA = implementing agency, ICB = international competitive bidding, NCB = national competitive bidding, O&M = operation and maintenance, OSFMD = Operations Services and Financial Management Department, PMO = project management office, PRC = People's Republic of China, QCBS = quality- and cost-based selection,.

Note: The assessment and general recommendations concerning the national procurement environment are based on

Note: The assessment and general recommendations concerning the national procurement environment are based on separate findings by ADB's OSFMD. Source: ADB.

Prior Review Thresholds

The following procurement shall be subject to ADB prior review as described in Appendix 1 of the Procurement Guidelines and Appendix 1 of the Guidelines on the Use of Consultants.

	1.1		
Works Contracts		Goods Contr	acts
All contracts in excess of \$10,000,000 All contracts in excess of \$1,000,000			
The first use of NCI	B irrespective of value	The first use of	of NCB irrespective of value
Consulting Service	es Contracts	•	
Consultancy for Monitoring and Capacity Building Number of submissions: Four			bmissions: Four
Approved By ADB		Designation	
Agreed by EA		Designation	

 $\mbox{ADB} = \mbox{Asian Development Bank, EA} = \mbox{executing agency, NCB} = \mbox{national competitive bidding.}$ $\mbox{Source: ADB}$

Annex 1: The National Procurement Environment (PRC)

	Risk Assessed as		as
General Procurement Environment Assessment	Low	Average	High
1. Is there a procurement law? The answer to this is a simple yes or no, i.e. is there a single law governing procurement which is representative of best practice or is procurement governed through various laws, decrees etc.? Assess this as either "High" or "Low"	x		
2. Are the laws and regulations clear and concise? If there is no single law check "high", and similarly if the law is complex and difficult to follow check "average". If the law is easy to follow check "low".	Х		
3. What does the law (or regulations applicable to procurement) cover? If there is a single law, "low" will apply when the law covers drafting and use of standard bidding documents evaluation, contracting, through to the management of contracts including payment, warranty and defects liability periods. The less the procurement process is covered the higher the risk. If there is no single law, check "high"		X	
4. Does the law cover the procurement of consulting services? If consulting services are not covered or there is no law the risk is high, if they are covered the risk is low.			х
5. Does the law differentiate between processes for consulting services and Goods/Works? If there is no law, or it applies the same processes to consulting services as for goods and works check high. If there is some differentiation but the processes are similar, check average. If consulting services are dealt with separately check low			x
6. Does the law require advertisement of all procurement opportunities Low risk will be represented through advertisement all above \$25,000, average above all above \$100,000, high by no advertisement or advertisement at a higher threshold than \$100,000.		ments are differ	
7. Are contract awards advertised? The same thresholds as stated at question 6 should be applied		•	
8. Are there restrictions on goods works and services on the basis of origin? If procurement is limited to solely national origin check high, if there are restrictions or a national preference scheme, average. If None low	×		
9. Do the law or relevant legislation and regulations provide acceptable provision for the participation of state owned enterprises? Only if the SOE is legally and financially autonomous and not a dependent agency of the purchaser low, other than this high			X
10. Are there restrictions on the nationality of bidders and consulting firms invited? If procurement is limited to solely national firms and individuals check high, if there are restrictions or a national preference scheme, average. If None low	Х		
11. Are foreign bidders and consultants forced to offer through or with local partners? If yes, high; in certain circumstances, average; never, low		X	
12. Is there a domestic preference scheme? If there is across the board high, if applicable in limited circumstances, average, if none, low.	Х		
13. Is there a national standard mandated for use for quality control purposes? No, or Yes with direct, accessible international equivalents low, yes without international equivalents high			Х
14. Are any agencies exempt from the law? Such as the security forces, if yes high, also high of any types of goods are exempt from parts of the law such as medicines, text books or any other commodity		ernment procure general procure	

	Risk Assessed as		as
General Procurement Environment Assessment	Low	Average	High
15. Is the default method for procurement open competition? Either yes or no and low or high	Х		
16. Is open procurement easily avoided? If the procurement law allows avoidance of open procurement above the national threshold on the basis of circumstances that are not in response to natural disasters, i.e. simple urgency, check high, if open procurement can be avoided by senior management decision average. If avoidance requires approval of an oversight agency, low.	X		
17. Do the rules and regulations require pre-qualification? Only for complex contracts, low, no contracts average, all contracts high.		X	
18. Do the rules and regulations require registration? If yes, high, if only for specialist goods such as medicines average. If no registration low.	Require	company regist	ered
19. Are there systematic procurement process audits? Yes, low. Only financial audits average, none, high		X	
20. Is there a national procurement manual or guide? A single procurement manual or guide, low, manual exists but out of date/not in wide use average, none high			X
21. Do the laws and regulations mandate the use of standard documents? Documents for goods, works and consultants services low, just for 2 of the three average, only one or none high		on sectors, son s have standard nts	
22. Have these standard bidding documents been approved for use on ADB projects? Yes low, some but not all average, no high	х		
23. Do the regulations require the collection of nationwide statistics on procurement? Yes and statistics collected low, yes but data not collected or used average, no high			×
24. Is consolidated historical procurement data available to the public? Yes low, too much or too little, average, no high			Х
25. Do the procurement laws and regulations contain provisions for dealing with misconduct? Such as fraud and corrupt practices – the procurement law or regulations may include or cross refer to anti-corruption legislation. Yes low, no high.	х		
26. Is fraud and corruption in procurement regarded as a criminal act? The penalties should include penal servitude (prison) yes low, no high.	Х		
27. Have there been prosecutions for fraud and corruption? If there have been successful prosecutions for fraud and corruption, low, if prosecutions seem to focus solely on low grade junior staff average, none high	Х		
28. Is there an alternative disputes resolution process independent of government and courts? If there is an arbitration law and independent process low, if the standard contracts use ICC or similar dispute resolution average, if arbitration is through the courts or can be overturned by courts high.		x	
29. Does the law allow for sovereign immunity to the EA for claims against it? If plaintiffs can sue the government for contractual non-performance low, if they cannot high	Х		
30. Do the regulations allow for black listing (disbarment) of firms and individuals? If there is no black listing process or the process is transparent and equitable and undertaken by an independent oversight agency low. If there is a process and it is administered by a single line agency such as finance average, if it is administered by the executing agency high.	Х		

	ı	Risk Assessed	as
General Procurement Environment Assessment	Low	Average	High
31. Which body oversees procurement? Independent body reporting to the elected body low, single body reporting to the cabinet average, no body or reports to a single state agency such as the Prime Minister or Finance Minister high.	By government at different level		ent levels
32. What powers does the oversight body have? If the body can impose administrative sanctions on an EA and its staff and overturn contact awards including ministerial decisions low, if the body only can impose sanctions through the head of the EA, average, if the body can only recommend action high		х	
33. Is there a nationwide procurement training plan? If procurement training is assessed and planned for nationwide low, if this is delegated to line agencies average, if there is no strategy or plan high.		Х	
34. Is there a procurement accreditation or professionalization program? An externally recognized program low, a government sponsored program average, none, high			Х
35. Are major projects identified within an agencies appropriation or budget? Yes low, no but a system in place for the ring-fencing of project funds average, neither low	Х		
36. Is the procurement cycle tied to an annual budgeting cycle? i.e., can procurement activity only commence once a budget is approved? No a medium expenditure framework is in place low, activity may start up to but excluding contract award average, yes tied to annual budget high	Budget need to be approved, but may not be always on annual basis.		
37. Once an appropriation or budget is approved will funds be placed with the EA or can the EA draw them down at will? Yes low, no – additional controls imposed high (such as cash release system)			х
38. Can an EA draw directly from a loan or imprest account or will it spend budgeted funds with the borrower claiming reimbursement? Draws directly low, from budgeted funds high		Both	
39. When an EA is implementing a project using funds from the national budget has a delay in funding significantly delayed procurement? No or not applicable low, yes high.		X	

ADB = Asian Development Bank, EA = executing agency. Source: ADB.

Annex 2: Executing Agency Capacity Assessment Questionnaire —Chaonan for Project Management Office

Risk Ratings	Extremely High	High	Average	Low

I. Specific Assessment and Ratings

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
A. ORGANIZATIONAL AND STAFF CAPACITY		
A.1. How many years of experience does the head of the procurement department/unit have in a direct procurement role?	10 years	Low
A.2. How many staff in the procurement department/unit are:	4 people	Average
Full Time?	3	
Part Time?	1	
Seconded?	0	
A.3. Does the procurement staff have English language proficiency?	Yes	Low
A.4. Are the number and qualifications of the staff sufficient to undertake the additional procurement that will be required under the proposed project?	Yes	Low
A.5. Does the unit have adequate facilities, such as PCs, internet connections, photocopy facilities, printers, etc., to undertake the planned procurement?	Yes	Low
A.6. Does the agency have a procurement training program?	No, but will do.	Average
A.7. Does the agency have a procurement committee that is independent from the head of the agency?	No	Average
A.8. Does the agency have a procurement department/unit, including a permanent office that performs the function of a secretariat for the procurement unit, and which serves as the main support unit of the procurement committee?	No	Average
A.9. If yes, what type of procurement does it undertake?	N/A	
A.10. At what level does the department/unit report (to the head of agency, deputy etc.)?	Project Leading Group	Low
A.11. Do the procurement positions in the agency have job descriptions, which outline specific roles, minimum technical requirements and career routes?	Yes	Low
A.12. Is there a procurement process manual for goods and works?	Yes	Average
A.13. If there is a manual, is it up to date and does it cover foreign-assisted projects?	No	

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
A.14. Is there a procurement process manual for consulting services?	No	
A.15. If there is a manual, is it up to date and does it cover foreign-assisted projects?	N/A	
A.16. Are there standard documents in use, such as standard procurement documents/forms, and have they been approved for use on ADB-funded projects?	No	
A.17. Does the terms of reference follow a standard format such as background, tasks, inputs, objectives and outputs?	Yes	
A.18. Who drafts the procurement specifications?	IA with assistance of design institute	Low
A.19. Who approves the procurement specifications?	EA	
A.20. Who drafts the bidding documents?	The bidding agent drafts the commercial bidding documents, while the IA drafts the technical specifications with the assistance of the design institute.	
A.21. Who manages the sale of the bidding documents?	The bidding agent	
A.22. Who identifies the need for consulting services requirements?	EA in conjunction with ADB for their respective projects	Low
A.23. Who drafts the terms of reference?	Chaonan District PMO	
A.24. Who prepares the request for proposals?	Chaonan District PMO	-
B. INFORMATION MANAGEMENT		
B.1. Is there a referencing system for procurement files?	No, but will set up a referencing system for procurement files.	Low
B.2. Are there adequate resources allocated to record keeping infrastructure, which includes the record keeping system, space, equipment and personnel to administer the procurement records management functions within the agency?	Yes	Low
B.3. For what period are records kept?	At least more than 20 years	Low
B.4. Are copies of bids or proposals retained with the evaluation?	Yes	Low
B.5. Are copies of the original advertisements retained with the pre-contract papers?	Yes	Low
B.6. Is there a single contract file with a copy of the contract and all subsequent contractual correspondence?	Yes	Low
B.7. Are copies of invoices included with the contract papers?	Yes	Low
C. PROCUREMENT PRACTICES		•
Goods and Works		
C.1. Has the agency undertaken foreign-assisted procurement of goods or works recently (last 12	No	Average

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
months, or last 36 months)? (If yes, please indicate the names of the development partner/s and the Project/s.)		
C.2. If the above answer is yes, what were the major challenges?	N/A	
C.3. Is there a systematic process to identify procurement requirements (for a period of one year or more)	No	Average
C.4. Is there a minimum period for preparation of bids and if yes how long?	30 days for domestic projects	Low
C.5. Are all queries from bidders replied to in writing?	Yes	
C.6. Does the bidding document state the date and time of bid opening?	Yes	Low
C.7. Is the opening of bids done in public?	Yes	Low
C.8. Can late bids be accepted?	No	
C.9. Can bids be rejected at bid opening?	Yes	
C.10. Are minutes of the bid opening taken?	Yes	Low
C.11. Who may have a copy of the minutes?	Relevant departments	
C.12. Are the minutes free of charge?	Yes	
C.13. Who undertakes the evaluation of bids (individual(s), permanent committee, ad-hoc committee)?	An ad-hoc tender evaluation committee, formed by 5 to 7 experts from the national bidding net, and representatives from the bidding agent, the IAs and the EA	Low
C.14. What are the qualifications of the evaluators with respect to procurement and the goods and/or works under evaluation?	The experts with senior professional qualifications are selected randomly from the expert database on the National Bidding Net	Low
C.15. Is the decision of the evaluators final or is the evaluation subject to additional approvals?	Evaluation committee's decision is final	Low
C.16. Using at least three real examples, how long does it normally take from the issuance of the invitation for bids up to contact effectiveness?	Chaonan Urban Flood Control Project (implementation): 63 days; Nancheng Interception River Rehabilitation Project (Design): 45 Days; Nancheng Interception River Rehabilitation Project (Implementation): 38 Days.	Low
C.17. Are there processes in place for the collection and clearance of cargo through ports of entry?	Yes. Normally an international firm arranges for delivery to a port, and its domestic partner delivers it to the site	Low
C.18. Are there established goods receiving procedures?	No	Average
C.19. Are all goods that are received recorded as assets or inventory in a register?	Yes, equipment as assets, and accessories as inventory	Low
C.20. Is the agency/procurement department familiar with letters of credit?	No	Average
C.21. Does the procurement department register and track warranty and latent defects liability periods?	Yes	Low
periods?		

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
Consulting Services		
C.22. Has the agency undertaken foreign- assisted procurement of consulting services recently (last 12 months, or last 36 months)? (If yes, please indicate the names of the development partner/s and the project/s.)	No	Average
C.23. If the above answer is yes, what were the major challenges?	N/A	
C.24. Are assignments and requests for EOIs advertised?	No	Average
C.25. Is a consultants' selection committee formed with appropriate individuals, and what is its composition (if any)?	Yes, and at least five individuals with relevant qualification and experience.	Low
C.26. What criteria is used to evaluate EOIs?	Similar experience in the PRC and overseas, and key staff qualifications	Low
C.27. Historically, what is the most common method used (QCBS, QBS, etc.) to select consultants?	QCBS	Low
C.28. Do firms have to pay for the RFP document?	No	Low
C.29. Does the proposal evaluation criteria follow a pre-determined structure and is it detailed in the RFP?	Yes	Low
C.30. Are pre-proposal visits and meetings arranged?	The EA does not arrange pre-proposal visits or meetings. All bidders may choose to visit if they like	Low
C.31. Are minutes prepared and circulated after pre-proposal meetings?	No	
C.32. To whom are the minutes distributed?	N/A	
C.33. Are all queries from consultants answered/addressed in writing?	Yes	Low
C.34. Are the technical and financial proposals required to be in separate envelopes?	Yes	Low
C.35. Are proposal securities required?	No	Low
C.36. Are technical proposals opened in public?	No	Low
C.37. Are minutes of the technical opening distributed?	No	
C.38. Do the financial proposals remain sealed until technical evaluation is completed?	Yes	Low
C.39. Who determines the final technical ranking and how?	The bid evaluation committee determines the final technical ranking based on pre-determined evaluative criteria and their respective scoring.	
C.40. Are the technical scores sent to all firms?	No	
C.41. Are the financial proposal opened in public?	Yes	Low
C.42. Are minutes of the financial opening distributed?	Yes	

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
C.43. How is the financial evaluation completed?	The financial evaluation is completed based on pre-determined evaluative criteria-the financial score is inversely proportional to the tender price.	Low
C.44. Are face to face contract negotiations held?	Yes	
C.45. How long after financial evaluation is negotiation held with the selected firm?	As soon as possible, typically from 3 to 14 days	
C.46. What is the usual basis for negotiation?	The bidder's proposals and bidding documents	
C.47. Are minutes of negotiation taken and signed?	Yes	
C.48. How long after negotiation is the contract signed?	As soon as possible, typically from one week to three weeks	Low
C.49. Is there an evaluation system for measuring the outputs of consultants?	There is no formal evaluation system, but the EA may discuss this with ADB missions	Low
Payments		
C.50. Are advance payments made?	Yes, depending on the tender and contract conditions and negotiations	Low
C.51. What is the standard period for payment included in contracts?	Based on the progress of the contract completed	Low
C.52. On average, how long is it between receiving a firm's invoice and making payment?	Payment will be made within 28 days if the invoice is found to be in good shape, otherwise it will be rejected within 7 days.	
C.53. When late payment is made, are the beneficiaries paid interest?	No	
D. EFFECTIVENESS		
D.1. Is contractual performance systematically monitored and reported?	Yes	Low
D.2. Does the agency monitor and track its contractual payment obligations?	Yes	Low
D.3. Is a complaints resolution mechanism described in national procurement documents?	Yes	Low
D.4. Is there a formal non-judicial mechanism for dealing with complaints?	Yes	Low
D.5. Are procurement decisions and disputes supported by written narratives such as minutes of evaluation, minutes of negotiation, notices of default/withheld payment?	Yes	Low
E. ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES		
E.1. Is there a standard statement of ethics and are those involved in procurement required to formally commit to it?	Yes	Low
E.2. Are those involved with procurement required to declare any potential conflict of interest and remove themselves from the procurement process?	Yes	Low
E.3. Is the commencement of procurement dependent on external approvals (formal or de-facto) that are outside of the budgeting	Yes. The EA will carry out procurement with consultation with the leading group	Low

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
process?		
E.4. Who approves procurement transactions, and do they have procurement experience and qualifications?	Yes, by the relevant administrative department	Low
E.5. Which of the following actions require approvals outside the procurement unit or the evaluation committee, as the case may be, and who grants the approval?		Low
Bidding document, invitation to pre-qualify or RFP	The EA prepares the bidding document, invitation to pre-qualify and request for proposal according to pre-determined procedures and after receiving ADB's agreement as the case may be.	
Advertisement of an invitation for bids, pre-qualification or call for EOIs	The EA prepares them according to pre-determined procedures and after receiving ADB's agreement as the case may be.	
Evaluation reports	The tendering evaluation committee prepares the report.	
Notice of award	The EA prepares it according to pre-determined procedures and after receiving ADB's agreement as the case may be.	
Invitation to consultants to negotiate	The EA invites consultants to negotiate according to pre-determined procedures.	
Contracts	The EA prepares the contracts according to pre-determined procedures.	
E.6. Is the same official responsible for: (i) authorizing procurement transactions, procurement invitations, documents, evaluations and contracts; (ii) authorizing payments; (iii) recording procurement transactions and events; and (iv) the custody of assets?	No	Low
E.7. Is there a written auditable trail of procurement decisions attributable to individuals and committees?	No	Low

II. General Ratings

Criterion	Risk
A. Organizational and Staff Capacity	Average
B. Information Management	Low
C. Procurement Practices	Average
D. Effectiveness	Low
E. Accountability Measures	Low
OVERALL RISK RATING	Average

ADB = Asian Development Bank, EA = executing agency, EOI = expression of interest, IA = implementing agency, PMO = project management office, RFP = request for proposal, QBS = quality-based selection, QCBS =quality- and cost-based selection.

Source: ADB.

Annex 3: Implementing Agency Capacity Assessment Questionnaire —Chaonan Water Supply Company (CWSC)

Risk Ratings	Extremely High	High	Average	Low
--------------	----------------	------	---------	-----

I. Specific Assessment and Ratings

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
A. ORGANIZATIONAL AND STAFF CAPACITY		
A.1. How many years of experience does the head of the procurement department/unit have in a direct procurement role?	5 years	Average
A.2. How many staff in the procurement department/unit are:	2 people	Average
Full Time?	2	
Part Time?	0	
Seconded?	0	
A.3. Does the procurement staff have English language proficiency?	No	High
A.4. Are the number and qualifications of the staff sufficient to undertake the additional procurement that will be required under the proposed project?	No	High
A.5. Does the unit have adequate facilities, such as PCs, internet connections, photocopy facilities, printers, etc., to undertake the planned procurement?	Yes	Low
A.6. Does the agency have a procurement training program?	No	High
A.7. Does the agency have a procurement committee that is independent from the head of the agency?	No	High
A.8. Does the agency have a procurement department/unit, including a permanent office that performs the function of a secretariat for the procurement unit, and which serves as the main support unit of the procurement committee?	No	Average
A.9. If yes, what type of procurement does it undertake?	N/A	
A.10. At what level does the department/unit report (to the head of agency, deputy, etc.)?	Deputy General manager in charge of procurement	Low
A.11. Do the procurement positions in the agency have job descriptions, which outline specific roles, minimum technical requirements and career routes?	Yes, but does not outline specific roles, minimum technical requirements and career routes.	Average
A.12. Is there a procurement process manual for goods and works?	No	Average
A.13. If there is a manual, is it up to date and does it cover foreign-assisted projects?	N/A	
A.14. Is there a procurement process manual for consulting services?	No	
A.15. If there is a manual, is it up to date and does it cover foreign-assisted projects?	N/A	
A.16. Are there standard documents in use, such as standard procurement documents/forms, and have they been approved for use on ADB funded projects?	Yes, but have not been approved for ADB-financed project.	
A.17. Does the terms of reference follow a standard format such as background, tasks, inputs, objectives and outputs?	No	

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
A.18. Who drafts the procurement specifications?	Technical Department	Low
A.19. Who approves the procurement specifications?	Board	
A.20. Who drafts the bidding documents?	Tendering company and technical department	
A.21. Who manages the sale of the bidding documents?	Tendering company	
A.22. Who identifies the need for consulting services requirements?	Head of the Procurement Department and relevant leaders	Low
A.23. Who drafts the terms of reference?	Staff of the Procurement Department	
A.24. Who prepares the request for proposals?	Tendering company	
B. INFORMATION MANAGEMENT		
B.1. Is there a referencing system for procurement files?	No	Average
B.2. Are there adequate resources allocated to record keeping infrastructure, which includes the record keeping system, space, equipment and personnel to administer the procurement records management functions within the agency?	Yes	Low
B.3. For what period are records kept?	20 years and more	Low
B.4. Are copies of bids or proposals retained with the evaluation?	Yes	Low
B.5. Are copies of the original advertisements retained with the pre-contract papers?	Yes	Low
B.6. Is there a single contract file with a copy of the contract and all subsequent contractual correspondence?	Yes	Low
B.7. Are copies of invoices included with the contract papers?	No	Average
C. PROCUREMENT PRACTICES		
Goods and Works		
C.1. Has the agency undertaken foreign-assisted procurement of goods or works recently (last 12 months, or last 36 months)? (If yes, please indicate the names of the development partner/s and the project/s.)	No	Average
C.2. If the above answer is yes, what were the major challenges?	N/A	
C.3. Is there a systematic process to identify procurement requirements (for a period of one year or more)	No	Average
C.4. Is there a minimum period for preparation of bids and if yes how long?	Yes, about 1-2 months	Low
C.5. Are all queries from bidders replied to in writing?	Yes	
C.6. Does the bidding document state the date and time of bid opening?	Yes	Low
C.7. Is the opening of bids done in public?	Yes	Low
C.8. Can late bids be accepted?	No	
C.9. Can bids be rejected at bid opening?	Yes	
C.10. Are minutes of the bid opening taken?	Yes	Low
C.11. Who may have a copy of the minutes?	Relevant departments	
C.12. Are the minutes free of charge?	Yes	

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
C.13. Who undertakes the evaluation of bids (individual(s), permanent committee, ad-hoc committee)?	By tender evaluation committee composed of owner and experts	Low
C.14. What are the qualifications of the evaluators with respect to procurement and the goods and/or works under evaluation?	From experts with senior professional qualifications	Low
C.15. Is the decision of the evaluators final or is the evaluation subject to additional approvals?	Evaluation committee's decision is subject to additional approval.	Average
C.16. Using at least three real examples, how long does it normally take from the issuance of the invitation for bids up to contact effectiveness?	41 days for Qiufeng Water Supply Plant.	Average
C.17. Are there processes in place for the collection and clearance of cargo through ports of entry?	Yes	Average
C.18. Are there established goods receiving procedures?	Yes	Low
C.19. Are all goods that are received recorded as assets or inventory in a register?	Yes	Low
C.20. Is the agency/procurement department familiar with letters of credit?	No	Average
C.21. Does the procurement department register and track warranty and latent defects liability periods?	Yes	Low
Consulting Services		
C.22. Has the agency undertaken foreign- assisted procurement of consulting services recently (last 12 months, or last 36 months)? (If yes, please indicate the names of the development partner/s and the project/s.)	No	Average
C.23. If the above answer is yes, what were the major challenges?	N/A	
C.24. Are assignments and requests for EOIs advertised	Yes	Low
C.25. Is a consultants' selection committee formed with appropriate individuals, and what is its composition (if any)?	Yes	Low
C.26. What criteria is used to evaluate EOIs?	In line with PRC laws and regulations and ADB guidelines if necessary	Low
C.27. Historically, what is the most common method used (QCBS, QBS, etc.) to select consultants?	QA/QC	Low
C.28. Do firms have to pay for the RFP document?	No	Low
C.29. Does the proposal evaluation criteria follow a pre-determined structure and is it detailed in the RFP?	Yes	Low
C.30. Are pre-proposal visits and meetings arranged?	Yes if necessary	Low
C.31. Are minutes prepared and circulated after pre-proposal meetings?	Yes	
C.32. To whom are the minutes distributed?	Participants	
C.33. Are all queries from consultants answered/addressed in writing?	Yes	Low
C.34. Are the technical and financial proposals required to be in separate envelopes?	Yes	Low
C.35. Are proposal securities required?	Yes	Low
C.36. Are technical proposals opened in public?	Yes	Low
C.37. Are minutes of the technical opening distributed?	No	

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk	
C.38. Do the financial proposals remain sealed until technical evaluation is completed?	Yes	Low	
C.39. Who determines the final technical ranking and how?	Evaluation committee		
C.40. Are the technical scores sent to all firms?	No		
C.41. Are the financial proposal opened in public?	Yes	Low	
C.42. Are minutes of the financial opening distributed?	No		
C.43. How is the financial evaluation completed?	Based on overall scoring	Low	
C.44. Are face to face contract negotiations held?	Yes, in accordance with the bidding document		
C.45. How long after financial evaluation is negotiation held with the selected firm??	Typically 1-4 weeks based on contract types		
C.46. What is the usual basis for negotiation?	Bidding documents and the bid		
C.47. Are minutes of negotiation taken and signed?	No	<u> </u>	
C.48. How long after negotiation is the contract signed?	Basically 2-3 weeks	Low	
C.49. Is there an evaluation system for measuring the outputs of consultants?	Yes, in accordance with RFP	Low	
Payments			
C.50. Are advance payments made?	Yes	Low	
C.51. What is the standard period for payment included in contracts?	Based on the progress of the contract completed	Low	
C.52. On average, how long is it between receiving a firm's invoice and making payment?	One week if the invoice and supporting documents are in good shape		
C.53. When late payment is made, are the beneficiaries paid interest?	No		
D. EFFECTIVENESS			
D.1. Is contractual performance systematically monitored and reported?	No	Average	
D.2. Does the agency monitor and track its contractual payment obligations?	No	Average	
D.3. Is a complaints resolution mechanism described in national procurement documents?	Yes	Low	
D.4. Is there a formal non-judicial mechanism for dealing with complaints?	Yes	Low	
D.5. Are procurement decisions and disputes supported by written narratives such as minutes of evaluation, minutes of negotiation, notices of default/withheld payment?	Yes	Low	
E. ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES			
E.1. Is there a standard statement of ethics and are those involved in procurement required to formally commit to it?	No	Low	
E.2. Are those involved with procurement required to declare any cotential conflict of interest and remove them from the procurement process?	Yes	Low	
E.3. Is the commencement of procurement dependent on external approvals (formal or de-facto) that are outside of the budgeting process?	Yes	Low	

Question	Answer/Finding	Risk
E.4. Who approves procurement transactions, and do they have procurement experience and qualifications?	Deputy general manager with procurement experience	Low
E.5. Which of the following actions require approvals outside the procurement unit or the evaluation committee, as the case may be, and who grants the approval?		Low
Bidding document, invitation to pre-qualify or RFP	Chaonan Water Affairs Bureau	
Advertisement of an invitation for bids, pre-qualification or call for EOIs	Chaonan Water Affairs Bureau	
Evaluation reports	Chaonan Water Affairs Bureau	
Notice of award	No need	
Invitation to consultants to negotiate	No need	
Contracts	Chaonan Water Affairs Bureau	
E.6. Is the same official responsible for (i) authorizing procurement transactions, procurement invitations, documents, evaluations and contracts; (ii) authorizing payments; (iii) recording procurement transactions and events; and (iv) the custody of assets?	No	Low
E.7. Is there a written auditable trail of procurement decisions attributable to individuals and committees?	Yes	Low

II. General Ratings

Criterion	Risk
A. Organizational and Staff Capacity	Average
B. Information Management	Low
C. Procurement Practices	Average
D. Effectiveness	Average
E. Accountability Measures	Low
OVERALL RISK RATING	Average

ADB = Asian Development Bank, EOI = expression of interest, RFP = request for proposal, QBS = quality-based selection, QCBS = quality- and cost-based selection. Source: ADB.

Annex 4: Procurement Capacity Questionnaire of Other Implementing Agencies

Chaonan Education Bureau

Name of department/unit responsible for the procurement process and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Education Bureau

Name of department/unit responsible for construction supervision and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Education Bureau

1. Past experience in similar project

No.

2. Design

How to arrange to select the 'design institute' to ensure compliance with necessary technical requirements

Through open tendering

3. Contract documents

How to arrange for preparation of contract documents, to ensure compliance with ADB's 'Guide to Procurement?

Through appropriate training of the responsible personnel

4. The tendering process

List the national/local government's guideline or regulations governing the tendering process.

Name the party responsible for the invitation of tenders.

Chaonan Education Bureau

5. Tender assessment

Explain the process for the evaluation of tenders received to ensure compliance with tender requirements, and what is the composition of assessment board if any.

The assessment board will be formed from experts randomly selected from an expect database kept by the tendering management department.

6. Contract award

Who is responsible for confirming the winning bid?

The assessment board

7. Signing of contract

Who will sign the contract with the successful tenderer?

Chaonan Education Bureau

8. Construction supervision

Who is responsible for supervising the construction work; are construction supervision systems/procedures available?

A construction supervision agency will be selected through open tendering.

9. Appointment of 'Site supervision' Agency

How to arrange appointment of the Agency

Selection through open tendering

10. Other supervisory/auditing mechanisms

List measures to ensure openness and fairness in entire procurement process

Chaonan Forestry Bureau

Name of department/unit responsible for the procurement process and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Forestry Bureau

Name of department/unit responsible for construction supervision and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Forestry Bureau

1.Past experience in similar project

No.

2. Design

How to arrange to select the 'design institute' to ensure compliance with necessary technical requirements

Through open tendering

3. Contract documents

How to arrange for preparation of contract documents, to ensure compliance with ADB's 'Guide to Procurement'

Through appropriate training of the responsible personnel

4. The tendering process

List the national/local government's guideline or regulations governing the tendering process. Name the party responsible for the invitation of tenders.

Chaonan Forest Bureau

5. Tender assessment

Explain the process for the evaluation of tenders received to ensure compliance with tender requirements, and what is the composition of assessment board if any.

The assessment board will be formed from experts randomly selected from an expect database kept by the tendering management department.

6. Contract award

Who is responsible for confirming the winning bid?

The assessment board

7. Signing of contract

Who will sign the contract with the successful tenderer?

Chaonan Forest Bureau

8. Construction supervision

Who is responsible for supervising the construction work; are construction supervision systems/procedures available?

A construction supervision agency will be selected through open tendering.

9. Appointment of 'Site supervision' Agency

How to arrange appointment of the Agency

Selection through open tendering

10. Other supervisory/auditing mechanisms

List measures to ensure openness and fairness in entire procurement process

Chaonan Urban Management Bureau

Name of department/unit responsible for the procurement process and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Urban Management Bureau

Name of department/unit responsible for construction supervision and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Education Bureau

1.Past experience in similar project

No.

2. Design

How to arrange to select the 'design institute' to ensure compliance with necessary technical requirements

Through open tendering

3. Contract documents

How to arrange for preparation of contract documents, to ensure compliance with ADB's 'Guide to Procurement'

Through appropriate training of the responsible personnel

4. The tendering process

List the national/local government's guideline or regulations governing the tendering process. Name the party responsible for the invitation of tenders.

Chaonan Urban Management Bureau

5. Tender assessment

Explain the process for the evaluation of tenders received to ensure compliance with tender requirements, and what is the composition of assessment board if any.

The assessment board will be formed from experts randomly selected from an expect database kept by the tendering management department.

6. Contract award

Who is responsible for confirming the winning bid?

The assessment board

7. Signing of contract

Who will sign the contract with the successful tenderer?

Chaonan Urban Management Bureau

8. Construction supervision

Who is responsible for supervising the construction work; are construction supervision systems/procedures available?

A construction supervision agency will be selected through open tendering.

9. Appointment of 'Site supervision' Agency

How to arrange appointment of the Agency

Selection through open tendering

10. Other supervisory/auditing mechanisms

List measures to ensure openness and fairness in entire procurement process

Chaonan Environmental Protection Bureau

Name of department/unit responsible for the procurement process and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Environmental Protection Bureau

Name of department/unit responsible for construction supervision and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Environmental Protection Bureau

1.Past experience in similar project

No.

2. Design

How to arrange to select the 'design institute' to ensure compliance with necessary technical requirements

Through open tendering

3. Contract documents

How to arrange for preparation of contract documents, to ensure compliance with ADB's 'Guide to Procurement'

Through appropriate training of the responsible personnel

4. The tendering process

List the national/local government's guideline or regulations governing the tendering process. Name the party responsible for the invitation of tenders.

Chaonan Environmental Protection Bureau

5. Tender assessment

Explain the process for the evaluation of tenders received to ensure compliance with tender requirements, and what is the composition of assessment board, if any.

The assessment board will be formed from experts randomly selected from an expect database kept by the tendering management department.

6. Contract award

Who is responsible for confirming the winning bid?

The assessment board

7. Signing of contract

Who will sign the contract with the successful tenderer?

Chaonan Environmental Protection Bureau

8. Construction supervision

Who is responsible for supervising the construction work; are construction supervision systems/procedures available?

A construction supervision agency will be selected through open tendering.

9. Appointment of 'Site supervision' Agency

How to arrange appointment of the Agency?

Selection through open tendering

10. Other supervisory/auditing mechanisms

List measures to ensure openness and fairness in entire procurement process.

Chaonan Water Affairs Bureau/Chaonan Water Conservancy Construction and Management Center

Name of department/unit responsible for the procurement process and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Water Conservancy Construction and Management Center

Name of department/unit responsible for construction supervision and personnel to be deployed Chaonan Water Conservancy Construction and Management Center

1.Past experience in similar project

No.

2. Design

How to arrange to select the 'design institute' to ensure compliance with necessary technical Requirements?

Through open tendering

3. Contract documents

How to arrange for preparation of contract documents to ensure compliance with ADB's Procurement Guidelines'?

Through appropriate training of the responsible personnel

4. The tendering process

List the national/local government's guideline or regulations governing the tendering process.

Name the party responsible for the invitation of tenders.

Chaonan Water Conservancy Construction and Management Center

5. Tender assessment

Explain the process for the evaluation of tenders received to ensure compliance with tender requirements, and what is the composition of assessment board, if any.

The assessment board will be formed from experts randomly selected from an expect database kept by the tendering management department.

6. Contract award

Who is responsible for confirming the winning bid?

The assessment board

7. Signing of contract

Who will sign the contract with the successful tenderer?

Chaonan Water Conservancy Construction and Management Center

8. Construction supervision

Who is responsible for supervising the construction work; are construction supervision systems/procedures available?

A construction supervision agency will be selected through open tendering.

9. Appointment of 'site supervision' agency

How to arrange appointment of the agency?

Selection through open tendering

10. Other supervisory/auditing mechanisms

List measures to ensure openness and fairness in entire procurement process.