



# Technical Assistance Report

---

Project Number: 50034-001  
Policy and Advisory Technical Assistance (PATA)  
November 2016

## People's Republic of China: Vocational Education– Enterprise Collaboration for Student Employment- Based Poverty Reduction in Gansu

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Public Communications Policy 2011.

Asian Development Bank

## CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(as of 7 November 2016)

Currency unit	–	yuan (CNY)
CNY1.00	=	\$0.1479
\$1.00	=	CNY6.7598

## ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
GPED	–	Gansu Provincial Education Department
MOE	–	Ministry of Education
PRC	–	People's Republic of China
TA	–	technical assistance
TVET	–	technical and vocational education and training

## NOTE

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

<b>Vice-President</b>	S. Groff, Operations 2
<b>Director General</b>	A. Konishi, East Asia Department (EARD)
<b>Director</b>	X. Jia, Officer-in-Charge, People's Republic of China Resident Mission, EARD
<b>Team leader</b>	I. Bain, Social Sector Specialist, EARD
<b>Team members</b>	B. Konysbayev, Principal Counsel, Office of the General Counsel S. Shakil, Senior Education Specialist, EARD S. Xu, Associate Project Analyst, EARD

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

## CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
POLICY AND ADVISORY TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AT A GLANCE	
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. ISSUES	1
III. THE POLICY AND ADVISORY TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	3
A. Impact and Outcome	3
B. Methodology and Key Activities	3
C. Cost and Financing	4
D. Implementation Arrangements	4
IV. THE PRESIDENT'S DECISION	5
APPENDIXES	
1. Design and Monitoring Framework	6
2. Cost Estimates and Financing Plan	9
3. Outline Terms of Reference for Consultants	10

## POLICY AND ADVISORY TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AT A GLANCE

<b>1. Basic Data</b>		<b>Project Number: 50034-001</b>	
<b>Project Name</b>	Vocational Education-Enterprise Collaboration for Student Employment-based Poverty Reduction in Gansu	<b>Department /Division</b>	EARD/PRCM
<b>Country</b>	China, People's Republic of	<b>Executing Agency</b>	Gansu Provincial Education Department
<b>2. Sector</b>	<b>Subsector(s)</b>	<b>ADB Financing (\$ million)</b>	
✓ Education	Education sector development		0.05
	Education sector development - social protection initiatives		0.15
	Technical and vocational education and training		0.20
		<b>Total</b>	<b>0.40</b>
<b>3. Strategic Agenda</b>	<b>Subcomponents</b>	<b>Climate Change Information</b>	
Inclusive economic growth (IEG)	Pillar 2: Access to economic opportunities, including jobs, made more inclusive Pillar 3: Extreme deprivation prevented and effects of shocks reduced (Social Protection)	Climate Change impact on the Project	Low
<b>4. Drivers of Change</b>	<b>Components</b>	<b>Gender Equity and Mainstreaming</b>	
Governance and capacity development (GCD)	Institutional development Public financial governance	Effective gender mainstreaming (EGM)	✓
<b>5. Poverty and SDG Targeting</b>		<b>Location Impact</b>	
Geographic Targeting	No	Rural	High
Household Targeting	Yes		
SDG Targeting	Yes		
SDG Goals	SDG8		
<b>6. TA Category:</b>	B		
<b>7. Safeguard Categorization</b>	Not Applicable		
<b>8. Financing</b>			
<b>Modality and Sources</b>		<b>Amount (\$ million)</b>	
<b>ADB</b>		<b>0.40</b>	
Policy and advisory technical assistance: Technical Assistance Special Fund		0.40	
<b>Cofinancing</b>		<b>0.00</b>	
None		0.00	
<b>Counterpart</b>		<b>0.40</b>	
Government		0.40	
<b>Total</b>		<b>0.80</b>	
<b>9. Effective Development Cooperation</b>			
Use of country procurement systems			No
Use of country public financial management systems			Yes

## I. INTRODUCTION

1. During the 2015 country program mission, the Government of the People's Republic of China (PRC) requested the Asian Development Bank (ADB) to provide policy and advisory technical assistance (TA) to the Gansu Provincial Education Department (GPED) for Vocational Education–Enterprise Collaboration for Student Employment-Based Poverty Reduction in Gansu. ADB included the proposed TA in its PRC country operations business plan, 2016–2018.<sup>1</sup> ADB conducted a fact-finding mission on 26–29 July 2016 and reached an agreement with the government on the impact, outcome, outputs, terms of reference for consultants, cost estimates, financing plan, and implementation arrangements. ADB approved the TA concept paper on 22 August 2016. The design and monitoring framework is in Appendix 1.<sup>2</sup>

## II. ISSUES

2. Nearly three decades of rapid growth and poverty reduction planning have dramatically reduced rural poverty in the PRC. However, existing poverty reduction planning requires additional approaches to better target, track, and address the changing needs of specific groups of rural poor amid significant socioeconomic change.

3. For example, the PRC's rural poverty reduction program has focused on income improvement through enhanced agricultural production and rural infrastructure since the mid-1980s. Its education activities have centered on training farmers, building schools, and providing subsidies for poor students enrolled in the PRC's nine-year compulsory education program. Employment generation has been supported through microcredit to farmer enterprises and the organized export of off-farm manual labor to other localities. Linkages to other government agencies and programs have mainly occurred at the project operational and funding levels rather than through integrated policy creation and interagency activity coordination.

4. However, broader and better-targeted poverty reduction measures are needed given (i) the rapid rates of out-migration and urbanization, particularly of rural youth; (ii) structural reform in economic sectors; (iii) the changing roles of government and enterprises; and (iv) industry technical upgrades and relocation.

5. The need for a new framework is apparent in youth poverty reduction, where the poverty reduction through education concept has gained policy momentum, including technical and vocational education and training (TVET) and education–enterprise cooperation. TVET-based poverty reduction aims to break the geographic concentration and intergenerational transmission of rural poverty through improved (i) training and soft skilling of poor rural students for the broader national economy, and (ii) management of their initial employment stability and income security. The concept necessitates closer and more mutually beneficial TVET–enterprise collaborations, and stronger policy and programming coordination between government agencies for TVET and poverty reduction.

6. Initial state-level steps on poverty reduction through education have included issuing guidance for poverty reduction and related agencies to “increase the relevance and effectiveness of training by orienting it toward employment, strengthening vocational training programs, encouraging businesses to combine poverty reduction efforts with vocational

---

<sup>1</sup> ADB. 2016. *Country Operations Business Plan: People's Republic of China, 2016–2018*. Manila.

<sup>2</sup> The TA first appeared in the business opportunities section of ADB's website on 25 August 2016.

education, and encouraging vocational schools to admit more applicants from poor families.”<sup>3</sup> The PRC’s Ministry of Education (MOE) has also begun pilot testing a modern apprenticeship system in which (i) junior and senior TVET schools and enterprises jointly recruit student apprentices under a training agreement and labor contract; (ii) TVET teachers and enterprise professionals jointly train student apprentices using a codeveloped training plan, teaching materials, and enterprise worker training funds; and (iii) local government education authorities use monitoring mechanisms to ensure the rights and responsibilities of contracting parties.<sup>4</sup> This system is in line with current macro-structural reforms to better define and delineate the roles of government, market, and society. It also aims to address some micro-level problems of previous student internships, which are now covered by new administrative measures.<sup>5</sup> MOE is encouraging the pilot scheme localities to develop detailed implementation plans, interagency working groups, coordination methods, and stakeholder responsibilities; and to explore different student development modalities.

7. As one of the country’s poorest provinces, Gansu in western PRC has been exploring ways to reduce rural poverty in its ecologically fragile regions. The province had 5.32 million rural poor in 2015 and the second-highest subnational rural poverty incidence during 2010–2014. Three of the 14 nationally designated zones of concentrated poverty cover parts of Gansu (the Liupan Mountain zone, the Qinba Mountain zone, and the Four Province Contiguous Poor Tibetan Area zone), and 58 of Gansu’s 75 national-level poor counties fall within these three zones.

8. Gansu’s experience registering poor households and issuing poverty cards to improve benefit targeting and tracking was recognized nationally in 2016. This system can provide a basis for improved targeting and tracking of poor students. In 2016, GPED included in its tasks integrating TVET–enterprise resources, increasing cooperation, and pilot testing a provincial-level modern apprenticeship scheme in 17 TVET schools to promote poverty reduction and education reform.<sup>6</sup> However, experience in Gansu also indicates that (i) some students doubt

<sup>3</sup> Government of the PRC, Communist Party of China Central Committee and the State Council. 2015. *Decisions on Winning the Tough Battle Against Poverty*. Beijing. The original document was issued on 7 December in Chinese.

<sup>4</sup> Government of the PRC, MOE. 2014. *Opinions on the Task of Developing Modern Apprenticeship System Pilots*. Beijing (Document No. 9).

<sup>5</sup> Government of the PRC. MOE; Ministry of Finance; Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security; State Administration of Work Safety; and the China Insurance Regulatory Commission. 2016. *Provisions on Administration of Internships of Students of Vocational Schools*. Beijing (Document No. 3; original document issued and made effective on 11 April in Chinese). The measures aim to better protect senior high- and college-level vocational school interns and to reduce labor abuses that drew public attention in 2012–2013. Key clauses are that (i) vocational schools fielding interns must be given access to the hiring enterprise’s premises to assess its worker health and safety conditions, basic enterprise information, and the intern’s role and function; (ii) the vocational school, enterprise, and the potential intern (interns under 18 years of age require the consent of a legal guardian) are to reach a tripartite agreement, including on the type of work to be undertaken and the liability for breach of agreement; (iii) interns cannot exceed 10% of the enterprise’s total labor force and 20% of the labor force in specific positions; (iv) the internship will normally be for 6 months; (v) student interns will not be allocated to enterprises that do not sign internship agreements complying with requirements; (vi) student interns should not (a) work on legally designated leave time or holidays, overtime, or the night shift; (b) work in bars, nightclubs, music halls, spa centers, or other such entertainment enterprises; or (c) arrange their internships through intermediary or fee-for-service organizations; (vii) in principle, intern remuneration shall exceed 80% of the salary of new employees on probation in the same position; and (viii) the vocational school and internship enterprise will cover student internship insurance following national regulations. Provinces, ethnic autonomous regions, and national municipalities are preparing implementing rules for the provisions. Those for Gansu have been completed.

<sup>6</sup> Government of the PRC, GPED and Provincial Party Higher Education Institute Work Committee. 2016. *Notice on Key Points in the 2016 Work Plan*. Lanzhou (issued on 4 March).

the value of TVET, given its unstable and low-paying job outcomes; (ii) some local enterprises lack enthusiasm and incentives to engage with the scheme; and (iii) local GPED student tracking capacity is weak.

9. Thus, both challenges and opportunities exist to pilot and refine TVET–enterprise-based student poverty reduction in Gansu and to potentially form a framework for sharing with other poor localities in western PRC. A 2015 PRC presidential mandate to eliminate absolute poverty by 2020 has intensified the need for such innovative strategies and fostered a more receptive policy environment.

### III. THE POLICY AND ADVISORY TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

#### A. Impact and Outcome

10. The impact will be a more effective national framework for TVET-based poverty reduction. The outcome will be improved TVET–enterprise collaboration for student employment-based poverty reduction. This will be evident from (i) GPED’s adoption of a TVET–enterprise framework of guidelines and procedures, and a gender-sensitive training manual for student employment-based poverty reduction; and (ii) the operation of a new provincial education and poverty reduction agency co-programming modality for TVET-based poverty reduction in Gansu.

#### B. Methodology and Key Activities

11. The TA will undertake gender-sensitive policy analysis, multi-stakeholder surveys, in-depth field interviews, consultations, gender-disaggregated data collection, TVET trainee tracking (from admission to completion or certification and then job placement), domestic experience exchanges, and a domestic study tour to achieve four outputs.<sup>7</sup>

12. **Output 1: Experience in technical and vocational education and training–enterprise collaboration for student employment-based poverty reduction reviewed.** The TA will analyze (i) PRC and international policies and practices; (ii) gender-disaggregated education, employment, internship, and apprenticeship data; monitoring reports; and poverty card records; and (iii) good practices observed during a domestic study tour.

13. **Output 2: Poverty reduction capacity of the Gansu technical and vocational education and training modern apprenticeship scheme assessed.** The TA will design and conduct well-targeted surveys, interviews, and small group discussions with TVET teachers, career advisors, poor students (and their families) from the 17 TVET schools in the modern apprenticeship system pilot, relevant industry and charitable associations, public and private sector enterprises, and labor recruitment organizations within Gansu and Tianjin, Gansu’s East–West Poverty Reduction partner metropolis in eastern PRC.

---

<sup>7</sup> The initial proposal is for surveys to be conducted in schools in the poor Gansu cities of Dingxi, Longnan, Pingliang, and Wuwei; in Gannan (Tibetan) and Linxia (Hui Muslim) ethnic prefectures; and in Lanzhou city schools that provide free junior TVET for Tibetan students. These constitute a subset of the 17 TVET schools in the MOE modern apprenticeship system pilot in Gansu. Of those 17, 14 are province-level pilot schools and three are national-level schools, representing 10 junior and seven senior TVET schools. Under this TA, an additional school was added in Gannan (Tibetan) and in Linxia (Hui Muslim) ethnic prefectures to ensure an ethnically diverse sample. It is anticipated that TVET schools not selected for survey would still participate in some TA activities.

**14. Output 3: Technical and vocational education and training–enterprise collaboration framework for student employment-based poverty reduction developed.**

The TA will develop implementation guidelines, procedures, monitoring criteria and indicators, sample TVET–enterprise agreements and student–enterprise employment contracts, and a gender-sensitive training manual that outlines (i) mechanisms for training staff and contracting students, (ii) new incentives such as ranking and resourcing TVET schools based on an employment rating of graduates, and (iii) monitoring criteria and indicators.

**15. Output 4: Knowledge about the Gansu technical and vocational education and training–enterprise collaboration framework for student employment-based poverty reduction strengthened.**

The TA will assist GPED in documenting good practices and recommendations for TVET–enterprise collaboration in a bilingual policy brief, knowledge product, media articles, and four subreports on TVET schools, international and PRC TVET–enterprise experiences, and poor TVET students and their families. Findings will be disseminated through stakeholder workshops, a northwestern PRC experience exchange meeting, and a national poverty reduction conference.

16. Potential risks affecting achievements include (i) an unanticipated decline in student employment opportunities within collaborating enterprises, (ii) slow implementation progress as enterprises and TVET schools doubt the benefits of collaboration, and (iii) inadequate statistics for an accurate and gender-based analysis. The TA will minimize risks by involving industry associations in regular stakeholder meetings and compiling supplementary statistics.

### **C. Cost and Financing**

17. The TA is estimated to cost \$800,000 equivalent, of which \$400,000 equivalent will be financed on a grant basis by ADB’s Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF-other sources). The government will provide counterpart support to finance the TA office and equipment (e.g., computers), office communication, remuneration and per diem for counterpart staff, and subsidies for eligible poor Gansu students at junior and technical schools within the province.

### **D. Implementation Arrangements**

18. GPED will be the executing agency. The TA will be implemented from 1 November 2016 to 31 December 2018.

19. In consultation with GPED, ADB will recruit one international and six national consultants for a total of 44 person-months over 23 months using individual consultant selection procedures, and will consider lump-sum payments and/or output-based contracts in line with the Midterm Review of Strategy 2020 action plan.<sup>8</sup> Recruitment will follow ADB’s Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time).

20. A national expert in PRC technical education–enterprise collaboration will (i) act as the team leader and assume overall responsibility for writing and disseminating a bilingual policy brief, the TA completion report, and a subreport on PRC TVET–enterprise cooperation; and (ii) oversee the team analysis of policies and data, survey design and implementation, stakeholder interviews, fieldwork and knowledge dissemination plans, international and national workshops, domestic study tour, and project training (12 person-months). A national technical education specialist will (i) collect gender-disaggregated data on Gansu TVET schools and students; (ii)

---

<sup>8</sup> ADB. 2014. *Midterm Review of Strategy 2020: Action Plan*. Manila.



design, conduct, and analyze a gender-sensitive TVET school survey, interviews, and focus groups; and (iii) prepare a TVET school subreport on means for strengthening the capacity of impoverished students to compete equitably, including through in-school improvements, internships, apprenticeships, and employment (8 person-months). A national poverty reduction policy and planning specialist will (i) analyze government data on household poverty cards, (ii) conduct interviews with poverty reduction agencies and poor rural TVET students and their families, and (iii) prepare a subreport and recommendations on the education-based poverty reduction policy initiatives and charitable activities of enterprises and society, including the Tianjin–Gansu East–West Poverty Reduction Partnership<sup>9</sup> (8 person-months). A national participatory rural poverty reduction and training specialist will (i) conduct a capacity, training, and soft-skilling needs assessment for government agencies, enterprises, and poverty card-holding students interested in equity-oriented technical education–enterprise activities; (ii) prepare a gender-sensitive Gansu modern vocational education apprenticeship scheme training manual with stakeholder group participation; and (iii) train participants and trainers of trainers in its use (7 person-months). A national legal advisor on contract law will develop improved TVET school–enterprise training agreements and individual student–enterprise contracts, and provide related training (1 person-month). An international expert on inclusive and equitable TVET–enterprise collaboration will research and report on international policies, incentives, and experiences in TVET–enterprise cooperation for student poverty reduction (3 person-months). A national administrative and financial assistant will assist with logistics, including fieldwork, meetings, and dissemination planning (5 person-months). ADB will engage up to 10 interviewers for the TVET survey, TVET–enterprise cooperation survey, and poor TVET student and household survey on a short-term basis under team leader supervision.

21. The experts will provide inputs as consultants and short-term resource persons. ADB will finalize the terms of reference for resource persons and specific tasks for the experts, including their duration and expected results. TA proceeds will be disbursed following ADB’s *Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook* (2010, as amended from time to time).

22. GPED and the provincial poverty reduction agency will convene quarterly coordination meetings to identify, track, and update overall TA progress, and will ensure timely TA outputs and effective dissemination. Policy and stakeholder dialogue will be maintained, including through routine TA advisory group and stakeholder meetings to ensure field-level feedback and policy relevance. Stakeholders will conduct self-evaluations in a concluding quarterly meeting.

23. ADB and GEPD will disseminate good practices and lessons learned in a policy brief, completion report, subreports, study tour report, a gender-sensitive training manual, improved contracts and agreement templates, and monitoring criteria and indicators. GEPD will provide TA findings and knowledge products to national and Gansu leadership for consideration in implementing new policies, pilot tests, and processes. GPED will issue government guidance on promoting school–enterprise cooperation and circulate copies to institutions for implementation.

#### IV. THE PRESIDENT’S DECISION

24. The President, acting under the authority delegated by the Board, has approved the provision of technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$400,000 on a grant basis to the People’s Republic of China for Vocational Education–Enterprise Collaboration for Student Employment-Based Poverty Reduction in Gansu, and hereby reports this action to the Board.

<sup>9</sup> The PRC government has paired wealthier eastern and poorer western areas as a poverty reduction policy since 1996. Gansu province is paired with the coastal port of Tianjin Municipality to exchange manual and skilled labor.

## DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

<b>Impact the TA is aligned with</b>			
A more effective national framework for TVET-based poverty reduction implemented (Decisions on Winning the Tough Battle Against Poverty) <sup>a</sup>			
<b>Results Chain</b>	<b>Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines</b>	<b>Data Sources and Reporting</b>	<b>Risks</b>
<b>Outcome</b> TVET–enterprise collaboration for student employment-based poverty reduction improved	By December 2019 a. TVET–enterprise framework of guidelines and a gender-sensitive training manual for student employment-based poverty reduction adopted by GPED (2016 baseline: 0)  b. Provincial education and poverty reduction agency co-programming modality for TVET-based poverty reduction operational in Gansu (2016 baseline: 0)	a. GPED guidelines and procedures for promoting school–enterprise cooperation; training manual  b. GPED and Gansu Office for Poor Area Development annual work plans and work reports; media reports	Unanticipated decline in student employment opportunities within collaborating enterprises
<b>Outputs</b> 1. Experience in TVET–enterprise collaboration for student employment-based poverty reduction reviewed  2. Poverty reduction capacity of the Gansu TVET modern apprenticeship scheme assessed	By 31 October 2018 1. Study reports on national and international TVET–enterprise collaboration for student employment-based poverty reduction prepared, with gender aspects highlighted (2016 baseline: 0)  2a. Assessment recommendations implemented to strengthen scheme operations, and poverty reduction agency and GPED monitoring (2016 baseline: 0)  2b. More than 15 GPED and poverty reduction staff trained (50% female) in scheme monitoring (2016 baseline: 0)	1. 2 TA subreports and a study tour report  2a. 3 TA subreports with recommendations, including for monitoring criteria and indicators  2b. TA subreport; trainee participant lists	Inadequate statistics for an accurate and gender-based analysis  Slow implementation progress as enterprises and TVET schools doubt the benefits of collaboration

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Data Sources and Reporting	Risks
3. TVET–enterprise collaboration framework for student employment-based poverty reduction developed	<p>3a. Gansu TVET modern apprenticeship pilot scheme undertaken with at least 100 student participants (female numbers commensurate to eligible female students) by month 17 (2016 baseline: 0)</p> <p>3b. Gender-sensitive training manual produced and more than 40 TVET headmasters, teachers, and GPED and enterprise staff trained (women comprise at least 90% of eligible female trainees); 10 GPED staff trained as manual trainers (2016 baseline: 0)</p>	<p>3a. Gender-disaggregated pilot participant lists; related apprenticeship agreements and contracts; workshop minutes and quarterly GPED and poverty reduction agency TA progress reports</p> <p>3b. Consultant subreports; TA training records; TA completion report</p>	
4. Knowledge about the Gansu TVET–enterprise collaboration framework for student employment-based poverty reduction strengthened	<p>4a. Knowledge product sent to more than 300 Gansu TVET schools, national and subnational education and poverty reduction agencies, and East–West poverty reduction partners and enterprises by month 23 (2016 baseline: 0)</p> <p>4b. Collaboration framework and TA report findings publicly referenced by Gansu leadership (2016 baseline = 0)</p>	<p>4a. TA dissemination plan updates recorded in quarterly GPED and poverty reduction agency progress meetings; routine TA advisory group meeting minutes</p> <p>4b. Presentations at the 2018 northwestern PRC government agency experience exchange meeting</p>	
<b>Key Activities with Milestones</b>			
<p><b>1 Review technical and vocational education and training–enterprise collaboration in student employment-based poverty reduction</b></p> <p>1.1 Establish a TA advisory group and hold a TA kick-off meeting to clarify and discuss TA implementation arrangements from month 1.</p> <p>1.2 Collect and assess PRC and international policies, schemes, experiences, and lessons in TVET-related poverty reduction by month 3.</p> <p>1.3 Conduct a literature and statistical review of poverty reduction through TVET by month 3.</p> <p>1.4 Conduct a TA inception workshop to review and discuss the inception report findings, proposed fieldwork strategy and time frame, domestic study tour, and TA dissemination plan by month 4.</p> <p>1.5 Conduct a domestic study tour to review TVET–enterprise collaboration for student employment-based poverty reduction and report findings in a TA advisory group meeting by month 6.</p>			

<p><b>2 Assess the poverty reduction capacity of the Gansu technical and vocational education and training modern apprenticeship scheme</b></p> <p>2.1 Survey and prepare a subreport on poor rural student TVET needs and preferences, household economic capacities, and parental and personal career and employment expectations by month 19.</p> <p>2.2 Survey at least 17 TVET schools, including in the poorer parts of Gansu and ethnic minority areas, to prepare a subreport on curriculum, training, soft skilling and employment methods, capacity, and interest to offer poverty reduction TVET, particularly through the pilot TVET modern apprenticeship scheme, by month 19.</p> <p>2.3 Survey and prepare a subreport on TVET–enterprise cooperation to support poor TVET students and graduates, particularly under the modern apprenticeship scheme, by month 19.</p> <p>2.4 Hold a workshop on the survey findings and identify the scope and locations for pilot testing the signing of TVET–enterprise agreements and student–enterprise employment contracts by month 7.</p> <p><b>3 Develop a technical and vocational education and training–enterprise cooperation framework for student employment-based poverty reduction</b></p> <p>3.1 Prepare a testable Gansu TVET–enterprise-based poverty reduction framework by month 6.</p> <p>3.2 Clearly define and document TVET school and enterprise rights and responsibilities in months 6–11.</p> <p>3.3 Pilot test the signing of TVET–enterprise agreements and student–enterprise employment contracts, and clarify relationships between enterprises, schools, and TVET student trainees in months 7–9.</p> <p>3.4 Conduct participatory training in framework implementation and draft an implementation mechanism and a gender-sensitive training manual by month 12.</p> <p>3.5 Convene a midterm review workshop and a TA advisory group meeting to review and finalize the midterm review report, implementation mechanism, and training manual by month 15.</p> <p><b>4 Strengthen knowledge about the Gansu technical and vocational education and training–enterprise collaboration framework for student employment-based poverty reduction</b></p> <p>4.1 Convene an experience-exchange meeting with relevant northwestern PRC agencies and East–West poverty reduction program partners by month 18.</p> <p>4.2 Convene a TA completion workshop and finalize the TA completion report by month 19.</p> <p>4.3 Convene a TA advisory group meeting and prepare a bilingual knowledge product on targeted student poverty reduction through TVET–enterprise collaboration for dissemination at a media launch and by mail to national and subnational stakeholders by month 22.</p> <p>4.4 Arrange for TA study tour members or provincial government representatives to present the Gansu TVET–enterprise collaboration experience on student employment-based poverty reduction at the annual International Day for the Eradication of Poverty in Beijing by month 23.</p>
<p><b>Inputs</b></p> <p>ADB: \$400,000</p> <p>Note: The government will provide counterpart support to finance the TA office and equipment, office communication, remuneration and per diem for counterpart staff, and subsidies for eligible poor Gansu students attending junior and technical schools within the province.</p>
<p><b>Assumptions for Partner Financing</b></p> <p>Not Applicable</p>

ADB = Asian Development Bank, GPED = Gansu Provincial Education Department, PRC = People's Republic of China, TA = technical assistance, TVET = technical and vocational education and training.

<sup>a</sup> Government of the PRC, Communist Party of China Central Committee and State Council. 2015. *Decisions on Winning the Tough Battle Against Poverty*. Beijing. The original document was issued on 7 December in Chinese. Source: ADB.

**COST ESTIMATES AND FINANCING PLAN**  
(\$'000)

Item	Amount
<b>Asian Development Bank<sup>a</sup></b>	
1. Consultants	
a. Remuneration and per diem	
i. International consultant (3 person-months)	40.0
ii. National consultants (41 person-months) <sup>b</sup>	155.0
b. International and local travel	40.0
c. Reports, translation, and communications	20.0
2. Training, seminars, and conferences <sup>c</sup>	
a. Facilitators and resource persons	10.0
b. Training and other meetings	45.0
3. Studies <sup>d</sup>	45.0
4. Miscellaneous administration and support costs	15.0
5. Contingencies	30.0
<b>Total</b>	<b>400.0</b>

Note: The technical assistance (TA) is estimated to cost \$800,000, of which contributions from the Asian Development Bank (ADB) are presented in the table above. The government will provide counterpart support in the form of subsidies for eligible poor Gansu students attending junior and technical schools within the province, staff, office meeting space and supplies, data and information, and other in-kind contributions; it will also cover travel costs and per diem for study site visits by Gansu Provincial Education Department counterpart staff and national and local government officials. The value of the government contribution is estimated to account for 50% of the total TA cost.

<sup>a</sup> Financed by ADB's Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF-other sources). As an upper-middle-income country, the People's Republic of China has not generally attracted cofinancing interest.

<sup>b</sup> Includes the cost of a research assistant under the national team leader contract.

<sup>c</sup> Includes TA workshops, and interpretation and translation costs.

<sup>d</sup> Includes surveys, fieldwork, knowledge products, and translation.

Source: ADB estimates.

## OUTLINE TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS

1. The technical assistance (TA) will require 44 person-months of individual consulting services from one international and six national consultants on an intermittent basis. Consultants will be recruited following the Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time) of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) and will work under the guidance of the People's Republic of China (PRC) Gansu Provincial Education Department (GPED) and ADB.

2. **Team leader and expert in People's Republic of China technical education–enterprise collaboration** (national, 12 person-months, intermittent). The team leader and expert will have a postgraduate degree and working experience in an education-related discipline, with excellent written and spoken English. Ideally, the expert will have experience in international study, research, or project management, including in gender-related and development projects. The expert will have at least 10 years' relevant work experience and strong expertise in the development, operation, and evaluation of educational policies and skills training in the PRC and its poor regions as evidenced from research projects, Chinese and English publications, professional affiliations, and strong collaborations with government, educational, enterprise, and social organizations. TA funds are available to hire one national research assistant to support activities that do not duplicate the team leader's tasks. The team leader will develop the research assistant's terms of reference for approval by the ADB mission leader and executing agency. The expert will

- (i) serve as the team leader for consultants and ensure timely completion of all TA technical outputs, including taking overall responsibility for the draft and final inception, midterm, and completion reports, as well as the bilingual policy brief;
- (ii) take responsibility for and lead team members in reviewing policies, practices, and experiences in technical education–enterprise collaboration for poverty reduction; and assess the potential role of the modern vocational education apprenticeship scheme;
- (iii) in collaboration with team members, design and conduct workshops and finalize the TA research and methodology plans, field survey locations, and associated gender-sensitive survey, interview, pilot, and training mechanisms;
- (iv) take responsibility for and lead team members in interviewing organizations and analyzing Gansu education, employment, and apprenticeship data and poverty card records to inform survey design;
- (v) oversee team member design and conduct of well-targeted surveys, interviews, and small group discussions with technical and vocational education and training (TVET) teachers, students, poor households, industry associations, public and private sector enterprises, and labor recruitment organizations within Gansu and its poverty reduction partner metropolis of Tianjin in eastern PRC, including overseeing the quality of survey instruments and interviewer work;
- (vi) take primary responsibility for the collection and analysis of enterprise student employment and apprenticeship data; the interviews with industry associations, public and private sector enterprises, and labor recruitment organizations in Gansu and Tianjin; and the TVET–enterprise cooperation survey to evaluate government practices and incentives for—and enterprise experience with—training, soft skilling, and employing poor students from TVET institutions;
- (vii) collaborate with team members to obtain and analyze gender-disaggregated data, and to draft gender-sensitive processes and guidelines on technical education–enterprise collaboration for poverty reduction, including a possible role for the modern vocational education apprenticeship scheme;

- (viii) work with the technical education specialist to survey TVET schools;
- (ix) coordinate team member inputs; assist GPED in identifying locations, activities, and institutions for the domestic study tour; and review the draft study tour report;
- (x) write (a) a TA subreport on PRC TVET–enterprise cooperation, and (b) the final project report executive summary and sections on PRC policies, schemes, experiences, and lessons from the PRC technical education–enterprise collaboration; and oversee the quality of team member inputs, reports, and materials; and
- (xi) work with the executing agency to develop and implement the knowledge dissemination plan, ensure sharing of TA findings to national and provincial policy makers and other stakeholder groups, and codesign the Lanzhou TA experience-sharing and exchange meeting.

**3. Expert on inclusive and equitable technical and vocational education and training–enterprise collaboration** (international, 3 person-months). The expert will be an established professional with an advanced degree in education, a record of relevant publications and consultant report preparation, and at least 10 years’ project or research experience in developing and evaluating PRC educational policies and programs, particularly for poor and ethnic minority students, from school to work and from a gender perspective. Good spoken Chinese is desirable. Under team leader supervision and in coordination with the team, the expert will

- (i) research and prepare a report on international policies, incentives, and experiences in TVET–enterprise cooperation for student poverty reduction;
- (ii) assist GPED and the team leader in identifying locations, activities, and institutions for the GPED domestic study tour; and review the draft tour report;
- (iii) assist the team leader, as required, in preparing the TVET–enterprise survey and summarizing resulting data;
- (iv) review the TA subreports on TVET schools, PRC TVET–enterprise cooperation, poor TVET students and their families, the pilot TVET modern apprenticeship scheme implementation mechanism in Gansu, associated agreements and contracts, the gender-sensitive training manual, and the Lanzhou experience-sharing and exchange meeting design;
- (v) work with team members, GPED, and ADB to identify suitable TA-funded international resource persons to join some meetings and workshops; and
- (vi) provide draft input to the TA kick-off, inception, midterm, and completion reports, and other outputs as required by the team leader.

**4. Technical education specialist** (national, 8 person-months, intermittent). The specialist will have a postgraduate degree and good English skills. The specialist will have at least 5 years’ direct expertise in TVET education—and have authored Chinese publications relevant to this—as well as experience in field interviews, documentation, and presentation of findings to government agencies. The specialist will also have experience collecting and using gender-disaggregated social survey data for research purposes. Under team leader supervision and in coordination with the team, the expert will

- (i) take prime responsibility for collecting, analyzing, and supplementing, where possible, gender-disaggregated statistics relevant to Gansu TVET schools, apprenticeships, career advisors, teachers and enterprise staff teaching in TVET schools, and TVET student employment in Gansu;
- (ii) design survey methodologies and a gender-sensitive survey for TVET schools, teaching and career advisory resources, apprenticeship arrangements, students in poverty, and past and present internships and apprenticeships;

- (iii) work with the team leader and take responsibility for implementing and analyzing the TVET school survey to profile poor student enrollment and conditions to incentivize the students; and tracking soft skilling, internship, apprenticeship, and employment conditions, including gender dimensions;
- (iv) work with the team leader and take primary responsibility for exploring the existence of, or options for adapting, a simple computerized system to track trainee performance from admission to completion and/or certification and job placement;
- (v) work with the team leader and take responsibility for developing the criteria and indicators for monitoring the scheme performance, reflecting gender dimensions;
- (vi) work with the legal advisor to pilot and review draft TVET–enterprise agreements and student–enterprise contracts;
- (vii) work with the team leader and take primary responsibility for implementing the Lanzhou TA experience-sharing and exchange meeting;
- (viii) prepare a subreport on TVET schools, addressing poor student interest and incentives to enroll in Gansu TVET schools, forms and adequacy of support through subsidies, and career advice and placement or employment opportunities, including gender aspects and recommendations to strengthen poor students’ capacity to compete equitably for internships, apprenticeships, and available employment; and
- (ix) provide draft input to the TA kick-off, inception, midterm, and completion reports, and other outputs as required by the team leader.

5. **Poverty reduction policy and planning specialist** (national, 8 person-months, intermittent). The specialist will have a university degree and good English skills, and have authored Chinese and English publications relevant to poverty reduction policy and planning. The specialist should have demonstrated links with PRC poverty reduction agencies and at least 10 years’ direct expertise in PRC poverty reduction policies and practices (including poverty reduction project development, management, and evaluation), and related institutional analysis. The specialist should also have experience in field interviews, documentation, and presentation of findings to relevant government agencies. Under team leader supervision and in coordination with the team, the expert will

- (i) review government initiatives and charitable activities by enterprises and societies to support poor Gansu TVET students and their employment, particularly the Tianjin–Gansu East–West Poverty Reduction Partnership;<sup>10</sup>
- (ii) analyze available government poverty card data; collaborate with the team leader; and take primary responsibility for (a) codesigning gender-inclusive interview protocols for Gansu and Tianjin poverty reduction agencies, and poor Gansu TVET students and their families; (b) selecting interviewees; and (c) conducting interviews, focusing on the adequacy of poor student fee exemption and impacts of other TVET costs;
- (iii) use documents and field interviews to analyze government poverty reduction strategies for TVET student employment, including from a gender perspective;
- (iv) take primary responsibility for developing recommendations on TVET-based poverty reduction methods and procedures from the perspective of poverty reduction authorities, and provide inputs to interim and final reports, including from a gender perspective;

---

<sup>10</sup> The PRC government has paired wealthier eastern and poorer western areas as a poverty reduction policy since 1996. Gansu province is paired with the coastal port of Tianjin Municipality to exchange manual and skilled labor.



- (v) assist the participatory rural poverty reduction and training specialist to develop the gender-sensitive training manual and training program;
- (vi) work with the technical education specialist to study gendered student employment rates and incomes as a result of internships, placements, and/or cooperation; and document the situation of poor students;
- (vii) work with the technical education specialist on the monitoring criteria and indicators, and take primary responsibility for elements relating to poor students and their families, incomes, and expenses; and
- (viii) assist GPED and the team leader in identifying locations, activities, and institutions for the GPED domestic study tour and in reviewing the draft GPED study tour report; and prepare required sections of final reporting, particularly relating to para. 5 (iii–vi), and a subreport and component of the completion report on poor rural TVET students and their families, together with specific poverty reduction policy initiatives for TVET education, and other outputs as required by the team leader.

**6. Participatory rural poverty reduction and training specialist** (national, 7 person-months, intermittent). The specialist will have a university degree in a rural development discipline and good English skills, and have authored Chinese and English publications relevant to participatory rural poverty reduction. The specialist should have more than 10 years' field experience with gender-sensitive rural poverty reduction and poor household development projects and strategies, and significant experience facilitating interaction between project stakeholder groups. The specialist should have received training in training techniques, ideally including international training. The specialist should have experience in providing training to relevant government and project stakeholder groups, and preparing gender-sensitive training resources and documentation. Experience in poverty reduction activities in western PRC (including in ethnic minority areas and with women's groups) and in poverty reduction social enterprise activities is highly desirable. Under team leader supervision and in coordination with the team, the expert will

- (i) contribute to the TA research and methodology plans, including identifying appropriate fieldwork locations and organizations;
- (ii) assist the poverty reduction and planning specialist in designing and conducting a survey of poor rural TVET students and their families' conditions, and in preparing the related subreport and completion report sections;
- (iii) conduct a capacity, training, and soft-skilling needs assessment of government agencies, enterprises, and poverty card-holding students interested in equitable technical education–enterprise activities;
- (iv) assist GPED and the team leader in identifying locations, activities, and institutions for the GPED domestic study tour and reviewing the draft tour report;
- (v) prepare the gender-sensitive Gansu modern vocational education apprenticeship scheme training manual through participation by stakeholder groups;
- (vi) train participants and trainers of trainers on the draft training manual for the TA pilot and finalize the manual for use in follow-on activities;
- (vii) assist team members in planning, conducting, analyzing, and documenting training workshops for inclusion in the midterm review and completion reports;
- (viii) work with the technical education specialist on the monitoring criteria and indicators, including elements for gender-sensitive training; and
- (ix) assist the team leader in organizing and facilitating project workshops.

**7. Legal advisor in contract law** (national, 1 person-month) The advisor will be a qualified lawyer and/or have a license to practice law in the PRC, and have at least 3 years' working

experience in labor contract law, liabilities, the legal aspects of PRC TVET–enterprise agreements, and student apprenticeship and employee labor contracts and conditions. Under team leader supervision and in coordination with the team, the expert will

- (i) develop improved TVET school–enterprise training agreements and individual student–enterprise contracts for use in the TA pilot activity; and ensure these contracts are gender equitable and legally binding, address liabilities, and comply with the Labor Contract Law, 2013 and Provisions on Administration of Internships of Students of Vocational Schools, 2016;
- (ii) provide pre-pilot training in pilot contract rights, responsibilities, and contents to GPED pilot managers and to poverty reduction and TVET school staff, who are expected to become trainers of trainers and monitor pilot contract adherence;
- (iii) assist the technical education specialist in developing the monitoring criteria and indicators, particularly for agreements, contracts, and maintenance of gender equity in operation; and
- (iv) provide recommendations for the TA completion report, including on the quality of Gansu provincial measures for the national implementation of the Provisions on Administration of Internships of Students of Vocational Schools, 2016.

8. **Administrative and financial assistant** (national, 5 person-months) The TA will provide non-consultant administrative and financial management support through a national assistant. The assistant should have basic qualifications in administration and finance, 3 years' experience, and English fluency. The assistant will report to GPED, ADB, and the team leader, and will

- (i) assist GPED in organizing workshops, conferences, and other TA meetings; training sessions; and logistics for field trips and the domestic study tour;
- (ii) assist GPED in arranging translation, proofreading, and TA knowledge product dissemination, following the TA dissemination plan;
- (iii) assist GPED in promptly administering ADB finances and preparing regular liquidation reports following ADB procedures; and
- (iv) liaise with the ADB PRC Resident Mission and ADB headquarters as required to fulfill tasks.

9. **Survey interviewers.** The TA will engage up to 10 interviewers on a short-term basis to assist with the TVET survey, TVET–enterprise cooperation survey, and poor TVET student and household survey. The consultant team leader will submit a list of proposed candidates for ADB non-objection.

10. **Resource persons.** The TA will provide about 12 resource persons from academia, research institutions, public and private sector enterprises, industry, and social organizations to present and discuss issues on equity-oriented technical education–enterprise cooperation in the PRC. The resource persons' inputs will enhance the discussion quality and provide concrete field experience, especially during the TA workshops and conferences.