



Technical Assistance Report

Project Number: 48491-001
Capacity Development Technical Assistance (CDTA)
December 2015

Kingdom of Bhutan: Decentralized Coordination and Partnerships for Gender Equality Results (Financed by the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction)

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Public Communications Policy 2011.

Asian Development Bank

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(as of 1 December 2015)

Currency unit	–	ngultrum (Nu)
Nu1.00	=	\$0.01504
\$1.00	=	Nu66.47

ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	–	Asian Development Bank
NCWC	–	National Commission for Women and Children
NGO	–	nongovernment organization
PPP	–	public–private partnership
SHG	–	self-help group
TA	–	technical assistance

NOTE

In this report, "\$" refers to US dollars.

Vice-President	W. Zhang, Operations 1
Director General	H. Kim, South Asia Department (SARD)
Director	H. Carlsson, Advisor and Head, Portfolio, Results and Quality Control Unit, SARD
Team leader	F. Tornieri, Principal Social Development Specialist (Gender and Development), SARD
Team member	J. Colasito, Senior Operations Assistant, SARD

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

CONTENTS

	Page
CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AT A GLANCE	
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. ISSUES	1
III. THE CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	3
A. Impact and Outcome	3
B. Methodology and Key Activities	3
C. Cost and Financing	4
D. Implementation Arrangements	4
IV. THE PRESIDENT'S DECISION	5
APPENDIXES	
1. Design and Monitoring Framework	6
2. Cost Estimates and Financing Plan	8
3. Outline Terms of Reference for Consultants	9

CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AT A GLANCE

1. Basic Data		Project Number: 48491-001	
Project Name	Decentralized Coordination and Partnerships for Gender Equality Results	Department /Division	SARD/SAOD
Country	Bhutan	Executing Agency	National Commission for Women and Children (NCWC)
2. Sector	Subsector(s)	Financing (\$ million)	
✓ Public sector management	Decentralization		1.00
Industry and trade	Small and medium enterprise development		0.50
		Total	1.50
3. Strategic Agenda	Subcomponents	Climate Change Information	
Inclusive economic growth (IEG)	Pillar 2: Access to economic opportunities, including jobs, made more inclusive	Climate Change impact on the Project	Low
4. Drivers of Change	Components	Gender Equity and Mainstreaming	
Governance and capacity development (GCD)	Civil society participation Institutional development	Gender equity (GEN)	✓
Knowledge solutions (KNS)	Pilot-testing innovation and learning		
Partnerships (PAR)	Civil society organizations Implementation Private Sector		
Private sector development (PSD)	Promotion of private sector investment		
5. Poverty Targeting		Location Impact	
Project directly targets poverty	Yes	Not Applicable	
Geographic targeting (TI-G)	Yes		
6. TA Category:	B		
7. Safeguard Categorization	Not Applicable		
8. Financing			
Modality and Sources		Amount (\$ million)	
ADB		0.00	
None		0.00	
Cofinancing		1.50	
Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction		1.50	
Counterpart		0.15	
Government		0.15	
Total		1.65	
9. Effective Development Cooperation			
Use of country procurement systems		No	
Use of country public financial management systems		No	

I. INTRODUCTION

1. Two of the four pillars of the Kingdom of Bhutan's 11th Five-Year Plan, 2013–2018 are sustainable and equitable socioeconomic development, and good governance.¹ Achieving this requires diversifying the country's economy, creating an enabling environment for private sector development, and reducing poverty and inequality by enhancing the standard of living and the quality of life of the most vulnerable sections of Bhutanese society. Gender equality concerns are integrated in the plan to ensure that the poor—many of whom are women—benefit from economic growth transforming the Bhutan economy. The National Commission for Women and Children (NCWC) is the Government agency responsible for protecting, promoting and reporting on rights of women and children in Bhutan. Its Strategic Plan, 2014–2019 is an accompanying document to the 11th Five-Year Plan with the following strategic priorities: (i) enhance socioeconomic opportunities for women, (ii) address sociocultural gender stereotypes, (iii) promote gender responsive governance, (iv) provide social and legal protection, and (v) strengthen institutional capacity of NCWC.²

2. This capacity development technical assistance (TA) will strengthen the institutional capacity of NCWC to promote gender equality and women's empowerment through national and local government institutions. It will also contribute to strengthen the private sector through public–private partnerships (PPPs) in economic projects and in the provision of social services that benefit the poor, especially poor women.³ It will build capacity of functional women self-help groups (SHGs) by enhancing their marketing capacity and promoting an entrepreneurial culture in the villages (and potentially extending to the whole district) where these SHGs are operating. More viable and productive SHG enterprises will create employment and enhance rural income, a priority in the plan.

3. The TA is included in Bhutan's country operations business plan, 2014–2016. The pre-fact finding mission discussed the TA with NCWC in March 2015 and in a fact-finding mission in August 2015, and consulted with a wide range of government, civil society, and private sector stakeholders.⁴ The government concurred with the impact, outcome, outputs, implementation arrangements, cost, financing arrangements, and terms of reference. Comments from the NCWC are incorporated in this TA report. The design and monitoring framework is in Appendix 1.

II. ISSUES

4. Despite an average gross domestic product growth of 8% in the past decade, rural poverty in Bhutan has remained high (at 16.7%) with more than half of its 20 districts having poverty rates above the national poverty rate of 12% (2012).⁵ Youth unemployment is high at 9.5% for males and 11.6% among females.⁶ Gender disparities still exist in employment, income generation, and education enrollment and completion rate (footnote 2). Labor force participation of females (59%) is lower than that of males (72%).⁷ Income-earning opportunity is also lower

¹ Government of Bhutan, Gross National Happiness Commission. 2013. *11th Five-Year Plan, 2013–2018*. Thimphu.

² Government of Bhutan, National Commission for Women and Children. 2014. *NCWC Strategic Plan, 2014–2019*. Thimphu.

³ The TA paper adopts ADB definition of PPP as a contractual arrangement between public and private entities through which the skills, assets, and/or financing resources of each of the public and private sectors are allocated in a complementary manner, thereby sharing the risks and rewards, to seek to provide optimal service delivery and good value to citizens.

⁴ The TA first appeared in the business opportunities section of ADB's website on 29 June 2015.

⁵ Government of Bhutan, National Statistics Bureau. 2012. *Poverty Analysis Report*. Thimphu.

⁶ Government of Bhutan, National Statistics Bureau. 2012. *Bhutan Living Standards Survey*. Thimphu.

⁷ Government of Bhutan, Ministry of Labor and Human Resources. 2013. *Labor Force Survey Report*. Thimphu.

for women than for men as among those employed, fewer women (6%) hold regular-paying jobs compared to men (19%) (footnote 7).

5. The report on Gender and Employment Challenges in Bhutan in 2013 identified the reasons for women's unemployment, including (i) lack of available jobs, (ii) lack of experience and skill, (iii) poor academic performance in secondary school, and (iv) family and marriage problems.⁸ A year earlier, the 2012 Bhutan Living Standards Survey similarly asked the reasons for women's unemployment and found that 93% of urban women aged 25 to 34 and 99% of women aged 35 to 44 cited "house or family duties," which could cover childcare (footnote 6). As noted in ADB's 2014 Bhutan Gender Equality Diagnostic of Selected Sectors, the data suggest a pressure on working women, especially in urban areas where family networks and assistance are less available.⁹

6. In the rural areas, the 2012 agriculture sector study by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations and World Bank highlighted the burden carried by rural women as a result of reduced male involvement in farming due to rural–urban migration.¹⁰ The study also sought for greater attention to be given to the labor burden on women. Another study found that rural women were increasingly responsible for bringing farm produce to market.¹¹ According to stakeholders consulted for this proposed TA, it is important to note the increasing number of rural women coming to Thimphu¹² market and other urban markets to sell their produce. These female vendors sleep at the market, have no decent toilet and other place to wash, and expose themselves to the risk of gender-based and sexual violence as well as theft.

7. The government recognizes the critical role of decentralized structures—*dzongkhag* (district), *gewog* (block), and *chiwog* (village)—in achieving sustainable, gender- and socially inclusive economic growth. Since 2004, the NCWC has gradually established itself at the central level, through a focused approach aimed at strengthening gender mainstreaming capacities of sector agencies.¹³ The challenge—at the moment—lies in NCWC's ability to deliver on two of the critical aspects of its mandate: decentralized coordination and public-private partnerships for greater gender equality results. In this context, increased capacity in mainstreaming gender equality in development planning of decentralized structures' and delivery of services would contribute to gender equity in economic growth. Improved coordination between decentralized structures and central government agencies would enhance government's effectiveness in delivering much-needed economic and social services to their constituents, especially the poor who need those most. The Economic Development Policy (2010) of Bhutan identified PPP as a key approach in working towards sustainable, inclusive economic growth.¹⁴ The PPP approach will contribute to expanding Bhutan's economic base, developing the private sector, and creating jobs and business opportunities. Integrating a gender equality perspective in PPP could help ensure that men and women benefit equitably from the gains of economic growth.

⁸ ADB. 2015. *Implementation Completion Memorandum. BHU: Advancing Economic Opportunities of Women and Girls*. Manila.

⁹ ADB. 2014. *Bhutan: Gender Equality Diagnostic of Selected Sectors*. Manila.

¹⁰ G. Christensen, T. Fileccia, and A. Gulliver. 2012. *Bhutan Agricultural Sector Review. Vo. 1. Issues, Institutions, and Policies*. Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations and the World Bank.

¹¹ C. Niang et al. 2013. *Connecting the Disconnected: Coping Strategies of the Financially Excluded in Bhutan*. Washington, DC: World Bank.

¹² Thimphu is Bhutan's capital city and the main center of commerce.

¹³ The NCWC is governed by a Commission comprising of a Chairperson (Cabinet Minister) and Commissioners with representation from government, non-government and private sectors. The NCWC Secretariat is headed by the Director General, under whom, three main divisions, the Administration and Finance Division, the Children's Division and the Women's Division function, together with a Legal Unit.

¹⁴ Royal Government of Bhutan. 2010. *Economic Development Policy of the Kingdom of Bhutan, 2010*. <http://rtm.gnhc.gov.bt/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/EDP.pdf>

8. The TA builds on the successful implementation, results and lessons from the grant project Advancing Economic Opportunities of Women and Girls, funded by the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction.¹⁵ This grant enabled NCWC to successfully fulfill its mandate to promote gender equality and women’s empowerment. The capacity of gender focal persons in each of the central government agencies on gender mainstreaming was improved and a web-based gender monitoring system established. The same grant also enabled close to a thousand poor rural women increase their income through micro-enterprises set up by self-help groups (SHGs) where they were members. These SHGs and new ones whose growth was spawned by the example demonstrated by successful SHGs are ready to expand their volume of production, produce new or improved products, and expand markets.

9. The need for gender mainstreaming in local governments and building their capacity to deliver economic and social services to the poor is another gap that needs to be addressed. Government agencies consulted for the design of this TA highlighted the need for PPPs and working at all government levels to reduce poverty, especially among poor women, and achieve the goal of “sustainable and equitable socioeconomic development,” one of four pillars of gross national happiness (footnote 1). This TA aims to build capacity of government, private sector, and civil society organizations to enter into such multistakeholder partnerships to achieve the goals of poverty reduction and sustainable, equitable socioeconomic development. Specifically, through these PPPs, this TA is expected to respond to cited barriers to women’s effective engagement in economic activities (i.e., need for childcare support, lack of lodging facilities for rural women market vendors, and need for more economic opportunities through providing assistance to SHGs).

III. THE CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

A. Impact and Outcome

10. The impact will be access to productive resources and social services by the poor—particularly women— improved in selected urban and rural areas, aligned with Bhutan’s 11th Five-Year Plan, 2013–18. The outcome will be strengthened government capacity in addressing gender equality concerns and delivering services in partnership with private sector and nongovernment organizations (NGOs).

B. Methodology and Key Activities

11. The TA will support this outcome through the following outputs:¹⁶
- (i) **Output 1: Capacity of the National Commission for Women and Children for greater achievement of gender equality results at local level strengthened.** The gender focal persons serve as NCWC’s extensions in promoting gender mainstreaming at central and local government levels. Elected and appointed officials play key roles in ensuring that gender equality concerns are integrated in government planning and budgeting, and in delivery of services. For these reasons, 35 gender focal persons (15 at central and 20 at district levels), 100

¹⁵ ADB. 2011. *Proposed Grant Assistance to Bhutan for Advancing Economic Opportunities of Women and Girls*. Manila.

¹⁶ The TA presents some risks at outcome and output levels, including: (i) NCWC’s challenge to fully institutionalize gender-inclusive partnerships across sector and line agencies and participating districts; (ii) limited support from sector and local government officials to NCWC’s commitment to gender mainstreaming; and (iii) longer than expected time to reach consensus on PPP modalities. Risks are reflected in the design and monitoring framework (Appendix 1).

district officials and staff, and 60% of parliamentarians will be trained in gender mainstreaming. More in-depth gender analysis of key aspects of the Bhutanese society (namely, law, economy, and governance) will be conducted to contribute to the body of knowledge for policy reform and development planning. Gender advocacy tools with a broader reach (such as videos) will be produced and circulated.

- (ii) **Output 2: Public–private partnerships addressing the needs of women and vulnerable groups established.** PPP agreements will be formulated, in the following areas:
 - (a) socioeconomic security and physical safety of market vendors and informal sector workers that will lead to the establishment of two market vendors’ cooperatives in Thimphu, and 30-bed lodging facility for market vendors; and
 - (b) access to childcare services by formal and informal sector workers in Thimphu that will lead to the establishment of the following facilities: five crèches (day care centers) in central government agencies, one crèche in private sector, and two crèches for informal sector workers.¹⁷
- (iii) **Output 3: Capacity building of selected self-help groups on upgraded production technologies and market accessibility undertaken.** Capacity development program on upgrading of production technologies and increased access to profitable markets for SHGs will be implemented. This is expected to lead to (a) increased number of new products or designs sold by SHGs in cane and bamboo craft and textile weaving; (b) technology upgrading and expanded market base for selected products such as raw and processed fruits and vegetables, honey, cardamom, animal feeds (grain), milk, and poultry; (c) 20 agreements reached for marketing of SHG products at district level one-stop farmers’ shops; and (d) formation of five SHGs in recycled waste livelihoods.

C. Cost and Financing

12. The TA is estimated to cost \$1.65 million, of which \$1.50 million will be financed on a grant basis by the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction and administered by ADB. The government will provide counterpart support in the form of remuneration and per diem of counterpart staff, office and office supplies, secretarial assistance, domestic transportation, meeting venues, staff time to review outputs of consultants and conduct periodic field visits, and other in-kind contributions.

D. Implementation Arrangements

13. The NCWC will be the executing agency for the TA. A small project management unit will be established within the NCWC’s Women Division to carry out day-to-day TA implementation. The Women Division—in coordination with the project management unit—will work with the TA consultants to support two-way knowledge transfer. The TA will be implemented over 36 months, commencing in mid-January 2016 with completion date expected in December 2018. All consultants will be engaged in accordance with ADB’s Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time).¹⁸ Consulting inputs will be provided under the TA as follows:

¹⁷ In carrying out the needs assessment for the crèche in the central government agencies, private companies, informal sector, and the lodging facility for informal sector workers, NCWC will consult and seek endorsement of relevant government agencies.

¹⁸ For the recruitment of individual consultants and organizations (firms and/or NGOs), the use of output-based (lump-sum) contracts will be considered for all consulting services.

- (i) Individual national experts: project manager (36 person-months); monitoring and evaluation officer (36 person-months); finance and procurement officer at the project management unit (36 person-months); administrative and financial consultant (9 person-months); researcher for crèche and lodging needs (2 person-months); researcher for gender and law (3 person-months); PPP expert (6 person-months); researcher and gender economist (6 person-months); and gender and governance expert (6 person-months).
- (ii) National organizations (2): one NGO responsible for activities related to market vendors and informal sector (36 months), to be engaged under the consultants' qualifications selection; and a firm responsible for video production (4 months) to be engaged following the use of Service Delivery Assignments, based on para. 2.43 of ADB's Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time).
- (iii) An international NGO to be engaged under the quality- and cost-based selection method (80:20 quality to cost ratio). The implementation team fielded by the international NGO will be composed of individual international experts: value chain development expert (3 person-months), marketing expert (3 person-months), designer of handwoven textiles (2 person-months), designer of cane and bamboo craft (2 person-months), recycled solid waste trainer (2 person-months), and subcontracted national NGOs (72 months).

14. All disbursements under the TA will be done in accordance with ADB's *Technical Assistance Disbursement Handbook* (2010, as amended from time to time). All TA-financed goods and equipment will be procured in accordance with ADB's Procurement Guidelines (2015, as amended from time to time). The procured equipment will be handed over to the NCWC upon TA completion. The outcomes of the TA will be disseminated through various knowledge products such as publications, conferences, and training and seminar-workshops. The government has committed to disseminate the TA outputs widely throughout the country to create greater impact. Other than through printed materials, TA outputs will be disseminated through the NCWC website¹⁹ and the gender monitoring system²⁰ established through the Advancing Economic Opportunities of Women and Girls (footnote 8). The TA will be administered by ADB.

IV. THE PRESIDENT'S DECISION

15. The President, acting under the authority delegated by the Board, has approved ADB administering technical assistance not exceeding the equivalent of \$1,500,000 to the Government of Bhutan to be financed on a grant basis by the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction for Decentralized Coordination and Partnerships for Gender Equality Results, and hereby reports this action to the Board.

¹⁹ National Commission for Women and Children. <http://www.ncwc.gov.bt/ncwc/> (NCWC has been maintaining its website regularly since its establishment in 2004, and independently through the government's national budget).

²⁰ National Commission for Women and Children. Gender Monitoring System. <http://www.ncwc.gov.bt/gms/>

DESIGN AND MONITORING FRAMEWORK

Impact of the Technical Assistance Project is Aligned with Access to productive resources and social services by the poor—particularly women—in selected urban and rural areas improved (Bhutan's 11th Five-Year Plan, 2013–18)			
Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Data Sources and Reporting	Risks
Outcome Government capacity in addressing gender equality concerns and delivering services in partnership with private sector and NGOs strengthened	By 2018: a. At least 75% of relevant central government agencies have an updated gender mainstreaming strategy (2015 baseline: 2 out of 15) b. At least 10 out of 20 <i>dzongkhag</i> (districts) have a gender mainstreaming strategy (2015 baseline: 0) c. At least 3 long-term (5-year) partnerships established to deliver socioeconomic services to poor women and men (2015 baseline: 0)	a–c. Annual reports of central agencies and districts NCWC annual reports Activity reports from NCWC and partners Project progress reports	NCWC's challenge to fully institutionalize gender-inclusive partnerships across sector or line agencies and participating districts
Outputs 1. Capacity of the NCWC for greater achievement of gender equality results at local level strengthened	By 2018: 1a. At least 35 GFPs (15 central, 20 districts) trained on web-based gender monitoring system for policy reform and planning (2015 baseline: 15) 1b. At least 100 officials and staff participated in gender sensitivity training at local level (2015 baseline: 25) 1c. At least 60% of parliamentarians participated in gender sensitivity training (2015 baseline: 20%) 1d. At least 3 gender studies conducted, published and disseminated (2015 baseline: 0) 1e. 4-part TV series on gender issues raised in the 3 gender studies broadcasted nationwide (2015 baseline: 0) ^a	1a–e. Annual reports of central agencies and districts NCWC annual reports with inputs from collaborating partners Project progress reports Published studies 4-part TV series ADB review missions	Limited support from sector and local government officials to NCWC's commitment to gender mainstreaming
2. PPPs addressing the needs of women and vulnerable groups established	By 2018: 2a. 3 needs assessment and feasibility studies finalized (2015 baseline: 0) 2b. 2 PPP agreements formulated for establishment of market vendors' cooperatives in Thimphu (Target: 75% women) (2015 baseline: 1) 2c. PPP agreement formulated for establishment of lodging facility for market vendors in Thimphu (2015 baseline: 0) 2d. 6 PPP agreements formulated for establishment of crèches (day care centers): 5 in central government agencies (2015 baseline: 1); 1 in private sector (2015 baseline: 0); and 2 for informal workers ^c (2015	2a–2d. Feasibility studies Partnership agreements Studies and other consultant reports Review missions Progress reports	Longer than expected time to reach consensus on PPP modalities

Results Chain	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Data Sources and Reporting	Risks
	baseline: 0)		
3. Capacity building of selected SHGs on upgraded production technologies and market accessibility undertaken	3a. At least 10 SHGs trained on micro-enterprise development and market access (2015 baseline: 3) 3b. At least 6 SHGs in recycled waste livelihoods established [Target: 75% women] (2015 baseline: 0) ^d 3c. At least 20 agreements reached for marketing of SHG products at district level one-stop farmers' shops (2015 baseline: 0)	3a–3c. Feasibility studies Partnership agreements Studies and other consultant reports SHG financial records	
Key Activities with Milestones 1. Capacity of the NCWC for greater achievement of gender equality results at local level strengthened 1.1 Set up PMU at NCWC (Q1). 1.2 Conduct consultation and planning workshops with central government agencies and districts (Q2 onward). 1.3 Carry out capacity building program on gender mainstreaming for central government agencies and districts (Q2 onward). 2. PPPs addressing the needs of women and vulnerable groups established 2.1 Recruit consultants to conduct needs assessment, feasibility studies on (i) lodging for vendors in the Centenary Farmers' Market in Thimphu; and (ii) crèches in central government agencies, private companies, and for informal workers (Q1). 2.2 Formulate PPP agreement for establishment of market vendors' cooperatives, lodging for market vendors and the crèches (Q8). 3. Capacity building of selected SHGs on upgraded production technologies and market accessibility undertaken 3.1 Recruit international NGO to undertake value chain and marketing-related studies and build business enhancement capacity of SHGs (Q1). 3.2 Prepare capacity building plan for SHGs' business enhancement (Q2). 3.3 Conduct baseline and end-line survey to assess gender-related impacts of training activities (Q2 and Q12). 3.4 Reach agreements for marketing of SHG products (Q8).			
Inputs Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction: \$1.5 million Note: The government will provide counterpart support in the form of remuneration and per diem of counterpart staff, office and office supplies, secretarial assistance, domestic transportation, meeting venues, staff time to review outputs of consultants and conduct periodic field visits, and other in-kind contributions.			
Assumptions for Partner Financing Not applicable.			

ADB = Asian Development Bank, GFP = gender focal person, NCWC = National Commission for Women and Children, NGO = nongovernment organization, PMU = project management unit; PPP = public-private partnership, SHG = self-help group.

^a TA support will be limited to production costs and not include cost of airing at Bhutan Broadcasting Services.

^b Partnership between Thimphu Thromde (City Corporation), market vendors' cooperatives, and nongovernment organizations (NGOs).

^c Partnership between Ministry of Labor and Human Resources and NGOs.

^d Waste management is a lucrative business with market and proven success in Bhutan. There is a large potential for SHGs, mostly composed of women, to be involved in collecting, managing, and marketing waste. Project will identify districts to establish these SHGs.

Source: Asian Development Bank.

COST ESTIMATES AND FINANCING PLAN
(\$ '000)

Item	Amount
Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction^a	
1. Consultants	
a. Remuneration and per diem	
i. International consultants ^b	543.0
ii. National consultants ^c	455.0
b. International and local travel	105.0
c. Reports and communications	10.0
2. Equipment ^d	23.0
3. Training, seminars, and conferences	240.0
4. Surveys ^e	40.0
5. Miscellaneous administration and support costs	13.0
6. Contingencies	71.0
Total	1,500.0

Note: The technical assistance (TA) is estimated to cost \$1,650,000, of which contributions from the Japan Fund for Poverty Reduction are presented in the table above. The government will provide counterpart support in the form of counterpart staff (including secretarial services as required), office accommodation and supplies, domestic transportation, and other in-kind contributions. The value of government counterpart is estimated at 10% of the total TA cost.

^a Administered by the Asian Development Bank.

^b This includes estimated remuneration and per diem costs associated with the recruitment of international consultants' services, international nongovernment organization (NGO) and subcontracted national NGOs (see Appendix 3, B[2]).

^c This includes costs associated with the recruitment of a national NGO responsible for managing the lodging facility for market vendors and crèche (day care centers) for informal workers inclusive of rental costs, on a 3-year pilot basis.

^d Standard IT equipment (3 computers) and equipment for the operation of the crèches managed by the government agencies (see 2d in Design and Monitoring Framework [Appendix 1]) will remain with the executing agency after completion of the TA.

^e The allocation for training is based on the following estimates. For output 1, \$120,000 (\$2,000/year for 3 years and 20 districts); and for output 3, \$120,000 (\$40,000/year for 3 years).

Source: Asian Development Bank estimates.

OUTLINE TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR CONSULTANTS

A. National experts

1. **Project manager** (36 person-months). The expert will have a bachelor's degree or higher in development planning, community development or any related field, and more than 7 years of experience in project management with prior involvement in managing the government- or development partners-financed projects, preferably in the area of social development, gender and development (GAD) and/or women's empowerment. She or he will work closely with National Commission for Women and Children (NCWC) in overall project management and ensure smooth project implementation. She or he will lead the project management unit in annual planning and budgeting, regular and periodic monitoring, and reporting to NCWC and the Asian Development Bank (ADB), develop standards and systems in recruitment of consultants, facilitate ADB review missions, provide technical advice to NCWC and nongovernment organizations (NGOs) as requested and as appropriate, and liaise with development partners on behalf of the project.

2. **Monitoring and evaluation officer** (36 person-months). The expert will have a bachelor's degree or higher in project development and management or any related field and at least 5 years of experience in project monitoring and evaluation with prior involvement in monitoring government- and/or development partners-financed projects, preferably in the area of social development, GAD and/or women's empowerment. She or he will develop project monitoring system and tools, train partners in use of tools, and produce aggregated project monitoring reports showing sex-disaggregated data. She or he will train partners in writing case stories, work closely with partners and consultants in identifying good practices and lessons for documentation and publication, and lead in the identification and publication of knowledge products.

3. **Finance and procurement officer** (36 person-months). The expert will have a bachelor's degree in accounting, finance or public administration and qualification of certified public accountant from a national recognized institute of accountancy, with at least 5 years of relevant finance experience at national level and familiarity with government accounting system and standards. She or he will provide project implementation support to the financing accounting, reporting, submission of withdrawal applications for the proposed technical assistance (TA), draft terms of references for expert(s) and specialized service provider(s), participate in selecting experts and consultants, and facilitate fund requests and releases.

4. **Administrative and financial consultant** (ADB headquarters-based, 9 person-months). The consultant will have at least 15 years of relevant administrative and financial experience in ADB, with deep knowledge of ADB business processes and practices. She or he will be responsible for supporting the South Asia Department in the following tasks: (i) provide guidance on the financial and contractual aspects related to the implementation of the capacity development TA activities, including monitoring of disbursements, liquidation of advance, submission of progress reports, certificates of full payment, including formal closure of contracts and accounts; (ii) update on a daily basis the status of TA activities and TA status monitoring for activities under implementation or in the pipeline; (iii) proactively engage user divisions and resident missions to ensure on-time implementation of activities and disbursements; and (iv) prepare reports using these data, including (a) monthly progress reports, (b) updated monitoring sheets, and (c) quarterly statistics and information.

5. **Researcher for crèche and lodging needs** (2 person-months). The consultant will have a bachelor's degree or higher in social sciences or related field, at least 5 years of relevant experience in doing social assessments with strong analytical skills; knowledge, understanding, and practical implementation of survey methods; and cultural awareness and sensitivity to gender issues. She or he will conduct surveys on crèche (day care center) for formal, informal and private sector, and lodging needs of female market vendors in Thimphu (with emphasis on vendors coming from rural areas outside Thimphu such as Wangdi and Punakha) through a questionnaire and interviews (individual and group); and present findings and recommendations to NCWC, Thimphu city government, and other interested agencies. Issues of security and physical safety of female market vendors will be assessed.
6. **Researcher for gender and law** (3 person-months). The consultant will have a bachelor's degree or higher in law, with knowledge of government legal framework and gender-related laws or regulations, social sciences, international law or human rights and at least 5 years of experience in the legal field, with experience in areas such as law drafting, policy analysis, legal literacy and/or legal aid. She or he will assist the international expert on gender and law in conducting review of Bhutan laws and policies from a gender perspective.
7. **Public-private partnership expert** (6 person-months). The expert will have experience in (i) establishing public-private partnership (PPP) programs and financially closed PPP projects across sectors with 10 years' experience in the commercial and finance arena; (ii) advising on micro-infrastructure projects and, in particular, projects involving the private sector; and (iii) strong knowledge of Bhutan policy, legal or regulatory, financial, and commercial market. The consultant will support the finalization of three feasibility studies and support the consultative process for the finalization of the agreements for establishment of infrastructure projects (market vendors' cooperatives, market vendors' lodging facility, crèches and commodity collection centers) using the PPP modality. He or she will review existing documents and/or perform an assessment of the current conditions of the assets, the current status of service delivery, and perform an analysis of the possible alternatives in the delivery of these services. Adequate types and modalities of PPPs through which private sector financing and/or management skills will be identified to help achieve this output.
8. **Researcher and gender economist** (6 person-months). The consultant will have a bachelor's degree or higher in social sciences and/or related field. At least 5 years of relevant experience in doing social and gender assessments with strong analytical skills and understanding of gender dimensions of economic development will be required. She or he will assist the gender economist (international expert) in conducting the study on women's contribution to the economy.
9. **Gender and governance expert** (6 person-months). The expert will have a postgraduate degree or higher in public administration, governance or related field, with demonstrated gender skills and expertise or postgraduate degree in gender studies or social sciences, with demonstrated expertise in public administration and governance. At least 10 years of relevant experience in supporting gender-responsive public governance reform at central and local level, and exposure to the context of South Asia and cultural awareness and sensitivity to gender issues will be required. She or he will provide technical advisory services to NCWC including (i) capacity development of central and district-level government agencies in developing a gender mainstreaming strategy and annual gender action plan; (ii) support to NCWC Women Division in updating gender-related training manuals to make them suitable to local government context; (iii) support NCWC in developing stronger terms of reference for sector-level gender focal persons (GFPs) with built-in accountability mechanisms; and (iv) carry

out training and seminar-workshops for NCWC staff and commission and board members, GFPS, district officials and staff, and parliamentarians.

B. Organizations

1. National Organizations

10. **Nongovernment organization** (lodging facility for market vendors and crèche informal sector) (36 months). The NGO will have demonstrated ability to work with vulnerable urban communities in Thimphu and contribute to address the practical needs related to the working and living conditions of vendors and traders (especially women) involved in the Centenary Farmers' Market in Thimphu. At least 10 years of national experience in promoting the empowerment of local communities (especially women) to take a larger part in program planning and implementation at local level will be required. Experience in collaborating with government agencies, preferably Thimphu Thromde (City Corporation) and addressing the needs of urban communities in Thimphu will be required. The national NGO will work with the NCWC to establish two market vendors' cooperatives in Thimphu (target: 75% women), in partnership with the Department of Agricultural Marketing and Cooperatives, cooperatives and NGOs. In addition, the national NGO will work with NCWC to (i) manage on a 3-year pilot basis a lodging facility for vendors in the Centenary Farmers' Market in Thimphu in partnership with the Thimphu Thromde (City Corporation), and two crèches for informal workers in Thimphu in partnership with market vendors' cooperatives; and (ii) facilitate—under the guidance of NCWC—the finalization of longer-term PPP agreements for the sustainable management of market vendors' cooperatives and lodging facilities for market vendors.

11. **Video production firm** (4 months). The firm will have demonstrated ability to take videos, edit, and interview independently to a high standard for dissemination on national and international network. At least 5 years of national experience in filming, producing, writing and editing documentaries and corporate videos, including human interest features for broadcasters and other institutions, will be required. The video production firm will produce a four-part television series that depict gender inequality issues in Bhutan to be used in training and gender advocacy by NCWC and the gender focal persons.

2. International organization

12. **International nongovernment organization implementation team.** The NGO or firm will include (i) six individual international experts (value chain development expert for 3 person-months, marketing expert for 3 person-months, designer of handwoven textiles for 2 person-months, designer of cane and bamboo craft for 2 person-months, and recycled solid waste trainer for 2 person-months) for a total of 12 person-months; (ii) one individual national expert (project coordinator for 36 person-months; and (iii) national NGOs (72 months).

13. **International nongovernment organization responsibilities.** The NGO will enter into subcontracts with the national NGOs on terms and conditions approved by ADB. The approach and methodology for supervising and administering such subcontracts, and the identity and qualifications of each proposed national NGO, will need to be detailed by each shortlisted international NGO in their simplified technical proposal, as this aspect will be given significant weight in evaluation of such proposals. Outline terms of reference associated with individual international and national experts as well as national NGOs are outlined below:

a. Individual international experts

14. **Value chain development expert** (3 person-months). The expert will have a master's degree in social sciences or comparable in economics, agriculture, social sciences or related discipline. She or he will have at least 10 years of experience in livelihood projects and social enterprises, with exposure to gender-responsive value chain analysis. Applied knowledge of and at least 5 years project experience in agricultural value chain development or local and economic development and technical expertise in the fields of value chain development and multistakeholder management will be required. She or he will (i) conduct value chain analysis of the following products and commodities: handwoven fabrics, cane and bamboo craft products, cardamom, animal (cattle) feeds, poultry, honey, and processed fruits and vegetables; (ii) examine roles, capacities and needs of the poor, women and other disadvantaged groups that participate in the value chain, and provide recommendations on how to optimize capacities and income generation for these groups; (iii) present findings to relevant government agencies (central and local); and (iv) train staff of relevant government agencies and NGOs on value chain analysis.

15. **Marketing expert** (3 person-months). The expert will have a master's degree in marketing, business administration or related field, and at least 10 years of experience in commercial or social marketing. Knowledge of and experience in interpreting and using qualitative and/or quantitative research to develop evidence-based strategies and cultural awareness and sensitivity to gender issues will be required. She or he will base interventions on value chain analyses of the value chain development specialist and study market (domestic and foreign) trends, and options for producers of handwoven fabrics, cane and bamboo craft, cardamom, cattle feeds, poultry, honey, and processed fruits and vegetables. She or he will present findings to relevant government agencies (central and local), train staff of relevant government agencies and NGOs on market analysis, and conduct follow up visits to provide guidance and advisory support in implementation of recommendations by NGOs and self-help groups (SHGs).

16. **Designer of handwoven textiles** (2 person-months). The expert will have a degree or postgraduate diploma in relevant field (craft and design, textiles etc.). She or he will have (i) proven knowledge of working with heritage material and patterns and utilizing these in a contemporary manner, (ii) demonstrated knowledge and experience of working with rural communities in a hands-on manner, and (iii) cultural awareness and sensitivity to gender issues. She or he will be familiar with Bhutan culture and indigenous cultural expressions manifested in handwoven fabrics; also, with resources needed for hand weaving available in Bhutan. She or he will train representatives of selected SHGs on new and modern designs of Bhutanese handwoven textile products. In consultation with the marketing expert, she or he will recommend marketing strategies and market options for such products.

17. **Designer of cane and bamboo craft** (2 person-months). The expert will have (i) a degree or postgraduate diploma in relevant field (craft and design, textiles); (ii) proven knowledge of working with heritage material and patterns and utilizing these in a contemporary manner; (iii) demonstrated knowledge and experience of working with rural communities in a hands-on manner; and (iv) cultural awareness and sensitivity to gender issues. She or he will be familiar with Bhutan culture and indigenous cultural expressions manifested in cane and bamboo craft; also, with resources needed for cane and bamboo craft available in Bhutan. She or he will train representatives of selected SHGs on new and modern designs of cane and bamboo craft products. In consultation with the marketing expert, she or he will recommend marketing strategies and market options for such products.

18. **Recycled solid waste trainer** (2 person-months). The specialist will have (i) a degree or postgraduate diploma in relevant field (environmental and sanitary engineering, environmental planning and management, etc.); (ii) proven knowledge of working on solid waste management in urban areas; (iii) demonstrated knowledge and experience of working with rural and urban communities in a hands-on manner; and (iv) cultural awareness and sensitivity to gender issues. She or he will work closely in training poor women and men in Thimphu on how to convert solid waste (paper, juice packs, fabrics) into commonly used products such as bags (of various types), fashion accessories, rags and mops, etc. She or he will be familiar with sources and types of solid waste produced in Thimphu and recommend designs and market strategies for new products. She or he will conduct periodic checks on quality of new products through the web.

b. National nongovernment organizations (72 months)

19. As social mobilizers, the national NGOs will work closely with SHGs and women's associations engaged in livelihood or business activities, and facilitate access of SHGs to business capacity-building services and organizational strengthening opportunities by linking them to relevant government, private sector agencies or companies, and international experts.

20. **Geographical scope and duration of engagement.** NGOs should be located in five subdistricts in three selected areas: (i) Shemgang and Samtse in the south, (ii) Trashigang in the east, and (iii) Trongsa in the central region. Each NGO will implement the component in one area for a period of 33 months.

21. **Selection criteria.** The NGOs will be selected based on their track record in enabling women and girls in rural communities to engage in agri-based livelihood activities or non-agricultural, micro-enterprise activities.

22. **Scope of work.** The scope of work will include

- (i) mapping project *gewogs* (blocks) based on poverty indicators and identifying the poor households in each of the villages in the pilot *gewogs*; developing the socioeconomic profiles of participating *gewogs*;
- (ii) organizing at least 10 SHGs; mobilizing at least 50% of identified poor households in SHGs;
- (iii) developing other strategies for empowering the ultra-poor, in addition to organizing them into SHGs;
- (iv) providing support to identified SHGs by strengthening their livelihood and entrepreneurial activities in the form of equipment, facilities (e.g., production sheds), inputs for production, training in use and maintenance of technology, financial support in SHG-initiated marketing of products, development of livelihood and entrepreneurial skills training programs, direct linkage with business development service providers and microfinance organizations;
- (v) carrying out the proposed capacity development initiatives, developing appropriate gender-responsive training modules drawing from and enhancing existing modules and material, organizing and conducting the needed trainings; and
- (vi) finalizing *gewog*-wise phasing of the project (including possibility of randomized roll out to enable a robust impact evaluation).