



Completion Report

Project Number: 48357-001
Technical Assistance Number: 8781
March 2017

Malaysia: Sustainable Urban Management (Green Cities) Support for Follow-up Activities in Melaka, Malaysia

This document is being disclosed to the public in accordance with ADB's Public Communications Policy 2011.

Asian Development Bank

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

TA Number, Country, and Name:			Amount Approved: US \$150,000.00	
TA 8781-MAL: Sustainable Urban Management (Green Cities) Support for Follow-up Activities in Melaka, Malaysia			Revised Amount: \$135,239.73	
Executing Agency: Melaka Green Technology Corporation		Source of Funding: Technical Assistance Special Fund– Others	Amount Undisbursed: \$35,994.46	Amount Utilized: \$99,245.27
TA Approval Date: 9 Dec 2014	TA Signing Date: 9 Dec 2014	Fielding of First Consultants: 9 Nov 2015	TA Completion Date Original: 31 Dec 2015	Actual: 31 Oct 2016
			Account Closing Date Original: 31 Dec 2015	Actual: 5 Dec 2016
Description				
<p>ADB has supported green cities planning across Southeast Asia. Melaka, Malaysia was an early-adopter, and the capacity development technical assistance (CDTA) builds on the planning processes conducted to help implement systematic action on city-level planning. Key elements include: baseline data, targets, monitoring, and institutional capacity development, which help the city to prioritize and tie “green actions” to city planning goals. Melaka Green Technology Corporation (MGTC) requested the TA to follow-up TA 8314-REG,¹ which developed Green City Action Plans (GCAPs) and conducted capacity building with municipal officials to balance economic growth with urban sustainability and climate resilience. Melaka piloted the first GCAP under TA 8040-REG.² The TA reflects a high level of city ownership through the origins as well as unique reimbursable structure. The CDTA was financed by ADB’s Technical Assistance Special Fund (TASF—Other Sources) and reimbursed by MGTC. The undisbursed amount of \$35,994.46 was returned to MGTC at the end of TA activities.</p>				
Expected Impact, Outcome, and Outputs				
<p>The impact of the CDTA is a start to a sustainable green city in Melaka with improved urban environmental sustainability and climate resilience with the ability to consolidate and prioritize green city projects. Improvements will be measured by implementation of GCAP. The outcome is improved capacity for urban planning and capacity building of MGTC and local government officials, which is needed to implement the plan. The outputs are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The PINTAR³ model developed as a decision-support system with baseline database and economy, environment, and equity (3E) benchmarking approaches, which summarizes the extent to which the green city development as of the baseline year (PINTAR default is 2013) has progressed as a result of the adoption of GCAP; 2. Capacity building program conducted and modules for enhancing capacity and learning on integrated urban development and environment planning issued; 3. Knowledge sharing and awareness raising workshops for expanded GCAP implementation; and 4. (Added as a minor change in scope on 13 November 2015 to utilize contracting cost savings): Planning framework for the creation of a nongovernment organization to implement actions and facilitate the roll out of GCAP initiatives known as Green Growth Asia (GGA). 				
Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities				
<p>The TA originally amounting to \$150,000 became effective on 9 December 2014. Surplus funds amounting to \$14,760.27 due to savings in costs for Output 2’s capacity building and awareness workshops during recruitment was cancelled on 22 June 2015, reducing the total amount of the TA to \$135,239.73. The TA recruited two firms and two independent consultants. For Output 1, a firm was recruited through fixed-budget selection for 3.5 international person-months. The firm selected using simplified technical proposal was ICLEI–Local Governments for Sustainability–South Asia. Although the EA and ICLEI’s resource commitments to organizing the Resilient Cities Asia-Pacific (RCAP) 2016 Conference in Melaka delayed TA outputs according to the updated timeline, ICLEI’s performance was satisfactory, delivering high quality work according to the Terms of Reference (TOR) and demonstrated diligence in long term planning for the project. All activities and milestones were met under this output. The individual national consultant directly recruited performed generally satisfactorily and was flexible in his support. For Output 2, the Institute for Housing and Urban Development Studies (IHS), was recruited through single source selection for two international person-months. IHS performed satisfactorily and delivered the primary outputs. All activities and milestones were met. For Output 3, activities were conducted through the coordination of inputs in the TORs for ICLEI, IHS, and the consultant, which included: leveraging MGTC and ICLEI’s work on RCAP to share Melaka’s GCAP priorities; conducting ICLEI’s workshops during Review and Final Missions; and conducting on-the-ground meetings and training on Green Cities. For Output 4, an international consultant was recruited as an</p>				

¹ ADB. 2012. *Technical Assistance for Green Cities: A Sustainable Urban Future in Southeast*. Manila.

² ADB. 2011. *Technical Assistance for Master Plan on ASEAN Connectivity Implementation*. Manila.

³ PINTAR is the Malay word for smart and swift reflecting the thinking behind the development of the green city model to establish and monitor baselines and benchmarks using smart technology.

individual for 66 working days. TOR was the EA's vision of organization (i.e. mission, vision, and scope). The consultant, generally satisfactory, was competent, communicative, and timely.

Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome

The TA was extended once from 31 December 2015 to 31 October 2016. All outputs were successfully completed, and the overall outcome was achieved. Key challenges to the integration of Project outputs into existing city business processes included low baseline institutional capacities and lack of coordination across institutions. Overall, the TA was relevant for ADB and Urban Sector's strategic priorities on GrEEEn/livable cities and climate resilience and efficiently utilized resources.

Output 1 was successfully developed and implemented with a tool governance/management plan going forward. Baseline environmental data and target indicators require further input from the EA. The inclusion of Economic Planning Unit (UPEN) to support the EA in data gathering, input, and management ensure sustainability of PINTAR, though both require additional consulting support to institutionalize PINTAR's full functionality. Upon TA closure, PINTAR has been available to all stakeholders but has not been integrated into existing city planning processes.

Output 2 was successfully delivered. Through outreach and training, new municipal stakeholders were identified to support aspects of GCAP and PINTAR, as seen in broader audiences for IHS training. Training modules are replicable and stakeholders, such as the Training and Environment Departments, UPEN, and the Indonesia-Malaysia-Thailand Growth Triangle (IMT-GT), are identified as targets for future iterations.

Output 3 was successfully implemented. Familiarity with GCAP and green city concepts was less pervasive than anticipated, but awareness-raising in-country and regionally through the RCAP Conference as well as the inclusion of officials from IMT-GT GCAP cities during ADB review missions, utilizing funds from the Urban Financing Partnership Facility, drove efficient and effective dissemination of GCAP priorities and awareness of PINTAR. Consultation for a citizen scorecard, however, proved unripe given the limited reach of GCAP, thus, scorecards were developed but resources prioritized municipal official engagement across organizations rather than citizens.

In addition to TA outputs, policy dialogue/knowledge-sharing through the RCAP Conference facilitated consultations on ADB investment opportunities. At TA closure, a potential project with the EA and ADB's Office of Public-Private Partnership is being supported under TA 8240.⁴ Moreover, output 4 supports future policy dialogues and awareness by laying institutional foundations for GCAP goals. Output 4 was added by request by the EA, using contracting savings. The product requires honing for implementation. The outcome of the TA was achieved and confirmed by EA which complimented ADB's support. Going forward, the concern is sustainability (uptake and maintenance) of the outputs. In this regard, the EA has committed to move Melaka toward sustainability, as demonstrated by the spearheading of a reimbursable TA, and cites the successful outcomes of the TA in outreach programs internationally and at home. ADB and EA performed satisfactorily and all requisite functions, activities, and milestones were met.

Overall Assessment and Rating

The TA achieved its intended impact of contributing to Melaka's transition to a sustainable green city with improved quality of life and climate resilience. Using Melaka's original GCAP as a heuristic to measure performance of the TA, five of the first six actions to institutionalize the GCAP have been conducted, and at least two of the nineteen Environmental Quality actions have been conducted/initiated. This TA successfully demonstrated a unique structure as a reimbursable TA model in a Middle Income Country. Overall, the TA is assessed as successful, though sustainability requires further consulting support to the EA.

Major Lessons

As the third reimbursable TA at ADB and the first in Malaysia, key lessons included needs for additional time and coordination for unique payment model finalization and contracting, especially around the avoidance of forex losses. Further lessons included challenges with EA's convening power to integrate the GCAP into city business processes, which requires more on-the-ground coordination than resources allotted for this TA.

Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions

Ongoing support from ICLEI to UPEN and MGTC to fully populate PINTAR with local data, facilitate target-setting, and integrate PINTAR with GCAP and annual city planning process should be maintained. Moreover, the State Training Division and IMT-GT could replicate/adapt the green city concept training through Training of Trainers. Finally, contracting and financial challenges in setting up this TA model could be used internally to establish a reimbursable TA model procedure.

Prepared by: Diana Connett⁵

Designation and Division: Environment Specialist, SEUW

⁴ ADB. 2012. *Technical Assistance for Supporting Regional Project Development for Association of Southeast Asian Nations Connectivity into Regional Cooperation*. Manila.

⁵ SEUW acknowledges the help of Gary Krishnan, Country Specialist, SERC/Team Member.